



**MULTI-AGENCY RESPONSES FOR ACCESSING SERVICE TO TRAFFICKED
PERSONS IN ADDIS ABABA**

By: Solomon Girma

Advisor: Debebe Ero (PHD)

December, 2019

Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

**MULTI-AGENCY RESPONSES FOR ACCESSING SERVICE TO TRAFFICKED
PERSONS IN ADDIS ABABA**

**BY
SOLOMON GIRMA**

**A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL WORK, ADDIS ABABA
UNIVERSITY, IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE
DEGREE OF MASTER OF SOCIAL WORK (MSW)**

ADVISOR: DEBEBE ERO (PHD)

ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY

**ADDIS ABABA
DECEMBER, 2019**

Declaration

I, the undersigned, declare that this Master's thesis is my original work and all the source or materials used have been duly acknowledged.

Name Solomon Girma

Signature _____

Date _____

Advisor's Approval

This Master's thesis has been submitted for examination with my approval as a university

Advisor.

Name _____

Signature _____

Date _____

ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES

Thesis Approval

This is to certify that the thesis presented by Solomon Girma entitled “*Multi-Agency Responses for Accessing Service to Trafficked Persons in Addis Ababa*” submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts (school of social work) complies with the regulation of the university and meets the accepted standards with respect to originality and quality.

Signed by Examining Committee

Advisor _____ Signature _____ Date _____

Examiner (Internal) _____ Signature _____ Date _____

Examiner (External) _____ Signature _____ Date _____

Chair of Department or Graduate Program Coordinator

Acknowledgment

I would like to express my special thanks goes to my thesis advisor Dr. Debebe Ero for constructive comment and guidance throughout the writing process of this thesis to be accomplished.

Next, I would like to thank to acknowledge the Director and employees of Good Samaritan and Agar Ethiopia rehabilitation center for their much cooperation, support to do this thesis and my practice profession development in the issues.

Furthermore, I would like to thank you Federal Anti-Human trafficking task force secretariat Head Mesaye Tsegaye for her much time, detail information and data support in order to overview the task force activities and I would like to thanks all my research participants for your appreciated involvement for this study.

Finally, all my friends who provide professional comment for this thesis. Moreover, my close relatives never missed them, for your encouragement that gave me strength not only for this research but also throughout my life.

Above all, my gratitude goes to God to give me the entire grant to accomplish this study

Table of Contents

Contents	Page
Acknowledgment	i
Table of Contents	ii
List of Table	v
Acronyms	vi
<i>Abstract</i>	vii
CHAPTER ONE	1
1. Introduction	1
1.1 Background of the Study.....	1
1.2 Statement of the Problem	2
1.3. Objective of the Study.....	3
1.3.1 Specific Objective.....	3
1.4 Research Questions	4
1.5 Significance of the Study	4
1.6 Limitation of this Study.....	4
1.7 Conceptual Definition	4
CHAPTER TWO	7
2. LITERATURE REVIEW	7
2.1 Literature review and Theoretical Framework	7
2.2 Concept Background	7
2.1.1 What is Migration.....	7
2.2 Migration and Migrants: A Global Overview	7
2.3 What is Human Trafficking.....	8
2.4 Migration: An Overview in Ethiopia.....	9
2.5 Cause and Consequence of Human Trafficking in Ethiopia	10
2.6 Strategies to Combat Human Trafficking	11
2.6.1 Prevention.....	11
2.6.2 Protection.....	12
2.6.3 Prosecution	13
2.7 Theoretical Framework of Human Trafficking	14
2.7.1 Human Rights Approach in Ethiopia.....	14
2.8 Migration Policy Framework in Ethiopia.....	16
2.9 Multi Agency Framework in Ethiopia.....	16
2.9.1 Legal Enforcement Framework	17
2.9.2 National Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force	18
2.10 Summary	19

3.1 Research Methodology	20
3.1.1. Research paradigm	20
3.1.1.1. The social constructivist worldview	20
3.1.2. Research Design	20
3.1.3. Research Participant	21
3.1.4. Inclusion criteria for Selected Organization	22
3.1.5 Inclusion Criteria for Selected Individual	22
3.1.6 Data Collection Tools	22
3.1.7 Data Collection	23
3.1.8 Key Informant Interview	23
3.1.9 Interview	24
3.1.10 Focus Group Discussion	24
3.1.11 Observation	25
3.1.12 Document Review	25
3.1.13 Description of Study Area	25
3.1.14 Data Analysis	26
293.1.15. Trust Worthiness and Quality Assurance	27
3.1.16. Ethical Consideration	27
CHAPTER FOUR	28
4.1. Data Presentation	28
4.1.1 Demographics Characteristics of Research Participants	28
4.1.2 Coordination Efforts with Stakeholder	31
4.1.3 Comprehensives Service For victims of Human Trafficking	33
4.1.4 Multi-Agency Responses	34
4.1.4.1 Challenges of Referral System	35
4.1.5 Back ground Information for Focused Group Discussion One	35
4.1.6. Back ground Information of Focused Group Discussion Two participants	37
4.1.7. Background Information of Interviews	38
CHAPTER FIVE	39
5. Finding and Discussion	39
5.1 National response to human trafficking	39
5.1.1. Functionality of Multi-Agency Responses	39
5.1.2. Contribution of Comprehensive Service for Victims of Human Trafficking	40
5.1.3. Challenges of Referral System for Assisting Victims of Trafficking	41
5.1.3.1 psychosocial problem	42
5.2 Discussion	44
5.2.1 Multi Agency Cooperation Framework in Migration Functioning	44
5.2.1.1 Federal Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force (FATTF)	44
5.2.1.2 Prevention Working Group	46

5.2.1.3 Protection Working Group	47
5.2.1.4 Prosecution Working Group	48
5.2.2. Contribution of Comprehensive Service Provision for Trafficked Person.....	49
5.2.2.1 Access of Rehabilitation Service.....	50
5.2.2.2 Psychosocial Supports	51
5.2.3. Challenges of Referral System	51
5.2.4. Human Right Aspect in Human Trafficking	53
CHAPTER SIX	54
6.1. Conclusion. Recommendation and Social Work Implication	54
6.1.1. Conclusion.....	54
6.1.2 Recommendation	55
6.1.3 Social Work Implication.....	56
References	57
Appendix I.....	61
Appendix II.....	63
Appendix III	64
Appendix IV	65

List of Table

	Page
Table 4.1 Demographic characteristics of research participants.....	31
Table 4.2 background information participants for FGD one profile	35
Table 4.3 background information for FGD two participants profile	36
Table 4.4 background information for interviews participants' profile	36

Acronyms

AWSA	Association for Women’s Sanctuary Development
BoLSA	Bureau of Labor and Social Affair
FATTF	Federal Anti –Trafficking Task Force
FGD	Focused Group Discussion
GSA	Good Samaritan Association
IDPs	Internally Displaced persons
IGAD	Inter Governmental Authority on Development
ILO	International Labor Organization
IOM	International Organization for Migration
KSA	Kingdom of Saudi Arabia
MoLSA	Ministry of Labor and Social Affair
NGO	Non-government organization
NRM	National Referral Mechanism
OPRIFS	Organization for Prevention, Rehabilitation and Reintegration of Female Street Children
SSA	Sub Sahara Africa
UJCFSA	Urban Job Creation and Food Security Agency

Abstract

The purpose of this research was to study multi -agency responses for accessing service to trafficked persons in Addis Ababa. The study was conducted in Addis Ababa .to meet the objective of the study qualitative methods of the data collections were used. Data were collect though purposive sampling the data collection were includes key informants interview, interview, observation and document review. Qualitative research approach and phenomenological research design was used. The research participants of this study were ten key informants from each selected organization. The researcher used, two focused group discussion (FGD); five interviewees from rehabilitation center beneficiaries' observation and document review as a tools to collect data. the data were analyzed through following thematically qualitative method and phenomenological approach. The finding of the study demonstrates that the need of effective coordination mechanism for human trafficking and formal national referral mechanism for victims of trafficking, the result showed that a gap of coordination system and diffusion of responsibility between stakeholder members of task force. The study showed that the need of effective national coordination mechanism and the need of comprehensive national referral mechanism for victims of trafficking.

CHAPTER ONE

1. Introduction

1.1 Background of the Study

Migration, as defined by the international organization for migration (IOM) is the movement of a person or a group of persons either across an international boarder or within a state. It is a population movement encompassing any kind of movement of people whatever its length composition and causes. It includes refugees, displaced persons, economic migrants, and persons moving for other purpose including family reunification (IOM, 2004).

Migration could also be regular where it occurs through recognized legal channels or irregular where movement takes place outside the regulatory norms of the sending transit and receiving countries. Migration can also be voluntary or forced, the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia (KSA) Government decreed that all migrants irregularly residing in the kingdom should either legalize their status or voluntarily leave the country within an established amnesty period. The Government of Ethiopia estimated that 500,000 Ethiopians were likely to be affected by the decree. Since the final extension of the grace period, which ended in November 2017, monthly deportees to Ethiopia average 10,000 individuals.

Most of these returnees come back to Ethiopia empty-handed and in great need of assistance to reintegrate within their communities. Where, International Organization for Migration IOM and the Government of Ethiopia have also strengthened their collaboration to give young people information on the realities of irregular migration and discourage them from undertaking risky journeys in search for a better life.

Young people comprise one third of Ethiopia's population, and a significant number do not have access to information on the realities of irregular migration and alternative livelihood options. (Andrijasevic & Walters, 2010).

1.2 Statement of the Problem

Migration issues are complex and require several bodies to be involved. Moreover, victims of human trafficking also require the coordination and collaboration of various stakeholders to help alleviate the challenges they face. It appears that the law by providing immunity to victims of trafficking and by proposing the formation of a national committee led by the Ethiopia's Deputy Prime Minister to coordinate anti-trafficking activities, aims to improve the lives of these survivors. The Government of Ethiopia has established a National Anti-Trafficking Council and Taskforce, which have been cascaded down at regional, zonal and district levels. The council has the mandate to coordinate counter trafficking and irregular migration prevention activities and enable a more efficient implementation and monitoring of prevention, protection and prosecution activities. The Council and Taskforce are headed by the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister at the federal level and by the Presidents of the Regional States at regional levels. In response to the growing incidents of abuse and human rights violations on the Ethiopian labor migrants in Gulf countries, the national referral mechanism (NRM), one of the effective methods of ensuring the protection of victims of trafficking, was established as a strategic framework for national actors to cooperate and coordinate towards safeguarding the rights of victims of trafficking and victimized migrants. It also helps improve victim related policies and procedures such as witness protection, victim compensation...etc. A well-managed NRM can also improve information gap with regards to trafficking and can help

establish baselines to track progress. As part of the implementation of the Anti-Trafficking and Smuggling Proclamation, according to (ILO, 2016).

