

**MEDIA FRAMING OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING: A COMPARATIVE
STUDY OF *ADDIS ZEMEN* AND *THE REPORTER***

Addishiwot Tesfaye

**A Thesis Submitted to the Graduate School of Journalism and
Communication**

**In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts
in Journalism and Communication**

Addis Ababa University

Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

June, 2017

Addis Ababa University

School of Graduate Studies

This is to certify that the thesis prepared by Addishiwot Tesfaye, entitled: Media Framing of Human Trafficking: Comparative Study of *Addis Zemen* and *The Reporter* and submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts in journalism and communication complies with the regulations of the University and meets the accepted standards with respect to originality and quality.

Signed by the Examining Committee:

Examiner _____ sig. _____ Date _____

Examiner _____ sig. _____ Date _____

Advisor _____ sig. _____ Date _____

Chair of Department or Graduate Program Coordinator

Abstract

This study was conducted with the aim of investigating how human trafficking issue was framed by the selected newspapers in comparative perspective. Qualitative content analysis (textual analysis) used as a major approach. Further in-depth interview was conducted with six media professionals. The study employed framing theory and political economy of the mass media as the theoretical framework.

Two newspapers-*Addis Zemen* from the government and *Amharic Reporter* from the private press were selected purposively as source of data. The research was conducted based on eleven-month time frame (from October 11th, 2013 up to February 9th, 2014 and February 10th 2015 up to August 6th 2015 and November 2014). The data from each newspaper were also gathered by following periods of special events like in 2013 more than hundred thousand Ethiopian human trafficking victims returned from Saudi Arabia due to 'illegality' and in 2015 more than dozen of Ethiopian who travel Libya were slaughtered by ISIS.

The study revealed that morality frame was the most predominant frame used by *Addis Zemen* whereas *Amharic Reporter* used attribution of responsibility dominantly. Both newspapers used solution frame almost similarly. *Addis Zemen* failed to use conflict frame in the framing of human trafficking stories whereas *Amharic Reporter* used conflict frame to report disagreement. Both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* was failed to give enough emphasis to internal trafficking rather they significantly emphasize on the external one. Moreover, there was no consistency and fair coverage of human trafficking issue in the selected time frame. In both newspapers variation has been seen in highlighting and emphasizing the causes. In *Addis Zemen*, broker initiatives or the act of trafficker made salient through repeating the same message *Amharic Reporter* mentioned diverse cause but poverty as cause appeared repeatedly. *Addis Zemen* utilized government sources dominantly. In contrast, *Amharic Reporter* relatively utilized researches and international human trafficking reports as sources of information. So, *Addis Zemen* reflects the view of the government in framing human trafficking stories, whereas *Amharic Reporter* relatively fair in framing the issue.

Acknowledgement

First and above all, praises and gratitude to God, the Almighty, for His blessing and support all the way through my research work to complete this thesis effectively.

I would like to thank my Adviser Prof. Debashis Chakrabarti, for his guidance, encouragement and advice. I am lucky to have an adviser, who cared so much about my work and dedication in reading the entire manuscript as well as responded to my enquiry so swiftly.

I would especially like to thank Dr. Negeri Lencho, as my mentor, he has taught me and rally round me when I call for help in most difficult times. Dear Dr. You showed me, by example, what a good person should be.

I am extending my sincere thanks to my husband, Dereje Berhanu, for his encouragement and support throughout the research. Also I would like to thank my Son Marken Dereje, for his patience during research work. So, thank you my little prince.

I would like to thank my mother; Asrat (Asa), without her continues support and encouragement I never would have been able to reach here.

Especial thanks to my friends Buze and Momi for their encouragement and support.

Finally, my thankfulness goes to all friends, colleagues who have supported me in my entire journey.

Table of Contents

Abstract	i
Acknowledgement	ii
List of Acronyms	v
Chapter one.....	1
1. Introduction	1
1.1. Background of the study	1
1.2. Statement of the problem	5
1.3. Objectives of the study	7
1.3.1. General Objective	7
1.3.2. Specific objectives	7
1.4. Research questions.....	7
1.5. Significance of the study.....	8
1.6. Scope of the study.....	8
1.7. Limitations of the study	9
1.8. Organization of the Study	9
1.9. Operational definitions	9
Chapter two	11
2. Review of Related Literature	11
2.1. Human trafficking: definition and overview.....	11
2.2. Causes of human trafficking	16
2.3. Human trafficking and the media	17
2.3.1. Media representation of human trafficking.....	19
2.3.1.1. Representation of victims in media.....	20
2.3.1.2. Representation of offender in media.....	21
2.3.1.3. Representation of Claim-makers in media.....	22
2.4. Use of Sources in reporting human trafficking stories.....	23
2.5. A brief overview of Ethiopian print media	23
2.6. Theoretical framework.....	26
2.6.1. Framing Theory	26
2.6.2. Political economy of the mass media.....	32
Chapter Three	37
3. Research Methodology	37
3.1. Research method.....	37

3.2. Method of data collection	38
3.2.1 Qualitative content analysis (textual analysis).....	38
3.2.2 In-depth interview.....	39
3.3 Sampling technique	40
3.4 Unit of analysis.....	44
3.5 Data analysis procedures	44
Chapter four.....	46
4. Data presentation, analysis and discussion	46
4.1 Data presentation and analysis.....	46
4.1.1 Framing of human trafficking by the selected newspapers.....	46
4.1.2 How the Newspapers Cover Human Trafficking Issue?	55
4.1.3 Locations of human trafficking articles	58
4.1.4 Sources of information for human trafficking stories	59
4.1.5 Causes portrayed in the newspapers	62
4.2 Discussion of the findings	66
4.2.1 Dominant frames used by the selected newspapers	66
4.2.2 Newspapers' differences in portraying the causes of human trafficking	70
4.2.3 How the newspapers gave emphasis to human trafficking issue?.....	72
4.2.4 Sources used in the selected newspapers	73
Chapter five	74
5. Summary, Conclusion and Recommendation.....	74
5.1. Summary and Conclusion.....	74
5.2. Recommendations.....	78
Reference.....	vi
Appendices	xi

List of Acronyms

AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
EPA	Ethiopian Press Agency
EPRDF	Ethiopian People’s Revolutionary Democratic Front
FDRE	Federal Democratic of Ethiopia
FHAPCO	Federal HIV/AIDS prevention and control
FM	Frequency Modulation
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
IOM	International organization for migration
IS	Islamic State
MCC	Media and Communication Centre
MoLSA	Ministry of Labor and social affairs
NGOs	Nongovernmental Organizations
RMMS	Regional Mixed Migration Secretariat
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Right
UK	United Kingdom
UNICEF	United Nations International Children’s Emergence Fund
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
US	United State

Chapter one

1. Introduction

1.1. Background of the study

Human Trafficking is a serious crime and a grave violation of human rights. It becomes a problem of both developed and developing countries. Weitzer(2015) noted that, human trafficking is the third-largest organized crime enterprises in the world, following illegal drug and weapon trading; estimated profits range from US\$13billion toUS\$36 billion annually (Weitzer, 2015, p.227).

Almost every country in the world is affected by human trafficking, whether as a country of origin, transit or destination for victims. Trafficking in persons was first defined in the international law through the United Nations protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children. The protocol is widely known as the ‘Palermo protocol’ or ‘trafficking protocol’. The Palermo protocol represents a broad international consensus on the definition of human trafficking. It is define as:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the Purpose of exploitation (UNDOC, 2008).

In this case exploitation can be sexual, forced labour, slavery and the removal of organs. According to United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) human trafficking has its own process, means, and purpose (Makisaka, 2009).

Process	means	purpose
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Recruitment• Transportation• Transfer• Harboring• Reception of persons	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Threat• Force• Coercion• Abduction• Fraud• Deception• Abuse of power• Abuse of vulnerability	Exploitation which includes: a) Prostitution and other forms of sexual exploitation b) Forced labor and services c) Slavery and similar practices d) Involuntary servitude e) Removal of organs

Source: UNODC 2009 cited in (Makisaka, 2009)

People usually confuse the difference between human trafficking and smuggling and also Media's present the two terms interchangeably without clear vindication. Human smuggling is a crime against country's border, whereas human trafficking is a crime against a person (Polaris, 2013). Human smuggling needs illegal border crossing but human trafficking can take place within the country. Migrant smuggling involves illegal entry of a person into a country for financial or other material advantages only, whereas, trafficking in person occurs in order for sexual or other labour exploitation, or the removal of organs (Makisaka, 2009, p.3).

The challenge of human trafficking is more prevalent in Africa where according to UN most of the trafficking victims reported are children and women. They are trafficked for sexual exploitation while men are often for labor sector (UNODC, 2009).

Annual human trafficking report by Global slavery Index shows that Ethiopia is among the countries that are highly affected by this situation. The Index ranked the country thirteenth in 2014 by a number of people living with modern-day slavery among 167 countries (Tomas, 2016).

United States Department's 'Trafficking in Persons' Report 2016 also describes Ethiopia as a source, destination, and transit country for people subjected to forced labour and sex trafficking. It says young Ethiopians, particularly girls, are exploited for domestic servitude and prostitution within the country, while boys are subjected to forced labour in traditional weaving, construction, agriculture, and street vending. They are also exploited outside the country especially in neighbouring countries and Middle East for cheap labor (US Department of State, 2016).

Legally, The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (FDRE) constitution assured that 'every citizen has the right to move and freedom to choose his residence' (Art.32). This right is usually violated by individuals and groups who engage themselves in human trafficking activities by manipulating citizens who want to exercise their rights.

The trafficker's abuse not only the law of the land but also international legal instruments such as *The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR)* of 1948. Human trafficking violates the human rights granted under UDHR such as the right to life, liberty, and security of person (Art.3); the right to be free from slavery or servitude; freedom from torture or degrading treatment (Art.4 & Art.5); and the right to work in just and favourable conditions

(Art.23). As a result, human trafficking also violates laws against kidnapping, slavery, false imprisonment, assault, fraud, and extortion (Borer, 2015).

Media play a crucial role in every aspect of social life. It serves as a useful means to broaden awareness, critical in shaping public opinion and generating deeper insight into human trafficking. Moreover, the Vienna forum, 2008 (unedited version) says “responsible journalism provides accurate information on a given issue to the public and insures the protection of individual from harm as a result of balance information disclosure”. It is obvious that the purpose of journalism is providing people with balance and relevant information.

One of Media’s critical tasks is to disseminate clear information on the status of human trafficking. In order to foster a greater understanding, initially the media should have a clear understanding of human trafficking in all its tone complexities, and then reporting on it in a way that provides people with clear understanding of the issues involved, as well as informing them of their rights and equipping them with relevant information (Hamman, 2011).

UNODC (2008) note that “human trafficking has become more visible in the media in recent years”. However, the issue has tended to be covered from primarily one angle, particularly trafficking in women sexual exploitation. Though there are many forms of trafficking for different purposes, some media tend to focus on Business stories and failing to present different forms of exploitation and the variety of trafficking, such as trafficking in men and children for domestic servitude or labor in agriculture, textiles and construction.

Media in this regard have a big room to work on and carry out its responsibility effectively by making trafficking in person an issue to the public. The activities of “...officials, interest groups, policymakers, journalists, and other groups interested in shaping media agendas and frames can have an impact on both the dimensions and character of news messages about a particular issue”(Scheufele & Tewksbury, 2007 p.7). It means that media can make an issue more salient through different modes of presentation and it can also have the ability to shift people’s attitudes. It is essential to understand the way newspapers represent human trafficking offenders and victims (Weitzer, 2007). Media can draw an essential picture in socially constructing images of victims and offenders of crimes. These images that the media creates, whether accurate or not, can influence policies being created (Virkus, 2014, p.4).

Media have the authority to control public opinion and important social issues. Human trafficking is one of the issues that require prior media's attention and coverage. According to Entman (cited in Powers and Endsagers, 1999 p.553), frame occurs when journalists "emphasize certain words and source of information; the writing of the reporters then form thematic clusters" (Bruktawit, 2008 p.3).

In another study, it's asserted that framing theory has been vital particularly to create communication between media and audience. Templeton (2011), refers to "the intentional or unintentional process of a communicator creating a perspective that shapes the interpretation of the message receiver around a particular issue, event, or problem." such kind of technique is used to stress certain aspects of a subject while de-emphasizing others (Borer, 2015 p.2).

Examining how media frame the stories can tell something about the issue and also help to know the media's role in reporting human trafficking. It can also serve as a window into the way that the public perceives the problem. The media often use particular words, phrases, or images to provide a shorthand interpretation of a subject, which forms a point of view by which future actions related to that problem may be judged (Templeton, 2011). Ethiopia's media outlets as well cover human trafficking stories however, how media frame stories of human trafficking might have influence in showing the real image of the problem. Thus, this study ensures the difference and resemblance of public and private print media outlets (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*) in framing of human trafficking stories.

For community groups who are affected by human trafficking and organizations, gaining progressive and consistent coverage on trafficking can have a constructive impact on fight against trafficking. The coverage can have an effect on the good work of Law enforcement agencies and civil society groups. If people get access to the media outlets easily knows what media have done.

The more information media gets, the more likely media have a greater influence. However, it is important that trafficking stories getting media attention as a bigger priority than actually doing the work they do, it can make a difference.

Every single citizen has a responsibility in the reduction process of human trafficking. In combating the problem governments can be model and encourage multi-stakeholders dialogue and partnerships to bring together business and anti-trafficking experts to generate ideas, solutions and promote voluntary responsible business conduct initiatives (US Department of State, 2015).

This study tries to analyze framing of a stories by taking placement of the stories, type of trafficking addressed, sources, causes, and solutions cited and their impact on the result into consideration as it is the task of the media, whether it is a private or public, to frame issue in a responsible way. This study also tries to delve into the difference and resemblance of public and private print media outlets in the framing of human trafficking stories, among other things, by taking again the cases of one from private and state-owned newspapers into consideration.

1.2. Statement of the problem

Many of the forms of human trafficking involve the movement of people from one place to another often unknown to the victim. In many cases, this involves victims being lured by better opportunities in the form of jobs elsewhere. A study conducted on in country trafficking in five major towns found that three-fifth of trafficking victims were made vulnerable by economic reasons such as poverty and lack of employment opportunities while social causes like violence within the family, unhappy marriage and death of parents were identified as the major push factors (Yoseph, Mebratu, & Belete, 2006).

Knowing which events have importance over the other is very important concept in media. Human trafficking is one of the problems that need prior public support. Hence, due to media's reachability to mould public attitude toward the problem, it is a powerful tool in combating trafficking. It is further acknowledged that media shape the public interpretation of events through a serious decision on how long and often to cover them.

When the media puts emphasis on certain issues constantly, through time the issue becomes a talking point within the general public. Case in point, Ethiopian media played a key role in creating awareness on HIV/AIDS, as the result of that it became a burning health problem issue within the community. Based on the HIV/AIDS prevention and control office (FHAPCO, 2014), HIV prevalence level has fallen in a year of (2011-2013), the office credited the success to the collective effort but the media had a huge role in it. Alongside this, how the media covered HIV/AIDS as a health problem had also its own collision on the society's perception. At the time some people understood the issue as a horrific health problem. After a while when the media shifted its agenda to other health issues the case of HIV/AIDS became much more concealed.

Currently, human trafficking is one of the most important problems that need prior attention. The seriousness of the problem and its veiled nature require an immediate and rapid response

from the society, especially from media and governments. The media, however, coverage the issue of human trafficking is usually limited and often is like a campaign that gets reporting for short period of time. For instance, human trafficking issues have been dominant in 2013, when thousands of Ethiopians returned from Saudi Arabia and in 2014 when ISIS killed more than two dozen Ethiopians.

There are a number of factors which challenges media's role in defining different social issues. Theoretically, media are generally characterized as independent, fair and balance. Contrary to this, in reality, there are a number of institutional forces which have a powerful effect on the choices that individual news organizations make every day. Sometimes 'the most volatile issues of the day might receive the least coverage in mainstream media outlets' (wallinger, 2010). Ownership influence is considered as a pretext for the media to frame its news contents in the case of both private and government owned media. Frequently, Journalists faces a challenge in objectively frame their news contents despite the media's ownership influence. Similarly, information that news reporters gather does not necessarily get published rather it will be filtered to include some and omit others with reference to the interests of owners (Simret, 2006).

How human trafficking issue framed in media has implication for both on society perception and policy maker. Bjork (2007, cited in virkus, 2014) if the reporters use sympathetic language and word when discussing the victim, the individual was being portrayed as an innocent victim and not as contributing to their victimization. Most studies indicate that women and children are portrayed in a sympathetic manner; whereas men as trafficker (Virkus, 2014). Mostly both public and private print media have their own framing approach. They might categorize traffickers as the cause of human trafficking problems or they might emphasize their stories on victim's contribution for trafficking. Hence, the researcher will focus on how the media houses framed the issue.

Conducting a research focusing on framing of an issue or event is vital in examining the roles of the media in defining a problem, searching for the cause, providing moral evaluation, and suggesting solution (Entman, 1993). Even though the problem is getting worse and graver, thoroughly deep academic investigations are scanty. Beside this, it is hard to find several types of research that focus on how public and private media outlets frame human trafficking issue. Despite the fact that the significance of the media in framing of tackling human trafficking issue, little research has been done in Ethiopia.

The previous study such as Epherem Besha (2008) deal with only a single radio program called “Enewaq” or “let’s know”. It was conducted in one electronics media outlet (FM 97.1) and focus on coverage. The other thesis conducted by Niggussie kibru (2014) focused on only six months (March10, 2013 to September 5, 2013) coverage of human trafficking issues by print media. This study did not address the whole theme of the stories and also it did not deal with the effect of ownerships. Another recent study by Thomas Kebede (2016) only addressed human trafficking issue concerning the electronics media. Therefore, there seems to be a need to conduct a research which aims at finding how the local media represents an important social issue like human trafficking and also investigate how ownership affects the issue to be presented properly. This study attempts to find out how Ethiopian print media (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*) frame human trafficking issues.

1.3. Objectives of the study

1.3.1. General Objective

The main objective of this research is to investigate how *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* frame human trafficking issue comparatively.

1.3.2. Specific objectives

The specific objectives of this study are:

1. To assess how human trafficking stories were framed by the selected print media outlets (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*).
2. To identify the dominant frame used in reporting human trafficking stories in the selected newspapers.
3. To find out how the causes of human trafficking were presented.
4. To find out whether there is any difference between private and government owned media in framing of human trafficking issues.

1.4. Research questions

This thesis is guided by the following research questions:

RQ₁. How did the selected print media (*Addis Zemen* and the *Amharic Reporter*) frame human trafficking issues?

RQ₂. What types of frames were dominantly used in human trafficking issues in the selected newspapers?

RQ₃. What causes of human trafficking were mentioned and how these causes were presented?

RQ₄. How different are the framing of human trafficking stories by the government and private owned media outlets?

1.5. Significance of the study

As there is little research conducted on framing of human trafficking and the Ethiopian media, the result of the study will be significant to examine how the selected media (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*) frame issue regarding human trafficking.

Media organizations significantly differ on the selection of an angle of a story and their frames. Thus, this empirical study helps to show if any difference between government and private media in the framing of human trafficking issues. It will give some hints for the common weaknesses committed to treating the human trafficking stories and will also show the well-built side of the outlets in framing the issue. Journalist and other media practitioner will have an initial concept about the framing of human trafficking in print media. It will also offer a better insight in how the causes of human trafficking differ within public and private media outlets. From this study furthermore, the study conducted in a belief that it might give an idea on print media outlets address the current global issues like human trafficking.

The study focused on the extent of the media's efforts towards addressing the human trafficking problem in order to demonstrate how it might focus more exactly in its coverage, frames, ownership variation of this issue. The research will also benefit the two analyzed newspapers as it will point out both strong and weak side of in framing human trafficking issue. The result of the study can provide additional information and serve as a reference for researcher, media practitioner, and policy maker.

The study will also helpful in giving background information for the concerned body outside the media. Moreover, the result of the study might be supportive for other researcher and media practitioner to conduct a study in another dimension of the topic. This will allow playing a vital role in addressing this current issue.

1.6. Scope of the study

The scope of this study is limited to Ethiopian print media special concern on *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*. The focus of the study is how human trafficking articles framed by the selected print media outlets.

The study made a deep analysis on difference in framing of human trafficking issues between the government and private print media. Therefore, it focuses on media framing of human trafficking issues: a comparative study of *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*. Hence, it should be noted that the study doesn't focus on electronic media like television, radio, and social media. It doesn't also concern on magazine, pamphlets and other media. Furthermore, other issues concerning audience frame and reception were not addressed by this research.

1.7. Limitations of the study

The results of the study might not represent the coverage of the whole print media outlets in Ethiopia. It is restricted to only the two selected media outlet (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*). In addition, the focus of the study is only limited to analyzing the written texts. Though, *Addis Zemen* is the only public Amharic newspaper in Ethiopia, the study couldn't make comparison analysis of more than two outlets (restricted on *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*). In future study, it is better to include other media outlets widely. It would have been better to include the opinion entire editors and other informants in the study. But the given time, a budget and resources constraint was not allowed to extend the scope.

1.8. Organization of the Study

This thesis follows the standard outline of master's thesis papers at Addis Ababa University. This empirical research has been organized as follows: chapter one presents the introduction part, statement of the problem, general and specific objectives of the research, research questions, significance, scope, and limitation of the study. Under chapter two reviews of related literature on human trafficking and media, and also the theoretical framework are part were discussed. Chapter three concerns methods, procedures and sampling technique. The data obtained through qualitative approach (textual analysis) were analyzed and interpreted in chapter four. The fifth chapter entirely focuses on finding of the study, conclusion drawn, and recommendation provided.

1.9. Operational definitions

Types of frames used to analyze the stories:

Morality frame -when the story concerned with right or wrong judgments of human trafficking; or the story tells to do or not to do something.

Solution frame-when the story directly or indirectly discusses the possible solution to the problem (human trafficking).

Attribution of responsibility-when the story attributes responsibility to certain body or when the story suggests somebody should take action on the issue.

Diagnostic frame- when the story focuses on providing causes of human trafficking (what is the causes of human trafficking?).

Conflict frame- when the story concentrates on disagreement between two or more groups or entertaining different opposing ideas.

Definition of repeatedly used terms

Human trafficking –When the article deal with about the problem of human trafficking and related issue with reference to movement of people through fraud, force or coercion or false promises, etc.

Internal trafficking- Trafficking takes place from one community or village to another or it can be within the state or outside the state (Victims needn't want to cross the boundary).

External trafficking-takes place outside the shores of the victim's country or the victim need to cross-boundary

Smuggling-when the problem is related to voluntary movement of people across boarder. (Have mutual consensus between smugglers and the smuggled individuals).

Chapter two

2. Review of Related Literature

2.1. Human trafficking: definition and overview

Human trafficking is dealing of transporting individuals from one place to the other for seeking of exploitation and it is often called modern slavery. The problem is critical that currently impacts societies across the globe. Human Trafficking business produces between \$13 and \$20 billion per year and the returns to traffickers range between 5 and 20 times the original acquisition price whereas the victims obtain nothing (Schauer & Wheaton, 2006). However, the latest report indicates that the profit obtained from human trafficking reached US\$36 next to drug and weapon trafficking. Due to its vilest characteristics and affects millions of people, it is essential to be given emphasis for the issue (Weitzer, 2015, p.227).

