

**ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY  
SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES**

**THE STATE OF RESEARCH AND RESEARCH  
OUTCOMES UTILIZATION FOR EDUCATIONAL  
AND CULTURAL DEVELOPMENT IN BORANA  
ZONE**

**By  
Assefa Mengistu Lemma**



**June 2009**

**THE STATE OF RESEARCH AND RESEARCH  
OUTCOMES UTILIZATION FOR EDUCATIONAL AND  
CULTURAL DEVELOPMENT IN BORANA ZONE**

**By  
Assefa Mengistu Lemma**



**A Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies of Addis  
Ababa University in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements  
for Degree of MA in Educational Research and Development  
In the Institute of Educational Research**

**Institute of Educational Research  
Addis Ababa University**

**June 2009**

## **Acknowledgements**

I am so grateful to my advisor Dr. Wegayehu Tebeje for his invaluable professional guide, advice and corrections in this study. His scholarly support helped me to successfully complete my thesis.

My gratitude also goes to my instructors in the Institute of Educational Research at Addis Ababa University, who helped me to grasp adequate knowledge regarding the courses in Educational Research and Development.

My extended appreciation also goes to Fiona Flintan, Dr. Sileshi Zeleke, Adrian Cillis and all organizations who gave me documents and technical support during the entire study period. I express gratitude to Yabsira Marcos, Abomsa Kebede, Tesfaye Diressie, who devoted their time to read and edit this thesis.

Also my sincere thanks is for the participants in the interview, focus group discussions, and to those who kindly participated in private discussions and provided me the most reliable and useful information for the study.

As well, I am grateful to the Borana zone pastoralist community, whose life inspired me and shaped my career around. This study is the product of my devotion for the education of their children.

Last but not least, I say thanks to my wife W/ro Haymanot Gashaw, our children Kehali Assefa and Teminet Assefa; for their support and encouragement to pursue my study to this end. Without them I would have remain away.



# Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	
TABLE OF CONTENTS .....	II
ABSTRACT.....	IV

## CHAPTER ONE

### INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND.....	1
1.2 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM .....	4
1.3 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY.....	6
1.4 DELIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY .....	6
1.5 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY .....	7
1.6 THE STUDY AREA.....	7
1.7 OPERATIONAL DEFINITIONS.....	8

## CHAPTER TWO

### REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

2.1 THE PROFILE OF BORANA ZONE .....	12
2.2 THE PASTORALIST MOBILITY AND SCENARIO ANALYSIS.....	14
2.3 RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT .....	16
2.4 FACTORS DETERMINING UTILIZATION OF RESEARCH OUTCOMES IN A PASTORALIST SCENARIO .....	19
2.5 EDUCATION AND DEVELOPMENT IN PASTORALIST COMMUNITY .....	26
2.6 POLICIES AND STRATEGIES TO SUPPORT EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT; .....	29
2.7 EDUCATION IN PASTORALIST AREAS OF ETHIOPIA .....	31
2.8 OTHER COUNTRIES EXPERIENCE .....	34

## CHAPTER THREE

### RESEARCH METHOD

3.1 RESEARCH DESIGN .....	41
3.2 SAMPLE AND SAMPLING TECHNIQUE.....	41
3.3 DATA GATHERING AND ANALYSIS INSTRUMENTS .....	45
3.4 PROCEDURES.....	46

## CHAPTER FOUR

### DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

4.1 RESEARCHES AND STUDIES IN BORANA ZONE.....	48
4.2 ANALYSIS OF DATA FROM INTERVIEWS .....	62
4.3 DISCUSSION OF RESULTS .....	83

## CHAPTER FIVE

### SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 SUMMARY.....	87
5.2 CONCLUSIONS .....	91
5.3 RECOMMENDATIONS .....	92

REFERENCE..... **ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.**

APPENDIX A .....

APPENDIX B.....

APPENDIX C .....

APPENDIX D .....

APPENDIX E.....

LETTER OF DECLARATION

## **Acronyms**

ABE	Alternative Basic Education
ADB	Africa Development Bank
AFD	Action for Development
ARI	Acute Respiratory Tract Infection
AU	African Union
BOFED	Bureau of Finance and Economic Development
CARE	Complementary Assistance for Relief Everywhere
CBO	Community Based Organizations
CSA	Central Statistics Authority
DHS	Demographic Health Survey
DPPC	Disaster prevention and Preparedness Commission
EFA	Education for All
ESDPIII	Education Sector Development Plan III
ETPE	Education and Training Policy of Ethiopia
FDRE	Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GO	Government Organizations,
GPI	Gender Parity Index
GTZ	German Technical Cooperation
LEAP	Livelihoods Enhancement for Agro-pastoralist and Pastoralist
MOE	Ministry of Education- Ethiopia
NFE	Non-Formal Education
NGO	Non- Governmental Organizations
OC	Observer's Comment
OREB	Oromia Region Education Bureau
PFE	Pastoralist Forum Ethiopia
PIE	Partnership for Innovations in Ethiopia
PTA	Parent Teachers/ Association
KAP	Knowledge, Attitude and Practice
SC/US	Save the Children- USA
SDPRS	Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy
SORDU	Southern Range Development Unit
TGE	Transitional Government of Ethiopia
TTI	Teachers' Training Institution
UNESCO	United Nations Education, Science and Cultural Organization
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United State Assistance for International Development
WFP	World Food Program

## Abstract

*The study examined the situation of research works, outcome utilizations and contributions to foster education and culture in the pastoralist Borana context. The available researches related to education were identified and reviewed. Eight interviews with researchers, concerned program staffs, education officers were conducted and private discussions with five informants were held. Nine individuals participated in FGD held at Yabello. Site observations, illustrative case studies and researcher's personal diary were added to strengthen the validity. The results indicate that there were studies conducted by NGOs for program purpose. The investigation made on these researches asserted that however they address the problems of the education system; they did not reach the appropriate bodies for implementation. There were very limited utilization of research findings for the purpose they were intended. The short-range studies such as baseline surveys conducted by NGOs were utilized and have contributed on increasing coverage and enrolment. Research for education improvement and tackle cultural barriers on girls' education remain at infant stage. The findings show that to improve quality, relevance and girls' parity require undertaking comprehensive research. As well, the study showed that conducting in-depth research and integrating the livelihood with the education of the children and adults learning are important. The findings confirmed as the stakeholders have keen interest to use research outcomes, in spite of their budget constraint to fund researches. The study recommends the importance of establishment of a library in Borana zone, and organizing and documenting the available researches for reference. This study finally calls for the attention of the government and NGOs involved in education programs in Borana zone to encourage and fund more in-depth researches.*

# Chapter One

## 1 Introduction

### 1.1 Background

Education is believed to be a solution to many problems related to development. The 1994 Education and Training Policy of Ethiopia (ETPE) noted that education has a very significant contribution and high priority to human development in the overall development endeavor of the government (TGE, 1994). Also education is an instrument for reducing poverty, improving the living conditions of rural people and building a food-secure world (Ayalew, 2005). Education is a basic right in itself (UN, 1948).

Many studies conducted on livelihood issues proposed that education has a positive effect on reducing poverty and enhancing life. For example, the study by the United States Chamber of Commerce (in Harrison and Godwin, 1962) noted that there is a positive and direct relationship between educational level and 1) income; 2) the community's economic production; 3) the consumption of goods; 4) political activity; 5) economic attitude; and 6) in general as the standard of living is directly and positively related to educational level.

Another important aspect of socio-economic differentials in childhood treatment is better education among mothers. For example, studies conducted in 34 developing countries show that better education among mothers often reflects access to information necessary to prevent childhood diarrhea, Acute Respiratory-tract Infection (ARI) and fevers (DHS, 1990).

Research documents related to the pastoralist issues are also intended for bringing about positive changes. For example, one of the objectives of the proclamation for the establishment of the Ethiopian Pastoralist Affairs Standing Committee Proclamation No 271/2002, *Article No 32b*, (FDRE, 2002) is to build the capacity of the pastoralists in a short time by expanding capacity

building institutions with special emphasis on the construction of boarding and mobile schools as well as other educational facilities depending on the situation. However, the status of implementation of what has been prescribed in the proclamation needed investigating.

In addition, the Livelihood Enhancement for Agro-Pastoralists and Pastoralists (LEAP) project of Save the Children/ USA (SC/US) describes that pastoralists and agro-pastoralists will improve their quality of life if, among other interventions, alternative basic education centers that conform to the pastoralist and agro-pastoralists way of life are established and functioning for children, youth and adults (SC/US, 2003).

In context to education development, planning should not be seen as an end in itself (Carron and Bordia, 1985), rather it is supposed to be subject to improvement periodically or as required. Accordingly, development planning process including education follows, 1) introduction of study and research; 2) exchange of experiences amongst different communities and pilot-testing; and 3) consultation with various departments, agencies and political leaders. This is also true for the pastoralist areas.

In line with this, the pastoralist development program in the Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy (SDPRS) noted to provide mobile social development services including health and education holistically for those that continue to be mobile (MOFED, 2002).

To this end, the importance of education in improving people's living and livelihood conditions was discussed and reached in consensus. The AU endorsed Education, Science and Technology as one of the eight prime areas of policy framework (AU and UN- OCHA-PCI, 2007). The outcome of the summit highlighted that education is of paramount importance if pastoral

societies are to realise their economic potential. The lead-time for improvements in education is long overdue, so work would have started.

Moreover, in promoting the pastoralist livelihood, Coppock (1994) underlined the effect of education and stimulation of local urban development, the impact of policy frameworks and procedures. He also noted that the pastoralist education development needs adequate scrutiny and implementation of the researches that are backed by policy and implementation strategies in local context.

Hence, research and development needs to bring sustainable and positive change in people's livelihood and standard of living. In accordance with this understanding the TGE (1994) noted that there will be an appropriate nexus between education, training, research and development through coordinated participation among relevant organizations.

This being the case, the concerted effort of all stakeholders of education in the pastoralist areas is believed to bring positive impact on the development of education among other issues for the needy people.

Another case, Coppock (1994), noted knowledge of traditional, social and economic values allow one to see why intervention could be resisted; and emphasized on the need for interdisciplinary and systems-oriented education, research or develop systems in Borana zone.

Therefore, research based development interventions are important to bring about change in the pastoralist area. There are many researches undertaken in the pastoralist Borana zone and the livelihood conditions. Education was one of the areas of studies undertaken in the Borana pastoralist zone. However, how many of them were implemented? Which outcomes are utilized

and which ones brought positive change? If not, then why? This study investigated these questions.

## **1.2 Statement of the Problem**

There were many individual researchers, stakeholders and development actors in Borana pastoralist scenario, who conducted research and study to solve the educational problems. Their objectives were to implement the research outcomes and bring about change and development on the culture and education of the needy community. Some of the studies were undertaken in similar situations, places and people. Yet there was little significant change documented in that particular context.

For example, a study in Oromia region confirmed the mobile schools' experience as more feasible than the boarding schools (Ziyn, 2004), and recommended for Afar to replicate the mobile school model of Borana.

Other documents in Borana zone recommended the boarding schools as more appropriate for girls' education. For example, the terminal evaluation of the Catholic Church Schools showed that retention increased in Dhedim and Dhokole schools, because of hostel service for girls; and girls' dropout rate increased above grade 4 in Dherito because there is no hostel (the Borana Zone Education and Capacity Building Desk report, 2005). This showed the need to cross validate the researches and studies against program implementation reports.

Thus, it is assumed that the educational development activities for the pastoralist Borana people were not backed by ample research and studies; and the few studies conducted were not effectively monitored and implemented for the purpose they were intended. Recognizing the aforementioned facts, this study investigated the status of research outcomes utilization and the implications for education and cultural development in Borana zone.

In order to address the issues raised above, the research investigated the following basic research questions

1. How many researches are there conducted in Borana zone on education, health, cultural, economy and other livelihood issues of the people? Where and in what form are they kept?
2. Which researches or studies conducted on education, social and economic sectors in the Borana zone have a direct or an indirect relationship to education development and which are implemented, if not why?
3. What are the implications of utilization of the research and study outputs and outcomes for education development in Borana zone?
4. How do the development actors and target community see the status of research utilization for education development in the zone?
5. What is the status of the research outcomes utilization in relation to education and culture development in the Borana zone?

### **Objective of the Study**

In line with the research questions, the main objective of the study was to examine the status of researches and studies outcomes utilizations and identify their implications on education development in Borana zone. The specific objectives are:

1. Identify research and study documents on education, health, economy, culture and other issues conducted and select those related to educational and cultural issues of the Borana zone;
2. Explore the status of utilization of researches and studies conducted which are related to education and culture of the Borana zone;

3. Identify the status of education development in the zone in line with the research outcomes utilized; and
4. Describe the relationship between development researches and practitioner/stakeholders and beneficiaries and their contribution to enhance the status of educational service in Borana zone.

### **1.3 Significance of the Study**

The Borana zone has been the focus of many researchers for the last half century. During this time most of the research was conducted on social issues, like education and health; on the livelihood, like on the pasture, livestock, and market; on the culture and other related issues of the Borana zone. However there was no indication of the status of utilizations of the findings of the researches.

This study was intended to identify the status of utilization of the researches and studies, and remedial information. Thus, it was the right time, place and situation to undertake this study and suggest remedial actions to be taken in line with the utilization of research and study outcomes in Borana zone.

This research has significance to inform the concerned bodies, like policy makers, curriculum developers, implementers and sector institutions and NGOs to diagnose their position in relation to their perspectives of research undertakings and outputs utilization.

### **1.4 Delimitations of the Study**

The study is delimited to research undertakings and implementations of results in context to the Borana zone. The main reason this zone was chosen was to make the study more manageable in terms of financial and time constraints. In addition to this, it was the researcher's former place of

work, so that the researcher can easily identify sources of relevant data, creates communication with stakeholders and find researches and studies undertaken in the zone.

Beyond that, research based development involvements are important, especially in underserved and marginalized areas such as Borana. Since there are diversified researches conducted in different themes of the community and education problems in the zone, this study focuses on examining them, particularly those conducted on education issues.

Thus, the study is delimited to collection of data on the available studies, identification of utilization status and their contribution. It was also limited to information from researchers, organizations' program technical persons and other individuals familiar with the area of study.

### **1.5 Limitations of the Study**

In this study the researcher utilized studies conducted in Borana zone, to investigate their utilization and implications on education and culture development. It was intended to collect data from different organizations and institutions. However, some organizations in Addis Ababa were reluctant to provide information, with the rationale that they closed their programs in the area and archives are not accessible. This created limitation on accessing of information and the researcher was faced difficulties and forced to change the study approach and travelled to the zone. This has consumed much of the time and resource beyond the budget originally anticipated.

### **1.6 The Study Area**

Primarily the study focuses on the research outcomes utilized in the pastoralist Borana zone of the Oromia regional status, including the former district like Liben. The main districts included in the study are Yabello, Arero, Dire, Teltele, Bulehora, Liben and Moyale. In addition, the study included education issues of the people living in the Borana zone, like the Gujji and the minority

Gabra and Garri communities, since they are sharing the same resources and benefits in the combination.

**Table I: Borana zone education and capacity building desk report 2005;**

Borana Zone	Female	Total	% of Female	School Enrolment		Gender Parity Index (GPI)
				Female	Total	
<b>Total Population</b>	489766	947323	51.7			
<b>School age 7-14</b>	101292	207056	48.92	40516.8	124234	0.67
15-18	42995	88195	48.75	10318.8	37042	0.4
7-18	144287	295251	48.87	50835.6	161276	

Most of their girls do not go to school. According to central statistics agency population projection, out of the total population of the zone 489,766 (51.7 %) are female. From the school age children (age 7-14) 101,292 (48.92%) are girls (CSA, 2007). The most remote part of the zone is Teltele, which has shortages in every social service. Particular to Teltele district, 24,627 (48.93%) are female population and 7192 (48.43%) of the school age children are girls (Borana zone statistics desk, August 2006).

In general, the education service in Borana zone, compared to other parts of the region requires much attention, especially that of the Teltele District which is in poor condition. For example, the Borana zone report shows that in Teltele district only 2289 (31.83% of school age girls) and 501 (6.97% of age 14-18) girls are attending grade 1-4 and 5-8, respectively. In other words, more than 68% of girls at lower primary and more than 90% of girls at upper primary were not going to school.

## 1.7 Operational Definitions

√ Implication:

Changes due to utilization of research and studies in the Borana zone;

√ Pastoralism:

“Pastoralism is a system of production devoted to gaining a livelihood from the care of large herds of animals based on transhumance and is an adaptation to a particular habitat: semi-arid open country or grasslands, in which hoe or digging-stick cultivation apparently cannot be sustained” (Cohen, 1974; in Smith 1992).

According to the definition given, pastoralism is a system of production strongly related to holding and using large populations of animals as the main source of food and income. Also the echo system in the pastoralist livelihood is not friendly to sustain agriculture.

√ Pastoralist:

Somebody living pastoral life: somebody who has pastoral way of life;

√ Transhumance

Seasonal change of grazing lands, the practice of moving livestock between different grazing lands according to season, especially up to mountain pastures in summer and back down into the valleys in winter (Microsoft® Encarta® 2009. © 1993-2008 Microsoft Corporation. All rights reserved.)

√ Livelihood:

Economic life style, living condition, income source of living, walk of life,

Research at Output Level

√ Output Level: refers to whether the study produced and read by the appropriate people; the reaction of those individuals who read it; offices or organizations the document sent for; how organizations received or got access to the research output; Why, they become interested to get the research output; and their reaction after they received the research or study result.

√ Intermediate Output Level: the level of importance of the research or study that helped to measure if there is policy or strategic issue raised or addressed in the research related to education or culture; whether the policy or strategy existing or new one; and how it was/is related to education development in the Borana context;

Research at Outcome Level:

√ Initial Outcome: this is a level that helps to categorize researches and findings at initial outcome level which is the core of the study. It sees if policies and strategies developed based on the research implemented; to what degree they were implemented; the resources-technical, institutional and managerial input utilized; what is the status of the utilization of the research results?

√ Long-term Outcome or Impact: helped to investigate research utilized in education programs or projects gave life to the policies and strategies in key educational development indicators; these can be on school construction, enrolment of children, girls' participation, community support to education, government and NGOs focus on education, quality of education, mode of delivery, relevance And appropriateness, and others involvement increased as a result of the policy introduced in the research.

