

ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES
CENTER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS

**The Right to Food and School Feeding Programmes in Addis Ababa:
Experiences from Tsehai Chora and Dagmawi Minelik Kindergarten
& Primary Schools**

By: Helen Getachew

Advisor: Dr. Girmachew Alemu (Assistant professor)

June 2014
Addis Ababa

**The Right to Food and School Feeding Programmes in Addis Ababa:
Experiences from Tsehai Chora and Dagmawi Minelik Kindergarten and
Primary Schools**

By: Helen Getachew

**A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES OF
ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS IN
HUMAN RIGHTS**

June 2014

ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES
CENTER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS

**The Right to Food and School Feeding Programmes in Addis Ababa:
Experiences from Tsehai Chora and Dagmawi Minelik Kindergarten
& Primary Schools**

By: Helen Getachew

Approved by:

Advisor

Signature

External Examiner

Signature

Internal Examiner

Signature

Table of contents

Contents	page
Acknowledgement.....	i
Abbreviations.....	ii
Abstract.....	iV
Chapter One	
I. Introduction	1
1.1. Statement of the Problem.....	3
1.2. Research Questions.....	6
1.3. Objective of the Study.....	6
1.4. Significance of the Study.....	6
1.5. Delimitation of the Study.....	7
1.6 Methodology and Methods of Data Collection.....	7
1.7. Ethical Considerations.....	8
1.8 Limitations of the Study.....	8
1.9. Organization of the Study.....	8
Chapter Two	
2. Conceptual Issues and Perspectives on School Feeding Programs and the Right to Food	
2.1 Perspectives on School Feeding Programs.....	10
2.2. The Right to Food and its Components	12
2.3. Interrelations between the Right to Food and other Human Rights	14
2.4. The Link between School Feeding Programs and the Promotion and	

Realization of the right to food	15
2.5. The Broad Context of the Right to Food and School Feeding Programs:	
Discourses of Economic Development and MDGs.....	19

Chapter Three

3. Exploring International and Regional Normative Frameworks for the Right to Food

3.1. The Right to Food under International Human Rights Instruments	23
3.1.1. Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR).....	23
3.1.2. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR).....	23
3.1.3. The Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)	24
3.1.4. The Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC)	25
3.2. The Right to Food under Regional Instruments	26
3.2.3. African Regional Human Rights Systems	26
3.3. The United Nations’ Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) Voluntary Guidelines	27
3.4. The Scope of Duty of States and others in Relation to Realization of the Right to Food.....	28
3.5. Nature of Obligations	28
3.5.1. Immediate Obligations	29
3.5.2. Quartet Layers of State Duties	29

Chapter Four

4. The Right to Food under FDRE Constitution and an Overview of Experiences in School Feeding Programs in Ethiopia

4.1. The Right to Food under the FDRE Constitution.....	32
4.2. Overview of School Feeding Programs and the Right to Food in Ethiopia	33

Chapter Five

V. Data Presentation and Discussions

5.1. Introduction.....	39
5.2 Description of School Feeding Programs at TsehayChora and DagmawiMenilik	
KG and Primary Schools	40
5.2.1.Physical Accessibility of the School Feeding Programs for Children.....	42
5.2.2. Adequacy.....	43
5.3.3. Timeliness.....	44
5.2.4. Existence of Complaint and Follow up Mechanisms.....	44
5.2.5. The Eligibility Criterion to Select Children Beneficiaries.....	45
5.2.5. Acceptability.....	45
5.2.5. Contribution of the Programs in Alleviating the Problems.....	46

Chapter Six

6.The Challenges of School Feeding Program and the Prospects of the Promotion of theRight to Food in Addis Ababa

6.1.The Challenges of School Feeding Program.....	47
6.1.1. Lack of Awareness about the Right to Food.....	47
6.1.2 Lack of Adequate Legislations and Clear Policies.....	48
6.1.3. Parents, Community, and Students Participation in School Feeding Programs.....	48
6.1.4. Lack of Government Involvement.....	49
6.1.5. Funding Problems	50
6.1.6. Charity or Rights?.....	51
6.2. Lessons to be Learnt from the Experience of Selected Countries in Rights Based Approach to School Feeding.....	51

6.2.1. Rights Based Approach to School Feeding Program and the Prospect
for the Promotion of the Right to Food in Ethiopia..... 52

6.2.2. Lessons to be Learnt from the Experience of School Feeding Programs in
Different part of the World..... 52

Chapter Seven

7. Conclusion and Some Suggestions for the Future

7.1. Conclusion..... 59

7.2. Some Suggestions for the Future.....62

References

Interview guidelines

Focused group discussion guidelines

List of persons interviewed and participate in focus group discussion

Acknowledgment

I would like to forward my deepest appreciation and gratitude to my advisor Dr. Girmachew Alemu (PhD) for his constructive advice in the course of writing this thesis. The comments and the suggestion he provided has been very useful in shaping the research and his support is an inspiration for the completion of this study.

My deepest and heartfelt admiration also goes to all interviewed students, parents, teachers and service providers at Teshay Chora and Minilik II Primary and Kindergartens Schools for their willingness and openness in giving valuable information. My especial thanks goes to Ato Mohamed Demessie of the Ministry of Education and Ato Fetehalew Belay of Tsehay Chora School who helped me greatly in providing documents and make arrangements for interview and conduct the focus group discussion.

Words fail to express my appreciation to my husband Solomon Mebrie (Dr.) for his all round support. Thank you sole I feel a sense of fulfilment and so happy because I have you. I also wish to express my deepest gratitude to my parents for your encouragement and all round support. And my kids thank you for your lovely detractions whenever I focused too much on the writing. Last but not least, I would like to thank and all my friends for your encouragement and support.

Abbreviations

AACBoE	Addis Ababa City Bureau of Education
ACHPR	African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women
CESCR	Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CFDRE	Constitution Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
CRC	Convention on the Rights of Child
ESDP IV	Education Sector Development Program IV
GCNF	Global Child Nutrition Foundation
HGSF	Home-Grown School Feeding Programs
ICPPR	International Covenant in Civil and Political Rights
KG	Kindergarten
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MDM	Mid- Day Meal
MFFC	Mercy Fellowship Feeding Center
NEPAD	New Partnerships for Africa's Development
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organizations
NNP	National Nutrition program
NSPP	National social protection policy
OHCHR	Office of High Commissioner for Human Rights Human Rights Commission

RBA	Rights-Based Approach
SFP	School Feeding Programs
SNHS	National School Health and Nutrition Strategy
SNNPR	Southern Nation Nationalities Peoples Region
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights,
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNFAO	United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
WFP	World Food Program
WL	World Learning

Abstract

This thesis examines school feeding program in Addis Ababa and it explores whether it contributes to the promotion and realization of the right to food in Ethiopia. In doing so, the study explores the experiences of some selected schools' feeding programs in Addis Ababa. The writer interviewed and conducted discussion with number of informants drawn from students, parents, teachers, school representatives or administrators, representatives of governmental and nongovernmental organizations.

The study shows that the programs helped to some extent in alleviating the lack of food they faced. The programs helped the student beneficiaries and allowed them to have to get food and enabled them to go to school. This shows the potential of the school feeding programmes to prevent the consequences of lack of food among the school children studied. The study also shows that school feeding programmes in Addis Ababa being carried out at the schools visited for the purpose of this study are initiated on humanitarian ground, although there are some principles that are incorporated in the programs which are in line with the right based approach. Consequently, the affected students are passive recipients of food being served at the respective schools based on voluntary contribution of individual members of the community with some support from non-government organizations.

The writer suggests that first of all, the potential of school feeding as the mechanism for promotion of the right to food and to be free from hunger among children and the affected population as a whole requires further research. Secondly there is a huge gap in terms of awareness and information about the on-going programs, and there is a need to create awareness in these programs. The writer also suggests laws and policy in regard to the right to food and school feeding programmes in Ethiopia are not adequate and this need to be revisited.

In conclusion school feedings program based on the rights-based approach have the potential to serve as springboard for the promotion and then the realization of the right to food. The right based approach would help incorporate and represent better the students affected and may help them influence what and how they are going to get what they should get. Moreover such an approach contributes to break the silence surrounding the suffering due to lack of food, children and the various categories of people in Addis Ababa and elsewhere around the country.

Chapter One

1. Introduction

Malnutrition, hunger and starvation remained among the major problems that human beings in different parts of the world have continued to face. Millions of people around the world suffer from these problems every year (FAO, 2008:4). More specifically, a significant number of the population of the developing countries in particular are believed to be affected by the problem of lack of food or lack of adequate food.

In Ethiopia, millions of people have been affected by lack of food, often characterized by some as food insecurity. Rauan and Haug (2001:16) note that the problem in Ethiopia is not only about the lack of food but is also a situation of exceptional food insecurity emergencies.

The issue of lack of food among the urban population in Ethiopia has been receiving little attention. This could be for several reasons. Some argue that this is because lack of food in urban areas is not linked to seasonal food shortage that is believed to occur frequently among the rural population, and partly based on the perception that urban communities are in better position than the rural population (Ejigayehu and Abdi-khali, 2012:8). It is understandable that the nature of lack of food or food insecurity in urban areas is different from those in rural areas, which is most of the time associated with the issue of seasonality, land degradation and land policy (Ibid). At times inflation is mentioned as one of the key factors for problems experienced in urban areas of Ethiopia. Ejigayehu and Abdi-khali for instance cite the “rapid increases in food prices during 2007 and early 2008 showed the vulnerability of the urban poor to price rises” (Ibid). There is also an argument that studies in relation to urban food security problems should focus on the question of access to food (Ibid).

In Addis Ababa, a home of more than 3.5 million populations with different levels of economic well-being, ranging from the very rich to the destitute, the issue of access to or availability of food has become critical (Degefa, 2008:1). This indicates that while the problem of access to food has become a new area of concern, it appears that there is no common understanding about the problem that has been affecting the population in urban areas.

In general, there are various factors contributing to the lack of food or food insecurity problems faced by different categories of the population in different situation in different countries. For instance, in the case of farming communities the situation may arise due to

crop failure, shortage of arable land, and in the case of pastoralist communities the problem could arise due to significant loss of herds as a result of prolonged dry seasons, or a gradual deterioration of the environment as a major issues behind the prevalence of food shortage. It is also important to note that even within a supposedly food self-sufficient communities, there are always those members of same community who suffer from lack of food.

In other words there is observable difference in the size of fertile land, the type of farming tools employed, lack of access to select seed and fertilizers and so on. It is also important to note that the younger generation of the rural population have no access to land in as long as the practices of land redistribution have long been stopped. Therefore the younger rural population are either at the mercy of their older parents, take part in off-farm activities, migrate to the towns and the cities, or simply go starved.

The lack of food among the population in towns and cities could arise from the lack of income among considerable number of the inhabitants, due to high level of unemployment, or due to low income. Dramatic decline in purchasing power of national currencies, artificial prices, absence of social-security, all of these in one way or another contribute to the problem (Ejigayehu and Abdi-khali, 2012).

Following from the above general remark, it is important to note that the lack of food affects different section of society in many different ways. In a country characterized by various social, economic and political problems and in the context of growing level of income inequality and in the absence of social and legal safeguards, the vulnerable sections of the society could be subjected to enormous suffering.

It is also important to mention that beyond humanitarian assistance during times of emergency, various policies have been initiated to tackle the problem of food insecurity, lack of food or shortage. This varies from programs of poverty alleviation, humanitarian food aid, safety net programs, food rationing and feeding programs which include school feeding programs. School feeding program and the right to food are the focus of this study.

School feeding programs have been conducted in most part of the world, in both developed and developing countries. Studies on this topic indicate that at least 330 million people around the world receive school meals, and similar programs have been introduced in a few places in Ethiopia including in Addis Ababa (Darke et al, 2012:3). School feeding programs

are conducted in different countries for different reasons. For instance in Brazil the program started with the aim of addressing hunger and ensuring the human right to adequate food for all (Ibid). In India as well, school feeding program was used as one way of implementing the right to food though such programs could have multipurpose (Secretariat of the Right to Food Campaign, 2008:6).

In Ethiopia school feeding programs started in 1994 in few selected schools in Oromiya, Tigray, Amhara, and Afar regions, in collaboration with the United Nation World Food Program/WFP (2007:65). As this study shows, in Addis Ababa, school feeding programs have been started in a few primary schools through the initiative of non-government organizations and individuals more recently.

In general while there are varying explanations as to the rationales and approaches for the provisions of school feeding programs in Ethiopia, whether such programs help in the promotion of the right to food is the central theme of the discussion in this paper. The right to food is recognized in several international and regional human rights instruments and this aims to explore the contribution of school feeding program in the alleviation of the problem of lack of food faced by children at schools selected for the purpose of this study. The writer focuses on selected school feeding programs in Addis Ababa to examine whether they are in line with the objectives of the protection of right to food of the affected school children and for all in need.

1.1. Statement of the Problem

Ethiopia has often been regarded as one of the most food-insecure countries in the world. At least 58 percent of the death of children in the country are believed to be directly or indirectly caused by malnutrition as the major reasons behind the high rates of child mortality (Ziegler¹, 2005). The problem with regards to food is not limited to rural population affected due to the recurrence of drought. Studies conducted on food security in urban areas in Ethiopia (Degefa, 2008:8) clearly indicate that the problem of lack of food (often referred to as food insecurity) is affecting a significant number of urban populations.

¹ UN Commission on Human Rights, Report of the Special Rapporteur on the right to food, 24 January 2005, E/CN.4/2005/47, available at: <http://www.refworld.org/docid/42d66e590.html> [accessed 13 Dec 2013]

Addis Ababa is a case in point where lack of food is affecting a significant number of the people including children (Ibid). In this connection, for instance Plan International in its Report (2011) indicated that food crisis in Addis Ababa left many Children at risk of starvation. The report indicated that many children were ‘fainting’ or ‘falling’ in classrooms due to lack of food. The report further cites that many families were struggling to feed their families even once in a day.

However, while some of the studies conducted on the topic indicate the prevalence of the problem in Addis Ababa, there is a lack of understanding of the scope of the problem in the City. More importantly, children are one of the most vulnerable members of a society, and it is not clear if the condition of some of the affected children in Addis Ababa has been studied adequately.

Secondly, the right to food is one of the widely recognized human rights in the various international conventions. To mention some of them, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women and several others provide for the right to food. Ethiopia is party to the international conventions mentioned², and reference to the right to food is also made in the 1995 Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, FDRE Constitution.

As contained in many of the agreements mentioned, states are responsible to take measures that enable the full realization of the rights protected in those covenants. There is a growing understanding that the right to food is a fundamental human rights and failure to realize this right may lead to several unwanted consequences. OHCHR has the following to say in this regard;

Hunger often makes children more vulnerable to child labour, including the worst forms of child labour, such as child slavery, child prostitution or recruitment as child soldiers. Hunger also forces children to drop out of school as they have to work to secure food or because hunger is depriving them of their physical and mental strength to attend school (OHCHR Fact sheet No. 34, 2006:17).

² Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, year of ratification 11 Jun 1993, Convention on the Rights of the Child, 14 May 1991, Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women, 8 July 1980.

Therefore it is possible to say that despite its recognition in many international instruments, millions of people including children in the world have continued to be affected by malnutrition and hunger and the same is true in Ethiopia in general and in Addis Ababa in particular.

Many countries in the world have been adopting different policies and strategies to realize the right to food. Among several mechanisms, school feeding programs has emerged as one of the main ones, especially as it aims to cater for the needs of children as one of the most vulnerable members of the society. According to FAO's report school feeding programs can have several purposes. It states that it is more than food giving; it is "an investment in the world's poorest children. They are an investment in our common future and global stability. School feeding can bring children into school and out of hunger" (WFP, 2010:3).

Moreover, as indicated in the same material mentioned above, school feeding program could contribute towards the realization of the Millennium Development Goals- 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5. These include reduction of hunger and poverty, education and gender equality, to child mortality and maternal health respectively (Ibid: 2). As Kent³ stated school feeding programs can contribute to the realization of a wide variety of human rights and he asserted that though the contribution of the program in realization of the right to adequate food is obvious, the programs are also relevant in realization of the right to education and health (Kent, 2007:3).

As mentioned earlier, school feeding program in Ethiopia started in 1994 as a component of a plan for Accelerated Sustainable Development to End Poverty in collaboration of WFP in Afar, Amhara, Oromiya and Tigray. While school feeding programs are introduced in few places in Addis Ababa, the reasons and justifications for such programs are not clearly understood. In other words, it is the objective of this paper to explore the experiences and the activities at schools in Addis Ababa identified for the purpose of this study, and ultimately to examine the potential of school feeding programmes in realization of the right to food, based on data and information from two kindergarten and primary schools in Addis Ababa that have introduced school feeding programs.

In doing so, the study advances the argument that while it is assumed that school feeding programs could help to increase child school participation, there is a need to understand the potential of the current feeding programs in Addis Ababa in avoiding hunger and promoting

³ Goerg Kent, , member of the Working Group on Nutrition, Ethics, and Human Rights of the United Nations System Standing Committee on Nutrition

the right to food as a whole. This has not been dealt with satisfactorily. It is this gap in our understanding, more importantly the potential of such programs in the promotion of the right to food, which is the key issue in this study, based on experiences in Addis Ababa. On the basis of this general argument, the following sections outline the research questions and the objectives of the research.