To get an effective outcome from the work of policymakers, researchers, NGOs, and others on the issue of human trafficking, there should be a basic working definition of the term in order to articulate the problem in a concise fashion. The definition of the term should be comprehensive in clarifying the statement of the particular meaning in vividness to outline the purpose of protecting the victims and should indicate incorporating economic manipulation of labour, sexual exploitation, illegal adoption and conscription of children into armed struggle and, in the meantime it should able to mark the manifold culprits of the maltreatment.

The term 'Human trafficking' that we are using is vague and difficult to get shared meaning, which is common to altogether. The absence of lucidity on the meaning of the term indicates entities, academics and investigators to mix the terms like irregular migration, smuggling and forced labor in exchange of human trafficking (Lee, 2007 p.10). Moreover, because of the absence of shared compromise between intellectuals on the meaning of the term human trafficking, much academics obliged to practice the definition proposed by United Nations. UN protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children, supplementing the UN convention against Transnational Organized Crime (Palermo protocol, 2000) offered universally accepted definition. Nevertheless, there is still debate about certain basics. The given definition is wide-ranging and ambiguous; thus it leaves - interpretation to every nation and it creates numerous disputes on the term (Makisaka, 2009).

Hence, to frame the scope of the research, the same definition given by the United Nations is also used for this particular study. According to Palermo Protocol human trafficking shall mean:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the Purpose of exploitation'' (UNDOC, 2008).

According to the United Nation Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (UNODC, 2008), Palermo protocol describes three basic elements of trafficking: the means, the process, and, the purpose. The means (exists before the actual action), it comprises varies procedures like recruitment, transportation transfer, harbouring receipt of persons. The other element is the Process, in which it involves the different forceful means human traffickers' practices to control victims. Some of the means, incorporating threat, intimidation, coercion, abduction, fraud, deception abuse of power and the like. The driving purpose of human trafficking is the Traffickers desire to seek financial benefit through the use of the victim. Traffickers financially profit through the use or sale of the victims. Furthermost it's frequently done to generate a large amount of profit by using different forms of exploitation. Such as forced labour and services, sex slavery and similar practices, involuntary servitude, Removal of organs (Makisaka, 2009).

Human trafficking is predominantly prearranged by five organized and unorganized actors. The first partakers are victims who are called Migrant victims. They are the one trafficked and transported for seeking of exploitation. The second partakers are comprised recruit victims and recurrently cover the expense of transportation. Third, are purchasers who claim the title of proprietorship of victims' property; in this case, most of the time purchasers may practice influence and intimidation to uphold obedience of the victim into surrender. Fourth, are the enablers, people who can make things possible. Mostly, they operate behind the scenes both deliberately and unintentionally through helping in assisting the movement of victims from one place to the other. This forthcoming in feeble emerging states of Africa, Asia, and South America, a place human trafficker could knock the structure deprived of without held by law enforcement officials. The fifth are an individual who purchases services of prostitutes from pimps, who manage clients in order to take part earnings. Lastly, NGOs

are one of the contributors that perform a major role in socializing victims from human trafficking risk (Rahman, 2011).

Even though trafficking and smuggling of person involve the recruitment, movement, and delivery of migrants, both activities have different characteristics. In differentiating human trafficking from smuggling Mekisaka (2009) have been identified three key elements: the movement across borders, consent, and purpose of exploitation. The first main difference is that human trafficking involves the movement of victims, within or across borders illegally. Unlike smuggling, human trafficking can be undertaken within and outside the country. The other difference is the consent of a person. Traffickers often enslave and exploit trafficked persons, while smuggled migrants have mutual consensus between smugglers and the smuggled individuals. They are free at the end of their journey (Shelley, 2010). Finally, the smuggled person might need to cross border illegally for financial or other gain whereas, trafficking mostly takes place for sexual, labor exploitation or for removal of the organ (Mekisaka, 2009). In the process of smuggling of migrants, the profit might be a one-time product, however; trafficking involves the long-term exploitation of individuals, which follow continuous income.

Trafficker contributes at different stages in the human trafficking process for the purpose of exploiting the victims for economic or other gain. The first one is for sexual exploitation. It is the primary form of human trafficking which mostly impacts on women and children. As different literatures indicate Sex trafficking remains an important issue to study because the numbers keep increasing and the effects of this crime on victims are severe. “Victims of sex trafficking have a 40% higher mortality rate than non-victims, or individuals who participate in the sex industry voluntarily” (McCabe, 2010).

Other form of trafficking is forced labor. Victims often work in hidden locations, such as agricultural fields in rural areas, mining camps, factories and the private houses in the case of domestic servitude. As a result, the trafficking victims of forced labor are less likely to be identified than the trafficking victims of sexual exploitation (Makisaka, 2009).

Shelley (2010) assert that the problem of “labour trafficking is often less recognized but no less acute in affluent countries”. Economic exploitation is probably the biggest motivation behind the most cases of human trafficking; nonetheless, there is no enough attention given to human trafficking from an economic perspective. Regarding labor trafficking, there are four major types of labor:

(1)**Bonded labor** is a person’s pledge of labor or service as a grant for repayment for debt or other obligation. The service requires to repay the debt may be undefined and the services’ duration also undefined.

(2)**Debt bondage** which defines as “people give themselves into slavery as security against a loan or when they inherit a debt from a relative” (Bales 2004, cited in Weitzer, 2015 p.229). Any workers, especially in third world countries, are likely to be trafficked in a form of debt bondage as a result of the temptation of higher salaries (US Department of State, 2010).

(3)**Domestic servitude** is an especial category of labour trafficking. According to fight slavery definition, the plight of domestic workers such as maids, servants, housekeepers, and child care givers those who caring from the elderly, the ill, and the infirm.

(4)**Forced child labor** is enforced exploitation of a child for their labor for someone else’s gains. It hinders children education and development.

Many of the forms of human trafficking involve the movement of people from one place to another often unknown to the victim. In many cases, this involves victims being enticed by better opportunities in the form of jobs elsewhere. Trafficking can be carried out internally and externally. Victims could be oblivious to unintended consequences such as arrests or Coercion while in transit to the new destination (Rahman, 2011).

Internal trafficking:	External trafficking
Trafficking takes place from one community or village to another	Takes place outside the shores of the victim’s country or the victim need to cross-boundary
It can be within the state or outside the state Victims needn’t want to cross the boundary.	Victims may be either documented or without documentation as they head to an unknown destination, and in most cases, the person being transported is unaware of the consequences.
The purpose is usually for domestic and child labor trafficking, begging illicit adoption, sexual exploitation, ritual exploitation, organ harvesting traditional waving etc E.g. Ethiopian child trafficked from rural area to urban for the purpose of traditional waving.	Here sexual and labor exploitation is the major type of trafficking but others are domestic servitude, begging and organ harvesting etc E.g. when individual trafficked to Middle East for domestic or other purpose.

Source: (Odukwu, n.d) HUMAN TRAFFICKING: NATURE, CAUSES, AND EFFECTS NAPTIP, and NIGERIA.

Trafficking in person within countries and continents still, exists on a large scale in Africa. Yet increasingly, victims often travel long distances to their point of exploitation. Many countries are simultaneously source, host, and transit countries for victims of human trafficking. Three main forms of trafficking have been dominated in sub-Saharan Africa: child trafficking for domestic and agricultural work; sexual trafficking of women and children within the region and overseas. Most of the trafficking victims are children in West and Central Africa and adult women and children in Southern Africa (Makisaka, 2009). According to Bales (2009, cited in Rhaman, 2011) majority of women and children were rescued in Italy most of whom emigrated from Sub-Saharan Africa where they were recruited and promised better job opportunities.

Ethiopia is a source, destination and transit country for men, women, and children subjected to forced labor and sex trafficking. Girls from Ethiopia's impoverished rural areas are exploited in domestic servitude and prostitution within the country, while boys are subjected to forced labor in traditional weaving, construction, agriculture, and street vending (US department of state, 2016).

Regional Mixed Migration Secretariat (2016) indicates that Ethiopians leave their country either as regularly or irregularly. According to the ministry of Labor and social affairs (MoLSA) that cited in this report approximately 4600,000 Ethiopian migrated legally from their country within six-year interval. Majority of Ethiopian flee to Saudi Arabia (79%), Kuwait (20%), and the rest going to Dubai and other countries. As the report indicates only about 30-40 % of Ethiopian migrated to the Middle East and Gulf countries in 2012. Other about 60-70% travelled illegally by trafficking (RMMS, 2016).

The US State Department trafficking in persons' report, (2016) highlights the problem of Ethiopian human trafficking as:

.....Ethiopian girls are exploited in domestic servitude and prostitution in neighbouring African countries – particularly Sudan – and the Middle East. Ethiopian boys are subjected to forced labor..... errand boys, domestic workers, thieves, and street beggars. Young people from Ethiopia's vast rural areas are aggressively recruited with promises of a better life and are likely targeted because of the demand for cheap labor in the Middle East; many are subsequently subjected to forced labor. Child sex tourism is a growing problem in major tourist hubs, including Addis Ababa, Bahir Dar, Hawassa, and Bishoftu; reports identify both foreign and domestic perpetrators, with links to local hotels, brokers, and taxi drivers (US Department of State, 2016).

The report strongly addressed there should be action and commitment in tackling human trafficking problem. Continue to increase efforts to convict traffickers, including improving the investigation capacity of police train law enforcement and judicial officials on the anti-trafficking proclamation (ibid, 2016).

From the November 2013 to March 2014, the Saudi Arabian government deported more than one thousand seventy hundred Ethiopians for unlawful presence in the country. The Ethiopian government and human right organization believe that most of the deportees were victims of trafficking (RMMS, 2016).

2.2 Causes of human trafficking

Although the root cause of human trafficking can be varying from one country to the other, the structural factors are similar. However, many factors have been inferred to human trafficking globally. Basically, the highest numbers of victims come from developing country like from Africa, Asia, Latin America, and Eastern Europe. Whereas, the richest (developed) countries like North America and Western Europe are serves as destination. Human trafficking is a hidden and complex process that is mostly driven by social, economic and political factors (Odukwu, n.d).

Push factors: these factors are tending to exert pressures on victims that push them into the control of traffickers. Poverty, oppression, lack of human rights, lack of social or economic opportunity is some of the push factors. Globally, in addition to the economic turmoil, military conflicts and political upheaval, persecution, and violence also encourage people to seek refuge and opportunities abroad, making them particularly vulnerable to trafficking networks (Gill et al 2007, cited in Gulati, 2010). In addition to corruption, gender and ethnic discrimination, decline of border controls have a significance impact on human trafficking (Shelley, 2010). Similarly, Gudina & Tariku (2013) note that, the main factor of human trafficking are unemployment, high population growth, poverty, pressure from family and peer group, broker initiatives, stories about the improvement of the life of those who arrived at the place of the destination and the long bureaucracy(Gudina & Tariku, 2013 p.13).

Trafficking is also backed by dishonest agents who claim to have established contacts with employers overseas. These agents' forced victims to be exploited. Moreover, lack of awareness on the legal migration process and preferences to swifter migration ways were identified as a root cause of human trafficking. Lack of accurate information is among the major factors that contribute to worsening the problem. A number of Ethiopian leaves their

homeland and move to Arab countries through traffickers misinformed about the working and living conditions at countries of destination (Gudetu, 2014).

Pull factors: are flourished with demand for workers, the possibilities of higher standards of living, and an increase perception of poor communities that better opportunities exist in abroad. The shift of economic and social pattern in different countries led to a shortage of cheap and low-skilled labour in agriculture, food-processing, construction, manufacturing, domestic work, and sex work. Various countries depend on migrant workers to fill labour shortages in sectors that are low paying, dangerous, and poorly-regulated (ILO, 2011). Individuals from Poor Country are eager to take risks in order to seize opportunity abroad. Because they want to have better living conditions, and access to hard currency seem to offer a way out of endless hardship(Shelly, 2010).Demand for potential economic exploitation, include the demand for domestic work, and for work in commercial agriculture and plantations are most widely documented type of exploitation in Africa (UNICEF, 2005).

Recently, globalization forced to increase human trafficking dramatically. Especially, the globalization of economy has impelled. Different corporations outsource their business in order to engage in the services for children and minors for the purpose of exploitation. For instance, Company like Nike outsourced their major productions to Lebanon and Indonesia to engage the services of women for just a dollar a day for the production of Nike products that are being sold for excessive prices in the US. Hence, these and other factors create a precondition for human trafficking (Shelly, 2010).

2.3 Human trafficking and the media

The first and foremost function of the media in a society is providing information to the masses. People need information for various reasons, on one hand, it can be used to socialize and on the other to make decisions and formulate opinions. Our minds are full of media-derived information and impressions. “We are living in world which saturated by media sounds and images” (McQuail, 2010). Educating the masses about their rights, moral, social and religious obligations is the important function of mass media. The media has a huge impact on society in shaping the public opinion. They can form or modify the public opinion in different ways depending on what is the objective.

Media message can influence and may result in either a change or reinforcement in an audience or individual beliefs. The effects can be visible that result from media influence, or a media message. According to tan (2011, cited in Curtis, 2012) without much in-depth

knowledge, the public tends to rely on only the information being conveyed in the media. While the media has the ability to frame social issues and direct public discourse, they often rely on a pre-existing understanding of ideas and simply reproduce symbolic meanings, rather than overtly reinterpreting them (Curtis, 2012).

The effect of media can be positive or negative, abrupt or gradual, short-term or long-lasting. Not all effects result in change: some media messages reinforce an existing belief. The way media entertain issue has also an enormous impact. According to the US Department of state Office to monitor and Combat Trafficking in person (2014) the way media reports on human trafficking issue is just as important as *what* is being reported, and the overall impact of these stories is reflected in the way the public, politicians, law enforcement, and even other media outlets understand the issue. Thus, it needs to be further acknowledged that how media shape the public interpretation of events through a series of decisions on how long and often to cover them. With regard to this Wanta (1997 quoted in Wallinger, 2010) “.....The more an issue gets covered, the more it will be perceived as being important by the member of the public” (Wallinger, 2010 p.7).

Shaping and defining social issue in media may face a challenge. Indeed media should be independent, fair and balance. Although in reality institutional forces which may have a powerful effect on the choices that individual media outlet make every day. It is for this reason, perhaps, that some of “the most volatile issues of the day may receive the least coverage in mainstream media outlets”. So, it is vital to understand the content of the news and very essential how this content is shaped by interested bodies (ibid, 2010).

According to Wallinger (2010) media dependency theory supports the notion that “if an individual has the goal of gaining information on the important issue of the day, they will become highly dependent on the media because of the media control access to a variety of information”. Mostly people always believe what they see and hear in media and try to interpret, relate with what they already know. Any organization of the media can play an important role in shaping different social problem. The way the media align themselves within public and private sectors may have an effect on how the news is reported. Any decision of newsworthiness of a given event or occurrence has also an influence. “Most events which do receive more coverage, the organization of media around specific, legitimized and bureaucratized beats tends to limit the quality and quantity of information provided ” (ibid, 2010). In addition to this, Lack of appropriate media emphasis of an issue

leads to the implication that the topic is not important. And obviously, if a story is not given much attention and even not reported, public awareness might significantly lessen.

Similarly, media play a vital role in tackling any activities of human trafficking and minimizing such problem. It is among the main instruments to help towards attaining the necessary objective relating to human trafficking. Examining the media's role can provide a complete picture of anti-trafficking policy and it used as a window into the way that the public perceives the problem (Gulati, 2010). Effective communication, that raises awareness in the society, challenges the problem of human trafficking, and also can play a crucial role in bringing change. However, media may not give prior attention or may not accurately portray what we understand about an event or situation. For instance, the study by Roth (2004) revealed that most stories in the USA that relating to human trafficking are published "either a heels of a major unplanned event....such as when a boat of people being smuggled sinks off the coast of Florida or as a result of human actors staging events issuing reports or press release or convincing editors the stories is worth pursuing". In other word it means that, the story of worthiness might depend on in the eye of publication's editorial staff. In this case few decision makers in media may affect the news value (Wallinger, 2010).

As stated earlier, Ethiopia is among the most affected country in Africa. Though the problem is getting worse, there is little research on the area of human trafficking and media. From this (Loseke, 2003)research For example, the study on framing of human trafficking in the case of 'Bekur' newspaper reveal that, the media outlet hardly cover internal trafficking rather focus on external trafficking (External trafficking was the highly mentioned in the stories and accounted for 95.83 percent while internal trafficking was the least mentioned 4.17 percent) (Haftamu, 2014, p.13). From the study, one can understand that internal trafficking was not given equal importance compare to external one.

Thus scholars like Roth (2004) emphasize that "when the media fail to cover adequately an issue such as human trafficking, is less likely that the public can and will form an opinion about the issue". The more we create uninformed public; the more we get the less resource to fight human trafficking. Therefore, mobilizing, informing and creating awareness among the public has crucial importance.

2.3.1 Media representation of human trafficking

Representing all forms of human trafficking and participants in media properly can create appropriate awareness among the society. Contrary to this, misrepresentation of human

trafficking might affect especially the victims (trafficked person). Moreover, the images and stories that created in newspapers can influence the public's behavior, such as people being more anxious about certain victims or offenders rather than protecting the problem. Regarding media reporting of human trafficking, articulating balanced picture of the problem in media can benefit policy and law maker (Virkus, 2014).

2.3.1.1 Representation of victims in media

The effect of victimization is hard especially to the “poor, powerless, the disabled and socially isolated”. Because, those victims of trafficking often experience abuse, exploitation, poverty prior to being trafficked (UNODC, 2008). Individuals once trafficked, and thereby exploited and harmed, a person's future opportunities in life are might be affected. In this case, media should play a vital role in treating the issue equally inappropriate manner.

Earlier to the 1990s, the issue of human trafficking was not raised publically, but by the mid-1990s, it began to discuss as a human rights problem. At that time, the media mostly captured sex trafficking of young white women in their stories. Newspapers began to focus predominately on female victims, and nearly ignored to cover male and labor trafficking victims. As different studies indicates, white women became viewed as being innocent and pure, the young white girls' stories evoked sympathy from the public and government, leading human trafficking to be defined as a social problem (Farrell & Fahy, 2009 quoted in virkus, 2014).

Internationally, it is less frequently discovered and reported than trafficking for sexual exploitation. Mostly, media outlets reports, policy making, and law enforcement give emphasis to commercial sex markets rather than labor trafficking (Chuang et al 2010 cited in weitzer, 2015, p. 228). For instance, the title called trafficking in human being and Greek mass media the guide for journalist (2007) disclose the status of Greek media in covering human trafficking issues. In such case, the media present trafficking victims by over emphasizing on the sexual dimension of the stories. In most trafficking case, the Greek media manipulate and try to attract the audience by presenting women's for the purpose of prostitution. As a result, viewers/reader confuses and unable differentiate trafficking victims with voluntary prostitutes.

Even though human trafficking become popular in media in recent years, the term human trafficking wasn't articulated in a way that it define the reality. Sometimes the problem might link with other phenomenon. In reporting trafficking journalist might confuse the term human

trafficking, prostitutions, smuggling and migration. As a result, the public might unable to differentiate those terms properly (ibid, 2007).

On the other hand, media might cover the stories of victims in a companionate manner and in confusing sympathy. The journalist might present face or stories of victim in over exposing mood. According to Weitzer (2007) unlike men, women and children of human trafficking have been presented in a sympathetic manner. In such case, the message that released in media in stereotype form might lead to distorting perception. United State department of combating and monitoring trafficking in person office (2014) assert that, ‘‘human trafficking cases often involve complex safety concerns that could be exacerbated by a published story, or if a victim or survivor has not fully healed, a published story may reactivate trauma or shame years later’’.

Denton (2010) conducted a quantitative content analysis of newspapers focusing on how newspapers frame human trafficking. The research includes all articles discussing human trafficking between January 1 and June 30, 2007, using Google News Archive, a database that includes both national and international newspapers.

The study revealed that while newspapers discussed both male and female victims of human trafficking, women and children were more frequently discussed than male victims. The findings also revealed that both males and females were portrayed as an offender of human trafficking, and were often portrayed as working together. Females commonly portrayed as the innocent victim and males as the evil offender (Denton, 2010 cited in virkus, 2014 p.40-42). Thus, from this one can understand that the role of media in presenting trafficking victims should be constructive in raising awareness, informing and educating the public.

2.3.1.2 Representation of offender in media

On a regular basis offenders portrayed in USA media, as if they are the only entity to blame for the organized crime. On other hand victims always depicted as innocent, barely cooperate with criminal networks. This innocent’s media depiction of the victims even hinders the law enforcement effort to capture the criminal networks. Since the victims willingly trafficked in order to run away from poverty and after reaching their destination they will continue paying their debts (Farrel & Fahy, 2009 p.623).

Studies on the U.S media show that if offenders are from other nation the community outlook towards human trafficking crime most possibly as frightening and a serious matter. This image created by the media character representation on crime reporting (Denton 2010, cited

in virkus 2014). Moreover, other studies reveal that minorities are always represented as offender.

2.3.1.3 Representation of Claim-makers in media

Claim can be spoken, visual, or behavioural statements that need to persuade the public to describe a condition as a social problem. *Claim makers* are also people or any organizations that have an interest in a particular social problem and makes about the people impacted by the condition (Loseke, 2003 p.27). “Anyone can become a claims-maker, but certain people have a higher degree of credibility and become more successful at claims-making”. The public views scholars, scientists considered as the top claims makers because of their educational or other status and occupational background (virkus, 2014, p.12).

According to Loseke (2003), people who are working in mass media became claim-maker in two ways. First, the reporters can look for information and write a story. At the same time, they are taking similar role as social activities in constructing social problem. Second, people who are working in mass media can also claim makers; means that, their social problems work is that of translating and packaging claims made by other like politicians, social change activists, and academic researchers (ibid, 2003, p.42). “The primary role of a claims maker is to raise enough attention, outrage and/or fear about a social condition that others begin to see it as a social problem” (virkus, 2014).

In reporting human trafficking stories federal agencies, non-profit organizations, police officials, academicians could be cited as claim-maker. Claim makers main role is to convince somebody about the issue. Claim-makers always want to present their issue in front because they want their case to appear important and worthy of attention. On the other hand, claim help to generate broad popular understanding of the problem and can mould the way political elites or other powerful stakeholders should respond (Farrel & Fahy, 2009). It is important to notice that; claim- maker might give accurate or distorted information about human trafficking. Virkus’ study revealed that, claim-makers in the newspaper stories discussed females while ignoring male victims. Thus, according to the study, most claim-makers will focus on sex trafficking compared to labor trafficking (Vrikus, 2014). For instance, in Ethiopia, the cause of human trafficking have different image in the view of claim-maker, traffickers, and society in general.