√ Research outcome utilization:

Implementation of research findings for the purpose they were designed as illustrated above.

√ Gumi-Gayo:

Gumi is the general assembly of the entire Borana community in the traditional 'Gada' System. Gayo is a place for one of the nine dip wells, where the Borans meet every fourth year of the Gada period, to review the rule of the Gada system. This place is found in Borana zone Dire

(Mega) district, about 40 kilometers to the east of the asphalt road. Gada is a customary institution, which is very powerful and well known in the Oromo tradition.

## **Chapter Two**

### **2 Review of Related Literature**

#### **2.1 The Profile of Borana Zone**

The pastoralists of Ethiopia constitute 12-15% of the total population and about 60% of the rangelands (GTZ, 2004), which is in the country's periphery. The Borana land, which is the Southern Ethiopia pastoral area, constitutes more than 12% of the total land of Ethiopia.

The Borana Lowland is semi-arid. Annual mean temperatures vary from 18-25 degrees Celsius with little seasonal variation. Annual rainfall varies from 440-1100mm, the average is 600mm. Rainfall is bimodal; the long rain '*Gana*', which is 59% of the annual precipitation, occurs during March to May and the short rain '*Hageeyaa*', 27%, occurs from September to October, (SC/US, 2006; GTZ, 2004). These are factors that characterize and influence the livelihood system of the Borana zone.

Due to recurrent drought, the people face difficult situations related to loss of animals and, sometimes, people. In such circumstances, the cattle do not get grass and water and cows do not give milk. Children do not get milk, which is the basic link between the pastoralist children and the livestock (SC/US, 2007). In addition, milk is the motivation factor for the community to send children to school. Thus, shortage of milk becomes one of the causes to stop parents sending their children to school.

Even though the Ethiopian government is issuing different policies to curb the poverty situation and enhance the living conditions of the community, the people in Borana zone are still suffering in extreme poverty. The policies related to lowland farming and settlement in the pocket areas of the pastoralist territory (FDRE, 2002) need revision to make them friendly to the livelihood conditions. A few examples to support this thought is presented as follows.

Some of the strategies in the pastoralist area do not comply with the development needs of the pastoralist Borana people. For example, the Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy (SDPRS) promote settlement and lowland farming in the hillsides and pocket areas (FDRE, 2002). Also the strategic plan deals with development however it gives little room to consider the mobility with the intention of cyclically giving the grassland time to revive. Also the proposed settlement and farming areas are potential residing places for the livestock keepers at the time of drought and long dry season.

Moreover, land for the Borana people is deemed essential; and administered in the customary system by dividing into different areas for grazing, known as '*dheeda*'. Apart from the *Dergue* land proclamation, land in Borana was a communal resource. The movement between them and use of the land was used to be managed through the customary intuitions. This customary system was violated since mid 1970s. The Borana institutions and norms appear unable to cope with the development and resettlement policies; decisions are simply imposed by the status administration. In addition, massive immigration of persons not sharing the values attached to Borana governance has delegitimized their landscape level effect. The negative impact on biodiversity is also tremendous, despite the establishment of some formal protected areas within the Borana territory (Watson, 2003: Bassi, 2003).

The conflict and violence in the pastoralist areas were considered as "traditional" (Kratli, 2001), disregarding destitution and impoverishment, erosion of social cohesion, and hopelessness. However, all these are not caused by tradition; rather they are the ultimate results of inadequate development policies whose outcome was progressive loss of entitlement to crucial resources, social services, ideologically produced and chaotic settlement emanating from marginalization.

Despite the planners thinking of the land for agriculture, moisture stress was the major limiting factor of crop production in the Borana pastoral areas. Harvest obtained from crops is not reliable. Harvest is possible only once in 3- 4 years, (GTZ, 2004). With this trend, ultimately the livelihood situation of the Boran is at risk.

Regarding the infrastructural facilities, there were few schools and health centers in the urban and some rural villages of the Borana zone. They are far from the neighborhoods (*Olla*). The average distance of a school from the neighborhoods was found to be two to four hours walk, which is an average of 15 kilometers (SC/US, 2006), and one kilometer for ABE center (SC/US, 2007). The ABE centers were established with community participation. There are few high schools in the main towns and no more than a single technical and vocational education training institution (TVET) in the zone. There is no any type of higher education.

This being the case, many children, especially girls in the Borana zone, do not go to school. In addition, culture and lack of awareness contributed to this problem. The Borana community gives more attention to the education of the boys than the girls. In a gender analysis conducted in Borana community, the girls and mothers are more occupied with household tasks than the boys and fathers (Assefa, 2005). The parenting style also affects the girls' participation in education.

## **2.2 The Pastoralist Mobility and Scenario Analysis**

Before getting into the researches and development issues related to education and culture in the Borana community and land, it is important to present here the framework of what pastoralist and pastoralism mean. Can we consider any one who owns livestock to be pastoralist, or are there distinctions that can be made between pastoralists who practice agriculture and agriculturalists who also own animals? Distinctions are made on at least two factors (Smith,

1992). The first would be on the basis of mobility. Sedentary agriculturalists usually do not practice transhumance.

The second, and perhaps more important criterion, would be how the people view themselves. If they consider themselves as herdsmen, even though grains may play a large role in their diet, then we would have to call them pastoralists. If, on the other hand, their gardens are more important to them than their herds, even when animals are the most valuable possessions they have, we can refer to them as agro-pastoralists (Hall and Smith, 1986; cited in Smith, 1992). Here self-identification plays a more important role, to the extent that people consider livestock or camel herders while they have significantly huge number of goats and sheep.

The special adaptation of a herding economy requires mobility to make use of the seasonal availability of pasture and water. The basis for the mobility was cyclical transhumance, rather than random nomadic response. Movement of the pastoral camps will vary with the time of year and access to needed resources. In general, camps dispersed in the wet rainy season and congregated around water points during the dry season (Smith, 1992).

In Borana community, mobility has pattern and reasons like preventing overgrazing, degradation, maintaining the equilibrium system and carrying capacity of the land and the cattle population. Thus, during the rainy season the community spreads and comes back to settlement areas during the dry season, (Coppock, 1994). Thus, productivity of the pasture boosted and livelihood sustains. This is also the traditional early warning and response system to the drought that assumed to occur once in 10- 20 years, the high cattle generation in four years.

The choice of settlement location is made according to Smith (1992) on three levels:

- i. Proximity to pasture and water. These building the settlement half way between the two. The homesteads tend to be within 7- 9 kilometers of water.
- ii. To minimize stock losses from predation, increase the comfort of humans and provide the materials needed for life in the settlements. Slops should not be too long or too steep, being on top of a ridge.
- iii. Some distinctive reasons which made the environment worthwhile, such as a strategic view or presence of shade trees, etc.

These are issues, which need attention to strategic approaches for the education development linked to the livelihoods in the pastoralist communities of the Borana zone. The resource allocation for education programs should be based on analysis of the situations in the zone.

### **2.3 Relationship between Research and Development**

Many research findings showed that education has positive effect on reducing poverty and enhancing better life. A study conducted by the United States Chamber of Commerce (Harrison and Godwin, 1962) indicated that there is direct and positive relationship between educational level and 1) income; 2) community's economic production; 3) consumption of goods; 4) political activity; 5) economic attitude; 6) in general the standard of living.

Taking into consideration the importance of research for development endeavour, Addis Ababa University is providing a field of specialization in education and other fields at a graduate level. For example, Institute of Educational Research (IER) at Addis Ababa University aims to support the implementation and improvement of research development endeavours in the field of education (IER, 2006). Research departments and institutes were established to play the role to

enhance quality of education and promote technological, social and cultural development (IER, 2006).

According to a presentation of findings of a study on a conference held at the IER (2006), it was learnt that universities and higher institutions need a quality assurance department. This has attributed to AAU to establish its own quality assurance office, which is working based on the three approaches- assessment, accreditation and auditing. The above examples show the importance of utilization of research for education and development interventions.

Also the 1972 Education Sector Review (ESR) had contributed to illustrate the then education problems of the country. However, the ESR document was termed '*died before its birth*' though it was comprehensive research made on the education of the country. Also it contributed to the 1974 government change. According to Solomon (2008), the presentation of interview report held with officials of the Institute of Curriculum Development and Research (ICDR), the country had no fully-fledged education policy, except curricular materials adopted from some countries. It was noted that the ESR and the Evaluative Research of the general Education of Ethiopia (ERGESE) were the two research documents used to formulate the 1994 ETP of Ethiopia. This shows implementation of research for identification of policies and strategies.

The role of education in preserving and enriching culture, Harrison and Gowin (1962) noted that a school has the responsibility of developing knowledge, habits, aspirations, and respect for the rights of others; not simply a few narrow issues that may prove to be part of human life. Also the role of schools in maintaining and perfecting a free society is to enlighten citizens through instruction, training, and inspiration. Hence, an enlightened citizen loves his country, analyzes problems and proposals, gives thorough consideration to development issues and intelligently formulates and tests his conclusions.

Besides, the issue of culture development related to the education of children was presented in many studies reveal the importance of research. According to Stearn (in Harrison and Gowin, 1962), studies conducted on parents proved that parents can do more in their children development beyond fulfilling needs. Also they recommend in-depth research to analyze the cultural make up of children on institutions, partnering of parents with schools, and implementation of workable strategies of that given culture. This creates the understanding that no human instinct can ever equal or be a substitute for the natural love of parents. This creates a school that centers the child.

Hence research can add value to the indispensability of education through examining the multiplicity of cultural patterns (Brown, 1970). People can develop and improve intellectually and morally, through sharing experiences and lessons of others. Thus, through research there is establishment and transfer of knowledge, skill, attitudes and social values that result in the development of constructive and productive social culture.

The above argument leads to the importance of research and investigation of workable ideas instead of seeing planning as an end. Thus, any development needs testing, workout, and based on research and monitoring it needs improvement periodically or as required. Accordingly Carron and Bordia (1985), the following practices are part of the development planning process.

- i. Introduction of a continues process of study and research;
- ii. Exchange of experiences amongst regions with similar nature;
- iii. Calling up international experiences;
- iv. Experimentation and pilot-testing;
- v. Consultation with various departments, agencies and political leaders for advocacy;

These steps help to evaluate the education development programs are research based or not. These are comprehensive steps that are helpful to see the researches and development plans in the pastoralist Borana context as well.

## **2.4 Factors Determining Utilization of Research Outcomes in a Pastoralist Scenario**

The discussions in the previous sections tried to show the general overview of the development in the context of the pastoralists. Also attempts were made to illustrate the important relationship between research and development interventions in the pastoralist communities. But the utilization of researches was thought to be influenced by some critical factors. The objective of the education designed for the community, the collaboration of stakeholders in the development sector and livelihood and the choice of the mode or format of delivery were considered to be contributing to the utilization of research findings in the pastoralist situations. They are presented below.

### **Collaboration of Different Actors**

A few researchers have addressed specific aspects of the reform process which may be especially useful to the implementation of collaborative efforts. Developing evaluation criteria early in the planning stage to ensure the synergetic action and looking at both the process and outcomes of change is quite important (Adler and Gardner, 1994). Since collaboration is a relatively new venture, it is important to focus evaluation research on how people in agencies learn to collaborate as well as on improving service delivery.

Also Fullan (1992; in Adler and Gardner, 1994) noted the important aspects of leadership which build collaborative work cultures and suggests that the leader should be considered as an enabler of solutions rather than the finder of solutions. Similarly many politicians condemn academic researches like in the case of ESR without having adequate reason, which is traditional weakness

of politically affiliated educators as well (Solomon, 2008). The resistances were not academic and not for the reason that the findings were worthless, rather purely political. This confirms the confusion authorities' role as facilitators of the solutions instead of becoming creators of the solutions. Professionals and implementers involving the community have to join hands in identifying and promoting utilization of research based solutions.

Yet, many studies showed that one of the challenges to effectively implement development interventions was associated to pastoralist exclusion from their own issues. According to Kratli (2001) pastoralism was misrepresented in the pastoral development policies and service provisions in the pastoralist areas. Therefore, partnership and collaboration in poverty reduction through education necessitates immediate review of the pastoralist participation at local and national level.

This being the case, a study in Turkana of north Kenya and Karamoja of Uganda noted the promising participation of the pastoralists in the parliament through members from the pastoralist districts. The promising trend with this is the positive influence of the members of the parliament and other policy makers in changing their attitudes towards pastoralism (Kratli, 2001). In line with this, many issues of the pastoralist education need to be raised and debated by parliamentarians in Ethiopia to initiate education development in the Borana zone. There is the PASC established by the parliamentarians, which deals with the pastoralist development issues in the Ethiopian House of Representatives (FDRE, 2002). This body of the parliament should involve members from the pastoralists to take seriously the development issues of the pastoralists to the attention of the authorities and policy makers. Then collaboration can be strengthened for a common goal.

## **Objectives of Education**

The feature of education in most countries was one of dualism: dualism between urban and rural schools, and dualism between schools for Western and for indigenous people (Watson, 1984). The same can be applied to the dualism between the schools for the highlanders (agriculture based) and the lowlanders (livestock based) livelihoods, and the dualism between the advantaged and the disadvantaged.

Another argument is that the most effective form of control was exercised through the language and curriculum content used for instruction. Such arguments try to justify how education was used as an instrument of the Western and better-off local politicians who have the political upper hand, whereas it should have served the community at the grassroots level as a means to development and social welfare. The limitation of resources like finance was the pretext not to use the local language and curriculum whereas the main issue denied is the rights of the children.

Apart from the challenges, how can education bring change to a certain community without using the basic tool of the indigenous community, which is language? The local politicians want to produce scholars who are loyal to their philosophies. This is true in countries whose education curriculums were copied from the west. However, in view of the pastoralists, education philosophy should see opportunities in modernization and diversification of livelihoods including for those who dwell in between the urban and the country side (Kratli, 2001). The Borana education needs to be investigated from this main philosophical framework.

Watson (1984) noted that western education was to strengthen indirect rule, in that in the first place- it leads to the training and education of indigenous elites for mere educational qualifications, rather than for improving their livelihood status as future leaders of their people. For example, the French policy for its neo-colonies states education was to produce 'auxiliaries'

through chosen elites and educate the masses to transfer their way of life through bringing it closer to them. Both depart from their natural identity. When it comes to Ethiopia, this can be related to the pastoralists' fear of loss of cultural sustainability in their children.

The other consequence of the legacy education has been double-edged; it was designed to produce bureaucratic machinery, to make the people multi-racial, and to let loose a sense of nationalism amongst different groups. The curriculums were not adequately studied to consider the local context and did not use the local language. With this approach there are many things that the educated child loses, like the community's indigenous glory and national culture, history and language of the people.

According to Watson (1984), the high valuing of schooling throughout the third world and the legacy of formal, linear school systems network was created through the western education. Education (i.e. schooling) came to be seen not only as an avenue to up-ward social development but as an instrument for social change and progress and as a means of welding different ethnic and linguistic groups together. Such an approach to education may lack appropriateness to deal with the issues of the local context and education needs. Therefore, the customary pastoralists like Borana become very reluctant to accept such education for their children especially for their girls.

According to the practice in Turkana (a pastoralist community territory in Kenya), inline to the cultural and local context, non-formal type education was given much emphasis. The argument is that with regard to education in particular, innovative and more responsive solutions are undermined by education systems centered on the conventional school setting. It marginalizes alternative ways of learning into subordinate limits and places them in preparatory roles. Instead,

alternative education requires full integration into the national education system enjoying the same status as formal school education (Kratli, 2001).

According to Kratli (2000) in the Mongolian nomads' education, the formal education was performed with some degree of success. Among other things it was characterized by effective law enforcement, without modifying (rigid), and inline to the pastoralist development policy, successful in decreasing labor intensity and freeing children from the household's labor demand. On the other hand the non-formal education have the following features like being delivered within a friendly and non-antagonistic cultural environment and in a strongly nomadic culture, with high flexibility in structure and content, responsive to changing pastoralist needs, within parents close surveillance over physical and moral security- especially on girls, in acknowledgement to social, economic and political hindrances.

The latter helps to shape the education philosophies of the pastoralists or objectives. Similarly, the issue of choosing appropriate policies and strategies contributes to the effective utilization of research findings. The same applies for the pastoralist areas of Borana. Therefore, for effective implementation of education development programs there should be reciprocating collaboration between the researchers and the implementers. Researches should be geared towards addressing the problems and reach their beneficiaries through the implementers of programs in Borana zone.

### **Choice of Mode of Delivery**

Without making a difference among the people or geography, pastoralist communities face problems of access to education services (Devereux, 2006). The reasons given were partly their high mobility together with the low population density of arid areas, which make the delivery of public services logistically complex and more expensive than in better settled communities; but

partly because of the marginalization of pastoralists, and so have little power to influence government-spending. The pastoralists are not well represented politically.

According to the education research by Kratli (2001) in Turkana and Karamoja, the low and high enrolment of pastoralist to education needs to be diagnosed. In the pastoralists context many outsiders may consider low enrolment as lack of awareness- regardless of scrutinizing the appropriateness and availability of services; and the high enrollment rate is also taken as progress- still disregarding the risks of the people's involvement. However, the study urges any stakeholders, including politicians, have to contemplate and conduct a field work to develop appropriate mode of delivery, localize the curriculum and reform the school system.

There should be an agreement between the choice of mode of delivery for schooling and the objective of education to improve the people's life and to facilitate development. Accordingly, many countries investigate the thematic areas, targets, setting and mode of delivery of education (Carron and Bordia, 1985). For example, in Brazil education, though the formal education system embodies objectives, which are broader than those of the minimal curricula, the structure has remained virtually stagnant and dissociated from these objectives. Broad concern has been documented at this situation on the part of the ministry of education and culture. Here, basic education is defined not only as the sum of various levels of education from pre-school to secondary, but also as incorporating formal and non- formal approaches. Also educational activities were integrated to problems of health, nutrition and work and educational contents were related the following issues.

- √ Positive attitudes towards cooperation, solidarity, and the valuing of local and national culture.
- √ Functional literacy and basic mathematics;

- √ Scientific approaches to health, agriculture and productive activities in general,
- √ Basic knowledge required for social and civic participation.
- √ Consciousness rising.

Thus, strong data collection and research are recommended to analyze the thematic area and type of education that suite the target community. In addition, Carron and Bordia (1985) noted about the functionality of the work that it is necessary to define and visualize clearly how literacy can help change the life of the learner and the larger community. This idea holds true for the pastoralist community in Borana and elsewhere.