1.2. Research questions

The following section briefly presents the research questions.

- What are the possible reasons for initiating school feeding programs in selected schools in Addis Ababa?
- What are the major problems in the implementation of school feeding programs in Addis Ababa?
- Do school feeding programs serve as a means in the promotion and then the realization of the right to food in Ethiopia?
- What are the lessons to be learnt from the experiences of selected school feeding programs in this study and what are the overall implications?

1.3. Objective of the study

The objective of this study is to explore the potential of school feeding programs in Addis Ababa and whether these would contribute to the realization of the right to food for children as the most vulnerable members of the population. In doing so, in this study the writer attempted to examine some selected schools' feeding programmes in Addis Ababa and explore their background and their experiences and whether they are in line with the objectives of the protection the rights of the children affected, and for the future promotion of the right to food for all in need in Ethiopia.

1.4. Significance of the study

Conducting study on this topic contributes to better understand the problem, and it may contribute to efforts aimed to the promotion of the right to food in Ethiopia. It may help to bring the problem to the attention of policy makers and other stakeholders the need and relevance of school feeding program in safeguarding the right to food and other related rights of children and for the affected population as a whole.

1.5. Delimitation of the study

Conducting a comprehensive research on the right to food and school feeding program in Ethiopia demands a considerable time and resources. As a result, this study is limited to the examination of the school feeding programs of two kindergarten/KG and primary schools in Addis Ababa. Nevertheless, while the focus of this study is children as the beneficiary of these programs, the views and opinion of those responsible for running such programs is covered to have a broader view of the issues under consideration. Concerning human rights, the focus will be those literatures and materials on the right to food.

1.6. Methodology and Methods of Data Collection

The study is based on qualitative research methodology. Qualitative methodology refers to a method of study where a researcher “investigates questions without statistical tools, relying instead on the ability of the researcher to observe patterns” (Kalof et al, 2008: 79). Moreover, the use of qualitative method in this study involves the use of non- statistical methods of data gathering and analysis. Following from this assumption, the study will use both primary and secondary data sources. The primary data sources are interview with informants in the conduct of this study. The secondary data sources are books, journals, articles, national and international human rights instruments which are relevant to this study.

Since the methodology of the study is qualitative, to increase the validity and the reliability of the research, the writer used the following data collection methods-interviews, group discussions and analysis of document in accordance with the principle of triangulation.

The writer interviewed selected informants drawn from students, parents, teachers, school representatives or administrators, representatives of governmental and nongovernmental organizations and funding organizations and others who are directly involved in the conduct of the program. Focus group discussions were conducted with two groups to get information that is not likely to be gathered by individual interview. The targets of focus group discussions were teachers, program leaders, and students who are the beneficiary of the program. Personal observations at the feeding centres in both schools studied were made in order to see how the services were provided. This helped the researcher to gain an understanding about school feeding programs, and to listen to the views of the participants of the programs.

Regarding sampling techniques, the writer used purposive or judgmental sampling usually utilized in the context of qualitative research. As Babbie stated it has an aspect of “nonprobability sampling in which the unit to be studied are selected on the basis of the researcher’s judgment about which one will be the most useful or representative” (2010:184). Accordingly, a group of students from each of the schools were selected for discussions and interviews by giving equal chances in the selection of female and male students. Finally, selection of key informants and participants of focus group discussions were made based on the representativeness of the institutions relevant for the purpose of this study.

In addition to generating data from primary sources of information indicated above, a range of secondary sources of information, books, journal articles, reports and documents obtained from different organizations are examined.

1.7. Ethical considerations

Interview and focus group discussions were conducted in a manner consistent with ethical principles that need to be considered in conducting research. More specifically, the fact that the study is on school feeding programs involving children required respect for the privacy of the families or parents of the children in the course of the study. Prior consent of the participants was requested before implementing the data collection instruments.

1.8. Limitations of the study

Due to inadequate information on how school feeding is conducted in Addis Ababa, the study has faced some limitation in its depth and coverage to fully address its objectives. Regardless, however, the result of the study may provide some insight into how school feeding programs have been conducted in Addis Ababa, and whether such programs potentially contribute to the promotion of the rights to food in Ethiopia.

1.9. Organization of the study

This study is organized into seven chapters. Chapter one deals with the background, problem statement, research question, objectives, methodology, significance and delimitation of the study. The second chapter offers an overview of relevant issues in the literature and a discussion of some conceptual issues of the right to food, school feeding program and the relationship between the two. The third chapter discusses international, regional, and national legal and policy frameworks aimed at the implementation of the right to food. The fourth

chapter deals with legal and policy framework and an overview of activities of school feeding programs in different regions in Ethiopia. The fifth and sixth chapters present and analyse the data by focusing on existing situation of the school feeding programs in those selected schools, the responses from interviews and focus group discussions as well as personal observation of the researcher are integrated, in identifying and discussing the major challenges and problems affecting school feeding programs. The last chapter makes an overall assessment of the situation on how the rights based approach and experiences of school feeding programs in different countries may help in contributing to the promotion of the right to food in Ethiopia followed by conclusion. List of references and interview questions are presented at the end of this paper.

Chapter Two

2. Perspectives on School Feeding Program and the Right to Food

2.1. Perspectives on School Feeding Program

Recent studies indicate that at least 330 million pupils around the world receive school meals (Darke et al, 2012:3), and similar programs have been introduced in a few places in Ethiopia including in Addis Ababa

School feeding programs have been implemented in both developed and developing countries across the world (Kent, 2010, 192). In United Kingdom for example it was initiated in 1906 as one of the elements of welfare reform, and in Brazil it has been conducted in the context of the 'zero hunger strategy' to address hunger and ensure the human right to adequate food for all (Darke et al, 2012:3). In India school feeding has come to form the legal right for school age children and is recognised as an important mechanism for the realizing the rights of food for children (Shankar, 2009:11). Since the beneficiary of school feeding programs are children, scholars and activists in India argued that children are the right holder and the Indian government primarily and the various categories of Indian society are the duty bearers (Ibid: 22).

In general school feeding programs are conducted in different countries for different reasons. This has given rise to the various perspectives on school feeding programs. Looking at the various literatures relating to the programs, one could identify a number of perspectives some of which are briefly described below.

First, school feeding programs has long been considered as one component of safety net programs. World Food Program (WFP) from its several decades of experience in regards to school feeding has the following to say; “

School feeding is an effective safety net. It helps to protect vulnerable children during times of crises. It safeguards nutrition, education and gender equality and provides a range of socio-economic benefits. School feeding can also contribute to a much-needed sense of normality for children living in-secure environments. (WFP, 2009:3).

Building on the perspective of safety net program, it is believed that these programs, especially in the context of developed countries aim to enhance the concentration span and

learning capacity of school children by providing meals in schools to reduce short-term hunger that may otherwise impair children's performance (Jomaa et al, 2011:84). In a similar manner Burbano maintains that school feeding can increase school participation and support learning in the classroom by relieving short-term hunger and reducing micronutrient deficiencies as "barriers to healthy and productive schooling affecting large numbers of school-age children living in poverty and food insecurity" (Burbano, 2009:1)

As Kent stated, school feeding programs are programs which can be organized at any level school, district, nation, region, and world—to facilitate the feeding of students in school that are in need. And sometimes the school feeding programs includes home-take ration to feed school-age children who are not enrolled (Kent, 2007:1).

Secondly, there are those who look at school feeding program as one aspect of public service delivery mechanism in a broader context of welfare and development policies. This perspective maintains that such programs could have wider impact when they are designed in support of other public policy measures on education, nutrition, health and sanitation (Ibid). In this respect school feeding programs in the developed world is usually considered as part of specific policy of schools, and feeding or providing meals for students is often regarded as one of the services a school as public institution provides and this is usually taken for granted. Here it is clear that it is not the needs of students or hunger or starvation or safety net considerations underlying such practices of providing food to all students across the board, and it is rather undertaken as a matter of a given school's policy.

Thirdly, the notion of food security has become a widely discussed perspective in recent times and school feeding program is considered as one of the mechanisms of putting the same into practice. According to the World Food Summit Plan of Action (OHCHR Fact sheet 34, 2006:4) "food security exist when all people, at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and health life."

Fourthly, the rights based approach as it relates with various policy initiatives gained prominence over the last few decades. Rights based approaches have been popularized in the context of the growing consensus on the need to include human rights principles in development programs including in school feeding programs. It is believed that rights based approaches keep governments accountable for their action, enhance transparency, empower the rights holders and aim to ensure their participation in the whole processes of the program

(OHCHR Homepage, 2009). Building on such an understanding, the rights-based approach to the problem of hunger and starvation, compared to other perspectives described above, stress the importance of government obligations based on international human rights instruments and domestic legislations to make sure that people are free from hunger and have sustainable access to adequate food (Ibid, 6).

Along the same line, as a United Nation Food and Agriculture Organization stated,

A rights-based approach views governments' promotion of food security as an obligation, hence not as a form of benevolence. It insists on the accountability of duty-bearers to rights-holders. Its conception of good governance places special emphasis on the active participation of all stakeholders in policy development, on transparency in government, and on ensuring through an independent legal framework that people have access to effective remedy whenever they have not received their due (OHCHR Fact sheet 34, 2006:3).

2.2. The Right to Food and its Components

As mentioned in the introduction, the right to food is recognized in several international and regional human rights instruments. The right to food very much relates to the concept of human dignity underlined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Golay et al⁴ defined the right to food as follow:

it is the right to have regular, permanent and unrestricted access, either directly or by means of financial purchase, to quantitatively and qualitatively adequate and sufficient food corresponding to the cultural traditions of the people to which the consumer belongs; and which ensures a physical and mental, individual and collective, fulfilling and dignified free of fear (Golay et al, 2011: 15).

Golay et al further identify the components or elements of the rights of food in a similar way with the General Comment No. 12 of the Committee on Economic and Cultural Rights. General Comment No. 12 defined the concept of adequate food presented in the following manner.

The right to adequate food is realized when every man, woman and child, alone or in community with others, has physical and economic access as all times to

⁴ Golay, legal adviser to Jean Ziegler, the first UN Special Rapporteur on the right to food.

adequate food or means for its procurements. The right to adequate food shall therefore not be interpreted in a narrow restrictive sense which equates it with a minimum package of calories, proteins and other specific nutrients (General Comment No 12, para.11).

Dietary requirement is also considered to be one of the elements in understanding the right to food. This implies that the diet as a whole is required to have a mix of nutrients necessary for physical mental growth and development and the sustenance of physical activity towards fulfilling the physical and physiological needs of the person at all stages of life (Eide, 1998:3).

The cultural aspect is another element in understanding the concept of the right to food (Golay et al, 2011:17). The argument here is that the recognition of everyone's right to food should not be in contradiction with particular culture of groups to which the individuals including children belong. This also relates to the assumption that the culture of the community to which the individual belongs highly influences food preferences among members of the society and this need to be taken into consideration.

The concept of accessibility or access to food as mentioned in the General Comment no. 12 is important. This generally refers to whether individuals have the means such as income to cover costs associated with the acquisition of food understood as “any acquisitions pattern or entitlement through which people procure their food and is a measure of the extent to which it is satisfactory for the enjoyment of the right to food”(Ibid).

In addition to the above elements, though the right to adequate food is generally understood as something to be realized progressively The Committee on economic, social and cultural rights noted that state parties to the Covenant have as their core obligation to take action to make sure that at the very least people have access to the minimum essential food that is needed to ensure their freedom from hunger (General Comment, No. 3, para.10).

Based on the phrase “...*access at all times to adequate food...*” in the definition given by the Committee, many scholars agree that access to safe and nutritious food constitutes the right to adequate food. In addition, the Human Rights Commission in its resolution 2000/10 explicitly confirmed this position.

In line with this, the document adopted at the High-level Plenary Meeting of the General Assembly on the Millennium Development Goals in 2010 clearly underlined

the right of everyone to have access to safe, sufficient and nutritious food, consistent with the right to adequate food and the fundamental right of everyone to be free from hunger, so as to be able to fully develop and maintain his or her physical and mental capacities (UN General Assembly Resolution 65/1, para. 70).

In general, the right to food raises the question of responsibility and accountability of the duty bearer understood in terms of obligation or the duty to protect, respect and fulfil the right to food in a similar manner with other human rights. Consequently, the notion of '*accessible to all*' implies an obligation to provide special programmes for the vulnerable i.e, requiring governments and others to ensure freedom from hunger and starvation and taking the necessary measures to ensure the protection of these rights. In this regard, state parties to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights are legally bound to respect, protect and fulfil the right to food (Kent, 2005:104). This means that governments have the duty and obligations to respect and protect the right. The situation also raises questions of accountability of violations of the right in this respect.

2.3. Interrelations between the Right to Food and other Human Rights

The Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action that was adopted during the Second World Conference on Human Rights in 1993 expressly stated that “all human rights are universal, indivisible and interdependent and interrelated. The international community must treat human rights globally in a fair and equal manner, on the same footing, and with the same emphasis” (UN Doc. A/CONF.157/23, para.5).

Interdependence and interrelation of the rights implies that the realization of one right in many cases depends in all or in part on the realization of others rights. The realization of the right to food for instance contributes to the realization of many human rights- the right to life, right to health, the right to work, right to health, freedom of association, expression and information, and right to education (Ahluwalia, 2004:15).

The interrelatedness of the right to food and the right to life is fundamental. The right to life implies more than mere existence, and it relates to life with human dignity (Ibid). Therefore, the interpretation of the right to life needs to expand to include those necessary rights for its enjoyment, the right to food in this context. The Supreme Court of India, for instance, in the

right to food case between *People's Union for Civil Liberties v. Union of India* affirmed that inherent interrelatedness of the right to food and the right to life (Winch, 2009:22). The Special Rapporteur on the right to food also noted that "...To die of hunger is equivalent to being murdered, while chronic and serious undernourishment and persistent hunger are a violation of the fundamental right to life..." (E/CN.4/2001/53:2).

The right to food relate with the right to work. As we know, the right to food implies access to food in a dignified manner and where everyone in urban and rural areas are not expected to produce their own food and therefore creating a favourable condition for gainful employment could be one of the realistic options to protect people from hunger and poverty (Ahluwalia, 2004:15). In other words, the production of large amount of food and its availability on the market are not sufficient as far as there is unemployment, and in the absence of social protection system to receive unemployment benefits the situation could resulting in the lack or access to food, which in turn lead to the violation of the Right to Food (Ibid).

Therefore for the purpose of this study, it is necessary to have broader understanding of the right to food. What have been discussed previously about the right to food in the context of the problems in Addis Ababa raises issues of governmental accountability and societal responsibility. It could potentially raises questions about the roles of different actors and institutions, and whether they adhere to the principles of human rights- human dignity, universality, non-discrimination, interdependence and indivisibility of human rights. The problem faced by children due to lack of sufficient food and their suffering raises the question of moral responsibility. Supported by empirical observations in this research, the writer argues that rights based approach to school feeding programs may potentially contribute to developing new mechanisms and strategies aimed at addressing the problems of hunger and starvation among school children, and for the realization of the rights to food in the long run.

2.4. The Link between School Feeding Programs and the Promotion and Realization of the Right to Food

As mentioned above, the right to food is recognized in many international and regional human rights instruments as one of socio-economic rights. However, for political, ideological and other reasons, there have been misconceptions in relation to the right to food, particularly due to its being in the category of economic and social right, arguably making it to be part of

a soft law in international human rights law. This is mainly based on the belief that those rights are very much dependent on countries resources and it might not be feasible to persuade states to implement such rights immediately (OHCHR Fact sheet No. 34, 2006:3). Moreover, such a misconception is believed to have affected policies and mechanisms for the promotion and realization of economic and social rights in general and the right to food in particular.

Regardless however, as part of the debates since the 1980's, in the context of debates on development, especially the emergence of the discourses of human development and human security, the rights based approach have been emphasized to be an appropriate mechanism including in the implementation of socio-economic rights (Randolph& Hertel, 2012:8). And in this context, especially since the 1990s, the right to food started to have been elaborated and articulated.

Therefore it is no coincidence that the discussion about the right to food got momentum after the end of the 1980s and at about the time when various programs of safety net and food security policies have been widely propagated. In other words, the concept of the rights based approach and the argument for putting the same a central perspectives in new development discourses gained ground at about the same time or within the same context (OHCHR Fact sheet no. 34, 2006:25). Consequently, it has been argued that human right based approach to the issue of food problem or food security requires “identifying, analysing and solving the problems that underlie hunger and poverty, and an alternative method of promoting development. Seeing the development challenge in terms of the right to food and the other human rights inseparably connected to it is not only indispensable for the survival of individuals ” (Ibid).