NRM was developed and endorsed by the Anti-Trafficking Task Force in 2016, and there is also a standard operating procedure to implement these referrals. However, based on the, implementation of the NRM is weak, and there is weak coordination among stakeholders to help victims. The stakeholders involved in assisting victims of trafficking indicated that there is a need to reinforce the NRM and enhance its implementation. Therefore, for a standard identification procedure that will ensure the proper protection of the victimized migrants and improving their access to the proper emergency services through formalized coordination among stakeholders. Because of the complex nature of trafficking, identifying victims is not easy and even when victims are identified; it is not guaranteed that they will receive the assistance they need. Therefore, there was gap of cooperation framework. And principle of practices among relevant agencies in different areas to ensure comprehensive protection and support to trafficked persons. Therefore; this study focus on multi-agency responses for accessing service to trafficked persons in Addis Ababa.

1.3. Objective of the Study

The general objective of this study is multi-agency responses for accessing service to trafficked persons in Addis Ababa.

1.3.1 Specific Objective

1. To identify the functionality and collaboration frame work of human trafficking.
2. To assess how the comprehensive service referral system functions for trafficked persons.
3. To identify the challenges that hinder for accessing service to victim of trafficking.

1.4 Research Questions

1. What are the functionality of multi-agency cooperation frame work in migration to access service to trafficked persons in Addis Ababa?
2. What are the contributions of comprehensive service provisions for trafficked persons?
3. What are the challenges of referral system through multi-agency cooperation framework for accessing service to trafficked persons in Addis Ababa?

1.5 Significance of the Study

The foremost purpose of the research is for completion of MA degree in social work. It makes ground for my further education. It may contribute towards the knowledge for other individual who are interested to do further research in the area. It can open spaces for open discussion and a research interest in accessing service for victim of human trafficking. In addition, it may be beneficial to government and non-government institution for baseline assessment to design specific practice and procedures to service access for trafficked person.

1.6 Limitation of this Study

There were limitations in this research. Migration issues are complex and dynamic phenomena. so it is difficult to cover the whole aspects, the researcher was try to show victims human trafficking multi deamination problems from violation of human right approach and the need of collaboration and coordination. The study does not cover the regional context and situation of their family and the communities in the place of origin.

1.7 Conceptual Definition

Human trafficking Article 3, paragraph (a) of the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons defines Trafficking in Persons as the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons by means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion,

abduction, fraud, deception, the abuse of power, of a position of vulnerability giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.

Victim According to proclamation no. 909/2015 Article 11 victim means a person against whom the offence stipulated under this Proclamation has been committed or any person who has sustained harm, including mental and physical injury, emotional suffering, economic loss or substantial violation of basic human rights due to the commission of the crime.

Framework The Palermo Protocol uses what is called the 3P framework to create a comprehensive anti-trafficking policy model (protection, prevention, and prosecution). The U.S. federal anti-trafficking law is modeled after this Palermo Protocol, and the U.S. Department of State considers the 3P framework to be a significant criterion in evaluating governments' efforts to combat trafficking in the annual Trafficking in Persons Report (Steiner, kynn, stylianou, &postmus, 2018).

Migrant. According to IOM defines a migrant as any person who is moving or has moved across an international border or within a State away from his/her habitual place of residence, regardless of (1) the person's legal status; (2) whether the movement is voluntary or involuntary; (3) what the causes for the movement are; or (4) what the length of the stay is. (International Migration Law Series No. 25, 2011).

Smuggling. The procurement, to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit, of the illegal entry of a person into a State Party of which the person is not a national or a permanent resident" (Art. 3(a), UN Protocol Against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000). Smuggling, contrary to trafficking, does not require an element of exploitation, coercion,

or violation of human rights.

Irregular migrant. A person who, owing to unauthorized entry, breach of a condition of entry, or the expiry of his or her visa, lacks legal status in a transit or host country. The definition covers inter alia those persons who have entered a transit or host country lawfully but have stayed for a longer period than authorized or subsequently taken up unauthorized employment (also called clandestine/undocumented migrant or migrant in an irregular situation). The term irregular is preferable to illegal because the latter carries criminal connotation and is denying migrants humanity (IOM, 2004, p.54).

Irregular migration. Movement that takes place outside the regulatory norms of the sending, transit and receiving countries. There is no clear or universally accepted definition of irregular Migration. From the perspective of destination countries, it is entry, stay or work in a country without the necessary authorization or documents required under immigration regulations. From the perspective of the sending country, the irregularity is for example seen in cases in which a person crosses an international boundary without a valid passport or travel document or does not fulfill the administrative requirements for leaving the country. There is, however, a tendency to restrict the use of the term illegal migration to cases of smuggling of migrants and trafficking in persons. (IOM, 2004, p.54).

CHAPTER TWO

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Literature review and Theoretical Framework

This chapter attempt to overview on the issue related to migration and human trafficking through reviewing different research upon the previous literature relevant to the subject matter of this study. The chapter gives an overview of the migration and human trafficking us well us respective theoretical frame work that explain the phenomena. Previous studies are conducted on human trafficking and many humanitarian organizations work on it, therefore, this chapter focused on the concept of migration and human trafficking us well global an Ethiopia context overview; causes and consequence of human trafficking in Ethiopia and strategies and approaches to compact human trafficking and theoretical framework of human trafficking to address the issue of migration.

2.2 Concept Background

2.1.1 What is Migration

Migration is the movement of a person or a group of people, either across an international boarder or, within a state .it is a population movement, encompassing any kind of movement of people. It includes migration of refugees, displaced persons, economic migrants and person moving for other purpose, including family reunification. (IOM, 2011)

2.2 Migration and Migrants: A Global Overview

Human migration is an age-old phenomenon that stretches back to the earliest periods of human history. In the modern era, emigration and immigration continue to provide States, societies and migrants with many opportunities. At the same time, migration has emerged in the last few years as a critical political and policy challenge in matters such as integration,

displacement, safe migration and border management. In 2015, there were an estimated 244 million international migrants globally (3.3% of the world's population) an increase from an estimated 155 million people in 2000 (2.8% of the world's population). Internal migration is even more prevalent, with the most recent global estimate indicating that more than 740 million people had migrated within their own country of birth. It is important to understand international migration and its various manifestations to effectively address evolving migration dynamics, while at the same time adequately accounting for the diverse and varied needs of migrants. International movement is becoming more feasible, partly thanks to the digital revolution, distance-shrinking technology and reductions in travel costs. Factors underpinning migration are numerous, relating to economic prosperity, inequality, demography, violence and conflict, and environmental change. While most people migrate internationally for reasons related to work, family and study, many people leave their homes and countries for other compelling reasons, such as conflict, persecution and disaster. Overall, displaced populations such as refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs) comprise a relatively small percentage of all migrants; however, they often capture and demand collective attention and action as they frequently find themselves in highly vulnerable situations. These are the people who are often most in need of assistance. (IOM, 2018. p13)

2.3 What is Human Trafficking

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for exploitation.

Exploitation includes, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices like slavery, servitude or the removal of organs. (Palermo protocol, 2000).

An estimated 21 million individuals are victims of forced labor globally, according to ILO. The figure includes cases of human trafficking for the purposes of sexual or labor exploitation; however, the real number of victims of human trafficking remains unknown. Over half of the estimated victims of forced labor are found in the Asia-Pacific region (11.7 million), followed by Africa (3.7 million) and Latin America (1.8 million). The Central and South-Eastern Europe region, together with the Commonwealth of Independent States count 1.6 million victims, while 1.5 million victims are estimated to be in the developed economies and the EU, and another 600,000 in the Middle East (Global migration trend, 2015. p15).

2.4 Migration: An Overview in Ethiopia

According to Sixth IGAD Regional Consultative Process on Migration (IGAD RCP) – October 2015, Ethiopia is a major source of irregular migration in the IGAD region. Despite many initiatives by the government and other stakeholders, irregular migration remains a challenge for the country. Migrants are smuggled and trafficked in significant numbers through three different routes:

- **The Eastern route** via Djibouti (Obock), Somaliland, Punt land (Bosaso) and Yemen into Saudi Arabia, Gulf Countries and the Middle East. Although it is difficult to establish the exact number of migrants transiting through the Eastern route, there is an estimate that it is the preferred route for Ethiopian migrants. Between 2006 and 2013 more than half Million migrants mainly from Somalia and Ethiopia have been reported to have been smuggled into Yemen through this route.

- **The Northern route** transits through Sudan, Egypt, and Libya onward into Europe through crossing of the Mediterranean Sea. Many Ethiopian as well as Somali and Eritrean nationals (also transiting through refugee camps in Ethiopia) use this route to go to Europe.
- **The Southern route** transits through Kenya, Tanzania and other African countries onward to South Africa. Exact figures are unknown but there are number of cases of Ethiopian migrants apprehended and imprisoned in various transit countries such as Malawi, Tanzania, etc. Ethiopia is a source and, to a lesser extent, destination and transit country for men, women, and children subjected to forced labor and sex trafficking. Trafficking in persons primarily occurs on the Eastern and Northern migration routes while fewer cases have been reported on the Southern route(IGAD,2015).

2.5 Cause and Consequence of Human Trafficking in Ethiopia

The main cause of Human Trafficking in our country is the quest for better income; in addition, the lack of awareness of citizens about the possibility of changing their lives in their localities through associations, the irregularity of awareness creating tasks and on the other hand, the existence of illegal brokers who spread elusive hopes of migration with an ultimate goal of achieving their personal gain, lack of interest to make use of the employment opportunities in the country and problems of wrongful understanding and attitude towards the standard of jobs are the causes of illegal migration with the hope of getting a better income. The youth, women and men as well as children are victims of the problem. Hence, it is diminishing the developmental human resource. (FDRE council of Anti –trafficking strategic plan,2015 p. 2).

The consequence of human trafficking can be social, economic and political aspect in Ethiopia. The economic impact of trafficking is capital as it not only affects the migrant, who get back empty handed, but also their family and the country as a whole. Migration which was

thought to respond to the economic crisis of the family and the migrant becomes a heavy burden to the entire household. (Gudetu, 2014 p.241).

In addition to the trafficked person, human trafficking has a huge impact on families, society and the nation. The problem targets the youth and the productive sections of the society and as a result, it will have quite a massive effect on the national economy. Data indicate that women, young people and children are the major sections of the society who are the victims of human trafficking. These sections of the society abandon local employment opportunities which they could have used to support themselves and their family and are lured by illegal brokers to migrate and the nation loses the contribution of these people on the development of the country. (Gudetu, 2014).

2.6 Strategies to Combat Human Trafficking

Article 9 of the Palermo Protocol obligates states to establish comprehensive policies, program and other measures to prevent and combat trafficking in persons and to protect victims of trafficking in persons, especially women and children from re-victimization.

Combating human trafficking articulated the 3 P Approaches namely prevention, protection and persecution. The 3P Paradigms-Prevention, Protection and Prosecution continue to serve as the fundamental frameworks used by Governments around the world to combat human trafficking. Ethiopia also follows this approach, reflected in the *United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish trafficking in Persons (Palermo Protocol)*.