2.4. Use of Sources in reporting human trafficking stories

Any stories especially news items has its own elements such as background information, facts, sources, suggestion etc....the decisions with regard to this element will have a powerful effect on how the issue understood by the readers. Like other elements, Sources are very decisive in the work of journalists. Depending on only similar and some sources may lead journalists to supply implausible and unbalance information for the public. Sources can highly influence the way journalists to frame their stories. Schudson (2003 cited in Mihret, 2015 p.20) define sources as “the deep, dark secrets of the power of the press. Much of this power is exercised not by the news institutions themselves but by the sources that feed them information.” This means that sources have the power to influence a certain issue. With regard to news source (Gans, 2014) mentioned that “.....sources are also often organized and unorganized interest groups.....they are actors whom journalists observe or interview”

In reporting human trafficking issue it's important to notice the sources of the stories (who are the common source): government officials, police officers, NGOs, international organizations, civil society, victims, victim's families and friends, traffickers, association donor's, research and researchers unspecified source etc. As the media are a source of information for the public, it is important to take care in selecting the appropriate source. Relying always on only some sources can also have its own impact. Gans (2005 cited in Gulati, 2010 p.370) noted by attributing different literature that, instead of influencing the nature of the debate, most media echo the narratives presented by the major sources especially elites who have decisive role executing law and policy Media outlets routines (i.e. beat reporting and dependence on official sources) can limit the ideas and information that get included in a story (ibid, 2010).

In the case of Ethiopia, state-owned newspapers consistently and accurately attribute government sources whereas, private newspapers are inclined to use different anonymous sources in their news articles (Asgedom, 2006; Eden, 2009; Tizita, 2008 quoted in Skjerdal, 2012).

2.5 A brief overview of Ethiopian print media

There are different arguments with regard to Ethiopian media development. Many scholars may argue that Ethiopian media was not reaching the desired level. Those scholars dispute that including the political history of the nation over different period poverty has its own influence on the development of the Ethiopian media. On the other hand, some scholars may believe that currently Ethiopian press got its real growth as a result of the nation become

stable compare to the previous period. But most of them are agree that Ethiopian media had remained under the control of different government who was in power across various regimes (Nigussie, 2014).

During the post Italian occupation different newspapers come into existence. For instance, *Addis Zemen* (New Era) in Amharic, *Sendek Alamachin* (Our Flag) appeared in Amharic and Arabic, the *Negarit Gazeta* appeared in Amharic and English. In 1943, *The Ethiopian Herald* started as a weekly English newspaper. *Ye-Eritrea Demts* (The Voice of Eritrea) was being published in Amharic and Tigrinya by the Ethio-Eritrean Unionist Association. *Ethiopian Review* (in English) and *Berhanena Selam* (in Amharic) the two monthly appeared as in 1946. In the following year, the three newspapers: *Zena Bete Kristyan*(News of the Churches), *Nuro Bezeday* (living Wisely), *Tekle Haimanot* (Saint Tekle Haimanot) and one English Newspaper– the Daily News Bulletin . These and other newspapers were flourished during and after Italian occupation (Ellene, Mesfin & Alemayehu 2003, cited in Nigusie, 2014).

The press in imperial regime had its own limitations. It had low circulation due to poor infrastructure, very low level of literacy (poor content quality), and the inadequate number of the copies of the newspapers. During the Derg Regime, different media outlets including print media was used for the purpose of propaganda. Privately owned media were legally banned. All publication was used to explore socialist ideology. For instance, during that time magazine called “Meskerem” (September) that marks the revolution day and a newspaper called Serto Ader (Proletariat), which was meant to pronounce the sovereignty of the proletariat. Additionally, the Dergu continued to publish *Addis Zemen (the Ethiopian Herald)*, and *Yezareyitu Ethiopia (Ethiopia Today)*” (ibid, 2014).

Skjerdal (2012, p. 17) note that “the media situation during EPRDF is significantly different from that of the two previous regimes, especially with regard to formal media policy and openings for independent journalism.” According to the study media during EPRDF show remarkable progress. Private newspapers were allowed to work for the first time. As of today there are four state-owned newspapers with different language and nine privately owned newspapers. In addition, there are eight magazines (out of eight one belongs to the government).

State owned newspapers

Currently (*Addis Zemen* in Amharic, *The Ethiopian Herald* in English, *Bariisaa* in Afan Oromo and *al-Alem* in Arabic) are categorized under state owned newspapers. The Two newspapers, *Addis Zemen* and *The Ethiopian Herald* started 1941 and 1943 respectively. Later on, the Afan Oromo version, *Barisa* and Arabic, *Al-Alem* weeklies newspapers were started publication. *Addis Zemen* and *Ethiopian Herald* are daily newspapers whereas, *Bariisaa* and *al-Alem* both *biweekly*. It was in 2001 that *Addis Zemen* became daily newspaper. Ethiopian press agency serves as an umbrella for those newspapers. All state owned newspapers are financed by government from public fund and at the same time they are loyal to the government (Hllelujah, 2012).

Addis Zemen, which was established in 1941, is the oldest and popular among other state-owned newspapers. It has the highest circulation rate both among state and private newspapers. According to Ethiopian press agency (EPA, 2016) currently the circulation of this particular Newspaper is fifteen thousand. It is distributed to every region of the country. Thus, it has a potential to reach many ordinary people, higher officials, and policy makers throughout the country. *Addis Zemen* newspaper covers range of issues on daily and weekly sections covering (Eden, 2011). It is because of this and others reason the researcher choose these media outlets.

Skjerdal (2012.p 46) noted in his study that, State newspapers are differing in their reporting style. Mostly the content of the stories are “uncritical and development-oriented, up against private newspapers’ tendency to be conflict-oriented, profit-driven and critical to the party in power”.

Private newspapers

Privately owned newspapers become flourish, following the declaration of the press proclamation 1992 which was entitled, *A Proclamation to Provide for the Freedom of the Press No. 34/1992*.

Among others, the two popular newspapers *Addis Admas* and *The Reporter* (both are Amharic version) have the highest circulation rate. *Addis Admas* newspaper is a weekly (Saturday) privately-owned newspaper established in 1992. It is owned by *Admas Advertising*. Following *The Reporter* (Amharic version) it has highest circulation rate and longer duration (Eden, 2011 p. 60). According to the ministry of information, the circulation

number of *The Reporter* and *Addis Admas* Amharic version newspaper is eleven thousand respectively.

Skjerdal (2012) in his dissertation prefer to call private media as ‘independent media’. According to him, he called them ‘independent’ not because of their independent from ideology rather he used the term for linguistic purpose and prefer to emphasize private media outlets are independent from government interest. However, instead of selecting and focusing core society’s problem; most private newspapers prefer to focus on political, conflict, and different profit oriented issues (Skjerdal, 2012, p.96). Thus, the researcher selected those newspapers from government and private, based on the above historical and current status.

2.6. Theoretical framework

2.6.1 Framing Theory

It is possible to use different form of communication to transfer information to the receipt. These messages can be framed in a way that to get the receipt attention. In such case, the framing and presentation of an issue or event in the media can affect how these recipients understand and interpret the stories. Hence, considering how Journalists can make decision about their stories, background, and also which facts and interpretation to include and exclude, what is the pillar of the theme, which sources to use and quotes are very essential. As stated earlier, human trafficking is a deep-rooted problem all over the world. Though, how it is framed by the media can affect the public’s formation of opinion and the response received from the government regarding the issue. Moreover, it can have a profound influence on how a social problem is discussed and the actions taken by policymakers (Gulatil, 2010). Framing the issue and defining the problem have a direct relationship. In this case it needs to know the determinant to because of the problem, its consequence, what are the solutions to tackle the problem (Entman, 1993).

Framing is one of the fundamental theoretical frameworks for this research. Media framing serves as a means in which information is presented as to the audience. Previously several definitions of framing have been provided. Framing is like “the process of culling a few elements of perceived reality and assembling a narrative that highlights connections among them to promote a particular interpretation” (Entman, 2007 cited in Bruktawit, 2008). In other words, framing is intended to make the audience think or feel in a certain way about the issue under discussion. Similarly, Gitlin (1980) define frames as “persistent patterns of cognition, interpretation, and presentation of selection, emphasis, and exclusion by which symbol

handlers routinely organize discourse” (Gitlin 1980, cited in de Vreese 2005 p.52). Those definitions that provided in the above consider or emphasize the central element of framing.

For the sociologist Goffman (1980) frames are “schemata of interpretations” which assist individuals to “locate, perceive, identify, and label a seemingly infinite number of concrete occurrences defined in its terms” According to him frames “focuses on how individuals learn to routinely make sense of their social world” (Goffman, 1974). The well-known scholar, Rober Entman has been provided more than one definition of framing. But the most famous definition in framing research, to frame means:

To select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation for the item described (Entman, 1993 p.52).

From the definition, the word salient has an immense impact. ‘*Saliencie*’ means ‘making a piece of information more noticeable, meaningful or memorable to audience’. In other word, when salience increase the probability of the audience receiving the information will boost (ibid, 1993).Hence, media can draw or direct the attention of audience by silencing and omitting

According to the author, frames refer those information-processing schemata (Entman, 1991, p. 7) that operates by selecting and highlighting some features of reality while omitting others. Mass media can select some aspect of a ‘reality’ to audience while ignoring or de-emphasizing the other. In this sense, the concept framing links sense-making and action, suggesting that how we talk about an issue and focus our attention on certain elements.

Based on Entman (1993) idea it is possible to understand frames functions. According to him, frames have four functions: first, media frame can define a problem by determining a causal agent activity with what costs and benefits. Second, it diagnoses causes by finding the forces behind the problem. Third, media frame provides moral judgment by *evaluating the* causal agents and their effects’ and finally, it can suggest remedies by providing solution for the problems and predict their likely effects (ibid, 1993 p.52).

How a human trafficking story is framed in various contexts is essential for the study of how human trafficking is perceived and responded to. Different framing literature suggests that, all of our knowledge makes use of frames and that every word is defined by through frames; hence what and how we think and talk directly relates with framing. Globally, it has been used by several researchers to analyze how attitudinal and policy responses to human

trafficking have been approached. Media scholars have found the concept of framing useful for examining media coverage of news (Borer, 2015).

For instance, we talk about human trafficking; the issue might always frame in some way, whether or not we are aware of it. Framing can thus be seen as a process in which the substance of the frame is constantly negotiated between various frame articulators or claim makers. For example, if human trafficking is mostly framed as a social problem, rather than as an issue of development or economics, this implies that we will talk about, compare, and understand human trafficking in relation to how we understand other social issues.

Type of media frame

Iyenger (1990) distinguished generic frames into episodic and thematic frames. When frames focus on specific event or isolated case it is called episodic frame. Here the reader or viewers provided with a particular case. For example, a news article would episodically discuss human trafficking through featuring a victim family. Contrary to this, thematic frames emphasize broader social and institutional background by providing deep interpretive analysis. In this kind of frame, news content might focus on general trend Iyenger (1990, p.22-23). For instance, stories would talk about tackling trafficking in person by presenting statistics about victim cities and governmental initiatives to mitigate trafficking effect.

Scholars have been identified different frame typology. From different type of frame prognostic and diagnostic frames are commonly used in social issues. These types of frames are categorized under the thematic frame. Because they have the ability to show the broader social and institutional cases by discussing causes and effects of an event.

Semekto and Valkunburg (2000) identified five dominant or major frames which are categorized under generic frames. These are conflict frame, human interest frame, economic frame, morality frame, and attribution of responsibility frame. For this particular study, including diagnostic frames the researcher used most of dominant types of frames.

Conflict frame: Emphasize on disagreement between individuals, groups and institutions as means of attracting audience attention. The reason behind the use of conflict frame might be because journalists think that conflict is one way to catch the attention of more readers. For example, political debate, election campaigns news is framed mostly in terms of conflict (Semekto &Valkunburg, 2000, p.96).

Human interest frame: in this type of frame the media outlets can bring emotional angle of stories to the audience. Journalist and media practitioner eager to produce that captures

audience interests. Framing a story in human interest terms is one way to achieve this. In such frame, news can be personalized, ‘dramatize & emotionalize’ in order to attract readers attention. The frame is also referred as “human impact” frame and is considered the second common frame in the news next to conflict frame (Neuman et al., 1992, cited in Semetko and Valkenburg, 2000)

In reporting human trafficking stories journalist might bring a human face and emotional angle to the audience. For instance, Gulatis (2010) study revealed that the reason why human trafficking stories have been covered differently than other international human rights issues is that journalists like most Americans find the topic interesting. Moreover, they found most stories can easily capture the audience attention. The subject also seems to have captured the imagination of Hollywood screenwriters and television producers.

Economic frame: a problem or an issue that will have economic consequence on individual or group or institutions. When an issue or event has wide impact on finance, it adds value to the news, and its economical consequences are often vital (Garber, 1993, cited in Semetko and Valkenburg, 2000).

Morality frame: set an event in moral or religious contexts (Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000). In order to keep “the professional norm of objectivity, journalists often make use of the moral frame indirectly by using quotation and inference” (Neuman et al., 1992 in Semetko and Valkenburg, 2000). In such cases media outlets covers events in terms of morality aspect that is either emphasizing the bad or good side of an event. When the story tells the readers to do or not to do something, this is also can be concerned with right or wrong judgments of issues. For example, newspapers may use the view of interest group to raise question on human trafficking. Such story may contain moral message or offer specific prescription about how to tackle trafficking in person.

Attribution of responsibility frame: present an issue in a way as to attribute responsibility to its cause or solution (i.e., who should be credited or blamed for events) Semetko and Valkenburg (2000).It gives more emphasis on why events happen. Sillars (1982 cited in Hallahan, 1999) note that “attribution of an event to either personal or environmental factors determine the extent to which an individual is held responsible”. However, the attribution of responsibility does not always reflect the objective facts of a situation accurately and can be distorted based on how events are described (Hallahan, 1999 p.219).

When media report on human trafficking, mostly they try to attribute the responsible body. For instance, in Ethiopian different study conducted on human trafficking reveals that the root cause of human trafficking can be viewed as economic, socio- cultural and legal and political. also giving attribution to the issue(Gabriel, 2013).

Diagnostic frame: serve the function of identifying a social problem and then linking that negative aspect of social life to a certain cause. When a story focuses too heavily upon diagnostic frames without at least dealing with a potential solution to this problem, will be most likely ineffective, as the problem will seem unsolved (Corrigall-brown & Snow, 2005).

Prognostic frame: provides a solution to the problem by specifying what needs to be done. Over-emphasizing on this frame would most likely fail to motivate individuals that are not directly related to the victimization that is being dealt with (ibid, 2005).

This study was primarily aimed to respond the question how human trafficking stories were framed, what were the dominant frames used in reporting human trafficking news stories. So, in order to respond the question, the researcher used the above major types of frame.

Factor affecting media framing

Scholars have been identified and examined extrinsic and inherent factors that influencing the selection production and presentation of events. There are different factors that can affect framing. Based on the previous study Schefele (1999) identified five variables that may affect journalists' framing of an issue or an event: social norms and values, organizational pressures and constraints, pressure of interest groups, journalistic routines, and journalistic ideological or political orientations (Schefele, 1999 p.109).

Different scholars (e.g. Van Dijk, 1985; Edelman, 1993 p. 232; Gamson and Modigliani, 1987 cited in Schefele, 1999 p.110) suggest how those factors affect framing. The way news is framed in the mass media might be a result of social and professional routines of journalists. The combination of selecting sources, setting the news headline with the way of gathering information and the purpose of writing the news can determine how the event is framed. In addition to this, the choice of frames often is “driven by ideology and prejudice.” Media frames can be sometimes imitating those used by politicians, social activists, other media outlets, or citizens (Scheufele 1999, p.109 quoted in Dennis &Druckman 2007). Shoemaker and Reese (1996, cited in Asplund, 2014 p.26) also support the idea by suggesting that media do not always mirror ‘reality’ but rather that media content is produced and shaped by a number of forces, such as media workers’ socialization and attitudes, media routines, social

institutions and forces, and ideological positions. According to Gamson & Modigliani (1987, cited in Scheufele & Tewksbury, 2007) “the formation of frames can be explained by an interaction of journalists’ norms and practices and the influence of interest groups”.

Location of frames in media text

Frames can be found in different location. Entman (1993) from the cold war example, suggest four frames location in communication process: the communicators, the receiver, text, and the culture. Framing in various location perform similar function. In all location there is selection and highlighting, in addition, “the highlighted element use to construct an argument about problems and casual evaluation and solution.” He also said, frames in a text can be manifested by the occurrence and absence of “certain key swords or stock phrases, stereotypical views or images, sources of information and sentences that provide thematically reinforcing clusters of facts or judgments” (p. 52). In addition, Gamson and madigliani (1989 cited in de Vreese, 2005) provide different framing devices that can help to identify frames in issue or event. These are metaphors, exemplars, catchphrases, depictions and visual images. Bearing in mind, Tankard (2001) identified a complete list of framing mechanism or focal point. These frame mechanism (Headlines, Subheads, Photos, Photo captions, Leads, Source selection, quotes selection, logo, statistics charts) help to measure news frames (Tankard, 2005as cited in de Vreese, 2005, p.54). Similarly, in mass communication field journalists, photographers, producers, editors, elites, sponsors are the main participant in framing process. The selections and choices of those participants develop the frame for the information that reaches the audience at the end, potentially causing a framing effect. Media professionals might send a message systematically and strategically with a frame in order to achieve something (Elsamni, 2016).

Criticism of framing theory

Framing theory is famous in different branches of human knowledge and mass media. It also represents a cross-disciplinary approach to research. However, it is criticized that, the concept lacks theoretical, methodological, and conceptual rigour. Regarding the limitations of media framing theory Scheufele (1999) argued by attributing the idea to Entman’s (1993) referred framing as “scattered conceptualization” explain that framing theory “lacks clear conceptual definitions and relaying on context specific rather than generally applicable operationalization”. In other word, it “lacks consistent or common fundamental definition that shows how frames are fixed and become visible in a text as well as how it influences

thinking’’. As a result, one can conclude that, because of the absence of clear conceptual definition and other limitation, framing theory may not applicable uniformly to all discipline and context.

The other constrain of framing theory is goes to the recent media framing studies. According to Carrage and Roefs (2004), a number of trend in framing research fail to show the relationship between media frames and broader issues of social and political power. This neglect comes from ‘‘conceptual problem in the definition of frames, intention to frame sponsorship, the failer to examine framing in contest within the wider political and social context’’ (Carrage & Roefs, 2004).

2.6.2 Political economy of the mass media

Political economy is the study of social relations, particularly power relations that mutually constitute the production, distribution, and consumption of the resource (Mosco, 1996, p.24). The Communication industry runs as any other business within the political economic system. The political economy of communications particularly means the theory how the broader economic and political arrangement affects the working of establishment’s communications. Political economy of media also means the study of ‘‘the social relations, particularly the power relations, which mutually constitute the production, distribution, and consumptions of resources, including communication resources’’ (Alexader, 2004).

Political economy approaches media studies had their peak in the 1970s (Miller & Gandy, 1991). By the end of the century, other research perspectives overshadowed these applications. Yet the current trend towards international comparisons invites a renewal of this kind of social studies, taking into consideration the institutional context surrounding media market competition, especially in order to balance excessive claims and exaggerated generalizations in relation to globalization and media convergence.

The political economy of the press is more about how communication industry functions and to analyze social relations especially the power relations constitutes the production, distribution, and consumption that include communication (Mosco, 2009, p.2). As for Robert McChesney (1999) the Political Economy of Media Political economy of press mainly focuses on how the environment of media and its accessibility to the mass. He argues that ‘‘the political economy of media uniquely positioned to provide the insights necessary for constrictive action’’.

For Mosco political economy is about ‘survival and control’, or how societies organized to produce what is necessary to survive: “The study of the social relations, particularly power relations, that mutually constitute the production, distribution and consumption of resources” (Mosco, 1996, p.5).

The expression of political economy first was used by French writer Antoine de Wontchrstien, in his 1615 published book called ‘Traincte de leconomie politique’ (treatise of political economy) it shows how politics and economic activity are interdependent thought-provoking Aristotle’s longstanding position independence of politics.

Political and economic philosophers like John Locke on his book the “Two Treatises of Government” described property mainly generated by government, “Government has no other end but the preservation of property” (Locke, 1991, p.329). For Adam Smith’s The Wealth of Nations, “The preservation of property and the inequality of possession first formed it, and the state of property must always vary with the form of government” (Smith 1896, p.401). Smith’s point out that, the responsibility of the government protection is property through a legal structure.

The modern Political economy groundwork was done by the 18th-century Scottish enlightenment Adam Smith and 19th-century critique David Ricardo grounded its theory. Smith defined political economy as the study of wealth or allocation of resources. “...How mankind arranges to allocate scarce resources with the view towards satisfying certain needs and not others” Additionally, political economy studies capitalism as a system of social production, distribution, exchange and consumption of wealth and the consequences for the welfare of individuals and society (Smith, 1776). The well-known Capitalism critique Karl Marx and Frederick Engels’ historical materialism and class analysis oppose the system as the unjust characteristics.

The propaganda model is advanced by Edward S. Herman and Noam Chomsky to give detail about the propaganda and system prejudice operates in mass media. The model deals with how populations are influenced or manipulated and how consent for economic, social and political policies is manufactured in the public mind due to this propaganda. According to their propaganda model, there are five fundamental elements of news filters. These are: 1) the size, concentrated ownership, owner wealth, and profit orientation of the dominant mass-media firms 2) Advertising licenses to do business 3) elites as a source of information 4) flake 5) anticommunism “Governments and business elites do have privileged access to the

news; advertisers do operate as a ...Licensing authority ...: media moguls can determine the editorial line and cultural stance of the papers and broadcast stations they own” (Herman & Chomsky, 1988).

The first filter is the size, concentrated ownership, and profit-seeking orientation of the mass media. Thus, the first filter-the limitation on ownership of media with any substantial outreach by the requisite large size of investment-was applicable a century or more ago, and it has become increasingly effective over time (Herman & Chomsky, 1988).

Political economy of the press concerned with the size and ownership of mass media corporations and the economic model planned on generating income through corporate promoting impact: “the conditions and constraints under which journalism is practiced”. It is more interested in how ownership, power, and wealth affects media content (McChesney, 1999, p.118). The media biases can depend on the size and profit seeking imperatives of corporations.

For Graham Murdock and Peter Golding, the political economy of communication is “commodity produced by capitalist industries” the mass “first and foremost industrial and commercial organizations which produce and distribute commodities” (McChesney, 1974 p.205-206). The information presented to the public depends on the interest of the elites. As a result, the news media faced the greatest bias and censorship.

The second filter Advertisement: at the early history of the media, advertisement was not the main source of finance for media companies. Before advertisement becomes prominent the price of a newspaper had to cover the costs of doing business. “The growth of advertising papers that attracted ads could afford a copy price well below production costs”. Newspapers were forced to attract advertising in order to cover the cost of production; without it, they would have to increase the price of their newspapers (Herman & Chomsky, 1988).

Advertisers through time their influence over the media program grow to the level picking the kind of program they like; “they seek programs that will lightly entertain and thus fit in with the spirit of the primary purpose of program purchases the dissemination of a selling message”. It is also true that, currently, mass media allocate vast time for ad rather than addressing society’s problem (ibid, 1988).

Third filter: deal with sourcing mass media news. The press is in an interdependent association with elites as sources of information for mutual economic and political interest. Not only small but also large media corporations always cannot afford to place journalists everywhere. They always want to concentrate on their resource where news sources likely to happen. Depend on this the reliance on considered reliable sources, which frequently means using government or corporate spokes people who spend vast sums on public relations and lobbying. Thus, the media has become unwilling to run articles that will harm corporate interests that provide them with the resources that they depend upon. Journalists are then supposed to adopt an uncritical attitude that makes it possible for them to accept corporate values (ibid, 1988).