Though it is among the rights which are considered to be progressively realized, the realization of the right to food demands for its realization a lot to be done, ranging from activities involving the ratification of treaties, formulation of polices to creating strategies that are applicable at grass roots level. In further articulating the right to food and its implementation mechanisms, Kent stated it can be addressed through “cash transfers, employment, direct feeding programs, subsidized food, land reforms and many protective measures”(2008:192). The need for identifying mechanisms for the realization of the food

makes us to think about how to conceptualize the link between the right to food and school feeding programs.

When we come to exploring the link between the right to food and school feeding programs we also need to see the different contexts in which school feeding has been implemented by various organizations such as the World Food Program/WFP. As it could be observed from the WFP activities school feeding policies or programs are more of safety net programs put to use during the times of emergency, in post-conflict, post-disaster period or during transitions, by providing nutrition, education and value transfer (WFP, 2009:15).

In the time of crisis or emergency school feeding programs aim to “meet the immediate food needs of communities and prevent a decline in the nutrition and health status of children...It help encourage children to remain in school by providing “a food value transfer to the household on the condition attend class” (Ibid). The same material indicates that recently several governments around the world wanted to implement school feeding programs in their respective countries following what has been regarded as the 2008 worldwide food crisis (Ibid, 6). Moreover, this links with state’s obligation to mitigate and alleviate hunger including even in times of natural or other disasters, since the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights clearly stated that it is state’s minimum core obligation to ensure the satisfaction of essential levels of each of the rights (General Comment No. 3: para. 10). Further, the committee elaborated, “A State party in which any significant number of individuals is deprived of essential foodstuffs, of essential primary health care, of basic shelter and housing, or of the most basic forms of education is, prima facie, failing to discharge its obligations under the Covenant” (Ibid).

In general in examining the experience of other countries towards implementation of the right to food we see a situation in which school feeding program has emerged to become one of the mechanisms for the implementation of the right to food. If we see the Brazilian ‘Zero hunger strategy’ for instance, it involves actions to increase basic food supply, improvement income, and making available cheap food, and there are “program that transfers cash to poor families and the national school-feeding program” (Schutter, 2010: 8).

The link between the right to food and school feeding programs can also be inferred from the link between the right to food and the Millennium Development Goals/MDGS, as resolution

1/65, 2010 clearly affirmed. The resolution noted that the “the right of everyone to have access to safe, sufficient and nutritious food, consistent with the right to adequate food and the fundamental right of everyone to be free from hunger...” (UN General Assembly Resolution 65/1, para. 70)

The United Nation Human Rights Commission stated that 825 million Peoples in the world do not have enough food to meet their basic nutritional needs and in the view of the commission, this implies violation of the right to adequate food and the fundamental right to be free from hunger (the commission Resolution 2000/10). In addition, during the World Food Summit 1996 which was organized by FAO, the participant Heads of State and Government reaffirmed that, “the right of everyone to have access to safe and nutritious food, consistent with the right to adequate food and the fundamental right of everyone to be free from hunger”. (Ahluwalia, 2004: 8&9)

As we understand from this, school feeding programs used in some countries could serve as examples of implementing the strategies aimed towards the realization of the right to food and experiences in Brazil and India are instructive of the strong link between the two. As discussed earlier, school feeding program is broadly implemented in the developing as well as in the developed countries around the world. Moreover, there are efforts aimed towards making school feeding program part of legal right and moral obligation of the global society to provide food as a matter of right to children across the world (Kent, 2010:192).

In further strengthening the argument for the link between school feeding and the right to food, FAO’s Voluntary Guidance states that food programs in general and school feeding programs in particular serve as important mechanism or the means to realize the right to food is gaining (FAO, 2005:2). In this respect, FAO further argued that,

Children should have a clear sense of what they should and should not be receiving, while understanding that they are not merely recipients of charity, but are instead entitled rights-holders. Moreover, children should have a means of remedying or changing the system if they are not receiving the adequate quality and quantity of food; they should also know who is accountable for the food and feel as though they have the right to speak out when they do not receive their due (Shankar,2009:23).

2.5. The Broad context of the Right to Food and School Feeding Programs: Discourses of Economic Development and MDGs

In this section, the writer briefly discusses the wider context and some misconceptions that often arise in relation to the right to food, and on the need for school feeding programs. To begin with many people tend to assume that economic growth is the only solution to insure the right to food in the long term. While it is true that economic growth and food production reinforce each other (Narula, 2006:5), the question however is that economic growth or increase in food production alone could not be taken as a guarantee to ensure the rights to food. While the contribution of economic development or increase in food production to enhance food security is not deniable, economic development and increase in food production alone are not sufficient to fully realize the right to food, since the poor and vulnerable members of the population are often overlooked and their situation could be overshadowed by discourses of economic growth (Ibid). Narula further argued that the prevalence of hunger should not be blamed on shortage in production of food. The rapporteur further stated that

inequitable distribution of the available food at the national and household level, general government apathy and unwillingness to take measures to combat starvation, general poverty, lack of purchasing power of individuals, distorted food price policies, relief measures taken by government being far from adequate, corruption, faulty public distribution system, inappropriate lack of access to land and credit and lack of legislative measures (Ahluwalia, 2004:25).

Furthermore, the United Nation High Commissioner on Human Right (Fact sheet No 34) stated that the denial of the right to food in the world is not related to the lack of food the world produces enough food to feed its entire population (Ibid:3). In other words, the reason for the denial of the right to food is not lack of food in the world. This argument is also in line with Amartya Sen's⁵ approach in combating hunger. Sen argued that "...each person's entitlements to commodity boundless including food, and views starvation as resulting from a failure to be entitled to any bundle with enough food." (2006:434). This puts forward the argument that each person's entitlements to enough food is important than blaming scarcity of food for the persistence of hunger in the world. This means that the focus should be on

⁵Amartya Sen, Indian Economist, Nobel Prize Winner.

each person's entitlement than the overall or gross food production in the economy (Narula, 2006:5).

Therefore, the understanding in this paper is that sustained economic growth may contribute to increase food production in a certain country but it is not sufficient to ensure the right to food as long as the poor and vulnerable members of the population could be by-passed in periods of economic growth also.

It is also worth mentioning that the right to food and food security are not the same. Food security is not a concept with a legal content and as result of which it cannot establish the notion of a right holder and a duty bearer in the relationship (OHCHR Fact sheet no.34, 2006:3). The right to food as provided for in relevant international regimes is a fundamental human right, entitlements to individuals and groups to access adequate food and to the resources that are necessary for the enjoyment of the right in relation to food (Ibid, 4). In short, the right to food places legal obligations on states and other actors while food security does not impose obligation on the state and does not entitle the individual to the right to adequate food.

In general while it is possible to say the various perspectives about school feeding programs could potentially be relevant in the case of Ethiopia, the rights based approach is emphasized in the context of this study, and in the long term to address the problems of lack of food faced by the different section of the urban population in Addis Ababa. As mentioned in the statement of the problem, Plan International in its report (2011) indicated that food crisis in Addis Ababa left many children at risk of starvation and that many families were struggling to feed their families even once in a day.

Overall this study advances the argument that school feeding program when based on the right based approach could be an important mechanism in implementing the right to food. Hence the perspective that being free from hunger and malnutrition as fundamental human rights of every woman, man, youth and child guides the argument and the discussion in this paper. The state is the primary duty bearer to work towards realizing the right to food and to eradicate hunger. So far it is the lack of food or widely felt lack of access to food in Addis Ababa that led a few individuals and institutions to take the initiatives of school feeding programs, for children as those members of the community that are widely affected by the problem. Overall, the approach that emphasizes the right to food underscores, "that creating an

enabling conditions that allow people to feed themselves and ensuring the right to food, especially in the context where people are not in a position to feed themselves and it must be understood that government has the primary obligation to provide for those individuals” (Weston, 2006:194). In this respect, Kent also argued that, “The promise and possibility of school feeding should be argument enough to extend it to every child in need. It is both a legal and a moral obligation of the global society to provide school feeding as a matter of right to children across the world.”(Kent, 2010:192).

In this connection it is also worth noting that MDGs has been proclaimed and put to use for a number of years now. It is based on the assumption that the international community and national governments and various actors need to be committed to eradicate abject and dehumanizing conditions of extreme poverty’ (OHCHR, 2010:1). MDGs have specific set of goals that are required to be “quantifiable and time-bound goals that clearly marked the social, economic and environmental progress that are necessary to achieve sustainable gains in human development” (Fukuda-Parr, 2006, 969). MDGs emerged from what was termed as Millennium Declaration, including some eighteen targets and forty-eight indicators adopted at the 2000 UN Millennium Summit. The eight Goals aim to “eradicate extreme poverty and hunger, achieve universal primary education, promote gender equality and empower women, reduce child mortality, improve maternal health, combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases, ensure environmental sustainability, develop a global partnership for development respectively” (United Nations Millennium Declaration. A/RES/55/2, 2000).

In particular the goal to “eradicate extreme poverty and hunger” provides the scope for the promotion of the right to food including through various programs of MDGs. Since its adoption, many countries in the world designed their policy in line of achieving these goals. For instance, safety net programs are launched in many parts of the world to eradicate hunger in general and the lack of food for children in the framework of MDGs. Among these various approaches in the context of MDGs, school feeding is considered as a very important intervention mechanism, which could be used as springboard for many positive outcomes for poor children and their families (WFP, 2010: 4).

Many scholars also agreed that school feeding program especially where it is supported by home-take ration programs; it helps promotes gender equality and Women empowerment which directly relates to MDGs 3. As recent studies conducted by the WFP showed girls

continue to drop out from school at much higher rates than boys (Ibid, 12). There are anecdotal evidences that, in rural India girls' school attendance became higher by 15% than before because of well-established school feeding programs (Ibid, 13) which is arguably based on the perspective which provide the scope both for MDG goals as wells for the rights based approach. In Ethiopia in those regions where school feeding is supported by WFP, there were attempts to introduce home take ration for female students to encourage them to attend class regularly as an exchange of the labour cost their family missed because of the fact that their daughter is in school (Interview with Ato Muhammed⁶).

Thus it is possible to argue that school feeding programmes contribute to Millennium Development Goals 4 and 5 that aim to reduce child mortality and to improve maternal health. As mentioned earlier school feeding encourages girls to continue to attend their education and help to fight harmful tradition practices like early marriage (WFP, 2010:16). This is firmly based on the understanding that education empowers girls to make better and informed decisions about their life. Overall, school feeding programs and the promotion of the right to food take place in the context of national, regional and international policy discourses on Economic Development and MDGs. This serves as broader context in which to study school feeding programs and the right to food in Ethiopia.

⁶ Ato Mohamed Demise, Representative of School feeding project planning and monitoring at Ministry of education.

Chapter Three

3. Exploring International and Regional Normative Frameworks for the Right to Food

3.1. The Right to Food under International Human Rights Instruments

Before the adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the right to food in regards to prisoners of war and protection of civilian persons in time of war was recognized per article 18 and 72 of the Third Geneva Convention, and article 55 of the Fourth Geneva Conventions. In the context of the development of international human rights, it is indicated that the right to food was for the first time mentioned in ‘Economic Bill of rights’ which was proposed to the United State congress by President Franklin D. Roosevelt in 1944, following his famous speech about ‘Four freedoms’ (Haugen, 2007:15). The following sections briefly examine a number of international human rights with the aim to identify the relevant provisions on the rights to food.

3.1.1. Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR)

The 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) is the first international human rights instrument to give explicit recognition to the right to food (Ibid). According to article 25 of the (UDHR) the right to adequate standard of living, including the right to food is recognized and is stated as follows.

Everyone has the right to a standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of himself and of his family, including food, clothing, and housing and medical care and necessary social services, and the right to security in the event of unemployment, sickness, disability, widowhood, old age or other lack of livelihood in circumstances beyond his control.

The UDHR gave rise to the two covenants, i.e International Covenant in Civil and Political Rights (ICPPR) and International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), each of which are discussed in the following section.

3.1.2. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR)

The ICESCR constitutes the major international human rights instrument in regards to the right to food. The Covenant has so far been ratified by around 160 countries in the world (Jaichand, 2010: 62).

The ICESCR, in its article 11(1) and (2) stated that,

1. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the right of everyone to an adequate standard of living for himself and his family, including adequate food, clothing and housing, and to the continuous improvement of living conditions. The States Parties will take appropriate steps to ensure the realization of this right, recognizing to this effect the essential importance of international cooperation based on free consent.
2. The States Parties to the present Covenant, recognizing the fundamental right of everyone to be free from hunger, shall take, individually and through international cooperation, the measures, including specific programmes, which are needed:
 - (a) to improve methods of production, conservation and distribution of food by making full use of technical and scientific knowledge, by disseminating knowledge of the principles of nutrition and by developing or reforming agrarian systems in such a way as to achieve the most efficient development and utilization of natural resources;(b) taking into account the problems of both food-importing and food-exporting countries, to ensure an equitable distribution of world food supplies in relation to need.

As we understand from this article, there are two notions of the Right to Food arising from the interpretation of paragraph 1-“...adequate food...” and from paragraph 2 “...freedom from hunger...” While the former is a broader concept as elaborated in General Comment No 12, the right to be free from hunger as many scholars agree is narrow in its scope and could be achieved by designing policies to provide a minimal daily nutritional programs (Ahluwalia, 2004:13). Based on General Comment No. 12 and article 11(1) and (2), the right to food can be defined as the right to have sustainable access to food in a quantity and quality sufficient to satisfy one’s dietary and cultural needs and the right to be free from hunger (Narula, 2006:1). Beside this, the Covenant provided for state obligations, progressive as well as immediate, to realize the right to food which is going to be discussed in some detail in the following part.

3.1.3. The Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)

Article 12(2) of the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), recognize the right of women to “...appropriate services in connection with pregnancy, confinement and the post-natal period, granting free services where

necessary, as well as adequate nutrition during pregnancy and lactation.” And Article 14 of the convention recognized the right of rural women to adequate living conditions.

3.1.4. The Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC)

The Convention on the Rights of the Child is recognized as the main international human rights treaty specifically aimed to protect and promote children’s rights, including children’s right to food. Article 27 of the Convention recognizes the right of every child to a standard of living adequate for the child’s physical, mental, spiritual, moral and social development. Article 24 provide that state parties should take appropriate measures to overcome malnutrition, though, *inter alia*, the provision of nutritious foods clean drinking water, among others. Article 6 of the convention discusses that the primary responsibility for the protection and implementation of the rights under the convention is that of state parties with the obligation to recognize this rights for children and ‘shall ensure to the maximum extent possible the survival and development of the child.’ In addition to the Convention on the Right of the Child, as it is also cited in Golay et al (2011) the CESCR imposes obligations on member states to respect, protect and fulfil the right to food of all members of their population, without discrimination.

In addition to these legally binding instruments, there are also so many non-legally binding international human rights instruments, including recommendations, guidelines, resolutions or declarations which are relevant to the realization of the right to food.

Among those conferences which passed resolutions and recommendations regarding the full realization of the right to food, the 1996 World Food Summit is considered to be a watershed. This is the case since it aims at the strengthening of international co-operation to end hunger and it is believed to have laid the foundation for the Rome Declaration on World Food Security and for the adoption of the World Food Summit Plan of Action (Randolph and Hertel, 2012:8). In this particular summit representatives of 182 countries expressed their political will to “.....achieving food security for all and to an ongoing effort to eradicate hunger in all countries, with an immediate view to reducing the number of undernourished people to half their present level no later than 2015” (Ibid). This commitment laid down the ground for UN Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

In general, it appears that due to the wide coverage of the rights food in several international human rights instrument, especially 11(2) of the Covenant some scholar like Narula argued that, ‘the fundamental right of everyone to be free from hunger’ *has* achieved the status of customary international law (Narula, 2006:78). It is further stated that the right to be free from hunger being the core obligation of the right to food it is immediate obligation of the state at the very least to ensure the minimum essential level required to be free from hunger, even in times of natural or other disasters (OHCHR, Fact sheet No. 34: 22). Since children are dependent on their families or care givers for their survival, the capacity of families and caregiver would have a considerable impact on the fulfilment of the right of food to children (Ibid: 17).

3.2. The Right to Food under Regional Instruments

There are several regional human rights instruments concerning the right to food. These instruments though they are regional in coverage they could be considered international instruments. There are three regional human rights instruments that are relevant for the discussion here. These are the European, the Inter–American, and the African. Each of these regional instruments has their own distinctive features they have various provisions related to food. As Kent stated, regional human rights instruments are useful since “they reflect particular regional cultural perspectives with regard to the means for realizing human rights. They can also be important bases for developing innovative institutional arrangements for ensuring the realization of human rights” (Ahluwalia, 2004:34).

3.2.1. African Regional Human Rights System

In Africa, the right to food is implicitly recognized under Article 4 the right to life, Article 16 right to health, and Article 22 the right to economic, social and cultural development of the African Charter on Human and People’s Rights (Banjul Charter) (kent, 2005:33). In addition, the right to food is also recognized in the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child (ACHPR) . Article 14 of the ACHPR obliges member states to be committed “to ensure the provision of adequate food and safe drinking water.” Further in Article 20 (2)(a) “to assist parents and other persons responsible for the child and in case of need provide material assistance and support programmes particularly with regard to nutrition, health, education, clothing and housing;” And the right to food is also recognized in the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa (OHCHR, Fact sheet No.34:8).

