

Addis Ababa
University
(Since 1950)



ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY
COLLEGE OF LAW AND GOVERNANCE STUDIES
CENTER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS

**ASSESSING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF ETHIOPIAN POLICE UNIVERSITY
CURRICULUM DESIGN AND DELIVERY IN LIGHT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
EDUCATION METHODOLOGY**

BY

NIGUSIE GERIE DINKU

JUNE, 2023

ADDIS ABABA, ETHIOPIA

**ASSESSING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF ETHIOPIAN POLICE UNIVERSITY
CURRICULUM DESIGN AND DELIVERY IN LIGHT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
EDUCATION METHODOLOGY**

BY

NIGUSIE GERIE DINKU

**A THESIS SUBMITTED TO COLLEGE OF LAW AND GOVERNANCE STUDIES,
CENTER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS, IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTERS OF ARTS IN HUMAN
RIGHTS**

**ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY
COLLEGE OF LAW AND GOVERNANCE STUDIES
CENTER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS**

JUNE, 2023

ADDIS ABABA, ETHIOPIA

ASSESSING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF ETHIOPIAN POLICE UNIVERSITY
CURRICULUM DESIGN AND DELIVERY IN LIGHT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
EDUCATION METHODOLOGY

BY

NIGUSIE GERIE DINKU

Approved by Board Examination

Fasil Mulatu (PhD)
Dean, Center for Human Rights

Signature Date

Elshaday Kifle (PhD)
Advisor

Signature Date

Christophe Van der Beken (PhD)
Internal Examiner

Signature Date

Commander Dr. Demelash Kassaye
External Examiner

Signature Date

Declaration

I declare that the thesis entitled “Assessing the Effectiveness of EPU curriculum Design and Delivery in light of HRE Methodology” is my original work and has not been presented for a degree in any other university, and that all sources of material used for the thesis have been duly acknowledged.

Declared by:

Nigusie Gerie Dinku

Candidate

Signature

Date

This thesis has been submitted for examination with my approval as a university advisor

Elshaday Kifle (PhD)

Advisor

Signature

Date

Table of Contents

Contents	Pages
Declaration.....	i
Table of Contents.....	ii
List of Figures and Tables	iv
Acronyms.....	v
Acknowledgments	vi
<i>Abstract</i>	vii
Chapter One: Introduction	1
1.1 Background of the Study	1
1.2 Statement of the Problem.....	2
1.3 Objectives of the Study.....	4
1.4 Scope of the Study	4
1.6 Significance of the Study.....	5
1.7 Limitations of the Study	5
1.8 Organization of the Study	5
Chapter Two: Review of the Related Literature.....	6
Chapter Three: Research Design and Methodology	24
3.1 Research Design and Types of Data	24
3.2 Sampling Techniques.....	25
3.3 Instruments of Data Collection.....	25
3.4 Procedure of Data Collection.....	28
3.5 Method of Data Analysis	28
3.6 Ethical Consideration.....	28
Chapter Four: Presentation, Analysis and Interpretation of Data.....	30
Chapter Five: Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations	49
5.1 Summary.....	49
5.2 Conclusion	50
5.3 Recommendation	51
Reference.....	52
Appendixes.....	1

List of Figures and Tables

Figure 2.1: Curriculum focusing on Specific functions of Law Enforcement Officials12

Table 4.1 Certificate program Human Rights Courses Objective development33

Table 4.2 Post Diploma Program Human Rights Courses Objective Development35

Acronyms

AAPC- Addis Ababa Police Commission

CAT - Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

CRC - Convention on the Rights of the Child

CERD - Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of the Racial Discrimination

EPU- Ethiopian Police University

EHRC- Ethiopian Human Rights Commission

FDRE- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

HRE- Human Rights Education

ICCPR - International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

NHRI-National Human Rights Institutions

UN-United Nations

WPHRE- World Programme for Human Rights Education

Acknowledgments

The successful completion of this thesis could not have been done without the help of God. I would also like to thank my Advisor Dr. Elshaday Kifle for her unreserved contribution and support throughout this research project. My sincere thanks also to EPU and AAPC staff members in general who were hospitable and cooperative for the proper conduct of the study.

And also, I would like to thank M.s Aster Gebeyehu for her uncountable support. Last but not least, I would like to thank my wife an unforgettable and amazing experience despite the challenges we faced. Thank you all for your help, love, and support.

Abstract

The main purpose of this study was to assess the effectiveness of EPU curriculum design and delivery of human rights course in light of HRE methodology. To achieve this objective, the researcher used qualitative research design. In this study, both primary and secondary sources of data were used. Interview, focus group discussions and document analysis were used as viable instrument for data collection. The data was collected from 5 EPU instructors, and from 19 AAPC employees who were EPU students, who have deep and relevant information about the problem under study. The data gathered were analyzed by following narration of interviews as well as focus group discussion in line with the themes raised in the research questions. The study found that though human rights education is offered as a course in EPU, yet, fundamental human rights issues were not well addressed. The result of the study also portrayed that learning objectives were not compatible with human rights education methodology that is the content of the course focused on cognitive domain rather than affective and psycho motor domains. Moreover; the EPU curriculum was not effective in terms of changing the attitudes and behavior of police. Therefore, it may be concluded that causing the police to failure to respect human rights. Hence, it was recommended that the university better to revise the modules and syllabus that makes sure learning objectives well addressed the practical skills and attitudes in addition to knowledge. It may also be required to provide and follow up the execution mechanisms for tracking behavioral change of police as part of human rights education assessment.

Keywords: *Human rights education, Curriculum design and delivery*

Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 Background of the Study

As defined by the United Nations human rights education (HRE) is a process of acquiring knowledge, skills and values for communicative and claiming one's rights based on international human rights standards. It is more elaborated as:¹ *“Human rights education is training, spreading information aimed at the building of a culture of human rights through the imparting of knowledge and skills and the molding of attitudes. Human rights education promotes values, beliefs and attitudes that encourage everyone to uphold their own rights and those of others.”* It develops an understanding of everyone's common responsibility to make human rights a reality in each community.² Since then, numerous policy documents developed by United Nations (UN) affiliated agencies, international policy making bodies, regional human rights bodies and national human rights agencies have referenced HRE, proposing that the treatment of human rights themes should be present in higher educations.

Human rights education is one of the most important strategies to build human rights culture since a comprehensive education in human rights not only provides knowledge, but also imparts the skills desired to promote, protect and apply human rights in daily life. As the guidelines for national plans of action for human rights education³ notes *“there is consensus that education in and for human rights is essential and can contribute to both the reduction of human rights violations and the building of free, just and peaceful societies.”* Human rights courses should be vital to the curriculum of medical schools, law schools, universities, police and military academies, and other professional training organizations. Education has been considered as the major instrument to address inequalities by promoting equality, social justice and respect for the individual human being, which are pre-conditions for ensuring rights.⁴

The Ethiopian police university prior as college was established as an autonomous higher education institution that plays a major role in producing police professionals and leaders

¹ United Nations Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training (2011) article 2.

² Plan of Action of the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education (1995-2004), para. 2.

³ UN, Guidelines for National Plans of Action for Human Rights Education, 1997 p.12.

⁴ International Journal of Research in Education Methodology, 2014. Vol.3

who are loyal to the constitution and professionally capable.⁵ In its enabling regulation the University is granted to design and deliver undergraduate and postgraduate programs in the fields of policing and related public safety and security. Its complementary mandate to produce professionally qualified police to speed up the improvement and modernization of the police services by preserve and transmit knowledge pertaining to the profession of police. The Curriculum design is aimed providing to speed up the improvement and modernization process of the police service. However, in practice human rights violations have seen which are committed by police. This may happened as the result of the gaps in the curriculum design as well as delivery of courses in the point of human rights education methodology. Thus, the purpose of this thesis is, therefore, to assess the situation of the actual curriculum design and delivery of courses in light of human rights education methodology and subsequently to recommend possible solutions to address the problems.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

Integrating human rights education in the formal curricula and higher education play a prominent role in creating a culture of human rights and thereby reducing human rights violations.⁶ When HRE is established as an integral part of university curriculum, that is, the teaching and learning processes related to subject-matter teaching, it would be possible to strategically increase outreach capacity and create multiple and long lasting effects in terms of creating a human rights culture.⁷ Hence, human rights should be an integral part of any training or educational programme for law enforcement officials.⁸ Human rights training for police are one of the most commonly anticipated and actually employed activities for improving human rights performance of police. Whenever police perform in a way that violates human rights, the call for more and better training of police in human rights is quickly voiced.⁹

However, as so many reports indicate that practically, there are human rights violations which are committed by police. As EHRC report indicates there are acts of violation of

⁵ Ethiopian police university College establishment proclamation No.132/2007, P.2.

⁶ The contribution of HRE for the realization of human rights, see United Nations Plan of Action for the third phase (2015-2019) of the world programme for human rights education.

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (OSCE), Hereafter guidelines on human rights education for law enforcement officials, 2012.p.12.

⁹ Suntinger W. Police Training and International Human Rights Standards, March, 2020.

human rights committed by police officers. As the commission point out “*police have overreacted and unnecessarily beaten people, used tear gas, plastic and lethal bullets, and other excessive measures including on older persons and children resulting in at least one death, several bodily injuries and distress on people gathered around Menelik Square for the national celebration of Adwa.*”¹⁰ Apart from this, in October 1, 2021 in the capital city, the Addis Ababa police officers brutally beating a woman with a child at a particular place called Michael Square in Nifas-Silk Sub-city.¹¹

In cognizant with this, EHRC in its press statement stated that Addis Ababa police arbitrary arrest and detentions of political party leaders and members, members of the media and social activists without court warrant. Similarly with this, some studies have examined the practice of police in Addis Ababa. As Alemayehu concluded in his study suspects were arrested by the police without court warrants and without reasonable grounds. As he stated that most police members have a mistaken belief that they have an absolute right to physically attack anybody who they believe is a violator of the law. Some of them associate police violation of human rights with a lack of knowledge, accountability and concern for the respect of human rights principles.¹²

As a result, though there are various determinate factors that police involves in human rights violations, police training curriculum designing and delivering practices are the front variables. So, these my happened as the result of gap of curriculum design and delivery that the development of the human rights course that was not based on three core HRE competences that is knowledge, skills and behavioral change/attitude. On the other hand, the researcher could not find any specific prior studies regarding the EPU curriculum design and delivery of courses in light of human rights education methodology.

Therefore, it seems crucially important to examine the EPU curriculum and it’s actual teaching learning practices thereby to see its implication to take into account respect for and protection of human rights as crucial components of police actions. Thus, the thesis aims to

¹⁰ Ethiopian Human rights commission press-release, on 3march, 2023. Available on <https://ehrc.org/category/press-release>.

¹¹ Fana Broadcasting corporate (FBC) news, Addis Ababa, October 2, 2021.

¹² Alemayehu S. Evaluating the Application of Human Rights Principles In Crime Investigation In Ethiopia (A Case Study Of The Addis Ababa City Police), University of South Africa. October, 2010

assess the effectiveness of curriculum design and delivery of courses in light of HRE in the case of EPU. To this end, the following research questions have established.

- 1) To what extent courses learning objectives/goals align with human rights education Curricula?
- 2) To what extent courses delivery in the university fulfils human rights education methodology approaches?
- 3) How effective are the courses in terms of changing attitude and behaviour of police?
- 4) What are the challenges of police while carrying out crime investigations/ crime preventions?

1.3 Objectives of the Study

1.3.1 General Objective

The overall objective of the study is to assess the effectiveness of curriculum design and delivery of courses in light of human rights education methodology in the case of EPU.

1.3.2 Specific Objectives

With the ultimate objective in mind, the study seeks to:

- Explore the courses to what extent learning objectives aligned with with human rights education Curricula.
- Assess the extent of human rights courses delivery in the university complies with human rights education methodology approaches.
- Assessing the effectiveness of the course in terms of changing the attitude and behavior of the police.
- Assessing the challenges of police while carrying out crime investigations/ crime preventions.

1.4 Scope of the Study

The study comprises effectiveness of EPU curriculum design and delivery of courses in light of human rights education methodology. The scope of the study was limited to EPU. Thus, the scope of the study does not include other higher education institutions and regional police colleges. The reason for delimiting in the specific higher education institution is to be manageable and limited time.

The subject of the study was also delimited to the curriculum design and delivery of human rights courses in the point of view of human rights education methodology. For this reason, the researcher used purposive sampling technique.

1.6 Significance of the Study

This study is going to support EPU in giving hints about the curriculum design and delivery. It may assist the instructors how to design course and instructional objectives in line with human rights education methodology. As the result the study helps to show that the process of curriculum design courses in light of human rights education methodology demanding tasks but very useful to make courses based on human rights education methodology.

1.7 Limitations of the Study

In the process of this study some drawbacks were encountered. For instance, extra time had been needed as the results of a few of the interviewee's had canceled the fixed time to conduct the interview because of their work nature. However, an attempt was made to overcome the problems by applying extra effort and time to complete the research project. As a result, the limitation might have no major significance influence on the results of the study.

1.8 Organization of the Study

This thesis has five chapters. The first chapter is the introduction of the study, which included background to the study, statement of the problems, research questions, and objectives, significance of the study, delimitation of the study, limitation of the study and organization of the study. The second chapter deals with literature which briefs the review of the related literatures. Chapter three is about the research design and methodology of the study. Chapter four encompasses data presentation, analysis and interpretation. The last chapter presents summary; conclusion of the study and provides feasible recommendations.

Chapter Two: Review of the Related Literature

2.1 The Concept of Human Rights Education

The furthest commonly known definition of human rights education (HRE) is that presented by the United Nations, whose General Assembly passed in December 2011 a declaration on human rights education and training with the following language (Article 2)¹³ explained as: *“providing knowledge and understanding of human rights norms and principles, the values that underpin them and the mechanisms for their protection; Education through human rights, which includes learning and teaching in a way that respects the rights of both teachers and students; and education for human rights, which includes enabling persons to enjoy and exercise their rights and to respect and defend the rights of other.”*

Cognizant of this, Bajaj has pointed out that human rights education (HRE) as *“a field utilizes teaching and learning processes to educate about basic rights and for the broadening of respect for the dignity and freedom of all people(s).”*¹⁴ Drawing on the potential of grassroots level efforts to influence awareness about human rights, Amnesty International defines human rights education as a ‘deliberative, participatory process aimed at empowering individuals, groups and communities. Amnesty¹⁵ explained it more as: *“Its goal is to build a culture of respect for and action in the defense and promotion of human rights for all.”*

Therefore, human rights education is all learning about human rights, dissemination information about human rights instruments and protection mechanisms, and international human rights issues, changing of attitude and values through the transferring of knowledge

¹³ The UN policies as a key validator of HRE definitions, particularly as these have been influenced by practitioners, including NGOs such as Amnesty International, over the past decades. Thus, although the language of the documents remains general they nevertheless offer normative guidance that is based in part on input from the grassroots level.

