

**ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY  
SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES  
DEPARTMENT OF BUSINESS EDUCATION**

**AN ASSESSMENT OF THE PRACTICE OF  
COOPERATIVE TRAINING IN AFAR REGIONAL  
STATE: THE CASE OF LUCY TECHNICAL AND  
VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING  
COLLEGE**

**BY: ZELALEM ABEBE**

**JULY, 2011  
ADDIS ABABA**

**Addis Ababa University  
School of Graduate Studies**

**Assessment of the Practice of Cooperative Training in Afar  
Regional State  
The case of Lucy TVET College**

**Thesis Presented to the School of Graduate Studies  
Department of Business Education  
AAU**

**In Partial Fulfillment of MA Degree in Management of  
Vocational Education**

**By: Zelalem Abebe**

**Submitted to the Department of Business Education**

**July 2011**

## List of Tables

<b>Table</b>	<b>Page</b>
Table 3.1: Sample size of the Study .....	27
Table 4.1.1 Description of TVET trainers/instructors .....	30
Table 4.1.2 Respondents characteristics based on Age and years of experience.....	31
Table 4.1.3 Distribution of trainees based on age, level and department .....	32
Table 4.2. Industries and trainees Interest towards Cooperative Training.....	33
Table 4.3. Benefit of Cooperative Training and the Proximity of the CTC .....	35
Table 4.4 Management of C.T. in Lucy TVET College .....	38
Table 4.5. The Presence and Accessibility of C.T Guideline .....	39
Table 4.6. Role of Guidance and Councilor.....	40
Table 4.7 Allotment of time for CT in Lucy TVET College .....	42
Table 4. 8 The Readiness and Capability of trainees to CT .....	43
Table 4. 9 Role of Trainers to CT .....	44
Table 4.10 Assignment and Assessment of Trainees in C.T .....	45
Table 4.11 Assignment of Supervisor by industries During CT .....	47
Table 4.12 Infrastructure provided for C.T and the general status of the Management .....	48
Table 4.13 The relation between Lucy TVET and Industries or enterprises.....	49

4.11 Assignment of Managing Supervisors for CT by Industry....	46
4.12 Infrastructure provided by the College and the general status of the management .....	48
4.13 The Relation between Lucy TVET College and Industries/Companies.....	49
<b>Chapter Five</b> .....	52
5. Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations.....	52
5.1 Summary .....	52
5.2 Conclusion .....	55
5.3 Recommendations .....	56
Reference .....	58
Annex I Questioners for the Trainers.....	VIII
Annex II Questionnaire for the Trainees .....	XIII
Annex III Interview Guide for the College Management and Guidance and Counseling .....	XVII
Annex IV Interview Guide for Industry Supervisors and Owner s.....	XVIII
Annex V Interview Guide for supervisors of Cooperative Training in TVET .....	XIX
Annex VI Profile of Interviewees and Date of Interview.....	XX

## **Acknowledgements**

First I would like to thank my advisor Dr. Worku Mekonen for his supports in identifying the problem and formulating the topic and later in correcting the paper unreservedly offering his valuable comments. For all these I am highly indebted.

I wish to express my sincere thanks to my informants from Lucy TVET College, supervisors and heads of various industries and enterprises in Afar Regional state, for their full cooperation in expressing their experience regarding the dynamics of cooperative training.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge that the writing of this Essay would have been impossible without the support of my families and friends.

# Table of Contents

	Page
Acknowledgements .....	I
Table of Contents.....	II
List of Tables .....	V
Acronym and Abbreviation ... ..	VI
Abstract.....	VII
<b>Chapter One</b> .....	1
1. Background of the Study .....	1
1.1 Statement of the Problem .....	2
1.2 Research Questions .....	3
1.3 Objective of the Study.....	3
1.4 Limitation of the Study .....	3
1.5 Significance of the Study .....	4
1.6 Organization of the Study .....	4
<b>Chapter Two</b> .....	5
2. Review of the Literature .....	5
2.1 Evolution of Vocational Education in Ethiopia .....	5
2.2 What is New in the Concept of TVET? .....	6
2.2.1 Vocational Training/Education .....	7
2.2.2 Technical Education .....	7
2.2.3 Continuing TVET.....	8
2.2.4 Principles of TVET.....	8
2.3 Modes of Delivery and their challenges .....	8
2.3.1 Cooperative Training .....	13
2.3.2 Benefits of Cooperative Training .....	15