3.3. The United Nation Food and Agriculture Organization's (FAO) Voluntary Guidelines

Though as the name indicates the voluntary guidelines are prepared based on previously discussed binding as well as non-binding international instruments (voluntary guidelines, page 5). Within FAO, the voluntary guidelines is understood as human rights-based practical tool which is designed in the hope of supporting the progressive realization of the right to adequate food in the context of national food policies and practices. States are therefore encouraged to apply in developing their national strategies, policies, programmes and activities which focus on the realization of the right to adequate food (FAO, 2005: 2).

The Voluntary Guidelines incorporates a wide range of important principles of human rights, and among these are equality and non-discrimination, participation and inclusion, accountability and rule of law, and the principle of human rights for all, indivisibility and interdependence of human rights (Ibid).

In this regard, guidelines no.14 emphasizes the necessity of establishing social and food safety nets programs to support those who are unable to provide for themselves to the extent the country's resources permit. Accordingly, the guideline, underlined that it is important to,

seek to reflect existing human rights standards and provide useful guidance to States on how they can implement their existing obligations. They cover the full range of actions to be considered by Governments at the national level in order to build an enabling environment for people to feed themselves in dignity and to establish appropriate safety nets for those who are unable to do so, as well as measures to hold Governments accountable to rights holders... The Right to Food Guidelines also invites non-governmental organizations (NGOs), civil society organizations and the private sector to promote and strengthen the progressive realization of the right to adequate food (OHCHR, Fact sheet No.34:8&9).

Generally the voluntary guideline is found to be important tool in translating the principles of the right to adequate food into practical recommendations in designing national policies and strategies (FAO, 2005: 9)

3.4. The Scope of Duty of States in relation to Realization of the Right to Food

Under international human rights instruments, states are the primary responsible organs to realize the rights. Regarding the right to food, article 11(2) of the Covenant states that the States which are Parties to the covenant will take appropriate steps to ensure realization of the right to food. Once a certain state ratified an international instrument, it should adopt national laws, strategies, policies and programs (Ahluwalia, 2004:17). Here it is important to note that such an obligation to the realization of the right to food is not limited to the state territory, rather a certain state should take care not to violate the right of food of persons living in other states (Ibid). Moreover, it requires states to ensure that national laws, strategies, policies and programs which are designed to realize the right to food in that particular country should not contribute to the violation of the right to food in other countries.

As one could understand from the closer look into the General Comment No. 12 paragraph 21 the best way and means in realization of the right to food vary from country to country. However, according to FAO, generally state obligation in regard to realization of the right to food is progressive as well as of an immediate nature. Although article 2 (1) of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights provides that some aspects of the right to food could be subject to the notion of the progressive realization of economic, social and cultural rights, there are also immediate state obligations in regard to the realization of the right the right to food (OHCHR, Fact sheet No. 34:20), discussed in the following sections.

3.5. Nature of State Obligations

In this part, the writer examines in some detail the nature of state obligations in relation to the right to food. First of all the right to food implies that the right should be enforced effectively by responsible organs. Since the right to adequate food or the right to be free from hunger is fundamental human right of every individual the state is responsible to ensure its fulfilment. The obligation of states in relation to the rights under the covenant of economic, social and cultural rights most of the time has been argued to be based on the country's resource and subject to progressive realization. However, there are also immediate obligations, states that are parties to the covenant oblige to discharge irrespective of their economic resources. This is with a view to make the argument for the right to food as a matter of immediate obligation briefly discussed below.

3.5.1. Immediate Obligations

According to FAO, Elimination of Discrimination “in access to food and to the related resources on the basis of race, colour, sex, language, age, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth, disability or other status, and adopt measures to eradicate discrimination on these grounds.”(Ibid)

Concerning the notion of ‘obligation to take steps’, the point here is that though the realization of the right to food is subject to progressive measures this does not mean that states can be passive, rather they should make constant efforts within a reasonable time to improve the enjoyment of the right to food (Ibid: 21).

There is also a concept of ‘Prohibition of Retrogressive Measures’ which means that on the part of the state, it is not allowed to take measures that led to the deterioration of the existing level of fulfilment of the right to food (Ibid). For instance, withdrawing existing services would severely constrain the right to food of the individual or groups concerned.

The Protection of Minimum Essential Level of the Right according General Comment no. 10 of ESCR on the right to food relates to minimum core obligations. It is the obligation of the state Under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights to meet the minimum essential levels of each of the rights protected in the covenant. It emphasises that general states have the obligation to ensure the right to be free from hunger at any cost. As stated by FAO, “even if the resources at its disposal are clearly inadequate, the Government must still introduce low-cost and targeted programmes to assist those most in need so that its limited resources are used efficiently and effectively ”(Ibid:22).

Generally, the nature of state obligations concerning the right of individuals and groups that are guaranteed in the relevant instruments can be divided into four. These are duty to respect, duty to protect, duty to promote, and duty to fulfil. In the following part, I will discuss briefly, what these suggest regarding human rights in general and the right to food in particular.

3.5.2. Quartet Layers of State Duties

Duty to Respect: this is also known as negative duty since a government of the state is expected to refrain from interference while the right- holders exercise their rights (Nowak,

1997:87). Most of the rights found in the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights impose such kind of duties on the government. Article 2, paragraph 1 of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights oblige state parties to the treaty “to respect and to ensure” the rights. In regards to the right to food, the duty to respect entails that it is the obligation of states to ensure that “every individual has permanent access at all times to sufficient and adequate food, and not to take any measures that would result in preventing individuals from having access to adequate food.”(Ahluwalia, 2004:18)

Duty to Protect: here the government needs to protect the violation of the rights by third party (Ibid). As a result this demands the government to enact protective laws, setting up institution like courts, police stations and provision of well trained professionals in those institutions (Ibid, 88). The same is true about the right to food.

According to OHCHR, Fact sheet No.34, in international human rights norms now a days it is widely understood that states should take preventive measures so that sources of food for people should not be destroyed, for instance, by polluting land, water and air with hazardous industrial waste. The land of indigenous peoples should not be seriously endangered in the process of clearing the way for mines, dams, highways or industrial agriculture. The obligation to protect also includes ensuring that food put on the market is safe and nutritious, calling up on states to establish and enforce food quality and safety standards. Furthermore, States are required to take the legislative and other measures that are needed,

To protect people, especially children, from advertising and promotions of unhealthy food, so as to support the efforts of parents and health professionals to encourage healthier patterns of eating and physical exercise. A State must also take into account its international legal obligations regarding the right to food when entering into agreements with other States or with international organizations (OHCHR, Fact sheet No.34: 18).

Duty to Promote: the duty to promote implies the “creation of awareness of the ESC rights and related obligations as well as mechanisms for their implementation and monitoring.” (Sisay, 2011: 225) Moreover, the duty to promote enables the right holder to exercise their rights and duty-bearers to understand the root causes of the problem and to take the necessary steps to fulfil their obligations (Ibid).

Duty to Fulfil: this also known as positive duty as it demands the state to go further and to provide those infrastructures that enable the realization of those rights (Ibid, 87). This kind of duty very much relates to most of the rights listed under economic, social and cultural rights. Duty to fulfil implies two types of duty i.e to facilitate or to provide. The duty to facilitate regarding the right to food implies the obligations of the state to enact necessary laws and to take administrative and resource related measures (Sisay, 2011:225).

On the other hand the duty to provide implies,

whenever an individual or group is unable, for reasons beyond her/his/its control, to enjoy the right to food through the means at his/her/its disposal, States have the obligation to fulfil this right directly, by providing resources that ensure individuals' access to food or by providing them with food (or money to buy food) (FAO, 2012:7).

Although it has always been emphasized that the state is the ultimate duty bearer for the realization of the right to food as FAO stated, institutions with in the society, groups and individuals have responsibilities in realization of the right to food, (FAO, 2012: 17). In other words, although the government have the primary obligations in realization of the right to food, achieving the ultimate goal that is maintaining food security for all requires "full engagement of all stakeholders-civil society, governments, international organizations and multilateral institutions"(Ahluwalia, 2004:51).

Chapter Four

4. The Right to Food under the FDRE Constitution and Overview of Experiences in School Feeding Programs in Ethiopia

4.1. The Right to Food under the FDRE Constitution

Ethiopia ratified many international human rights instruments, namely, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights, International Convention on Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination, the Convention Against Torture and other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women, Convention on the Rights of the Child. Ethiopia is also a party to the African Charter on Human Right, the Africa Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, and among International Labour Organization international instruments, Ethiopia ratified the Minimum Age Convention and the Convention on Equal Remuneration for Men and Women workers for work of equal value⁷.

Besides ratifying the above international instruments the FDRE Constitution dedicated a number of provisions on fundamental rights and freedoms under its third chapter. The coverage that is given to civil and political rights is more or less similar with those in Universal Declaration of Human Rights (Adem Kassie, 2011: 50), though this could be a matter of debate. The Constitution also recognises economic, social and cultural rights (Ibid, 54). As Sisay stated, “the entrenchment of economic and social right as fundamental norms of constitutional legal order through their incorporation in the bill of the rights with stern amendment requirements... to provide a very basis for the protection of the rights.”(Sisay, 2008:137). This again is a matter of argument and as Getachew pointed out, it does not show the way these rights are formulated in the constitution, it does not show clearly the scope of the rights (Getachew, 2012: 453).

It is possible to argue about the nature of obligation concerning the right to food in the Constitution could be interpreted through the principle of interdependence of the rights, and the right to food falls under the category of “fundamental rights and freedoms” in the

⁷International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, year of ratification 11Jun 1993, Convention on Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination, 23 June 1976. the Convention Against Torture and other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 14 March 1994. Africa Charter on Human Rights , 15 June 1998 . the Africa Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, 02 Oct.2002. International Labour Organization Minimum Age Convention 27 May 1999, Convention on Equal Remuneration for Men and Women workers for work of equal value, 24 March 1999.

Constitution (Chapter Ten). Article 90 stated that it aims to ensure access to public health and education, clean water, housing, food and social security to all Ethiopians to the extent the country's resources permit. To give effect to such provision, detailed policies that identify the responsible organs and the period needed to implement the same would have been required and such policies could have served as major vehicles to realize the right to food in Ethiopia (Sisay, 2008:142).

Although, the right to food and food security are not the same, policies have been formulated in Ethiopia to overcome food insecurity. So far, most of them focus on famine and food shortage in the rural part of Ethiopia. Usually in collaboration with donors, the government within the framework of poverty reduction Strategy design food security programs (FSP) (FSP, 2004). Food security programs attempted in Ethiopia among others include resettlement and productive safety nets programs. The main objective of such programs was to help millions of chronically food insecure people out of the problem and to increase the number of food secure people up to ten million within five years (Ibid).

Additional policies and strategies set to bring economic growth have been formulated. To mention some of these, Land Tenure Reform, Resettlement Plans, Agriculture Development Led Industrialization, Growth and Transformation Plan are some of the major policies. Here it is to note that, it is not clear how these policies tackle the problems concerning the urban population especially in Addis Ababa and possibly other towns where considerable number of the population could be subjected to hunger (Interim Report on Poverty, 2012: 8). It is uncertain how these broad policy frameworks directly apply in the case of Addis Ababa, although it is also worth mentioning that organizing people to operate in small and micro financed enterprises by providing credit service have been considered as one of the solutions to fight poverty in urban areas as well (A.A Socio -Economic Profile, 2013:45). The next section will provide the background discussion on school feeding programs in Ethiopia.

4.2. Overview of School Feeding Programs and the Right to Food in Ethiopia

There is a long standing understanding that millions of people in Ethiopia face starvation and hunger every year and usually children have become one of the most affected (Ziegler, 2005).

Moreover, studies conducted so far on Ethiopia in relation to the topic usually approach the issue from the perspective of food security. According to Degefa (2008), urban food

insecurity constitutes one of the issues of concern in the development agenda of the country. In this connection there is an observation that not much is known about the “the determinant of food insecurity in the city of Addis Ababa, making it difficult for development practitioners and policy makers” to fully understand the scale of the problem and put in place effective strategies to overcome the problem in urban areas (Ejigayehu and Abdi-khali, 2012:12).

A few other studies directly relating to the right to food (Girmay 2012 for example) associate it with access to rural land. Girmay’s research further argues that rural landlessness continued to increase as land in rural area comes under multiple pressure, including population growth, environmental degradation, and natural disaster and so on. For him rural land governance policy is fundamental in any analysis for the realization of the right to food.

Another study concerning the right to food as it relates to Ethiopia which the writer came across in exploring the literature for this research is entitled ‘ Operationalizing the Right to Food in Africa’ by Haug and Rauan (2001). According to the writers, the main purpose of their study was how rights-based approaches to development could be integrated with Development cooperation by linking food security issues with international agreements and bilateral agreements between two donor countries such as Norway and Ethiopia. Moreover, the writers raised one of the main issues relevant in realizing the right to food by arguing as follow:

Legislation alone cannot solve food insecurity problems although legislation might be one important tool in the struggle to eliminate poverty and food insecurity. Whether or not the countries have included food as a human right in national legislation does not appear to be of significant importance for the food security situation in the country. The critical issue regarding food as a human right is enforcement, not the legislation by itself (Haug and Rauan, 2001:1).

Regardless however, Ethiopia commenced school feeding programs as one component of the Plan for Accelerated Sustainable Development to End Poverty in collaboration with the United Nations World Food Program (WFP). The program was started in 1994 in four regions-Afar, Amhara, Oromiya and Tigray (WFP, 2004:50). As a result the program was conducted in forty schools in the above mentioned regions and reported to have reached 25, 000 school children (Ibid). As Ato Mohamed stated recently school feeding programs in

Ethiopia expanded to more regions and the program is being implemented in some regions of Somali and SNNPR. The regional breakdown is as follows:

Regions	Schools	Students
Afar	355	76,000
Amhara	146	142,000
Oromia	217	133,000
SNNPR	94	62,000
Somali	229	139,000
Tigray	146	118,000
Total	1,187	670,000

(Source- School feeding program in Ethiopia- concept paper page 6, 2014)

With a view to realize the Plan for Accelerated Sustainable Development to End Poverty, WFP in its Ethiopia country program incorporated two interrelated components. These are Managing Environmental Resources to Enable Transitions and Children-In-Local-Development-based food for education (WFP, 2008:3).

However, these programs were only intended to be conducted in rural part of Ethiopia with the aim of investing on children education, and to strengthen their health and nutrition status by feeding them in schools in parts of the country considered food insecure (WFP, 2008:43). Though the aim of ‘Children-In-Local-Development-based Food for Education’ was to bring sustainable and community owned school feeding programs, until now school feeding in those mentioned regions were mainly provided by WFP by importing 70% of the food from abroad and only 30% of the food purchased from the local market (Interview with Ato Mesefin⁸). Though WFP took the largest share in implementing school feeding in the world as a whole, there have been calls for global solidarity to eradicate hunger from school (WFP,2009). In the view of the WFP, this solidarity emerges from “coalition of governments, WFP, the World Bank, the United Nations and non-governmental organization partners, research and academic institutions and the private sector” (Ibid).

⁸ Ato Mesefin Mekuriya, senior program assistant, child/FFE at WFP, A.A

The WFP also notified that school feeding programs should strive towards the following standards:

strategies for sustainability, sound alignment with national policy frameworks, stable funding and budgeting , needs based, cost effective quality programme design, strong institutional arrangement for implementation, monitoring and accountability, local production and sourcing where feasible, strong partnerships and inter-sector coordination, strong community participation and ownership (WFP,2009:4)

In October 2012 Ethiopian Ministry of Education has developed a National School Health and Nutrition Strategy (SNH) based on the recognition of the persistence of poor health and nutrition for school age children. This Strategy is defined as “An integrated set of planned school-based strategies, activities and services designed to promote the optimal physical, mental, social, spiritual and educational development of students and to improve the health of the surrounding community”(Ibid, 5). And its objective is to make sure that;

mechanisms are put in place for ownership and sustainability of SHN programs (such as school feeding programs and other promotive nutrition interventions, cooking demonstrations and school gardens) thereby, increasing access and completion rates by reducing dropout and absenteeism prevalent in chronically food insecure areas of the country (Ibid, 9).

It is also believed that SHN promotes equity as long as the vulnerable and the most disadvantages children’s are the main targets of the program (ESDP IV 2010/2011-2014/2015, 83).

In this same material it was also mentioned that,“ School children are often thought of as naturally healthy...that many school children are stunted in height, underweight, wasted, anemic, and iodine or vitamin A deficient. In many areas schoolchildren are affected by health- and nutrition-related problems that constrain their ability to thrive and to benefit from education” (Ibid, 8).