2.6.1 Prevention

Prevention efforts are component of the global movement to monitor and combat human trafficking. Past efforts focused on public awareness campaigns that inform and educate communities in source and destination countries about human trafficking.

The Government of Ethiopia give emphasis to prevention of human trafficking throughout federal and regional awareness rising campaigns. According to the EFDR Council of national anti-human trafficking strategic plan,2015 p.13

A wide range of awareness creation campaigns focusing on social and economic impacts of human trafficking plus measures that need to be taken to contain human trafficking were disseminated using various mass media particularly efforts of bringing attitude change among the youth with regard to human trafficking have been exerted in an extensive manner.

According to the ILO and MoLSA Awareness-raising intervention to prevent irregular migration assessment; the awareness-raising interventions covered have used various communication strategies to reach their target audience. Significant among these was the use of mass media, training, CCs, entertainment program, and dissemination of IEC materials. The activities undertaken by the GoE and key institutional actors were effective in terms of reaching a broad audience as well as targeting vulnerable social groups (ILO & MoLSA, 2016).

2.6.2 Protection

Protection is defined as shielding victims to mitigate harm suffered as victims of trafficking as a result of any exploitation and consequences they might have faced such as social, physical and psychological abuses. (Kenya National Plan of Action for Combating Human Trafficking, 2013-2017, p.8).

Direct assistance provided for victim of trafficking through civil society organization and international organization to recover from their trauma.

According to Article 6 of the Palermo protocol makes

Provision for the protection of victims. It places the mandate on the state parties to protect the privacy and identity of Victim of Trafficking (VoT) and also to ensure that the domestic legal or administrative system has measures that protect them.

Comprehensive and immediate services that should be available to victims include temporary shelter, medical and psychosocial care, legal aid, food, clothing, and safe voluntary return and reintegration (including vocational and skills training, micro-finance, and employment creation). Particular attention should be given to the specific needs of women and children. (ILO, *Trafficking in Persons Overseas for Labour Purposes*, 2011 P.17).

According to the human trafficking and smuggling proclamation 909/2015 Article 20 (2) (b) victims shall be accorded the available health and social services, medical care, counselling and psychological assistance, with care, on a confidential basis and with full respect of privacy.

2.6.3 Prosecution

The Ethiopian Federal Police reported to have investigated 99 suspected trafficking cases in 2015 and prosecuted 93 cases involving 118 defendants. Additional cases are still ongoing in court. According to proclamation no.909/2015 Article 26 (4)

The victims while staying at temporary shelter shall, in no case, be kept in police stations, detention centres or prisons; and unless victims are required for testimony in the judicial process, they shall not stay in temporary shelter for a period exceeding three months.

2.7 Theoretical Framework of Human Trafficking

Ethiopia ratified the international human rights convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination against women (CEDWA), the convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), International Convention on Civil and Political Right (ICCPR) and convention Elimination of Racial Discrimination and other,

Often advance four major theoretical frameworks: law enforcement, human rights, labor rights, and women and children rights to conceptualize and address the challenges of human trafficking. However; these frameworks fail to capture fully the dynamics of human trafficking in persons, especially in addressing the context and the system that create the symbiosis between victims and perpetrators understanding the complex and dynamic nature of human trafficking requires going beyond in viewing the issue from human right perspective. In response to this concern, scholars have recently developed different models to help understanding the nature of human trafficking. (Abebaw & Waganesh, 2015)

According to the Palermo protocol Article 2 (b) *to protect and assist the victims of such trafficking, with full respect for their human rights*. According to the international law research, 2017 Trafficking is an abuse of human rights. During trafficking as the victim completely submits himself to the trafficker, the trafficked person is stripped off any existing right. Hence trafficking is the process inherently related to the violation of Human Rights.

As a result, any measure taken to address the issue of trafficking must predominantly give priority to the protection and respect of rights.

2.7.1 Human Rights Approach in Ethiopia

Migrants have the right to the same human rights protection as non-migrants. Yet, violations of fundamental human rights remain at the center of the experiences of both victims of

trafficking and smuggled migrants, occurring throughout the trafficking and smuggling processes – prior to, during and after these crimes have been committed – underscoring the critical nature of the need for assistance to both groups. Many migrants face significant rights violations in transit, at their destination, and during or following return. Discrimination on diverse grounds, including gender, ethnicity and sexual orientation, can severely limit economic opportunities, exacerbating poverty and pushing individuals to migrate. With increasingly limited legal avenues, they often turn to irregular and unsafe migration routes and the help of smugglers, who deceive them about costs, risks, transportation methods, routes and conditions of travel. Although choosing to retain a smuggler for the purpose of illegal entry into a country, smuggled migrants remain vulnerable to numerous human rights violations, including trafficking in human beings. Trafficking in human beings and smuggling of migrants (2018, p147).

Human Rights-oriented approach to trafficking stands on the notion that human trafficking is both a cause and effect of human rights violations. As the former UN High Commissioner for Human Rights, Mary Robinson alleges, trafficking is a cause of human rights violation because it violates fundamental human rights, such as the right to life, the right to dignity and security, the right to just and favorable conditions of work, the right to health, the right to equality and the right to be recognized as a person before the law (Farrokhzad, 2017, p.134).

The second National Human Rights Action Plan of Ethiopia adopted in 2017 to be implemented until 2019 also comprises key mechanisms that help to prevent human trafficking. In the document, it is provided that the government will perform essential activities that strengthen prevention of human trafficking through the coordinated efforts of the various organs of the State and other stake holders. Through involving the media and community based

organizations, the government also planned to increase the awareness of the society about human trafficking through devoting particular attention to areas where the practice is more prevalent. In February 2016, the government made a landmark decision to prevent human trafficking through regulating overseas employment relations. Ethiopia's Overseas Employment Proclamation (Proclamation No.923/2016) was adopted to protect the human rights violations of Ethiopians working abroad and discourage vulnerabilities to human trafficking. (Woldemichael, 2017. P. 213-214).

2.8 Migration Policy Framework in Ethiopia

According to ILO reintegration report 2017, Ethiopia does not have a comprehensive migration policy, nor does it have a reintegration policy or national strategy. However, some recently adopted proclamations, and some policy tools are relevant to the reintegration of returnees. The response to reintegration of migrants beyond the operational and humanitarian management of massive returns – relates to other issues, such as management of labor migration and protection of migrant workers' rights abroad, which includes trafficking and smuggling, as well as national political issues, such as economic development and youth employment. Most migration from Ethiopia is driven by lack of livelihood opportunities, especially for the young and fluctuations in migration flows are more related to economies than immigration policies. This research will propose to assess the cooperation frame work of comprehensive referral system for accessing service to trafficked person in Addis Ababa and as intervention activities to address the current and severe challenges of survivors of human trafficking.

2.9 Multi Agency Framework in Ethiopia

The Government of Ethiopia has taken different steps to increase and enhance the governance of migration and the protection of Ethiopian labor migrants. The policy framework

regarding migration was enacted in response to high levels of abuse and violence perpetrated against Ethiopians living and working abroad, especially female migrant domestic workers in the Middle East. The acknowledgement of the widespread abuses perpetrated against its citizens prompted the government to act on migration management. (ILO Reintegration report, 2017, p29).

The government has ratified international instruments that provide for protection of migrants and victims of trafficking which are recognized as part of the country's fundamental law according to the Constitution (art9-4). A new Proclamation to "Provide for the Prevention and Suppression of Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling of Migrants" (No. 909/2015) was developed and endorsed by the Ethiopian Parliament in August 2015. This Proclamation has revised the legal definition of Trafficking in Persons and smuggling of Migrants while providing for much harsher sanctions for the perpetrators offense crimes to strengthen the existing penal code. (Including fines of up to 500,000 Birr and the death penalty in cases where victims suffer severe Injury or death).

2.9.1 Legal Enforcement Framework

This proclamation, the Anti-Trafficking and Smuggling Proclamation, establishes the framework of actions for preventing, tackling and punishing human trafficking and smuggling in Ethiopia. This proclamation encompasses the various components of an anti-trafficking response, including the enactment of severe penalties for the crimes of trafficking and smuggling, the prevention through awareness rising, and measures to help and protection to victims.

The Proclamation adopted in the aftermath of the migration ban forms part of the Goosefoots to tackle the issue of the widespread abuses, violence and trafficking that its citizens

experience abroad. Yet, as it will be described, the institutional instances created by the Proclamations have responsibilities that go beyond the issues of trafficking and smuggling: such as reintegration, and the implementation of the Overseas Employment Proclamation. As such, the framework of action addressing issues of trafficking and smuggling constitute a key vehicle, some multi-stakeholders' collaborative platform, to address broader issues of migration in Ethiopian thus forms a tool for migration governance in Ethiopia.

According to proclamation no. 909/2015 article 40 *Anti Human trafficking and Smuggling of migrants Task Force, which is accountable to the national committee aimed at supporting efforts intended to rehabilitation of victims, prevention and control of crimes of human trafficking and migrant smuggling is established.* To coordinate human trafficking works.

2.9.2 National Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force

According to Expertise France,2019 Memorandum of Understanding to Improve the Participation of Victim -witnesses of Human Trafficking the exact numbers of Ethiopians who have migrated irregularly abroad and of victims of trafficking (VoT) is unknown, due to the absence of centralized registration system; according to the national reports released by the Federal Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force Secretariat, between the year July 2015-Dec 2017, about 35000 youths were intercepted while crossing borders along different irregular migration routes. In the same period, the report shows that more than 200,000 irregular migrants returned home from different transit and destination countries mainly from Kingdom of Saudi-Arabia, Yemen, Djibouti, Libya, Egypt, Tanzania, Kenya, Malawi, Zambia, Somaliland and Zimbabwe. It can be presumed also that the majority of Ethiopian domestic workers living abroad are

vulnerable to different forms of exploitation in destination countries due to weak protection the government of Ethiopia (GoE) have been giving to overseas employment workers

2.10 Summary

Ethiopia, like many sub-Saharan African countries, is a source, destination, and transit country for victims of human trafficking. However, the country has begun to implement measures designed to limit TIP and migrant smuggling. Government institutions, such as the Ethiopian Human Rights Commission, are tasked with investigating and combatting human rights violations. These and other measures pursued by Ethiopia are helping to address the problem of human trafficking within the country. Although incremental progress is being made, more can be done to address the problem, and Ethiopia continues to strive for improvement in its legal framework and its implementation of that framework. (Country report Ethiopia, 2017).

The basic purpose of the NRM is to respect and protect the basic rights of victims of human trafficking, and refer them to the correct agencies for assistance and services. The main activities of the NRM are to properly identify, treat and refer the victims, efficiently coordinating their needs with civil society organizations, international organizations, criminal investigation agencies and procurator ate courts, as well as with interdisciplinary and inter-agency administrative anti-human-trafficking agencies (Liu, G. 2017).