¹⁴ Bajaj, M. Human rights Education: Theory, Research, Praxis. University of Pennsylvania Press. 2017.p.1.

¹⁵ Amnesty international 2015.

and skills and the molding of attitudes for the purpose of respect and protecting of human rights and to bring human rights culture.¹⁶

2.2 The Role of Human Rights Education

The United Nations General Assembly adopted the declaration on human rights education and training Article 1 of the declaration reiterates that *“everyone has the right to human rights education, specifically to know, seek and receive information about all human rights and fundamental freedoms; that human rights education is essential for the respect and observance of human rights and that other human rights help enable access to human rights education.”*¹⁷

The right to education is often referred to as an enabling right because it supports the protection and fulfillment of other human rights. As office the High commissioner for human rights¹⁸ explained: *‘Education is both a human right in itself and an indispensable means of realizing other human rights.’* According to the UN¹⁹, national plans of action for human rights education: *“human rights education can promote through knowledge that providing information about human rights and the mechanisms that exist to protect those rights; beliefs and attitude by promoting a human rights culture through the development of these processes; the last but not the least through action that encouraging people to defend human rights and prevent human rights abuses.”* As the guidelines outlined there is consensus that education in and for human rights is essential and can contribute to both the reduction of human rights violations and the building of culture of human rights and peaceful societies.

Following from that, the FDRE constitution, in its preamble, stressed on *“the central role of fully respecting human rights in achieving the Ethiopian national objective of building a political community founded on rule of law and capable of ensuring a lasting peace, guaranteeing a democratic order, and advancing our economic and social development.”* Thus, human rights provide a valuable basis for worthy inter-personal relations and for

¹⁶ Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights; “Human rights education and training”; available at www2.ohchr.org/english/issues/education/training/index.htm.

¹⁷ The full text of the Declaration is available at: <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N11/467/04/PDF/N1146704.pdf?OpenElement>

¹⁸ United Nations Economic and Social Council, 1999.

¹⁹ Office of the united Nations High Commissioner for Human rights: Human Rights and Law Enforcement: A Trainer’s Guide on Human Rights Professional training series No.5/add.2c A/52/469/Add.1 (20 October 1997).

making informed and proportionate decisions, from the play area to government and public policy. All these start with human rights education in schools, and at pre-primary, primary and secondary and university levels. It is by far preferable and effective to raise a person with the knowledge and attitude of human rights values.

Similarly with this, human rights education for law enforcement officials is pivotal. Accordingly the United Nations office on drugs and crime handbook on police accountability, (article 2) ²⁰ clearly outline that “*in the performance of police duty, law enforcement officials should respect and protect human dignity and maintain and uphold the human rights of all persons. Local policing is on the front stage of the legal system and invested with considerable discretion in determining balance order with liberty.*” The police are the means to execute and protect the rights of the societies, while concurrently practicing and ensuring they adhere to the laws.

Cognizant of this, the Vienna declaration and programme of action state that the management of justice, including law enforcement is essential to the full and non-discriminatory realization of human rights. It goes on to endorse education as a necessary means to ensure law enforcement officials know they are enforcing.²¹ In light of this, the plan of action for the second phase (2010-2014) of the UN WPHRE indicates that the important of human rights and international standards from an HRE perspective. The 2030 agenda for sustainable development, particularly SDG target 4.7, and WPHRE provide important frameworks for assessing the level of recognition and implementation of human rights education in law enforcement.²² United Nations instruments provides detailed guidance to law enforcement officials and the military that have a specific responsibility, as state actors, for respecting, protecting and fulfilling the human rights of those under their jurisdiction on the performance of their duties. ²³

As Tibbits (2015) had pointed out training plans provide that human rights training as compulsory for professional and promotion, and specialized training is demanded for law

²⁰ United Nations Office On Drugs And Crime: Handbook on police accountability, oversight and integrity, criminal Justice handbook series, New York, 2011.p.23.

²¹ Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action: Adopted by the World Conference on Human Rights in Vienna on 25 June 1993,

²² U.N.plan of action for the second phase (2010-2014) of the world programme for human rights education, p.4.

²³ Ibid.

enforcement officials' commerce with particularly vulnerable groups. As it is more elaborated as ²⁴: *“A general education in human rights not only offers knowledge about human rights and the mechanisms that protect them, but also informs the skills needed to promote, defend and apply human rights in daily life.”* And also, she has noted out HRE is not only aimed at the formal education sector, but has profound in the non-formal education sector; it also takes place in the training of professionals such as journalists, teachers, and law enforcement organizations. Similarly with this, Bajaj (2017) clearly pointed out that schools who are welcoming human rights achieve intended outcomes. These were more explained as:

*“Human rights friendly schools framework weaves together the intended outcomes of HRE by highlighting three prepositions linking education and human rights in a comprehensive manner: education about human rights (cognitive), education through human rights (participatory methods that create skills for active citizenship), and education for human rights (fostering learners' ability to speak out and act in the face of injustices).”*²⁵

The role of law enforcement officials in protecting and respecting the human rights of every individual is fundamental. Therefore, human rights should be an integral part of any training or educational programme for law enforcement officials. Educational programming that integrates human rights for law enforcement officials strengthens officers' understanding and capacity to respect and protect the rights of others, especially those who are left out or discriminated, such as women, children and minorities. This brings law enforcement officials closer to the societies they serve and situations them to claim their own rights.

Cognizant of this, a document prepared by the organization for security and cooperation in Europe office for democratic institutions and human rights pointed out that police training should have competences that established learner outcomes. The competences are grouped under three headings that is knowledge and understanding, attitudes and values; skills guide the development of curricula, training, learning and evaluation processes, and the preparation of trainers.

²⁴ Tibbitts, F. (2015). Curriculum Development and Review for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights education. Strasbourg: Council of Europe, UNESCO, OSCE/ODIHR, Organization of American States.

²⁵ See ²⁵ Bajaj, M. Human rights Education: Theory, Research, Praxis. University of Pennsylvania Press. 2017.p.4.

As the guide indicates the following lists specific key HRE competences that law enforcement officials possess and be reflected in the curricula.²⁶ In the knowledge and understanding learners expected to realize the history and philosophy of human rights; the function of human rights; the relationship between human rights and other ethical and moral rights systems; the societal and personal benefits of realizing human rights; and the relevant regional human rights documents; the duties of law enforcement officials as defined in specific documents: the code of conduct for law enforcement officials; the basic principles on the use of force and firearms by law enforcement officials; the principles for the protection of all persons under any form of detention or imprisonment; the declaration of basic principles of justice for victims of crime and abuse of power; the principles on the effective prevention and investigation, arbitrary and summary executions; the nature of the state's human rights obligations which includes positive and negative obligations of the state and its agents with regards to the respect, protection and fulfilment of human rights; human rights mechanisms at the international, regional and national levels, including state and non-state actors, especially those with mandates or thematic focuses related to law enforcement; what constitutes a human rights violation; causes and consequences of violations, especially in the law enforcement context; and redress mechanisms; the rights of law enforcement officials which includes redress mechanisms if they feel their rights have been violated and restrictions imposed due to their duties and powers; and absolute rights and possible limitations to human rights.²⁷

Similarly with this, the UN human rights office of the high commissioner pointed out the attitude and values of learners expected to demonstrate in human rights course. These were more clarified as:

“the in the attitude and values learners expected to demonstrate respect for oneself and respect for others based on the principle of dignity of all individuals and their human rights, as well as on equality principles; personal and professional engagement in building a culture respectful of human rights; Interest in working collaboratively with others to promote human rights in and

²⁶ Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human rights: Human Rights and Law Enforcement: A Trainer's Guide on Human Rights Professional training series No.5/add.2c A/52/469/Add.1 (20 October 1997).p.23-27.

²⁷ Ibid.

beyond one's own environment; values human rights and justice; recognition of one's own attitudes and prejudices.”²⁸

Following with this, the UN human rights office of the high commissioner outlined that learners expected to demonstrate human rights values and principles. In the skill learners anticipated to respect for human rights in the exercise of duties. Particularly, police officers expected to perform his/ her duties in accordance with human rights standards while resisting political interference or prejudice of any type, particularly in crucial moments when: using force; carrying out arrests and detention; performing searches and carrying out surveillance; engaging in the prevention and detection of crime. And also, the police expected to able to identify important human rights issues relating to gender, religion, disability and other social concerns of direct relevance to key areas of their duties, and to react accordingly; apply discretion with due regard to human rights, including being aware of issues relating to vulnerable groups and power relationships.²⁹

2.3 HRE Curriculum

As office for democratic Institutions and Human rights (OSCE) highlighted that the term curriculum is usually associated with a bodily document such as a textbook, syllabus, teacher's guide, or learning package. For professional educators, yet, the word is usually more broadly defined. The term refers to a set of plans, aims, activities, or outcomes that are delivered in a variety of ways and in different settings. According to David G. Armstrong (1989) definition “*Curriculum is a master plan for selecting content and organizing learning experiences for the purpose of changing and developing learners' behaviors and insights.*” The curriculum denotes all the teaching-learning process that guided and directed by the school environment.

As Taba(1962)³⁰ clearly defined that “*the curriculum is the plans made for guiding learning in education institutions or organizations, usually represented in retrievable documents of several levels of generality, and the implementation of those plans in the classroom; those experiences take place in a learning environment that also influences what is learned.*” The curriculum generally consists of a scope or breadth of content in a given course/subject area

²⁸ Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action: Adopted by the World Conference on Human Rights in Vienna on 25 June 1993, p.24.

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ Taba, H. Curriculum Development: Theory and Practice. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Inc.1962.

and a sequence for learning. The central issue of curriculum development is to allocate the contents and methods that are seen as relevant for the challenges in the learners' present and future life. Taking all these points together, the curriculum is seen as a composite entire the learner, the teacher, teaching and learning methodologies, anticipated and unanticipated experiences, outputs and outcomes possible within learning or organizations or institution.

Figure2.1: Curriculum focusing on Specific functions of Law Enforcement Officials

Function	Competencies	What is needed to attain proficiency
Arrest	The ability to carry out an arrest in compliance with international / regional / national human rights standards	<p>Knowledge</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Essence of the right to liberty and security (ICCPR art. 9) • National law and procedures relevant to arrest • The rights of the person(s) arrested • Rights, obligations and duties of a law enforcement official • What constitutes a human rights violation during arrest <p>Values and Attitudes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ability to react accordingly • Capacity to act in a non-discriminatory way • Respect for the dignity of all persons <p>Skills</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discretion: the freedom and ability to analyse a situation and decide what should be done, especially under stress • Proportionality: ability to evaluate the consequences of actions. Do I arrest or not and what would be the consequences? Do my means correspond to the aims? Are the aims legitimate? • Ability to balance the situation in the event of a clash between different human rights

(Source: Adapted from OSCE office for democratic Institutions and Human rights, guidelines on human rights for law enforcement, 2012.p.39.)

As the OSCE indicates that the inclusion of human rights issues in the curriculum for law enforcement officials spans the full period of the training and is linked with other courses, so as to ensure that trainees successfully achieve human rights competencies across the full

range of operational and administrative duties, regardless of their rank.³¹ The curriculum takes into account the diversity of law enforcement and all other officials and is accessible to all learners, especially women and individuals who belong to minority groups or who have disabilities.

As office for democratic institutions and human rights (OSCE) emphasized that “*human rights education curriculum is outcomes-based and reflects key human rights competencies for each of the categories of knowledge and understanding, attitudes and values, and skills required by law enforcement officials.*”³² Therefore, in order to achieve the desired goal and objectives in the curriculum, law enforcement officials training program in colleges and universities should be aligned with the general education program of human rights education curriculum to build the capacity of polices, the curriculum should include human rights values and principles, to cultivate the behavior of students in a proper manner that enable students to exercise their rights and protect others rights.

2.4 Guiding Principles for Developing HRE curriculum Curricula

The Danish Institute for human rights suggested³³ the following guiding principles for developing HRE curricula. The first principle is bringing a human rights lens to education sector. The second guiding principle for HRE curriculum development is equal treatment and non-discrimination. Ensure that the treatment of vulnerable groups and specific groups of rights-holders in the curriculum is based on equality and non-discrimination, and adequately reflect the specific rights pertaining to these groups.³⁴ The third guiding principle is use taxonomies in the development of learning outcomes that is focused on trying to understand how people think and learn in order to understand how to teach effectively in terms of knowledge, attitudes and skills. And also, learning objectives should arrange in a hierarchy from lowest to highest levels of cognitive processing.³⁵

The fourth guiding principle for HRE curriculum development is going for furthering the status of HRE in the binding part of the curriculum. When the status of HRE binding the

³¹ OSCE office for democratic Institutions and Human rights, guidelines on human rights for law enforcement,2012.p.12.

³² OSCE office for democratic Institutions and Human rights, guidelines on human rights for law enforcement,2012.p.23.

³³ The Danish Institute for human rights: Guide on human rights education

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ Ibid.

part of the curriculum then HRE learning outcomes will be prioritize in favor of other themes.³⁶ The fifth guiding principle understands the educational contexts in which in developing HRE curriculum. This includes the police curriculum in all its forms, curriculum development processes and actors, and the opportunities and challenges for integrating HRE in the police curriculum.³⁷ The six guiding principle is foster an inclusive process of curriculum development. In keeping with a human rights-based approach, encourage the law enforcement ministry or commission to engage duty bearers, rights holders, and other stakeholders in the curriculum development process. These processes should be participatory and transparent and involve capacity development in HRE, as necessary. The last but not least guiding principle is developing a comprehensive HRE framework. As the Danish institute for human rights precisely expressed HRE frame work as:

*“Developing comprehensive HRE framework with over all educational aims, content or competence areas, and concrete learning outcomes with pairs of knowledge and skills and list of suggested teaching methodologies can serve as the reference point for curriculum development strategy and link with other policies addressing school operation and management.”*³⁸

In general, in the curriculum development, it needs to develop learning outcomes that incorporate the domains of knowledge /understanding, skills/ behavior and values/ attitudes yet it should not be able to address all three of these domains in every single lesson, but can aim to address them across the lessons.