Accordingly at least five facts of functionality are readily evident:

- 1) Acquisition of basic skills of reading and writing so that writing words become a communication tool. Communication enhances people's demand of their needs and rights.
- 2) Acquisition of basic literacy skills which can be built upon and the learner can continue the process of learning and intellectual development on his/her own or through formal institutions. Basic education can be accessed through alternative means.
- 3) Applying literacy skills directly or indirectly in improving one's productive skills and income- earning potential. Thus, the learner can improve own life situation and contribute to education of others.
- 4) Generation of critical awareness of one's situation and the possibilities of changing these situations. Therefore, the problem solving capacity develops.
- 5) Moving from critical awareness and knowledge to individual and collective actions to change one's situation. The behavior change realized and social benefits maximized in a community demand. Such systematic approach helps to respond to evolving demands in a sustainable and chain like manner.

Thus, based on the above, it is important to note that literacy skills improve communication, productivity and positively change the scenario on the pastoralist communities like Borana. Education researches should be based on the above factors in order to contribute to practicable solutions of the pastoralists in Borana zone and generate positive change. They contribute as well to the philosophy of the Borana education.

## **2.5 Education and Development in Pastoralist Community**

According to Brown (1970), education is meant to create civilized and developed social order. Plato was known for his strong stand in this respect. Brown presented the following three educational ends that are related themes to an ideal citizenship as taken from Plato's *The Republic*.

- 1) The relation of individual to state;
- 2) Recognition of individual difference among citizens;
- 3) Education as the basis of the social order,

Brown elaborates further what Plato stated in the three themes. The first theme describes that every individual thinks that he/she is an integral part of the state, as arms and legs are integral parts of the body. In many countries the pastoralists are misrepresented as citizens of their own country. In an educated modern community, an individual is importantly considered as a citizen and part of the state (Brown 1970). Education makes a modern system, where the individual is the unit of the community, which is different from the fact in the Borana pastoralists. In the pastoral system the education should consider the contribution of an individual in a clan of the community. This concept can be equated to clan as an important unit of the traditional authority. Thus, to boost education and foster representation in authority in Borana, identifying the role of the clan is wise.

As to the second theme, every status begins as a community of “partners and helpers”, each doing what he is best fitted to do (Brown, 1970). This argument reflects the very essential end of education, which facilitates division of labor and collaboration, as builders, weavers, shoemakers, carpenters, etc. pastoral component has significant contribution. These make a complete whole of the citizens of a nation.

In this regard, studies showed that pastoralists have significant contribution to the national economy and trade balance. According to Kratli (2001) technical education in pastoralist people is very important to increase productivity of the sector. The education in the pastoralists includes the non-formal and more functional literacy and numeracy. It requires education and training to be available for the pastoralists to increase social network, building social capital, bring diversity, commence new necessities and utilize opportunities. In general it helps for self-realization.

Brown (1970) noted explained the third Plato’s theme that education is the basis of social order. In line with this, philosophers/political leaders in the authorities of the Borana should be educated persons and bear the responsibility to rule and educate their people. Through education they can set lasting and indivisible order. In strengthening this idea, Kratli (2001) confirmed that the responsibility that the authorities have at national and local level is to make sure that the level of literacy goes with enrollment to reach the pastoral neighborhoods, rather than focusing on the absolute number. This makes the role of the government as a facilitator of education development through promoting researches and introducing practicable approaches, especially in the underserved Borana pastoralist zone.

In addition to this, the Somali women expect the government to play a facilitative role in expanding education in their villages (Devereux, 2006). They considered as it is only education

that will keep people out of poverty. In a focus group discussions held with pastoralist women at *Gashamo* and *Shinile* districts, the report of Devereux (2006) presents why education became the pastoralists' first priority. Some of the findings revealed that;

- √ Education allows people to choose between more options in life.
- √ Nothing, even drought can take away what has been learnt.
- √ These days, there's no place for an illiterate person, even in pastoralism.
- √ Children should go to school to learn about themselves and the world, and the language of the world, beyond pastoralism.
- √ There should be a school in the vicinity to educate their little children, especially girls at appropriate age.
- √ Life is easier for educated people.

These pastoralist women in the Somali Region argued that education helps their people to be 'better pastoralists' and make better use of weather forecast and livestock.

Thus, the pastoralists in Ethiopia including the Borana zone have a keen interest in the education of their children, provided that it is in their vicinity and the education has relevance and solve their problems. From the above, one can infer that the education of the pastoralist Borana zone is essential to improving the livelihood condition of the people, if the responsible bodies conduct the proper investigation of the curriculum contents, the education system and the education has clear objective or philosophy. Thus, it is important to see how planners should design appropriate education system and mode of delivery that complies with the pastoralist situations in this study.

## **2.6 Policies and Strategies to Support Education Development;**

It was discussed (See section 2.5 above) about the importance of diagnosing the education of the pastoralists in line with the development issues of the people. Thus, it was noted that planners should know first about the pastoralist context and interest, environment and resources, way of life and the back bone of the economy as a confirmed livelihood system; and above all their privilege to make choice of life. As well, the role of the government as facilitator of development through ensuring the availability of appropriate services for all citizens was presented in detail. In this section, the role of policies, policy and strategy designers' are presented.

There are three policy areas, namely redistributive, allocational and developmental (Peterson, 1981 in Adler and Gardner, 1994). Developmental policies enhance the economic positions through designing and planning services of the people as their basic requirement, whereas the redistributive policies benefit low income residents through attempts to spread the services to far off and inaccessible areas. As well, the allocation policies are more or less neutral on the economic development and more focus on addressing certain group of people whose rights to services cannot be satisfied unless special considerations are designed in an inclusive manner.

Education as social service has been treated quite differently in terms of public support and funding. While public education is seen as a service that is provided to every child and is, thus, allocational in natural and social service, which have means tests and are designed to serve those in special need, and considered redistributive to address the education needs of people in those in underprivileged and underserved areas. Of course, education policies promote development when intended to improve productivity of people and efficiency of the livelihood system. The pastoralist education in Borana requires a redistributive policy for the people in the remote and underserved areas. Also the allocational policy serves those children in the formal settings, to

make it more inclusive and consider their special context I their education. Of course it is developmental when education institutions are established including urban and rural settings.

Whatever policies and implementation strategies are introduced in a given community, education development can be effective under certain prevailing supportive conditions. According to Watson (1984), the inter-related factors to progress in education include the influence of senior officials in the administration, the nature of the relationship between the government and the missions (NGOs, CBOs, private sectors, etc), the strength of the local economy, and the attitude of the community towards education. Here the slow-moving progress in education is adversely affected by the economic self- insufficiency.

Accordingly Anderson and Bowman (1965) explained that the general illiteracy was among the factors impeding development. Policy makers try to produce different policies, which could facilitate the equitable distribution of development and social services and that improve benefits of citizens. Therefore, best policy to success is through the spread of relevant education and knowledge that possibly will increase in labor productivity as the only means to erase poverty.

Furthermore, in the Ethiopian education context, the Institute of Educational Research (IER) was established in 1968, with the intention of putting together education policy decisions as causes of actions with trainings and research for the societal as well as economic development (IER, 2001). As it was stated in the other section of this review, the institute has done tremendous effort to produce different research findings, which focus on education as a basis for development and improvement, with special emphasis to the importance of research. Even if the purpose of this research is not to measure the extent of the utilization of the researches by the institution, it is good to mention as an example, and to show how research findings were distributed to the audience and practitioners, including policy makers. Thus, in line to this, the

research institute has conducted many conferences and produced educational proceedings, journals and other publications that could improve the working atmosphere through creating a knowledge source reference system.

The above discussions clearly revealed the importance of conducting research and utilization of the findings for pro-pastoralist policies and application in areas, like Borana zone, where people are deprived of their chance and rights to education.

## **2.7 Education in Pastoralist Areas of Ethiopia**

The development of the education sector plays a decisive role that can substantiate the ground for the improvement of the national political and economic system since recently. The education policy (TGE, 1994) supports the production and distribution of education to different group of people based on their socio political environment. The document gives special emphasis to regions and areas that were underserved and marginalized, like the pastoralists including the Borana people.

In addition to the Education and training policy, the third education sector development plan (ESDP-III) has clearly verified chosen strategies to alternative approaches to implement pastoralist education, in the areas where the participation rates are very small (FDRE, 2006). Among the approaches Alternative Basic Education (ABE), boarding schools and community based low-cost construction schooling centers are creating access to pastoralist children. Also the utilization of flexible calendar and paraprofessionals as facilitators are included in the guiding documents. All these efforts are taking place in Ethiopia and enable the people to acquire services from the policies.

With regard to supporting the provision of quality education that is easily reached to all pastoralist areas, it became important to design appropriate and comprehensive implementation

strategy, that objectively take into account the distinctive way of life related to the cultural, social, economic, environments and livelihood system of the pastoralist population (MOE, 2006). Definitely, the Ethiopian government learnt one fundamental lesson from its experiences that it is impossible to address the educational rights of the needy pastoralist children through one approach, formal schooling alone.

Thus, the employment of all feasible alternative modes of delivery to ensure increasing rate of enrollment and equity, and eventually realize the «Education for All » and the «Millennium Development » goals related to education of children, has become the current urgent task. For this reason, the government has developed and distributed to the stakeholders (usually NGOs and UN agencies) a strategic document for implementing and enhancing the pastoralist education. Different workshops and, meetings were held at Awash with stakeholders from all pastoralist regions. A task force was established to review and enrich the document. The final version of this strategic document to enhance and guide the implementation of the pastoralist education consist different articles to enhance primary and secondary education in the pastoralist areas, including Borana zone. The Amharic version of the document is produced (MOE, 2006).

Among the opportunities to work on the pastoralist education MOE (2006) sated in the strategic document are: -

- √ The decentralized administrative and education system and
- √ Prevalence of mutual partnership and coordination involving government and NGOs;
- √ The increasing activities of sense of ownership of schools in the communities.
- √ The prevalence of clear policy directions and strategies at federal level;
- √ The commencement of a federal special support board to pastoralist and agro-pastoralist regions including the education sector.

- √ The commencement of inter-regional cooperation in which pastoralist and agro-pastoralist regions receive technical support and benefit from the experiences of neighboring regions in various development sectors including the education;
- √ The designing and endorsement of five-year strategic plan including the education sector by pastoralist regions.
- √ The policy directions prevalent to encourage local and international NGOs to engaged in pastoralist education along with the government.
- √ The commencement of the Pastoralist Commission for Development Programs (PCDP), and different pastoralist forums,
- √ The Pastoralist Development Policy Initiative of AU, are among others.

The Oromia region has also produced different strategies to provide support and properly address the Borana zone education.

Despite the efforts of the federal government to provide pastoralists with quality education, national and regional studies indicate that not much has been achieved to this end. Besides, many consultative meetings, workshops and discussions with experts and officials of education bureaus of pastoralist regions were held on pastoralist education revealed that the education of the pastoralist community children has barriers. According to MOE (2006) some of these obstacles are related to;

- √ Capacity gap on the part of the majority of officials and professionals
- √ Professionals do not stay longer at their positions; resulting in shortage of qualified manpower
- √ Improper utilization of scarce resources;
- √ Rejecting alternative basic education in favor of formal education;

- √ Teachers' absenteeism and lack of commitment to their responsibilities;
- √ Absence of incentives for teachers in hardship areas;
- √ The community's fear of cultural deviation of children caused by the unknown education;
- √ Fear of abuse and departure from culture on send girls to school;
- √ Dropping-out rate caused by sporadic conflicts among different clans and the subsequent vulnerability of pastoralists;
- √ The parents and community demand of children's especially girls' labor in the various economic activities like household duties, watering animals, breaking firewood, etc;

The Ethiopia experience gave the picture of the status and the prevailing conditions to facilitate the progress of the pastoralist education at federal level. The federal government has produced different documents in this regard. The pastoralist education department was established in the federal Ministry of Education.

In addition, there are multiple international and local NGOs working on pastoralist education, organizing separate department and soliciting budgets. Also, these NGOs and the government have discussion forums aiming at integrating efforts, enhancing the success, avoiding duplication of resources and exchange good practices and lessons through working on the pastoralist education.

Therefore, as part of this initiative, the status of education development and utilization of research outcomes in the Borana zone can be evaluated from this perspective.

## **2.8 Other Countries Experience**

### **Education in Turkana- Kenya and Karamoja- Uganda**

The research entitled 'Educating Nomadic Herders out of Poverty, Culture, Education Pastoral livelihood in Turkana and Karamoja' by Kratli (2001) suggests designing the pastoralist

education in a very flexible and appropriate manner to the context of the community. In addition, it recommends access to university education, in disciplines focusing on the skills and knowledge of the pastoralist livelihood development, particularly those that may include specializations in the local and livelihood situations, rather than on the general curriculum of primary and secondary school. It was recommended that intensive studies to be conducted in all sub-sectors of the education of the pastoralist children by familiar, interested and competent scholars in the sector. The implementers are expected to find and implement these studies to realize education of the pastoralist children.

The following are some of the recommendations for the development of the pastoralist education in Turkana and Karamoja. These points can be associated to the Borana context.

- √ Support further studies and enhance utilization of outcomes to produce evidence based efficient education for the pastoralists that promote economic and environmental sustainability;
- √ Promote local language as medium of instruction for pre-school and basic education;
- √ Support adult learning and skill trainings and cross cultural events;
- √ Give attention to non formal education to develop into fully functional alternatives for the conventional formal school based learning;
- √ Update the national curriculum and incorporate the pastoralist context in local school textbooks;
- √ Produce local curriculum and text books for the pastoralists, which deals with their environment, culture, values, social and economic conditions, and incorporated with the national syllabi, etc;

- √ Creating special examination board to evaluate students performance in line to the appropriate alternative approaches;
- √ Strengthen funding schemes for pastoralist households and motivate them to send their children to school
- √ Provide support for and training in policy analysis and lobbying for those engaged in the pastoralist education;
- √ Provide distance courses supported by periodical meetings with a tutor (like in the Distance Learning Program in Mongolia);
- √ Support for girls' education

The Borana zone social and livelihood environment is similar to the people in the pastoralist Turkana and Karamoja areas. Therefore, most of the above issues that rose in the Kenya and Uganda hold true in the Borana context as well.

There is a precious opportunity to recast education to support, generate and diffuse social capital. Among others, the following were mentioned in a research on the Turkana and Karamoja pastoralists' education;

- √ Identify through research ways of magnifying the potential role of the education process for fostering pastoral social capital;
- √ Promote and support adult learning associations;
- √ Experiment with cross-ethnic school events (sporting competitions, ritualized racing competitions);

### **Education of Pastoralist Children in Different Countries**

Tent-schools, schools-on-wheels and various kinds of collapsible schools have been experimented within at least over the past fifty years, for example in Mauritania, Algeria, Iran

and Nigeria (Blanguernon, 1954; Varlet and Massumian, 1975, Udoh, 1982, in Kratli, 2000). Their experiences were considered to pave the way for many countries pastoralist education practices. The Iran experience was mentioned as the best and most successful in the world. The white tent mobile schools have worked out for more than four decades.

With the exception of Iran, mobile schools have performed far below expectations. In Nigeria, for example, after almost twenty years since the first attempts, today the 'mobile school system is sparingly used due to the enormity of problems that are associated with the model' (Kratli, 2000). To fit in to the mobility of the pastoralist communities in those countries, tents were also used as semi-stable structures that are moved seasonally or that simply can be moved at low cost if necessary.

A recent successful mobile pre-school education project in Mongolia uses *gers* (the white tents of the nomads) or even cars as mobile training centers during the summer. All these are collapsible and easily moveable structures. The costs for the structures are low and can be afforded by local governments in partnership with communities and the families. Teachers are also nomads, they move their families and stocks together with the group of households involved in pre-school education and are paid by the government for their work as teachers (MOSTEC, 2000; SCF, 2000b, in Kratli, 2000).

These and other global and regional experiences positively illustrated that research based interventions in bringing many pastoralist children to schools and sustainable positive change in the education of the countries. The participations are development oriented since the benefits were proved by external evaluators and programs continue with feasible approach for program delivery.

## Summary of the Literature Review

Research is the basis for development intervention in the pastoralist Borana community. Development interventions need to be preceded by research and analysis of situations on the ground. This is highly related to the prevailing situation in the pastoralist community. The following are highlights of the review.

- √ Milk is the link between the pastoralist children and the livestock. Good milk is a motivation and prerequisite to send children to school.
- √ Mobility of the people is way of life that need to studied and managed for the betterment of development interventions. Studies should consider the supportive conditions to make implementation of research findings effective. Mobility routes and destinations areas are known in the traditional management or customary system. This traditional institution helps for effective utilization of innovative interventions.
- √ There should be scenario analysis before allocating resource in the pastoralist areas including the Borana zone. It is important to start thinking centering the children and the livelihood of the people. Development planning process should pass through the following.
  - i. Continues process of study and research;
  - ii. Experience sharing between regions and adopt international experience;
  - iii. Pilot testing; synergy and advocacy to agencies and political leaders;
- √ In considering the utilization of research in pastoralist areas it is important to note the following contributing factors. The first is *collaboration of stakeholders*- which refers to the consorted effort of the consortium engaged in the zone. The second is the need to have clearly defined *education objective or philosophy*- which is the basis in convincing and wining the confidence of the target people. The community should feel that education is friendly to their indigenous norm and knowledge.

- √ It is also noted the need to have education that gives much emphasis to the community livelihood and environment development. The legacy of education from the urban and agricultural settings used to be applied to the people in the pastoralist areas. The community has developed fear instead of confidence to send the children especially girls to these schools.
- √ The third factor was the *choice of mode of delivery*. In the pastoralist community the education system has to be flexible, localized curriculum and should be given side by side to the conventional formal school system. In a mobile community every service has to be delivered in accordance to the mobility pattern of the people, besides the cost it requires. It is also important to consider the curriculum contents and learning tools.
- √ It is also noted to consider the people (clan) in the state, recognize individual difference among citizens and give value to education as the basis for social order. The pastoralists are component and vital part of the population, which should never be overlooked. Research should consider typical cases of the pastoralists.
- √ Policies and strategies should take in to consideration the special features of pastoralists before imposing ideas that could work for people in other settings. Otherwise, people in the pastoralist community will be frustrated and will not participate. Of course, policies do not merely originate from research findings. However, researches help to assess the prevalent and workable situations on the ground to inform policy developers. To do this, participatory approach is recommended in many studies.
- √ The good practices in Ethiopia and other countries are helpful to see what is working in the pastoralist Borana context. Utilization of research in the pastoralist areas around the world has significant contribution to compare the case in Borana.