As a multi-agency stakeholder coordination problem, human trafficking requires coordination of varieties stakeholder aimed at prevention, protection, prosecution and partnership operations are work with multi agency response activities and combination of different approaches should Require to compact human trafficking.

CHAPTER THREE

3.1 Research Methodology

This chapter gives details about the chosen research design, the research site and selected research participant. Furthermore, the section was cover methodologies starting from field work, data analysis and presentation. During field work, research method and ethical principle have been applied. The ethical principle was acquired by requesting consent and filling the consent form for the research participants. The field work was conducted at Addis Ababa city.

3.1.1. Research paradigm

3.1.1.1. The social constructivist worldview

Social constructivists hold assumptions that individuals seek understanding of the world in which they live and work. Individuals develop subjective meanings of their experience meanings directed to words certain object or things (Creswell, 2009). The aim of research, then, is to trust as much as possible on the participants' views of the situation being studied. Researchers recognize that their own backgrounds shape their interpretation, and they position themselves in the research to acknowledge how their interpretation flows from their personal, cultural, and historical experiences. They also interpret what they find, an interpretation shaped by the researcher's own experiences and background

3.1.2. Research Design

This study used a qualitative research method because it is the most appropriate method to answer the research question of this study. According to (Creswell, 2009) qualitative research is to purposefully select participants or sites (or documents or visual material) that will best help the researcher understand the problem and the research question. A qualitative approach enables the researcher to get an in-depth understanding of the issue and allow research participants to

express their views broadly. It is a more appropriate in terms of documenting rich and detailed information (Snap & Spencer, 2003).

Phenomenological research, in which the researcher identifies the essence of human experiences concerning a phenomenon, as described by participants in a study. Understanding the lived experiences marks phenomenology as a philosophy as well as a method (Creswell, 2003).

A qualitative approach is selected in which data primary could be collected through key informant interview by take in account the view of beneficiaries, this method used to gain better understanding of coordination framework and service accessing to victims of human trafficking, multi-agency service cooperation challenges and contribution of services when assisting victims.

3.1.3. Research Participant

In order to select the key informants of the study purposive sampling was used. Which is one of the non-probability sampling techniques. The concept of purposeful sampling is used in qualitative research. This means that the inquirer selects individuals and sites for study because they can purposefully inform an understanding of the research problem and central Phenomenon in the study (Creswell, 2007).

This study was select 10 key informants using purposive sampling techniques. From organizations working on human trafficking network and member of national anti-human trafficking task force network, that was selected purposively based on their significance in providing relevant information to this study. Different sector were selected, namely Federal Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force secretariat (FATTF), prevention working group led by Ministry of Labor and Social Affair (MoLSA), Addis Ababa city government bureau of labor and social Affair (BoLSA), protection working group led by urban job creation and food security agency

(UJCFSA), prosecution working group lead by Federal Attorney General ; International organization for migration (IOM) donor organization and civil society namely AGAR Ethiopia, Good Samaritan Association, Organization for Prevention, Rehabilitation and Reintegration of Female Street Children(OPRIFS) and Association for Women's Sanctuary Development(AWSAD) who working on human trafficking related activities and 5 beneficiary participants from selected rehabilitation center.

3.1.4. Inclusion criteria for Selected Organization

The following inclusion criteria were imply during selecting the research participants:

- Organization who work on human trafficking related activities and working office in Addis Ababa
- Institution that have rehabilitation service at Addis Ababa especially for NGO.
- Significance in providing relevant experience and information to this study
- Key informants were have determined based on their free consent, institutional mandate, and relevance of the official position, expertise and familiarity with the subject matter under consideration.

3.1.5 Inclusion Criteria for Selected Individual

- A returnee who came from Middle East and other counties
- A returnee who get service from rehabilitation center.
- A returnee who face exploitation and get assistance

3.1.6 Data Collection Tools

An interview guide is a list of question or issues that are to be explored in the course of interview.an interview guide is prepared in order to make sure that basically the same information is obtained from a number of people by covering the same material. The interview

guide provides topics or subject areas within which the interviewer is free to explore, and ask questions that will elucidate and illuminate that particular subject (Patton, Michael Quinn, 1990).

Among the numerous data collection tools, this study was employed key informant; interview guide Questions and focus group discussion (FGD) guide Questions to acquiring a detailed account of information and the lived experience of giving and access of service to victim of human trafficking.

3.1.7 Data Collection

Based on purposive sampling techniques the appropriate government and non-government organization which have already taken part in migration related issues were selected. The whole purpose and objective of the study as well as the inclusion criteria of participant was employed. The primary sources of data for this study was the backbone of the research finding. Before I went to the field. I developed interview question and discussion point for both key informant's and FGD participants prior to field interview I made observation in field area to see the daily activities. This is helpful to establish rapport with the research participant.

3.1.8 Key Informant Interview

Key informants are used primarily as a source of information on a variety of topics (Wiley, 1957). The key informant was selected purposefully based on the assumption that they are able to provide significant information on the issue. Semi-structure question was used as tool of data collection the key informant interviewees were selected from prevention working group lead by ministry of labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA), Addis Ababa city government bureau of labor and social Affairs (BoLSA), prevention working group urban job creation and food security agency (UJCFSA), prosecution working group lead by federal general attorney; Federal Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force secretariat (FATTF), International organization for migration

(IOM) donor organization and civil society namely AGAR Ethiopia, Good Samaritan Association, Organization for Prevention, Rehabilitation and Reintegration of Female Street Children(OPRIFS) and Association for Women's Sanctuary Development(AWSAD)

3.1.9 Interview

Providing a deeper understanding of social phenomena, who has a researcher topic or research question that they want to investigate, unstandardized interviews are sometimes used during the course of field research to augment field observations. Such unstructured interviews allow researchers to gain additional information about various phenomena they observe by asking questions of participants (Berg, 2001).

Semi-structured interviews also allow informants the freedom to express their views in their own terms. Semi-structure interviews can provide reliable, comparable qualitative data. (Crabtree, 2006). Purposively 5 returnees were selected from rehabilitation center for interview.

3.1.10 Focus Group Discussion

Focus groups are a data collection method used to reveal people's thoughts, perceptions, and experiences related to topics of interest to the researcher (Wayne, 2013. p264). Focused group are used to collect data through the process of group member interaction and discussion

A focus group interview is an interview a small group of people on a specific topic. Groups are typically six to eight people who participate in the interview for one-half to two hours (Patten, Michael Quinn, 1990). Focus group interviews also provide a means for collecting qualitative data in some settings and situations where a one-shot collection is necessary (Berg, 2001). Members are selected because they share characteristics, needs or interest. Two FGD were conducted with service beneficiary at selected rehabilitation center. The size of FGD participants were from 6-7 were used.

3.1.11 Observation

Observations, in which the research takes field notes on the behavior and activities of individuals at the research site (Creswell, 2003). The researcher gets close enough to study subjects to observe with or without participation usually to understand whether what they say, and they do.

3.1.12 Document Review

Secondary data were collected from different source including related document like the constitution of federal democratic Republic of Ethiopia 1995, prevention and suppression of trafficking in persons and smuggling of migrant's proclamation no.909/2015, Ethiopia's overseas employment proclamation no.923/2016. Reintegration directive, National referral mechanism and Protocol to prevent suppress and punish trafficking in person especially women and children which contains different information about the objectives of the study, from government office, non -government office report, format and practice procedure the particular focus is given on issues related to the study multi-agency responses setting in line with victim of human trafficking rehabilitation service access in Addis Ababa.

3.1.13 Description of Study Area

Addis Ababa is one of the key transit towns for migrants. Addis Ababa, home to only 3.7 per cent of the total Ethiopian population (as per the 2007 Population and Housing Census report), produces the third highest number of migrants (16.3%). Addis Ketema, Arada, Kirkos, Kolfe, Lidata and Yeka sub-cities are major sub-cities of origin and transit for irregular migration in Addis Ababa. Irregular immigrants that originate from regional states also use Addis Ababa as a main transit point to travel to the Middle East or Europe using Bole International Airport as a border crossing point. Addis Ababa is also home for some refugees that

are benefiting from out of camp policy. In this section of the report, the key stakeholders that work on migration along with coordination mechanisms that exist in the city administration are highlighted.(ILO, 2018).The study was conducted in Addis Ababa federal government institution and non- government organization which service provision for trafficked persons.

3.1.14 Data Analysis

Data obtained from key informant, interviews and, focused group discussions were collected using voice recording and hand writing. After the compilation the data collection from the key informant's interviewees analysis were conducted based on the after both data types were collected, the recorded voices were transcribed and translated point by point. After having transcribed the audio-recording and made some checks on the data that gathered through all techniques, a researcher was organizes the raw data in to conceptual categories and creates themes. Take the significant statements and then group them into larger units of information called meaning units or themes (Creswell, 2003). All the information gathered in to key themes so that the data of each items with the same flow of content themes related to research questions were selected and analyzed. A good thematic data analysis addresses the thematic content of interview transcripts or other texts by providing common themes in the texts identified for analysis. The researcher groups and employs common themes and ideas from the gathered data in order to give voice to the similar and different themes of the participants (Kothari, 2004). In the process of organizing the gathered data under each category were given to each participant's idea in order to easily identify who said what. The findings had discussed through triangulating data from interviews, FGD and observation. Finally based on the findings of the study conclusions, recommendations and implication for social work is drawn.

273.1.15. Trust Worthiness and Quality Assurance

The quality of this research highly relies on the quality of data to be collected from the field. To this effect, various quality assurance mechanisms was applied by the researcher to ensure data quality at the different stages of design, data collection and processing. The data from key informant interview and observation are triangulated as a way of strengthen confidence in their validity.

3.1.16. Ethical Consideration

Ethical concerns were given due consideration in process of conducting the study. The research participants were approached by the researcher to establish rapport. Once they expressed them willingness, the objective of the study was explained to them before their consent. A support letter explaining the objectives of the research was taken from Addis Ababa University School of social work and showed to the participants of the study. Verbal consents were received prior to the interviews for each participant in the study.

Accordingly, the participants of the interview were explained the confidentiality of the interview in which their will not be used other than this study. It also agreed that the fact that the research subjects are free to discontinue them participation at any time they wish to do so and to ask the researcher detail questions on issues they are not clear on. The interviews were conducted with participant code used in place of the true names of the informants and the recorded voices remained confidential.

CHAPTER FOUR

4.1. Data Presentation

This chapter present researcher obtained through different data collection tools from participants are present. Same significant points or direct quotation from transcribed data were presented.

The data was collected from key informants using interview as well as Focused Group Discussion (FGD) with victim's returnees and beneficiaries' interviewees. The data presentation of the study organized under thematic issues it focused on participants' demographic characteristics, coordination efforts with stake holder, comprehensive services for victims of human trafficking and multi-agency responses.