2.5 Human Rights Education Learning Objectives

Instructional objectives are statements that describe the types of behavior students are expected to perform following instruction. Instructional objectives also called learning objectives, learning outcomes, behavioral objectives, and performance objectives.³⁹ Similar with this, United Nations human rights office of the high commissioner pointed out *“the learning objectives are outcome statements explicitly capturing what knowledge, skills and attitudes the learners should be able to show as a consequence of their*

³⁶ Ibid.

³⁷ ibid.

³⁸ Ibid.

³⁹ Centre for Teaching Excellence, University of Waterloo, ‘Bloom’s Taxonomy’ at: <https://uwaterloo.ca/centre-for-teaching-excellence/teaching-resources/teaching-tips/planning-courses-and-assignments/course-design/blooms-taxonomy>

participation in the course.” The learning objectives should address the needs identified through the needs assessment and should contribute logically to the achievement of the course’s overall goal/s and desired result/s.⁴⁰ It cannot be stressed enough that learning objectives should express what it is expected that the learners will be able to do as a result of the learning process not what the instructors will do during the course design. The learning objectives relay to changes at the level of the individual that can be directly attributed to the training course, and at the end of the course the teacher/the instructor should be able to evaluate their achievement.

As Nitko(1996)⁴¹ clearly pointed out the educational objectives of a given educational system embedded in the educational process at the different levels need to be achieved by the learners of the respective levels. To achieve the desired behavioral changes the primary function of education and appropriate contents are offered. Delivering instructing is not an end; what is taught must be appraised to know the achievement of objectives and to serve the several functions of educational assessments.

2.5.1. Guidelines for Writing Instructional Objectives

Payne (1997)⁴² suggested the following six instructional objectives guidelines. The first is objectives should begin with an action verb: Action verbs such as write, measure, draw, define, identify, name, demonstrate, organize, prepare, design and etc tells us what the students will be doing when demonstrating his/her achievement of the objective. When formulating instructional objectives, don’t use general/broad terms such as understand, know, comprehend, appreciate etc. As he raised questions that how can we measure whether a student has understood a certain lesson we have taught. Payne more elaborated it as: *“something may be only explaining its meaning whereas for teacher x, it may be different. General/broad terms are open to many interpretations that carry out different meanings. Yet objectives should not mean different things to different people rather should convey a single meaning.”*

⁴⁰United Nations human rights office of the high commissioner: From Planning A Manual On Human Rights Training Methodology, Professional Training Series No. 6/Rev.1,2000,p.23

⁴¹ Nitko,J. Educational testing and Measurement: Introduction. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, inc.1996,p.6.

⁴² See Payne,D.A(1997). Applied Educational Assessment: Belmont Wadsworth publishing company.p.104-106.

The second suggestion of Payne is that objectives should be stated in unambiguous terms. As he outlined objectives should not mean different things to different people. Ambiguous terms such as to know, to understand, and to appreciate. The third proposed suggestion is that objectives should be stated in terms of student's behavior. As he has pointed out objectives should not describe teachers behavior/activities rather measure and evaluate validity must articulate precisely what we expect students to be able to do at the end of a course or a unit of instruction.⁴³

The fourth suggestion is that objectives should be stated in terms of observable and measurable changes in students' behavior. An effective formulation of learning objectives for a course should specify: who will change learners, what will change the knowledge, skills and attitudes of learners, when will it change the expected time frame for changes to occur, how much change that is the types of changes or level of change expected.⁴⁴ The fifth recommendation of Payne stated that objectives should be unitary or stated singly. Each objective should relate to only a single process or action. Compound objectives are likely to lead to inconsistent measurement. The last but not the least suggestion is that objectives should be realistic in a given context. To recapitulate, whether the instructional objectives you have formulated for your daily lesson planning are good, make sure that are SMART. Where: s-specific; m-measurable; a-attainable; r-realistic/relevant and t-time specific.⁴⁵

As United Nations human rights office of the high commissioner manual on human rights training methodology indicates that *"in order to formulate "SMART" objectives, it is essential to identify the type of learning the training manager expects to occur, and to use action verbs which refer to concrete, measurable actions the learner can perform."*⁴⁶ UN human rights office suggest the following action verbs to use for objectives relating to learning new knowledge, such as list, name, describe, explain, tell and identify, whereas for objectives relating to learning new skills, use verbs such as apply, compare, create, decide, develop, demonstrate, examine, implement, plan, select and solve. While for objectives relating to changing attitudes, learning is often measured by observing

⁴³Payne. Applied Educational Assessment: 1997, p.107.

⁴⁴ Ibid.

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ *ibid.*

behavior. Objectives combining attitudes with action can be formulated: demonstrate respect for colleagues by seeking their opinion on related matters and take action after identifying a human rights violation.⁴⁷ Therefore, writing the instructional objectives are guides to measure the learners knowledge, skills and attitudes.

2.6 Human Rights Education Methodology

As defined by Bhatt methods of teaching are general means, manners, ways, processes, or steps by which a particular order is compulsory upon teaching or presentation of the activities.⁴⁸The idea that different people learning process accumulation and organise information in different ways is very common. There are lots of different theories about teaching methodologies and learning styles and abundant literature and research suggesting that educators should be aware of learner's preferred learning styles and adjust their teaching to suit individual learners.⁴⁹

There is some research that suggests the worth tailoring learning activities based on the content being taught, rather than the apparent learning preferences of students. It is best to try and use a variety of different teaching approaches. All learners are expected to be more engaged and focused if they have opportunities to process the learning in different ways. Bloom and his colleagues categorized learning into three separate domains: the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains. Today, the domains tend to describe in terms of knowledge, attitudes and skills.⁵⁰ The cognitive domain focusses on the acquisition of knowledge and associated intellectual skills. The affective domain focusses on the attitudes and values that contribute to and shape effective learning. The psychomotor domain focusses on the physical skills and abilities that are needed in order to perform a particular task.⁵¹

Similarly with this, Hopkins (1998) defines learning as it is a relatively permanent change/ modification of the behaviour of the learner as a result of practice. These were more

⁴⁷Supra, note 19.p.25.

⁴⁸ Bhatt,D. Modern Methods Of Teaching. Madan Sachdeva. , New Delhi,2002.P.15

⁴⁹ Chick,N 'Learning Styles', Center for Teaching, Vanderbilt University. Accessed at: <https://cft.vanderbilt.edu/guides-sub-pages/learning-styles-preferences/>

⁵⁰ Vanderbilt University Center for Teaching, 'Bloom's Taxonomy' <https://cft.vanderbilt.edu/guides-sub-pages/blooms-taxonomy/> ; Mary Forehand, Bloom's Taxonomy in Emerging Perspectives on Learning, Teaching and Technology <https://cdn.vanderbilt.edu/vu-wp0/wp-content/uploads/sites/59/2010/06/12092513/BloomsTaxonomy-mary-forehand.pdf>.

⁵¹ See supra, note18.

explained as: “*learning refers to change in knowledge that is the development of the mind or cognitive development, skills which is development of the muscle or hand (Psychomotor development), and attitudes which inculcates the development of the heart that is affective development*”.⁵² As the Danish institute for human rights indicates that outcome-based curriculum has a focus on learning outcomes. It recognizes that learning outcomes should include the domains of knowledge, skills and attitudes. It has a stronger orientation towards the how of learning and, thus, the use of teaching methodologies that will allow all learners to achieve the expected outcomes. This competence would be based on knowledge about different categories of human rights, skills in identifying a problem in, for instance, the school and developing a strategy to address it, and an attitude of responsibility and wanting to make a positive difference.⁵³

Knowles (1980) laid out a set of four learning assumptions specifically relevant to adult learners and compared them with the traditional expectations of child learners. Knowles’ work focussed on adult learning as distinct from the education of children. However, he has noted that educators of children and young people including primary, secondary as well as tertiary teachers have found that his learning assumptions also apply to a younger audience in some situations. Knowles thus concluded that both pedagogy and andragogy remain useful models that should be used alongside one another. He suggests that the models be considered as existing on either end of a spectrum, rather than being entirely separate from one another⁵⁴.

Most scholars and practitioners agree that HRE must include both content and processes related to teaching human rights (Flowers; Meintjes; Tibbitts as cited in Bajaj (2017). And also, furthest literature in the field deliberates the need for HRE to comprise goals related to cognitive (content), attitudinal values or skills, and action- oriented components (Tibbitts cited in Bajaj, 2017).⁵⁵

⁵²Hopkins,K.D.Educational and Psychological Measurement and Evaluation,4th ed.New York:Macmillan publishing company,1998,162-167.

⁵³ Supra note 20,p.10

⁵⁴ Knowles, M *The Modern Practice of Adult Education: From Pedagogy to Andragogy* (1980, Cambridge, Englewood Cliffs) and later works.

⁵⁵ Flowers, the human rights education handbook: Effective practices for learning, action, and change. human rights resource Center, University of Minnesota2000,p.3.

As Flowers (2000) indicates that learning begins with the experience of the students (i.e., their knowledge, skills, values and lived experience of human rights). After the students have shared their experience, they analyse that experience and look for patterns. And then, to complement the experience of the students, new information and theory from experts are added or new ideas are created collectively. Students need to practise what they have learned, practise new skills, and plan for action and finally, afterwards students apply in action what they have learned.⁵⁶

Human rights education not based on the three pillars of knowledge transfer, attitude-shaping and skills-building is incomplete. Attitude-shaping and skills-building without knowledge transfer lack the informational basis. Knowledge transfer and attitude-shaping make no sense without the necessary skills to implement human rights. Knowledge transfer and skills-building without attitude-shaping might even be used to work against human rights. It should sensitize students and make them aware of their own potential to support human rights or to violate them. Therefore, consider the three domains when developing learning outcomes is useful for students. Often, learning outcomes focus on acquiring new knowledge. However, principally in workplace and police training settings, changing attitudes and learning new skills are crucial to an effective learning experience. As the high commissioner for human rights human rights and law enforcement training manual point out the following selected teaching methods that could be implemented in a way that enhances the students' active learning teaching methodologies for police education.⁵⁷

2.6.1 Presentation and Discussion

Lecture based explanation of topics. This method is particularly employed in the sessions that require knowledge based learning on human rights contents and instruments. Presentation usually accompanied by visual aids. Following the presentation an informal discussion is useful to clarify points and facilitate the process of translating ideas into practice.⁵⁸ Discussion is a sharing and weighing of the sides: which are as many as there are conflicting interests and opinions. It is a process of collective decision making.

⁵⁶ Flowers, the human rights education handbook: Effective practices for learning, action, and change. human rights resource Center, University of Minnesota 2000, p.52.

⁵⁷ Payne. Applied Educational Assessment: 1997, p.9-11.

⁵⁸ Ibid.

2.6.2 Panel Discussion

The formation of panel of presenters possibly following a presentation by one or more of them has frequently been shown to be a useful training device. This approach is effective when the presenters have expertise in different aspects of a topic, because of their professional backgrounds. Preferably, human rights experts should be comprised together with experts in police practice and police training.⁵⁹ In this approach one presenter should act as facilitator, to enable the widest possible participation, to ensure that participant's needs are met, and to provide an overview or summary at the conclusion of the discussion.

2.6.3 Working Groups

A path may be divided into a number of small groups of five or six participants. Each group is given a topic to discuss problem to solve or something concrete to produce, within a short time period. An instructor may, where necessary, be assigned to each group. The course is then reconvened and the results of the deliberation of each group are presented by a spokesperson for the group. The course participants may then discuss the topics and the response of each group.⁶⁰

2.6.4 Case Studies

Case studies must be based on credible and realistic situations which are not too complex and which focus on two or three main issues. Case studies should require participants to exercise their policing skills in responding to them, and to apply human rights and human rights standards. And also, experienced law enforcement officials expected to exercise command and management skills.⁶¹ Case studies are provided to engage participants in an in-depth analysis of problems. In the case study, participants are required to develop a case story from real-life experience. It reinforces participants' critical and analytical ability and also useful to impact their attitudes. It requires a practical skills building process to enable them understand human rights problems and apply appropriate solutions. Since a number of issues may arise through case studies, it is important that the facilitator keeps an eye and lead the discussion to stay in focus. Case studies are used to help us to see how the complexities of real life affect results.

⁵⁹ Ibid.p.10

⁶⁰ United Nations Office On Drugs And Crime: Handbook on police accountability, oversight and integrity, criminal Justice handbook series, New York, 2011.p.11

⁶¹ Ibid.p.11

2.6.5 Problem-Solving/Brainstorming

Problem solving session can be conducted as intensive exercises to seek solutions to problems which are both theoretical and practical. Students require a problem to be analyzed and then solutions to be developed. And also, brainstorming inspires and requires a high degree of participation and it stimulates those involved to maximum creativity.⁶² Problem solving method is a type of teaching in which students use facts, concepts, principles & generalization in the process of solving problems & making decision. It enables the students' to develop problem solving & decision making skill.

Brainstorming helps generate as many ideas as possible promoting the involvement of most learners. Participants raise ideas spontaneously and each idea is recorded. Brainstorming actively occupies students in the learning process and encourages full participation as one person ideas spark off ideas for another.

2.6.6 Simulation/Role-playing

Simulation demands participants to achieve a duty or tasks in a realistic situation simulating real life. In the context of human rights and law enforcement, simulation or role playing exercises may be used to exercise a skill or to enable participants to experience situations yet unfamiliar to them.⁶³ A written factual situation is distributed in advance, and each participant is allocated a particular role that is police officer, the victim, the witness and the judge.

A role-play is a short drama played by the members of a group. It is an unrehearsed drama whereby participants are given specific roles that they should act out. The description of the role-play can be given by the facilitator and participants are given some time to prepare and be creative in how they portray the characters. It is an entertaining process for the youth and also useful to enhance their skills of expression and critical thinking. Simulated teaching is the method of learning and training, which changes the ability in an individual regarding problem solving behavior.

⁶² Ibid, p11.

⁶³ See supra note 32.p.11.

2.6.7 Field Trips

Filed group visits to relevant institutions or locations such as a police station, a refugee camp, and detention center can provide valuable perspective. The purpose of the visit should be explained in advance, and the participants should be instructed to pay critical attention and to record their observations for a subsequent discussion.⁶⁴ Visits need to have a clear focus relevant to the content of courses. All visits need careful planning and preparation. Field trip is the type of teaching method in which the student investigates issues through observation & interview.

2.6.8 Practical Exercise

Practical exercise involves the assignment of trainees to apply and demonstrate particular professional skills in supervised procedures. Police may be required to draft human rights standing orders on a particular aspect of police work. Police trainees may be assigned to draft a lesson plan, or to deliver a session in the course itself.⁶⁵ Practical learning is a process that involves a small group working on real problems, taking action, and learning as individuals, as a team, and as an organization. Action learning is particularly effective for solving complex problems that may appear unsolvable.