Fourth filter: Herman & Chomsky described the fourth filter flake as “negative response to the media statements or program”. It is also explained as the ability to complain about the media’s treatments of news”. Negative responses to a media can be report in the form of letters, phone calls, petitions, telegraph, lawsuits, speeches and bills. It can come from individuals or groups with interest can be treated advertisers may withdraw patronage. Flake from the powerful can be direct or indirect (ibid, p.26).

Fifth filter: is Anti-communism as a control mechanism. It is the use of antagonist ideology crucial evil to the system. It claimed that critical of the government as a communist, and anyone who is uncritical as anti-communist. In this regard, the ideology of anti-communism serves as a news filter (ibid, 1998).

Media ownership

Controlling the media machine like newspapers, television, radio and the new form of communication internet and digital televisions has great significance on the country’s political, economic and social issue. According to global campaign for free expression, the availability of information and its accessibility is central to the contemporary economic and political decisions making; “Although there exists little comprehensive empirical and theoretical study on the issue, the relationship between media ownership and economics, and the media’s role in society provides plenty of content for active public and policy debate at the international and national levels, including discussions within the European union and the council of Europe ”(Art 19).

Based on the capitalist, thought media and its products as a commodity are produced and distributed by profit-seeking individuals and organizations. Murdock and Golding put it is

expanded and intensified, not only within traditional media industries and more public and other Medias privatized within the market oriented model all over the world. Under the new reality media institutions have been privatized (Philo & Miller, 2000).

Media resources have become commodities that products and services that are sold by profit-seeking companies to consumers (Mosco, 1989). Following capitalist profit-seeking companies joined the industry, owners diversification commenced with the large number but through process for instance in U.S. Communications industry dominated by huge media conglomerates, such Time Warner, that are involved in a wide range of diversified activates. In U.S. in 1983, there was as many as fifty corporations were active in the media industry and shrunk in the merger by media industry into twenty-nine. Then 1990, the twenty-nine had shrunk to twenty-three. In the west, the corporate control the media and its communication resources for profit seeking in the other parts of the world because the power of media role in the society, politics, and economics the State is still there as owner of the media as well as the regulator.

Public and private media ownership -arguments in political economy between the pubic and the private: what constitutes the public good and notions threat private enterprise would not provide what a good society required and links the constitution of the good society to the extension of citizenship rights.

Chapter Three

3. Research Methodology

3.1 Research method

This research was conducted to analyze media framing of human trafficking stories in comparative perspective government and private print media outlets (*Addis Zemen and Amharic Reporter*) in focus. The study employed qualitative content analysis that includes textual analysis and in-depth interview. According to Shank (2002 cited in Ospina, 2004 p.1) defines qualitative research as "a form of systematic empirical inquiry into meaning". For him, systematic means "planned, ordered and public". Empirical means to say that this type of inquiry is grounded in the world of experience. The inquiry also to say researchers try to understand the meaning and how others make sense of their experiences.

Wolcott (1994 cited in Creswell, 2005) noted that qualitative research makes an interpretation of the data that include developing a description of an individual or setting, analyzing data for a theme and finally making the conclusion about its meaning. The method enables the researcher to develop a level of detail about the individual or place and to be highly involved in actual experiences of the participants (Creswell, 2005).

Qualitative research is interested in the nature and real meaning of an event, person, and case; with the aim of interpreting events of historical and cultural significance. Mostly concepts in qualitative research are presented in the form of theme and pattern. It involves in-depth investigation of knowledge through observation, document analysis or ethnographic study. However, qualitative method "doesn't rely on, but can involve, numerical measurement" (Grix, 2004).

Aim of scientific inquiry divides into five: "identification, description, explanation-generation; explanation testing, and control". Unlike quantitative research, the qualitative one used identification, description, and explanation generation. Qualitative descriptions, using qualitative methods, "explore the meanings variations and perceptions and perceptual experience of phenomena will often seek to capture their holistic or interconnected nature" (Miller & Crabtree, 1999).

The method often offers information about the "human" side of an issue contradictory behaviours, beliefs, opinions, relations, and relationship of individuals. At the same time Interpretive perspectives concern with how the social world is interpreted, understood

experienced, produced or constituted (Mason, 2002). Thus, all those things are difficult to quantify and it's better to apply qualitative methodology which can help to understand different version of things.

3.2. Method of data collection

This study has employed the qualitative method. The approach helps the researcher to identify and test theme, the source of the stories, locations of articles, the emphasis given by those newspapers, and the dominant frame used by the selected print media outlets (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*).

The study used textual analysis and in-depth interview or (intensive interview) as a tool for better data collection. A textual analysis was applied to interpret the frames used in the reporting of human trafficking stories. Moreover, the researcher conducted interview with editors and journalists of the selected newspapers (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*). In the interview section, the researcher gave justifications the reason why those interviewees were selected for this specific research. Therefore, the use these methods could help the researcher to qualify how articles were framed, how causes were presented, what type of frame were dominantly used to construct human trafficking issue and media organizational difference in framing of human trafficking stories.

3.2.1 Qualitative content analysis (textual analysis)

The textual analysis is used to interpret the framing of human trafficking stories. According to Bainbridge (2011) it is an “effective way of assessing, comparing and understanding media texts”. Media researcher uses textual analysis to comprehend how meaning is made from media text (p. 224). Scholars from other field try to define textual analysis in different time. From mass media theorist McKee (2003 cited in Bainbridge, Goc, and Tynan 2011 p. 224) puts it as:

Textual analysis is a way for researchers to gather information about how other human beings make sense of the world. It is a methodology—a data-gathering process—for those researchers who want to understand the ways in which members of various cultures and subcultures make sense of who they are, and of how they fit into the world in which they live.

Textual analysis is applicable for examining media advertisement, news narrative, television series, and films. It is also helpful for media researcher to convince their audience and provide them to think in a certain way. The method allows the media practitioners to analyze

expressions, words, phrases, presentations (ibid, 2011). In the textual analysis, the researchers focus to find the real meaning of a text (it can be narrative or visual text). It also used to analyze and interpret interviews, observations, and other empirical data (Larsen, 1991).

Textual analysis in qualitative research more relies on the researchers reading capability. During examining media text by using textual analysis, the researcher should apply careful reading of documents including media text. The qualitative content analysis examines the relationship between the text and its likely audience meaning, recognizing that media texts are open to multiple different meanings to different readers. Instead of giving attention to the text rather it pays more attention to media and contextual factors. Therefore, one of the main characteristics of qualitative content analysis (textual analysis) is relying more heavily on researchers reading and interpretations of media text (Macnamara, 2005).

Accordingly, through careful reading attempt was made to find out the way human trafficking stories were framed in the selected newspapers. The researcher provided relevant quotes from articles to support the frames. To get the intention of the informant's and to support the textual analysis intensive interview which is the unstructured type of interview was conducted.

3.2.2 In-depth interview

For this research, an in-depth or intensive interview was applied for better data collection method. It has helped the researcher to get the deeper understanding of the informant's and help to analyze how stories of human trafficking are framed by the selected newspapers. Moreover, it is a preferable method to strengthen the finding obtained through textual analysis. In-depth interviewing is “a qualitative research technique that involves conducting intensive individual interviews with a small number of respondents to explore their perspective on a particular idea, program, or situation” (Boyce & Neale, 2004 p.3).

The intensive or in-depth interview can provide detail background about the reasons respondents give the specific answer. It also assists to get more accurate responses on sensitive issues (Wimmer & Dominick, 2010). Obviously, human trafficking is becoming currently sensitive issue. In general, an intensive or in-depth interview has unique characteristics because of the following reasons:

- It generally uses smaller samples.

- It elaborates data concerning respondents' opinions, values, motivations, recollections of experiences, and feelings are obtained.
- The in-depth interview allows the researcher for lengthy observation of respondents.
- Unlike other types of interview, an intensive interview may last several hours and may take more than one session.
- They can be customized to individual respondents. It also allows interviewers (the researcher) to form follow up questions based on each respondent's answers

(Wimmer and Dominick, 2010 p.139)

Though in-depth interview is time-consuming it is resource intensive, flexible, dynamic, non-directive, unstructured, non-standardized and open-ended. Qualitative research interview seeks to describe the meaning of central theme in the life world. The intention of doing such kind of interview is to understand the meaning of what the interviewees say (Kvale, 1996). During conducting an in-depth interview the interviewer did not pose a list of questions to participants rather a researcher will have a mental framework of study questions (Yin, 2011).

So it's because of these and other unique feature of in-depth interview, the researcher applied the tool for better data collection method. Interviews were conducted purposively with two journalists (one Male and one Female) and one editor from each of the two newspapers (*Addis Zemen & Amharic Reporter*). Generally, the researcher conducted an interview with six informants. Those media informants were selected due to their contribution to social and economic affair concerning human trafficking stories in the newspapers. All of the respondents from those media outlets have written and edited many of the articles on the issue of human trafficking. The researcher counted the number of stories a reporter wrote by looking the by-lines and contacted those who had written and edited most of the articles. Furthermore, they have important positions that made them able to provide the necessary information about the issue. The interview with journalist, and editors were conducted in the interviewee's work office.

3.3 Sampling technique

If a researcher desires to obtain information about a research topic, he/she has to question or test every member of the population as a census; or a sample can be conducted in which only selected member of the population are tested. Obtaining data from a large population could

be extremely expensive, difficult and time-consuming. The sampling method involves taking a representative selection of the population and using the data collected as research information. A sample is simply a "subgroup of a population"(Latham, 2007).

There are two type of sampling strategy. One is probability or random sampling where each unit in the population has a known, nonzero probability of being included as a sample in the study or has equal chance to be selected. The other one is non-probability or non-random sampling which the subject selected based on appearance or convenience, or because they seem to meet certain requirements. In this sampling technique, the researcher doesn't follow any mathematical guideline and it's less time-consuming. Four basic types of methodologies are most commonly used for conducting probability samples; these are simple random, stratified, cluster and systematic sampling. Whereas the convenience sampling, quota sampling, purposive sampling and snowball sampling are categorized under non-probability sampling (Wimmer & Dominck, 2010).

Due to cost, time and purpose of the study mass media researchers mostly prefer to use non-probability sampling. In this respect, purposive sampling or non-probability sampling, which is appropriate to this study, was used. Purposive sampling involves respondents, subjects, or elements selected for specific characteristics or qualities and gets rid of those who fail to meet these criteria (ibid, 2010).

Research subject and data source

The researcher mainly used content (textual) analysis to investigate the framing of human trafficking of two purposely selected newspapers, the government-run Amharic daily, *Addis Zemen*, and the Private bi-weekly *Amharic Reporter*. The subjects were selected based on ownership, publishing frequency, and their circulation. Comparing to the other newspapers, the selected newspapers have high circulation and publication. (*Addis Zemen*, the only government-owned print media, is a daily newspaper and *Amharic Reporter* published twice a week). The reason for selecting each newspaper for this study has been discussed as follow:

Addis Zemen

Addis Zemen, ("New Era" in English) is the state-owned daily Amharic newspaper, longest serving over 75 years in Ethiopian press history. The Ethiopian government under Emperor Haileselassie I founded the paper as a four-page weekly on 7 June 1941 and On 5 May 1946 the paper became a broadsheet publication and later, a daily newspaper. At presently, *Addis*

Zemen is based in Addis Ababa and published by the Ethiopian Press Agency (Mekuria, 2006). It is the oldest among the present-day Newspapers in the country, which mainly focuses on social, political and entertainment issues and it also covers international issues.

The Newspaper was established with “the permission of His Imperial Majesty to explain to the people about what they should do for their country, for their King and for his government” An Amharic publication which has remained the most important state-owned newspaper in the nation ever since (*Addis Zemen* 7 June 1941, quoted in Skjerdal, 2012, p. 11). It's the dedicated servant of the last three governments of Ethiopia.

The government uses *Addis Zemen* Newspaper, to publicize its national policies, strategies on various social, political and economic issues. According to Ethiopian press agency (EPA, 2016) currently, the circulation of this particular Newspaper is fifteen thousand.

The reason behind picking *Addis Zemen* Newspaper was since the Newspaper owned by the government and the government considers trafficking as one of its challenges. Ethiopia is one of highly trafficking in person affecting nation the state-owned Newspaper required to cover the issue frequently. Other than that its circulation, ownership and printing frequency puts the Newspaper to take into account. It is believe that, the issue of human trafficking is one of its priorities and subjects to cover.

Amharic Reporter

Amharic Reporter is published two days a week by Media and Communication Centre (MCC). The newspaper has survived for more than 20 years in a volatile private media market.

The Newspaper covers perpetually Social, Political, Economic and Entertainment issues for the past two decades. According to the *Amharic Reporter* information, currently, the circulation reached around 13500. Because of its huge circulation and covering wider issues concerning in the country including human trafficking the researcher choose *Amharic Reporter* to be part of the study.

Data source: data came from both primary and secondary sources. The major data taken for this study was articles that gathered from the selected media outlets. Media professionals, IOM (international organization for migration) media experts have also been primary sources

of information. Different secondary sources like documents and written materials that related to human trafficking frames have been used to strengthen the study.

Time frame: the study intended to find out how human trafficking stories were framed by Ethiopian print media outlets (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*) in comparative perspective. The research was conducted based on eleven-month time frame. The study included the period from October 11th, 2013 up to February 9th, 2014 and February 10th 2015 up to August 6th, 2015. Moreover, the researcher intentionally added November 2014 but, the rest eight months selected consecutively from October to February 2014 and in 2015 from February to August respectively. This time frame was chosen because of two reasons. The primary factor was in November 2013 over hundred thousand Ethiopians return from Saudi Arabia due to 'illegality' and many immigrants crossed Mediterranean from Africa and the Middle East. Second, in April 2015 more than two dozen of Ethiopians were killed by ISIS. Therefore, it is believed that during this time a number of stories were critical issues concerning human trafficking covered in the media.

Both incidents happened in November 2013 and April 2015, however, the researcher deliberately added the other nine months to the time frame. This is because the intention to check how those newspapers gave emphasis during those time; ensure whether human trafficking stories were event based or not. The only reason that November 2014 added to the time frame was, during the pilot study the researcher hardly found the story relating to internal trafficking; however, within two years time interval only one story that concerns internal trafficking has been found in *Addis Zemen*. So, the month (November 2014) was selected to include that story.

According to Laczko and Gozdziaik (2005 as cited in IOM, 2008) selecting short time frame is one of the problems with other highlighted gaps in current empirical research on human trafficking. It's not rational having a specific time frame for getting sufficient data since human trafficking is not a onetime phenomenon.

Story selection: As mentioned above, the newspapers that were selected for the study were a daily newspaper, *Addis Zemen*, and a bi-weekly newspaper, *Amharic Reporter*. The study included all editions/issues of the two newspapers related to human trafficking stories. To be precise, *Amharic Reporter* is published every Sunday and Wednesday, whereas *Addis Zemen* is published from Monday to Sunday. For this study, all features, news articles, editorial, and commentaries written during the mentioned period were included. This means that all news

that entertains the human trafficking stories in the given time frames was taken into account. The reason that the researcher took all publication from both newspapers was to have enough data and reach in solid conclusion. Moreover, the researcher did not face time and resource constraint to include all publication within the selected time frame. Consequently, the researcher found 123 articles from *Addis Zemen* and 57 stories from *Amharic Reporter*.

3.4 Unit of analysis

Data from all columns of the selected newspapers were selected for the analysis. For this study, articles that focus on human trafficking stories such as news, editorial, and features which appeared the selected period were included. Wimmer and Dominick (2010, p.146) noted that the unit of analysis can be “a single word or symbol, a theme, or an entire article or story”. Therefore, articles taken from the newspapers were used to interpret as a unit of analysis. The focus of the analysis was only written text, excluding semiotic analysis which focuses on photos and pictures.

3.5 Data analysis procedures

This study examined how a human trafficking story framed by the selected print media outlets (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*) in comparative perspective. After collecting the necessary data through the help of the above data collection tools, the researcher used a qualitative content analysis (textual analysis), which allows for a more in-depth analysis of the data.

The analysis process of this study began by presenting the findings obtained from the textual analysis. Furthermore, the data found from the articles were presented with the support of convincing excerpts or quotes that support or show the extent of the frame. The researcher has made the analysis meaningful and strong by incorporating the result found from the individual interview with the media professional. In order to do so the data gathered from informants, every discussion was first recorded and short notes were taken. The recorded discussions were transcribed, categorized according to different topics. Finally, the findings were discussed with respective to the categories to respond the research questions easily.

To identify news frame using content analysis on qualitative research, Alozie (2005, cited in Linström & Marais 2012) suggests the following:

- Phase 1: General multiple reading of the articles while taking descriptive notes about the content

- Phase 2: A second reading to identify certain recurring themes, frames, values and topic categories and
- Phase 3: In--depth interpretation of the articles.

For this study, the researcher applied all those guidelines for better analysis. Emphasis was given to the analysis of human trafficking articles. As a result, the researcher has tried to link the results of the study with theoretical frameworks used in the study.

Chapter Four

4. Data presentation, analysis and discussion

4.1 Data presentation and analysis

This research was conducted to examine how *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* framed human trafficking stories in comparative perspective. All the collected data focused on how human trafficking issues framed in those print media outlets within the selected time frame. This chapter deals with the analysis of texts gathered from the two newspapers. Out of *Addis Zemen*, 330 editions/issues and the *Amharic Reporter*, 94 issues within the selected time frame 123 and 57 articles were found respectively. The selected articles were taken for the study since they are explicitly focused on human trafficking happening in the selected period.

Through close reading the researcher identified five dominant frames (attribution of responsibility, solution, morality conflict, and diagnostic frames) used by the selected media outlets. These frames were discussed primarily under the selected newspapers. Moreover, to strengthen qualitative textual analysis, interview was conducted with six media professionals (one editor and two senior reporters) from each newspaper. Therefore, all articles relating to human trafficking editions/issues found from the newspapers were analyzed qualitatively. The analysis and finding are presented in the following sections.

4.1.1 Framing of human trafficking by the selected newspapers

Addis Zemen

The framing of human trafficking stories and editorial pieces *Addis Zemen*, employed different frames however only few frames were used dominantly. Morality frame was the most dominantly used frame in the newspaper. The majority of stories and editorial pieces selected from the newspaper focus on condemning human trafficking and show the possibility of prosperity within homeland. Smetko and Valkenburg (2000) description of morality frame deals with when the issue tells to do or not to do something or the story is concerned with right or wrong judgments of issues. Such story may contain moral message or offer specific prescription about how to overcome a problem.

Articles that used morality frame were headlined ‘*the gloomy human trafficking and it’s risk*’, ‘*we condemn heinous action against our people*’, *how are we supporting fellow victim*

citizen 'As already mentioned earlier, in this newspaper the majority of human trafficking stories were appeared during the time of more than one hundred sixty thousand Ethiopians return from Saudi Arabia and more than dozens of Ethiopian trafficking victims were killed by ISIS. Hence, a number of articles were written in condemning both situations. For instance, November 16, 2013, *Addis Zemen* top news story appeared in front page. Under the headline "Ethiopia condemns any attack against its citizen" the newspaper attributed the then Foreign Minister, Dr. Tedros Adhanom, and a quote from the article states:

'Ethiopia more than any other nations needs her citizens' said Dr. Tewodros. Citizens owns country, they have the right to get back to their homeland. They couldn't suffer and mistreated just because they are illegal (*Addis Zemen*, November 16, 2013, p.1).

Different city residence, officials, religious institutions, international organizations were appeared in condemning the situations and the act of human trafficking. Quotes from Hawasa and Addis Ababa city residents that clearly showed condemnation of heinous ISIS action occurs:

Ato Tadess Netto, residence of Hawassa said: I am despairing by the heinous action against Ethiopians, people came in common in condemning terrorism and the lasting purpose should be deferred human trafficking. (*Addis Zemen*, April 24, 2015, p.2)

Another one also appeared like:

The Saudi Arabian government dreadful action against our citizen's anguishes (*Addis Zemen* November 16, 2013 p.1)

Most of the article tended to condemn two big issues. In one way the stories are likely expressed how those citizens were affected by human trafficking and give a lesson to other how the situation was worse. On the other hand, some story appeared in condemning human trafficking and the act of terrorist and extremist attack. The following excerpt supports the idea:

The residence in the city expressed their idea to the newspaper that, they are ready to support government's action in tackling terrorism. In addition, instead of trafficked and harmed by trafficking, people should prefer to work and make money in their homeland (*Addis Zemen*, April 24, 2015p.5).

Generally, out of the articles where the morality frame was found dominantly. Some of the stories condemned the situation directly or asked the readers to condemn the consequence to come from human trafficking.

Next to morality frame *Addis Zemen* used solution frame dominantly which helped to suggest solution to the problem. The suggested solutions in the text were having two characteristics. Some of the stories recommended permanent solutions to the problem while the other stories appeared in a way of implying temporary solution. The suggesting provisional solution of the problem concentrated on giving financial and moral aid to human trafficking victims and their family. On the other hand, some story presented in a way that having different long term solutions to the problem; such as raise awareness, legal measures, improving labor standards in destination country, job creation etc. Among various solution suggested in the newspaper more than one article appeared in focusing on the banning Ethiopian overseas employment or sending workers to Middle East. The following quote from one article show banned overseas employment action taken by government, which believed to have effect in minimizing human trafficking.

Legally registered employment agencies under the cover of their legal registration participating in human trafficking activity and underscore the agencies greatest role in exacerbating in the hitch, the Ministry says the ban will remain in place until the last solution is found (*Addis Zemen*, October 26, 2013 p.2).

The proclamations that prohibit sending workers to the Middle East considered as long term solution to human trafficking. According to the stories presented in the newspaper, those proclamations tended to tackle the act of traffickers and illegal agencies. In politics column one article appeared in *Addis Zemen* July 5, 2015, was headlined “the proclamations will have a great role in tackling human trafficking” the article appeared in interview form and the interview was conducted with Deputy Prime Minister Demeke Mekonnen, who also chairperson of National Council to Combat Human Trafficking. He was quoted as saying:

The new anti-trafficking proclamation that gives further leads to monitor human traffickers and it also helps to strengthen scrutinizing. Depend on the immensity of the crimes the proclamation demand heavy punishment. It is a strong bill because of it also accountable the executive if it would not implement based on the directives (*Addis Zemen*, June 25, 2015 p.1).