4.1.1 Demographics Characteristics of Research Participants

In this section, the demographic characteristics of the study participants were presented. For the key informant interview participants of the concerned stakeholders, this study consists of 10 key informants those of them consisted 6 females and 4 male key informant's participant.in terms of education qualification 3 of them are MA and the others are BA and LLB degree.in the other side two Focused Group Discussion (FGD) was conducted in the FGD one 7 victim's returnees was participated, in the FGD two 6 male victim's returnees was participated.

Table 4.1.1.1 Demographic characteristics of research participants

Participant's code	Gender	Organization	Position in the organization	Role in the network
Key informant 1	Female	Good Samaritan Association (GSA)	Acting Executive Directress	Member
Key informant 2	Male	Ministry of labour and social Affair	Team Leader	Lead of prevention working group.

		(MoLSA).		
Key informant 3	Male	FDRE Urban job creation and food security Agency	Enterprise development Director	Lead of protection working group
Key informant 4	Female	Organization for prevention, rehabilitation of female street children (OPRIFS).	Executive Directress	Member of network
Key informant 5	Female	Association for women sanctuary development (AWSAD).	Executive Directress	Member of network group
Key informant 6	Female	International Organization for migration (IOM)	Program coordinator	Member of network
Key informant 7	Female	Federal Anti-human trafficking task force (FATTF)	Head of secretariat	Leader of network
Key informant 8	Male	Federal Attorney General	Organized trans-border deputy Director	Lead of persecution working group
Key informant 9	Female	Addis Ababa city Administration bureau labor and social Affairs (BolSA).	Overseas employment promotion expert	Member of network
Key informant 10	Male	Agar Ethiopia	Male rehabilitation manager	Member of network

Source Key Informant Interviewees, (2019)

The above table presents that the first of the key informants was the Acting of executive directress position of Good Samaritan Association. having Master degree and experience on gender issue and member of the national anti-human trafficking task force network GSA

working on women safe house. Working for a long time on human trafficking issues, the main service of the organization is provision of shelter victim assistance in shelter. She knows about the organization is supposed to have every information about the organization and the services provided under shelter.

The second key informant was the team leader at MoLSA and focal person of the prevention work subgroup lead by MoLSA experienced in the organization having master's degree and having experience coordinating in different migration network group

The third key informant interviewee was director of Enterprise development at FUJCA and focal person to lead the prevention working group. He has bachelor degree. And coordinate the protection subgroup under FATTF.

The fourth key informant was executive directress of OPRIFS she has LLB degree and experience in different human trafficking subgroup

The fifth key informant was executive directress of AWSAD. She has LLB degree and longtime experience on safe house administration and victim's assistance work, and member of shelter network organization

The sixth key informants were a program coordinator at international organization for migration (IOM). Has experience in migration and returnee's reintegration program; IOM working on government capacity building to have national referral mechanism and community base reintegration.

The seventh key informant was head of the federal anti-human trafficking task force secretariat. She has LLB and coordinate overall the network of FATTE and sub working group secretariat take the report from prevention, protection and persecution subgroup and compile the report to the national committee

The eighth key informant was deputy director at federal general Attorney and coordinate the persecution subgroup work on mutual legal assistance for victims of human trafficking investigate the case of human trafficking and smuggling cases and working boarder intercept collaborating with other stakeholder.

The ninth key informant was Addis Ababa city Administration BoLSA overseas and employment expert she has BA degree and experience on human trafficking network members from different community representative like idirs. Using different consultative meeting and forum plat form on the migration issues.

The last tenth key informant was Agar Ethiopia male rehabilitation manager, has BA degree and experience in rehabilitation administration and victim's assistance. Agar Ethiopia member of the national task force and shelter network organization, one of the experienced organization on human trafficking issues and victim's assistance in different manner.

4.1.2 Coordination Efforts with Stakeholder

As the research participants were explained, currently all participants used their own coordination efforts to coordinate their stakeholder. Regarding to the victims of human trafficking coordination effort, they used different coordination efforts.

According to research participant said the following;

By coordinating the federal and regional office of MoLSA works on different awareness rising using a different strategy like a TV drama, religious leader, radio spot, community participation using CC (community conversation). (key informant 2, 2019).

The other research participant described;

No framework to cooperate with stakeholder, there is lack of duties and responsible for their own task. There is no evaluation mechanism of level of effort Evaluate by their own work .it needs government assessment to support NGO and other sectors (key informant 1, 2019).

According to the key informant from urban job creation and food security agency said the following;

“Lack of coordination and collaboration between responsible sectors does not plan and report accordingly there is no legal responsibility. There is a gap of collaboration between stakeholder’s problem of timely report and planning problem no correctional major taken for this clarity of responsibility are a major problem”. (Key informant 3, 2019).

The data gets from FATTF research participant explained conducted mid- term evaluation of strategic plan the key informant said the following;

“Research and monitoring working group are less functionality even know substitute by partnership working group lead by attorney General. It needs strategic plan revision and endorse by national committee; even proclamation 909/2015 also under revision. (Key informant 7, 2019).”

According to FATTF key informant said the following;

For migration prone area. It needs the same structure to national level task force structure formal and institution communication it needs legalized role, Legal replication to region and 909/2007 under revision to give mandate to region (key informant 7, 2019)

4.1.3 Comprehensive Service For victims of Human Trafficking

Regarding to comprehensive service for victims of human trafficking, the needs of service providers working with victims to meet those needs. In the absence of comprehensive service for victims of human trafficking it will be difficult victims to rehabilitate from their trauma. Little organization are working on rehabilitation service with limited resources .same origination working with victims of human trafficking the organization have providing shelter service to victims. According to research participant interviewed said as following;

She returned from bruit her age is 22, she returns because of her mental illness, her madam forced to take cigarettes and felt mentally stress. She gets shelter accommodation, food, medical treatment and counselling (Interview 2, 2019).

The other research participant also notes he said;

“ I am 20 years old, my mother and father are died, I have no sister and brother, I live with my grandmother after my grandmother died I am plan to migrate”. (FGD2, participant, 2019).

The purpose of providing comprehensive services for victims are to normalized their life and very helpful to their life. Major Service providing to victims are shelter, counselling, and psychosocial support special those who were in problem. Victims of human trafficking face the most prevalence form of abuse physical abuse and sexual abuse most commonly.

According to the research participant descried;

She is rape by solder and treated in human violation of human right; she has pregnancy and has a baby from solder, she deported empty hand. She faces difficulty with her baby, her baby is not having a birth certificate and any identification document she is difficult to get her baby medical

treatment in Ethiopia. She did not know her baby father also. Her baby also difficult of citizenship, (FGD one participant I, 2019).

The research participant describe that;

She returned from bruit, her age is 28 her education status is grades 5, she spent 5 years in bruit then she returns with problem, she has fracture of her leg, she returns to with the assistance of 50 lomi association in berut her friends assistance, she feels to stress when thinking about the community attitude towards her. (Interview 1, 2019)

With the most complex nature of the victim's problem it needs comprehensive services. In order to out their trauma victims they need support.

4.1.4 Multi-Agency Responses

Working with victims of human trafficking and migration needs vast resource and multi – agency response to deliver effective service for victims of trafficked persons. They needs to effective coordination system to provide effective service for victims.

Multi-agency responses important to prevent human trafficking and to coordinate government and civil society stakeholder.

According to research participant describes that;

“There is a challenge of Shelter rent problem and increment of shelter rent year to year Family tracing with the cooperation of government local structure in order to found the returnee's family by their own system.” (Key informant 1, 2019).

4.1.4.1 Challenges of Referral System

Victims of human trafficking are needs the national referral system in order to access service from different organization. The service delivery organization should have referral mechanism to victims to coordinate different types of service with their stakeholder there is absence national referral mechanism to assist victims of trafficked persons

According to key informant said the following;

Referral mechanism, at the time of boarder intercept and internal trafficking one-time victim witness from south region get rehabilitation center, they missed and cancel the case, no comprehensive service of victim center, domestic trafficking investigation technical and skill majority focused on broker not master mind of human trafficking mostly master mind of the trafficker lives in Addis Ababa trans board like Kenya and other transit country. There is collaboration and coordination problem on this working group. (Key informant 8, 2019).

Regarding to the referral mechanism to trafficked persons it needs to coordinate and facilitate between the service provider organizations

4.1.5 Back ground Information for Focused Group Discussion One

The below table shows as far as sex and age of the participants in concerned, 7 female returnees age range between 21-39 have been discussed in FGD one. In terms of their level of education background, out of the 7 female returnees taking part in this study, two was illiterate, two was grade ten, one six, one grade seven and one grade twelve' Regarding to the returned countries three female was from Saudi Arabia, one from Yemen, one form Djibouti and one from

Dubai. Regarding to place of origin region three was from Addis Ababa, two from Oromia, one from Harari and one from Amhara regions.

Table 4.2 background information participants for FGD one profile.

Participant code	Sex	Age	Returned countries	Education	Region
Participant I	Female	29	Djibouti	Illiterate	Oromia
Participant II	Female	21	Saudi Arabia	Illiterate	Harari
Participant III	Female	39	Yemen	Grade 10	Addis Ababa
Participant IV	Female	23	Dubai	Grade 10	Oromia
Participant V	Female	38	Saudi Arabia	Grade 12	Addis Ababa
Participant VI	Female	b33	Libya	Grade 6	Addis Ababa
Participant VII	Female	22	Saudi Arabia	Grade 7	Amhara

Source; Focused Group Discussion FGD One (2019).

There are 7 returnees participated. In FGD one from different destination country returned. In the discussion the reason for migration are almost the same result economically reason because of unemployment and lack of job opportunities in the place of origin, broker's false information.

The research participant in FGD describe that;

she migrated for the reason of better job opportunities on abroad, she recruited by agent, and employee in three-year contract in Libya, broker give information if you have injured or other things there are insurance coverage by the contract and medical coverage, almost it is false promise by the broker give to her. (FGD1 participant, 2019).

On the other hands, regarding to kinds of exploitation faced by victim's returnee came back with bad experience labour exploitation of victims of trafficking.

She returned from Saudi Arabia has disabled; she did not receive her salary when she requested after two years her employer through from the

building. Her employer is bad even they did not give food, she eats food in the toilet room and sleeps in the toilet room, her employer psychically abused. When she asks to return to her family her employer warned by the knife when she tries to escape from her employer through from the building she is physically disabled. (FGD1 participant, 2019).

After that, she did not know herself for three days after three days she knows herself at the hospital she spent 4 years in hospital treatment. Same Ethiopia collects the same money for returnees her to Ethiopia. After her returnee Ethiopia she get AGAR Ethiopia rehabilitation service Four months stay in a rehabilitation center She gets shelter, accommodation, food, medical treatment, sanitary material, soap, and psychosocial support If she did not get AGAR shelter it same to “*dead dog body through outside the street*” so it is good to get this shelter.no one concern about her.