Thus it is possible to observe that the National School Health and Nutrition Strategy was designed based on existing policies on education, health and agricultural sector and water in Ethiopia. And it is also to mention that, the strategy was mainly based on international

Convention on the Rights of the Child and the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the child. The Ministry stated that “Systems shall be put in place to provide preventive and curative medical care for vulnerable children and feeding programmes shall be established and food supplements be given to vulnerable children especially to those living in poverty and in marginalized areas” (Ibid:21).

From this, we can understand that the school feeding program is designed as one of the strategies to address multi-faceted problems school children in Ethiopia faced. In other words, it is to address children’s problems in relation to access to education, health and nutrition. Since human rights are interdependence and interrelated, program which are designed to promote one of the rights also contribute to the realization of the other. Though it seems that the immediate result is to enable children to stay at school it also helps to improve children’s health status and to reduce the number of those who go hunger as we understand from experience of other countries and this is directly related to Millennium Development Goal one, which is the eradication of hunger.

National nutrition program, 2013-2015 (NNP), consider Home Grown School Feeding as important intervention to fight malnutrition among school age children (NNP, 74). Also the 2012 National Social Protection Policy of Ethiopia considers school feeding as an important intervention strategy to tackle inequality of access to social services (NSPP, 2012).

As indicated in the Education Sector Development Program IV(ESDP IV) “addressing nutrition and health among school-age children does more than improve the health and learning capacity of the treatment group: it also brings intergenerational nutrition and health benefits and long-term economic gains as well” (ESDP IV, 2010:84).

In regards to school feeding programs in Addis Ababa the writer found it difficult to get information on the distribution within the city of the programs and their coverage. There is no adequate information at Addis Ababa City Government, Education Bureaus regarding school feeding programs that may have been conducted at different schools at different periods. Nevertheless, as observed by the writer during the visits tried to visit there is a handful of school feeding programs. However, in those schools visited for the conduct of this study the programs have been initiated by teachers, volunteer individuals, and by a few nongovernmental organizations. Form this we can understand that government intervention in

this regard in Addis Ababa is almost entirely absent. However, from the concept paper developed by the WFP in relation to school feeding program in Ethiopia, it is observed that the programs at the country level have been implemented with the help of WFP in six regions. The paper also cites that almost in all regions of Ethiopia including Addis Ababa and Diredawa there is vulnerability in terms of malnutrition, poverty and food insecurity (WFP concept paper, 2014:5). The concept paper underlines the importance of intervention in the form of school feeding in all regions of Ethiopia. The following table shows the level of vulnerability rate (Ibid, 6).

Region	Primary school Enrolment	Out of school children	Poverty index	Food poverty index
Addis Ababa	77%	22%	28%	26%
Afar	35%	70%	36%	32%
Amhara	93%	5%	31%	43%
Benishangule	93%	9%	29%	35%
Diredawa	72%	27%	28%	22%
Gambela	103%	10%	32%	26%
Harari	77%	18%	11%	5%
Oromya	84%	22%	29%	33%
SNNPR	91%	12%	30%	26%
Somali	64%	54%	33%	27%
Tigray	92%	5%	32%	37%

(Source- School feeding program in Ethiopia- concept paper page 6, 2014)

Chapter Five

5. Data Presentation and Analysis

5.1. Introduction

Addis Ababa, the capital city of Ethiopia which is also the largest in the country, takes a central place in the country's political, economic, cultural development. The total area of the city is 540 Sq. Km and geographically it is located at center of the country (Bureau of Finance & Economic Development, 2013:13). Addis Ababa's population is estimated to 3,048,631 based on the population (projected) census conducted on Addis Ababa, 2011/12 (Ibid, 16).

Within Addis Ababa city administration, there are schools run by government; private, missionaries and public organizations (Ibid, 20). Based on the study conducted by Addis Ababa City Bureau of Education (AACBoE) in the year 2011/12, the number of students in the city, from KG to secondary level was 797,226. Based on information from the same source, there were 1,050 kindergarten, 760 primary schools, 188 secondary schools (9-12) in Addis Ababa during the same period.

Addis Ababa is the city where various categories of the population with varying economic status, from the affluent to the destitute, live. Compared to the other parts of Ethiopia, the unemployment rate in Addis Ababa is considered to be very high and the numbers of female who are not employed are believed to be much greater than the male (Bureau of Finance & Economic Development, 2013:46).

The government has designed and implemented a number of urban poverty eradication strategies. Among these creating job opportunity by organizing unemployed youth and other members of the society in micro and small enterprises is main one (Finance & Economic Development Bureau, 2002: 23). It is also stated that to meet the Millennium Development Goals and the fifth year Growth and Transformation Plan, the city organizing, training, financing and counseling services for those engaged in micro and small enterprises are believed to be very much important (Bureau of Finance & Economic Development, 2013, 45).

However, the lack of food or adequate food is one among the major manifestation of human suffering in Addis Ababa. Out of the total population in Addis Ababa, 28.1% are under general poverty and 26.1% are under food poverty and females are more affected than male (Ibid, 49). Now days it is not uncommon for many people to see children going starved at schools, many people are scavenging for leftover food in garbage cans, and worse still it is sometimes reported that restaurants no more freely give leftover food to the needy and instead are reported to sell it to the people queuing at the gates of these restaurants in the mornings (www.ethiopianreview.com⁹). This clearly captures the seriousness of the problem in Addis Ababa, and as we see below it is individual members of the community who closely observed the suffering of children at schools who initiated school feeding programs.

5.2. Description of School Feeding Programmes at Tsehay Chora and Dagmawi Menilik Kindergarten and Primary Schools

In this part, the writer will briefly describe how school feeding programs are currently conducted in two of the schools I have visited for the purposes of this study. First there is Tsehay Chora Kindergarten and Primary school found in Addis Ababa and Gulele Sub City Woreda 3. In this school, a feeding program for children in need was initiated by an individual whose residence is in the United States of America, with the aim of sharing his lunch with those students in need¹⁰. The program started in September 2012. This individual later on became the founder of a charity organization which is called ‘Lunch for Education’.

It appears that this also inspired some of the teachers working at the school and some other individuals to start to support the program. With a view to make the program sustainable, the initiator of the program also came up with a proposal making a contribution of half a kilo of flour of any grain on monthly basis throughout the year to be a member of the organization, as the requirement. This half kilo contribution is designed to bring the program to the attention of more and more individuals, and to show that something that is considered impossible could be possible. It was explained to me that the organization was established with the motto that “it is possible to feed those students which failed to follow their education attentively because of the hunger they face by reducing from our consumption.”(Ibid)

⁹ www.ethiopianreview.com/index/35580 accessed 10/11/1014, 12:13

¹⁰ Interview with Ato Fekade Selassie Mekuriya, director of Tsehay Chora Kindergarten and Primary school

It was mentioned that when this program was started, the number of the students was about 54 and has increased since then. As w/t Mestawot¹¹ explained 88 students currently benefit from the program and mentioned that the founder has a plan to expand the program in another five schools in Addis Ababa.

In this school, food is prepared and served in rooms that are not being used for teaching purposes. The food is prepared from the mixture of different cereals. In the view of the cluster supervisor, the quality of the food in terms of its nutritional value, allowing the students to get the daily recommended nutrients. As an informant explained to me students get 250g of the food which is prepared from the mixture of different cereals and it was estimated that it could be over 1000 kilo Calories per meal because the aim was to help the students not to be starved until the next launch time(interview with Ato Fetehalew).

The second school visited for the purpose of this study was Dagmawi Minilik Kindergarten and Primary school located at Addis Ababa Arada Sub City Woreda 9. At this school the program was started in September 2007. The program was started by the school charity club, mentioned to have been first initiated by W/O Kebebush Briku¹² a teacher at the school. The members of the clubs are teachers and students who are volunteers to support the aims of the club.

Funding to run the programs at Dagmawi Minelik school come from contribution of members of the club and income derived from the small 'Pepsi Shop' in the compound of the school. Recently, the programs are also being supported by two non-government organizations, which are called World Learning (WL) and Mercy Fellowship Feeding Centre (MFFC). The two non-government organizations feed the students and provide other teaching materials for 130 students in the Dagmawi Minilik Kindergarten and Primary school. It was also mentioned that, MFFC sponsored around 611 students in eight other schools in Addis Ababa.

As the writer observed from the fieldwork at the two schools, the rationales behind school feeding programs in both cases is more or less the same. As w/o Kebebush said, there were a number of students who suffered due to lack of food. Before the feeding program started, there were some students who were 'fainting' and falling, tired and fall asleep, and were even crying, and therefore this was the main reason to take the initiatives to start the feeding them

¹¹ W/t Mestwat Gebre, Supervisor, Member of Launch for education at Tsehay Chora KG and Primary School.

¹² W/o Kebebush Briku, Teacher, Member of supervision committee at Dagmawi Menilik KG and Primary School.

in school. W/O Tsehaynesh¹³ who is a teacher and chairperson of the school feeding program supervisors' committee in Tsehay Chora stated that, the situation of the students became the source of concern. The problem came to their attention when it was observed while students have to stay in the school the whole day. Therefore during lunch break, before the afternoon class starts W/O Tsehaynesh and her colleagues would notice that some students do not bring their lunch and at the same time they won't go anywhere to have launch, and they stay at school and they were found to look very dizzy and sleepy, where some of them were seen fainting according to Ato Fete Halew¹⁴. The above statements clearly indicate the observation that hunger and starvation or the lack of food is the main reason behind the start of the feeding programs in the aforementioned schools.

In the next part, the researcher will try to explore the programs based on the interviews, group discussion and personal observations, and appraise the same in light of the elements of the right to food as discussed in the second chapter, i.e accessibility, acceptability, Adequacy, timeliness, and complaint and follow-up mechanisms and others.

5.2.1. Physical Accessibility of the School Feeding Programs for Children

When we say accessibility, it is about the physical distance, since most of the time such kind of programs are designed for “infants and young children, elderly people, the physically disabled, the terminally ill and people with persistent medical problems, etc” (Marks, 2004:86) And in the case of school feeding programs observed the beneficiaries are school age children who come to school for the purpose of education. Among the beneficiary, there were also those who are physically disabled as observed at Dagmawi Minelik School. Overall concerning physical distance as an element of accessibility at both schools, the programs have been provided in the school compound, in the rooms that are not being used for conducting teaching.

The programs being run at both schools cater for those in need most, only for those who are really in problem due to lack of food. However, as one of the beneficiary students mentioned, although he needed food like the rest of the beneficiaries, he could not because he does not want to be viewed as poor by the rest of student or the school community. During the visits, I

¹³ W/o Tsehaynesh Getachew, Teacher, Member of supervision committee in Tsehay Chora KG and Primary School.

¹⁴ Ato Fitehalew Belay, Cluster Supervisor for seven schools including Tsehay Chora

also observed that a number of students were standing around the feeding room to wait others to bring them some food from the feeding centers.

W/o Kebebush said students who are beneficiaries of the school feeding programs in Dagmawi Minilik are not expected to contribute or to pay anything to have their launch through the feeding program. Since these are very poor children coming from families who could not feed them adequately, they are not expected to contribute any financial resources to get the food. The same is true in Tsehay Chora School. But as w/o Tsehay of Tsehay Chora, mentioned in the near future the plan is to invite parents of students to participate in the program by contributing starting from half of a kilo to anything they can to make the program sustainable. Therefore it remains to be seen if families of children in need at the schools will accept the proposal or find it difficult to contribute so that the programs will continue. This shows that the issue of accessibility need to be broadly understood.

5.2.2. Adequacy

As I mentioned earlier adequacy encompasses the actual presence of food, the dietary needs and nutrients the food need to constitute for physical mental growth and development and the sustenance of physical activity towards fulfilling the physical and physiological needs of the person at all stages of life (Eide¹⁵, 1998:3). During the field work I observed the food being served. Concerning the quality of the food I tried to inquire about the nutritional value of the food provided. Generally it appears from the interview and from my personal observation that the student concerned gets a variety of food. In Tsehay Chora School the food is prepared from eight kinds of cereals as the director of the school mentioned, the nutritional value is based on the scientific calculation of the food, presumably.

It was observed that the students who are sponsored by the school feeding centre and by World Learning/MFFC are given launch which is prepared in the school compound. And students who are sponsored by the WL get their launch at Dagmawi Minilek School cafeteria. While the program is sponsored by Mercy Fellowship, the organization only allocate money to buy the cooked meal from cafeteria and teachers who are members make a follow up of how the program is run (Interview with w/ro Kebebush).

¹⁵ Senior Fellow and former Director, Norwegian Institute of Human Rights; Special Rapporteur on the Right to Adequate Food as a Human Right, the United Nations Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities

5.2.3. Timeliness

Concerning timeliness as Ato German¹⁶ stated, in Dagmawi Minilik KG & primary school the food is provided on timely basis, also involving the support from the two non-government organizations. The same is true in Tseha Chora, except that it was mentioned that last year because of electricity failure and inaccessibility of information to the supplier of the materials that are necessary to cook the food, the programs were interrupted for two to three days. Moreover, inability to keep food variety according to the plan is observed, and it was mentioned that different measures are being implemented to avoid the occurrence of such problems.

5.2.4. Existence of Complaint and follow up Mechanisms

Accountability is key point of the rights based approach to programming and it is necessary to smoothly run the programmes for the beneficiaries (Wilson, 2005:218). Follow up mechanism is important to improve the accountability and transparency of the programs, and although it is difficult to identify the duty bear in this case since the programs are conducted on charitable and humanitarian basis. Unless there is effective complaint mechanism in school feeding programmes, some of the students may not make suggestions or make complaint , and even when there is a mechanism, they tend to learn that their views have little impact to bring the above changes,

In this respect at the Tsehay Chora Kindergarten and Primary school, a committee for the purpose of supervising the program has been established. Well, before its establishment, it was mentioned that there where disappointment on the part of some of the student beneficiaries. There were also cases where some students preferred to talk to one of their teachers about their needs and concerns, instead of contacting the Committee. At Dagmawi Minilik Kindergarten and Primary school, as W/o Kebebush mentioned students who have complaints concerning the food they were served, they communicated it to the teachers who are members of the charity club in the school, to inform the responsible body to take corrective measures.

This can be taken as good trend and it needs to be appreciated, since it is in line with the issue of transparency and accountability. That is those who may have complains need to have

¹⁶ Ato German Fante, school feeding program Coordinator at MFFC

access to monitoring results and at the same time those who have responsibility need to act accordingly (Kent, 2007:34).

As I understood from my observations at both schools, there are follow up mechanisms. As w/o Kebebus stated, daily attendance of the students who are beneficiaries of the program is prepared on regular basis. In addition detailed information of each student including their photographs is kept properly. The same is true in Tsehay Chora School, that there is a list of student beneficiaries of the program.

5.2.5. The Eligibility Criterion to select Children Beneficiaries

Non-discrimination is one among the key principles in human rights. In addition as FAO stated food and nutrition programmes may foresee affirmative or positive discrimination for the sake of those who historically experience discrimination (FAO, 2012: 7)

In both schools, it was mentioned that it is the homeroom teacher's discretion to identify children facing hunger and to enable them become part of the feeding programs. Besides, since the start of the feeding programs as W/o Tsehaynesh mentioned, some parents come to school and ask the teachers to include their children into the program. Sometimes students also ask their teachers (to whom they feel close), to be part of the program, when they are not comfortable to talk about the situation in the classroom. At the Dagmawi Minilik School W/O Kebebus explained that, in the process of screening eligible students they cross-check the students' parent, or guardian or their neighbours. This is important in as long as the program could not be accessible to all students, and as the capacity of the programs is limited and caters only to those who are seriously in need of help.

5.2.6. Acceptability

Acceptability broadly relates to the type and quality of food or in relation to the culture of the community where the program is being conducted, or this could be in relation to the process relating to school feeding program itself.

As observed in both schools, the content of the food served acceptable by the students. The food at Tsehay Chora is made from the mixture of cereals served in the form of traditional made bread 'kita' with vegetables, like cabbage, potato, and carrot etc. However, one of the student beneficiaries mentioned that he would have liked if the food served is made from

‘injera’ indicating the preferences from the point of view of ‘injera’ being one among the major staple food in Ethiopia.

Concerning programs supported by MFFC and WL at the Dagmawi Minilik School, on the basis of the interview and from personal observation, student gets variety of food. However, one of the participants told the writer that most of the time rice is served and it will be good if other types of meal are included in the program. Concerning the program sponsored by Mercy Fellowship, the organization only allocate money to buy cooked meal from the School cafeteria and teachers who are member of the club follow up how the program is run (Interview with w/ro Kebebush).

5.2.7. Contribution of the Programmes in Alleviating the Problems

As mentioned earlier school feeding programmes contribute directly to help the student beneficiaries overcome their immediate needs, and indirectly contribute to various policy initiatives including the Millennium Development Goals. And based on the relationship between the MDGs and human rights, it could potentially contribute to the realization of the right to food, the right to education, and so on. As Ato Fetehalew stated at Tsehay Chora School the programs discussed contribute greatly, since the program help them not to go hungry and their performance in their education and their health condition may also improve. It was mentioned that the programs have been contributing to the wellbeing of the affected students and for an orderly conduct of school activities. It was mentioned that before the program was started there were disturbances where those students who were going hungry were said to have disturbing the class room- crying, experiencing dizziness and ‘fainting’.