Therefore, the education change and progress in the pastoralist Borana zone needs to be research based and the utilization of researches can be evaluated from the changes observed resulting from the knowledge, attitude and practice of the stakeholders (government and NGOs). In addition, increased coverage and school structures, enrollment and participation of girls, quality of children's learning and teachers/facilitators training, localization and contextual relevance of curriculum, mode of delivery and involvement of community in school activities and contribution to policy and strategy can exemplify the positive effects of the utilization of researches in Borana zone. This research will try to investigate the status of the above indicators in line with the research utilization in Borana zone.

## **Chapter Three**

### **3 Research Method**

#### **3.1 Research Design**

In this research, the researcher used pure qualitative method of study. Under qualitative research design the researcher utilized phenomenological and ethnographic techniques to analyze the data and reach in to conclusions. The status of utilization of researches and projects who implement research findings were analyzed and investigated using phenomenological enquiry. So that the condition under which projects implement research findings in their programs is presented in more detail. Data are collected taking in to consideration variation of assumptions and concepts. In this approach, variety of cases was considered and focus was made on the similarities and accordance of data of varied experience than emphasizing on the individual differences.

Also using the ethnographic enquiry, the Borana culture and the pastoralist scenario analysis was made in accordance to the individual experiences in the course of research outcome utilizations. In particular policy and livelihood issues have been investigated in line with the pastoralist group and results presented in this research.

Therefore, using the two qualitative research methods the researcher has tried to investigate the status of research outcomes utilization and the implications on the educational and cultural development of the Borana zone.

#### **3.2 Sample and Sampling Technique**

##### **Participants**

Participants of this study were researchers, program heads and technical experts as well as local government education officers and members of the community. They participated in interviews and focus group discussion (FGD). Researchers, program heads, technical experts and two district education bureau officers participated in interview. Eight individuals participated in

interviews were conducted. Also nine persons including education officers, technical experts and community members took part in the FGD. In addition, five key persons participated in personal discussions and gave useful information.

Five persons, who participated in interviews, were in Addis Ababa. The remaining three interview sessions were held in the Yabello, Liben and Bulehora towns.

The FGD was held in Yabello town, (on February 12, 2009). Native Borana elders, scholars, education officers and other key informants' were participated in the FGD. Also personal discussions were conducted with key community members at Bulehora and Liben. Personal diary and working documents were also used to strengthen the validity of information. The information from these sources were analyzed and presented as in the next chapter.

#### **Interviewees, FGD and Private Discussion Participants profile**

The study includes data collected from interviews, Focus Group discussion (FGD), private discussion and personal opinions during field observations. Therefore, the interview participants are referred in the discussion as R<sub>1</sub>, R<sub>2</sub> ....

- √ R<sub>1</sub> is a researcher, expatriate working in the pastoralist area and livelihood for long years. She has long experience in conducting research in the pastoralist areas internationally. She is acting as an advisor for many NGOs, working in the pastoralist areas of Ethiopia including Borana zone. She brought in to the study experiences and practices of many stakeholders and researchers in the areas.
- √ R<sub>2</sub> is an expatriate, who worked in pastoralist areas of Kenya, Uganda and Ethiopia. He has more than 26 years' profound knowledge and experience working on the pastoralist livelihood including the Borana development programs.

- √ R<sub>3</sub> is a native, born and brought up in the Borana zone that has studied, worked and developed his career in the pastoralist livelihood development, especially on Borana area. He has experience and knowledge of the education programs and participated in the studies and evaluation of projects.
- √ R<sub>4</sub> is an educationalist who worked in the region education bureau, education projects and who participated in many studies contributing to the education development in the country, including the Borana pastoralist education. He was one of the first implementers of the Mobile education in Ethiopia, in Borana zone.
- √ R<sub>5</sub> is a professional program person, who has long experience and knowledge of the projects implemented in Borana zone. He has experience of implementing, evaluating and reporting of many education projects undertaken in Borana zone. Still actively involved in the same work.
- √ R<sub>6</sub> and R<sub>7</sub> education supervisors working in Borana zone.
- √ R<sub>8</sub> is a Monitoring and Evaluation advisor for many of the projects implemented in the zone and who participate in KAP and Baseline studies.
- √ Participants of the FGD were nine persons from Bulehora (2), Arero (2), and Yabello (5). Three of them are women, and five of them are directly involved with education program implementations. The rest are persons working in education related organizations, and dwellers of the zone and native Borana members, who have closer look at the education and development issues.
- √ Private discussions were held with scholars who have high education and experience background in the Borana zone livelihood and education. These are presented in the literature as P<sub>1</sub> and P<sub>2</sub>.

√ Other participants of informal discussions held during the data collection process are also presented at different points, like at the Observer's Comment (OC).

### **Sampling Technique**

To investigate the status of research studies utilization in Borana zone, and to learn the implications on the development of education the researcher chose to undertake a qualitative research. In this study purposive sampling technique was utilized to select study participants. Also availability, critical, snowball and typical case sampling techniques were used. They were used in the research interchangeably to reach logical generalization of results.

During the study, the researcher found 39 studies conducted on education, health, culture, livestock marketing, gender and other livelihood areas. However, using availability case sampling 12 of these studies was selected for analysis.

Using the typical case sampling participants like key informants and project staffs were selected to qualitatively illustrate program issues. Also some generalized facts were identified from interview, private discussion and FGD participants. The critical case studies were used to conclude universal phenomenon, like 'if it happens here, it happens elsewhere' and Vice-versa (Patton, 2002).

Researchers and accessible stakeholders were included in the interview and private discussions in a snowballs' sampling technique. This approach helped the researcher to reach information rich individuals and organizations.

Hence, the consortium of local government, SC/US, CARE, ILRI, AFD, GTZ, SORDU, SOS-Sahel, and GOAL held in Borana zone engaged in the livelihood development of the zone were

identified as research funders, owners and implementers of the outcomes. Using availability case sampling technique the above organizations were involved in the research at through review of documents different points.

In addition to these illustrative case studies were used to highlight purposes and to balance the scope and depth, cases of formal and alternative schooling, issues of culture and girls' education, and demand of education in urban and rural settings of the Borana zone.

### **3.3 Data Gathering and Analysis Instruments**

#### **Data Collection Instruments**

The major data collection instruments were document review, in-depth interviews, field observation and FGD. Semi- structured questions were used to collect data from key informants in interviews and FGD. Unstructured questions were utilized during private talks with information rich individuals.

A checklist was used to generate and taxonomically tabulate information from research documents (see Appendix A). Then the interview questions were developed based on the information from the tabulated data (See Appendix B and C). The FGD questions and probing questions developed to fill the information gap from the two steps (See Appendix D). The FGD questions focused on issues needed to validate the information from document reviews and interviews.

Field observations were conducted around project impact areas, beneficiaries and achievements due to research/ study utilization. Checklist and photo camera were used during field observation.

## **Analysis of Data**

Qualitative data were collected during the study process. The data from documents, interviews and FGD were categorized and analyzed. The degrees of relevance of the studies utilization for educational and cultural development in line with the context of the pastoralist Borana community were investigated.

## **3.4 Procedures**

The study started with identifying research documents on education, health, economy, culture, and other issues related to educational and cultural development in Borana zone. Then outcome level studies were selected. Thus, the number of research documents became twelve.

Then a tool developed to review documents in different organizations in Addis Ababa. The researcher used letters from the university to access documents in different organizations and libraries. However, the pilot test showed the insufficiency of data from documents at Addis Ababa level. Based on the pilot study necessary adjustments that include choice of tools were made.

Thus, using snowball technique documents identified and reviewed by means of a checklist. Then developed interview tools and conducted interview sessions with project officers in the research sites at Addis and field level. The results also indicated the importance of including private discussions with individuals in Borana area.

The next step was data collection using interview, field observation and FGD. All interviews were undertaken by the researcher. However, two data assessors were hired co-facilitators of FGD and data encoders. They were taking notes during the FGD and helped in translating the local terms of the Borana Oromo dialect at Yabello.

Transcription and data entry took place every night or immediately after interviews and FGD. Then data was entered into computers, cross checked and interpreted. The next step was putting the findings, conclusions and recommendations into writing; and producing the draft report.

## **Chapter Four**

### **4 Data Presentation and Analysis**

#### **4.1 Researches and Studies in Borana Zone**

Different researches have been conducted in Borana zone. Few of these studies have focused on education. Different interest groups like individual researchers, students, organizations and government bodies conducted the researches and studies. For the purpose of this study, the researcher tried to obtain them through communicating different organizations, researchers and other individuals. Most of the studies are not published. They are available in soft copies. The researcher found twenty nine studies in soft copies during the pilot test from one of the interviewees. The researcher also found seven of the researches and studies in hard copies in libraries of some of the organizations such as SC/US livelihood project, the Education Library at Addis Ababa University. As well three hard copies were found in the hands of individuals.

The available works are reviewed and discussed in the next sections. The data obtained from documents are presented in a table (see, Page 101). In reviewing the works, first the studies are classified by owners or the sponsor organizations and researchers. Then the utilization and implications are discussed in detail.

#### **Research Related to Education in Borana Livelihood Development**

Many researchers appeared to be concerned with the actions to be taken for enhancing educational development in the Borana zone. Accordingly, Coppock (1994) noted that perceived impacts of interventions in the southern rangelands since 1960s made use of a systems approach combined with commodity-based research and insights derived from local development experience. He argued that past interventions had value by helping delay an inevitable decline of the production system that ultimately results from rapid growth of human population that is

dependent on a finite resource base. This implies the need for methodical approach to tackle the challenges related to population pressure in the Borana area.

In any livelihood system, people strive to tackle their problems and sustain life, if not development. Especially in situations like Borana the pastoralist livelihood system is a system at risk. Thus, the community at all levels tries to come out of the crisis through different coping mechanisms. In line with this, the appropriate development philosophies for the Borana are primarily to secure food and creating alternative livelihood as a coping mechanism; the other is making informed choices for a better life-style. Coppock (1994) clearly noted that education has made such choices possible in addition to rural urban development. Also this happens through giving emphasis to the role of education in making an informed decision whether to stay or go out of the livelihood.

Implicit to development strategy is the promotion of system sustainability. For that reason, system sustainability indices suggest that milk is the measure of food security while the number of animals determines economic growth in the durable assets. It is also difficult to see the children outside the good harvest of the livestock products, like milk, as the main food for pastoralist community. Hence the link between the animals and children is just milk (SC/US, 2007) and, regarding children in the Borana community, the above statements show that milk is assurance for their education.

In general, to achieve appropriate development impact involves knowing the status of any given system at any point in time. A theory of local system dynamics may be unusual compared to previous system theories because; it presents a very dynamic view of system interactions and the most important interaction can only be understood if one sees that system forces act across disciplines. For example (in pastoralist Borana context), stocking rate influences milk production

per head and per hectare and milk production influences social and economic behavior of households (Coppock, 1994). The interactions can shift from year to year depending on rainfall and other external events.

In this regard, knowledge of traditional, social and economic values allows one to see why development interventions produced little results. According to Solomon (2008), resisting innovative practices of research findings before coming in to effect was the weakness of the politicians including educators in Ethiopia. However, the importance of utilization of systems-oriented education for people involved in research requires capabilities to deal with challenges.

The policies and procedures declared to bring change in the pastoralist area like Borana need in-depth analysis of the prevailing situation. The support of policies and procedures are important to promote utilization of research in the pastoralist education development.

A study of technical policy interventions strongly suggests that most of the limitations of effective implementation lie outside, not within, the pastoralist system. Thus, the pastoralist Borana education development needs adequate investigation of the content to fit in to the livelihood. This has to be backed by policy and implementation strategies, in the local context (Coppock, 1994). The research clearly confirmed the positive relationship between researches and utilization of findings in the Borana pastoralist education.

### **Researches of Socio-economic Challenges of the Education in Borana Zone**

The pastoralist Borana community can be viewed as consisting of those residing in urban settings, in the periphery of towns and those who are deep in the rural areas. In the modern world, the pastoralist Boran looks for opportunities to improve their conditions. The alternative livelihood especially for those who dwell in the sub-urban areas, for increasingly migrating young males engaged in daily income, creates chaos bringing about in the area a massive labor

crisis to hold the livestock production. Ultimately, the trend creates fear to intergenerational transfer of social customs, increased burden on women and reservations to sending children to school. The good thing is that, elders acknowledge the increasing importance of education for their youth (Coppock 1994).

Most of the above challenges pertain to the poor and those who dwell near the towns in Borana zone (see Box 1: Case in Gobicha, Page 1). Parents look up on child labor and generate alternative income. Therefore, there is conflict of interest between the child's right and the families' expectation. Unlike families expectations, the rate of immigration for better life that the children anticipate from outside continues. Of course, compared to their fathers and forefathers, they will face more challenges in gaining livestock wealth (Coppock, 1994). Investing on improving the education of the pastoralist Borana children improves the livelihood and system productivity.

According to the report of ADB and UNESCO (2005), the problem of access in the context of the pastoralists include issues like housing for those who lag behind, inaccessibility of 'middle' schools, scarcity of teachers, and education materials like textbooks. The report further noted that the Borana parents do not send their children to school, because of lack of school lunch and inability to pay for their food and shelter when the students go to the next level of schooling. Apart from this, Bishop (1993 as cited in Teffera, 2001) noted that education in Iran is free and school materials like textbooks, exercise books and supplies are distributed freely to the pastoralist/nomadic people and children. The researches indicated that the issues of children in such situations can be addressed through utilization of appropriately studied and designed education in the context of their livelihood.

## **Researches on the Status of Education in Borana Zone**

Save the Children-USA and CARE International in Ethiopia conducted a Knowledge, Attitude and Practice (KAP) survey for the BESOI/SCOPE project in four regions of Ethiopia; namely Oromia, Gambela, Somali and Afar in 2003. In Oromia regional state, all zones including Borana were included in the study. In Borana zone, three sample districts were included out of the six. Yabello, Dire and Arero districts were targets of the study. The study was conducted in 8 schools out of the target 52 schools. The informants or participants were 52 teachers, 7 principals, 9 district education officials, 75 community members and 60 students. Data were collected for the study using questionnaires, interviews and document review.

The study gives a general overview of the Borana zone and the status of education programs implementation using some basic indicators. The study made comparison of the students participating in school feeding programs against those who do not and found that those who participate are better in terms of health and school participation than the others. According to the findings, only five percent of girls ever enrolled in schools. The district education officials were involved in improving access and increasing enrollment, especially in girls' participation.

The officials also provide support to the schools on areas of documentation, lesson planning and implementation, evaluation and disciplining. However, the study shows that the officials had problems conducting periodic supervision and monitoring support for the schools in their respective district.

In addition, the report shows that the schools in Borana zone have a shortage of textbooks, qualified teachers, furniture, teaching materials, reference books and libraries, playground materials and other facilities like separate and functional latrines, potable water, and fencing. Furthermore, most classrooms were dark, dusty and suffocated.

The parents' participation in the school administration was very poor. The SMCs in the schools do not have good understanding of their roles and responsibilities. As a result, they did not participate in school management and mobilization of their community. The community participation in Borana zone schools was in its infancy.

Another basic finding of the KAP concerns the major barriers of the girls' education. The other challenge was the cultural constraints on the girls' education. Therefore, the KAP on girls' education in Borana zone was characterized by low participation and high dropout rate.

In line with this, the education system of the pastoralist community children in Borana was characterized by low participation, inflexibility of curriculum, incompatible school calendar and daily school time, lack of school water, absence of functional and separate latrines, and poor school- community partnership (Teffera, 2001). Also, the schools have shortage of textbooks, sport materials and play grounds, furniture, trained and committed teachers.

The other issue, which was given emphasis in the study, was resource availability and allocation for school development. In this regard, the KAP study depicts the availability of construction wood, sand and human labor. Livestock is the high potential asset in the community. These were the assets in the community, which can be used as a matching fund for school development. The following are some of the recommended actions by the KAP study to improve conditions of the schools and bring about education development in Borana zone.

- √ Improve the enrollment rate of the rural children or herders, especially the girls' participation through providing special support;
- √ Improve the teachers' quality through in-service trainings;

- √ Fulfill school facilities; provide teaching and school materials, create child friendly school environment especially to enhance girls' participation;
- √ Conduct community awareness and establish community committees like PTA and enhance community ownership of schools;
- √ Establish accommodation like hostels and boarding for students who go to distant schools;

### **Research on the Effect of Culture on Education in Borana Zone**

Culture is one of the factors contributing to the free interaction and exercising rights of citizens.

In many cultures children and women, especially girls are not getting the maximum out of the

#### **Box 1: Case in Gobicha**

Gobicha is a small village, about five kilometers from the town of Liben in the former Borana zone of the Oromia region. The dwellers of Gobicha are dominantly Borana and there are others, like Garri and Gujji. Their basic income source is from the selling of firewood and few of them earn their living through daily labor in Libentown (Grhan, 2001).

The study showed that only about ten percent of adults in Gobicha have attended school. Similarly, the report underlines the importance of formal education for the children in Gobicha and the surrounding, since they are in a trend of transforming into urban economy. Grhan further noted that not all children had the opportunity to go to school, since their family could not afford their school expenses; in addition, the older children especially the girls, look after their younger siblings, when their parents are away from home.

In a characteristic household of the Gobicha, one or two children (normally boys) go to the government school. Thus, only 23% of children of school age attended government school. Children from the poorer families usually go to attend Koranic school. Although it appears that teachers often waive the fees, the cost of books, writing material and clothes alone was enough to put schooling out of reach for the majority of children from the poor families.

Also, the medium of instruction is a challenge. The Garri returnees' children from Somalia to Gobicha repatriated by UNHCR are not going to a school in Oromiffa language. Due to these and other problems prevalent in Gobicha, the majority of children do not go to school.

*By: Grhan, in 2001*

OC: Site observation and private discussions with elders in the village and in Liben town confirmed the students can go to schools in Oromiffaa and in Somali language. The Garri children learn their language. However, no one knew the research by Grhan existed.