2.6.9 Debates

Debate is a process that comprises formal discussion on a particular issue. In a debate, contrasting arguments are put forward to argue for opposing viewpoints. It is a proper type of discussion, often with a moderator and an audience, in addition to the debate contestants. Debating is also found to improve learning outcomes. The direct positive effects include greater knowledge acquisition by reinforcing already taught materials.⁶⁶ The teaching of human rights education must adopt methods that promote reasoning, critical thinking, and enable police to develop social cohesion and to learn how to live harmoniously within diversified society.

Therefore, the above teaching methodology encompasses the three domains that is knowledge which includes presentation, discussion, panel discussion, and round table. While a skill which contains case study, simulation, and practical exercise. Whereas

⁶⁴ Ibid, p.11.

⁶⁵ See supra note 32.p.11.

⁶⁶ Ibid. p.11.

attitudes which comprises role playing, field trip working group and problem solving. So we can say that the methodology is complete. In general, applying the above methods in human rights education methodologies in police training is so crucial.

2.8 Empirical Studies

So far, few researchers have studied curriculum of EPU, yet there are gaps seen which need to be filled by this study. For instance, Samuel (2020) has assessed crime investigation curriculum at EPU: practice and challenges. His study mainly focused on assessing the practice and identifying the existing challenges on the crime investigation curriculum practice. As to their functions, he concluded that the overall crime investigation curriculum practice at EPU has multiple problems and struggling to educate competent investigators that are capable to handle present-day crime and criminals. Alemayehu also assessed the application of human rights principles in crime Investigation in Ethiopia (A case study of the Addis Ababa city police). As to the investigation function of police in Addis Ababa, his finding states that police do not focus on gathering more sophisticated information about the suspects. Rather, they focus more on gathering oral information from the suspects and using it as evidence. This is particularly true when the suspect is under arrest. It did not specifically explore the why police committed to the misconduct behavior in that endeavor which are the central aim of this study. Hence, the thesis did not cover the problem that is intended to be addressed in this study. Apart from this, his study limited to crime investigation work, but the present study includes crime investigation, crime prevention and public safety and community policing schools' programmes. Moreover, in his study there are limitations in identifying gaps in curriculum design and it did not specifically explore the curriculum design and delivery of courses in light of human rights education methodology and the course effectiveness in terms of changing the attitude and behavior of the police in that endeavor which are the prominent aim of this study.

This thesis therefore intends to adequately examine the situation of the actual practice of curriculum design and delivery of courses in light of human rights education methodology in the case of EPU.

Chapter Three: Research Design and Methodology

This chapter deals with the research design and methodology of the study that includes research design and types of data, sampling techniques, instruments of data collection, procedures of data collection, method of data analysis, and ethical consideration.

3.1 Research Design and Types of Data

This study focuses on assessing the effectiveness of curriculum design and deliver in light of human rights education methodology in the case of EPU. To achieve this objective, qualitative research method was applied. Hence, based on the research problems intended to be addressed in this study, qualitative research approach was applied since this approach is crucial for an in-depth and detailed explanation and understanding of the problem from multiple perspectives.⁶⁷ In line with this, qualitative research approach brings the researcher in close contact with the participants in order to capture their perspectives on the meaning of reality.⁶⁸

For the study, both primary and secondary data had been applied. The primary data which includes data gathered through interviews and focus group discussion. Primary data can provide information about virtually any aspect of our life and surroundings.⁶⁹ The primary data are the first and most direct recording of a situation. Apart from this, analysis of relevant documents including human rights education, the importance of human rights to police, human rights education methodology, review of technical products (police training modules and courses, syllabus, curriculum frame work, tools, technical guidelines, etc.). And review of other relevant documents such as UN human rights training manuals, world programme for human rights education, human rights education and police, national laws and regulations on the course was consulted. Following with that, secondary data were used in the study that encompasses data collected from relevant books, thesis and other documents related to the problem under study. Because using secondary data is making an assessment of the quality of the information or opinions provided.

⁶⁷ Creswell, Research design, Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Approaches, (4th ed. 2014) p.32.

⁶⁸ Lodico, M, Spaulding D, and Voegtle K. Methods in Educational Research from theory to Practice 2nd ed. Jossey-Bass, 2010. p.34

⁶⁹ Walliman, N. Research Methods. The basics. 2010. p.70

3.2 Sampling Techniques

In this research non-probability sampling specifically purposeful technique was used. Because it is effective to deeply understand the research questions through collecting data mainly from participants that have sufficient knowledge and essential data about the research problem.⁷⁰ And also, purposive sampling helps the researcher to select the participants who have key knowledge or information related to the purpose of the study.⁷¹ Purposive sampling is a feature of qualitative research when the sample is needed for specific purpose for instance, a group of instructors and police officers who have distinguished experiences in the area and are critical informants that may satisfy the researcher's needs. Thus, in this sampling technique the researcher selected the study participants taking into account the purpose of the study.

The purpose of the study is examining the effectiveness of EPU curriculum design of human rights course in the lens of human rights education methodology. Thus, to achieve the objective, the researcher had selected primarily who are directly concerned individuals and entities as the source of data and from those sources enable to meet the purpose of the study because the sources are relatively they have noticeable knowledge and information to give important data regarding the research problem. Specifically, EPU certificate and post graduate diploma programme of crime prevention and public safety, crime investigation and community policing schools programme were selected. The reason for delimiting in the specific platform is because of the nature of their work, the trainees of the programme are they are forefront to the public and their day to day activities have a linkage with communities.

3.3 Instruments of Data Collection.

To collect necessary data for the study, three instruments of data collection were used which includes interview, focus group discussion and document analysis.

3.3.1 Interview

In this study semi structured type of interview was applied. This is because it allows the researcher to develop and ask key open-ended questions that address the research

⁷⁰ Supra, note 71, p. 32

⁷¹ Supra, note 72. p.34.

problems⁷². The interview permits greater depth of response which is not possible through any other means. And also, it helps to ensure that the responses are accurate. It also allows for the researcher to act as an observer, giving the interviewer the opportunity to focus on nonverbal cues.⁷³ Such data collection include narratives from individuals about the reasons they are unable to perform and to get experts view. Accordingly, 15 individuals were interviewed to gather the necessary and relevant data. It includes 5 lecturers from EPU community policing, crime investigation and crime prevention and public security schools and program managers and quality assurance experts. The researcher developed key and open-ended questions (topic guide) and administered to purposefully selected study participants. The interview questions mainly focus on the curriculum design and delivery of HRE methodology, teaching methods, and human rights education instructional/learning objective, significance of human rights education for law enforcement and students assessment.

Apart from this, interview was conducted with 10(ten) AAPC police officers. The interview questions encompasses the effectiveness of the EPU human rights course in terms of changing behaviors and attitude of police and challenges that police face while carrying out crime investigations/crime prevention. Specifically, the practice of police crime investigation and prevention, police point of view on in degrading treatments, arbitrary arrests and detention, non-discrimination, the right to life and challenges or difficulties that police face while carrying out crime investigations. The reason why focuses on the above specific thematic area is that because of the problems are so sever as so many report indicates and mentioned in the statement of the problems.

And also, the researcher set the number of interviewees in the above manner by using two criterions. The first is that the interviewees have relatively better knowledge of the research problem that had taken more training and to get most important information. In other words, they are directly concerned about the research problem and relatively, they are in better exposure to give relevant and necessary data to address the issue for the study. The second is that the data collected from such number of interviewees was manageable for effective analysis and interpretation.

⁷² Supra note 70.p.72

⁷³ Dantzker, Hunter, and Quinn. Supra, note 71, p.340.

3.3.2 Focus Group Discussion

In light of the interview, focus group discussion was also conducted with 9(nine) individuals in two teams which were EPU graduates and now Addis Ababa police commission crime investigation, and crime prevention and public safety directorate police officers. This tool was used to collect data which could not be covered by the interviews. Under focus group discussion interview the interviewer had the freedom to decide the manner and sequence in which the questions that was asked and has also the freedom to explore reasons and motives.⁷⁴ It is also important to generate collective memory of the participants which saves the possibility of forgetting relevant information and to confirm the information obtained from individual interviewees.

In qualitative research the researcher has discretion to select study participants that can give necessary data to achieve the purpose of the study. Taking this in to consideration, the researcher had divided the police officers into two groups who are the position of crime investigation in one team, and community policing and crime prevention police officer in other team. The aim of making almost all the participants to be those who engaged in the two positions is that because of their work have day to day accesses with the entire society, suspected and accused persons in the discharging of their duties.

The other reason to take into consideration was the ability to communicate, had taken more training and better exposure to the problem of the study. The focus group discussion questions mainly focused on the effectiveness of the EPU human rights course in terms of changing behaviors and attitude of police and challenges that police face while carrying out crime investigations/crime prevention. Specifically, the practice of police investigation, police point of view on degrading treatments, arbitrary arrests and detention, non-discrimination, the right to life and challenges or difficulties that police face while carrying out crime investigations.

3.3.3 Document Analysis

The last but not the least data collection tool in the study was document analysis. Analysis of relevant documents includes review of documents related to the project, including human rights education methodology, review of technical products (police training modules and

⁷⁴ Kothari, C.R. Research methodology, methods and techniques, second revised edition, new age international publishers. (2004), pp.98.

courses, syllabus, curriculum frame work, tools, technical guidelines). And review of other relevant documents such as UN human rights training manuals, world programme for human rights education, HRE curriculum, human rights education and police, national laws and regulations on the subject were consulted. Furthermore, supplementary documents such as books and thesis on the subject matter were used.

3.4 Procedure of Data Collection

Procedurally, first the researcher had clearly pointed out the purpose of the interview and the focus group discussion before commencing the discussion. This helps to reduce possible errors that result from misunderstanding of the interviewees get informed about their responses that uses only for academic purpose rather than for any other purpose. The interview and focus group discussion questions were first prepared in English and communicated in local language, which were Amharic to avoid communication barriers.

And then, the interview was conducted with purposively selected EPU, and previous students of EPU now who are Addis Ababa police commission employees. Specifically, the researcher interviewed with selected crime investigation, and prevention and public safety and community policing lecturers, quality assurance experts, and human rights commission education experts. Following that, researcher undertaken focus group discussion with Addis Ababa police commission crime investigation, crime prevention and public safety police and community policing police officers.

3.5 Method of Data Analysis

All the data collected were qualitative. Thus, the analysis is followed narration of interviews as well as focus group discussion in line with the themes raised in the research questions. And findings from the document analysis were then being reported using thorough narratives which include literature review, methods, analyses, including findings and then conclusions with theoretical implications. The data collected from secondary sources were carefully analyzed, and used to supplement the interviews and focus group discussions.

3.6 Ethical Consideration

All participation in this research was voluntary and participants of the study were given a full description of the study before deciding to participate. The information collected was

kept confidential. The study was conducted straightforwardly, and all the data analyzed was reported in the study.

Chapter Four: Presentation, Analysis and Interpretation of Data

Introduction

The EPU was established through regulations No. 132/2007 as an autonomous higher education institution that plays a major role in producing police who have required knowledge, skill and attitude by offering quality, relevant and adequate education and training. As such the EPU is granted a broad mandate to design and implement specialized and upgrading training programs in various aspects of policing functions that articulated in article 5(3) of its establishment regulation. While designing of the curricula the university should provide skills, knowledge, and attitudinal change of individuals to transform their own lives and realities so that they reflect human rights norms and values. Thus, in light of this theoretical framework, the university practices in designing and delivery of courses and effectiveness of the course in this chapter have been carefully examined based on data collected through interviews, focus group discussion and document analysis.

4.1 The Practice of EPU Learning Objectives/goals Alignment with Human Rights Human Rights Education Curricula

4.1.1 Human Rights Standards and Mechanisms Explicitly Incorporated in Mandatory Course of the EPU Curricula

As the interviewees⁷⁵ and the documents⁷⁶ indicates that HRE is offered as a separate course in EPU for certificate cadet, crime investigation and crime prevention and public safety as well as advanced post diploma programs and discussed as follows.

4.1.1.1 Certificate program cadet, Crime Investigation and Prevention and Public Safety School

As all the interviews, focus group discussants and the documents show that for certificate program, EPU offered human rights course in the nomenclature of “Constitution and human rights.”⁷⁷ EPU constitution and human rights course, the module organized under two sub units and six chapters. The first sub unit deals about constitution and has three chapters. The

⁷⁵ Interview with Commandar Sefiew A; Crime prevention and public security studies college director and FDRE constitution and policing course instructor, `Chief Inspector Worku Fulea; Certificate programme department head, chief instructor Birhanu Buta, crime investigation head, Chief inspector Sisay M; FDRE Constitution and policing” cadets programme certificate and advance diploma crime investigation instructor (Sendafa may,2023).

⁷⁶ EPU Cadets School Certificate programme: Constitution and Human rights Module November, 2020 and Post Graduate Diploma Program: FDRE Constitution and policing” December, 2010.

⁷⁷ Interviews and focus group participants of AAPC police officers and investigators, and EPU instructors, May 2023; EPU Cadets School Certificate programme: Constitution and human rights module November, 2020.

first chapter deals about the essence of constitution, features of constitution, and types of constitution. The second chapter enlightens development of Ethiopian constitution, purpose of the constitution and constitutional principles and the third chapter informs about state structure and division of powers. The second sub unit enlightens about human rights and police and organized under three chapters. The first chapter tells about the essence of human rights, characteristics of human rights, limitations and derogations of human rights. The second chapter deals with history of human rights in Ethiopia, international conventions, the practice of human rights in Ethiopia. The third chapter focuses on human rights and police which encompass core functions of police, human rights and police service, and human rights issues related to the functions of police.⁷⁸

So that providing human rights education enables the learners to enjoy their own rights and discharge their responsibilities by respecting and protecting of other persons rights. According to the UN, national plans of action for human rights education, human rights education plays a pivotal role in providing information about human rights and the mechanisms that exist to protect and encouraging people to defend human rights violations.⁷⁹ Particularly, human rights education is essential for law enforcement officials to the full and non-discriminatory realization of human rights.⁸⁰ As mentioned in chapter two above, law enforcement officials expected to attain the competences and proficiency; the ability to carry out an arrest in compliance with international /regional /national human rights standards, respect for the dignity of all persons, capacity to act in a non-discriminatory way.⁸¹

As review of the course syllabi of constitution and human rights course reveals that major human rights issues are incorporated, yet it lacks valuable contents such as: values of human rights, human rights principles, human rights enforcement mechanisms, human rights of vulnerable groups, state obligations in relation to human rights, the role of the societies and non-governmental organizations in respecting and protecting human rights.