In *Addis Zemen* nearly every story that states solution to the problem tended to emphasize government’s effort and the solution provided by government though there were some stories

that expressed other bodies support beside government. Specially, stories that appeared in way of implying temporary solution presented how government tried to come up with the enduring solution for human trafficking victims. From this perspective, the stories state solutions for victims in two way; returning victims and rehabilitation. Some of the headlines were *'the region prepares job opportunity for Saudi returnees'*, *'repatriating to Ethiopia effectively continues'*, *'is working to get lasting resolution on human trafficking'*. Some stories quoted different officials and expressed what has been done for victims. Excerpt from an article appeared:

Citizens' allure by human traffickers and brokers are arriving in Lebanon are passing through unceasing exploitation, misery, said head of Ethiopian Missions. *However, the consulate office also said to undo the citizens undergoing inexpressible suffering it has exerting strenuous efforts to safeguard the rights of citizens, recently the consulate office in person helped citizens who were in pain by car accident and others who face misfortunes to get medical help (Addis Zemen October 31, 2013, p.2).*

Some of the articles written under the solution frame were news articles, which appeared in the international news page. In this column, the newspaper tended to present different mechanisms taken by countries to control human trafficking taken as a model. Excerpt from article appeared:

British new law intends for stiff penalty against human traffickers and other who exploit immigrants. According to the draft bill that design to enforcing the *law* against traffickers states a convicted human trafficker once conclude his imprisonment penalty will be banned entering the UK to life (*Addis Zemen, October 19, 2013, p.7).*

The newspaper also used attribution of responsibility frame dominantly next to morality and solution frame. Most the stories expressed the responsibility of different actors in its editorial pieces. Nearly all responsibility frame articles claim that 'everybody should take action to tackle human trafficking', which means that the responsibility shouldn't be left to government alone rather every citizen, has a duty to control the problem. Examples took from editorial page recommend:

The government created numerous of job opportunities to indication prosperity can be achieved in homeland. Youths employing starting from Micro and small enterprises to the mega projects all around the country and they have extensive opportunity to change their life as well as the county. The private sector should also create sums chances. Citizens, beforehand they

make a decision to immigrate their leading choice it needs a lot of work to convince them to engage in these jobs to build better Ethiopia. Moreover, it is important to create consciousness they have in their country (*Addis Zemen*, April 27, 2015, p.3).

The newspaper also used attributes a responsibility to give a special assignment to the private company, family, religious and legal institutions for awareness creation. The following quotes from articles attributed private companies in terms of job creation and awareness creations. The quotes read:

By creating extensive job opportunity in the country, the effort continues to prevent youths from immigrating by supporting the youth to organize in Micro and small enterprises. In addition to supporting this foundation, it is vital the private sector also to create extensive job opportunity and employees to get payment. Side by side with this we should demonstrate how terrible human trafficking is and the opportunities they have to prosper in the county as well as fulfilling each responsibility is necessary(*Addis Zemen*, November 18, 2013, p.2).

The other one reads:

The security apparatus to monitor human traffickers in order to make accountable convicted them they should work in an organized approach to salvaged the public from the danger (*Addis Zemen*, December 25, 2013 p. 2).

Addis Zemen also used diagnostic frame that expressed causes of human trafficking. Some of the stories were framed in a way of emphasizing causes of human trafficking whereas other were simply mentioned some push and pull factors. Articles that used diagnostic frames were repeatedly described or gave emphasis to traffickers as a cause of human trafficking. Traffickers, victims, illegal overseas employment agencies, lack of awareness, lack of good governance, poverty, unemployment, lack of interest in job creation, family and peer pressure were mentioned as a cause of human trafficking. Traffickers as a cause of human trafficking were mentioned repeatedly. The following articles emphasized traffickers as a cause of human trafficking:

At this moment the most distressing thing citizens choice wandering to the Middle East operating through human traffickers. From this dealing, the traffickers significantly benefit in reverse the victims after paying cash they are exposed to misery plus fatality (*Addis Zemen*, April 28, p.3).

The other one reads:

50 people have been found while traffickers transporting victims in the in the lorry's container some fatigued by cramped condition. They were found after two days of travel when the lorry searched at the checkpoint (*Addis Zemen*, May 1, 2015 p.7)

The newspaper used human-interest frame that describe people especially victims and their testimonies about human trafficking. However, the newspaper didn't use this frame dominantly. In its human interest frame stories, mostly victims were giving their experiences passed through their dangers journey. Sometimes journalists featured individual's those who are successful at home and used to be victims of human trafficking. One of the article appeared narrate a personal journey of a young trafficking victim According to the story the young man was forced to work illegally without any salary. In other word the story focuses labour exploitation that happened to the young man. Excerpt from an article appeared:

Yohaness Alemu is a young man who resided for the past two years and four months in Saudi Arabia. He arrived in Saudi after dangerously crossing the sea. He left to Saudi after he was allured by traffickers' and convinced him by illusory chatter professionals in welding and metals needed in Saudi for job then he decided to go to Saudi looking for his desired life. After arriving in Saudi even if he works he use to not get his payment for many months survived in desolation since he was working in hid and most of the time after the work is done, when he request the payment the employers demanded him to present his work permit (*Addis Zemen*, December, 11, 2013, p.13).

Among majors five frames economic and empathy frame were not dominant in *Addis Zemen*. Both frames were the least used frames by *Addis Zemen*. In other word the economical impact of human trafficking on individual and country level were not given priority. The newspaper did not prefer victims of human trafficking in sympathetic manner.

Amharic Reporter

Attribution of responsibility frame was dominantly used by *Amharic Reporter*. The newspaper mostly used this frame to indicate what action government should take. Under this frame most of the articles demands accountability to avoid the problem. Moreover other written under Attribution of responsibility frame state how government should entertain the problem of human trafficking. The article entitled '*the government have done nothing other than condemning the suffering of its immigrant citizen*', '*anti human trafficking national council should scrutinize its performance*', '*issues that needs attention other than the*

temporary ban of recruiting Ethiopian employs abroad etc can easily show the newspaper dominantly attributed government to take action in all circumstance of the problem.

Amharic Reporter March, 15, 2015 under the title '*unaccountable ban of employee's overseas spreading illegality*' the writer raised different issue concerning '*the proclamation of overseas employment*' in one hand the government believes that the proclamation will tackle human trafficking. On the other hand different agencies claim that the ban stated in the proclamation was become the major cause to citizen to be trafficked. The article portrayed government specially Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs as the major responsible body for aggravating human trafficking. It was strongly recommended government should have to come up with better solution rather than abusing the constitution since (EFDR) constitution acknowledge citizen's right to move everywhere. The excerpt from an article appeared:

When examine the last 18th month performance of Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, with other countries experience, we can realize there is a problem in leadership, organizational and sufficiency. To achieve a goal set, the government desired to clear the problem with in the sectors particularly lack of governance issues and provides quality service to public and business in accordance to the law and order, by assigning individuals with ability and necessary quality(*Amharic Reporter*, March, 15, 2015 p.19).

The *Amharic Reporter* in its attribution of responsibility frame also described a strong recommendation on national policy and law enforcement related to human trafficking. Concerning this idea the newspaper writes:

To brought numerous human traffickers before court, illegal immigration oversight should report before the damaged happened, surge the regular report period, strength the capacity of security force, improve evidence gathering and interpretation capacity are should be given consideration for the implementation of the law (*Amharic Reporter* May, 10, 2015 p.38).

In general in this frame The *Amharic Reporter* tended to emphasize government's responsibility especially in terms of job creation, law enforcement, in protecting citizens, in creating conducive environment to citizen were saliently appeared.

The next dominant frame in *Amharic Reporter* was solution frame. As it was the case in *Addis Zemen* the newspaper tended to present the stories that have both permanent and temporary solution to the problem. Even though the newspaper (*Amharic Reporter*) made the government responsible for not enforcing anti- trafficking law properly and not restricting the

overseas travel ban, it was claimed that these law and proclamations had a considerable effect in diminishing trafficking in person.

Stories entitled ‘a proclamation that allows investigators to use special procedures during investigation to combat human trafficking present before law-makers, the government ban citizens from travelling abroad to looking for job, etc These were appeared in the assumption that to bring permanent solution to minimize human trafficking. Under the title ‘a new proclamation that allows investigators to use special procedures during investigation to combat human trafficking present before law-makers, the newspaper described how the draft proclamation helped to prevent the action of trafficker and widely discussed how to pose punishment on them. The pervious investigation procedure couldn’t cope with the challenge of human trafficking. So in order to combat human traffickers as well as arrest the criminals and to put them before the law the draft proclamation provides a remedy by introducing special investigation procedure as a solution. The following examples excerpt from the articles show how legal solution portrayed by the newspaper:

It needs exceptional investigation procedures to comprehend criminality of this action in-depth and in what way the crime was carried out as well as to acquire evidence especially how the crime occurred and gathering materials evidences like transport documents; says the description (*Amharic Reporter*, August, 5, 2015 p.1).

On the other hand following the incident in Saudi Arabia and Ethiopians slaughtered in Libya there were some stories that tended to focus on temporary solution to the victims and their family. For instance, stories with the headline ‘*Tsemekse Global donates two hundred thousand birr for victims of ISIS slaughtered Ethiopians, Government officials’ delegation to travel Libya to return Ethiopian from Libya* etc. Under the headline ‘US support women’s who are victims of human trafficker: Ambassador says’. The story quoted the then America to Ethiopia Ambassador Patrishya Haslak and the Ambassador confirmed that the government of America was ready to support Ethiopian victims of human trafficking. It state:

Her government will continue working with Ethiopian government to help woman and girls who are victims of monstrous action of human traffickers and want prevent this type of crime (*Amharic Reporter*, December, 1, 2013 p.39).

The other one appeared by attributing the former foreign minister. Excerpt from article reads:

Ethiopian delegation lead by Foreign Minister Dr .Tedros Adhanom, come back after discussing with Egyptian officials about the remaining Ethiopians

in Libya who are still living in hid in a great danger and distressing situation after the slaughter of Ethiopians' in Libya by ISIS (Amharic Reporter May,6,2015 p.5).

Diagnostic frame also applied in *Amharic Reporter*. The more emphasized causes were poverty rather than other causes. While traffickers as cause of human trafficking was not emphasized in the articles, it was not ignored either. Gender discriminations and violence did not get emphasis also.

...Following the banning of foreign work permit illegal immigration is booming and the suffering of citizens intensified according to information. The Minister of labour and Social Affairs is the one concerned with after a year of banning employment agencies, drafted new bill in 2014 and put on the table for discussion to replace the previous bill which was in effect starting from 2009 under proclamation number 632/2001 but it is not yet ratified (*Amharic Reporter*, July 1, 2015 p.7).

The *Amharic Reporter* used conflict frame in order to entertain disagreement between various bodies involved in the issue. Articles written under conflict frame focused on attacks, public revolt and contrary ideas between different bodies. Articles entitled like '*protester who gathers to oppose Saudi government action clash with police*', '*the heinous massacre against Ethiopians create public discontent*', '*police and protester clash in a public rally called to condemn ISIS*' etc. words like '*clash*', '*protest*', '*disagree*' have been used.

When the Saudi Arabia government ordered the so-called 'illegal' Ethiopian immigrants to leave the country, local media frame the issue according to their interest. In addition to other frame *Amharic Reporter* used conflict frame to entertain the anger of Ethiopian towards Saudi government. Story that expressed anger was appeared on November 13, 2013 in *Amharic Reporter* front page. The introductory part of the article reads:

Ethiopians discontentment was rise inside and outside the country following attack against citizens in Saudi Arabia. The killing, suffering and cold-hearted congesting imprison rise all Ethiopians all over the world in contradiction of what's happening in Saudi (*Amharic Reporter*, November, 13, 2013 p.1).

The other article appeared with the headline '*protester who gathers to oppose Saudi government action clash with police*' excerpt from the article occurs:

The distressed Addis Ababa residence, clash with police on 'Hidar' 6, 2006 E.C while rallying against Saudi Arabia government action, on the road that take to Saudi Embassy, the demonstration condemning the killing, tortures and suffering of Ethiopian in Saudi Arabia (*Amharic Reporter*, November, 17, 2013p.1).

The newspaper reported the disagreement between government and different individual's personal opinion. Concerning those issue, the *Amharic Reporter*, presented both side of the argument. For instance, among other newspaper wrote stories that focus on employment travel ban. Regarding this idea there were disagreement between both sides. The government claims that travel ban would help to control human trafficking. On the other hand some people argue that the ban by itself would aggravate human trafficking. The newspaper presented both sides view in different publication. One quote was taken as an example. The article reads:

The overseas employment agency is the one who could not clear out itself, involved in human trafficking and they don't have shame to request to a place in drafting the new law. No way if they coincide to keep calm that is tolerable. Whatever the case it should be comprehended that is unbearable to draft the law with a crowd of corrupt 'rent seeker's' (*Amharic Reporter*, March 5, 2014 p.18).

From the five major frames human interest and empathy frames were the least used frame in *Amharic Reporter*. This indicates that the newspaper was not interested in approaching stories in way of personalizing and having testimony about human trafficking. Moreover, there was one story that used sympathetic frame. To sum up *Amharic Reporter* did not use human interest and sympathetic frame dominantly within the selected time frame.

4.1.2 How the Newspapers Cover Human Trafficking Issue?

While discussing how media frame a certain issue, it is worth examining the coverage the media has given to the issue. From *Addis Zemen* (daily newspaper) and the Reporter (*Amharic* bi-weekly newspaper) out of 424 editions/issues, the researcher found 180 news, feature articles and editorial pieces that were directly or indirectly concerned with human trafficking. Within the selected time interval much of the stories concentrated within a specific month. Most of the stories appeared in both newspapers in November 2013 when over hundred thousands of Ethiopians returned home and in April 2015, when ISIS in Libya killed more than two dozen of Ethiopian trafficking victims.

Regarding the coverage of human trafficking issue, all informants agreed that inadequate priority was given to human trafficking issues. According to the informants, even though human trafficking issue was one of the alarming social issues, the emphasis and consistence coverage given by the media to the issue was inefficient. Informant's (informant 1 Deputy-Editor-in-Chief and informant 2 Senior Reporter from *Addis Zemen*, informant 4, Managing

Editor and informant 5, Senior Reporter from *Amharic Reporter* idea's concerning the priority and coverage of human trafficking given by the selected media outlets (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*) presented respectively as follows:

Informant 1 (Deputy-Editor-in-Chief in *Addis Zemen*): at one moment as event-driven news we covered the incident as a campaign however from broad-spectrum viewpoint it was not given ample stress. At one time, the government provided direction showing its particular emphasis and there was coverage in a campaign. We do not have practice of covering the issue in consistency and I don't consider our newspaper offered adequate stress to the problem (*personal interview, February 24, 2017*).

Informant 2 (Senior Reporter in *Addis Zemen*): At the period, other media houses gave vast coverage on the issue (human trafficking) our media also forced to provided coverage. Other than that, I can contemplate there was no planned coverage of the issue in order to create awareness to the general public and that is the huge gap (*Personal interview, February 24, 2017*).

Informant 4 (Managing Editor in Reporter): the coverage and emphasis we provide to human trafficking was not what it supposes to be. Our reporting follows happenings that appeal to human interest (*Personal interview, February 27, 2017*).

Informant 5 (Senior Reporter in Reporter): at that time when Ethiopian returned home with our obligation as Ethiopian, we provide coverage to the issue; however, we could do better than that. When we cover the issue as a sensational it could take us to public outrage and that could take the public against the government (*Personal interview, February 27, 2017*).

During the selected time interval of the study, all informants underscored that the human trafficking issue was considered as 'national agendas' since many Ethiopian human trafficking victims returned from Saudi Arabia due to 'illegality' and more than dozen of Ethiopian who travel illegally were killed by ISIS. Through interviews, it was further discovered that during that time the issue considered as big phenomena, for specific months in a row it got coverage like a special campaign. From the informants, one can understand that the issue of human trafficking got coverage following some events happened. They assert that their media did not have any long-lasting strategy to report human trafficking issue and predominantly their stories were event based.

As mentioned earlier, *Addis Zemen*, a government-owned Newspaper, published 330 editions/issues. Out of it 123 articles that deal with human trafficking and related issue have

been found. A privately owned newspaper *Amharic Reporter*, out of 94 editions/issues totally 57 articles that deal with human trafficking appeared.

In *Addis Zemen*, coverage numerous of human trafficking stories concentrated within a few months especially on November 2013 and April 2015 followed by a number of Ethiopian returns from Saudi Arabia due to illegality and dozens of Ethiopian were killed by ISIS respectively. During those months in one publication, a couple or more than that articles appeared in the newspaper. However, the issue lacks consistency. The researcher found only three articles relating to human trafficking stories during February 2015. Similarly, *Amharic Reporter* had only two articles during this month. Like to *Addis Zemen* in the *Amharic Reporter* most of the stories concentrated in November 2013 and April 2015. From that, we can understand that in terms of coverage both newspapers gave less emphasis to the issue of human trafficking since most of the stories appeared followed by some incidents.

Deputy-Editor-in-Chief of *Addis Zemen*, informant 1, said the media outlet gave coverage about human trafficking issue when the government considered the issue as existing agenda and events. According to the informant one reason that lack of continues coverage of human trafficking was “there are many social problems we suppose to give coverage besides human trafficking”. This means that the media has been lack of addressing all social problems comparing the number of social problem with the responsibility of the media. The other reason the informant rise was, “most of the time there was no development on human trafficking reporting. Our stories keep similar since there were no new developments concerning the implementation of different proclamation on the government side.”

On the other hand, unlike to *Addis Zemen*, *Amharic Reporter*, as the media house is a private company, its activity based on business orientation. When the issue becomes human interest they will give much emphasis to the issue. Contrary to *Addis Zemen*, the reason why they couldn't give enough coverage to human trafficking is that that couldn't match with their business strategy. As per the personal interview with informant 4, Managing Editors of the Reporter, like any private company The *Amharic Reporter* gave a special emphasis to attract their audience in order to sell their Newspaper. According to the informant 4, since the media house is a business company doesn't dedicate on a single social problem and rather want to get attentions of its wider readers. Hence, the data imply that comparing to the seriousness of the problem; *Amharic Reporter* did not give ample coverage to human trafficking issue.

Even though there are internal and external human trafficking, both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* tended to focus on external trafficking while ignoring internal trafficking. Within the selected time interval the researcher found only one story, which focused on internal human trafficking. The article appeared in *Addis Zemen* as an opinion piece. The headline reads:

'The aggravating internal trafficking and recklessness of parents', (Addis Zemen November 14, 2014, p, 3).

The story states that, most of the children who are affected by internal trafficking coming from rural areas. Because of the pressure coming from the parents, these children couldn't have a chance for education and exposed to labor exploitation. While, within the selected time interval, no internal trafficking stories appeared in the *Amharic Reporter* newspaper. In general, there was inadequate media coverage about human trafficking in the face of a serious problem that could have a direct effect on the general public and government, the media seems to glaze over its events.

Both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* were not giving emphasis comparing to the seriousness of the problem. However, in terms of a number of editions the private owned one, *Amharic Reporter*, has gave better coverage than the government owned *Addis Zemen*. Disproportionately treated internal trafficking with external human trafficking, it was considered that there was a big gap on both selected media outlets.

4.1.3 Locations of human trafficking articles

Newspapers locate stories based on the criteria they set to each page and influence on the importance of a topic. In framing human trafficking issue, the location of the articles in newspapers can be considered as a valuable factor indicating the importance of the issue in the newspapers. Among the total human trafficking issue covered by *Addis Zemen* in the selected time frame about more than half of human trafficking and related issue has located on its front page as well as in editorial pages. In addition, there were occasions when the front pages allow more articles of human trafficking especially during incidences like many Ethiopians forcefully returned from Saudi Arabia and ISIS slaughtered Ethiopian trafficking victims. For example, on the 21 April 2015 three news items on the front page and another news item on the second page appeared. The stories focused on the moral issues, for instance, the headline reads 'No More Immigration', and 'Nationwide Public Discontent Continuous over ISIS Action'.

The front page story is considered the biggest news of the day, the newsworthiness stories of the day and it is the most important page even the passersby will have a chance to look at, and so it represents the showcase that might determine whether or not they will decide buying the newspaper and the editors determine the newsworthiness of the stories, such as timeliness, proximity of the story. As a result giving stories, a front-page position can increase its value.

On the other hand, *Amharic Reporter*, widely read a private newspaper, gives less front-page position for articles that focuses on human trafficking issues. Only nine out of fifty-seven articles were published on the front page. Most of the issue relating to human trafficking reported in the form of news and also some of the articles appeared opinion page. Most stories that appeared in front page deals with conflict issue. In the *Amharic Reporter*, the researcher couldn't found the occasions that appeared two or more human trafficking stories on the front page. This may imply that in terms of location *Addis Zemen* gave much attention than *Amharic Reporter*.

4.1.4 Sources of information for human trafficking stories

In the framing of human trafficking stories, the study considers the types of a source used in the selected print media outlets. The government, victims of human trafficking, public, political parties, civil society, associations, religious institution, media, and international organization like IOM were used as a sources, in both *Addis Zemen* and the *Amharic Reporter*. It is possible to say that, the use of sources for the selected media seems similar but differ the way they use sources.

Hence, all the sources were not used uniformly. The government-owned newspaper, *Addis Zemen* relayed more on government sources. In other words, this media house has been treating the issue of human trafficking primarily conveyed what the government sources offered. However, the researcher has found one single story that used economist as a source of information. The story depicted the impacts of human trafficking on the country's economy. It was observed that more than half of the stories relied on government officials. The articles took direct quotes from government officials as a headline. An example from headline reads:

“Government has no mission superior than safeguarding its citizens” (*Addis Zemen*, November 19, 2013, p.1)

(The story attributed to Tedros Adhanom , Ministry of Foreign Affairs and used his direct quote in the headline)

“*The proclamations will have a great role in tackling human trafficking*” (*Addis Zemen*, June 26, 2015, p, 1)

(The story Attributed to Deputy Prime Minister, Demeke Mekonnen and used a direct quote in the headline)

“*Working to come up with enduring solution for human trafficking*” (*Addis Zemen*, March 10, 2015, p. 2)

(The story attributed Ministry of labour and Social Affairs)

As per the interview held with Deputy-Editor-in Chief of *Addis Zemen*, informant 1 indicated that most of the time *Addis Zemen* used government sources particularly Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs.

We usually balance human trafficking stories by using government source because they are the one most of the time organize events on this subject (personal interview, February 24, 2017)

Informant 2, Senior Reporter at *Addis Zemen*, who wrote many human trafficking articles, asserted that most of his human trafficking stories were relayed on government source.

I used the ministry of Labour and Social Affairs as a source for over 90% of our human trafficking stories since international and local organization who have abundant information are not willing to share us information unless they benefit out of it. Occasionally, I use human trafficking victim as a source when get them while they back home. We never use traffickers as a source of our story since these persons are not ordinary brokers or criminals the government authorities are behind the curtain of this business and if we try to do that even we can collide with ministers or higher officials. (*Personal interview, February 24, 2017*)

Informant 3, a senior reporter at *Addis Zemen*, also agreed with informant1 that majority of the stories attributed to government officials. ‘Most of our human trafficking stories attributed government officials or experts as a source. Due to the complex nature of human trafficking, we were not motivated to investigate the case, the trafficking process, and illegal activities of the human trafficking issue. Instead, we simply pick the information that we got from the government’ (Personal interview, March 31, 2017).

According to the above informants, the major reason that they relied on government source was that of their belief to have the government say in every human trafficking story. Instead of using other sources in a balanced manner, they prefer to have a government say. The other reasons that they relied on government sources were the accessibility of information. Obtaining information from government body has been easy as they were easy to contact. On the other hand, international organization experts and researcher were used as a source in a very limited manner because; they believe that, those sources were not always available for them. This indicates that, if journalists will have information easily from the government body, they lack commitment and priority in searching of additional sources to make balance their story. In addition, having government source will make them safe.

Even though *Addis Zemen* relied on government source dominantly, other sources were also used. Victims, international organization and media, associations, experts, and religious bodies were used as a source of information. The second most used source in *Addis Zemen* was victims. This government media outlet used victims frequently when over hundred thousand Ethiopian human trafficking victims return from Saudi Arabia due to 'illegality'.