February 15, 2009

benefits. According to a study by Teffera (2001) culture plays significant role in hindering the participation of girls in education. However, it is their development right. The KAP study conducted by SC/US also confirmed that early marriage, undervaluing of girls' education, higher workload, and distance of schools so that fear of harassment and sexual abuse on girls and absence of role models were some of the factors that hindered girls' education. Thus, the study confirmed that the Borana community children have cultural constraints to education such as early and unmatched marriage (marriage of a teenage girl to an old man).

Among the other issues that contribute to the poor participation of children in education and sharing benefits from social services in pastoralist Borana areas are tribal conflict and food crisis. Conflict with neighboring ethnic groups, recurrent drought and lack of integration of efforts of the government and non-government organizations in the implementation of appropriate education programs identified as factors hindering the education of the pastoralist children in Borana zone (Teffera, 2001). They are causes for evacuation of families from their villages and closing of school. Most of these children do not return to school when the conflict is over.

In addition to this, a research related to culture, which was conducted on gender in Borana zone by Ridgewell and Flintan (2007) investigated the status of women and girls in the community. This research was funded by CARE- ENABLE Project and SOS-Sahel, in Yabello in 2007. According to this study, the former project implemented in the Borana community 'changed' the situation availing life skills trainings and income generating schemes for women, like beadwork. In order for this to happen, it confirmed the need for basic education. If the women get basic education and basic skills, especially mothers, get alternate means of income to support the

education of their children. Alternative incomes are subsidiary to cover household costs of mothers in their role of administering family expenses including tuition.

In support of mothers' responsibility a credit scheme has enabled them to send both boys and girls to school, not just one child per household. The study noted that empowering the women with similar schemes enables them to support the education of their children.

The study also recommended different livelihood related capacity-building actions. For example, the importance of education for the purposes of creditworthiness, confidence and to enable the women to work in their executive committees without corruption got emphasis. The research gave high value to the importance of the women's economic capacity to tackle the cultural barriers and support their children are education. It indirectly gives much emphasis to the value that education of the women has in tackling cultural barriers and building their confidence.

In addition to this, the study underlines the importance of development services like communications, electricity, transportation, and social services, like education, health and the need for integration with complementary markets and diversification of opportunities. It also gives emphasis to the need for strengthening the Borana socio-economic development and livelihoods by improving access to quality education. Education is viewed as an essential means for the development and modernization of the children.

Another point discussed in the research, in relation to culture that hinders girls' participation in the available social services is the workload. The Borana girls, like their mothers, are responsible to everyday household tasks and therefore, travel up to four hours to fetch water (equivalent to traveling two ways more than 20 kilometers), engage in the tedious watering of animals and grass collection activities. This is a challenge to the girls' education. However, the good thing is

the gender division of labor is shared somehow with the men over recent years. It is noted that this is the effect of education in a family and evolving economic empowerment of women.

Ridgewell and Flintan (2007) also noted those cultural changes as positive in terms of lobbying market crafts and other tourist infrastructures, as long as they support children's education. Other studies also noted that there is no abduction in the Borana culture, though there is unmatched marriage. Thus, the study recommends implementation of research to identify positive values in the culture and use these for education development of the boys and girls in Borana zone.

### **Implication of Education for Improving Livestock Production**

Boosting livestock productivity requires a good livestock management and handling system. This in turn requires improved technological support. In another development, a study conducted by PARIMA/ENABLE on livestock markets of Oromia Region, CARE (2007) recommended the significance of education and training of the community to enhance participation in livestock marketing. The study also underlines the need for the development of the 'intellectual capital stock' for the livestock market development. Through educating the pastoralist Boran, the study confirms that the annual livestock off-take increases to over the existing level of household basic requirement. This situation may help the pastoralists to keep cash capital and escape the loss of cattle due to the recurrent drought.

Thus, the study strongly recommends additional investment for boosting the human capital at higher priority, in order to make maximum utilization of the existing potential resource. In Borana, the community is bound to the highly unified and proven traditional management system called the Gada. In this regard, the study suggests using the long standing and most reliable customary institutions of the community at their supreme Gumi-Gayo (general assembly), which is held every eight years.

### **Pro-Borana Policies and Strategies for Education of the People**

The Ethiopian government defines poverty in terms of the ability to get 2200kcal to an adult per day, which costs about \$0.20 per day, (1.77 Birr per day, 648 birr per year, according to the 1995 prices). Considering the adjusted estimate of expenditure for the food and non-food items, the cost becomes birr 1075 in 1995/96 (FDRE, 2002). This shows the national situation of food crisis.

When it comes to Borana, the average cash income (dry season) from livestock products is \$131 (Jed, 2006); the average household income of people in Borana and neighboring Afer and Liben zones was \$159 (SC-USA, 2003; in Jed 2006). Accordingly, the average cash income ranges from US\$45 to US\$217 and to US\$382 for the poor, intermediate and wealthy people, respectively. The aggregate of income, commercial plus sustainable production, averages US\$975, which is 95% from livestock. This shows clearly that the average household in Borana is pastoralist rather than agro-pastorals with only less than 1% of crop production (Coppock, 1994).

Thus, the actions that may be designed and implemented in the context of the pastoralist are also true for the Borana people. In line with this, there are strategic plans and policies that are directed toward developmental interventions in Borana livelihood. All the policies are produced by the federal government. Some of these policies are pro-Borana livelihood and education.

For example, the Sustainable Development for Poverty Reduction (SDPR) strategic development plan for the pastoralist areas states that the basic problems of the pastoralists (including the Borana community) are poor facilities, like education services, because of mobility and absence of road and information (FDRE, 2002). However, the document blames people's mobility as hindering social services. But mobility by itself has pattern and management, which helps to

facilitate services. Corresponding to this, the ETP asserts the right of citizens to education as means of alleviating poverty and bringing about sustainable positive change and development (TGE, 1994). The aforementioned documents, one way or another, underline the importance of education in reduction of poverty that emanates from illiteracy.

The three documents of the Education Sector Development Plans (ESDP I, II, and III) noted the road-map to enhance the education participation of the pastoralist community children through construction of low-cost or one to two classroom schools, introducing multi-grade classrooms, localizing curriculum, introducing ABEC and mobile mode of delivery (MOE-ETHIOPIA, 1999, 2002, 2005). Further to the pastoralist context, ESDP III stated that TTIs should organize trainings of paraprofessional facilitators, and to provide pre and on the job trainings (MOE-Ethiopia, 2006). Now, TTIs are transformed to colleges and produce teachers at diploma level.

The development plan, cognizant of the major issues and problems confronting the sector, sets the following goals. To produce good citizens and achieve universal primary education through expanding coverage of equitable quality primary education are among others (FDRE, 2002). Among the strategies designed to implement in the pastoralist areas, including Borana, were building boarding schools and hostels, in addition to establishing low cost schools and multi-grade village schools and strengthen non-formal education programs as alternative routes (MOE-ETHIOPIA, 2006). In terms of budget, the primary school education has the highest priority with 41.7% in the plan year 2002. The above strategies are very basic to the development of education in the Borana zone.

The African Development Bank (ADB) and UNESCO Synthesized (2005) report on the Education of the Nomadic People of East Africa, considered mobility as the cause, makes the pastoralist Borana “poorer and marginalized” than the rural poor people in the other sedentary

livelihoods. According to this report, the education participation of the pastoralist people including the Borana was 10-47% and this implies that the situation is difficult to realize EFA or UPE goals in 2015. The existing statistics show a GER which is more than 72%, according to the zone report, (2007). The EFA strategies and the UPE by 2015 are at risk of attainment, given the above figures.

Another challenge in the zone is high turnover of teachers (see Box 2: Teachers' Case, Page 1) from their location of duty because of the absence of appropriate policies and supporting strategies to motivate them with proper remuneration system. Teachers request a fair salary scale and other benefits that can compensate the hardship in the hot, remote and difficult to reach areas of the pastoralists. The teachers compare what they get with those at relatively better-off areas and ask for compensation. Usually their requests do not get answered and they choose to quit and depart. Because of lack of development infrastructures, delay of salary and failure to consider special incentives for teachers at distant village schools, most of them are reluctant to continue teaching in pastoralist areas or do not want to go in these areas to begin with.

#### **Studies on Options to Deliver Education in Borana Pastoralist Area**

Many program developers and educationalists recommend mobile schools for the pastoralist community children, following their context and mobility pattern. However, unless adequately studied, mobile school has its own problem. One of the problems could be that teachers stay with those children who are left behind the movers. According to ADB and UNESCO (2005), the second challenge mentioned was the issue of failure to integrate with people in other livelihood, which is one of the purposes of education. However, according to the Philippines experience, (Lasam, 1990, as cited in Teffera, 2001), the remote and deprived areas were given attention, through mobile tent schools as alternative schools to the nomadic communities, displaced people and ethnic minorities, who are similar to those in Borana zone.

Contrary to the integration, the risk of inclusion of ‘educationally disadvantaged’ pastoralist children into a national education system need to analyze the systems and policies (a) the integration of pastoralist children within their own household’s economy; (b) the causes of under-enrollment; and (c) the causes of the marginalization of the pastoralists at social, economic, and political level. Failing to do so, the mixing of the urban rural children (inclusion) may do more harm than good, resulting in further marginalization and disempowerment (SCF, 2000; Dyer and Choksi, 1997a, in Krätli, 2000). Here the argument supports that mobile schooling can benefit the pastoralist children in Borana context. Since the communities are moving together with their school age children between the defined mobility roots, education is necessary for the children.

The ADB and UNESCO (2005) recommend increase in investment on schools through concerted efforts of GOs and NGOs in partnership with the community. The study also recommended construction of low cost schools in areas of potential settlement for enhancing access and enrolment, school feeding programs of WFP, and introducing the pastoralist development issues in the teachers’ training curricula of the TTIs.

## 4.2 Analysis of Data from Interviews

### Types and Status of Researches in Borana Zone

There are different studies and researches conducted in Borana zone. Some were on the livelihood while others were on social and cultural issues. Of course, few of these were conducted on the education of the pastoralist people in Borana zone. The interviews and FGD (held on February 12, 2009) with researchers, heads of implementing organization, experts and native members of the Borana community have confirmed that a variety of research has been conducted in the zone. The personal discussions and site observations also confirm that this is the case.

However, the types and issues raised, their relevance and utilization of the research, were the questions posed to these participants. As the sample studies indicate (see page,99), most of the education issues were raised in research conducted on the Borana livelihood, economies, culture and social development. There are also few studies conducted by organizations and individuals on education of the Borana people. Many of the researchers have completed their studies and submitted to the sponsors, funding organizations or to the institutes who have interest on the

#### **Box 2: Teachers' Case**

Teachers in remote areas of the Borana zone were heard complaining about their salaries not paid on time. They sent delegated teachers (usually principals) who stay a couple of weeks until there is transport to the villages or they walk back. The messengers are expected to procure food and other shopping items as well.

During this time children do not get education. For distant schools and teachers, like those at *Galesa Inchini, Horbatie, Baya Gundi, Hobok, Golbo, Saritie, Dilo*, etc the problem is agonizing.

Regarding shelter there is no option. Female teachers have more serious challenges than the male ones. Compared to their importance as role models, nothing is done to encourage them. Thus, most of the teachers, especially females, in these schools leave after serving for a maximum of one year.

Observer's Diary  
November 2006

thematic areas. Thus, most of the studies were produced and are in the hands of the donors.

Moreover, some of these research owners/possessors or sponsors are implementing agencies. For example, R<sub>1</sub> is a researcher, who conducted a study on gender and pastoralist livelihood development. There are some points in the study emphasizing that education of the women is significant to promote women's participation in their own issues (see above, page 54). With her research associate, she conducted the study for SOS Sahel. The study was completed and submitted to the sponsor organization. However, it is not implemented. It did not reach the hands of many users and beneficiaries.

In another session, R<sub>2</sub> said that his organization (Save the Children- USA) has conducted many studies on the Borana livelihood, which include development of the people's social services, improvement of the natural resource and the enhancement of the utilization of the livestock and promoting appropriate education to pastoralist livelihood. The studies were conducted for the purpose of the LEAP project proposal development which was later funded by USAID implemented in Borana and neighboring zones. It was an integrated program of education with other livelihood development issues. Under the LEAP project, the education of the pastoralist people was given priority including budget allocation. The study was implemented and the report disseminated to government offices, NGOs and the community. The program was evaluated at different phases of the project and the outcome was presented for Africa regional pastoralist education conferences.

Another study pertaining to the Borana zone was the one conducted by BESOI/SCOPE project, as a KAP survey Table II, Page 100. This study was conducted, like in the LEAP case, as a baseline for project implementation. The study showed the status of education development in the zone. The findings were utilized to direct the progress of the BESOI/SCOPE project.

According to R<sub>3</sub>, R<sub>5</sub> and R<sub>6</sub> the stated indicators helped to develop tools, collect data and served as baseline that helps to set planned target, to compare future progress and achievement. This was confirmed further, during the FGD held at Yabello and data obtained from interview held with the former monitoring and evaluation coordinator.

Of course, some of the studies conducted in the zone did not reach the implementers and other people, who are interested in seeing them, because they are at their preliminary stage. Such studies remain in the hands of the researchers and are not printed or published. Some of these studies reached implementers through unconventional/verbal means and not in the form of documents. For example, the interview with R<sub>4</sub> verified that when the mobile education project was implemented in Borana zone it was studied but was in the hands of those people who studied it. A personal discussion with P<sub>1</sub> indicated that the study is somewhere in the MOE or UNICEF's archive, but there was a study conducted to implement mobile education in Liben rural villages. UNICEF was a partner in the study and implementation of the project, through allocating one person/ consultant and sufficient budget.

**OC 1:**

*The effort exerted by the researcher to find the study was not successful. Even the participants could not tress the researchers' proposal for the implementation.*

Similarly, participants in the FGD noted that there are many studies conducted in Borana zone on different thematic areas, including education. However, most of them are left on shelves of different individuals and institutions. The FGD participants and personal discussions confirm that many of the implementation of programs in the Borana zone is not backed by adequate research findings.

All participants of the interview and FGD agree that many NGOs in the zone utilize studies outcomes like baselines and KAP surveys. These baselines lack far-sightedness, since they were conducted after project designs were completed. However, it is good to give emphasis to the researches before choosing the program and designing the project.

### **Rationale to Utilize Research to Education Development in Borana**

The social services including education and health in the pastoralist areas are at the stage of infancy. Many development issues in the area need much emphasis. The people are marginalized and underserved. Therefore, many development programs necessitate the utilization of research undertakings in the pastoralist area, apart from impositions of development ideas and policies. The same holds to the Borana pastoralist community.

In an interview with R<sub>1</sub> it was understood that many of the cultural and livelihood issues and concerns of the Borana community are undiscovered. The interviewees agreed that undertaking in-depth studies is compulsory before proposing any solution for the Borana people. In line with this, R<sub>2</sub> underlines that researches are important to integrate proposed development programs to the Borana pastoralist communities. He highlights the contribution of application of findings of the researches before implementation of any program. According to his explanation, the researches help to positively influence the authorities' thinking, appropriate program design and suitable program funding of the interventions. Moreover, R<sub>4</sub> explained that researches help to lead the program to the intended target through convincing the program implementers, designers and managers.

In addition to this, participants of the FGD agreed on the importance of studies in different fields and integration of programs. For example, they mentioned that livelihood improvement cannot be effective unless it is backed by education. And the content of the education should incorporate

the people's main interest, which is their livelihood. The participants agree that relevance of education is associated with the level of integration to the livelihood, which is only possible through research. According to a personal discussion with P<sub>2</sub>, an educated member of the community learnt that the customary system and indigenous knowledge of the Borana community is an ocean of wisdom, which deserves in-depth study and investigation, especially when it comes to the education of children.

Of course, as the studies in the previous section indicate, the existing education of the Borana people is not about the livelihood, social and economic environment, and does not deal with the development issues of the people. Moreover, it needs to be localized and identify the interest of the children. To this end, research based interventions on education and other sectors are very important.

The aforementioned discussions show that the existing researches and those which will be conducted in the future enhance the relevance of education. This is achievable through utilization of the studies for incorporation of the livelihood issues in the education. Furthermore, the utilization of research in the education of the Borana zone improves the cultural and social values of the community.

### **Research Based Pastoralist Education in Borana Culture**

Researches on education of the Borana community before program design contribute to the smooth and effective implementation of programs in pastoralist areas. But what is the significance of utilizing research based education in the pastoralist Borana culture? The interviewees provided their views in response to this question.

The studies showed that the Borana culture and social environment are different from the other areas. In this connection, R2 suggests that model education of the Borana community is different

from the other areas in its content, structure, mode of delivery and relevance. First of all, Borana has strong values and norms that are distinguishable from the others. Secondly, the Borana pastoralist has its own coping mechanism and early warning system to come out of natural and non-natural disasters. These are totally different from the people in other livelihood, like in agriculture. Thirdly, the people geography, living conditions, culture, tradition and economic base have to be included in the curriculum materials. Therefore, reviewing the content and utilization of findings in the curriculum improvement contributes in building the children's confidence.

The other reason for making the education research based is that the girls' issues in Borana require special consideration. For example, girls' education in Borana has many obstacles. The culture gives much 'attention' to the girls and women. Therefore, the research should identify the opportunities for the promotion of girls' education through overcoming the hindering forces.

According to the FGD, significance of the research for educational intervention in relation to the Borana pastoralists' culture is the need to have real change than the superficiality of results. For example, enrollment may increase in some schools. However, there are still many school age children especially girls, outside school. Also many children are traveling long distances for schooling. Research can identify the paradox between the mass enrollment, and high dropout as well as those who are out of school.

In addition, in a personal discussion with a native scholar P<sub>2</sub>, research based interventions in Borana community help for sustainable program. The sustainability of development ensures the services continuity and improvement of facilities. People develop trust in the institution and become motivated to participate or do more. For example, a school system will continue serving the children, and grows to a higher level based on the demand, as long as the people are there.

Thus, the education program will continue and children will go to school, even if the project period is over.

The other point is benefit continuity. That is, if the school system is sustained, the targets benefit also continues gradually increasing in scope and depth. Therefore, in research based interventions, schools will be constructed and curriculum and other inputs will be facilitated centering on the child. Teachers get standard training and remuneration and the school follows a flexible calendar including daily school hours. Thus, the programs address the rights of the children through upgrading the school system and the education development becomes more balanced and culture friendly.