⁷⁸ EPU Cadets School Certificate programme: Constitution and human rights module November, 2020.

⁷⁹ United Nations General Assembly, Guidelines for National Plans of Action for Human Rights Education, UN AOR, 52nd sess, 5, UN Doc A/52/469/Add.1 (20 October 1997).

⁸⁰ Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action: Adopted by the World Conference on Human Rights in Vienna on 25 June 1993.

⁸¹ OSCE office for democratic Institutions and Human rights, guidelines on human rights for law enforcement, 2012.p.39.

4.1.1.2. Post Graduate Diploma Program Crime Investigation and Prevention and Public Safety School

As all the interviews, focus group discussants and the documents show that for post graduate diploma, EPU offered human rights as “FDRE Constitution and Policing” course.⁸² The module structured under five chapters. The first chapter deals about politics, government and policing which encompasses theoretical perspective of politics, overview of state and government functions, forms and branches of government; democratic system and rule of law and the linkage between politics, government and police. The second chapter contains concepts and principles of constitution.

The third chapter enlightens the FDRE constitution which comprises general provisions and fundamental provisions of FDRE constitution, fundamental rights and freedoms, state structure and division of power in FDRE constitution, institutional and functional aspects of the FDRE constitution, and state of emergency and constitutional amendment. The fourth chapter deals with human rights and humanitarian law which includes basic concepts of human rights, basic human rights instruments, and international humanitarian law, human rights and police leaders. The fifth chapter deals with FDRE Policies and strategies which comprises introduction to FDRE policies and strategies, economic policies, strategies and programs, capacity building programs, foreign affairs and national security policy and strategy and social policies.

Alike to certificate program, post graduate diploma it lacks much valuable contents such as: characteristics of human rights, categories of human rights, human rights values and principles, human rights limitations and derogations, human rights enforcement mechanisms, human rights of vulnerable groups, state obligations in relation to human rights, the role of police, societies and non-governmental organizations in respecting and protecting human rights. Besides this, as the majority of the interviewee and focus group participants argued that EPU offered human rights course, yet the course is given in the lens of loyal to the constitution and imparting about government police strategies.⁸³ Whereas some interviewees and focus group discussants stated in contrast: “learning *about*

⁸² Interviews and focus group participants of AAPC police officers and investigators, and EPU instructors, May 2023, and EPU Post graduate diploma program: FDRE Constitution and policing” December, 2010.

⁸³ Interviews and focus group participants of AAPC police officers and investigators, May 2023.

constitution learning about human rights. So we acquired new knowledge regarding human rights from the course. It builds our capacity on human rights issues.”

As the Danish Institute for human rights pointed, curriculum developer should consider that the treatment of vulnerable groups and specific groups of rights-holders in the curriculum that adequately reflect the specific rights pertaining to these groups⁸⁴. Thus, to produce, police who stand for respecting and protecting human rights violations, the learning area should include contents which are essential to enhance police to be effective in their work like rights of vulnerable groups, state obligation and human rights values and principles. Therefore, from the data, it is possible to infer that EPU in the curricula development had failure to adequately address fundamental human rights issues.

4.1.2 The Practice of EPU Course Objectives Development

Table 4.1 Certificate program Human Rights Courses Objective development

Level	Programme	Course title	Competences
Certificate	Crime prevention and public safety and security, and crime investigation	Constitution and Human rights	<p>A the end of the chapter, students will be able to:⁸⁵</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Know the of the definition of human rights • Understand the features of human rights • Understand the importance of protecting human rights and human rights conventions

As stated in chapter 2, the learning objectives should address and contribute logically to the achievement of the course’s overall goal/s and desired results. As it is clearly mentioned, when formulating instructional objectives, using general/broad terms is forbidden such as understand, know, and be familiar.⁸⁶ General/broad terms are open to many interpretations that carry out different meanings. Yet objectives should not mean different things to different people rather should convey a single meaning. And also, experiences can be used

⁸⁴ The Danish Institute for human rights. Guide On Human Rights Education Curriculum Development,2021

⁸⁵ EPU Cadets School Certificate programme: Constitution and Human rights Module November,2020.p.65

⁸⁶ Payne,D. Applied Educational Assessment: Belmont Wadsworth publishing company.1997,p.104- 106.

to attain the same educational objectives. Action verbs such as write, measure, draw, define, identify, name, demonstrate, organize, prepare, design and etc tells us what the students will be doing when demonstrating his/her achievement of the objective.⁸⁷

As Payne (1997) pointed out instructional/learning objectives should be measurable. The role of measurement is to see how far these objectives have been achieved. Statements of instructional objectives are the prerequisites for effective measurement as well as evaluation of educational program. This is because the only way of telling whether learners have acquired a certain type of behavior is by giving opportunities to display this behavior which enables to see the degree of realization of the instructional objectives. The learning objectives relate to changes at the level of the individual that can be directly attributed to the learning course.⁸⁸ And also, the Danish institute for human rights stressed that learning outcomes should include the three domains which are knowledge, skills and attitudes.⁸⁹

In the case of EPU practically, as we can notice from the above table 4.1, in the certificate program at minimal level learning objectives are stated. As indicated in the table upon the completion of the chapter, learners are expected to have knowledge about definition of human rights, the features of human rights and the importance of protecting human rights and human rights conventions. Yet the content of the module only focused on cognitive (knowledge) domain rather than affective (attitude) and psycho motor (skill) domain. As clearly stated, the words “know and understand” shows that learners expected to have awareness on the mentioned issues but not through action and demonstration.

On the other hand, learning objectives were not well formulated based on instructional objectives principles that is learning objectives were not articulated in measurable action verbs. As we can see in the table learning objectives stated in general objectives which are not measurable that is learners expected to know the definition of human rights, understand the features of human rights, and understand the importance of protecting human rights and human rights conventions. Thus, the words “know and understand” are not measurable. it is difficult to measure the learners whether they know and understand about the mentioned issues.

⁸⁷ Ibid.

⁸⁸ Ibid.

⁸⁹ The Danish Institute for human rights. Guide On Human Rights Education Curriculum Development,2021

In light of this, as one of the course instructor interviewee confirmed that *“I am not sure whether the objectives are formulated based on instructional objectives or not because am not familiar how learning objectives can I frame. I didn’t get any training regarding teaching methodologies and instructional objectives formulation”*.⁹⁰ Similarly with this, quality assurance director highlighted that *“there is a gap on formulating of instructional objectives, this is due to may be module developers have no awareness how to write instructional objectives and in some case couldn’t give attention on setting of objectives. Thus, this was happened as the result of lack of skills and awareness regarding learning objectives formulation.”*⁹¹

Other EPU, instructors replied that *“in the course development we formulate objectives, but we didn’t consider whether the objectives are measurable or not”*. Therefore, from the data we can conclude that EPU constitution and human rights course learning objectives are not well formulated.

Table 4.2 Post Diploma Program Human Rights Courses Objective Development

Post Graduate Diploma	Crime prevention and public safety and security, and crime	FDRE Constitution and	<p>Upon completion of the unit, the students should be able to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explain the meaning of human rights, • Identify basic features of human rights, • Describe categories of human rights and rights associated with each categories, • Identify obligations in respecting and protecting human rights and their role as a police officer,
------------------------------	--	-----------------------	---

As indicated in the above table 4.2 learning objectives are clearly stated. As we can observe from the table at the end of the chapter, the learner are expected to have knowledge about the meaning of human rights, the basic features of human rights, the categories of human rights and rights associated with each category, the police obligations in respecting and protecting human rights and their role as a police officer.

In addition to this, in the course “FDRE constitution and policing” learning objectives are well formulated based on instructional objectives principles that is learning objectives are

⁹⁰ Chief Inspector Worku F; Certificate programe department head, (Sendafa 4 may,2023).

⁹¹ Interview with Chief inspector Samuel. EPU quality Assurance directorate director (sendafa 19 may,2023).

formulated in measurable action verbs. As Payne (1997) pointed out objectives should measure and evaluate validity that articulate precisely what we expect students to be able to do at the end of a course or a unit of instruction.⁹² Yet, when we see the “FDRE constitution and policing” course, the content of the module highly focused on cognitive (knowledge) domain rather than affective (attitude) and psycho motor (skill) domains. Human rights education not based on the three pillars of knowledge transfer, attitude shaping and skills-building is incomplete. Attitude-shaping and skills-building without knowledge transfer lack the informational basis. Knowledge transfer and attitude-shaping make no sense without the necessary skills to implement human rights. Knowledge transfer and skills-building without attitude-shaping might even be used to work against human rights. Thus, only imparting knowledge does not bring commitment to sustaining and safeguarding human rights and not act in violating of the dignity and rights of others and motivation and flexibility in carrying out collaborative efforts for human rights promotion.⁹³

Therefore, during the design of objectives of law enforcement curricula the three competences must be taken into considerations to produce all rounded police officer. Conversely to this in practices, EPU did not consider the three human rights education competences in the developing of curricula. In general, in EPU both in the certificate and advance diploma programmes curricula learning objective formulation were not guided by the three HRE competences that is knowledge/cognitive domain, attitudes/affective domain and skills/psychomotor domain.

4.2 The Practices of EPU Courses Delivery in Light of Human Rights Education Methodology

4.2.1 Teaching Methods Practices in EPU

As the OSCE guide stated that teaching methods are varied and aim at facilitating the acquisition of skills and attitudes that promote and protect human rights which includes roleplaying, simulations, case studies, field work and presentations from internal and external resource persons.⁹⁴ Methodologies of human rights education are linked to understanding the international human rights instruments; essentially based on the right to

⁹² See Payne, D.A (1997). Applied Educational Assessment: Belmont Wadsworth publishing company. p.104- 106

⁹³ Ibid.

⁹⁴ OSCE: supra note 19.p.42.

know our rights; curriculum planning, efforts to promote social empowerment; responding to the goals of specific user groups; and program and participant evaluation.⁹⁵ Yet goals are overlapping, but are distinguishable. Within the framework of these goals and the methods used to advance them, we should also recognize distinguishable teaching objectives.

Hence, the experiential learning methods provide an opportunity for learners to experience, share reactions and observations, reflect upon implications and consequences, discuss patterns and dynamics, develop practical and conceptual understanding and apply it to the real life situations. One of the major Principle of human rights education methodology for adult education is exploring learner's real experience and share with each other's.⁹⁶ Learner-centered methods and approaches are used to empower learners to learn and to encourage active participation, co-operative learning, and a sense of solidarity, creativity and self-esteem. So, learner-center method is recommendable.⁹⁷

In the case of EPU, the curricula did not give chance to apply variety teaching methods. As the researcher critically reviewed "constitution and human rights" and post graduate diploma program: "FDRE constitution and policing modules," EPU focus on lecture methods. The modules show that there is no room to apply variety methods in line with that of objectives rather it forces to use lecture methods. As the result of the scope of the content so broad, and by its nature participatory approach needs enough time, the module did not consider to accommodate different teaching approaches. Modules are full of theories and have no room to apply different teaching modalities.⁹⁸ To achieve the expected outcome, the use of teaching methodologies matter.

Following with this, the EPU interviewees were asked to point out whether they consider cognitive/ knowledge, psychomotor/ skills, and affective/ attitudes in their teaching methodologies or not. According to most interviewees; practically, instructors dominantly used lecture, question and answering, brainstorming, and group discussion. And also, the instructors have no idea which method is appropriate with the stated objectives. Instructors

⁹⁵Tazkir,S. Human rights education Methodologies,2002.p.2

⁹⁶ Flowers. The Human Rights Education Handbook: Effective Practices for Learning, Action, and Change,2000,p.58.

⁹⁷Ibid.,p.58.

⁹⁸ EPU Cadets School Certificate programme: Constitution and Human rights Module November, 2020 and Post Graduate Diploma Program: FDRE Constitution and policing" December, 2010.

used the methods for the purpose of learner's participation rather than achieving the goal.⁹⁹ Apart from this, one of the EPU interviewee confirmed that there is no standard guideline which is prepared by the university that when and how teaching methods used and which method is appropriate for each competence. So, using variety methods depends on the instructor capability and not based on what the objective demands.¹⁰⁰ Cognizant of this, as one of the interviewee from certificate program department highlighted that *"to complete the course on the scheduled time, mostly we used lecture method, and rarely we do question and answering as well as brainstorming methods."*¹⁰¹

The same questions were also intervened with interview and focus group participants of AAPC staff members. Their answers revealed that the major method that the EPU teaching method was lecture methods. In some case question and answering method applied.¹⁰² Though EPU instructors did not applied, but giving emphasis on the development of investigation skills practical session such as case studies are crucial, whereas only imparting theory and philosophy did not equip a well police officers.¹⁰³

Hence, lecture is termed a didactic method. It involves verbal presentation of ideas, concepts, generalization and facts. The objective of this method is just to inform the students with information. Most of the work done by the instructor talking while students are just passive or slightly involved by taking down notes and asking few or no questions. As clearly pointed out in chapter 2, applying all the teaching method is not appropriate for each competence. When the focus of learning is increasing knowledge then the methods used may be lectures, field visits, demonstrations, self-study etc. in adult education we have taken into consideration that we need to talk about only those facts which the participants need to know. It is important to get the participants' attention before explaining why they need to know the topic. And also, explain the main themes you are going to cover. Present the facts and information. Use handouts to reinforce the talk. Participants learn more by listening and

⁹⁹ Interview with Commandar Sefiew A; Crime prevention and public security studies college director and FDRE constitution and policing course instructor, 'Chief Inspector Worku F; Certificate programe department head, chief instructor Birhanu B, crime investigation head, Chief inspector Sisay M; FDRE Constitution and policing" cadets programme certificate and advance diploma crime investigation instructor (Sendafa may,2023)

¹⁰⁰ Interview with Commander Samule. A. Curriculum Assurance director (Sendafa 15 may,2023)

¹⁰¹ Interview with Chief Inspector Worku F; Certificate programe department head and course instructor(Sendafa 4 may,2023).

¹⁰² Focus group discussion with Crime investigators and Community policing Awareness rising police officers (Addis Ababa, 11 may and 13 may,2023).