In addition to that, school feeding serve as one way of cash transfer to the family of the students. As a parent¹⁷ of three of the students who are beneficiaries explained,

The program contributed a lot in supporting the family. I consider it as if money is given to me, without the program, I can’t feed my three children. I might fed them once a day whatever the quality of the food but it is unthinkable to provide food for my children two or three times a day. In the past some of my neighbours who felt sympathy to me helped me a lot to feed my children. Because of health problem I do not have job and I can’t be employed to generate income.

¹⁷ w/o Faitu kewe, parent of three students who are beneficiaries of school feeding program in Tsehay Chora.

Chapter Six

6. The Challenges of School Feeding Programs and the Prospect of the Promotion of the Right to Food in Addis Ababa

6.1. The Challenges of School Feeding Programs

In this part the writer identifies the challenges observed from interviews and groups discussions at the schools visited, supported by information obtained from various written materials used for the purpose of this study.

6.1.1. Lack of Awareness about the Right to Food

As mentioned earlier one of the obligation of states concerning the right to food is to promote the right through awareness creation programs. The right to adequate food and to be free from hunger got attention since the 1980s, and especially since the year 1990s. Despite this, at the two schools where the data is collected, it appears that virtually there is no awareness about the right to food. Looking at the interview with the informants, none of the informants mentioned that he/she knows about the right to food. During the interviews one of the informants argued that it is the duty of the parent to feed their children. Some of the other informants noted that that they often hear about human rights not about the right to food.

According to FAO's guidelines "awareness raising must be carried out from the outset of the programme cycle and should continue through all the programme phases as part of the activities and expected results of programme implementation" (FAO, 2012: 18). This means that both the right holder and the duty bearer need to be aware about the right to food. The importance of awareness rising from the perspective of the right holder helps the right holder to know how to hold the duty bearer accountable concerning their decisions, the management of public resources and programs. And for the duty bearer awareness to the right to food help to know the structural causes of hunger, and appropriate ways of addressing these (Ibid), and work on how to proactively deal with the problem effectively.

In the Guidance Note it is stated that

Awareness raising strategies and activities should be specifically designed for each programme, taking into account the particular context, the causes of food insecurity to be addressed and the specific characteristics of the stakeholders, especially the most vulnerable. The design of an FNS programme must therefore include

sufficient activities, resources and time for awareness rising. Information and transparency regarding stakeholders' roles in the programme, criteria for selecting beneficiaries, and the operational rules will make both institutions and beneficiaries more aware of their responsibilities and rights (Ibid, 19).

6.1.2. Lack of Adequate Legislations and Clear Policies

It is possible to argue that there is no adequate policy and legislations concerning school feeding programmes in Ethiopia, although there are acknowledgements including through intervention in the form of school feeding programs. School feeding programs especially home-grown programs are considered an important intervention to tackle malnutrition among school aged children as Ato Demeke Mekonnen¹⁸ noted (GCNF,2012:8) .

Policy is a key factor to understand areas of the government priorities in the country and indicate that the country is committed to implement such programmes and it will be easy for those potential organizations to provide support for countries with resource constraint to run the programmes (Ibid:9).

And as one way of tackling inequality of access to social services school feeding is mentioned in social protection policy of Ethiopia. And it is also mentioned in National School Health and Nutrition Strategy which is designed by Ministry of Education to “promote the optimal physical, mental, social, spiritual and educational development of students and to improve the health of the surrounding community.” (Ministry of Education, 2012:5) Though this by itself is a positive step towards school feeding programs the existing policies and legislation are adequate to implement school feeding programs in Ethiopia from the perspectives of the right to food or the rights based approach.

6.1.3. Lack of Parents, Community, and Students Participation in School Feeding Programs

Participation of all stakeholders in food and nutrition programs is the key element for the successfulness of rights based approach to programmes as discussed previously.

As W/o Tsehaynesh explained there is no participation in regards to the parents or guardian of the students are beneficiaries of the program at Tsehay Chora School. As she further stated “let alone those who are not part of the program even parents of the students who benefited

¹⁸H.E. Demeke Mekonnen, Minister of Education, Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia(former)

from the program” ; “they did not come to school and ask what we fed for their children”; “once they register their children to be part of the program”. The same is true in regards to the community at large. Nevertheless, some volunteer individuals from the community who have become the member of an organization i.e ‘Launch For Education’ in case of Tsehay Chora School to contribute as much as they can. Though it does not participate in school feeding program, a certain non-government organization in Tsehay Chora School also participated in providing clothes and teaching materials to students that are in need at Tsehay Chora school.

Regardless of the difficulties, the importance of participation of all in the whole process of the programmes is noted as follow;

in the programmes cycle process, including by parents, women and discriminated and excluded groups, is one of the human rights principles to be considered in FNS programmes. People who are poor and marginalized have the right to be consulted – including through their own representative institutions – to obtain their free, prior and informed consent. They also have the right to participate in identifying their problems, analysing ways of addressing these problems, and making the necessary decisions. Consultation, participation and decision-making processes should not be intimidating and should be conducted in a climate of trust (FAO, 2012: 20).

6.1.4. Lack of Government Involvement

As I understood from the interview conducted with Ato Mohamed, in Addis Ababa, currently there is no school feeding program which is run or directly supported by the government. When I say government involvement or intervention, it means programs run by budgets allocated by the government in the case of Addis Ababa. All of the school feeding programs in the previously mentioned six regions are sponsored by the World Food Programme, and so far the role of the government appears to be limited to coordinating, identifying those food insecure areas and undertake some follow-up activities. Recently however there is information suggesting that the regional government of the Southern Nations, Nationalities Peoples/SNNP allocated about one Million Birr 1,000,000 to school feeding program in the region (WFP concept paper, 2014:7).

As WFP report stated, integrating the right to food into food and nutrition program activities may not be easy, and rather it needs,

Political commitment, knowledge and skills for implementing the right, strong institutions, civil society participation, and access to justice and recourse mechanisms for right holders. It is worth investing time and resources in this venture as FNS programmes that apply a right to food approach have better and more sustainable outcomes in reducing food insecurity and improving nutrition (FAO , 2012: 47).

As mentioned repeatedly primarily, it is the responsibility of the government and then other agencies to provide food through food and nutrition service programmes for those who are unable to feed themselves as a result of emergencies or conditions of extreme poverty. Since the right not to suffer from malnutrition is a human right and since the right to food is fundamental (Kent,2007:2), this directly points to the state obligation to implement the right which is recognized under the international and regional instruments.

The importance of government intervention also emphasised at The 2012 Global Child Nutrition Forum (GCNF, 2012:9). For one thing the implementation of the program need strong support of national leaders, including national presidents, ministers, other members of the central government, and local government organizations. And to ensure the success of the program because it is believed that when the government needs to take the leadership role in in formulating and implementing policies, strategies and programs “people will follow and then the success of the program will be ensured ” as Kufuor ¹⁹(GCNF,2012:9) stressed.

6.1.5. Funding Problems

As mentioned in the discussion about the accessibility of the school feeding programmes, it is pointed out that the program covers only a few numbers of students in both schools studied. Financial shortage is one of the main problems in running those programs as desired. As one of the informant stated, this problem relates to the fact that despite the prevalence of the situation, the program is not well known in Addis Ababa as result of which it is only a few number of individuals and non-governmental organizations who support the program at present.

As w/o Kebebus explained in regards to Dagmawi Minilik School, recently they are fundraising and some awareness creating activities about the advantages of the school feeding

¹⁹ John Agyekum Kufuor, Former President of the Republic of Ghana; Partnership for Child Development Global Advocate for Home Grown School Feeding; World Food Programme Ambassador of the UN Against Hunger

program, to attract those individuals and organizations that could contribute and make the programs sustainable and to expand the coverage in light of the pervasiveness of the problem.

6.1.6. Charity or Rights?

Though, the programs discussed in this study may have indirectly contributed to the objectives of the promotion of rights, it would be difficult to say that most of the school feeding programs studied are based on the rights based approach. For instance when the writer raised the question to the interviewees asking to explain the contribution of the program most informants answer that it helps them to prevent students from going hungry and to go to school and to improve the health of the students (from the focused group discussion). There appears to be a consensus among the view of the participants that the program are essentially humanitarian/charity based, depending on the will and capacity of those involved to continue to provide support to the students in need.

6.2. Rethinking the Role of School Feeding Program in Ethiopia

As discussed, school feeding programs have been conducted for different reasons in different parts of the world both in developed and developing countries. In few countries, the program started long ago, in 1906 in England and in Brazil around 1950's, and it generally appears that it is a recent phenomenon in the majority of the developing countries.

In the year 2011 the WFP studies show that nearly a billion people around the world are affected by hunger (WFP, 2011:5). However WFP was able to provide food aid only for about 100 million people in about 75 countries. Out of these around 83 million were women and children (Ibid). The WFP in collaboration with national governments and others actors tried to respond to the situation through different programmes like emergency food relief, school meals, nutrition for children under two, small-scale farming, and training and voucher programs. According to the survey conducted by the WFP there are at least 368 million school children around the world who benefit from school feeding programmes (WFP, 2013:10). Nevertheless, due to the problem of lack of food that has been happening in different places for different reasons, people around the world including in Ethiopia have continued to be affected and children remained one of the most vulnerable category of the population.

School feeding programs in most rich and middle-income countries are covered by the countries themselves while in developing countries where hunger, poverty, and poor social conditions prevailed the programs are dependent on external support and most of them are supported by WFP (Ibid).

In terms of perspectives or approaches, school feeding programmes have been considered as an investment in the world's poorest, children. Furthermore, such programs have continued to be viewed as 'savings' in global stability. The World Bank also consider school feeding a safety net, a strategy or a response to the global food crises and a means to provide social protection for the poor, and a sustainable investment in human capital as part of long-term global efforts to achieve Education for All (EFA) (rethinking school feeding page 1).

From the above one can see perspectives of international development such as safety net etc dominating the practices of school feeding programs and food security and safety net programs. It appears that the practices of school feeding programs initiated in different parts of Ethiopia have been conditioned by such a practice, and the role of the rights based approach in school feeding is far from being clearly understood. Therefore, on the basis of the discussion concerning school feeding programs and its challenges in Addis Ababa, the following section provides further analysis focusing on the prospect for the promotion of the rights to food in Ethiopia through rights based approach to school feeding programs.

6.2.1. Rights Based Approach to School Feeding Program and the prospect for the Promotion of the Right to Food in Ethiopia

One of the main advantages of incorporating the right based approach into programs or projects is to develop effective mechanism to address violation of human rights, to lessen the impact of poverty, prevent injustice, conflicts, marginalization that has continued to affect the population at large (Chilton & Rose, 2009:1203-1211).

Most scholars agree that introducing right based approach constitute a move from other approaches such as safety net, need based and other approaches towards those that help develop the capacity of communities and individuals to realize their rights (Ibid). It has been also observed that the rights based approaches contribute to the creation of more and more opportunity to the rights holders and to strengthen the ability of a state to fulfil their obligation as duty-bearer (Ibid).

The rights-based approach employs the principles which are recognized under the international human rights system (FAO, 2012:35). In implementing the right based approach the principles of participation, non-discrimination, equality, accountability and interdependence of human rights need to be explicitly observed (Wilson, 2005:221).

Participation implies broad based participation of every person, especially those that are affected and participation should be active, free and meaningful (Ibid, 218-219). Active, free and meaningful participation has many advantages such as the use of local knowledge, knowing local needs and preferences and maximize the chance of ownership of programs and projects (OHCHR, 2002:15). As opposed to other mainstream approaches, this advocates for the poor and the marginalized to participate in such project from their inception to completion.

Integrating the human rights principles of equality and non-discrimination in school feeding projects would help to identify the root cause of the problem the concerned member of the society face. The principles of equality and non-discrimination implies that obligations of states to make sure that the equality of all individuals as a human being as a result of which each person is entitled to human rights without discrimination of any kind (FAO, 2012:7). This is necessary because, the poor and marginalized group in the society are often deprived of their right because of the power relations that prevails (Wilson, 2005: 219). The idea therefore, if the principles of equality and non-discrimination are institutionalized, discrimination based on any ground could be prevented and the chance for inclusion of all the affected members of the community would increase (FAO, 2012:8).

In the rights based approach to school feeding, the principle of accountability is important as it establishes obligation to answer complaint or claims raised by the rights holder who and help in identifying who is the duty bearer (Ibid, 217). This is important because the rights based approach requires the development of laws, administrative procedures, and practices and mechanisms to ensure the fulfillment of entitlements, as well as opportunities to address denials and violations” (Ibid). Generally, accountability is the key “to effectiveness and transparency of action; facilitating monitoring of programmes and inducing duty bearers to act” (Ibid, 218).

There is a growing understanding that human rights are interdependent and interrelated with each other. This implies that the realization of one right depends wholly or in part on the realization of the others (Ahluwalia, 2004:16). This means the reinvigoration of school feeding programs based on the rights based approach also helps to promote other human rights such as the right to education. These briefly explain some of the basic principles of the rights based approach which may strengthen school feeding programs and may enhance the prospect of promotion of the right to food in Ethiopia through rights based programs, policies and legislation, if give emphasis in the future.

As Kent stated the rights based approach to programs, policies and social services goes a long way “for everyone to gets what they are supposed to get” (Kent, 2007: 1), and help to make strong normative basis for the realization of freedom from hunger and malnutrition as a fundamental human right of every woman, man, youth and child all over the world.

Most scholars agree that rights-based school feeding program appear to be more progressive when compared with school feeding programs which are narrowly conceived as humanitarian assistance; safety net or food security programs (Kent, 2007:1). In need- based approach for instance the beneficiaries of the program are usually assumed by the providers of the service as passive recipients in need of assistance on permanent basis (Chilton & Rose, 2009:1203-1211). In addition, such an approach provides the service for those in need without expectation of action from the beneficiaries, without obligation and without legal protection, and everything seems to depend on the will of the provider (Ibid). There is an understanding that the idea of informed legislation, political will, and coordinated action are required more in the rights based approach than in the need-based approach (Ibid).

In the right based approach it is expected of all parties to involve more or less on equal basis including the rights-holder who, should be aware of what the rights-holder is entitled to as a matter of right not as charity (Shankar, 2009:6). Further, such an approach creates conducive environments to the people in helping themselves while providing a structure for legal recourse to hold governments and public officials accountable for their policies and actions (Riches, 2002:663). As result, the rights-holder knows whom to speak to in cases where the right is not being guaranteed, and it empowers the right holders to be able to shape and have a say in the way the service is provided (Shankar, 2009:6). Generally the right, based approach

to school feeding programs consists of the rights-holders, the duty bearers, and the agents of accountability (FAO, 2012:22).

The idea here is that school feeding programs based on the rights based approach could be one way of introducing students about their human rights to food and how that works in practice (Kent, 2007: 1). In other words, the right based approach to school feeding programs, if given emphasis in the future in Ethiopia goes further than ensuring the approach which aims to fulfil the biological needs of students and it is also more than a top-down model. As Shankar stated the approach help to create

a human rights culture surrounding welfare schemes where from the top down, the governments' promotion of food security is viewed as an obligation and where from the bottom up beneficiaries of the scheme are empowered, can participate, know their rights, and can shape government policy affecting them.(Shankar, 2009:19).

In general the major arguments here is that if school feeding program is understood as an approach incorporating human rights, it would allow student to know for example that they have the right to know about the content and quality of the food and when and how the food will be served (Kent , 2007: 8). Moreover, the duties of the duty bearer expands to include providing reports on what food they provide the students and the cost and other related matters in carrying out their duties (Ibid). Accountability, implies how the duty bearer carryout its task , what procedure would be followed to submit complaints, what steps would be taken to validate the complaints, and, when complaints were found to be valid, what steps would be taken to make the necessary corrections (Ibid).

6.2.2. Lessons to be Learnt from the Experience of School Feeding Programs in

Different parts of the World

The discussion in this paper have shown school feeding program in Ethiopia especially in Addis is at an early stage, and it is being conducted in a limited number of school, and the sustainability of the few existing programs is uncertain. Worse still, the promotion of the right to food is virtually non-existent while the problem of lack of food among the various section of the population has been chronic. In the first place it is the close observations of the suffering of school children by individual members of the community including teachers that led to the starting of school feeding programs in Addis Ababa. A number of issues about

better approaches have been discussed already focusing on the advantages of the rights based approach. In line with this, the experience of some countries which effectively institutionalized school feeding programs that are based on the rights based approach is worth revisiting in the hope that some lessons from these could be relevant for Ethiopia.

India like many other states in the world ratified a number of international human rights instruments which has recognized the right to food (Ahluwalia,2004:22). In addition to the ratification of the international instruments, the right to be free from hunger is recognized under the Indian Constitution though not directly. In the Constitution article 21 stated, “No person shall be deprived of his life or personal liberty except in accordance to procedure established by law.” In addition, article 39 (a) of Indian constitution provides that state shall direct its policy towards securing— (a) “that the citizens, men and women equally, have the right to an adequate means of livelihood” and article 47 stated that “the State shall regard the raising of the level of nutrition and the standard of living of its people and the improvement of public health as among its primary duties...” (Secretariat of the Right to Food Campaign, 2008:3).