4.1.6. Back ground Information of Focused Group Discussion Two participants

The following table show 6 Male returnees of age range between 19-58 have been discussed in FGD two. In terms of their level of education, out of the 6 male returnees taking discussion, two was grade eight, one grade nine, one grade seven one grade twelve and one illiterate. Regarding to the returned countries 5 male was from Saudi Arabia and one from South Africa. Regarding to place of origin region four was from Amhara, one from Oromia regions

Table 4.3 background information for FGD two participants profile

Participant Code	Sex	Age		Education	Region
Participant I	Male	58	South Africa	Grade 12	Oromia
Participant II	Male	22	Saudi Arabia	Grade 9	Amhara
Participant III	Male	25	Saudi Arabia	Grade 8	Tigray
Participant IV	Male	19	Saudi Arabia	Grade 7	Amhara
Participant V	Male	20	Saudi Arabia	Grade 8	Amhara
Participant VI	Male	25	Saudi Arabia	Illiterate	Amhara

Source; Focused Discussion (FGD) two, (2019)

In the FGD two discussions 6 returnees participated. They mentioned the reason for migrated are almost the same economical reason except one returnee political reason. About migration route all participant uses the irregular route of migration guided by broker and smuggler in different transit and distention area

4.1.7. Background Information of Interviews

Table 4.4 background information for interviews participants' profile

Participant code	Sex	Age	Education	Returned country
Interview I	Female	28	Grade 5	Beirut
Interview II	Female	22	Grade 8	Beirut
Interview III	Female	20	Grade 6	Saudi Arabia
Interview IV	Female	25	Grade 7	Saudi Arabia
Interview V	Female	21	Grade 8	Kuwait

Source, (Interview, 2019)

As indicated in the above table five of the interview participants in the study are female regarding to age ranges from 21-28 year and concerning on the education level participants were two of them are grade eight others are grade seven, grade six and grade five. About returned country two of them from Beirut, two of them from Saudi Arabia and the rest one from Kuwait.

Regarding to the kind of service from the rehabilitation center

CHAPTER FIVE

5. Finding and Discussion

This chapter deals with the findings of this study based on the data was collected from research participants, it used phenomenological approach. The findings were organized under three thematic issues. by describing and analyzing the current findings in relation to the existing literature were discussion.

5.1 National response to human trafficking

Two bodies were created to address the issue of trafficking and smuggling. The first is an Anti-Trafficking National Coordination Committee, chaired by the Prime Minister's Office, which has a political role in advising and guiding policy, and the second is a National Task Force, led by the Federal Attorney General. The Task Force is composed of 38 organizations, including 17 government institutions, UN agencies, some civil society organizations, religious organizations, and media organs.

5.1.1. Functionality of Multi-Agency Responses

There is a need to comprehensive migration framework to cooperate stakeholder to address effect of migration. The magnitude of the problem are needs the multi-agency approaches to involving different stakeholder have a duty to be given attention to the problem at different level of migration. Effective cooperation mechanism gives a chance to address the problem. Coordination to support victims of human trafficking are effective to deliver service, the following gaps were identified;

There is weak coordination system and low functionality between human trafficking stakeholder. Awareness raising and creation of job opportunities are important factors to reduce irregular migration in the community. The task force by itself challenges to give service for victims of trafficked persons.

There is difficulty on victim's assistance and witness center to implement its responsibility for their work by Task force .it has a legal framework like proclamation, directive on the issues under the law but there is weak performance and Lack of responsibility, diffusion of responsibility between stakeholder and low functionality among responsible sectors; weak coordination problem between the subgroup to give comprehensive referral system between and among the stakeholder .it need to focused on. Migration for development, safe migration, and remittance policy initiative's.

There is a gap on accountability mechanism and national referral mechanism to assist trafficked persons as well as national migration framework like policy issues. There is little shelter in the country, and it needs witness cascade improvement of the justice system for fighting human trafficking also important on selective area of migration pro area and work on awareness raising.

5.1.2. Contribution of Comprehensive Service for Victims of Human Trafficking

Most of victims of human trafficked persons needs comprehensive service those who are with different trauma. They need to rehabilitation of victims to providing all necessary service support like shelter, clothes, counseling and psychosocial and medical support. With this regard, the following gaps were identified.

There is no government owned rehabilitation service for victims of human trafficking the service provide to victims of trafficking are the given by civil society organization working with victim of human trafficking. Have provided shelter. Civil society organization like Agar Ethiopia and Good Samaritan Association are working on human trafficking and empowering victims of trafficking. They provide comprehensive services like shelter, food, clothes, and psycho social and medical services to trafficked persons. They have experience in rehabilitating, economic reintegration and reunifying of victims of human trafficking by providing victims

The services provided to victims of trafficking and safe migration focused organization potential migrant and returns working on awareness creation, vocational training and giving seed money. Job opportunities with the private sector. Life skills, business skills, and reproductive health.

. Same of the organization are. no screening mechanism by their own; same of the civil society organizations are gives the service to assist victims trafficked persons which is provided safe house, vocational training, psycho social support and legal aid. Through Working with police, women and child affair and BoLSA.

5.1.3. Challenges of Referral System for Assisting Victims of Trafficking

Challenges when assisting victims of trafficking are psychological problem, economically problem, traumatized problem, high expectation returnees. The community attitude towards the returnees, lack of rehabilitation in victim's assist and no comprehensive national referral mechanism with duty and responsibility the migrant resource center, the challenges to give service for trafficked persons; service giving organization face then working with victims of trafficking it needs expensive resources and needs skilled professionals to deliver effective services for their beneficiary. There is coordination problem between service

giving organization and government responsible sector as well as lack of national referral system to support victims of trafficked persons

5.1.3.1 psychosocial problem

Multifaceted challenges being faced by the victims. The data collected during the fieldwork shows that victims faced a lot of diversified problems during the cross border journey, which is made to reach destination country. The study also discovered that Ethiopian victims of trafficking face very devastating problems including rape and death after they have crossed the border and transferred to traffickers. But it is not to say that the victims do not face problems while they were inside their country's border.

Women returnees with special needs those who are disabled, those who face mental health issues as a result of abuse and violence experienced while abroad, or returnees who are Victims of trafficking will usually be identified early on, either upon their arrival at the airport or soon after their return does not get immediate service

The study also used focus group discussion as a data collection tool to ensure the data quality and to triangulate the findings. Focus group discussion ensured extensiveness of data in the meantime participants discussed from different views. Researcher was conducted two FGD which contains seven and six participants respectively but the result of the discussion which have were collected with FGD guide question much similar with the one that were collected from FGD two. So, I have compiled the result together and prepared this discussion as follow so as to remove redundancy of idea.

Reason to migration discussed on FGD are for better life, Lack of job opportunities, and false information regarding to the destination country. Regarding to route of migration they are

many Ethiopia girls use eastern migration route their destination is Middle East country. They recruited by a broker, trafficker and smuggler to the boarder

Regarding to the types of exploitation during the process of trafficking, a victim's basic human rights are violated: they may be beaten, raped and threatened by employer. Labor exploitation, physical abuse, prison, bondage are the most common one. When victims fall under the control of the traffickers, they are mostly too terrified to seek help.

Regarding to the types of service they get to victims of human trafficking are they received services like shelter, food and clothes, and medical services to trafficked

On the other hands, the service contribution it is good to receive from airport and reunification with their family and place of origin. But the problem to victims are arrival reception and guide to the appropriate information and service giver address for help.

5.2 Discussion

5.2.1 Multi Agency Cooperation Framework in Migration Functioning

Regarding this issues, research participants were describing many different multi-agency responses based on their experience on the issues and their Owen experience work experience with their stakeholder to assist victims

5.2.1.1 Federal Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force (FATTF)

One of this study finding describes that the Gap of national coordination mechanism the main reason to be establish Federal Anti – human Trafficking Task force established under the proclamation no 909/2015 .to coordinate the national anti-trafficking activities Legal mandate given to federal Attorney General. Under the coordination of. FATTF is different government institution, international organization and civil society are member of task force. Under national task force there are four working group. Prevention working group, protection working group, prosecution working group and research and monitoring working group.

The study conducted on this issue described that by ILO & MoLSA although many efforts were made to improve the reintegration of returnees, the desired results were not achieved. In this regard, the stakeholders determined that the major reasons were lack of coordination, lack of responsibility and lack of a clear mandate (ILO & MoLSA, 2018). In this regard, the finding of this study consists to the finding of other research on the same issues.

To facilitate Coordination and cooperation structure of FATTF is by strategic plan members of Federal organization are its own role in the strategic plan but Legal coordination mechanism given by law given to attorney General. All member organization Focal person assigned by Director Position plan and report to human trafficking task force Secretariat. The task force Give evaluation to focal person’s organization. The gap identified in this regard is no

accountability mechanism to working group member organization. Accountability measure are administratively because of inter- agency coordination mechanism. Accountability with institutional level and Task force experience also recently trend to Ethiopia institution.

The study conducted in Ethiopia recommended to have an institution should be clearly mandated to address trafficking in persons and exploitation of migrant workers. A formal coordination system should also be established between the different governmental and non-governmental stakeholders at the national and regional levels to ensure integrated, comprehensive and multi-agency approach towards combating trafficking and exploitation of migrant workers (ILO, 2011).

The finding of this study more supports to the above ILO study. Achievement of the FATTF Overall framework is available for human trafficking Legal frame work UN convention protocol ratified by Ethiopia and have Legal aid by Proclamation909/2015; draft National referral mechanism and Reintegration directive.

Challenges of the FATTF is International definition of VoT is need the fulfillment of Aim, Purpose and Means, dominantly Mass deportation returnees need less Referral mechanism system to VoT Less investigative capacity to court. Only focused on broker not chained network large criminal person Legal limitation, Lack of Commitment to institution to mainstreaming the issues, Resource limitation, Lack of leadership and Lack of civil society involvement. Migration aspect issues expanding the mandate of task force in region and Engagement of civil society fighting against human trafficking; Private sector large industry owner civil society engagement mobilization and civil society engagement in the task force.

5.2.1.2 Prevention Working Group

Study carried on this issue in Ethiopia describes that; a comprehensive anti-human trafficking strategy should incorporate prevention programs to be carried out by the government in cooperation with civil society. Moreover, the legislator must take care to harmonize related laws with anti-human trafficking legislations. Related legislation must likewise be reviewed and brought into compliance with international and regional human rights standards and the anti-trafficking laws (Mehari, .et at., 2017).

Focused on awareness rising and safe migration aspects .it concerns including from country and labor bilateral agreement in the distention country. MoLSA working on migration two major task one to prevent human trafficking by using different strategies working on awareness raising and second strength safe migration as a means of prevent human trafficking. Under the national task force, there are sub-working group's prevention, protection, prosecution, and partnership.

MoLSA leads the prevention working group. Under prevention working group more than 25-member organization from government, NGO, religious institution, media, private sector, and international organization

The aim of the prevention working group is three.