¹⁰³ Flowers. 2000.

actively participating than by taking detailed written notes. Ask participants to tell stories about how the evidences will be used. Among the materials to be used, whenever possible, use audio-visual aids such as plan an exercise for participants to practice the knowledge they learned.¹⁰⁴

Whereas the focus of learning is to increase skills, the methods used are more of practice sessions, demonstrations, apprenticeship and learning by doing. Apart from this, if the focus of learning is to attitudinal change then the methods used would be role-plays, small group discussion, case studies, simulation, learning games, structured exercises etc. One's own experiences, both past and present and others' experiences form an important source of learning.¹⁰⁵

Following with this, the interviews and focus group participants were asked to point out EPU curriculum design whether they acquired new knowledge, skill and attitudinal change or not. According to most of the interviewees and focus group discussants, EPU courses enhanced their knowledge but not bring viable attitudinal and behavioral changes. These were more explained as:

*“In relation to the teaching method of EPU ‘constitution and human rights’, and ‘FDRE constitution and policing’ courses, we didn’t account of an activity, event or problem that contains a real or hypothetical situation that includes the complexities which would encounter in the workplace. However, linking the reality helps us to see how the complexities of real life influence that requires us to practice applying knowledge and thinking skills to a real situation”.*¹⁰⁶

Thus, from the data we can conclude that EPU dominantly applies lecture method teaching. In general, it is impossible to achieve the ultimate objective of the course without using variety methods of teaching.

4.2.2 The Practices of Students Assessment in EPU

Assessment of learning is one of the influential methods for enlightening the learning and raising standards. It can be achieved through processes such as sharing criteria with learners,

¹⁰⁴ Flowers. 2000.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid.

¹⁰⁶ Interviews and focus group participants of AAPC police officers and investigators, May 2023.

effective questioning, and feedback.¹⁰⁷ Similarly with this, Assessment of human rights education is the deliberate and planned assessment of an activity during and at the end of its implementation. Assessment is a key part of teaching and learning process. Assessment seeks to evaluate the newly acquired knowledge, skills and affective of the learners. Assessment enables the educator to measure the contribution that the education activity makes to the expected outcomes.¹⁰⁸ Main aim of assessment is to ensure educational results are evaluated, including success in achieving learner outcomes and improving the overall enjoyment of human rights.¹⁰⁹

In the case of EPU, both the “Constitution and Human Rights”¹¹⁰ and “FDRE Constitution and Policing”¹¹¹ courses the minimal learning competences clearly indicates that students cognitive (knowledge) domain assessed but not affective (attitude) and psycho motor (skill) domains. So, if the competences set to measures knowledge, we can’t expect that the assessment measures skills and attitudes of learners because the assessment depends on the competences. On the other hand, the EPU interviewees were asked to point out during evaluation of students whether they assessed learners’ achievements related to human rights education knowledge/ skills/ attitudes whether or not. All the EPU interviewees replied that student’s achievements were assessed in continuous and summative assessment methods. These were more clarified as: *“The assessment takes place through continuous assessment and at the end of the course students will take final exam. But the assessment technique predominantly focused on evaluating the knowledge level of students instead of evaluating the attitudes and behavior of students.”*¹¹²

And also, the same question was posed to APPC interviewees and focus group participants. All of them confirm that in EPU, they were assessed by continuous assessment and final examinations. Assessment was for grading purpose but they were not sure whether the

¹⁰⁷ Asia Pacific Forum Human Rights Education: A Manual for National Human Rights Institutions, 2013. P.73.

¹⁰⁸ Nitko,J.): Educational Testing and Measurement: An introduction. New York. Harcourt Brace Jovanvich,inc. 1983. p,25.

¹⁰⁹ OSCE, guidelines on human rights education For law enforcement officials,2012,p.43.

¹¹⁰ EPU Cadets School Certificate programme: Constitution and Human rights Module November, 2020

¹¹¹ EPU Post Graduate Diploma Program: FDRE Constitution and policing” December, 2010.

¹¹² Interview with Commandar Sefiew A; Crime prevention and public security studies college director and FDRE constitution and policing course instructor, `Chief Inspector Worku F; Certificate programe department head, chief instructor Birhanu B, crime investigation head, Chief inspector Sisay M; FDRE Constitution and policing” cadets programme certificate and advance diploma crime investigation instructor, Commander Samule. A. Curriculum Assurance director (Sendafa may,2023)

assessment was based on the three (knowledge, skill and attitudes) competences or not.¹¹³ However, assessing a learner's course competence entails collecting information from the learner regarding their progress towards attaining the necessary knowledge, skills, attitudes, or behaviors, which is useful in deciding the degree to which the learner has accomplished the performance standards.¹¹⁴ Therefore, from the data, it is possible to infer that EPU assessment techniques predominantly focused on evaluating the knowledge level of learners instead of evaluating the attitudes and behavior of learners.

4.3 The Effectiveness of EPU Courses in Terms of Changing Attitudes and Behaviors of Polices

In this part, the interviewees and focus group discussion participants were asked different questions concerning the effectiveness of the EPU human rights courses in terms of changing behaviors and attitude of police and challenges that police face while carrying out crime investigations/crime preventions. Specifically, the practice of police crime investigation and prevention, police point of view on the thematic issues such as: in degrading treatments, arbitrary arrests and detention, non-discrimination, the right to life and challenges or difficulties that police face while carrying out crime investigations. The reason why focuses on the above specific thematic area is that because of the problems are so sever as so many report indicates and as mentioned in the statement of the problems. Thus, based on the response obtained from them and reports, the data analysis and interpretations are presented as follows.

4.3.1 In degrading Treatment

As stated in chapter 2 above, law enforcement officer should show through in action and demonstrate the values and is committed to respect for the dignity of all people with whom he/she interacts regardless of race, colour, gender, language, political or other opinion, religion, national or social origin, property, birth, age or other status; and awareness of the root causes of human rights violations, including the role of stereotypes and prejudice in the process that leads to human rights abuses.¹¹⁵ Besides, Universal Declaration of Human

¹¹³ Interviews and focus group discussion with APPC police officers, may, 2023.

¹¹⁴ Supra note 111.

¹¹⁵ OSCE guide Supra note 19.p.30.

Rights¹¹⁶ article 5 and International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights¹¹⁷ article 7 stated that no one shall be subjected to torture or to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment. Similarly with this fact, Article 5 of the African Charter on Human and Peoples' rights states; "Every individual shall have the right to the respect of the dignity inherent in a human being and to the recognition of his legal status."¹¹⁸ In line with this, the FDRE Constitution article 18(1) states that everyone has the right to protection against cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment. And also, article 24(1) articulates everyone has the right to respect for his/her human dignity.¹¹⁹

In practice from different national and international organizations reports shows that during the northern conflict, serious international human rights and humanitarian law violations against civilian's inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment perpetrated by the police.¹²⁰ And also, yet the police duty is first and foremost to serve the public, but police members failing to respect. In normal circumstance, in October 1, 2021 in the capital city, the Addis Ababa police officers brutally beating a woman with a child at a particular place called Michael Square in Nifas-Silk Sub-city.¹²¹ Similarly with this, EHRC pointed out that "*Polices have overreacted and needlessly beaten people, used tear gas, plastic and lethal bullets, and other excessive measures including on older persons and children resulting in at least one death, several bodily injuries and distress on people gathered around Menelik Square for the national celebration of Adwa.*"¹²²

Following with this, the interviewees and focus group discussants were asked to point out police perception on case of degrading treatment. All respondents strongly highlighted that "*no one shall be subjected to torture or to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment and currently no one can be subject to illegal treatments.*"¹²³ But, practically, as so many reports indicate that there are such violations though the respondents deny the fact.

¹¹⁶ Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948,p.

¹¹⁷ International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966,p.5.

¹¹⁸ The African Charter on Human and Peoples' rights states,1981.p.4.

¹¹⁹ FDRE Constitution,1994,p.6

¹²⁰ Ethiopia 2020 human rights report

¹²¹ Fana Broadcasting corporate (FBC) news,Addis Ababa, October 2, 2021.

¹²² Ethiopian Human rights commission press-release, on 3march, 2023. Available on <https://ehrc.org/category/press-release>.

¹²³ Focus group discussion with Crime investigators and Community policing Awareness rising police officers (Addis Ababa, 11 may and 13 may,2023).

Following with this, the AAPC interviewees and focus group participants were asked to share their experience of crime investigation. Majority of them replied that “*currently there is a great improvement in crime investigation. There is no torture and there is no human rights violation which is committed by police.*” Conversely to this, one interviews from organized crime investigation department of AAPC mentioned that: all crime investigators did not apply human rights principles during crime investigation process because some investigators do not have the necessary skills how to demonstrate the provisions pertaining to human rights and the law violate it due to different reasons. This depends on the maturity level of the police officers and work experience. Most of the time police who are in rank of constable and assistant sergeant police officers penetrated in such acts.

Thus, human rights violations by police in the process of law enforcement can have extremely adverse effects on the entire criminal justice system. When such wrongdoing is discovered it can lead to loss of confidence in the police, and in the law, the courts and the judiciary and entire society have no protection of human rights principles and difficult to advance human rights in Ethiopia.

4.3.2 Arbitrary Arrests and Detention

As the universal declaration of human rights and international convention on civil and political rights article 9 (1) states that everyone has the right to liberty and security of person. “*No one shall be subjected to arbitrary arrest or detention.*” No one shall be deprived of his liberty except on such grounds and in accordance with such procedure as are established by law.¹²⁴ And also, Article 9 (4) convention on civil and political rights stressed anyone who has been the victim of unlawful arrest or detention shall have an enforceable right to compensation.¹²⁵ Similarly with this fact, Article 6 of the African Charter on Human and Peoples’ rights states that no one may be arbitrarily arrested or detained. Besides, the FDRE Constitution article 17(2) states that no person may be subjected to arbitrary arrest and no person may be detained without a charge or conviction against him.

In fact, every individual is protected by law, practically; Addis Ababa police arbitrary arrests politicians, journalists and social activists. EHRC in its press statement stated that arbitrary arrest and detentions of political party leaders and members, members of the media and

¹²⁴ Universal declaration of human rights, 1948, 9.20.

¹²⁵ convention on civil and political rights, 1996, p.6.

social activists is a serious concern in Addis Ababa.¹²⁶ In its report, the commission observed that people especially members of the media, leaders and members of opposition political parties, and activists were arrested by the police on suspicion of various crimes who were detained in a contrary way, were detained in prolonged pre-trial detention or without charges, some were charged with a crime but the charges were not supported by sufficient evidence but were rejected by the court's decision or were released free or on bail after extended detention by the police's decision. Similarly, Amnesty International and the Committee to Protect Journalists (CPJ) urges in its statement to stop, 'arbitrarily arrests' of journalists without enough evidence and to respect citizens' right to peaceful protests.¹²⁷ Besides to this, during the state of emergency, unlawful incidents and arrests targeting ethnic Tigran's in Addis Ababa some suspected detainees including media workers have been transported to locations outside the capital and may face continued harassment.¹²⁸

Conversely to this, majority of AAPC interviewees and focus group discussants replied that no one is unlawfully arrest without charge.¹²⁹ Yet, international and national organizations confirm the issue, the respondents denied the fact. On the other hand, some interviewees confirm that "*if government higher officials order the police commission, we arrest the person without following crime investigation procedure and also without court order*". And also, one of the interview respondents strongly highlighted that "*in the case of state emergency, if we feel the person suspected to do crime, we can arrest him without court order.*"¹³⁰ So, police had arrested suspects without court warrants and without reasonable grounds. In general, human rights are rights that enabled to all human beings and state have responsibilities for the full enjoyment of rights. Thus, on behalf of the state police have an obligation to respect and protect human rights in its day to day activities, but practically police perpetrated in acts of human rights violations of citizens? Though the constitution and federal law prohibit arbitrary arrest and detention and offer for the right of any person to encounter the justice of his or her arrest or detention in court, the police rarely observed

¹²⁶ EHRC, Press release April 15,2023. Available at <https://ehrc.org/category/press-release/>.

¹²⁷ Amnesty International and the Committee to Protect Journalists (CPJ), April,20,2023.

¹²⁸ EHRC, Press release July 15, 2021. Available at <https://ehrc.org/category/press-release/>

¹²⁹ Interview and focus group discussion conducted with Addis Ababa police commission crime investigators and community policing awareness rising police officers and crime prevention police officers. May, 2023.

¹³⁰ Interview with Addis Ababa police commission investigator (Addis Ababa, 4 may,2023).

these requirements. Therefore, police have low perception regarding the human rights principles and these led citizens to loss their confidence and feel insecure.

4.3.3 Non-Discrimination

As stated in chapter 2 above, in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights the entitlement of everyone to all of the rights set forth without discrimination of any kind such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status is embodied in article 2 of that instrument¹³¹. A similar provision is incorporated in article 2(2) of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights in respect of the rights they recognize.¹³² In line with this, the regional human rights treaties also set out this entitlement in respect of the rights they embody. African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, article 2; convention establishes a general prohibition of discrimination.¹³³ Similarly with this fact, the FDRE Constitution article 25 states that "*all persons are equal before the law and are entitled without any discrimination to the equal protection of the law. In this respect, the law shall guarantee to all persons equal and actual protection without discrimination on grounds of race, nation, nationality, or other social origin, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, property, or other status.*"¹³⁴

In fact, citizens protected by law, practically; Addis Ababa police have arbitrarily detained, forcibly disappeared, and committed other abuses against ethnic Tigrayans in Ethiopia's capital, Addis Ababa. And Human right which urges account for Tigrayans' forcibly disappeared, release those being held without credible evidence of a crime, and ends all discriminatory treatment.¹³⁵ This shows that police is not stand for citizens human rights protection rather tool for implementation of government policies. And also, police commission is not an independent organization its operational functions.

On the other hand, all the AAPC interviewees and focus group discussants confirmed that "*there is no discrimination, in all of its forms of police work*". But in some case it may happened due to influence of the government and particularly to reduce social tension and to

¹³¹ Universal Declaration of Human Rights.1948,P.6

¹³² International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966, P. 2.

¹³³ The African Charter on Human and Peoples' rights states,1981.p.3.

¹³⁴ FDRE Constitution, 1994, p.8.

¹³⁵ Human Rights Watch, August 18, 2021.

prevent social disturbance and conflict, police may respond promptly and conclusively to instances or situations of unlawful judgment.¹³⁶ This shows that police forced to act human rights violation as the result of internal and external factors.

4.3.4 The Right to Life

As indicated in the international conventions, the right to life is a fundamental human right. Universal Declaration of Human Rights¹³⁷ and International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights¹³⁸ article 3 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights protects the right to life, as well as two other rights relevant to the use of force by police that is the rights to liberty and security of person. Article 6.1 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights states: “*Every human being has the inherent right to life.*” Similarly with this, article 4 of the African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights states: Human beings are inviolable. “*Every human being shall be enabled to respect for his life and the integrity of his person.*”¹³⁹ No one shall be arbitrarily deprived of this right.