The Indian experience show that, despite the existence of a number of international and national laws which give legal base to the right to food in India, the issue of right to food got its momentum after the India Supreme Court ruling on the issue. In India there was public interest litigation initiated by the People’s Union for Civil Liberties which is also known as the ‘right to food case’, in 2001(Dreaze, 2005:56). The petitioner alleged the violation of the right to food in relation to failure to respond to the prevailing drought by the Central and State Government at the time of the petition. And the petitioner requested the court to order the government to address the breakdown of the public distribution system and to take adequate measures in relation to drought relief works (Secretariat of the Right to Food Campaign, 2008:6). Following this the court passed orders focusing on “eight food-related schemes, and the Mid- Day Meals (school feeding programmes) scheme as the main one (Ibid, 15). Mid- Day meals scheme is a program that is implemented across the country in the aim of ending child hunger and malnutrition and to increase access to education (Ahluwalia, 2004:35).

The importance of the Court order was that it transformed the benefit of food related schemes into legal entitlements of the beneficiaries (Ibid). Consequently, it appears that Indian school

feeding programs were considered as one of the most successful government interventions, though its implementation was delayed for different reasons until 2002 (Ibid). As Stephen elaborated school feeding programmes in India is one way to ensuring physical and economic access to the right to food for children (Mark, 2004:86).

Secondly, Brazil like many countries in the world ratified a number of international instruments which are pertinent to the right to food. It also passed the Organic Law of Food and Nutrition Security which was enacted in 2006. Until the amendment of the Constitution in 2010, the issue of availability and access of food in Brazil were understood from the perspective of food and nutrition security (Chmielewska& Souza, 2011: 3).

The constitutional amendment made the right to food part of the Brazilian social rights (Otsuki & Arce,2007:4). Many scholars agree that despite the late recognition of the right to food in the constitution, the attention given to the framework of food and nutrition security as a whole contributed a lot in developing many food schemes and in understanding underlying causes of hunger (Ibid). For example, inequality, poverty and social exclusion were identified as the major cause of hunger in Brazil (Ibid). In Brazil the food and nutrition framework was complemented with the idea of food sovereignty (Ibid,4). The idea of food sovereignty emphasizes on choice of a state in regards to diversify food habit and of government support to different food production models (Ibid).

The food and nutrition security framework together with the concept of food sovereignty laid down the ground for government interventions based on ‘Zero Hunger’ policy and the recently created National Food and Nutritional Security Policy (Ibid, 4).

‘Zero Hunger’ is a national strategy on food and nutritional security in Brazil, as Chmielewska & Souza (2011:10) and it is stated “Zero Hunger aimed to ensure the human right to adequate food for the segment of the population at the highest level of food and nutritional insecurity, in an effort to have significant impact on inequality and poverty.” It has more than 20 initiatives in four areas of interventions (Ibid, 5). These four bases of interventions are food access, strengthening of family agriculture, income generation, and articulation, mobilization and social control and government intervention, and among these, school feeding programmes is the main one (Ibid, 6).

In Brazil school feeding programme started in early 1940s and it is one of the largest food programmes in the world (Ibid, 21). It covers all students in kindergarten, elementary and high school, and all youths and adults enrolled in public schools and charity systems (Ibid, 21). The aim of the program is “to meet the nutritional needs of students during their time in the classroom, contributing to their growth, development, learning and academic achievement, as well as promoting healthy eating habits” (Ibid). Until a new law enacted was in 1994 the program was administered by the central government, from then onwards school feeding programmes in Brazil have been decentralized for many reasons (Otsuki & Arce, 2007:7). To mention some of them the food provided by the central government “did not respect the local students’ habits and taste...,did not allow local governments to make decisions about the menu, the procurement process for their school networks or their local commerce and agriculture”(Ibid). The 1994 law obliges each state government in Brazil to establish school feeding committees composed of representatives of executive and legislative bodies from the municipalities, representatives of teachers, parents, civil societies which support the producers, all functioning tighter as a responsible organ to conduct school feeding program at the local level (Ibid).

In general the experience of the two countries just cited may be instructive of the potential of school feeding program in the promotion of the right to food in Ethiopia. The Indian and the Brazilian practices show the importance of how legislations and policies based on the specific circumstances of lack of food in the context of this study could be tackled better. These provide an example of how school feeding programs informed by the rights based approach could be effective in working to end the suffering of millions thereby ensuring the rights to food for children and potentially to all members of the society in need of food. Moreover, global organizations such as the WFP have been at the forefront in providing food aid, promoting and help conducting school feeding programs around the world. The Brazilian and Indian experiences underscore the significance of locally rooted programs and policies, and the importance of home-grown initiatives in sustaining and expanding the scope of school programs thereby contributing and promoting the rights to food for all.

Chapter Seven

7. Conclusion and Some Suggestions for the Future

7.1. Conclusion

Although the right to food is an internationally recognized right, it could not achieve wider recognition for ideological reasons and misconception related with the nature of the rights, specifically as part of those rights in the category of economic, social and cultural rights. Gradually, however the persistence of hunger and malnutrition in the world which are morally and legally difficult to ignore, became a driving force to give special attention to the right to food in more recent times. Following this, in particular the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights gave due attention to the right to adequate food and to be free from hunger and called for the international community's commitment to meet the Millennium Development Goals, and somehow persuaded the same to design different policies and programs.

In Ethiopia the right to food is not directly recognized in the Constitution under the human rights section. However this does not lead to the conclusion that the state does not have the duty to respect, protect, promote, and fulfil and to respect at least those immediate obligations related to the realization of the right to food. Ethiopia is party to a number of international human rights instruments that give due recognition to the right to food, and many of the rights recognized cannot be realized without the recognition of the right to food and to be free from hunger. Hence the right to food and to be free from hunger relates to most, if not all, human rights as they apply in Ethiopia.

In Ethiopia, it has usually been the case that millions of people suffer from lack of food from time to time. Although the causes and its impact differ due to varying local contexts, the problem continue to prevail in both rural and urban areas of the country. In the urban areas in the country, especially in Addis Ababa the problem is widely felt in recent times. Lack of food or lack of access to food experienced among considerable number of the population, may relate to unemployment, inflation, and perhaps orphanage when it comes to children.

However, the idea that the state has an obligation to create the necessary condition to make people free from hunger, as a matter of right, has not been taken up seriously. The poor and vulnerable part of the society and children are suffering. Much information has been coming out concerning the extent of starvation and its consequence in Addis Ababa. Many children

have been unable to get food, and there are stories of students ‘fainting’ or ‘falling’ in classes due to lack of food. There is a widely felt understanding that many families are struggling to feed their families even once in a day.

As a response to this widely felt problem, school feeding programmes have been initiated in some of the government run kindergarten and primary schools in Addis Ababa. School feeding programmes in Ethiopia was started in 1994 in collaboration with the World Food Program as one component of the Plan for Accelerated Sustainable Development to End Poverty. And the program covered Afar, Amhara, Oromia, Tigray, Somali and SNNPR, but it did not include Addis Ababa. This may be due to misconceptions that Addis Ababa is not food insecure, and perhaps since student enrolment appeared very high compared to the regions. Despite this currently, there is an emerging consensus that school feeding programmes are needed in Addis Ababa, due to the observation that 26% of the residents are to be in a serious situation called food poverty. The figure could even be higher.

In Addis Ababa, so far school feeding programs have been conducted by few non-governmental organizations and through individual initiatives to help those children who are suffering due to lack of food. Although there is no observable intervention on the part of the government, feeding programs have been conducted in a few government run kindergarten and primary schools. However, it is very difficult to get information concerning the exact number of schools and the numbers of student who benefit from the programs.

School feeding is used ‘as zero hunger’ strategies in Brazil considered the world’s oldest and largest program in the history of school feeding programs. In India school feeding is legal right, and is recognised as a major mechanism for the realization of the right to food. Such experiences in the countries mentioned underscored the significance of the right to food and fundamental freedoms to be free from hunger, a worthwhile agenda in Ethiopia for the future.

In addition, school feeding program could have multipurpose. Its contribution to the realization of many human rights has been emphasised. In connection to the Millennium Development Goals for instance school feeding programs directly help to achieve Goal 1, 2, 3 and in directly to achieve the other goals. School feeding in relation to goal one of the MDG, that is eradication of extreme poverty and hunger directly relates to the right to food, and since school feeding serves as one of the mechanism, it helps as the basis of argument for the rights of children to have adequate sufficient and nutritious food. Since to be free from hunger and malnutrition is a fundamental human right of every woman, man, youth and child

the contribution of school feeding is therefore paramount. And the same is true with other goals aimed to achieve universal primary education, promote gender equality and empower women, reduce child mortality, improve maternal health, combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases, ensure environmental sustainability, develop a global partnership for development respectively.

The role of School feeding in the realization of human rights to food could be highly significant when such programs are approached from the perspective of the rights based approach. The principles incorporated in the right based approach, i.e. the principles of accountability, participation, transparency, non-discrimination and focus on vulnerable groups make this approach more relevant in the efforts towards preventing the suffering of children and other members of the society from hunger and malnutrition.

It is possible to conclude that school feeding programs in Addis Ababa being carried out at the schools visited for the purpose of this study are essentially charity based, although there are some principles that are incorporated in the programs which are in line with the right based approach. For instance, there is monitoring mechanism by the non-governmental organizations involved in supporting such programs even though the extent to which they do so is not clear. In addition, the principles of equality and non-discrimination were also applied to some extent in selecting the neediest since the capacity of the programs are limited. And positive discrimination to benefit the most vulnerable in the program could also be appropriate. Moreover, in further exploring the follow-up mechanism there are informal ways of expressing complaints by students but the complaints do not go further. Consequently, the affected students are passive recipients of food being served at the respective schools based on voluntary contribution of individual members of the community with some support from non-government organizations. Despite this, appreciation is needed to be accorded for those individuals who are struggling to feed those children, because their survival would be at risk without such support.

So far the students get their meals once in a day during lunch time. Despite the constraints discussed in chapter six, the programs helped the students in many ways in alleviating the lack of food they faced to some extent. The programs helped the student beneficiaries above all other things, arguably allowed them to have a balanced diet to meet the minimum daily calories, and enabled them to go to school. This shows the potential of the school feeding programmes to prevent the consequences of lack of food among children at the schools

visited. This may in the long term serve not only to alleviate the immediate needs of the students concerned but also may serve as springboard towards the promotion and the realization of the right to food in Ethiopia.

7.2. Some Suggestions for the Future

Though, it is difficult to make a detailed and technical recommendations based on the points raised in this thesis, let me indicate some of the possible suggestions arising from the analysis and conclusion in this paper.

First, the potential of school feeding as the mechanism for promotion of the right to food and to be free from hunger among children and the affected population as a whole requires further research. For one thing, school feeding programmes in Ethiopia in general and in Addis Ababa in particular is a new area, and not much is known even about the existence of such programs.

Secondly, therefore on the basis of the findings of the research, the major suggestions focus on the creation of awareness on the right to food and school feeding programmes in the Ethiopian context. The right to food is given a growing attention internationally since 1990s. It is often emphasised that violation of the right to food occurs when the state parties to the covenants fail to ensure the core obligation of the right to food that is freedom from hunger. Ethiopia ratified a number of international human rights instruments that give recognition of the right to food. Though, the constitution does hinder the justiciability of the right to food, as it made part of the policy principles, the government/ the state has the duty to promote, protect, respect and fulfil the right to food in practice. So the most important point here is that the duty to promote implies the state should work hard to increase awareness in regard to the right to food and related obligations and its implementation and monitoring mechanisms. This is because the lack of awareness concerning the right to food is a serious problem observed not just among the students, but also within state institutions, policy makers and those who are directly involved in running the programs. Since the right to food is basic right, it is crucial for the enjoyment of other rights. And the fact that many people, notably children, are suffering from hunger, creation of awareness should be the primary step towards the promotion of the right to food in Ethiopia.

Awareness is also highly needed in regards to the school feeding programs. Although school feeding programs have been conducted in six regions of Ethiopia and in a few schools in

Addis Ababa, the existences of such programs are not known widely among the population. Moreover, little is known about the contribution of such programs in the realization of many of the rights. Many organizations and individuals may contribute financial and other resources when information about the problem is brought to light. An enabling environment needs to be created through awareness programs so that the problem of lack of food among school children may decrease from time to time, and for the promotion of the rights for all in the long term.

Thirdly, whether there are adequate laws and policy in regard to the right to food and school feeding programmes in Ethiopia need to be revisited. The situation may require explicit provisions on the rights to food in the FDRE constitution, as fundamental human rights. This is possible, at least theoretically. At least making the main component of the right to food that is the right to be free from hunger a justiciable right goes a long way in giving some meaning to the promotion and realization of the right to food in Ethiopia. The idea here is that once there are clear legislations and policies, it may be taken as an indication of some level of commitment on the part of the government. This may also encourage individuals, groups and institutions within the society to carry out more and more advocacy activities, and participate directly in initiating and supporting feeding programs.

Therefore, on the part of the government the situation may require establishing a permanent legal or policy framework at the national level to guide school feeding programs and this may serve as basis to enact legislation for school feeding programs and to allocate adequate resources for school feeding.

Fourth, though, the efforts on the part of the government to create job by organizing the unemployed and the youth through small scale and microfinance enterprises appreciated, a lot more is need in regards to supporting those who are unable to be part of these efforts for different reasons. For instance, there are cases where children are no more able to go to school and other category of the population may have been affected severely, and therefore home take ration could serve as a social welfare program so as to ensure that people should not go hungry.

Five, so far school feeding programs in selected schools in Addis Ababa are carried out through the support of a few concerned individuals and sometimes through non-governmental organizations. If clear laws and policy enabling the schools and other to raise funding from

within the country and abroad exist, it will make it possible for the program to be accessible to more and more children

Sixth, school feedings have the potential to serve as springboard for the realization of the right to food and possibly many of the human rights in. It will have great benefit if it is taken up seriously. Though it clear that the schools whose students are being affected cannot receive fund from abroad directly because of the existing law concerning civil society law. The perspective of the right based approach may help transform the practices of a few of school feeding program as one of the way to realizing the right to food. Without understanding the role of such an approach, it would be difficult to understanding the actual role of the current programs in the realization of the right to food in the long term. The basic point here is that the rights based approach would help incorporate and represent better the needs, the interest and the voices of the recipients from legal, political, economic and cultural point of view.

In school feeding programs which are not informed by the rights based approach, it would be difficult for the affected people to influence what and how they are going to get what they should get. Further, the right based approach may contribute to break the silence surrounding the suffering of children and the various categories of people in Addis Ababa and elsewhere around the country. As a final point, in the spirit of the principles of rights based approach to school feeding programs, in Tsehay Chora and Dagmawi Minelik schools, the supervision committees in both schools need to include some members form students, parents, teachers and other stakeholders in the activities of the respective school feeding programs.

In conclusion, while the few on-going programs observed could contribute to the creation of awareness about the activities, the challenges as to what needs to be done, there is a huge gap in terms of awareness and information, which could also be part of the limitation of this study.