In short, the participants of the interview agree that although, education is given in the zone and gradually growing, there is much to be done to make it research based and culture friendly. As long as children, especially girls, are outside school, one can not completely say that the attitudes and practices of the people changed to support children's education. Therefore, utilization of participatory research is vital in implementing education programs, in a culturally sensitive and traditionally tight community like Borana.

### **Research and Development in Borana**

The implementation of educational research has contribution to the development of people and the zone. For example, the pastoralist education is the result of many international studies, exchange of experiences and evaluations of programs. Similarly, implementing research results helps the success and improvement of the education programs in the Borana zone.

In Borana many projects including education were implemented without conducting in-depth research assessment. However there are some projects, which were implemented based on the studies conducted in the zone. R<sub>2</sub> agrees that his project conducted in-depth study to implement ABE in Borana community integrated with other livelihood programs. R<sub>2</sub> and R<sub>5</sub> asserted that the project success has been confirmed by external midterm and terminal reviews. In addition, one can see the outcome that many students are schooling in those ABE centers, some of which are transformed in to full primary and first cycle primary schools after they were handed over to the government.

Education can bring the needed positive change in the people's life, livelihood and economy, if the relevance of the education is ensured. Such education creates link between the indigenous knowledge and science and technology. According to the interview with R<sub>1</sub>, education can be a cause for the modernization of people if the education can contribute to the productivity of the existing livelihood. Thus, in a pastoralist Borana community, utilization of research in education can improve human and animal's health service facilities, strengthen child caring and good parenting practices, and contribute to the betterment of their income.

Another point which rose in relation to the contribution of educational research in Borana development concerns producing independent and confidential social capital, which assertively represent the interests of the Borana community in the political and other decision-making positions or authorities. R<sub>2</sub> does not agree with the purpose of education to modernization. To R<sub>2</sub>, education of the Borana children primarily contributes to the fulfillment of the child's potential. When someone's potential is fulfilled, one can make a choice between options and make informed decisions. For this purpose, R<sub>5</sub> emphasizes the need to identify thematic areas of the curriculum through executing research.

Furthermore, the curriculum experts and education designers should think about the interest and the facts prevailing in the child and the environment to fulfill the child's potential. R<sub>4</sub> also agreed that studying the context in Borana is vital for designing education that can promote sustainable change. This helps children's rights to basic education in their own Borana context.

The experts working on education at the federal and regional level have limited knowledge of the Borana pastoralist livelihood and way of life. They do not ask relevant question; why the Borans are doing what they are doing. Unfortunately some of these types of authorities are strategic level decision makers. For example, considering mobility as a challenge to the development in Borana education, they simply recommend sedentary life, like urban settlement, concentration around farms, water points, and road and hill sides. They expect education to play this role.

The authorities think that the legacy of the urban education works in the Borana pastoralist community. According to R<sub>2</sub> this assumption is dangerous for the people and their livelihood. Supporting this, R<sub>5</sub> noted that development of the system can come without violating the proven pastoralist way of living. This implies that development is the means to improve service in mobility, rather than become a reason for replacing it with sedentary livelihood.

Moreover, R<sub>2</sub> stresses that it is better to study and implement the type of education that innovates mobile services, like schooling and health, and animal health and marketing. If these services are there, the pastoralist livelihood can continue in a better development track. Development should benefit, not harm, the people by introducing some uncertain ideas, imported from other areas or livelihood.

Supporting the last statement, the participants of the FGD confirmed that the education in Borana does not discuss the “*eellaa*”, “*maddaa*”, “*dheeddaa*” \*. No part of the education of the children starts with what the children know. Nothing in their education deals with the idioms, folklores and lyrics of the singing wells. No part of the social studies books dealt with the “*konffii*”† (rule of the water) or about the traditional ways of providing time for the grass to revive and water to mount up, through mobility and other indigenous practical means of natural resource conservation. There is nothing learnt in class about the traditional early warning system, which is a proven way of monitoring and preparedness and ensuring sustainability through challenges. The participants also doubt whether any part of the textbooks raises points about minerals, the salt craters “*Boqee*”, and the medical herbs, the fumigations for traditional way of killing microorganisms or pests, and traditional healing systems, cultures and traditions. The education

### **Box 3: Case Study: ABE for Girls’ Education**

The 13 years old pastoral girl G. is a 5<sup>th</sup> grade student. She lives with her family at Dembela Bedena. Her father sent his two children to school and kept her tending livestock.

The disappointed G. and her friends (all girls) enrolled in an ABE centre established by CARE-Borana near her home four years ago. The authoritarian father beat the girls and warned them he will break their legs. He said, “Borana is lost! You may read and write, but you won’t get married.” With this restriction all girls, except her dropped school for future marriages.

However, G. assertively said, “Let me learn then I will get my own life.” Three months in class, she learnt the basic literacy and numeracy. After five months, she read a sentence in English in front of her mother, Borana community and the USAID visitors’ team. She taught her mother to read and write her name. She became a girls’ literacy model in a mobile pastoral community, working under the shade at herding, while assisting her mother to fetch water.

She proved the competency test set by Ethiopian government using non-formal approaches to education. Currently she is promoted from level III (ABE) to grade 5, in the 2<sup>nd</sup> cycle primary.

She said, “*Barnootni Karaa Yeroo Hundaa Ilmaan Namaa Gara Guddinaatti Geessu*” meaning, Education is the path that always take people to advancement.

Source: Wako Dubo (2007). ABE for girls’ Education in Yabello. Unpublished research report. Yabello

of the Borana should not start from nowhere, but from the research and studies of the livelihood, and Boran's own sphere of psychological makeup, socio-economic scenario and environment. Then it can expand outwards.

### **Importance of Research in Borana Education to Policy Improvement**

Some of the problems of the education in Borana were shortage of physical access to school, quality, and equal participation of girls. The dropout rate at grade one is greater than at other grade levels. R<sub>4</sub> agrees that, especially in the remote areas, many children were enrolled at the beginning of the year and after couple of months, they leave the school and go away. The participants of the FGD said that the school calendar is one of the causes for the massive dropout.

There was also the big problem of teachers. According to R<sub>6</sub> and R<sub>7</sub>, (supervisors working in district education offices), there were very few teachers willing to stay in the remote and difficult areas of the Borana zone. Most of the teachers resign (see Box 2: Teachers' Case, page 1) within two to three months, especially if they get trainings for nursing, rural development agent, or other gainful employment. Facilitators employed on contractual basis for NGO run ABE centers also head-off seeking better paid jobs outside.

Of course, using the rooms in the policy and some government strategic documents, few education projects recruited local facilitators from the community who have education up to grade eight. A few weeks of pre service trainings prepare them to become paraprofessionals. R<sub>2</sub> and R<sub>5</sub> have also confirmed that their agency has used local facilitators.

In an interview with R<sub>4</sub> and afterwards in a private discussion with P<sub>1</sub> revealed that a team from the MOE, OREB and UNICEF recruited 50 local facilitators from the community and gave them trainings at Robe TTI in 1996/97. According to R<sub>4</sub>, Disaster Prevention and Preparedness Commission (DPPC) and OREB jointly evaluated the project in Borana zone and confirmed that

it was an appropriate program for pastoralist people. That contributed in influencing authorities to think of the possibilities of the pastoralist education as strategic direction.

Based on the result, a team including R<sub>4</sub> conducted initial rapid assessment, funded by SC-USA and USAID, on problems of basic education in Borana zone. Thus, a new project called Partnership for Innovation in Education (PIE) was designed and implemented in the period 1998-2004, in partnership with Local NGOs and Community Based Organizations (CBO), in Borana and other areas. They implemented non-formal education and alternative approaches to basic education. It was confirmed during the field visit that *Germedu* and *Tutufie* schools are upgraded to primary schools. In the middle of the implementation period, LEAP project emerged with ABE program, funded by USAID.

During the FGD, participants agreed that the NGOs and some government offices initiative to implement ABE have a positive effect on the policy. They consider the decentralization, which is one of the strategies in the 1994 ETP of Ethiopia, gave chance to the districts to promote such innovative ideas. Of course, R<sub>5</sub> and P<sub>1</sub> also agreed that the EFA 1990 Jomtien declaration forced the government to accept the initiative, to tackle education coverage in the remote and difficult to reach areas.

R<sub>2</sub> also agreed that there are rooms in the existing education and training policy to realize such programs. Also there are other NGOs in Ethiopia and abroad, whose good experiences learnt were adopted into the ABE programs. The government is now using those practices and developed ABE implementation strategies and guidelines. This is indicative of the result of a chain of research and development thinking and mutual understanding between the government

and development oriented NGOs working in the country. According to R<sub>2</sub>, research findings help to inform policy.

Many development practitioners in the pastoralist area face challenges of addressing basic education as the human right of children, in the conventional<sup>‡</sup> schooling system. To mitigate such gaps, the ESDPIII, which is a supportive document to the ETP of Ethiopia (1994), considers the importance of thinking outside the conventional setting. This encouraged many pastoralists' friends to think outside the box and implement mobile education, ABE, and other models of delivery studied in non-formal setting. This means that the policy support to implement innovative studies conducted in Borana zone, as far as it is important for the people.

Also R<sub>6</sub> and R<sub>7</sub> agreed that the BESOI/SCOPE program utilized the KAP under CARE/Borana in eight districts of the zone. The project became successful in bringing many students to school, enhancing girls' education participation, and promoting community participation in school activities. The program was implemented in partnership with the local government and contributed in building the capacity of the district education office officials. As well, utilization of the KAP survey has contribution to the exiting policy, such as enhancing the role of parent teachers association (PTA).

Of course, the ETP of Ethiopia acknowledges the importance of the integration of research in different livelihood sectors to education of children and its contribution to increase the relevance of education. Based on the policy, as a guiding document, R<sub>1</sub> and R<sub>2</sub> agreed that the curriculum can become worth serving the Borana pastoralist children, if it is enriched through different researches. Otherwise, R<sub>2</sub> suggested that the conventional way education is pure schooling that

---

<sup>‡</sup> Commonly imply the public/ formal/ regular schools, or government schools

lacks to fit into the pastoralist and other underserved areas. Hence the above discussions signify the role of research to make the policy fit to the pastoralist Borana education.

In relation to the effect of policy support, pro-Borana studies were implemented with supervision of and technical support from federal government. According to R<sub>4</sub> and R<sub>2</sub>, for example, the Afar and Somali region authorities visited the ABE program of the LEAP project. The MOE's pastoralist and none formal education unit has provided technical supervision and trainings. Therefore, the Borana and neighboring zones pastoralist education projects contributed to the design of the pastoralist ABE implementation strategy at the Awash conference (July 2007), and in a task force. Also the NFE guideline development is ongoing by the MOE of Ethiopia. Now the country has both supportive policy documents. Thus, LEAP was a successful program in terms of promoting policy improvement. These are results of the collaborative efforts of the stakeholders (government and NGOs) on the utilization of studies conducted on the pastoralist education including Borana.

From field observation, many study products were utilized by different agencies. Some of them were about ABE program, mobile schooling, fund raising, communication, school and ABE administration, community mobilization, gender and pastoralist education, etc. Their professional input has significant contribution in developing and introducing workable ideas and theories for the success of the projects. Most of these modules and evaluation reports were produced by researchers from Addis Ababa University, ILRI and Tufts University and distributed to different organizations including the government. According to R<sub>2</sub>, the NGOs are good at using possible advocacy network for pro-poor policy. It shows the positive attitude of stakeholders' commitment to utilize research.

### **Contribution of Research to Choice of Models of Delivery**

Some of the participants in the interview and FGD have agreed that conventional education is important for those children who can access formal schooling. R<sub>2</sub> said that it makes them bright and academically, they do extremely well. The non-formal education is also important for the majority of the pastoralist children. R<sub>2</sub> strongly advocates that, if we simply stick to only one mode of delivery, we have many things to miss. As all participants agreed, it is possible to give conventional and non-conventional or alternative education side by side.

Another point is that there should be a link between the two. In the rigid conventional schooling only few children become bright. According to R<sub>1</sub> the existing conventional schooling cannot transfer relevant skill. Other participants also agreed that students of such a system do not understand their environment, livelihood, culture and history. As R<sub>5</sub> clearly stated it, the Borana community needs problem solving school products.

Moreover, R<sub>2</sub> suggested, and FGD participants also agreed, that the Borana education should equip the children with the necessary skills and attitudes, values and virtues of their own community. It should build the values of the child based on the merits of the livelihood system. The education should help them to get the skills to relinquish traditional drawbacks. Similarly R<sub>2</sub> underlined that researches should give much time to explore the situations in the zone, in order to make the education start from the child.

According to R<sub>5</sub>, sixteen ABE centers were established in *Dire*, *Teltele* and *Yabello* districts under the LEAP project. The centers were constructed in a cost effective manner from locally available materials and cash of the communities. They follow a flexible calendar. In addition, the communities supervise and administer the schools' activities. They also pay 25 percent of the local facilitators' salary.

R<sub>4</sub> agreed that this program has important implication for the education development in the Borana zone. One can see that other districts, like Arero, Moyale and Bulehora have started satellite ABE projects (in 2005). Also some ABE centers are upgraded to public primary schools and, around them, feeder ABE centers are established. The ABE program is practiced further into the remote areas by the demand of the community since 2005. According to R<sub>6</sub> and R<sub>7</sub> explanations, three of the ABE centers were upgraded to full primary schools.

The participants expressed their fear that the ABE cannot continue beyond and after the lower primary. The upper primary, secondary and tertiary educations are also below standard. There is nothing more than a high school level in the zone. The FGD participants agreed on the need for a special type of school system to address the education of the pastoralist children. From the interview with R<sub>4</sub>, it is learnt that participatory researches contribute in identifying approaches convenient to children through community participation. Effectiveness of delivery system for access was confirmed in some agencies through executing education programs in the zone, involving the stakeholders from the beginning.

ABE as a mode of delivery has significant contribution to basic education of the out of school children, especially for girls, in the remote areas of the Borana zone. However, the choice of any method should be based on researched rationale for the exceptionality of the education in the future of the continuing Borana pastoralist livelihood. Therefore, the education of the Borana lacks the research based approach.

### **Education Vs Culture in Borana Community**

Contribution of research in the education of the Borana zone is immense. The argument is presented in the above sections in line with the importance of the research in strengthening the

relevance of the education. Such education contributes to enhancement of positive culture and productivity of the livelihood.

The doubt that the stakeholders have is that with such education, the children will go out of pastoralist livelihood. However, R<sub>2</sub> argues that education does not pose a problem to the children. The question is does the education have quality? Does it bring the needed change in the child? Is it relevant to the child and livelihood situation and does it promote the system? These and other questions should be answered affirmatively. If so, then let the child decide.

From this argument, the outsiders may not acknowledge the system and they cannot produce education, which has full respect for the Borana pastoralist livelihood, culture, history, customary system, the resource; and, in general, for the people. If the education has the legacy of the sedentary and urban livelihood system, it will not be free from prejudices. Therefore, according to R<sub>2</sub>, and R<sub>5</sub>, such education will bias the child and might lead to an undesired end. That is by no means the outcome of a good quality education.

In another interview, empowerment of women and the cultural challenges were discussed with R<sub>1</sub>. According to R<sub>1</sub> only basic literacy and numeracy skills are enough for the mothers or women. This statement gives little attention to the importance of the conventional education (compare, Box 3, Page 71) for the women. Accordingly the empowerment of the women is the organizational strength in the form of cooperatives, unlike education, considering the fact in the Borana community. Empowerment is taken here as manifestation of cultural change. She concluded empowerment is not the result of education development in the zone.

Another point is the participants in the FGD also assert that the basic barrier in pastoralist development interventions, including education, is failure to consider the basic fact that clan is

the unit of the pastoralist traditional system. Such failure negatively affects the researches to be utilized and hinders the education development in the zone.

Conversely, in a modern and educated community context, R<sub>1</sub> noted that each person plus a household is the unit of the community (in urban and sedentary livelihood). Since education encourages individualistic approach, which is very different from the pastoralist livelihood system, it is important to pay adequate attention to the curriculum and content of education. R<sub>2</sub> added that there are many valuable researches on the livelihood, culture, economic resource and geography of the Borana people; however no curriculum designer has used any of these researches.

In a private discussion with P<sub>2</sub>, a social anthropologist, it was suggested that the problem needs much more attention. He said that nobody is interested to read the research documents and incorporate basic ideas in the children's curriculum materials. Thus, most of the education materials of the children in the Borana schools are dealing with issues outside the geography, culture, economy and the general context of the people. The schools have increased in number; however, the education is not established on the social and environmental facts of the Borana community.

It is threatening to think the future of the children who would be taught outside the longstanding system. R<sub>1</sub> agreed with this point and that stated there will be total departure of the educated from the pastoralist livelihood. Again this phenomenon shall not be considered as development of education in the zone. From the above, one can say that the education changed the culture and life of the educated. In such education, it is unlikely that the majority of the educated go back to their community and serve to improve the living conditions. It should be noted that, the fear of the community to send their children to schools emanates from this idea. Nevertheless, unless the

educated person returns to the community and improves the families' plus the communities' welfare, there is no development.

Of course, some scholars accept that the education of the pastoralists could bring modernization within the system, if appropriately managed. That is, pastoralists' cultural and traditional norm is deep-rooted, (R<sub>1</sub> also agrees), which requires research based modernization of the system to:

- √ Make the pastoralist livelihood more secure;
- √ Deal with crisis through creating alternative income to support and strengthen their resiliency;
- √ Care for the livestock in a more productive and economically advantageous manner; and
- √ Facilitate the improvement of life in the system.

Therefore, education of one or two members of a family, even at lower level can bring improvement in the life of the people without affecting the cultural and established traditional Borana norms. Only then can one say the education developed. The participants of the interview and FGD agreed that there is an improvement in terms of the non-formal education and even some individuals have become successful in higher education.

Presumably, the legacy of the previous education made the elites to think the purpose of education was an instrument to impose their ideas on the pastoralists. The ETP of Ethiopia (1994) utilized researches like education sector review (ESR) and Evaluative Research of the General Education System in Ethiopia (ERGESE) during the previous regimes, among others (Solomon, 2008). The ESR and ERGESE were the two studies, which pointed out the basic problems in the education system of Ethiopia and recommended problem solving education system. However, since the inception of the ETP of Ethiopia (1994), some efforts were made to include the local

language and detach the education from the trend. The increasing number of schools in the rural areas also shows the fact that access to education is improving.