Cognizant of this, the Convention on the Rights of the Child contains a number of provisions that protect the right to life of children. For instance, ‘article 6 entails states parties to recognize that every child has the innate right to life, and to ensure to the maximum extent possible the survival and development of the child; article 24 sets out a number of measures to ensure the health of children and, in particular, paragraph 2(a) requires states parties to take appropriate measures to reduce infant and child mortality; and article 38 contains a number of provisions to protect children in times of armed conflict.

In line with this, the FDRE Constitution article 15 states that “*every person has the right to life. No person may be deprived of his life except as a punishment for a serious criminal offence determined by law.*” In the normal course of things, no one shall be deprived his/her life.

But practically, allegations of police misconduct and abuse of power is seen. AAPC interviewees and focus group discussants were asked to share their experience of crime investigations. As interviewees and focus group participants highlighted “there is *no*

¹³⁶ Interview and focus group discussion conducted with Addis Ababa police commission crime investigators and community policing awareness rising police officers and crime prevention police officers. May, 2023.

¹³⁷ Universal Declaration of Human Rights.1948, P.8.

¹³⁸ International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966, P.4.

¹³⁹ The African Charter on Human and Peoples’ rights states,1981.p.4.

deprived of life of citizens.” In fact according to EHRC report, during the celebration of Adwa unlawfully peoples were killed. Security forces have overreacted and at least one death, several bodily injuries and distress on people gathered around Menelik square for the national celebration of Adwa.¹⁴⁰ In light of this, at the time of writing of this thesis, EHRC in its press statement stated that unknown numbers of protests of Muslims in Anwar mosque were killed by police as the result of unproportioned force usage and fire arms. And also, hundreds of peoples were arrested arbitrarily.¹⁴¹ But the use of force by the police must be lawful, necessary to protect the rights of citizens and proportionate to bring about a peaceful outcome: it is ultimately a value judgment of each police member, who must remain committed to the highest ethical behavior. The highest priority of the police must always be respect for, and the protection of life.

Therefore, from the interviewees and the focus group discussants view what the researcher concludes is that though police committed to human rights violations they deny the fact. In general, the EPU curricula hadn't been effective in terms of achieving the desired behavioral and attitudinal change in the mind of polices. Moreover, police, whose primary responsibility is to protect the safety and security of the public and safeguard the human rights of all persons, though attitude of police towards protection of citizen's human rights not in the expected level. Thus, EPU course improves police knowledge but not bring viable attitudinal and behavioral changes. Therefore, EPU curriculum design may be one determinate variable that the course which had taken didn't significantly bringing attitudinal change of police that reflects people's respect for one another and behaving respectfully toward citizens by honoring everyone's human rights.

4.4 The Challenges of Police that Face While Carrying Out Crime Investigations/Crime Prevention

As most of the interviewees and the focus group discussants highlighted that there are major determinate challenges when police carrying out its crime investigation. As they stated *during crime investigation, there is government intervention. During investigation, we lost our professional independence that is if government higher officials order the police commission, we arrest the person without following crime investigation procedure and also*

¹⁴⁰ Ethiopian Human Rights Commission (EHRC) Press Release March 3, 2023

¹⁴¹ EHRC press statement June 1,2023.

*without court warrants.*¹⁴² Political affiliation is a major obstacle for police work as the interviewees and focus group discussants said. And also, during investigation police have no support from the community as the result of poor justice system.¹⁴³ As the discussants assure that communities believes that the person who do crimes and reported several times to police, but ,the police did not take action and sometimes the community arrested the suspect and handed over to police, but the suspect released immediately.¹⁴⁴ And also, most members of the community and police see each other as enemy. Because some police officers see all people as criminal and also the community sees the police as brutal. Moreover, some people attached the police activity with politics of government.¹⁴⁵

On the other hand, the major challenge for police is that though police follow appropriate procedures of crime investigation to obtain information about the committed crime, either by complaint or by police observation and any interested person's information, but the suspects when they go to court they will not tell the truth rather they deny the fact. This led the police use excessive force and violates the human rights principles. Moreover, as most of the interviewees and the focus group discussants police have no advanced technology as well as skill of crime investigation. As result of this, police follows customary investigation procedures and techniques and this may have a negative implication on human rights protection and respecting of suspects and peoples.

¹⁴² Interview and focus group discussion conducted with Addis Ababa police commission crime investigators and community policing awareness rising police officers and crime prevention police officers. May, 2023.

¹⁴³ Ibid.

¹⁴⁴ Ibid.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid.

Chapter Five: Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations

In this chapter the major areas covered by the study are summarized and conclusions are drawn based on the major findings. At the end, possible recommendations were forwarded.

5.1 Summary

The main purpose of this study was to assess the curriculum design and delivery of courses in EPU in light of human rights education methodology. To achieve the objective, the following research questions were developed:

- a) To what extent courses learning objectives/goals align with human rights education Curricula?
- b) To what extent courses delivery in the university fulfils human rights education methodology approaches?
- c) How effective are the courses in terms of changing attitude and behavior of police?
- d) What are the challenges of police that face while carrying out crime investigations/crime preventions?

Based on analysis and interpretation of data the following is summary of findings;

- a) The findings indicate that human rights education is offered as a separate course in EPU; yet, fundamental human rights issues were not well addressed.
- b) Learning objectives are not compatible with human rights education methodology.
- c) Both “constitution and human rights” and “FDRE constitution and policing modules,” courses content focused on cognitive domain rather than affective and psycho motor domain.
- d) Methods of teaching are mainly depended on teacher centered approach. i.e most of the time the course is delivered through lectures method. it does not give room for using variety teaching methods. Therefore, skill, attitudinal change teaching methods are undermined.
- e) The teaching methods of EPU, “Constitution and human rights” and “FDRE constitution and policing” were not effective in terms of changing the attitudes and behavior of police.

- f) The contents of the course were designed to inform students' about the constitution, laws of the land and policies of the government. In other words, the EPU is using the course in order to inculcate into students minds about governments program.
- g) The major challenges of police that face while carrying out crime investigations/crime prevention is interference of the government, low community perception towards police are the dominate factors.

5.2 Conclusion

On the bases of the findings of the study, the following conclusions are drawn: With regard to EPU human rights course curriculum design as well as delivery there are gaps seen in the point of human rights education methodology. Both the “Constitution and Human Rights” and “FDRE Constitution and Policing”¹⁴⁶ courses curriculum design lacks valuable contents such as values and principles of human rights, human rights of vulnerable groups, and human rights enforcement mechanisms. And also, the content of the course focused on cognitive domain rather than affective and psycho motor domain. Furthermore, the contents of the course were designed to inform learners or police officers about the policies and strategies of the government. In other words, the EPU is using the course in order to inculcate into learners minds about governments program. This means the learners expected to loyal to the government rather than in respecting and protection of human rights. Notwithstanding, EPU in the curricula development had failure to adequately address fundamental human rights issues and attention towards human rights education. Therefore, we can realize that it is difficult to produce police that has the responsibility to protect citizens from any kinds of human rights violation.

In overall course syllabus and modules possibly in both programmes government police and strategy have got much attention than human rights. In addition, the research findings explicitly stated the pervasive problems associated with teaching methods. Methods of teaching are mainly depended on teacher centered approach. i.e most of the time the mentioned above courses were delivered through lectures method. Lecture method is not always appropriate method depend on the nature and objectives of the course. As a result, this method of teaching has never changed the deviant behavior of police. The appropriate

¹⁴⁶EPU Cadets School Certificate programme: Constitution and Human rights Module November, 2020 and Post Graduate Diploma Program: FDRE Constitution and policing” December, 2010.

teaching method of the course supposed to be helping learners to discuss each other on principles and values that enable them to internalize the human rights principles and to exercise them in their classrooms.

In spite of the fact, that the course needs practical observation to associate with the theories that learners have learned in the class room. As the result of gap of curriculum design and delivery that the development of the human rights course a major determinate variable that was not based on three core HRE competences that is knowledge, skills and behavioral change/attitude that led police acts in violation of human rights.

5.3 Recommendation

Based on the major findings and conclusions drawn, the following recommendations are suggested;

- a) It is recommended that EPU better to revise the modules and syllabus that makes sure the objectives address practical skills and attitudes in addition to knowledge.
- b) It is better to modify and revise the contents and teaching methods of the course particularly by giving more attention on affective and psycho motor domain.
- c) Hence, learning objectives are not measurable, it is better to revise and formulate in the way of instructional objectives which are SMART-specific, measurable, achievable, and reliable and time bounded.
- d) It is recommended to adopt and follow up the implementation of mechanism for tracking behavioral change of police as part of human rights education assessment.
- e) Since, police is committed by human rights violation, it is better to design specific human rights in service training.
- f) It is recommended that police commission should take serious measures that a police, who acts in human rights violations.
- g) To bring a culture of human rights, it need to involvement of governmental and non-governmental organizations working in the area.

Reference

- Asia Pacific Forum Human Rights Education: A Manual for National Human Rights Institutions, 2013.
- Bajaj, M. (2017). Human rights Education: Theory, Research, Praxis.(1st ed.). University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Centre for Teaching Excellence, University of Waterloo, ‘Bloom’s Taxonomy’ at: <https://uwaterloo.ca/centre-for-teaching-excellence/teaching-resources/teaching-tips/planning-courses-and-assignments/course-design/blooms-taxonomy>.
- Crawshaw R.(2009). Police and Human Rights A Manual for Teachers and Resource Persons and for Participants in Human Rights Programmes. Martinus Boston.
- Creswell, J.(2009). Research Design: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approach (3rd . ed). Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J.(2014). Research design, Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Approaches, (4th . ed. 2014).sage publications.
- Dantzker, Hunter, and Quinn (2018): Research Methods for Criminology and Criminal Justice,(4th . ed). Jones & Bartlett Learning.
- EPU Guidelines for curriculum design, review and approval: Quality assurance and relevance center. Sendafa, Ethiopia June, 2020.
- Flowers, Nancy, ed. Flowers, Nancy, ed (2000). The Human Rights Education Handbook: Effective Practices for Learning, Action, and Change. Human Rights Resource Center, University of Minnesota.
- High commissioner for human rights, Center for human rights human rights and law enforcement: a manual on human rights training for police, professional training series No.5, Geneva, 1997.
- Hopkins,K.D(1998).Educational and Psychological Measurement and Evaluation,4th ed.New York: Macmillan publishing company.
- International Journal of Research in Education Methodology,2014.Vol.3
- Kothari, C.R. (2004), Research Methodology, Methods and Techniques, (2nd ed.), new age international publishers.
- Knowles, M (1980). The Modern Practice of Adult Education: From Pedagogy to Andragogy, Cambridge.

- Lodico, M., Spaulding D, and Voegtle K. (2010). *Methods in Educational Research from theory to Practice* (2nd . ed). Jossey-Bass.
- Malcolm Knowles (1980). *The Modern Practice of Adult Education: From Pedagogy to Andragogy* Cambridge, Englewood Cliffs) and later works.
- Nitko, J. (1983): *Educational Testing and Measurement: An introduction*. New York. Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, inc.
- Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (2012): *Guidelines on human rights education for law enforcement officials*. Poland.
- Payne, D.A. (1997). *Applied Educational Assessment*. Belmont: Wadsworth Publishing Company.
- Taba, H. (1962). *Curriculum Development: Theory and Practice*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, Inc.
- Tibbitts, F. (2017). *Evolution of Human Rights Education Models*. Available at: https://www.Research_gate.net/publication/314606886.
- Tibbitts, F. (2015). *Curriculum Development and Review for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights education*. Strasbourg: Council of Europe, UNESCO, OSCE/ODIHR, Organization of American States.
- *The contribution of HRE for the realization of human rights, United Nations Plan of Action for the third phase (2015-2019) of the world programme for human rights education*.
- *The Danish Institute for human rights. Guide on Human Rights Education Curriculum Development, 2021*.
- *The UN General Assembly adopted the UN Declaration on Human Rights Education and Training in December 2011 (UN A/RES/66/137)*.
- *UN, Guidelines for National Plans of Action for Human Rights Education, 1997*.
- *United Nations Office On Drugs And Crime: Handbook on police accountability, oversight and integrity, Criminal Justice Handbook Series, New York, 2011*.
- *Vanderbilt University Center for Teaching, 'Bloom's Taxonomy'* <https://cft.vanderbilt.edu/guides-sub-pages/blooms-taxonomy/>; Mary Forehand, *Bloom's Taxonomy in Emerging Perspectives on Learning, Teaching and Technology*.

Thesis and Reports

- Alemayehu S.(2010). Evaluating the Application of Human Rights Principles in Crime Investigation In Ethiopia (A Case Study Of The Addis Ababa City Police), University Of South Africa.
- Samuel M.(2020). Crime Investigation Curriculum at EPU College: Practice and Challenges, Addis Abba University.
- Suntinger W(2020).Police Training and International Human Rights Standards.
- Ethiopian Human Rights Commission Report, 2021.
- Amnesty international report May 2020.

Domestic Laws

- FDRE Constitution, 1994.
- EPU College Establishment Council of Ministers regulations No. 132/2007.

Regional

- The African Charter on Human and Peoples' rights states, 1981.

International laws,

- Universal Declaration of Human Rights.1948.
- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966).
- International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966.
- International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (1965).
- Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (1984).
- Principles and General Comment Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948.
- Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action: Adopted by the World Conference on Human Rights in Vienna on 25 June 1993Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948).
- United Nations Economic and Social Council, 1999.

Appendixes

Appendixes 1: Interviews for EPU Lecturers and Experts

The purpose of this research is to examine the curriculum design and delivery of courses in EPU in light of human rights education methodology. Your responses will allow the researcher to understand to what extent curriculum design and delivery meets with the standard. Your input is very important in this project because, as an instructor and expert, you are more familiar with the design of curriculum and delivery of courses. Participation is voluntary and confidential. Please, answer these questions as clearly and accurately as possible from your perspective.

Date:-----Name of Interviewee-----Sex-----

Address-----Position-----

1. Based on your experience to what extent human rights standards and mechanisms explicitly incorporated in mandatory course of the EPU curricula? Do human rights course given a separate/embedded course for police trainees?
2. As a police academy instructor, does the curriculum include human rights education methodologies that are rights-respecting, adult education friendly and participatory? If that can you explain some of the participatory techniques that you used?
3. During course/module design, do you consider the learning objectives?
 - Do the objectives begin with an action verb?
 - Learning objectives are designed based on measurable learning objectives? Stated for each activity, lesson plan, or unit?
 - If learning objectives are stated, do they include a combination of didactic, affective, and psychomotor domain objectives?
4. During your course design, did you consider human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes and teaching methodologies? Over all, are human rights education-related knowledges/skills/attitudes and methodologies present in the curricula of EPU?