Similar to *Addis Zemen* the *Amharic Reporter* used different sources. The newspaper used Government, victims of human trafficking and their family, civil society, political parties, associations, religious institution, international media, and international organization like IOM, public as a source of information. However, unlike to *Addis Zemen*, the newspaper also used academic research and international report frequently. Moreover, observed the newspaper entertaining two or more sources with dissimilar outlook used in a single story.

According to informant 4, Managing Editor of the Reporter, most of the time their media don't rely on government source since the information they obtain from government unreliable or according to the informant's word the information is 'cocked'

When we write a story about human trafficking, we use every party who have a stake on the issue like individuals international organizations, government agencies as a source of information. Despite the fact that, the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, made available a cocked information. So, we rather prefer to use international agencies like IOM since most of their information prepared by experts (Personal interview, February 27, 2017).

Informant 6, Senior Reporter at *Amharic Reporter*, Stated that they incorporate different news sources.

We use victims, families of victims and focal person of government offices and organizations working on victims of trafficking. Unless we incorporate all voices, the story would be single and incomplete (Personal interview, February 30, 2017).

Thus, unlike *Addis Zemen* the *Amharic Reporter* relatively uses various sources of information in a single story. However, both media outlets (*Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*) were not used traffickers as a source. They all said it was challenging to communicate human traffickers.

To sum up, concerning the use of source in framing of human trafficking stories among the selected government and private print media outlets, one can understand that, government-owned media (*Addis Zemen*) less independent compared to the private one (*Amharic Reporter*).

4.1.5 Causes portrayed in the newspapers

Addis Zemen

Addis Zemen, in its human trafficking reporting, mentioned diverse causes. Some of the causes were emphasized, and others were de-emphasized. The magnified causes were stated with more elaboration and repetition, whereas, the de-emphasized one simply mentioned. Traffickers, victims, illegal overseas employment agencies, lack of awareness(False Promises of stable Employment in Arab Countries), lack of good governance, poverty, unemployment, lack of interest in job creation, family and peer pressure were mentioned as a cause of human trafficking. From listed causes above some of them were did not get focused but mentioned. However, traffickers as a cause of human trafficking were mentioned repeatedly.

The two editorial reports that clearly show the stand of *Addis Zemen* newspaper concerning the issue concur with the examples. The first one was titled “No More Immigration” while the second says “Everybody has a responsibility to prevent human trafficking”. Article from the first editorial reads:

However, now the most nerve-racking thing is human trafficking, which is *caused by illegal brokers* and is currently it instigated citizen’s death and anguish. Not taking urgent action while citizens carrying the burden of the loan with deception in empty hope to leave their country is an existential threat and it is morally and legally historical responsibility (*Addis Zemen*, May 11, 2015, p.3).(emphasis is mine).

This editorial piece underline that every citizen has part in preventing trafficker, which is the cause of human trafficking. It also mentioned all bad consequences were happened because of traffickers.

The second editorial article stated:

Our fellow nationals who travelled illegally couldn't see the opportunity they left at homeland. Because of the *everlasting mislead of trafficker* many that push them out illegally. Most of the times illegal immigrants' pressed to go to the place they don't want and ultimately take their life endanger (*Addis Zemen* April 26, 2015, p.3) (*emphasis is mine*).

Traffickers as a cause of human trafficking were discussed widely in the stories. It was placed in the headline, body as well as background of the stories. Different sources that quoted in the stories such as government officials, victims, victim family, and friends were mainly blaming traffickers. Most of the stories indicated that traffickers should take responsibility to all the 'bad consequence' happened. For example, the following sentence mentioned by victims that express trafficker push him to be trafficked.

Alemayehu Dinku born and grow up in Arsi Zone, Eteya town. In 2008 *lured by traffickers* and went to Saudi Arabia after challenging sea trip from Djibouti to Yemen and tough long walk crossing Yemeni desert to reach Saudi (*Addis Zemen*, June 6, 2015 p.9) (*emphasis is mine*).

The above story did not blame traffickers entirely as a cause of trafficking; rather it favours to mention other causes. 10th paragraph of the article stated other causes besides trafficker; however, the paragraph strongly gave emphasis to traffickers as a cause of human trafficking.

To give stress different phrases have been used in the story such as "Lured by traffickers, depicting the desert like heaven, deceived by traffickers falsify information" etc.

In this newspaper, one headline appeared like '*For how long traffickers would be the cause of illegal immigration?*' The whole story states that traffickers were the major reason for citizen to be trafficked. The researcher couldn't find such kind of headline in *Amharic Reporter*.

Excerpt from the story appeared:

Until when the traffickers can because of immigrations three of her sons living in South Africa said Tadlech Meshesha, remember that five years ago 'one of my son arrived South Africa after a long suffering. Understanding all the suffering the other two of my sons followed the same way'. She accounts traffickers for separating from her sons. *Traffickers lure victims* has if they will going to get job, easy money in order to get money from them as well as

demanding money from the family(*Addis Zemen, May 7, 2015 p.1*).*(emphasis is mine)*

Thus, in addition to a trafficker, the newspaper also made other reasons accountable as a cause in its editorial pieces and articles but still the causes were not emphasized and repeatedly expressed.

Informant 1, Deputy Editor in Chief and informant 3, Senior Reporter of *Addis Zemen* justified why their stories concentrated on traffickers. According to their argument poverty or other causes shouldn't applicable to all trafficking victims.

Human trafficking doesn't have one cause. The cause differed from one place to the other, however; it is a misleading idea of trafficker could play a great role (Personal interview, February 24, 2017).

Informant 3, Senior Reporter of *Addis Zemen*, believed that now day there is tangible economic change in the country and it is easy to observe the change here and there:

In our human trafficking stories, we did not magnify poverty and other related issues as a main cause of human trafficking because, I believe that the government of Ethiopia working exhaustively working to fight poverty (Personal interview March 31, 2017).

Amharic Reporter

Amharic Reporter mentioned different causes in its human trafficking reporting. These are trafficker, victims, conflict, poverty, peer and family pressure, poor management system, political landscape, lack of good governance, human right issue, and lack of awareness (False Promises of stable Employment in Arab Countries), illegal employment agencies, corruption, and unemployment. These causes were appeared in news, feature and editorial pieces. The newspaper preferred to reveal a variety of causes in its articles. For example in the editorial pieces, that plainly shows the stand of the newspaper mentioning different causes in addition to trafficker. The following example has taken from editorial reads:

Not appropriate to overlook lack of good governance and human right violation whereas there is a consensus that *poverty is the major reason* why citizens leaving their country in mass through illegal brokers (*Amharic Reporter, May, 10, 2015, p.2*). *(Emphasis is mine)*.

Traffickers as a cause of human trafficking were mentioned in the stories. It was placed in the body as well as background of the stories. However, contrary to *Addis Zemen, Amharic*

Reporter did not express trafficker as a cause in the headline. In addition the causes like trafficker was not emphasize and appeared with details like *Addis Zemen*. Rather the newspaper had a tendency to mention different causes of human trafficking. The phrase like '*looking for a better opportunity*' was the most emphasized themes of the causes. Excerpt from the article:

Over the past few years a number of Ethiopians were paying a lot of money to traffickers as a means to go to South Africa, *looking for better job opportunity* (*Amharic Reporter* October 13, 2013, p. 4)(*emphasis is mine*)

The above article emphasizes that; people with a desire to have a better job continuously struggled to escape from poverty. This is considered as push factor for trafficking. Moreover, the article gave special focus that, because of searching for better job, citizens forced to fall in trafficker's hand. So, according to the article, the root cause was unemployment rather than traffickers.

Similar to *Addis Zemen*, *Amharic Reporter* has been mentioned variety of causes by sources. Whether the newspaper use government or private source; the causes were expressed without over depending on specific type of causes. As opposed to over relaying on single outlook by *Addis Zemen* that the major causes of human trafficking was trafficker, *Amharic Reporter* included different type of causes reputedly with source statements. The following extracted sources were from the government and individual sources appeared respectively:

Family and peer pressure, economic dependency, lack of awareness are some of the causes of human trafficking. Because of Traffickers, employment agencies and sometimes unethical embassy employees involved for citizens to be trafficked and end up in misery (*Amharic Reporter* May 27, 2015, p. 4).

Because most of the youth are not benefiting from economy to solve their economic concern they choose to be trafficked (*Amharic Reporter* May 27, 2015, p. 4).

Speaking about human trafficking causes, informant⁶ and informant 5, Senior Reporters' at The Reporter and expressed their idea respectively:

People have a desire to move place to place, especially from rural to urban area looking for a job and better life. But most of the time they are not informed and don't know how to make it happen safely. And finally they end up in the hand of illegals (*Personal interview, February 30, 2017*).

One of the root causes for our human trafficking problem is poverty. The other one is unemployment, low payment, lack of good governance and unfair competition among citizens (*Personal interview, February 27, 2017*).

The informants perceived poverty as major causes of human trafficking. According to them, poverty and desire for better life was the primary reason for people to be trafficked.

Both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* have been covered the same issue on human trafficking victims. The stories deal with the Ethiopians trafficking victims slaughtered by ISIS in Libya. Both newspapers stories attempted to show how victims were trafficked. However, the way of presenting the cause had difference. The extracted cause from *Addis Zemen* appeared:

These citizens left to get better opportunity however if they observed an opportunity at their homeland in their backyard and they could have found it (*Addis Zemen, April, 26, 2015, p.13*).

The cause extracted from *Amharic Reporter* reads:

“His desire to support his mother was the main motive that pushed him to be trafficked” (*Amharic Reporter April, 22, 2015, p.1*).

Both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* tended to describe the banning of overseas employment agencies as one of major cause of human trafficking. In addition, there were articles that failed to discuss any causes at all in both newspapers.

Consequently, from the data presented under this topic, one can understand that there was a difference between *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* in mentioning and emphasizing causes of human trafficking.

4.2 Discussion of the findings

4.2.1 Dominant frames used by the selected newspapers

A story may have various theme and frames. However, the dominant frame is the single main theme of a story, while secondary theme might be considered as supplementary ideas. Most often the supplementary frame can give strength to the main frame. Stories could also have one dominant frame and several supplementary or secondary frames (Baysha & Hallahan, 2004).

According to Iyengar (1990), frames can be classified into two categories as Episodic and Thematic frames. The majority of articles found from the data interpreted the issue in

focusing on events and certain incidents rather than presenting the issue in a broader context. Based on this, dominant frames used in this study such as attribution of responsibility, solution, morality and conflict frames were categorized into Episodic frame whereas, Diagnostic frames which deal with causes of the problem put under the thematic frame. At the beginning of this study four questions were set to be answered. The first and second questions were:

RQ₁. How did the selected print media (Addis Zemen and the Amharic Reporter) frame human trafficking issues? and

RQ₂. What types of frames were dominantly used in human trafficking issue? Based on the finding, answer for those questions forwarded as follow.

Morality frame

The selected media houses framed the issue of human trafficking by giving emphasis to the one and omitting some facts to the other. As the data presented showed that different type of frames were used by the selected newspapers in framing human trafficking stories. While *Addis Zemen* used morality, solution, attribution of responsibility, and diagnostic frames dominantly; *Amharic Reporter* used all three frames dominantly but morality frame to some extent. In addition unlike to *Addis Zemen*, *Amharic Reporter* used conflict frame dominantly.

Morality frame was the most dominant frame to *Addis Zemen*, but *Amharic Reporter* has given little attention for morality frame. Attribution of responsibility was a dominant frame to *Amharic Reporter*. However, similarities have been observed in using the second dominant frame. Solution frame was the second commonly used frame between both media outlets.

In *Addis Zemen*, the major theme of the articles that discussed in the morality frame was moral messages, support (giving hand to whom in need), and recommendations on social behaviors regarding the issue of human trafficking.

As the presentation of the data previously showed the majority of human trafficking stories and the related issue appeared following the return of Ethiopians from Saudi Arabia due to 'illegality' and following the slaughter of Ethiopians by ISIS. *Addis Zemen* described the situation in the aspect of 'national mourn'. Thus, the newspaper allowed people, religious institutions officials, international organizations etc to express their pays tribute. A keyword like condemn has been used repeatedly. During that time the newspaper tended to emphasize

the theme like how human trafficking was bad and the situation was worse. Showing solidarity with victims and supporting them in all circumstance were the other highlighted theme by *Addis Zemen*. To tackle human trafficking, citizen can 'Work and flourish' within their homeland were also recommended change in social behavior by *Addis Zemen*.

Unlike to *Addis Zemen*, *Amharic Reporter* used morality frame to some extent. The newspaper used this frame to describe people's solidarity to the victims and their family. Therefore, *Addis Zemen* emphasized the theme of 'working within the country' as a right and 'preferring to be trafficked' as a wrong judgment of the event. In addition, events were interpreted in a context of the religious aspect, which means assisting someone is morally acceptable. According to (Neuman et al., in Semetko and Valkenburg, 2000) journalists often make use of the moral frame indirectly by using quotation and inference. They always tended to tell to their audience how to behave toward a particular issue.

Attribution of responsibility

The *Amharic Reporter* used attribution of responsibility dominantly whereas it was the third dominant frame for *Addis Zemen*. Even though both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* used attribution of responsibility frame, they showed variation in portraying the theme. The *Amharic Reporter's* stories that employed responsibility frame were argued that to alleviate the human trafficking problem every concerned body should react toward the problem. Government and the general community were stated as agents who could alleviate the problem. However, an emphasis was given to solution in governmental level. The newspaper emphasized that issue related to human trafficking like Law enforcement, policy improvement, job and awareness creation, good governance; should get answer in government level. Semetko & Valkenburg (2000) study revealed that "the predominance of attribution of responsibility frame in media suggest the importance and potential influence of political culture and content on the framing problem and topics in the news" (Semetko& Valkenburg 2000, p.106).

Contrary to *Amharic Reporter*, *Addis Zemen's* approaches toward responsibility in tackling human trafficking and supporting citizen is not the only responsibility of the government; rather every individual should react on it. The newspaper attempted to highlight the efforts made by the government in combating human trafficking and draw attention to every citizen. In this type of framing, calling upon strong action against trafficker was also the major responsibility theme for *Addis Zemen*.

Solution frame

Solution frame was the second most dominant frame for both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*. Following the incident in Saudi Arabia and after Ethiopians were slaughtered in Libya there were some stories that tended to focus on a solution to the victims and their family. The then situation forced them to emphasize on a solution.

The newspapers strongly suggested that providing support such as training, providing financial support and rehabilitating victims are key solutions to the problem. They also introduced the new anti-trafficking law and overseas employment proclamation that concern on prevention and suppression of trafficking in person as a solution to the problem. Both media outlets portray the draft law as effective in containing law grave punishment, which enables to pass proportional sentence against human trafficking criminals. However, *Addis Zemen* tended to salient how the government support and rehabilitate the victims. It was expressed that the process was successful. On the other hand, *Amharic Reporter* expressed how different organizations support the victims and to some extent portray government's effort in controlling human trafficking. To sum up, concerning solution frame both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* prefer to focus on a temporary solution in tackling human trafficking instead of highlighting the long-term resolution for the problem.

Diagnostic frame

Both *Addis Zemen* and the *Amharic Reporter* tended to see the events by using diagnostic frames. In using diagnostic frame various differences have been observed between the two newspapers. As previously mentioned *Addis Zemen* tended to salience trafficker as the major causes of human trafficking; whereas, the *Amharic Reporter* relatively fair in attributing causes of human trafficking. The newspaper portrays poverty, unemployment, traffickers and other causes described repeatedly as a reason for trafficking in person. Though *Addis Zemen* mentioned various causes of human trafficking especial emphasizes has given to the lack of awareness and traffickers. Therefore, in reporting causes of human trafficking, *Amharic Reporter* relatively has been used balanced approach than *Addis Zemen*.

Conflict frame

During the selected time interval, *Amharic Reporter* has provided various opposing ideas; which indicated that the newspaper has been used Conflict frame in reporting human trafficking and relating stories. On the other hand, conflict frame was totally ignored by *Addis*

Zemen. In using conflict frame the *Amharic Reporter* allowed to express one party or individual disagreement and disappointment to another and also two or more sides of the issue of the human trafficking were presented.

The main theme of conflict frame rotated on the disagreement between the public and police during a protest on condemning the act of the Saudi Government and ISIS. The newspaper reported such kind of conflict stories on its front page. For instance, the *Amharic Reporter* reported some stories following the ISIS attack. The story showed how public demonstration and the incident immediately have been changed into conflict. As results, some political party members have been arrested. It was how the *Amharic Reporter* portrayed the main theme of the story. In addition, follow up stories have been depicted in the newspaper. Contrary to the *Amharic Reporter Addis Zemen* presented the story in moral and responsible perspective. The story presented by attributing to Redwan Hussein, Former Government Communication Office affairs Minister. He has been thanking the public due to their peaceful demonstration and solidarity. The other article appeared in *Addis Zemen* in the same issue was demand accountability following the violence in the demonstrations. The title reads: “People who are responsible increasing violence at the rally should be accountable”

The other theme in conflict frame that was reported in *Amharic Reporter* was the disagreement between the government and overseas employment agencies. The newspaper presented the government decision regarding the banning of overseas employment; show how agencies were dissatisfied with government decision. Concerning the overseas employment ban, the newspaper particularly in its commentary page allowed entertaining different individual’s personal opinion. For instance, regarding overseas employment ban the newspaper gave wide coverage on its commentary page to Labour and Social Affairs Ministry and for Overseas Recruitment Agencies as well as individual wrote their opinion on the issue. In light of this Semetko and Valkenburg (2000), wrote that media use conflict frame to express conflict or disagreement between individual and institution as a means of capturing audience attention. Conflict frame was applied in *Amharic Reporter* since it is a privately owned newspaper wants to catch the reader's attention widely.

4.2.2 Newspapers’ differences in portraying the causes of human trafficking

Media message can be affected by including or excluding facts, emphasizing or de-emphasizing ideas in the story. So the absence or presences of facts or idea have its own impact on a message of human trafficking. *RQ₃*. *What causes were mentioned and how these*

causes were presented? That was the third question for this study. Accordingly, *Addis Zemen* found to be a little bit fair in mentioning different causes of human trafficking. The newspaper listed different type of causes in its news, feature and editorial pieces. However, except traffickers, peer and family pressure other causes were de-emphasized and even some of causes were omitted. They were presented without reputation. Contrary to this, traffickers appeared as the root causes of human trafficking. This was made salient through repeating the same message and including detailed information in the body, background and also in the headline. The story tried to assert that, almost all victims of human trafficking were misled by traffickers. Moreover, cause like human right issue, gender and ethnic discrimination was not discussed in the stories since those issues are considered as push factor of human trafficking. Omitting such kind of fact can mislead the reader.

Amharic Reporter listed various causes for human trafficking though some push factors were not included. Gender inequality, violence against women, displacement and disruption due to natural and human-created catastrophes were excluded. These factors were not also mentioned in *Addis Zemen*. The exclusion of such causes would make the stories unbalance in indicating the appropriate cause as these causes have a significant share of the problem. The theme of, 'looking for a better opportunity' and poverty as a cause were emphasized by *Amharic Reporter* among other. However, the newspaper mentioned causes like a human right issue and political scenery of the country unlike to *Addis Zemen*.

To sum up, some causes were selected presented and got emphasized by both newspapers. The other causes did not get much attention or not highlighted. In *Addis Zemen*, broker initiatives or the act of trafficker made salient through repeating the same message and including detailed information in the body, background and also in the headline. Poverty and unemployment were not emphasized.

On the other hand, *Amharic Reporter* mentioned diverse cause but poverty as cause appeared repeatedly. The fact that poverty and unemployment were mentioned the major root cause of human trafficking in international organization and in different research, these cause was not given much attention or de-emphasized by the government-owned newspaper, *Addis Zemen*. However in mentioning and emphasizing cause the *Amharic Reporter* put in a better position relatively. This in light with, Djankov et al (2003) idea's "a government monopoly in the media would distort and manipulate information". Whereas, because of independence private media could supply alternative view to the public. Therefore, in mentioning and highlighting

the cause government-owned media, *Addis Zemen*, exposed its elites thought whereas, *Amharic Reporter* relatively tried to mention causes fairly without omitting or de-emphasizing poverty as a root cause. According to (UNODC 2008, p.454) Poverty, oppression, lacks social and economic opportunities, lacks human rights are some of the conditions that make individuals want to migrate. In other words searching for a better life often forced them to be trafficked. Therefore it is claimed that most of the push factors are related to poverty.

4.2.3 How the newspapers gave emphasis to human trafficking issue?

Trafficking in human being and Greek mass media guide for journalist (2007) indicates that the media can play a great role especially in raising awareness and accurately informing the public on human trafficking with the aim of combating and preventing the phenomenon. Thus, giving appropriate attention to the issue has its own positive impact since human trafficking is one of the grave social problems within the country and worldwide. Furthermore, 'increase in the news coverage is thought to bring about increase in the salience of particular issues or events' (Rias 2008, cited in Ashenafi, 2012).

Research question four (*RQ₄. How differ the framing of human trafficking stories by the government and private owned media outlets?*) got answer in the whole discussion part but the following discussion provide more on media organizational difference and similarity. Based on this the data presentation previously indicates that human trafficking and related issues were not given enough attention in both the selected print media outlets. Mostly the coverage of the issue depends on some incident. In both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter*, within eleven-month time interval, out of 424 editions/issues, only 180 articles that related to human trafficking has been found.

The newspapers provided more coverage during the time of thousands of Ethiopians return from Saudi Arabia and dozen Ethiopians killed by ISIS. The informants have also confirmed that the selected media outlets did not give much attention to human trafficking issue. The coverage of human trafficking issue mostly follows some incident, in other words, its event based. Both media outlets did not have any annual or monthly human trafficking reporting plan. Moreover, instead of giving deep policy and law enforcement analysis, they tended to focus on an incident related to human trafficking.

Differences have been observed giving attention to the media house though the coverage human trafficking stories given by those media can be described as minimal. *Amharic*

Reporter found better in terms of a number of editions/issues, however, the newspaper did not give much attention to the location. As the data indicates *Addis Zemen's* half of human trafficking stories appeared in editorial and front page whereas, in *Amharic Reporter*, most of trafficking in person articles appeared inside page.

According to Department of State latest report (2016) "Ethiopian girls were exploited in domestic servitude and prostitution within the country, while boys are subjected to forced labour in traditional weaving, construction, agriculture, and street vending." This indicates that trafficking within the country become flourish and significant. Both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* did not give much attention even though trafficking in person within the country becomes serious. Within two years interval, there was only one story found in *Addis Zemen* that focuses on internal human trafficking. Therefore, this could imply that both print media outlets may not emphasize on the issues of internal trafficking compared to the prevalence of the problem. Hence, Stories that were portrayed by the newspapers might not be adequate compared with the extent and prevalence of human trafficking in the country and also in the region.

4.2.4 Sources used in the selected newspapers

According to Tuing and Hassim (2009), the sources used by newspapers play a substantial role in framing the news and also media can easily control their news framing by only referring to sources. Based on this the kind of sources used in human trafficking stories can also determine how an issue or event is framed. *Addis Zemen*, the government-owned newspaper, more relied on government sources. The sources were found direct quotes from government official's interview, press conference, public demonstrations, and events concerned human trafficking etc. The newspapers hardly used experts and political parties. The finding is similar to what Gulati's (2010) study the title called News Frames and Story Triggers in the Media's Coverage of Human Trafficking. The study conducted by using content analysis of relevant articles in The New York Times and Washington Post between 1980 and 2006 reveals that media coverage has relied mostly on official sources and is framed in a way that has mirrored the dominant view of trafficking.