On the other hand, it is better to leave all economies to compete and survive. The pastoralist economy has its own modality, which is completely different and complementary to the other. The researches on the pastoralist livelihood system are not utilized and understood. Many unscrutinized urban and highland development philosophies are imposed on the people in the pastoralist areas. This has an effect on the dominance of culture as well. This is not the ultimate purpose of education. Education shall not serve one at the expense of another. In a positive deviant approach, for the Borana development there should be synergy between the education and culture to add merit to the whole community, regardless of gender.

#### **Status of Research Utilization for Education in Borana Zone**

According to R<sub>4</sub>, UNICEF (see OREB and UNICEF, page 73) funded the pastoralist education project for Borana pastoralist, which was initiated by the Oromia Regional Status Education Bureau within the year 1996/1997. The discussion confirmed that the study was utilized to produce a project proposal and piloted in Moyale and Liben districts in Borana zone.

According to R<sub>4</sub> and P<sub>1</sub>, at the inception, the plan was to make use of teachers of conventional schools and education materials kit (suitable for mobile education) and was supposed to be carried on the back of animals, like camels and donkeys. Tree shades, cottages shelters and anything convenient were recommended as classrooms. The mode of delivery according to R<sub>4</sub> was preferred to be mobile education.

On the other hand, R<sub>4</sub> and R<sub>5</sub> said now almost all are changed into permanent construction of conventional schools. It was the choice of the district education office and the interest of the community. However noted R<sub>4</sub>, it needs further study to identify the gap and improve than

altering the proposed approach. Even so, the model has been replicated in several other villages, and children are schooling in these centers. This shows that the option of using mobile school in purely pastoralist communities was not dropped at least for beginners.

Regarding the importance of research output utilization in Borana zone, R<sub>2</sub> argued that there remains much to be done. Implementations of education programs are short of adequate research and in-depth studies. But he underlines the importance of in-depth research prior to any project planning and program design. Accordingly, all participants agreed that donors hardly have an interest in funding researches than program focused studies. Of course, implementer organizations including the government show a reluctance to conduct and utilize research.

### **Challenges of Research Utilization**

According to the FGD and interview participants (especially R<sub>1</sub> and R<sub>5</sub>), the major challenges to utilizing research findings in Borana zone are the following.

- √ The available researches are not readers and audience friendly. The reasons are some of them do not have relevance to program intervention. The rest lack recommended actions and strategies to guide the project implementer. That is the researches lack a problem solving quality.
- √ The studies conducted on education are Addis Ababa University library and in the hands of individuals. These studies contribute to the theory than to propose action points.
- √ Some of the researches are very bulky and outputs are not articulated for the end user-stakeholders. Since the researches are too big they become costly to be published and distributed.
- √ They are not accessible for implementers or stakeholders. Therefore, those researches did not reach their audience because they are not printed or published. Even those printed, some are left on the shelves of individuals and libraries outside the zone.

√ Implementing institutions have limited resources to research undertakings and this hinders the distribution of the outcomes of the researches. Hence, it is difficult to conduct conferences, workshops, and publicizing the research or outcomes. Therefore, studies remain incomplete or in their preliminary form.

Finally, the interview and FGD participants concluded that there is wastage of resources and replication of researches, since the documents are not shared for the users. Thus, the implementing development oriented organizations prefer to implement their own studies such as baseline survey, KAP studies and participatory rapid appraisals for new projects and for replication of existing programs. And yet these are donor driven and short sighted. which is their basic limitation.

### **4.3 Discussion of Results**

The following are the major issues raised during this study. Through triangulation of the information from different sources, only valid results of the reviewed documents, interviews and private discussions held, field observation, and FGD conducted are presented below.

- √ In this study 12 researches/studies which deal with education of the Borana zone were identified. These studies recommended education for the improvement of the livelihood and economic problems.
- √ The research documents were found in the hands of individuals and were not accessible to implementers and other audiences. There is no library in the zone that can keep the researches and reports for audience and implementers.
- √ In this research, it was found that the education of Borana zone is characterized by low coverage (inaccessibility), poor quality, less girls' participation, high dropout rate and less friendly to children. The community participation was poor according to the reviewed research documents and participants response. The curriculum is not relevant to the pastoralist context and deals with urban and sedenterized people livelihood. The teachers did not get training to integrate the

education with the livelihood and localize the curriculum to the context of the Borana zone. Also teachers or facilitators have competency problems. They do not want to stay and work in the remote rural pastoralist people. Teachers resign or disappear from their duty during the academic period. Teachers' questions for remuneration in some remote villages not given much attention.

- √ The education is not provided with appropriate mode of delivery for the remote pastoralist mobile community. The Borana children were forced to learn in a conventional mode of delivery, which are situated in the urban and large villages. Only NGO lead programs promote alternative approaches to basic education.
- √ The Borana rural people education lack flexibility for the children to attend school. The children could not meet their herding and household responsibilities and go to school simultaneously. Therefore, their families do not let the children to go to the conventional schools.
- √ Research reports and participants confirmed that girls' education participation has challenges related to cultural, accessibility, continuity and relevance. As a result their participation is limited to ABE centers and accessible conventional schools. When they complete the schooling level in their vicinity they are forced to dropout stay at home. Since they do not have hostel, or shelter with protection in the urban settings, their families do not let them go to distant schools.
- √ The need to make additional investment on the livelihood to boost social capital and enhance women income would increase education opportunities for children, both boys and girls. Education improves services like human and animal health, livestock productivity, and parenting. Studies recommended the importance of alternative approach to education and other services with the aim of enhancing children education.
- √ EFA goals like UPE, adult literacy and Early Childhood Development and gender parity can only be addressed in the remote pastoralist areas of the Borana through the alternative means than the

rigid conventional schooling. The researches underlined to make the education reach the neighborhoods through utilizations of the recommendations of researches and strengthening stakeholders' collaboration on education. Participatory research and implementation of programs is important to create confidence in the people and enhance girls' participation through tackling cultural challenges.

- √ This study confirmed that utilization of studies has contributed to successful implementation of education programs by NGOs. These programs have also contributed to improving existing policies and producing strategies for the pastoralist and underserved community including the Borana people.
- √ The research also asserted that it is important to know “why the Boran’s are doing what they are doing” to win their confidence, involve them and develop productive strategies. This can be done only through in-depth research of the Borana livelihood condition and implementing the findings.
- √ The research as well showed that development is of sustainability of services and continuity of benefits. Therefore, it is good to investigate the reasons for high and low conditions of enrollment than interpreting the figures.
- √ Government and stakeholders should pay attention to the mobility of the people for the good of the livelihood and economic situation of the pastoralist Borana zone. The stakeholders should implement the important ideas in the pastoralist education strategic document and ESDP III.
- √ Education of the pastoralist Borana zone should go to the community and center the child than force or try to bring the children to the school, at least at lower primary level. Then only can children can go to school at their appropriate age. Also nearer schools encourage girls' education participation. It should be based on utilization of researches.

- √ Researches in Borana zone are not friendly to audience. Implementers do not have access to these researches, since they are not documented in an organized and accessible way. There is no library, even in the zone town, Yabello. Therefore, studies are in the hands of organization and individuals. They are not ready for reader, also the majority of these researches are bulky and in soft copies. Some of them are not complete. In this study, only two copies of studies found published.
- √ Also the research has found that it is difficult to conclude researches are utilized. Only donor driven and project oriented studies utilized in Borana zone.

## **Chapter Five**

### **5 Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations**

#### **5.1 Summary**

The purpose of this study was to assess the status of research and studies outcome utilization and identify the logical consequences of the utilization of the outcomes on education and culture development in Borana zone of the Oromia regional status. In line with this, the research has been conducted to answer the following research questions.

1. How many researches are there conducted in Borana zone on education, health, cultural, economy and other livelihood issues of the people? Where and in what form are they kept?
2. Which researches or studies conducted on education, social and economic sectors in Borana zone have direct or indirect relationship to education development and which are implemented, if not why?
3. What are the implications of utilization of the research and study outputs and outcomes for education development in the Borana zone?
4. How do the development actors and target community perceive the status of research utilization for education development in the zone?
5. What is the status of the research outcomes utilization in relation to education and culture development of the Borana zone?

In an effort to answer the above research question, data were collected and analyzed using qualitative approach. More specifically, variety of data from researchers, implementer organization heads, experts, and native members of the community were collected using interviews and FGD. Also field observations were conducted in the target Borana zone. Research and study documents were collected in soft and hard copies and reviewed in more detail.

Individual discussions and personal notes were utilized as additional data sources. Finally, the analyses of the data led to the following findings.

I. Regarding Identification of researches in Borana zone and how they are handled;

In this study the researcher has identified 39 studies conducted on livelihood areas like the Borana economy, health, livestock marketing, health, culture, education, animal health, and other sectors. However, only 12 of the studies, which are helpful for this study, are presented in Table II (see page 101 below). These studies were found in hard copies and soft copies, in the hands of individuals and Addis Ababa University and SC/US Food Security Unit libraries.

Implementing organizations do not know many of these researches exist. Only five copies identified have pages less than 100 pages. Only four copies identified in hard copies. Only three copies are published. One study studied and published by Coppock is widely known by implementers and individuals. Those studies conducted by donors and NGOs did not reach the audience beyond the members of the organization.

II. With regard to identification of researches related to education and status of their utilization;

Out of the identified researches and studies in Borana zone, 12 of them (see Table II, page 101) have direct or indirect relationship to education development. Six of the 12 are directly conducted on educational problems in Borana zone.

Moreover, three studies sponsored by NGOs were implemented. Another five studies were presented in public conferences and workshops. They are narrow and project or donor driven. Most of the studies are not utilized for the reason that some are not complete as intended, others

are large, and not published, not circulated or made available and read by the concerned people. Furthermore, some of them do not have recommended actionable solutions.

The reviewed research documents clearly pointed out that education development has positive relationship to the social sectors improvement in Borana, like the human health, animal health, building social capital, enhancing women's leadership role in committees, building confidence, maximizing benefits from livelihood and livestock, innovating modernization and improving productivity.

### III. Regarding implications of utilization of the research and study outputs and outcomes to education development in the Borana zone

The interview and FGD results showed that the researches and studies output utilized have a positively contributed to improving school structures, enrollment, capacity building, and innovating new approach to enhance basic education coverage in Borana zone.

Some of the studies have innovated alternative approaches to basic education in zone, through mobile education, alternative basic education and others. These studies conducted and implemented by NGOs have contribution for the education development in Borana zone, and have contributed to policy through promoting alternative routes to basic education of the pastoralist and needy herders.

Still others debate that only donor or project oriented studies were utilized than those in-depth researches. However, many participants agreed on the importance of utilizing in-depth researches for improving the curriculum relevance, to foster appropriate program design, to enhance the girls' participation at the 2<sup>nd</sup> cycle, and establish schools centering the community.

#### IV. Regarding views of development actors and target community and on the status of research utilization in the zone

The study confirmed that NGOs who sponsored and own the studies have implemented the findings through allocating adequate resources, like budget, manpower, logistics and institutional and managerial inputs. In this regard, USAID, UNICEF, SC-USA, CARE, GOAL and other organizations are stakeholders, who view positively the importance of utilization of researches.

Other participants also agreed that, the stakeholders engaged in education programs in Borana zone are reluctant to conduct in-depth study, before they design projects and implement integrated programs.

Some participants agreed that implementing agencies are reluctant to allocate enough money and time to implement programs with high technical expertise and budget; and therefore, they chose to implement low cost programs, like ABE in settlement areas and small villages. They do not want to implement mobile education for the mobile community, since it requires high logistics, budget, and training.

#### V. In regard to the status of the research outcomes utilization in relation to education and culture development;

Some participants suggest that the alternative basic education program has positive contribution to the education development through creating access to quality basic education in the neighborhood, and increased community participation. The study confirmed that education of the young children improves the family health care and productivity of the livestock.

In relation to culture, implementation of study findings positively contributes to girls' participation, decreasing the workloads, improving the health and family care through building confidence of the community.

Regarding implication of researches utilization on education development, others support that the education of the Borana children does not begin from the children's environment. The children are forced to learn about other livelihood. Therefore, even if schools and enrollment increased, that is not enough to imply education development.

However, the interview and FGD participants agreed that utilization of researches would have contributed to the education and culture development in Borana zone, had they been implemented as intended.

## **5.2 Conclusions**

There are many researches conducted by different stakeholders in Borana zone. However, the status of the implementation of the studies needed investigation. Thus, the primary focus of this study was to identify researches undertaken to assess the status of utilization of outcomes, and to investigate the implication of the utilization on education and culture development in Borana zone.

Thus, the study showed the following.

There are 39 research undertakings identified during this research on the livelihood, culture, economy, health, education and other issues of the Borana zone. Most of the studies are either sponsored or fully taken by NGOs and other multi-lateral organizations. Only 12 of these studies in Borana zone are related to education in the zone.

Among the studies related to education, five of them are utilized. According to the findings of this study, the implemented studies were conducted by NGOs and donor agencies. These implemented studies are short-sighted, in that they focus on a specific project or program rather than contributing to the right and sustainable benefits of the learner. Moreover, the studies represent narrow setting and short project period.

The remaining seven studies are not implemented. The reason was that they are very large, general, theoretical type, and lack problem solving action points. Therefore, the implementers fear that the outcomes and sustainability of the implementation cannot be monitored as per their organizational objectives and anticipated change on the beneficiaries.

The outcome of the implemented studies by NGOs has contributed positively on increasing access, enrollment, and community participation in school development and girls' education in the remote project sites. In terms of policy, for example the implementation of the studies has significant contribution in promoting pastoralist mobile and alternative basic education programs. However, the contributions research outcomes to quality of education appear to be minimal and much remains to be done in this regard.

One can, therefore, conclude that the researches in the pastoralist Borana zone are not utilized to bring significant change in the education of the Borana zone.

### **5.3 Recommendations**

This research shows that the researches are not utilized in a way they were intended. As a result, the culture and education of the Borana zone did not show significant change. Hence, to improve the status of research and utilization in Borana zone and enhance the education and culture development, this study calls for implementing the following suggested actions.

1. All stakeholders in the zone- local government, international and local NGOs and donor agencies and others, like higher institutions need to focus on improving the research undertakings; to make it readable, action oriented, in-depth, and concise.
2. Studies implemented so far were donor driven. That contributes to short-sightedness and inconsistency of development interventions beyond failure to implement them.

Therefore, future studies should be conducted with consultation of the zone education department and higher institutions.

3. Policy makers and curriculum developers should focus on researches to understand the reality integrate the livelihood in the education and localize the curriculum to the Borana context, instead of imposing on the pastoralists the curriculum designed in urban and agriculture setting.
4. Implementing organizations should focus on identifying researches in addition to program need studies, in order to address the education rights of the beneficiary children in the rural pastoralist Borana zone.
5. Researchers and research organizations should conduct and produce their studies on the pending educational needs of the Borana community. Their findings have to be clear and practicable. The study should be complete and reach the appropriate people and should be read. It should also be audience friendly and attract implementers to maximize benefits of the outcome.
6. The studies should address the particular challenges and possible ways of tackling them. Especially with regard to girls' education, the study has to deal with the problems related to cultural barriers and the opportunities in the culture, which help the implementer to use during the project design, in order to tackle the barriers. This helps many outsiders gain the courage to design culture friendly projects and support girls' and women's participation in education and other services.
7. Finally, the status of researches should be documented and made available for audiences in an organized and standardized manner. To do this, the local government can organize libraries and provide trainings for experts. This can reduce the problem of access studies conducted and duplication of efforts. Implementers (government and NGOs, including

donors) should exert their concerted effort to realize this important aspect of research based development. As there is no higher institution in the zone, those outside the area can take the lead in supporting the research undertakings and documentations for the betterment of utilization of the research findings for program development of the Borana community.