5. In your course/module design, does the curriculum provide a clear and organized breakdown of what will be covered in each session? If yes, does the outline provide an estimate of how much time to allow for each part of the session?
6. In your module/course, does teaching methods are appropriately designed to the stated objectives? In other words, is it possible to achieve the learning objectives using the teaching methods specified in the curriculum?
7. During evaluation of students are they assessed for their achievements in human rights education-related knowledge/skills/attitudes?
8. In your course/module, does the curriculum include evaluation instruments to measure students learning?
9. From your experience, what are the challenges to design the course in light of human rights education methodology?
10. Do you have any other comments you want to share?

147

Thank You!!

¹⁴⁷ The interview questions adapted from Global Coalition for human rights education, Human Rights Education Indicator Framework: Human Rights Education and Training for Law Enforcement, and military Personnel, 2020, and a Manual on Human Rights Training Methodology the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR, 2017.) and Weiss Iris: Local Systemic Change Observation Protocol: Sample observation Instrument, User-Friendly Handbook for Mixed Method Evaluations, Division of Research, Evaluation and Communication, National Science Foundation 1997.

Appendix 2: Interview Questions for Addis Ababa Police Commission Police Officers

The purpose of this research is to examine the curriculum design and delivery of courses in EPU in light of human rights education methodology. Your responses will allow the researcher to understand to what extent curriculum design and delivery meets with the standard. Your input is very important in this project because, as an expert, you are more familiar with the practice of police work. Participation is voluntary and confidential. Please, answer these questions as clearly and accurately as possible from your perspective.

Date:----- Name of participants-----
-Sex-----Address-----Position-----

1. How do you see the EPU curriculum design?
 - Did it help you to be effective in your work?
 - Describe improvements you made in your work.
 - How did you use the new knowledge and skills you acquire in your work?

2. In degrading treatment

Case:

An individual due to doing a crime he had taken into police custody in good health but found to be injured at the time of release, it was obligatory on the police commission to provide a reasonable explanation as to the causing of the injury. But the police commission failed to do that.

- Do you think that the police commission act was right?
- Who will be accountable?
- Do you think that the right of the person was violated?
- Do you agree that arrested person's should be protected from physical punishment and in human or degrading treatment?

3. Arbitrary Arrests and Detention

Case: In date 08/04/2023 in Addis Ababa X sub city four people who were arrested in a violent manner without any arrest warrant from a competent body. During the first four weeks of their detention, the right to be assisted by counsel was not respected, and their subsequent trial was not conducted with the safeguards of impartiality.

- Do you believe that the act of the police was right?

- Do you think that the police follow appropriate procedures?
- Who will be accountable?
- Do you agree that all persons have the right to be protected from arbitrary and unlawful arresting?
- Suspected or accused persons' human rights should be respected such as freedom of expression, violence, presumption of innocence, right to fair trial,)?

4. Non-Discrimination

Case: There were complain because several hundred non-ethnic people attacked in “X” settlement which resulted in the levelling of the entire settlement and the burning or complete destruction of all of the properties which were not belonging to the “Y” ethnic groups. A number of police officials were present when this incident took place but they failed to intervene.

- Do you think that the police were right? Why
- Who will be accountable? Why?
- Do you think that there were human rights violations? Is there discrimination?

5. The Right to Life

Case: For example, in “z” woreda the author of the complaint, house was completely destructed because illegal construction. But complaint husband resist the destruction. Unfortunately, the person killed by police.

- As a police what procedures you will follow?
- Do you apply human rights principles in the process of crime investigation?

6. How do you investigate crime?

- Do you consider the rights of the person?
- Do you apply human rights principles in the process of crime investigation?

7. How do you prevent crime?

- Do you consider the rights of the person?
- Do you apply human rights principles in the process of crime investigation?
Provide an example of an incident when you took Proactive measures to prevent crime?

8. From your experience, have you ever taken action after identifying acts of violation of human rights by fellow police officers?
 - If yes, what measures did you take?
9. What are the challenges or difficulties that you face while carrying out crime investigations/crime prevention?
10. From your experience, have you taken action for those suffering human rights violations, particularly for vulnerable groups?
11. In general, how do you see the effectiveness of the EPU courses in terms of changing your attitude and behavior?
 - Give examples
12. Do you have any other comments you want to share?

Thank You!!

148

¹⁴⁸ The FGD and interview questions are adapted from guidelines on human rights education for law enforcement officials. Published by the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR), 2012,p.29-31. Crashaw R. Police and Human rights: A Manual for Teachers and Resource Persons and for Participants in Human Rights Programmes, 2009.

Appendix 3: Focus Group Discussion Questions for Addis Ababa Police Commission Police Officers

The purpose of this research is to examine the curriculum design and delivery of courses in EPU in light of human rights education methodology. Your responses will allow the researcher to understand to what extent curriculum design and delivery meets with the standard. Your input is very important in this project because, as an expert, you are more familiar with the practice of police work. Participation is voluntary and confidential. Please, answer these questions as clearly and accurately as possible from your perspective.

Date:----- Name of participants-----

-Sex-----Address-----Position-----

1. How do you see the EPU curriculum design?

- Did it help you to be effective in your work?
- Describe improvements you made in your work.
- How did you use the new knowledge and skills you acquire in your work?

2. **In degrading treatment**

Case:

An individual due to doing a crime he had taken into police custody in good health but found to be injured at the time of release, it was obligatory on the police commission to provide a reasonable explanation as to the causing of the injury. But the police commission failed to do that.

- Do you think that the police commission act was right?
- Who will be accountable?
- Do you think that the right of the person was violated?
- Do you agree that arrested person's should be protected from physical punishment and in human or degrading treatment?

3. **Arbitrary Arrests and Detention**

Case: In date 08/04/2023 in Addis Ababa X sub city four people who were arrested in a violent manner without any arrest warrant from a competent body. During the first four weeks of their detention, the right to be assisted by counsel was not

respected, and their subsequent trial was not conducted with the safeguards of impartiality.

- Do you believe that the act of the police was right?
- Do you think that the police follow appropriate procedures?
- Who will be accountable?
- Do you agree that all persons have the right to be protected from arbitrary and unlawful arresting?
- Suspected or accused persons' human rights should be respected such as freedom of expression, violence, presumption of innocence, right to fair trial)?

4. Non-Discrimination

Case: There were complain because several hundred non-ethnic people attacked in “X” settlement which resulted in the levelling of the entire settlement and the burning or complete destruction of all of the properties which were not belonging to the “Y” ethnic groups. A number of police officials were present when this incident took place but they failed to intervene.

- Do you think that the police were right? Why
- Who will be accountable? Why?
- Do you think that there were human rights violations? Is there discrimination?

5. The Right to Life

Case: For example, in “z” woreda the author of the complaint, house was completely destructed because illegal construction. But complaint husband resist the destruction. Unfortunately, the person killed by police.

- As a police what procedures you will follow?
- Do you apply human rights principles in the process of crime investigation?

6. How do you investigate crime?

- Do you consider the rights of the person?
- Do you apply human rights principles in the process of crime investigation?

7. How do you prevent crime?

- Do you consider the rights of the person?

- Do you apply human rights principles in the process of crime investigation?
Provide an example of an incident when you took Proactive measures to prevent crime?
8. From your experience, have you ever taken action after identifying acts of violation of human rights by fellow police officers?
 - If yes, what measures did you take?
 9. What are the challenges or difficulties that you face while carrying out crime investigations/crime prevention?
 10. From your experience, have you taken action for those suffering human rights violations, particularly for vulnerable groups?
 11. In general, how do you see the effectiveness of the EPU courses in terms of changing your attitude and behavior?
 - Give examples
 12. Do you have any other comments you want to share?

Thank You!!

149

¹⁴⁹ The FGD and interview questions are adapted from guidelines on human rights education for law enforcement officials. Published by the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR), 2012,p.29-31. Crashaw R. Police and Human rights: A Manual for Teachers and Resource Persons and for Participants in Human Rights Programmes, 2009.

Appendix 4

  

አዲስ አበባ ዩኒቨርሲቲ
የሰብዓዊ መብቶች ግዕዝ

Addis Ababa University
Center for Human Rights

ቁጥር - ለመግቢያ/033/2015
ባህሪ - 6 ቀን 2015 ዓ.ም

ለ አዲስ አበባ ፖሊስ ኮሌጅ

ጉዳይ - ትዕዛዝን እንዲያረጋግጥልህ ስለመጠየቅ

በ አዲስ አበባ ዩኒቨርሲቲ የሰብዓዊ መብቶች ግዕዝ የጊዜ ሳገድ (MA) የሆነው እቶ ገንላ ጌዴ ደንብ መሠረታዊ ስራዎችን በ "Assessing the Curriculum Design and Delivery in Ethiopia Police University Inlight of Human Rights Education Methodology" ይባላል ርዕሰ ሳይ የሚያካትት ሲሆን ይህን ፕሮፖዛል-ቸውን ለማሻሻል የተለየ መረጃዎች እና ሪፖርቶችን መመርመር እና የተለያዩ ዓዛዞችን ለማግኘት ማረጋገጥ ለማድረግ የሚያስፈልገው ለመሥሪያቤቱ የተሰጠውን ተግባር ታደርጋለህ ብድር ይኮሰታል እንጠይቃለን ።

አዎንታዊ ጽ/ቤት

ፋሊል ሙሉ (አ/ር)

የሰብዓዊ መብቶች ግዕዝ ኃላፊ

P.O.Box 1176; Phone No. 011-1-223783/011-1-261200; Fax No 011-1-26 01 51
Website- <http://humanrights.aau.edu.et/>; Addis Ababa; Ethiopia



የሰው ኃብት ሥራ አመራር ዳይሬክቶሬት
Human Resources Development Management Directorate



ቁጥር 17/አ.አ.16/2301
ቀን መስ 19 2015

ሰውንጅል ትራኒሎጎር/ዘርፍ ጽ/ቤት
ሰውንጅል ትራኒሎጎ መከ/ዘርፍ ጽ/ቤት
አዲስ አበባ፤

ጉዳዩ፡- የት-ብብር ጥያቄ ይመሰክራል።

በአዲስ አበባ ዩኒቨርሲቲ የሰብአዊ መብቶች ማዕከል የ2ተኛ ዲግሪ(MA)የሆነው ኦቶ ገጉሴ ገሬ ድንቁ ለመመረቅ ስምዖን በ "Assessing the Curriculum Design and Delivery in Ethiopia Police University Inlight of Human Rights Education Methodology" የሚል ርዕስ ላይ የሚያከናውኑ ስሙዎን ይህንን ምርመራ-ቸውን ለማክናወን የተለያዩ መረጃዎች እና ሪፖርቶችን መመርመር እና የተለያዩ ባለደርሻ አካላትን ማነጋገር ስለሚኖርባቸው በተጠየቀው አሰሪ ላይም ት-ብብር እንዲደረግላቸው በማለት የአዲስ አበባ ዩኒቨርሲቲ የሰብአዊ መብቶች ማዕከል በቁጥር ስመግ/033/2015 በ06/07/2015 ዓ/ም በተገፈ ደብዳቤ ጠይቀዋል።

ስሙዎንም ከላይ እንደተገለጸው ኦቶ ገጉሴ ገሬ ድንቁ ለመመረቅ ደብዳቤ ለማገልገል የሚያስፈልጋቸውን መረጃዎች ት-ብብር እንዲደረግላቸው የላክናቸው ሙሉንን እንገልጻለን።

ገልጻዊ
ኦቶ ገጉሴ ገሬ ድንቁ
• ሰውን ኃብት ሥራ አመራር ዳይ ጽ/ቤት
አስጠባ



ከሙሉ ጋር
የሰው መብት ተቆይታ ማዕከል
የሰብአዊ መብት ማዕከል
University Commission
የሰው መብት ሥራ አመራር ዳይሬክቶሬት

ማሳሰቢያ-ይዩባዳይቸን መሰል ሲሰው ጭራግን ለጥላኔ
Note Quote Our/Her In Responses to our Letter.
☎0111 11 02 51 ☎5647



በአዲስ አበባ ፖሊስ ኮሚሽን
ABABA POLICE COMMISSION
የወገን አዋጅ ፈቃድ ዘርፍ ኃላፊ
CRIME INVESTIGATION TERRY D/COMMISSIONER



ቀጥታ ለፖሊስ/ቤት 19/ ጭጫጭ
ቀን 19/05/15

በወገን አዋጅ ፈቃድ ዘርፍ
በፊት ለፊት

የ.....ፈቃድ

በአዲስ አበባ ዩንቨርሲቲ የሙያዎች ማህበረ ተቋማት ማህበረ ሰነድ (MA) ተማሪ የሆኑት ስነ ምግብ ፈቃድ ለመስጠት ለሚያስፈልግ ስለሆኑ በሚኒስቴር አዋጅ በ Assessing the Curriculum Design and Delivery in Ethiopia police University Lnlght of Human Right Education methodology በሚሰጥ አድጋሚ ስር የሚገኘውን ስለሚያስፈልግ የተያያዙ መረጃዎች እና ለፈቃድ ለመስጠት ለሚያስፈልግ ስለሆኑ ማህበረ ሰነድ ስለሚገኘው በተጨማሪም ስለሚገኘው ተጽዕኖ እንዲሰጥ በሚሰጥ የአዲስ አበባ ዩንቨርሲቲ የስልጠና ማህበረ ሰነድ በቀጥታ ስምምነት/033/2015 በ06/07/2015 ዓ/ም በተሞላው ሰነድ/የአዲስ አበባ ፖሊስ ኮሚሽን በቀጥታ ስምምነት/16/2301 ሚያዝያ 19/2015 ዓ/ም በተሞላው ሰነድ ላይ ገብቶ የሚገኝ፡፡

ስለሆነም ስነ ምግብ ፈቃድ ለመስጠት ለሚያስፈልግ ስለሆኑት የሚያስፈልግ መረጃዎች እንዲሰጡ የሚቻል ሲሆን የሰነድ ገቢ ላይ ስለሚገኝ ስምምነት ላይ ለመስጠት ለሚያስፈልግ መረጃዎች ላይ ለፈቃድ ለመስጠት ለሚያስፈልግ ስለሆኑ ማህበረ ሰነድ ላይ ገብቶ የሚገኝ፡፡

ከሰጥኩት ጋር
TERRIE Kibistu Dadi
19/05/15
Commissioner
CRIME INVESTIGATION DEPT.
Ababa Police Commission