- 1, using different strategy creating awareness rising to the community
- 2, strengthen legal migration to prevent human trafficking
- 3, collaborators with other institutions facilitate job creation to prevent human trafficking

proclamation no.923/2016 article 8 (1) describes awareness rising program undertake regular pre-employment and pre-departure awareness raising to citizens who show interest to take-up overseas employment pertaining to the conditions of receiving countries, the required skill for a

job position they are taking, their rights and duties and similar other matters; regularly working by the ministry.

Working on prevention by MoLSA to strengthen legal migration legal framework proclamation no 923/2016, directive and manual. There is the structure from federal to the region to facilitate this work. Migrant database with the assistance of international labor organization (ILO) to communicate the lower structure to handle migrant profile from the beginning region to destination country. Working on the prevention of human trafficking and safe migration. Labor attaché assign with the collaboration between MoLSA and ministry of foreign affair (MoFA) it is ready to assign with the experience of another country. According to proclamation 923/2016 Article 14 (1) The Ministry shall,

In consultation with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and after obtaining permission from Government, cause the assignment of a Labour Attaché in the mission of the receiving country to ensure protection of the rights, safety and dignity of workers employed overseas.

400 agencies have license start recruitment of employees; began to training to have skill on the selected caregiving, housekeeping skill training with occupational standard (OS) and manual. There is 66 selected public training center to give training, there is a way to participate in the training center.

5.2.1.3 Protection Working Group

Concern on victim's protection and reintegration and Job creation aspects. Urban job creation which is different international organization members like IOM, GIZ, ILO etc. focused on job creation and protecting victims. Working on job creation for unemployment and returnees generally from 18-60 age job creation for all citizens inside the country. Process of Registration

and job creation; awareness creation and work readiness Training on soft skill Basic business skill development training by collaboration with the other stakeholder and us a leading of protection working group under federal anti-human trafficking task force it is the mandate of urban job creation and food security agencies. By preparing directive it is collaboration efforts according to the directive How to coordinate their stakeholder there is existing coordination mechanism.

According to Federal job creation and food Security Council lead by deputy minister secretariat Common plan and report under the council the 2010 year 8,500 returnees create job there are challenges when going to in the local structure regarding land access overall it is collaboration problem all people are a target but especially 18-35 age is a priority. Challenges Limited participation in the working group same active organization actively participate. The functionality of the working group is weak and weak even in secretariat level weak coordination level us a federal.

5.2.1.4 Prosecution Working Group

Prosecution working group is focused on the law enforcement implementation and trafficker and smuggler case. different federal and civil society organization are member of this working group at the time of this study conducting their is 55 pending smuggling case from this case 29 are decided, because of human trafficking a complex case they pace different challenge's to implement according to the proclamation. human trafficking is a dynamic issue even problem of investigating skill because of this it focused on the brokers not on the master mined of the human trafficker in large criminal action it is trans boarder issues it intervene different actors on the human trafficking crime, it needs in advance investigating skill, technology and economical

resource. The other challenges are get witness center; but according to proclamation no.909/2015 Article 26 (4)

“The victims while staying at temporary shelter shall, in no case, be kept in police stations, detention centres or prisons; and unless victims are required for testimony in the judicial process, they shall not stay in temporary shelter for a period exceeding three months”

Practically it is difficult to implement under the prosecution working group; does not use victim centered investigation to implement this article. Know a time it began to do multi - agency coordination system by memorandum of understanding with the rehabilitation center and law enforcement bodies to facilitate this kind of service.

Human trafficking law enforcement.

Challenges which is as general reason for migration are scarce economic opportunities, High poverty Migration as a culture for our community awareness rising working with behavioral change and Poor communication between regions. Service is not victim’s center investigation;

Addressing internal trafficking most focused international trafficking and Child labor abuse and exploitation Witness consent base and victim’s rehabilitation center there is standards of procedure (SoP) preparation by MoLSA to give service. There is Different motives to exploitation victims of human trafficking. Institutionalization of the task force work.

5.2.2. Contribution of Comprehensive Service Provision for Trafficked Person

The other findings on this study were the issues of Comprehensive service for victims it needs government and civil society organization collaboration. Victims of human trafficked are complex needs they want psychosocial support, medical assistance and economical reintegration

in order to sustainable reintegrate with their community. National anti-human trafficking task force and member of migration working group. Working recover and social inclusion

5.2.2.1 Access of Rehabilitation Service

The study conducted in Ethiopia illustrates that; Trafficked persons are constantly abused both in the trafficking process and up on their arrival on the place of destinations by the traffickers themselves and their employers respectively. Victims of human trafficking therefore experience a range of problems in all stages of the trafficking Trafficked persons are constantly abused both in the trafficking process and up on their arrival on the place of destinations by the traffickers themselves and their employers respectively. Victims of human trafficking therefore experience a range of problems in all stages of the trafficking (Hailemichael, et at., 2014).

A study conducted by ILO argued that Women returnees with special needs those who are disabled, those who face mental health issues as a result of abuse and violence experienced while abroad, or returnees who are victims of trafficking will usually be identified early on, either upon their arrival at the airport or soon after their return(ILO,2017). Which is supporting the finding of this study.

The rehabilitation center contribution to returnees are very important and need for them rehabilitate from their trauma and in order to get accommodation and family reunification for victims of trafficking and to gets vocational training like food preparation. They are medical treatment and get Emanuel psychiatry specialized hospital and she gets vocational training food preparation and shelter accommodation. same of the returnee the have followed up medical treatment in Emanuel hospital 6 months spent in the shelter and follow up by care giver medical treatment. And donor cooperation with a partner to assist victims of trafficking. Contribution of

the service reintegration contributes arrival reception when arrive in the country. Facilitate training for economic reintegration, to contribute their family, community and the whole country contribution.

5.2.2.2 Psychosocial Supports

Based on the observation conducted for this study; the researcher was observed very limited victims of trafficked psychosocial support being provided by government institution. The service rely on the civil society originations to provide this kind of supports .the study conducted in Ethiopia suggested that ;the need

Psychosocial assistance is a broad term that may encompass specific mental health care, as well as related non-therapeutic interventions. Counselling and psychosocial support may include addressing issues related to family difficulties, economic difficulties, and other difficulties encountered at the social level (ILO, 2017).

The FGD discussion result also show that the reason for migration are economically because of unemployment and lack of job opportunities; in the place of origin. Participants reported different kind of abuse in the process of the journey using irregular route of migration participants face physical abuse, psychological abuse and in prison in inhuman condition at transit though smugglers indifferent prison and use as bondage to take money from their family and relatives by smugglers.

5.2.3. Challenges of Referral System

Referral mechanism to victims of human trafficked are gap in national coordination mechanism to assist the victims by providing comprehensive service and building system to

coordinate the stakeholder both government and civil society. According to the study on this issues

There are gaps in terms of the institutional capacity to respond to the new and growing field of intervention regarding the reintegration of returnees. The needs of returnees are greater than the current capacities of the various institutions involved (ILO, 2017) this study finding argues that;

When you work with victims of trafficking there is Challenges which affects the work there are limited rehabilitation center working on victim's assistance specially returnees with mental illness, Same of the civil society organization are used the Owen internal referral system and collaboration to provide services for victims of trafficking.

A key component of an effective coordination is an effective referral mechanism, be it for referrals from one agency to another, from one component of the reintegration to another, or between the different service providers. Individual organizations have their own referral mechanisms toward specific services (ILO, 2017).

A study conducted by IOM concludes that ; With the guidance of governmental authorities and the participation of civil society organizations, many countries have launched and made some achievements in the establishment of referral agencies for victims of human trafficking, especially agencies for assistance, settlement and recovery. Nevertheless, most countries do not have a specific agency or a specific fund for the protection of these victims, nor have they made the assistance, settlement and recovery of victims of human trafficking part of the daily task or future responsibility of their Governments (Liu, 2017).

Ethiopia, there were no government run shelter for victims of human trafficking and very few NGO's owen shelter in Addis Ababa.

5.2.4. Human Right Aspect in Human Trafficking

Human trafficking is both a cause and consequence of the violation of human rights and human trafficking should be explicitly characterized as human right violation (OHCHR, 2002).

Study conducted on this issue suggests that protecting migrants' rights and ensuring their well-being; securing migrant workers' rights and labour standards, and protecting migrants from abuses, exploitation and human trafficking (IOM, 2017). Regarding to finding of this study were claims the violation of human right and consists to this study with the review literature.

Trafficking is a cause of human rights violation because it violates fundamental human rights, such as the right to life, the right to dignity and security, the right to just and favorable conditions of work, the right to health the right to equality and the right to be recognized as a person before the law (Farrokhzad,2017, p.134).

The findings of this study argues that; victims of trafficking are face The kind of exploitation through the journey very high abused physically, psychologically Prison with abuse physically, psychological abusing one month without enough food spent at prison. At the time of journey there seen death.

According to Palermo protocol (2000) Article 2 (b) propose to protect and assist the victims of such trafficking, with full respect for their human rights. The findings of this study concludes that victims of trafficking face violations of basic human right during the journey to irregular migration

CHAPTER SIX

6.1. Conclusion. Recommendation and Social Work Implication

In this chapter present the conclusion, recommendations and social work implication consequently based on the study finding and discussion conducted. And finally same of them a policy, practice implication.

6.1.1. Conclusion

Currently there is no comprehensive migration policy in Ethiopia. The magnitude of the problem needs the multi-agency approach responses to ensure the assistances of migration. there is a need to establish effective coordination mechanism to tackle the problem. The key mechanism of multi-stakeholder coordination is currently the Anti-Trafficking Task Force, in relation to the absence of coordination, a concern expressed by many stakeholders.

According to ILO national referral mechanism is a co-operative framework through which state actors fulfill their obligations to protect and promote the human rights of trafficked persons, coordinating their efforts in a strategic partnership with civil society. The main purpose is to ensure the human rights of trafficked persons are respected and to provide an effective way to refer victims of trafficking to services.

Based on the findings of this study it may be conclude that there is weak coordination between stakeholder of victims of human trafficking and members of anti- human trafficking task force, there is diffusion of responsibility between the taskforce working group, as well as a gap on national referral mechanism on victim's assistance There is a lack of effective coordination on national migration framework; even if the proclamation, directive under the law but there is weak performance and lack of accountability mechanism, diffusion of responsibility between sectors Weak coordination problem at the federal level.

Government aggressively work on the job creation issues because the cause of migration is more of economically and unemployment of youth in the place of origin communities. Government better work on migration for development, safe migration, and remittance there is the lack of rehabilitation center to assist trafficked person's the justice system needs to work victim center investigation by witness cascade improvement.

6.1.2 Recommendation

Based on the finding under this study on the multi –agency cooperation frame work of comprehensive referral system for victims of human trafficking the following recommendation are given;

- There is need to establish National coordination mechanism for better coordination of the inter-Agency approaching in different level of engagement of institution to assist trafficked persons.
- The government should take the leading role to coordinate and create comprehensive referral system in order to access service for trafficked persons.
- Currently there is no comprehensive migration policy in Ethiopia, but international conventions ratified accordingly to this there is a proclamation this is one improvement to fight human trafficking; but it needs national migration profile
- Government must create better job opportunities to youth in the place of origin communities and work on behavioral change awareness rising program.
- Civil society organization expanded their work on victim's protection rehabilitation center and collaborate with multi-disciplinary professional service assistance.