## Reference

- Anderson, A. & Bowman, M. J. (1966). *Education and Economic Development*; Chicago: Eldine Publishing Company.
- Assefa M. (2005). Synopsis of Gender Analysis of the Borana People; Yabello: Unpublished; December 2005
- AU and UN- OCHA-PCI. (July 2007). Pastoralist Policy Framework. Paper presented at Regional workshop on Pastoralism in Africa, held in Nairobi Kenya from July 9-11,
- Ayalew S. (2005). *Education for Rural People in Ethiopia: A Paper Presented on Ministerial Seminar on Education for Rural People in Africa: Policy Lessons, Options and Priorities* Hosted by the Government of Ethiopia, Addis Ababa,
- Bassi, M. (2003). Community Conserved Areas in the Horn of Africa, in Protected Areas Programs. PAFKS Vol. 16 No 1, *COMMUNITY CONSERVED AREAS 2006*; (IUCN), Gland, Switzerland: EPP project.
- Blanguernon, C. (1954). The Schools for Nomads in the Hoggar. *Fundamental and Adult Education* 6(1): 8-14, UNESCO
- Borana Zone Education and Capacity Building Desk Report, (2005). Yabello: Unpublished. June
- Borana Zone Statistics Desk Report. (2006). Yabello : Unpublished. August
- Brown, L.M. (1970). *Aims of Education*. New York; Teachers' College Press
- Carron, G. and Bordia, A. Ed. (1985). *International Issues for Educational Planning: Issues in Planning and Implementing National literacy Programs*; (UNESCO), Paris: Jouve Printing Press.
- Coppock, D.L. (1994). *The Borana Plateau of Southern Ethiopia: Synthesis of Pastoral Research, Development, and Change 1980-91. Systems Study No. 5*. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: ILCA (International Livestock Center for Africa), Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- CSA, (2007). The 1994 Population and Housing Census of Ethiopia; Country Level Report Vol.I and II
- Desalegn Ch. E, Mukand S. B, Gupta, A. D, and Seleshi B. A.,. (2005). Indigenous Systems of Conflict Resolution in Oromia, Ethiopia. Culture, Social and Political Conditions of the Borana Area, Conflict. Borana zone: Article presented on 26-28 January
- Dessalegn Ch. (2006). The Role of Addis Ababa University Research Institutes in the National Development. In: Daniel, Wossenu, Aytegeb & Tesfaye, (Eds.), *Summary of the*

- Proceedings of the National Conference Held in the School of Graduate Studies.* (PP. 109- 112). Addis Ababa: AAU Press,
- Devereux, S. (2006) *Vulnerable Livelihoods in Somali Region*. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies.
- DHS, (1990). Maternal Education, Use of Health Services. Working Papers No.1.USA
- FDRE. (2002). Proclamation No 271/2002, Article No 32b. Proclamation for the Establishment of the Ethiopian pastoralist Affairs Standing Committee (PASC). Addis Ababa.
- Gebru, G., Desta, S., and D.L. Coppock (Eds.). 2004. Pastoralism in Ethiopia and the Policy Environment: Linking Research, Development Actors, and Decision-Makers. Summary of Proceedings for a Meeting Held 15 August, 2003, at the International Livestock Research Institute (ILRI), (PP, 17-19). Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Utah State University, Logan, Utah, USA.
- Grhan, R. (2001). Livelihood Diversification in Southern Ethiopia: the Case of Gobicha Settlement. Cambridge University Masters Phil. Dissertation. [recharad@grahn.net](mailto:recharad@grahn.net). August
- GTZ (2004). Borana Lowland Pastoral Development Program Documentation on 7 years of *Field Experience*; Addis Ababa: Volume II, GTZ,
- Harrison, R.H., & Gowin, L.E., (1962). *The Elementary Teacher in Action*, San Francisco: Wad worth Publishing Company.
- IER. (2001). *Historical Development, Mission and progress*, AAU. Addis Ababa.
- Jed S. (2006). Household Consumption and Expenditure in Boranana, Ethiopia: Assessing Wealth and Poverty in Agro-Pastoral Settings. CARE, Basic Education Unit, Atlanta: Unpublished, May
- Krätli, S. (Ed.). (2000). EDUCATION PROVISION TO NOMADIC PASTORALISTS: A LITERATURE REVIEW. December 2000. UNDERTAKEN UNDER WORLD BANK CONTRACT 7528355
- MOE- Ethiopia. (1999). the federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Education Sector Development Program I (ESDP- I): program Action Plan. Addis Ababa. June
- MOE- Ethiopia. (2002). the federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Education Sector Development Program II (ESDP- II): Program Action Plan. Addis Ababa. June
- MOE- Ethiopia. (2005). Education Sector Development Program III (ESDP- III): Program Action Plan. (2005/2006- 2010/2011), Addis Ababa. May

- MOE- Ethiopia. (2006). Strategies to improve the Pastoralist Areas primary and Secondary Schools Education. Addis Ababa: Unpublished. July
- MOFED, (2002), Ethiopia: Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Program; Addis Ababa. Ministry of Finance and Economic Development
- PARIMA/ENABLE. (2007). Determinants of Producer Participation in Primary Livestock Markets: Evidence from Oromia Region, Ethiopia Report Submitted to CARE/PLI. APRIL 2007. Addis Ababa.
- Patton, M.Q. (2002). *Qualitative Research & Evaluation Methods*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. California: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Ridgewell, A. & Flintan, F. (eds.). (2007). Gender & Pastoralism Volume II: Livelihoods & Income Development in Ethiopia. Addis Ababa: SOS Sahel Ethiopia. [sos.sahel@ethionet.et](mailto:sos.sahel@ethionet.et). Addis Ababa. Ethiopia. September 2007.
- Save the Children- USA. (2003). Knowledge Attitude Practice (KAP) Survey. BES0II/SCOPE. Addis Ababa: Unpublished, November
- Save the Children- USA. (2003). Southern Tier Initiative Livelihood Enhancement for Agro-pastoralists and Pastoralists: Report on Household Baseline. Addis Ababa: unpublished. USAID. April
- Save the Children- USA. (2006). Livelihood Enhancement for Agro-pastoralists and Pastoralists (LEAP); Annual report, Liben Sub-office. Addis Ababa. Unpublished. June
- Save the Children- USA. (2007). Livelihood Enhancement for Agro-pastoralists and Pastoralists (LEAP); Five Years Terminal Report of the ABE program: (2002- 2007). Addis Ababa. Unpublished
- SCF - Save the Children Fund in Mongolia. (2000b). Pre-education for Nomadic Children in Mongolia. A video, SCF, Ulaanbaatar.
- Smith, A. B. (1992). Pastoralism in Africa; Origins and Development; London: Hurt & Company.
- Solomon Areaya. (2008). *Policy Formulation, Curriculum Development and Implementation in Ethiopia*. Addis Ababa: AAU Press.
- Teffera Challa. (2001). Primary Education for the Children of Pastoralists Borana Zone: Access and Alternatives. Masters Thesis. Addis Ababa University: Unpublished. June

- TGE. (1994). Education and Training Policy. Addis Ababa. Transitional Government of Ethiopia. April.
- Udoh S.U. (1982). The Problem of Administering Mobile Schools. In: Krätli, S. (Ed.). (2000). EDUCATION PROVISION TO NOMADIC PASTORALISTS: A LITERATURE REVIEW. December 2000. UNDERTAKEN UNDER WORLD BANK CONTRACT 7528355
- Varlet H. and Massoumian J. (1975). Education for tribal populations in Iran. Prospects, In: Krätli, S. (Ed.). (2000). EDUCATION PROVISION TO NOMADIC PASTORALISTS: A LITERATURE REVIEW. December 2000. UNDERTAKEN UNDER WORLD BANK CONTRACT 7528355
- Wako Dubo. (2007). ABE for girls' Education in Yabello. Unpublished research report. Yabello
- Watson, E.E. (2003), 'Examining the Potential of Indigenous Institutions for Development: A Perspective from Borana, Ethiopia', *Development and Change* 34(2): 287-309. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing
- Watson, K. (1984). Education in the Third World; London: Croon Helm.
- Wossenu Y. (2006). Evaluation and Accreditation of Higher Education and Institutions to Meet Social Expectations: lessons to Ethiopia. In Daniel, Wossenu, Aytegeb & Tesfaye, (Eds.), Summary of the Proceedings of the National Conference Held in the School of Graduate Studies. (PP. 109- 112). Addis Ababa: AAU Press,
- Zyien Engidasew. (2004). Education and Nomadic Pastoralism in Ethiopia. In. Daniel, Wanna, Aytegeb and Ayni. (edds.). Institute of Educational Research (IER). IER FLAMBEAU. Vol 12, No 1. (2004), Addis Ababa: AAU press. December (P. 53- 60)

**Table II: Data for Documents Reviewed**

Research Papers produced (RP); Study Documents of Organizations (SD); Documentary Review for Workshop or Panel Discussion (DW); Policy, Proceedings, Strategic Documents (PSD); Books and Publications by Scholars (BP)

Type Author Year / location of the study	Title and Theme of Research/ Study	Objective of the Study	Purpose/ Audience	Relation to Education	Stats/ Remark
RP1 Layne Coppock 1994 The Borana Plateau	The Borana Plateau of Southern Ethiopia: Synthesis of pastoral research, development and Change, 1980- 91	The general objective was to describe the evolving production system of the Borana pastoralists and prescribe best-bet component interventions and policies that might promote growth in the livestock sector and alleviate poverty among pastoral producers and encourage ecologically sustainable patterns of resource use.	It also intends to serve the main audiences, professionals in Ethiopia who deal with range research and development, who deserve detailed interpretation of data but who have poor access to international literature, and; an international audience concerned with more general implications of the work for pastoral research and development in sub-Saharan Africa	Directly related to research undertakings significance in Borana pastoralist area and indirectly related to education when it signifies issues related to policy, importance of multi disciplinary education, inclusion of the livelihood in the education for betterment of the human capital and systems approach in social development including education.	The researcher could not be accessed for the interview. Efforts failed including email. But the works are referred in many researches and project proposals, baseline surveys and other important documents, the government parliament proceedings workshop with MOA and PRIMA
SD1 SC- USA, CARE International in Ethiopia, November 20, 2003; Borana zone six woredas	BES0II/SCOPE Knowledge, Attitude and practice (KAP) Survey Report	To know the status of schools, PTA/ SMCs, equity, resources; Draw conclusion and recommendation; To implement project program	To conduct baseline survey and plan action points; 4 Regions Oromia and Oromia zones including Borana;	Education study dealing with schools' status, enrolment, girls' education, PTA, classrooms construction/ expansion, trainings, etc	Project was implemented and reported The KAP conducted by Zerihun Lemma, Wako Dubo and SCOPE Team

RP2 Richard Grahn 31/08/01 Borana Gobicha	Livelihood Diversification In Southern Ethiopia: The Case Of Gobicha Settlement	Livelihood; to describe and analyze the strategies used by residents of Gobicha to make a living at present the opportunities and constraints for further diversification of livelihood activities	Cambridge University Masters phil. Dissertation richard@grahn.net	Related to education of the people in low living conditions	Unknown, but there are improvements since then
RP2 Andrew Ridgewell Fiona Flintan September 2007; Borana and other areas	Gender & Pastoralism Vol2 Livelihoods & Income Development in Ethiopia	Enhancing women empowerment for betterment of livelihood and income	For SOS Sahel and CARE consumption	Issues of girls' education, culture indirectly related to education	Very big in size and not distributed ,Not implemented
SD2 PARIMA/ENABLE; April 2007; Borana & Fentale District of E.Showa	Determinants of Producer Participation in Primary Livestock Markets: Evidence from Oromia Region,	Livestock Market in Oromia		Indirectly Related issues to literacy for livestock production & improving off take	Journal reached GOs, NGOs, & research institutes Implementation status Unknown
PSDI (FDRE), (MOFED) July 2002 Plan for 2003- 05; Addis Ababa Ethiopia	Ethiopia: Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Program	To reduce poverty through at the same time maintaining macroeconomic stability to meet the MDG		Deals with education as crosscutting development issue for poverty reduction, thus related to education	Implemented; t is not yet knownbut specific impac
RP3 Teffera Challa 2001 In all districts of Borana Zone	Primary Education for the Children of Pastoralists in Borana Zone: Access and Alternatives	Examine participation in PE; Identify factors hindering access; Suggest major strategies to alleviate problems in the Pastoralist Borana	Master's Thesis in Addis Ababa University	Directly related to education	Not printed

BPI ADB, UNESCO, 2005; Borana pastoralists areas	The Education of nomadic Peoples in East Africa	To document and advance understanding of education in the pastoralist East African People	For policy makers and program implementers in Pastoralist areas GOs and NGOs	Directly related to education	Printed & distributed to GO & NGO
SD3 Save the Children- USA April 2003; Borana, Afder and Liben zone	Southern Tier Initiative (STI LEAP)	Report on Household Baseline Survey in Borana, Afder & Liben Zones	To Implement the LEAP Project by SC/US, CARE, OREB,	Related to education Directly	Implemented and Reported
GTZ December 2004; Borana zone	Development program documentation on 7 years of field experience Volume II:	To document the organizations experience and share lessons and help future interventions for management of the Rangeland Resource	Documentation of GTZ experience	Indirectly related to education	Published and Distributed on w/shop
DWIDesalegn Chemeda Edossa, Mukand Singh Babel, Ashim Das Gupta and Seleshi Bekele Awulachew26-28 January 2005: Borana zone	Indigenous systems of conflict resolution in Oromia, Ethiopia Culture, Social And Political conditions of the Borana Area, Conflict			Not said	

## Appendix A

### Tool One: Check List for Research Documents Review

Research Title \_\_\_\_\_ Researcher's Name \_\_\_\_\_  
 Year the Research Conducted \_\_\_\_\_ Area of the Research: \_\_\_\_\_

The part of the research the education issue discussed:

- a) In the Body of the Research Discussion
- b) In Research Problem:
- c) Objective of the Research or Study
- d) Conclusion Part:
- e) Recommendation Part:

S/n	Issues Raised in the research related to Education	Yes	No	Not Clear
	<b>Direct</b>			
1.	School Construction			
2.	Children Education			
3.	Curriculum Improvement or localization			
4.	Enhancing Children Enrolment in school			
5.	School materials supply			
6.	Teachers training			
7.	School Investment			
	<b>Indirect</b>			
8.	Tuition fee for school children			
9.	Withdrawal of students due to problems			
10.	Appropriate mode of education in pastoralist context			
11.	Gender issues			
12.	Distance of School from villages			
13.	The need to Basic Education			
14.	Adult especially women education			

## Appendix B

Substance of the Research Related to Education:

### Questions for Document Review

1) What is the main theme of the research?

---

---

2) Is the research/study complete (printed/Published)?

---

---

3) Who are the targets of the research/ study?

---

---

4) How related is this research/ study to education development in Borana zone? Either directly/indirectly

---

---

5) What related issue/program/activity to education is there for children or adults?

---

---

6) Which part presentation is this? (more than one optional answer)

Title	Objective of the research	Literature Review	Discussion	Conclusion and Recommendation

7) What is/are action point(s) in recommendations of the research/study?

---

---

8) Who sponsored the research?

---

---

9) Who is/are the possessor of the research?

---

---

10) What was the purpose of the sponsor?

---

---

11) Is there action recommended in the research or study? Yes. No  
If yes, which of the following action points proposed in the study?

- a) Basic Education program for children
- b) Appropriate mode of delivery- mobile/ABE/Formal School/ Reflect
- c) Adult literacy program
- d) Community partnership in school
- e) Girls'/women education participation
- f) Curriculum improvement
- g) Contextualizing education with livelihood
- h) Gender issue
- i) Improving traditional practices
- j) Financing Schools and other supplies
- k) Teachers' training
- l) Educational research and development
- m) Emergency Education
- n) Other issues: specify \_\_\_\_\_

## Appendix C

### Tool Two: Interview Questions for the Researchers

Organization's Name: \_\_\_\_\_ Sex: \_\_\_\_\_ Responsibility in the Org. \_\_\_\_\_  
Date: \_\_\_\_\_ Venue: \_\_\_\_\_ Time: Started \_\_\_\_\_ End: \_\_\_\_\_

- 1) Why did you become interested to conduct this study or research?  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_
- 2) Why is education of the pastoralists so important?  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_
- 3) What is the major objective of your research/study?  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_
- 4) Please, explain if your study outcome has implication to existing or new policy or strategy.  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_
- 5) How does that related to education and development in Borana zone?  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_
- 6) On page --- of your research it reads -----. Would you please, explain why you suggest that?  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_
- 7) How, that is, the implementation of your research outcome has effect on development of education in Borana zone?  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_
- 8) How does education development related to the development of the sector of your research?  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_
- 9) How do you know your research output implemented? If not, why? Please Give example;  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

10) If implemented, explain the status of the implementation. What was the reaction of the implementers (NGOs, GOs, individuals, etc) for your research?

---

---

11) Can you please, tell me if implementation of your research/study has contribution to education development in Borana zone? Give examples.

---

---

12) What resources (technical, institutional, financial, managerial) were required to implement the research/study outcome?

---

---

13) Were there adequate resources supplied?

---

---

14) Explain, related to education, the role of research/studies to development?

---

---

15) What do you recommend for utilization of researches in Borana zone, especially in relation to education development?

---

---

---

**Additional probing questions**

- i. Can you give some examples?
- ii. Can you please, tell the place and time?
- iii. Who did it?
- iv. What do you suggest to improve the situation?
- v. What kind of education do the communities like to have for their children?
- vi. Please, say what implication this has on the girls and women.
- vii. What change is there in relation to culture based on what you have mentioned now?
- viii. Please, give example if it has relation to policy issue.

..... **Thank You!** .....

## Appendix D

### Tool Three: Interview questions to the research sponsors and implementer organizations

Organization's Name: \_\_\_\_\_ Sex: \_\_\_\_\_ Responsibility in the Organization: \_\_\_\_\_  
Date: \_\_\_\_\_ Venue: \_\_\_\_\_ Time: Started \_\_\_\_\_ End: \_\_\_\_\_

1) Why did you or your organization become interested to sponsor this study or research?

---

---

2) Why is education of the pastoralists so important?

---

---

3) Do you accept the recommendations of the research? Why/why not.

---

---

4) To which institutions or individuals did you distribute the research output?

---

---

5) Why are they eligible to the research outputs?

---

---

6) What was the reaction of the audience of the research/study?

---

---

7) Please explain, if there is any related issue to policy or strategy in the research output.

---

---

8) Please, explain how the status of implementation of the research, whether it is complete or ongoing, who is in charge of it, the place and time.

---

---

9) What were resources (technical, institutional, financial, and managerial) required implementing the research/study outcome?

---

---

10) Was there adequate inputs/supply of resources for the implementation?

---

---

11) What are the outcomes of the utilization of the research?

---

---

12) In what status is the utilization of the research/study in Borana zone?

---

---

13) How does your organization view research utilization for education development in Borana zone?

---

---

14) What do you suggest to improve the status research utilization on education in Borana zone?

---

---

**Additional probing questions**

- ix. Can you give some examples?
- x. Can you please, tell the place and time?
- xi. Who did it?
- xii. What do you suggest to improve the situation?
- xiii. What kind of education do the communities like to have for their children?
- xiv. Please, say what implication this has on the girls and women.
- xv. What change is there in relation to culture based on what you have mentioned now?
- xvi. Please, give example if it has relation to policy issue.

..... **Thank You!** .....

## Appendix E

### Tool Four: Focus Group Discussion

Date: \_\_\_\_\_ Venue: \_\_\_\_\_ Time: Start \_\_\_\_\_ End: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Attendance: Organization: \_\_\_\_\_ Responsibility: \_\_\_\_\_ Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Main Questions	Notes from the Discussion
1. What are the progress in the education and culture in Borana area?	
2. Which organizations conduct research/studies on education and culture development?	
3. What do you know about the implementation of research by _____?	
4. Which progresses are results of research or studies utilization?	
5. Which studies conducted on health, livestock marketing, gender, animal health and other development issues implemented have implication for education of the Borana zone?	
6. How do you evaluate the status of research utilization for development in Borana zone?	
7. What do you recommend to sustain programs positive impact in the community?	
<p><b>Additional probing questions</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>vii. Can you give some examples?</li> <li>iii. Can you please, tell the place and time?</li> <li>ix. Who did it?</li> <li>xx. What do you suggest to improve the situation?</li> <li>xi. What kind of education do the communities like to have for its children?</li> <li>xii. Please, say what implication this has on the girls and women.</li> <li>iii. What changed is there in relation to culture based on what you have mentioned now?</li> <li>iv. Please, give example if it has relation to policy issue.</li> </ul>	

----- Thank You -----