Unlike to *Addis Zemen Amharic Reporter* relatively used various sources of information. It was also observed that *Amharic Reporter* referred political parties, academic research, and international report repeatedly than *Addis Zemen*. Moreover, unlike to *Addis Zemen* in a single story, two or more sources that have different view have been identified.

Chapter five

5. Summary, Conclusion and Recommendation

5.1. Summary and Conclusion

This chapter tries to summarize and provide a conclusion of the major findings which the study discovered about media framing of human trafficking in comparative perspective. Recommendations for future studies are also forwarded. The government owned, *Addis Zemen* and privately owned, *Amharic Reporter* were selected purposively for comparative analysis. The researcher used qualitative content analysis (textual analysis) as a technique to conduct the study. In order to strengthen the interpretations of the data found from the textual analysis, an in-depth interview was made with informants from each newspaper and media experts from IOM.

The study was conducted based on framing and political economic theory. The analysis of framing of human trafficking in the selected newspapers was focused on Entman's (1993) framing definition which says “to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in communicating text in such way as to promote particular definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation and/or treatment recommendation for the item described” (Entman, 1993, p.52). Journalists do not only select topics and events for publication, but also include and exclude facts in order to endorse particular definition, causal interpretation, moral judgment, and recommendation. Hence, in order to promote a particular definition, the selected media outlets have framed the issue by presenting some facts and by escaping others. They also gave emphasis and amplification to some concepts. In addition, political economy theory was used to set out the organizational difference in framing of human trafficking stories.

The analysis of the study showed that the sample media differ in some way in framing the issue of human trafficking. Both newspapers used different types of frames in framing of human trafficking stories. *Addis Zemen* used morality, solution, attribution of responsibility, and diagnostic frames dominantly; *Amharic Reporter* used all three frames dominantly but morality frame to some extent. The privately owned, *Amharic Reporter* used conflict frame dominantly which was totally ignored by *Addis Zemen*.

Morality frame was the most predominant frame used by *Addis Zemen* whereas *Amharic Reporter* used attribution of responsibility dominantly. A number of stories relating to human

trafficking appeared following the return of Ethiopians from Saudi Arabia due to 'illegality' and victims of human trafficking, slaughtered by ISIS in Libya. Most of *Addis Zemen's* stories appeared in ways that condemn trafficking in person. In addition, the newspaper strongly condemned the acts of (ISIS) terrorist attack and the action taken by Saudi Arabia Government. In *Addis Zemen*, it was emphasized the theme like 'Working within the country' as a right and 'preferring to be trafficked' as a wrong judgment of the event. Hence *Addis Zemen* tended to present the stories in a way of there is favorable environment within the country and there is an opportunity to be successful in their homeland.

For *Amharic Reporter*, the dominant frame was attribution of responsibility frame which helped the paper to attribute government and concerned bodies. While the *Amharic Reporter* urged that the Ethiopian government have a special responsibility in undertaking trafficking in person, the general community was also made responsible, besides the government by *Addis Zemen*. *Amharic Reporter* and *Addis Zemen* used attribution of responsibility frame though difference has been observed in applying the frame. *Addis Zemen* attempted to underline the effort made by the government in combating human trafficking and draw attention to every citizen while *Amharic Reporter* made government and concerned bodies responsible for combating trafficking in person.

In both media, similarity has been observed in using solution frame. Creating awareness, supporting victims and rehabilitating trafficked citizens were considered as possible solutions to the problem. Moreover, both newspapers introduced the then new anti-trafficking draft law and overseas employment proclamation bans that concern on prevention and suppression of trafficking in person taken as a solution to the problem. In both newspapers advocating public involvement in providing solution, revising current labour policy, addressing the root causes of trafficking, improving labor standard in the destination country, and providing the framework for law enforcement, were not emphasized as themes in the solution frame.

Addis Zemen failed to use conflict frame in the framing of human trafficking stories whereas *Amharic Reporter* used conflict frame to report disagreement between the public and police during the protest on condemning the act of the Saudi Arabian Government and ISIS. *Amharic Reporter* presented the government decision regarding the ban on overseas employment; show how agencies were dissatisfied with the government decision. Stories wrote with conflict frame appeared on the front page.

Based on the analysis, both media houses selected for this study mentioned some of the push factors of human trafficking. However, differences have been seen in highlighting and emphasizing the causes. In *Addis Zemen*, broker initiatives or the acts of traffickers was made salient through repeating the same message and including detailed information in the body, background and also in the headline of the newspapers. Poverty and unemployment were not emphasized as such. On the other hand, *Amharic Reporter* mentioned diverse cause but poverty as a cause appeared repeatedly. UNICEF (2005) noted that studies and international reports on trafficking in human beings in Africa typically recognize poverty as the most visible cause of trafficking in human beings. Trafficking in person closely related to countries' development issue (UNICEF, 2005 p.5). So, there is a general consensus on the fact that poverty is a major factor for human trafficking. Thus, de-emphasizing such fact would lead the reader to the wrong perception.

Frames can define the problems, suggest solutions and attribute responsibilities. The analyzed newspapers implied that human trafficking as horribly hurt the nation and would make victims vulnerable to death. They also underscore that trafficker, poverty, lack of awareness as causes of human trafficking and suggested creating awareness, supporting victims not re-migrate, and rehabilitating trafficked citizens considered as a solutions to the problem. Moreover, both newspapers introduced the then new anti-trafficking law and overseas employment proclamation bans that concern on prevention and suppression of trafficking in persons taken as a solution to human trafficking. The responsibility of solving the problem was attributed to the government, general communities and to concerned bodies.

It is obvious that identifying sources in the story may help to notice the frame. Entman's (1993) definition noted that the presence or absence of sources manifests the existence of frames. Thus, concerning usage of sources, the disparity has been found between the private and government newspapers though both newspapers were similar in failing to use trafficker as sources of information.

Addis Zemen utilized government sources dominantly. Little attention has been given to studies and international reports by *Addis Zemen*. In contrast, *Amharic Reporter* utilized researches and international human trafficking reports as sources of information. The newspaper often used two or more sources in a single story. This indicates that the *Amharic Reporter* has been found in a better position in utilizing and entertaining diverse views concerning human trafficking. Therefore, ownership has brought a difference in using

sources of information. Consequently, it can be claimed that using mixed sources can make the story more balanced. In contrast, over dependence on official sources can result in de-emphasizing other important and primary sources like victims, potential migrants, and traffickers.

When media emphasize and make certain thing popular, the popularity might lead those things to become an agenda. Trafficking in persons makes people victims of physical and emotional abuse including: rape, torture, starvation, imprisonment, threats and death. Hence, due to its worse aspects, human trafficking is categorized as an issue that requires prior media attention. However, the findings of this study indicated that comparing to the nature and seriousness of the problem; both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* did not give adequate attention to human trafficking. Within the sample time frame, out of 424 editions/issues, only 180 articles were found from both newspapers. The coverage of human trafficking stories In terms of coverage, *Amharic Reporter* can be put in relatively in a better position, while in terms of placement of the stories *Addis Zemen* gave prior attention to the issue.

The study also revealed that stories on external trafficking issues were dominant, even though the extent and prevalence of internal trafficking have been lingering. Both *Addis Zemen* and *Amharic Reporter* did not give enough emphasis to internal trafficking rather they significantly emphasize on the external one. Within the sample time frame, only one internal trafficking, which focuses on child labor exploitation was found in *Addis Zemen*.

As all the informants claimed, the issue of human trafficking was dominantly event based. Both newspapers did not have any permanent plan reporting about the issue. According to the informants 'there are a number of problems that need media coverage'. So, it was observed that there was no consistency and fair coverage of human trafficking issue in the selected time frame. Thus, it is possible to say little attention was given by the selected media.

Generally, *Addis Zemen* was better in covering the issue in front page and in its editorial pieces. However, in terms of usage of sources of information, in selecting and emphasizing the causes of human trafficking, in attributing the concerned bodies, in entraining different disagreements and various views, *Amharic Reporter* found in a better place than *Addis Zemen*. So, it can be said that *Addis Zemen* reflects the view of the government in framing human trafficking stories, whereas *Amharic Reporter* is relatively fair in framing the issue. The view of the government and its elites reflected in *Addis Zemen* than *Amharic Reporter*. Thus, the ownership and control of the media are a significant factor in determining the

structure, working and output of the mass media and also in the production of meaning in society (Williams, 2003).

5.2. Recommendations

Media play a priceless role in bringing the various problems of the public to the attention of concerned bodies. It does not only create awareness among the public on various issues but also mould public view. The effect of human trafficking is worse. Thus, the role of the media is an absolutely necessary. This study was conducted with the aim of investigating how human trafficking was framed by the government and private media in comparative perspective. Based on the finding the researcher has provided the following suggestions:

- Since the problem of human trafficking is complex, creating awareness and providing accurate information is extremely important. It is highly recommended that the selected newspapers should give appropriate emphasis and increase their coverage on a timely basis. Reports of human trafficking stories shouldn't be event based.
- The media should present all types of trafficking to the public in a comprehensive manner. Similarly, both the selected government and private media should give equal emphasis on internal and external trafficking.
- It is advisable that journalists should rely on multiple sources of information rather than presenting the same view on a given issue. Therefore, it needs to use diverse sources that have different outlooks about human trafficking. The study revealed that the state-owned media (*Addis Zemen*) utilized government source more dominantly and the privately owned one (*Amharic Reporter*) relatively used different sources. Moreover, both newspapers need to use victims and traffickers as sources of information because they are primary information provider.
- Both media houses had better provide a long-term solution to the public instead of relying on giving a temporary solution to the problem. The study showed that both newspapers did not give much concern to solutions that can address the root causes of trafficking, improve labor standard in a destination country, and enhance law enforcement.

- Journalists of the media outlets ought to mention the accurate causes of the problem and should provide a balanced description of event in order to manage the root causes of trafficking in persons.
- Media houses need to provide continuous training programs to journalists on human trafficking issues and it is advisable to give freedom to journalists in reporting the problem because their way of presentation matters most in achieving the desired goals.
- The media houses should be loyal to their profession rather than serving the interest of a few groups.

Recommendation for future research

- ✓ Since this research was conducted to find out how human trafficking was framed in print media it is advisable to conduct on electronics media.
- ✓ This research focused on analyzing written text. So researchers can conduct visual content analysis. They can examine portrayal of victims in media as well.
- ✓ Researchers can look at audience reception analysis to examine the effects of the newspapers coverage of human trafficking.
- ✓ Further researches can be conducted in order to identify the types of frame that Ethiopian print media need to use dominantly in framing human trafficking stories comparing to other African countries.
- ✓ Examining how human trafficking stories can be framed in print media using quantitative methodology.

Reference

Ashenafi, G. (2012). *The Ethiopian Media Framing of Political Parties during the 2010 Parliamentary Election* (MA thesis). Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: unpublished.

Asplund, T. (2014). Climate change frames and frame formation:An analysis of climate change communicationin the Swedish agricultural sector. *Linköping Studies in Arts and Science No. 619* , pp13-72.

Bainbridge, J., Goc, N., & Tynan, L. (2011). *Media and Journalism: New Approaches to Theory and Practice (2nd ed.)*. Australia: Oxford universty press.

Baysha, O., & Hallahan, K. (2004). Media Framing of The Ukrianian Crisis. *Journalism Studies*, 5 (2), pp.233–246.

Borer, M. (2015). *"human trafficking in media:Who,What,Where,and Why?"*(Honors thesis). unpublished.

Bruktawit, E. (2008). *The Framing of Gender Violence by The Ethiopian Print Media*(MA Thesis). Addis Ababa Universty,Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: unpublished.

Carrage, k. M., & Roefs, W. (2004). The Neglect of Power in Recent Framing Research. *Journal of Communication* , pp.214-228.

Corrigall-brown, C., & Snow, D. A. (2005). *"falling on Deaf Years: Confronting the Prospect of Non Resonant Frames"*. Minnesota: Universty of Minnesota press.

Creswell, J. W. (2005). *Qualitative, Quantitative, and mixed methods approach*. Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.,.

Curtis, R. R. (2012). *"Sex trafficking: How the media portrays victims and reflects legislation"* Graduate Thesis and Dissertations Paper. unpublished.

De Vreese, C. H. (2005). News Framing Thoery and Typology. *Information Designe Journal*, 13 (1), pp 51-62.

Dennis, C., & Druckman, J. N. (2007). Framing public Opinion in Competitive. *American Political Science Review*, 1 (4), pp. 637-655.

Djankov, S., McLiesh, C., Nenova, T., & Shleifer, A. (2003). Who Owns The Media? *Journal of Law and Economics* , pp.341-381.

Eden, T. (2011). *A Copmarative Analysis of State and private Newspaers of National News Coverage and presentation of Newsmaker-A case study on Addis Zemen and Addis Admas Newspapers.*(MA Thesis). Addis Ababa Universty, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Unpublished.

Elsamni, A. M. (2016). *Framing Arab Refugees in Global News*. Cairo: Unpublished.

- Entman, R. M. (1991). Framing US Coverage of International News: Contrast in Narrative of KALand Iran Air Incident. *Journal of Communication*, 41 (4), pp.6-27.
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43 (4), pp. 51-58.
- Ephrem, B. (2008). *Coverage of Human Trafficking Analysis of 'ENEWAQ' Programm.* (MA Thesis). Addis Ababa Universty, Addis ababa, Ethiopia: unpublished.
- Farrell, A., & Fahy, S. (2009). The problem of human trafficking in the U.S.: Public frames and policy responses. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 37, pp.617–626.
- Gabriel, T. (2013). *Root Cause and solution to human trafficking in Ethiopia.* Adigrat Universty, Ethiopia.
- Gans, H. J. (2014). America News Media in an increasingly unequal society. *International Journal of communication* .
- Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience.* New York: Northeastern University Press.
- Grix, J. (2004). *The Foundation of Research.* New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gudetu, W. (2014). Causes and Consequences of Human Trafficking in Ethiopia: The case of women in Middle Esat. *International Journal of Gender and Women's Studies*, 2 (2), pp. 233-246.
- Gudina, A., & Tariku, A. (2013). *Human Trafficking in Selected Woredas of Jimma Zone.*
- Gulati, G. J. (2010). News Frames and Story Triggers in the Media's. *Human Rights Rev.*, 12, pp.363–379.
- Haftamu, K. (2014). Framing of Human Trafficking in State Newspapers The Case of Bekur Newspaper. *Global Media Review* .
- Hallahan, M. (1999). 'Seven models of framing: Implications for public relations'. *Journal of public relations research*, 11 (3), 205-242.
- Hamman, M. (2011). *Human trafficking, Child protection and The Media.* Media Monitoring Africa.
- Herman, E. S., & Chomsky, N. (1988). *Manufacturing Consent: The Political Economy of the Mass Media.* New York: Pantheon Books.
- Hillelujah, A. (2012). *News source usage in Oromia Radio and Television Organization: A case study of Oromia Radio.* (MA Thesis). Addis Ababa Universty, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: unpublished.
- IOM. (2008). *Human Trafficking: New Directions for Research (papers prsented on meeting of research experts).* cairo: IOM.

- Iyenger, S. (1990). Framing Responsibility for Political Issue the case of Poverty. *political Behavior* , 12 (1), pp.19-40.
- Kvale, S. (1996). *Interviews: An Introduction to Qualitative Research Interviewing*. SAGA.
- Larsen, P. (1991). Media contents Textual analysis of fictional media. In K. B. W.Jankowski, *A handbook of qualitative methodologies for mass communication* (p. 133). London and New York: Routledge.
- Latham, B. (2007). *Sampling:What is it?*
- Lee, M. (2007). *Human Trafficking*. Oregon: Portland Willan.
- Linström, M., & Marais, W. (2012). Qualitative News Frame Analysis: A Methodology . *Communitas ISSN 1023-0556* , pp. 21-38.
- Loseke, D. R. (2003). *Thinking About Social Problem An Introduction to Constructionist Perspective (2nd ed.)*. New York: deGruyter Inc.
- Macnamara, J. (2005). Media Content Analysis: its uses, Benefit and Best practice. *Asia Pacific Public Relations Journal*, 6 (1), pp. 1 – 34 .
- Makisaka, M. (2009, December). Human Trafficking:A Brief Overview. *Social Development Notes :Conflict, Crime and Violence* , pp. 1-15.
- Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative Researching* (2nd ed.). SAGE publication Ltd.
- McCabe, A. (2010). *Sex trafficking : a global perspective*. Michigan: Playmous,Lexington.
- McQuail, D. (2010). *Mass Communication Theory* (6th ed). London: SAGA.
- Mihret, A. (2015). *External Influence on News Reporting: The Case of Reporter, Fortune, and Capital* (MA Thesis). Addis Ababa Universty,Addis Ababa,Ethiopia: Unpublished.
- Miller, K. M., & Gandy, O. H. (1991). Paradigmatic drift: A bibliographic review of the spread of economic analysis in the literature of communication. *Journalism Quarterly*, (68) pp. 663–671
- Miller, W., & Crabtree, B. (1999). *Doing Qualitative Research* (2nd ed). California: Sage publications.
- Mosco, V. (1996). *Political Economic of Communication:Rethinking and Renewal*. London: SAGA Publishing.
- Neale, C. B. (2004). *Conducting In-depth Interviews:A Guide for Designing and Conducting In-Depth Interviews for Evaluation Input*.
- Niggussie, k. (2014). *coverage of human traffickingissues by print media*. (MA Thesis) Addis Ababa Universty,Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: unpublished.

- Nigussie, M. (2014). Media and Politics in Ethiopia. *Ethiop.j.soc.lang.stud.* 1(2), .
- Odukwu, P. (n.d). *Human Trafficking: Nature, Cause, and Effects*. Naptip, Nigeria.
- Ospina, S. (2004). qualitative research. (G. S. G. Goethals, Ed.) *encycolopidia of leadership*, 1.
- Polaris, P. (2013, November 5). *Human trafficking*. Retrieved July 27, 2016, from polaris project.org.: <http://www.polarisproject.org>.
- Rahman, M. A. (2011). Human Trafficking in the era of Globalization: The case of trafficking in the global market economy. *Transcience Journal* , 2 (1), p.57-58.
- RMMS. (2016). Ethiopian Country Profile. *RMMS Horn of Africa and Yemen* , p. 1.
- Schauer, E. J., & Wheaton, E. M. (2006). Sex Trafficking Into The United States: A Literature Review. Retrieved February 6, 2016, from <http://cjr.sagepub.com/content/31/2/146>
- Schefele, D. A. (1999). Framing as Aa Theory of Media Effect. *Journal of communication* , pp103-122.
- Scheufele, D. A., & Tewksbury, D. (2007). Framing, Agenda Setting, and Priming: The. *Journal of Communication ISSN 0021-9916* , 9-20.
- scheufele, D. T. (2007). Framing, Agenada setting,and Priming:The Evolution of the three Media. *journal of communication ISSN0021-9916* .
- Semetko, H. A., & Valkenburg, P. M. (2000). Framing European politics: a content analysis of Press and Television news. *Journal of Communication* , pp 93-106.
- Shelley, L. (2010). *Human Trafficking a global perspective*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Simret, Y. (2006). *Press coverage of the post may 2005 election protests in Ethiopia: media ownership impact on news objectivity* (MA Thesis). Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.: Unpublished.
- Skjerdal, T. S. (2012). *Competing loyalties:Journalism culture in the Ethiopian state media(PHD Dissertation)*. Universty of Oslo.
- Templeton, J. (2011). *Framing Encyclopedia of Power*. Thousand oaks: SAGE publications.
- Tiung, L. K., & Hasim, M. S. (2009). Media Farming of A Political Personality: A Case Study of a Malaysian Politician. *European Journal of Social Science*, 9 (3), 408-424.
- Tomas, K. (2016). *Practises and challenges of electronic media stations in supporting prevention against human trafficking in Ethiopia* (MA thesis). Addis Ababa Universty, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: unpublished.
- UN.GIFT. (2008). The Role of Media in biilding Image. *Vienna Forum to Fight Human Trafficking*. Vienna.

- UNDOC. (2008). *An Introduction to Human Trafficking*. Vienna: UNDOC.
- UNODC. (2009). *Global Report on Trafficking in Person*. Vienna: UNODC.
- UNICEF. (2005). *Trafficking in Human Beings, Especially Women and Children, in Africa*. (2nd.edi). Italy: The UNICEF Innocenti Research Centre.
- US Department of State Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. (2014). *Media Best Practice*. Washington DC.
- US Department of State. (2016). *Trafficking in Persons Report*. United State Department of State.
- US Department of State. (2015). *Trfficking in Person Report*. United State Departement of State.
- Virkus, L. B. (2014). *Human Trafficking and the Media: Comparing Newspapers' portryal of Victims and Offender*. Norther Iowa: Uiniversty of Northern Iowa.
- wallinger, C. S. (2010). Media Representation and Human trafficking: How Anti Trafficking Discourse Affect Trafficking Person. *paper presented at Second Annual Interdeciplinary Conference on Human Trafficking*. Lincoln: Uiniversty of Nabrascak- Lincoln.
- Weitzer, R. (2015, August). Human trafficking and contemporary slavery. *Annual review of sociology* , pp. 223-242.
- Williams, K. (2003). *Understanding Media Theory*. Great Britain: Arnold publishers.
- Wimmer, R. D., & Dominick, J. R. (2010). *Mass Media Research: An Introduction*. Boston: Wadsworth Publishing Campany.
- Yin, R. K. (2011). *Qualitative Research From Start to Finish*. New York: Guilford publications, Inc.
- Yoseph, E., Mebratu, G., & Belete, R. (2006). *Assasement of Trafficking in Women and Children in and From Ethiopia*. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: IOM.