- Government should address the issue of human trafficking in order to minimize the violation of victim's right.
- Federal anti-human trafficking task force better to upgrading to national coordination and include private sector; civil society representative in order to insure addressing the issue of migration collaborations mechanism to address the community.

6.1.3 Social Work Implication

The finding of the study has also many implications for the need of social work practice. Social work practitioners could identify, assess, describe and evaluate the need for more rehabilitation, psychosocial service and social work services for trafficked persons. In order to achieve this goal, this research implies the need to detailed and comprehensive understanding of victims of human trafficking.

From policy point of view, Social workers need to advocate for policy improvement and promote the care and supports services to trafficked person from the human right perspective. Social workers should work on the individual, group and communities, NGOs, the government in different sectors and grass root level should advocate for benefit of migrant The government should provide attention for migration issues and it adverse effect to the community. The care and support service should also focus on the needs of trafficked person's gives attention to access service available.

References

- Abebaw, M., & Waganesh, Z. (2015). *Re- conceptualizing human trafficking*. World Academy of science, engendering and technology, vol. 3
- Abebaw, M., (2013). *Experiences of trafficked Ethiopian domestic workers who returned from the Gulf States: Implications for intervention and policy development*, Dissertation. Addis Ababa: Addis Ababa University
- Andrijasevic, R, & Walters, W. (2010). *The international organization for migration and the international government of boarders, Environment and planning D: society and space*
- Ardeshir Farrokhzad (2017) *Human trafficking: A human rights oriented approach* International Law Research Published by Canadian Center of Science and Education.; Vol. 6, No.1
- Beck, Dana & Choi, Kristen & Munro-Kramer, Michelle & Lori, Jody. (2016). *Human Trafficking in Ethiopia: A Scoping Review to Identify Gaps in Service Delivery, Research, and Policy*. Trauma, Violence, & Abuse. 18. 10.1177/1524838016641670.
- Berg, Bruce L. (2007). *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences*. 6th Edition. San Francisco: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Betelhem Mengistu. (2015). *an Assessment on Rehabilitation and Reintegration of Female Returnees: A Case of Kingdom of Saudi Arabia Returnees*. Addis Ababa
- Constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Proclamation* (1995).
- Creswell, John W. (2003). *Research Design: Quantitative, Qualitative and Mixed Method Approaches*. Second Edition. Sage Publications
- Creswell, John W. (2009). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods*
- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2016) *Ethiopia's Overseas Employment Proclamation*.

- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia *National Council Anti trafficking task force* (2015) Draft strategic plan.
- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia. (2015) *Prevention and Suppression of Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling of Migrants Proclamation*.
- Gudetu, W. (2014). *Causes and consequences of human trafficking in Ethiopia: the case of women in the Middle East*. New York: American Research Institute for Policy Development.
- International Labour Organization (2018) *Mapping of stakeholders working on migration and coordination*, final draft Report
- International Labour Organization (2018) *Situations and needs of Ethiopian returnees from the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia: Assessment report*
- International Organization for Migration (2018) World migration report
- International Labour Organization (2011). *Trafficking in persons overseas for labor purposes: The case of Ethiopian domestic*.
- International Organization for Migration (2011), Assisted voluntary return and reintegration leaflet
- International Organization for Migration (IOM). (2011). *Guidelines for Assisting Victims of Human Trafficking in the East Africa Region*.
- International organization for migration (2018), World migration report
- International organization for migration, (2004), *glossary on migration first edition*
- International organization for migration, (2011), *glossary on migration 2nd edition*
- Kothari, C.R. (2004). *Research Methodology: Methods & Techniques*. Jaipur (India): New Age International Publishers.

- Kuschminder & Anderson, (2012), *profiling Ethiopia migration: comparison of characteristics of Ethiopia migrants to Africa*, University Institute of Lisbon. Lisbon, 2012.
- Kenya (2013-2017) National Plan of Action for Combating Human Trafficking,
- Liu, G. (2017) ‘*National referral mechanisms for victims of human trafficking: deficiencies and future development*’, Ideas to Inform International Cooperation on Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration, IOM: Geneva.
- Michael, T. (2014). *Exploring the Reintegration Challenges of Irregular Migrant Men Returnees from the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia* (Unpublished Master's thesis). Addis Ababa University School of Social Work, Addis Ababa
- Memorandum of Understanding (2019) *Improve the Participation of Victim Witnesses of Human Trafficking and Abuse in Migration in Court Proceedings at the Federal Level*
- Russell Kin; Lulle Aija. (2016). *Research on migration; Facing and Maximizing opportunities, policy Review*
- Steiner, J.J., Kynn, J., Stylianou, AM., & postus, J. K (2018). *Providing services to trafficking survivors; understanding practices across the globe. Journal of Evidence- informed social work*, 15(2), 150-168
- Wayne, R. (2013). Focus Groups. In fortune A., Reid W., & Miler R. (Eds.), *Qualitative Research in Social Work, Second Edition* (pp. 264-283). Columbia University Press.
- Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.7312/fort16138.14>
- Wiley, (1957). *American Anthropologist*, New Series, Vol. 59, No. 4, pp. 688-701

Woldamlak, A (2014). *Psycho-social Conditions of Migrant Returnees from Middle East Countries up on Arrival at Bole International Airport: Implication for Intervention*, School of Psychology, Addis Ababa University (Unpublished Master's Thesis).

Woldemichael, Z.S. (2017). *Prevention of Human Trafficking in Ethiopia: Assessing the Legal Framework*. *Hasanud in Law Review*, 3(3): 208-217.

Appendix I

Appendix I. Interview Guide A

Key Informant Interview (KII) Guide Questions

Organization name: _____

Person Interviewed: _____

Sex Male _____ Female _____

Position: _____

Education background _____

Date of interviewed _____

1. What is the work provided to migration? Your service provided to Migration?
2. What activity have you done to prevent human trafficking?
3. Have you support victims of human trafficking? Have you made any coordinated efforts with other stakeholders?
 - A, how many victims of trafficked have you assisted?
 - B, do you provide comprehensive service for victim of trafficked persons? If you have Mention, it?
4. What is the target group of your services? (I.e. group, age, gender,)
- 5 Have you been in any networks relating to human trafficking?
- 6 please mention some multi- agency responses to give service for trafficked persons?
 - a. How it is functioning to assist trafficked persons?
 - b. B, do you have referral mechanism to trafficked persons?
 - c. Lessons learnt (good and bad).
7. What are the opportunities to migrant returnees to create job in their communities?

8. What kind of major taken on trafficker and smuggler to prevent human trafficking and smuggling?

9. Please mention what kind of work doing on the awareness rising on the cause and consequence of human trafficking?

10. Mention what type of coordination and cooperation mechanism use to cooperate your stakeholder?

11. How do you see the framework of stakeholder between the working groups? What are the problems of coordination system?

A, mention same majors to tackle the coordination problem?

12. What are the key challenges facing to assist trafficked persons and coordination of stakeholder?

a. How does your organization assist trafficked persons in meeting the challenges please Mention it?

13. Do you have any screening process to identify vulnerabilities? If so, what is your Process?

a. If returnees have specific needs, do you have a referral mechanism in place how does it work?

14. How do you think your organization contributes for trafficked persons to accessing service?

a. Economic reintegration for trafficked person

b. Social reintegration for trafficked person

c. Psychosocial reintegration for trafficked person

15. how do you see the implementation of anti -human trafficking task force coordination mechanism?

Appendix II

Interview Guide B

Individual beneficiary interview Question

Name (Optional) _____

Sex Male _____ Female _____ Age _____

Education background _____

Marital status _____

Region/ Location _____

Date of Interviewed _____

1. What kind of service do you get from this rehabilitation center? If possible, mention in detailed?
2. Is the service of the organization important to care of victims?
3. Do the organization give service considered the fact that human trafficking is a large violation of basic human, right?
4. Is the organization service focus on the individual victim's needs and concerns met with compassion, care and sensitivity in service delivery?
5. What kind of challenge face when you have stay in the rehabilitation center?
6. Is it the organization understand victim's physical, emotional and social effects possible effects on the professional offering care?
7. What do you think should be done by the government and other relevant organization to prevent human trafficking?

Appendix III

Interview guide C

Focused Group Discussion (FGD) Questions

Greeting, introducing myself and my work

The purpose of this FGD is to generate idea evidence based information from the beneficiary of rehabilitation center. which is giving assistance for victims of human trafficking, with these regards please feel free to give your experience and opinion on the issues under discussion well came.

1. Can you please tell me why you migrate to abroad? What was your reason for migration?
2. By which way you travel to abroad legal or illegal? Which migration route use for your travel?
3. What kind of exploitations you face when you at journey/ work?
4. Have you got support? What type of service do you get?
5. What kind of service you get from rehabilitation center?
 - A, Accommodation (shelter, food, sanitary and NFI (non-food Items).
 - B, medical treatment
 - C, psycho social support
6. What are the contribution of organization service in your life? if possible mention in detail?
7. What kind of challenge face when you stay at rehabilitation Centre?
8. Are there any other challenges you want to explain?

Appendix IV

Observation Check List

Psychosocial

1. The researcher was observe the participants Emotional condition during interview
2. The researcher was observed the way of communication during interview and FGD.

Shelter and care

1. The researcher will observe Housing condition and Accommodation of center
2. The researcher was observe the types of injure

Consent Form

Solomon Girma
Masters Candidate in social work at Addis Ababa University

Consent Information

My name is Solomon Girma , a Masters Candidate at Addis Ababa University. I am asking you to participate in a research project affiliated with my Master’s Thesis titled “Assessing Multi Agency Cooperation Frame Work of Comprehensive Referral System for Accessing service To Trafficked persons in Addis Ababa.” For my thesis research, I will be conducting interviews and discussions with organizations, officers and individuals associated with the topic. Interviews will include participation of Trafficked persons and/or potential migrants to the Gulf countries.

While you will not directly benefit from taking part in this interview or by being part of the production process, I hope society will benefit from the knowledge gained. Private information about you, such as your name, address and contact information will be kept separate from the study data/video-audio recording as well as from the public.

AS APPLICABLE: Audio recording:

You have the right to review your recording/photograph to determine whether they should be edited or erased in whole or in part.

All forms of recordings will/may be used for educational, publication, exhibition and will not be used for commercial purposes or for sale. If you have any questions regarding the interview audio recording, please do not hesitate to contact me:

Solomon Girma
Tel. 0920273635
Email: girma.solomon25@gmail.com

Subject Consent: I confirm that I am at least 18 years old, and I agree to participate:
Please circle one: YES or NO

Signature: _____ Name: _____

Date: _____ 66