References:

Books and Articles

Adem Kassie, 2011. *Human Rights Under the Ethiopian Constitution: a descriptive overview*, Biannual Law Journal, Mizan Law Review, Vol:5, No:1, St.Mary University College, Faculty of Law, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Ahluwalia, Pooja, 2004. *The Implementation of the Right to Food at the National Level: A Critical Examination of the Indian Campaign on the Right to Food as an Effective Operationalization of Article 11 Of ICESCR*, Center For Human Rights and Global Justice Working Paper Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Series Number 8, NYU School of Law, New York, USA

Alderman, Harold and Bundy, Donald, 2012. *School Feeding Programs and Development: Are We Framing the Question Correctly?*, World Bank Research Observer, Volume 27, issue 2, pp.204-221, Oxford University Press, UK

Babbie, Earl, 2010. *The Practice of Social Research*, Cengage Learning, Inc

Burbano and Gelli, 2009. *School Feeding, Seasonality and Schooling Outcomes: A case study from Malawi*, Institute of Development Studies, UK

City Government of Addis Ababa Bureau of Finance and Economic Development, 2013. *Socio-Economic Profile of Addis Ababa for the Year 2004 E.C/2011/12G.C*, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Dreaze, Jean. 2005. *Democracy and the Right to Food: In Human Rights and Development: towards Mutual Reinforcement*, (ed. Philip Alston and Mary Robinson) Oxford University Press, New York, USA

FAO, 2008. *The State of Food Insecurity in the World*, Rome, Italy

FAO, 2005. *Voluntary Guidelines to Support The Progressive Realization Of The Right To Adequate Food In The Context Of National Food Security*, Rome, Italy

FAO, 2012. *Guidance Note: Integrating the Right to Adequate Food into Food and Nutrition Security Programmes*, Rome, Italy

Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, 2012. *Ethiopia's Progress towards Eradicating Poverty: An Interim Report on Poverty Analysis Study (2010/11)*, Development Planning and Research Directorate Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Finance & Economic Development Bureau, Addis Ababa City Government, Urban Development Indicators, 2002 E.C Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Getachew Assefa, 2012. *Constitutional Law: With Comparative Notes and Materials*, School of Law, AAU, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Girmay Teklu, 2012. *The Right to Food and Access to Rural Land Under the FDRE Constitution: A Survey on the Contemporary Challenges and Practice in the Regional State of Tigray*, (Unpublished Master's thesis), Centre for Human Rights, AAU, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Global Child Nutrition Foundation, 2012. *Executive Summary: Stimulating Economic Development and Improving Food Security through School Feeding Programs*, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Golay, Christophe et al, 2011. *The Fight for the Right to Food: Lessons Learned*, the Graduate Institute, Geneva

Haug, Rauan, 2001. *Operationalising The Right To Food In Africa*. Noragric Agricultural University of Norway, Norway

Haugen, Hans Morten, 2007. *The Right to Food and the TRIPS Agreement: With a Particular Emphasis on Developing Countries' Measures for Food Production and Distribution*, Martinus Nijhoff, Leiden Boston, USA

Kalof, Linda and Dan, Amy and Dietz, Thomas, 2008. *Essentials of Social Research*, Open University press, England

Kent, George, 2005. *Freedom from Want: The Human Right to Adequate Food*, Georgetown University press Washington, D.C., USA

Kent, George ed,2010. *Global Obligations for the Right to Food*, Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, INC, USA

Kent, George, 2005. *Freedom from Want: The Human Right to Adequate Food*, Georgetown University press Washington, D.C., USA

Kent, George. 2008. *Global Obligations for the Right to Food*. Rowman & Littlefield Publisher, Maryland, USA

Marks, Stephen. 2004. *The Right to Development: A Primer*. New Delhi: Sage Publications.

Ministry of Education, 2012, *National School Health and Nutrition Strategy Addis Ababa*, the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Narula, Smita, 2006. *The Right to Food: Holding Global Actors Accountable Under International Law*, NYU School of Law, New York

Otsuki,Kei and Arce, Alberto, 2007. *Brazil: a desk review of the National School Feeding Programme*, World Food Program Rome, Italy

Randolph & Hertel, 2012. *The right to food: A Global Overview*, Cambridge University, Cambridge

Right to Food and Nutrition Watch, 2013. *Alternatives and Resistance to policies that generate Hunger*, Wilma Strothenke, Fian International, German

Secretariat of the Right to Food Campaign. 2008. *Supreme Court Orders on the Right to Food: A Tool for Action*. Second Edition, Delhi, India

United Nations Children's fund, 2007. *A Human Rights-Based Approach to Education*, New York, USA

WFP 2006, *the Right to Food Guidelines: Information Papers and Case Studies*, Rome, Italy

WFP, 2010. *Feed Minds, Change Lives: School feeding, the Millennium Development Goals and Girls' Empowerment*, Rome, Italy

WFP, 2008. *Standardized School Feeding Survey: Learning from Experience, Country Status Report: Ethiopia*, Ethiopia

Weston, B and Claude, R. 2006. *Human Rights in the World Community: Issues and Action*, University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, USA

Wilson, Emilie Filmer, 2005. *The Human Rights Based Approach to Development: The Right to Water*, Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights, Vol.23/2 p. 213-241, Netherlands Institute of Human Rights, Netherlands

WFP (2009). *Child Based Food for Education. W. F. Programme*, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
Bundy et al, Rethinking School Feeding Social Safety Nets, Child Development, and the Education Sector, Executive Summary, Rome, Italy

WFP (2008). *Standardized School Feeding Survey: 2007 Country Status Report*, Rome, Italy

WFP, 2011. *The Year in Review*, Rome, Italy

WFP, 2004. *Joint Evaluation of Effectiveness and Impact of the Enabling Development Policy of the WFP: Ethiopia country study*, Rome, Italy

WFP, 2013. *State of School Feeding Worldwide*, Rome, Italy

Constitutions

Constitution Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (1995)

Constitution of India (1950)

Constitution of Brazil (1998)

Conventions and related documents

African Charter on Human Rights and Peoples' Rights (1981)

African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the child (1990)

International Convention on the Rights of Child (1989)

UN Millennium Development Goals Declaration (A/RES/55/2, 2000)

Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women, (CEDAW, 1981)

International Convention on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights (ICESCR, 1966)

CESCR (1999) 'The Right to Adequate Food ', General Comment 12 (UN doc.E/C.12/1999/5.5).

UN, Geneva

CESCR 1991, 'The Nature of State Parties Obligation', General Comment 3(UN doc.E/1999/23,

UN), Geneva

Education Sector Development Program IV 2010/2011-2014/2015, Federal Ministry of Education, 2010, A. A, Ethiopia

OHCHR Fact Sheet No.34, The Right to Adequate Food

OHCHR, 2002: *Human Rights and Poverty Reduction: A Conceptual Framework*, United Nations, New York and Geneva

Universal Declaration of Human Rights,(UDHR,1948)

UN General Assembly Resolution 65/1, UN General Assembly Resolution 65/1, keeping the Promise: United to Achieve the Millennium Development Goals)

World Food Summit Plan of Action (1996)

The Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action (UN Doc.A/conf.157/23)

Web Sources

Chilton, Mariana and Rose, Donald, 2009. *A Right based Approach to Food Insecurity in the United states*, V. 99(7), American Public Health Association, Am J Public Health, p. 1203-1211 <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2696644/>, [accessed 5 Nov 2013]

Chmielewska & Souza et al, Danuta, 2011. *The Food Security Policy Context in Brazil*, International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth United Nations Development Programme, Country study No 22, <http://www.ifad.org/drd/policy/index.htm> [accessed 5 Aug 2013]

Degefa Tollosa, 2008. *Understanding the Realities of urban poor and their food security situation: a case study in Berta Gibi and Gemechu Safar in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia*, (V.R.F Series No. 440) <http://www.ide.go.jp/English/Publish/Download/Vrf/> [accessed 3 Dec 2013]

Drake et al, 2012. *School Feeding: Linking Education, Health and Agricultural Development* (Paper for the 2012 International Conference on Child Development Hosted by the *China Development Research Foundation*) http://hgsf-global.org/bank/downloads/cat_view/81-operational-support/82-info-on-local-foods, [accessed 6 Dec 2013]

Eide, Asbjorn, (1998). *The Rights to Food in Theory and Practice*, Publishing Management Group, Rome, <http://www.fao.org/docrep/w9990e/w9990e00.htm> [accessed 6 Dec 2013]

Ejigayhu Sisay, and Abdi-Khalil Edriss, 2012. *Determinants of Food Insecurity in Addis Ababa City, Ethiopia*, Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development ISSN 2222-1700 (Paper) (Vol.3, No.3). <http://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/JEDS/article/view/1377> [accessed 6 Dec 2013]

Ethiopia Country Study, 2004. *Joint Evaluation of Effectiveness and Impact of the Enabling Development Policy of the World Food Programme (Wfp)*, DRN, ADE, BAASTEL, ECO and NCG, <http://documents.wfp.org/stellent/groups/public/documents/newsroom/wfp209767.pdf>, [accessed 9 Nov. 2013]

Fukuda-Parr, Sakiko, 2006. *Millennium Development Goal 8: Indicators for International Human Rights Obligations?*, Human Rights Quarterly 28, The Johns Hopkins University Press,

http://www.hurilink.org/tools/MDG8_Indicators_for_measuring_implementation--Parr.pdf,
[accessed 4 Dec 2013]

Jaichand, Vinodh, 2010. *An introduction to Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Overcoming the Constraints of Categorization through Implementation: in An Introduction to International Human Rights Law*, ed. Chowdhury, Azizur Rahman and Bhuiyan, Md. Jahid Hossain, Martinus Nijhoff, Brill Publishers. <http://www.brill.com/introduction-international-human-rights-law>
[accessed 14 Oct 2013]

Kent, George, 2007. *Designing Rights-Based School Feeding Programs*, University of Hawai'

U.S.A. (unpublished) <http://societieswithoutborders.files.wordpress.com/2011/02/kent-2010-final.pdf> [accessed 3 Dec 2013]

The right to food-report by Special Rapporteur (E/CN.4/2001/53:2)

http://www.searchgol.com/?q=E%2FCN.4%2F2001%2F53&s=web&as=0&rlz=0&sd=33&babsr c=HP_def, [accessed 13 Dec 2013]

Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights Geneva, Switzerland,
Commission on Human Rights resolution 2000/10

[http://www.unhcr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/\(Symbol\)/E.CN.4.RES.2000.10.En?Opendocument](http://www.unhcr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/(Symbol)/E.CN.4.RES.2000.10.En?Opendocument)
[accessed 11 Oct 2013]

OHCHR Homepage. United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.

<<http://www.unhcr.ch/development/approaches-04.html> [accessed 1 Aug 2013]

Monitoring progress since the world food summit,

www.fao.org/worldfoodsummit/english/index.html [accessed 13 Aug 2013]

Plan Ethiopia, School meals provide vital support to Ethiopia's children

(<http://plan-international.org/where-we-work/africa/ethiopia/what-we-do/our-successes/school-meals-provide-vital-support-to-ethiopias-children/>) [accessed on Feb 14, 2013]

Riches G. *Food banks and food security: welfare reform, human rights and social policy*. Soc Policy Adm 2002; 36:648–663

<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2696644/#bib19> [accessed 3/7/2014]

The Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights Resolution 2000/10.

http://www.searchgol.com/?q=the+commission+Resolution+2000%2F10%29.&babsrc=HP_def
[accessed 6 Dec 2013]

Shankar, Priya .2009. *Hunger in a Land of Plenty: The Benefits of a Rights-Based Approach to India's Mid Day Meal Scheme* (unpublished) The University of Pennsylvania, Pennsylvania,
<http://repository.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1174&context=curej> [accessed 6 Dec 2013]

Schutter, Olivier De, 2010. *Countries Tackling Hunger with a Right to Food Approach: Significant progress in implementing the right to food at national scale in Africa, Latin America. and South Asia*
http://www2.ohchr.org/english/issues/food/docs/Briefing_Note_01_May_2010_EN.pdf,
[accessed 13 Dec 2013]

Sen, Amartya, 1981. *Ingredient of Famine Analysis: Availability and Entitlements, the Quarterly Journal of Economics*, Vol.96, No 3, p.434-464.
<http://www.scribd.com/doc/86131819/hunger-and-public-action-jean-dreze-amartya-sen>,
[accessed 13 Nov. 2013]

Sisay Alemahu, 2008. *The Constitutional Protection of Economic and Social Rights in the Federal Democratic Republic Of Ethiopia* (135-154) 22 J.Eth.L.No.2
http://web.abo.fi/institut/imr/publications/publications_list.htm[accessed 13 Nov. 2013]

United Nation , 2010. *Human Rights and the Millennium Development Goals in Practice: A Review of Country Strategies and Reporting*, HR/PUB/10/1

http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/HR_MDGs_in_practice_EN.pdf, [accessed 13 Dec 2013]

Winch, Rachel, 2009. *International Approaches to School Feeding: Country Experiences from Mali, Chile, and India* <http://www.gcnf.org/library/International-Approaches-to-School-Feeding.pdf> [accessed 11 Sep 2013]

Ziegler, Jean.2005. *UN Commission on Human Rights, Report of the Special Rapporteur on the right to food*, E/CN.4/2005/47, available at: <http://www.refworld.org/docid/42d66e590.html>, [accessed 13 Dec 2013]

Appendices

Interview and Focus group discussion guide checklist

First of all, I would like to thank you for your willingness to respond to my interview. I am conducting a research for the purpose partial fulfillment of Masters of Art in Human Rights on the topic “The Right to Food and School Feeding Programmes in Addis Ababa: The experiences of Tsehay Chora and Dagmawi Minilik Kindergarten and Primary Schools.” All the information provided will be treated as confidential and will only be used for the intended purpose.

I. Interview guide-student beneficiaries

Basic information

Age

Level of education

1. How many times a day you get food from the school?
2. What do you think about the accessibility of the program to students in need?
3. Have you encountered any problem while receiving the meal?
4. If yes, what was the problem and what do you think is the cause?
5. What benefit did you get from the program in general, and are you asked to contribute money?
6. Did you tell the school about the problem and whom do you usually talk to?
7. Did you get solution for your problem?
8. What is your opinion concerning the overall effectiveness of the school feeding program
9. How do you understand the contribution of the school feeding programs in the protection of human rights in general and the right to food in particular?

II. Interview guide- service providers

1. What is your role in the school feeding program?
2. What type of food do you provide, and which category of students is entitled to have access?
3. How are children beneficiaries selected to get the food is there any means or criteria?
4. Are students expected to contribute anything in return for the food?
5. Do you keep record of beneficiaries of school feeding?
6. Where does the funding come from in running the feeding programs?
7. What measures are being taken to provide the food on timely basis?
8. What efforts are made to increase the quality of the food?
9. Does the school (organization) maintain close contact with beneficiaries?
10. What are the main challenges in providing the food?
11. What mechanisms are used to overcome these challenges?
12. In your opinion, what must be done to improve school feeding programs?
13. How do you view the contribution of the school feeding programmes in the promotion and realization of the human rights in general and the right to food in particular in Ethiopia?

III. Interview guide- parents

1. Are parents expected to contribute any things in return for the food your children fed at school?
2. What was the problem for which you sought your children to be feed at school?
3. What is/are the source(s) of income in your family?
4. Have you ever applied for food aid before?
5. (if yes) Where did you go to get help?
6. How do you see the contribution of the school feeding programmes?
7. In your opinion, what must be done to improve school feeding program?

VI. Interview guide- key informants (World Food Program, Ministry of Education, Addis Ababa City Government, Education Bureau, and Gulele Sub City Education Bureau)

1. What is your role in school feeding programmes in Ethiopia?
2. What is your view about the importance of school feeding programs in promoting the right of food?
3. Is there any responsible organ in monitoring and evaluating school feeding programs in Addis Ababa, and who shall be in charge of providing school meals?
4. Is there periodic evaluation of school feeding programs?
5. What shall be done to make school feeding programs accessible to students?
6. What are the challenges in making school feeding programmes accessible for students in Addis Ababa and the majority in Ethiopia?
7. How do you see the contribution of the school feeding programmes in realization of the human rights in general and the right to food in particular?

V. Focus group discussion guide

1. What was the problem that forced your school to start feeding programs?
2. What are the main challenges in providing the food in practice?
3. What mechanisms are used to overcome these challenges?
4. How do you see the contribution of the school feeding programmes in realization of the human rights in general and the right to food in particular?
5. What are the suggestions for the future?

List of persons interviewed

Name	Position	Date of Interview	Age	Grade
1. w/t Tsehayneh Getachew	Teacher, Member of supervision committee in Tsehay Chora KG and Primary School	14/5/06		
2. Ato Fitehalew Belay	Cluster Supervisor in seven schools including Tsehay Chora	14/5/06		
3. Ato German Fante	Coordinator at MFFC	14/6/06		
4. w/o Kebebush Beruk	Teacher, Member of supervision committee at Dagmawi Menilik KG and Primary School	22/6/06		
5. Ato Fkade selase	Director at Tsehay Chora	16/4/06		

Mekuriya	KG and Primary School			
6. Ato Muhamed Demise	Representative of School feeding project planning and monitoring at Ministry of education	15/4/04		
7. w/o Faitu kewe	parent	3/7/06		
8. w/o Workenesh Olsna	parent	13/4/2006		
9. Ato Mesefin Mekuriya	Senior program assistant, child/FFE at WFP, A.A	23/7/06		
10. W/t Mestwat Gebre	Supervisor, Member of Launch for education at Tsehay Chora KG and Primary School	3/7/06		

11. Hanan Kelemu	Special need education expert at Gulele Education Bureau	5/6/06		
12. W/o Alem Seife	Employed to cook and distribute the food by MFFC	18/6/06		
13. Hawi Berehanu	Student	18/6/06	13	7
14. Anteneh zerihun	Student	18/6/06	13	7
15. Rahel Fkadu	Student	18/6/06	13	7
16. Selam Afework	Student	18/6/06	13	7
17. Kalabe Getahun	Student	18/6/06	13	7
18. Natnael Merid	Student	15/5/06	15	4
19. Betlehhem Seifu	Student	15/5/06	13	5
20. Netsanet Dejene	Student	15/5/06	15	8
21. Bezawit Tadesse	Student	15/5/06	13	5
22. Emawayish Abayeh	Student	15/5/06	10	4

Declaration

I, the undersigned declare that this thesis is my own original work. To the best of my knowledge, it has not been presented for a degree in any university, and all sources of materials that are used for writing this thesis have been duly acknowledged.

Name: _____

Signature: _____

Place: _____

Date of submission: _____

This thesis has been submitted for examination with my approval as university advisor.

Name: _____

Signature: _____

Date: _____