Appendices

Appendix -A

The Amharic Version of Extracts used in the text

ይሁን እንጂ አሁን የሚታየውና ዜጎችን ለሞትና እንግልት እየዳረገ ያለው አሳሳቢ ጉዳይ በደላሎች አማካኝነት በህገ-ወጥ መንገድ የሚደረግ የሰዎች ዝውውር ነው። ዜጎች ከፍተኛ ብድር እየወሰዱ ጭምር ሀገር ጥለው በባዶ ተስፋ እየተሰደዱ አፋጣኝና የተቀናጀ እርምጃ ያለመውሰድ በህግ ብቻ ሳይሆን በታሪክም የሚያስጠይቅ ወቅታዊ አደጋ ነው። (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ግንቦት፣ 3፣ 2007 ገጽ 3)¹

ብዙዎች በህገ-ወጥ የሚጓዙ ወገኖቻችን በሀገራችን እየታየ ያለ ወገግ ያለ ብርሀንን አያዩም። ለዚህ ደግሞ ህገ-ወጥ ደላሎች ማብቂያ የሌለውን ስብከታቸውን ስለሚደረድሩላቸው ለመከብላል ልባቸው ይነሳሳል። መቼም ቢሆን ህገ-ወጥ ተጓዦች ወደፊሉ ሳይሆን ወዳልፈለጉት በጭፍን መሄዳቸው ህይወታቸውን ለአደጋ እያጋለጠ ይገኛል። (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ሚያዚያ፣ 18፣ 2007 ገጽ 3)²

ወጣት አለማየሁ ዲንቁ ተወልዶ ያደገው በአርሲ ዞን ኢተያ ከተማ ነው። በ2001 ዓ.ም ህገ-ወጥ ደላሎች ተደናግሮ በጅቡቲ ና በ የመን በኩል ከአስቸጋሪው የባህር ጉዞ ተርፎ ሳዉዲ አረቢያ መግባቱን ይናገራል። (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ግንቦት፣ 29፣ 2007 ገጽ 9)³

ወ/ሮ ታደላች መሸሻ ልጆቻቸው በደቡብ አፍሪካ እንደሚገኙ ይናገራሉ ከ5 አመት በፊት የመጀመሪያ ልጃቸው በከፍተኛ ስቃይ ደቡብ አፍሪካ መድረሱን ያስታውሳሉ። ችግሩን እያወቁትም ሌሎችም ልጆቻቸውን በተመሳሳይ መንገድ ወደ እዚያው ማቅናታቸውን ይገልጻሉ። ለልጆቻቸው ከአጠገባቸው መራቅ ዋነኛው ተጠያቂ ህገ-ወጥ ደላሎች መሆናቸውን የሚጠቅሱት ወ/ሮዋ ውጭ ብዙ ስራ አለ ብዙ ገንዘብ ይገኛል በማለት ወጣቶችን በማታለል ያላቸውን ገንዘብ በመቀበልና ከቤተሰብ በማስላክ ደላሎቹ እየተጠቀሙ እንደሚገኙ ይገልጻሉ። (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ግንቦት፣ 29፣ 2007 ገጽ 1)⁴

ዜጎች ሃገራቸውን ለቀው በገፍ በህገ-ወጥ የሰዎች አዘዋዋሪዎች አማካይነት ለምን ይሰደዳሉ ተብሎ ጥያቄ ሲቀርብ ምክንያቱ በአመዛኙ ድህነት ነው ቢባልም በመልካም አስተዳደር እጦትና በሰብአዊ መብት አለመከበር ሳቢያ የሚሰደዱትን መዘንጋት ተገቢ አይደለም። (ሪፖርተር፣ ግንቦት፣ 2፣ 2007 ገጽ 2)⁵

ባለፉት አመታት የተሻለ ስራ ፍላጋ በሚል እሳቤ ከፍተኛ ቁጥር ያላቸው ኢትዮጵያውያን ለህገ-ወጥ ደላሎች ከፍተኛ ገንዘብ በመክፈል ወደ ደቡብ አፍሪካ የሚጓዙ ሲሆን... (ሪፖርተር፣ ጥቅምት፣ 3፣ 2006 ገጽ 2)⁶

የህገ-ወጥ የሰዎች ዝውውር መንስኤ የቤተሰብ ተጽእኖ፣ የኢኮኖሚ ጥገኝነት፣ የግንዛቤ እጥረት የጓደኛ ግፊት ተጠቃሽ ናቸው። ደላሎች ኤጀንሲዎች እና አልፎ አልፎ ስነ-ምግባር በጎደላቸው የውጭ ኤምባሲ ሰራተኞች ዜጎች በህገ-ወጥ መንገድ ከሀገር ወጥተው ለስቃይ ይዳረጋሉ። (ሪፖርተር፣ ግንቦት፣ 19፣ 2007 ገጽ 4)⁷

የአብዛኛው ወጣት ችግር ኢኮኖሚያዊ ተጠቃሚነት ላይ ነው። ይህንን ለመቅረፍ ህገወጥ ስደትን ይመርጣሉ። (ሪፖርተር፣ ግንቦት፣ 19፣ 2007 ገጽ 4)⁸

እነዚህ ወገኖች የሞቱን እንጀራ ፍለጋ ሲኳትኑ ነው። ዞር ዞር ብለው ለተመለከተ ግን በሃገር ውስጥም እንጀራ አይጠፋም። (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ሚያዚያ፣ 18፣ 2007 ገጽ 13)⁹

“የጉዞ መነሻ ምክንያት ደካማ እና ታችንን ለመጦር ነበር፡፡” (ሪፖርተር፣ ሚያዚያ 14 ፣ 2007 ገጽ 7)¹⁰

ኢትዮጵያ ከማንም እና ከምንም በላይ ዜጎቿን የምትፈልግ ሀገር ናት ያሉት ዶ/ር ቴዎድሮስ በዜጎቿ ላይ የሚደርሰውን ጥቃት እንደሚያወግዙ ተናግረዋል፡፡ ዜጎች ሀገር አላቸው ወደ ሃገራቸው መግባት ይችላሉ፡፡ ነገር ግን ህገ-ወጥ ስለሆኑ ብቻ አስቃቂ ጥቃት ሊፈጸምባቸው አይገባም ብለዋል፡፡ (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ህዳር 7 ፣ 2006 ገጽ 1)¹¹

አቶ ታደሰ ኑቶ የተባሉ የሃዋሳ ከተማ ነዋሪ በበኩላቸው ኢትዮጵያ ላይ የደረሰው ድርጊት ክፉኛ ማዘናቸውን ገልጸው ህዝቡ ሽብርተኝነትን በጋራ ከማውገዝ በተጓዳኝ ለችግሩ ዋና ምክንያት የሆነውን ህገ-ወጥ ስደትን መቆጣጠር ዘለቁታዊ መፍትሄ መሆን አለበት፡፡ (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ሚያዚያ 16 ፣ 2007 ገጽ 2)¹²

የሳውዲ አረቢያ መንግስት በህገ-ወጥ መንገድ ገቡ የተባሉ ዜጎች ላይ አስቃቂ የሆነ ተግባር መፈፀሙ ኢትዮጵያን ከልብ አሳዝኗል፡፡ (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ህዳር 7 2006 ገጽ 1)¹³

የከተማዋ ነዋሪዎች ለጋዜጣው ሪፖርተር እንደገለጹት መንግስት በቀጣይ ሽብርተኝነት ለመዋጋት የሚያደርገው ጥረት ይደግፋሉ፡፡ አያይዘውም በህገ ወጥ መንገድ ከሀገር ውስጥ አደጋ ላይ ከመውደቅ በሀገራቸው ስርተው መለወጥ እንደአለባቸው አስታውቋል፡፡ (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ሚያዚያ 16 2007 ገጽ 5)¹⁴

ህጋዊ ስራና አሰሪ ኤጀንሲዎችም በህጋዊነት ሽፋን በህገ-ወጥ የሰዎች ዝውውር ላይ እየተሰማሩ ለችግሩ መባባስ ከፍተኛ አስተዋጽኦ እያደረጉ መሆኑን አስገንዝቦ ተገቢው ማስተካከያ እስኪደረግ ድረስ የስራ ፈቃዳቸው መግለጫው ከወጣበት ቀን ጀምሮ መታገዱን ሚኒስቴሩ አስታውቋል፡፡ (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ጥቅምት 16 2006 ገጽ 2)¹⁵

ሰዎችን በህገ ወጥ መንገድ የሚያዘዋውሩ ሰዎች ለመቆጣጠር የሚያስችለው አዋጅ በራሱ ቁጥጥር የሚያጠናክር ነው፡፡ በወንጀሉ ክብደት ልክ ጠበቅ ያለ እርምጃ የሚያስወስድ ነው፡፡ በአግባቡ እርምጃ ያልወሰዱትንም የሚያስጠይቅ ጠንካራ ህግ ነው፡፡ (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ሰኔ 18 2007 ገጽ 1)¹⁶

ዜጎች በህገ-ወጥ አዘዋወሪዎችና ደላሎች ተታለው በተለያየ ሰቆቃ ውስጥ በማለፍ ወደ ሊባኖስ እየገቡ መሆኑን ሚስጥሩ አስታውቋል፡፡ ይሁን እንጂ ቆንስለ ጽ/ቤቱ በዜጎች ላይ የሚደርሱትን ችግሮች ለማቃለል መጠነ ሰፊ ስራዎችን እየሰራ መሆኑን ጠቅሶ በቅርቡ የመኪናና ሌሎች አደጋዎች የደረሰባቸው ዜጎችን በስፍራው በመገኘት ተገቢው የህክምና እርዳታ እንዲያገኙ አስፈላጊው ድጋፍ እየተደረገ ነው፡፡ (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ጥቅምት 21 2006 ገጽ 2)¹⁷

ብሪታንያ ሰዎችን በህገ ወጥ መንገድ በሚያዘዋውሩና በሚበዙብዙ ወገኖች ላይ ከባድ ቅጣት ሊያስከትል የሚችል ህገ ለማውጣት ማቀደን የቢ.ቢ.ሲ ዘገባ አመለከተ፡፡ እንደሚወጣ የሚጠበቀው ህግ አንድ የተፈረደበት ህገ-ወጥ አዘዋወሪ የእስራት ጊዜውን ፈፀሞ ቢወጣ እንኳን ዕገዳ እንደሚጣልበት የሚያመልክት እንደሚሆን አረጋግጠዋል፡፡ (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ጥቅምት 9 2006 ገጽ 7)¹⁸

መንግስት በሀገር ውስጥ ስርቶ መቀየር የሚቻልባቸው በርካታ የስራ ዘርፎችን ፈጥሯል፡፡ ከጥቃቅንና አነስተኛ የስራ ዘርፎች ጀምሮ በሀገሪቱ በሚከናወኑት ግዙፍ ኘርጆክቶች ወጣቶች ተሰማርተው ከራሳቸውና ሃገራቸውን የሚቀይሩበት አጋጣሚ የሰፋ ነው፡፡ የግሉ ዘርፍ የሚፈጥረው ዕድልም ቀላል አይደለም፡፡ ዜጎች ስደትን የመጀመሪያ አማራጫቸው ከማድረጋቸው በፊት በእነዚህ መስኮች ተሰማርተው የተሻለች ኢት/ያን እንዲገነቡ ብዙ መስራት ይጠበቃል፡፡ ከሁሉም በላይ ያለውን ዕድል የሚረዱትን አጋጣሚዎች መፍጠር አስፈላጊ ነው፡፡ የስደት አንዱ መንስኤ የመረጃ እጥረት ነው፡፡ ይህን ክፍተት በመሙላት ያሉትን እድሎች ማመላከት ይገባል፡፡ (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ሚያዚያ 19 2007 ገጽ 3)¹⁹

በሀገር ውስጥ ሰፋፊ የስራ ዕድሎችን በመፍጠር ወጣቶች በጥቃቅንና አነስተኛ ኢንተርኖራይዎች እንዲደራጁ በመደገፍ ስደትን ለማስቀረት ብርቱ ጥረት እየተደረገ ነው፡፡ ይህንን ጅምር ከማጠናከር ባሻገር የግሉ ዘርፍም ሰፊ የስራ ዕድል እንዲፈጠር ተቀጣሪዎች የተሻለ ገቢ እንዲያኙ ማድረግም ያስፈልጋል፡፡ ከዚህ ጉን ለጉን የህገ-ወጥ የሰዎች ዝውውርን

አስከፊነትና በሀገር ሰርቶ መለወጥ መቻልን በስፋት ማስገንዘብ ሁሉም ኃላፊነቱን እንዲወጣ ማድረግ ተገቢ ነው። (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ህዳር 9 2006 ገጽ 3)²⁰

በአጠቃላይ ህገ ወጥ ስደትን ለማስቆም ሁሉም ወገን በትኩረት መንቀሳቀስ አለበት። የአደጋውን አስከፊነት በመገንዘብ መረባረብ ካልተቻለ ተጨማሪ ጉዳት ማስከተሉ ስለማይቀር ሁሉም የድርሻውን ሊወጣ ይገባል። (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ታህሳስ 16 2007 ገጽ 2)²¹

አሁን ላይ አሳሳቢ እየሆነ የመጣው ነገር በህገ-ወጥ አዘዋዋሪዎች አማካይነት ወደ ባህር ማዶ መካከለኛው ምስራቅ ለመሄድ ዜጎች የሚያደርጉት እንቅስቃሴ ነው። ይህም ህገ-ወጥ አዘዋዋሪዎች ከፍተኛ ጥሪት የሚሰበስቡበትና ህይወታቸውን ወደ ተሻለ ደረጃ የሚያሸጋግሩበት ሲሆን በተቃራኒው ህገ-ወጥ ስደተኞች ደግሞ ገንዘባቸውን ከፍለው ለእንግልት ለመከራ... (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ሚያዚያ 19 /2007 ገጽ 3)²²

በህገ-ወጥ አዘዋዋሪዎች አማካይነት በኮንቴነር ታጉረው ሲጓጓዙ ከተገኙት 50 ስደተኞች መካከል ከፊሎቹ በአየር እጦት ምክንያት ተዳክመው ተገኝተዋል። ስደተኞቹ በኬላ ጠባቂዎች ፍተሻ የተገኙት የሁለት ቀናት ጉዞ ካደረጉ በኋላ እንደሆነ ተገልጿል። (አዲስ ዘመን፣ ሚያዚያ 23 /2007 ገጽ 7)²³

ወጣት የሃንስ አለሙ ይባላል በሳውዲ አረቢያ ለ2 አመት ከአራት ወራት ቆይቷል። ወደ ሳውዲ የገባው በህገወጥ መንገድ ባህር አቆራርጦ ነበር። ወደ ሳውዲ ሊሄድ የቻለው የብረታብረት ባለሙያ በጣም ይፈለጋል የሚለውን ጉም ይዘገናል ወሬ በመስማት እሱም የብረታ ብረት ሙያ ባለቤት በመሆኑ ሰርቶ ለመለወጥ ነበር። ይህንም ምኞቱን ለማሳካት ህጋዊ ፈቃድ ስለሌለው ስራውን ይሰራ የነበረው በድብቅ እንደነበረ ይናገራል። ለሰራበት ስራ ክፍያ ሲጠይቅ የገባህበትን ወረቀት አምጣ እየተባለ ማቅረብ ባለመቻሉ ለበርካታ ወራት ያለደመወዝ ተሰቃይቷል። (አዲስ ዘመን፣ መጋቢት 3 2006 ገጽ 13)²⁴

የሰራተኛና ማህበራዊ ጉዳይ ሚኒስቴር ዘርፍ ከሌሎች ሃገሮች ልምዶች በመነሳት ስንመለከተው የአመራር የአደረጃጀትና የብቃት ችግር ውስጥ እንዳለ ለመረዳት ያለፉትን 18 ወራት ስራ መመልከት ብቻ በቂ ይመስለኛል። መንግስት በተለይም የመልካም አስተዳደር ችግር ያለባቸው ሴክተሮችን በማጥራት ህዝቡም ሆነ ባለሀብቱ ህጋዊና ህጋዊ አሰራርን ብቻ ተከትለው ተጠቃሚ ይሆኑ ዘንድ ኃላፊነቱን ብቃትና አቅም ላላቸው ሰዎች መስጠት ያስፈልጋል። (ሪፖርተር፣ መጋቢት 6 2007 ገጽ 19)²⁵

ህገ ወጥ ደላሎችን በስፋትና በህገ ወጥነት የሚነግዱ ሰዎችን ጉዳት ከመፈፀማቸው በፊት መቆጣጠር፣ ህገ-ወጥ ዝውውር ሪፖርት የሚደረጉበትን መጠን መጨመር፣ የህግ አስፈጻሚ አካላትን አቅም መገንባት፣ የማስረጃ አሰባሰብና አተናተንን ማጠናከር ለህግጋቱ መፈፀም ወሳኝ በመሆናቸው አጽእኖት ሊሰጣቸው ይገባል። (ሪፖርተር፣ ግንቦት 2 2007 ገጽ 38)²⁶

እነዚህን ወንጀሎች ከስር ከመሰረታቸው ለመረዳትና በወንጀል ድርጊት አፈፃፀሙ የሚሳተፉ ሰዎችን ማንነት የወንጀሉን ማስረጃ የአፈፃፀም ስልት የሚፈፀምበትን ሁኔታና ጥቅም ላይ የዋሉ የጉዞ አቅጣጫዎች በአግባቡ ለማወቅና በመረጃ ላይ የተመሰረተ የምርመራ ሂደትን ለማከናወን ልዩ የምርመራ ዘዴዎች መጠቀም እንደሚያስፈልግ ማብራሪያው ያስረዳል። (ሪፖርተር፣ ሰኔ 28 2007 ገጽ1)²⁷

መንግስታቸው በህገ-ወጥ የሰዎች ዝውውር ተግባር ላይ በተሰማሩ ሰዎች አሰቃቂ ጥቃት የተፈፀመባቸውን ሴቶችና ልጃገረዶች በመደገፍ እንዲህ አይነቱ ጥቃት ለመከላከል ከኢ/ያ መንግስተ ጋር መስራቱን ይገፋበታል ብለዋል። (ሪፖርተር፣ ህዳር 22 2006 ገጽ 39)²⁸

በሊቢያ አይ ኤስ አሸባሪ ቡድን አሰቃቂ ግድያ የተፈፀመባቸውን ኢትዮጵያውን ተከትሎ በከፍተኛ አደጋ ውስጥ መሆናቸውንና ስለሚሰማውና መውጫ አጥተው በጭንቀት ላይ እንደሚገኙ ስለሚናገረው ኢትዮጵያውን ስደተኞች

ጉዳይ ከግብፅ መንግስት ባለስልጣናት ጋር የውጭ ጉዳይ ሚኒስትሩ ዶ/ር ቴዎድሮስ አድሃኖም ተወያይተው መመለሳቸው ተገለፀ፡፡ (ሪፖርተር፣ ሚያዚያ 28 2007 ገጽ 5)²⁹

እንዲሁም መንግስት የጣለውን ዕገዳ ተከትሎ ህገ ወጥ ስደቱ እየተባበሰና በየጊዜው በዜጎች ላይ እየደረሰ የሚታየው ስቆቃ ተባብሶ መቀጠሉን መረጃዎች ይጠቁማሉ፡፡ ጉዳዩ በዋናነት የሚመለተው ስራተኛና ማህበራዊ ጉዳይ ሚኒስቴር እግዱ ከተጣለ 1 አመት ቆይታ በኋላ በ2001 ዓ/ም ወጥቶ ስራ ላይ የነበረውን የስራና ስራተኛ ማገናኘት አገልግሎት አዋጅ ቁጥር 632/2001ን የሚተካ ረቂቅ አዋጅ በጥቅምት ወር 2007 ዓ/ም ለባለድርሻ አካላት አቅርቦ ውይይት የተካሄደበት ቢሆንም እስካሁን አልፀደቀም፡፡ (ሪፖርተር፣ ሰኔ 24 2007 ገጽ 7)³⁰

በሳኡዲ አረቢያ ኢ/ያን ላይ የሚፈፀመው ጥቃት ምክንያት ከሃገር ቤት እስከ ባህር ማዶ ቁጣ ቀስቅሷል፡፡ በዜጎች ላይ እየደረሰ ያለው ግድያ ድብደባና በአስቃቂ ሁኔታ በእስር ቤት መታገር በመላው አለም ያሉ ኢ/ያንን ከዳር እስከ ዳር አነቃንቋል፡፡ (ሪፖርተር፣ ረቡዕ ህዳር 4 2006 ገጽ 1)³¹

በሳኡዲ አረቢያ በሚኖሩ ኢት/ያን ላይ እየደረሰ ያለው የግድያ፣ የድብደባና የማንገላታት ድርጊት ያሳያቸው የአዲስ አበባ ከተማ ነዋሪዎች ህዳር 6 ቀን 2006 ዓ/ም ሰላማዊ ሰልፍ በማድረግ ወደ ሳኡዲ አረቢያ ኤምባሲ በማምራት ላይ እያሉ ከፌደራል ፖሊስ ጋር ተጋጩ፡፡ (ሪፖርተር፣ ህዳር 8/2006 ገጽ1)³²

ይህ ውስጥን ማጥራት የተሳነው በህገ-ወጥ የሰዎች ዝውውር ስራ ላይ የተሰማራ ኤጀንሲ ነው እንግዲህ የህግ አርቃቂነት ወንበር ይሰጠን እያለ ሲጠይቅ ሃፍረት የማይሰማው፡፡ የለም ለማን ነው እንጂ ጥያቄ ያቀረበው እኔማ አደብ ገዝቼ ተቀምጫለው የሚለን ከሆነ እሺ ለማንኛውም አዋጅ የሚረቀቀው ኪራይ ሰብሳቢዎቻችን ደቦ በመጥራት እንዳልሆነ ልብ ሊል ይገባል፡፡ (ሪፖርተር፣ የካቲት 26/2006 ገጽ 18)³³

Appendix-B

Interview guide

Interview questions for media professionals

Background

- **What is your perception towards human trafficking?**
- **What is your experience in differentiating Human-trafficking, Smuggling and Migration in your stories?**

Coverage

- **What was the top social problem issue during 2013/15 G.C.?**
- **How did you give emphasis for issues related to human trafficking stories comparing to others? How did you treat Human-trafficking issues while reporting?**
- **How did you examine the coverage of Human-trafficking given by your organization? What's your organization experience relating to the issue?**

- **Why most of the stories were reported when over hundred thousand Ethiopians returned from Saudi Arabia and ISIS slaughter Ethiopians in Libya?**
- **Did you give enough coverage for internal trafficking? If not, why?**

Causes

- **What were the causes of human trafficking in your stories?**
- What was the emphasized cause of your human trafficking in your stories?

Source

- **What were the dominant sources in reporting human trafficking stories? Why?**
- Did you use victims and traffickers as a source? If not, why?

Frames

- How did you frame your human trafficking stories?
How did you made a decision in selecting part of information to include or exclude?
- **How did you decide what part of information to include and exclude?**
- **Have you ever selected and highlighted some aspects of the stories whereas ignoring others while reporting human trafficking stories?**
- **Did your organization put influence over you to emphasize some part of your story by de-emphasizing other parts and leaving out some aspects completely?**
- **Did you have experience in shaping human trafficking stories deliberately?**
- **What was the dominant frame your media applied in reporting human trafficking stories?**
- Do your social norms and values, organizational and interest groups pressures, journalistic routines, and ideological or political orientations have affected the way you frame the human trafficking stories?

Interview guide FOR IOM media experts

- How do you evaluate human trafficking coverage given by those newspapers?
- How do you evaluate the role of media in tackling human trafficking?
- What was the main problem in reporting human trafficking stories?

NB. The emphasized interview questions are used for both journalist and editors.

Appendix –C

No.	Name of Informants	Position	Newspaper	date of interview
Informant 1	Daniel W/kidan	Deputy Editor in Chief	Addis Zemen	February 24, 2017
Informant 2	Kifeleyehonnes Anbereber	Senior Reporters	Addis Zemen	February 24, 2017
Informant 3	Aster Elias	Senior Reporters	Addis Zemen	February 24, 2017
Informant 4	Melaku Demese	Managing Editor	Amharic Reporter	February 27, 2017
Informant 5	Tamiru Tsege	Senior Reporters	Amharic Reporter	February 27, 2017
Informant 6	Mihiret Aschalew	Senior Reporters	Amharic Reporter	February 30, 2017

Declaration

I, the undersigned, declare that this thesis is my original work and all the sources of materials used for the thesis have been accordingly acknowledge.

Addishiwot Tesfaye _____

School of Journalism and communication

June, 2017