2.4 Measuring or Assessing the Effectiveness of Cooperative Training .....	18
2.5 Experience of selected countries in Cooperative training .....	19
2.5.1 Experience of Selected European Countries comparatively.....	19
2.5.2 Experience of Selected African Countries .....	21
<b>Chapter Three</b> .....	26
3. Methodology .....	26
3.1 Study Design.....	26
3.2 Target Population .....	26
3.3 Data Source .....	26
3.4 Instrument Development .....	28
3.5 Data Processing and Analysis .....	28
3.6 Dissemination of the finding of the study.....	28
<b>Chapter Four</b> .....	29
4. Data Presentation and analysis.....	29
4.1 General Description of the Respondents .....	29
4.1.1 Description of TVET Trainers/Instructors.....	30
4.1.2 Respondents characteristics based on Age and years of experience.....	31
4.1.3 Description of Trainees .....	32
4.2 Awareness and Interest towards Cooperative training .....	33
4.3 Benefit of Cooperative training.....	35
4.4 Management of Cooperative Training in Lucy TVET College ..	37
4.5 CT Guideline, .....	39
4.6 The Role Guidance and councilor in CT .....	40
4.7 Time Allotted to CT.....	42
4.8 Readiness and Capability of trainees for CT` .....	43
4.9 The Role of Trainers.....	44
4.10 Assignment and Assessment of Trainees in cooperative training.....	45

## **Acronym and Abbreviation**

AU:	African Union
CoC:	Center of Competence
CSTC:	Comminty skill Training Center
CT :	Cooperative Training
CTA :	Cooperative Training Agreement
ecdpc :	Engennering capacity building program
ENAT:	Ecol National des Artes Techniques
ILO :	International Labour Organization
Mo A:	Memorandum of Agreement
MoE :	Minstry of Education
NFTVET:	Non Formal TVET
NGO :	Non Governmental Organization
NVTD:	National Vocational Training Division
TC:	Training Center
TVE :	Technical and Vocational Education
TVET :	Technical Vocational Education and Tranining.
UNESCO:	United Nations Educational Scientife and Cultural Oranization
VETA :	Vocational Education and Training Authority
VS:	Vocational School
VTC:	Vocational Training Center

## Abstract

*This study is an assessment of cooperative training in Afar Regional State taking Lucy TVET College as a case in point. The major objective of the study is to explore the status of cooperative training, the benefit and the role of the stakeholder involved, as well as the challenge facing cooperative training in the region. In so doing, the study used both primary and secondary data. The primary data accessed through interview, questionnaires and observation. To acquire reasonable representation of the population, purposive sampling was followed to select key informant and respondents from all stakeholders such as trainers, trainees, guidance and councilors, management members head and supervisors of the cooperative training in the enterprises. Books and articles used as secondary data. The data are both qualitative and quantitative analyzed using percentiles and presented by tables and descriptive approach. As the result of the analysis indicate, the poor management of cooperative training, lack of skilled human resource mainly guidance and counselor, shortage of infrastructure, lack of awareness by the industries, poor involvement of the trainers, enterprises and other stakeholders in cooperative training, lack of readiness academically, technically and ethically from the trainees, the poor relation/partnership of the college with the industries/companies are the major challenges of cooperative training in the region. Hence, the study recommend that an effort has to be made from the management of Lucy TVET college and other concerned bodies to address shortage of human and material resources needed for the training. These stakeholders also should exert their efforts to involve stakeholders mainly enterprises/industries in planning, implementing, and assessing of cooperative training. In so doing, the college has to create stages for discussion and awareness creation on the issues of cooperative training. The enterprises involved in the cooperative training also have to work with the college to improve the cooperative training service they are delivering. This is owing to the fact that through the partnership of stakeholders all challenges and problems facing cooperative training can be well managed.*

# Chapter One

## 1. Background of the Study

Every country poor or rich strive to achieve better in education sector which is a pillar of development. The system of education in most countries structured systematically comprising various sub systems. The same is true in Ethiopia; a country now striving hard to get something out of its educational system. The national educational system of the country comprises various sub systems.

Technical and vocational education and training is an integral part of the national educational system. (MoE, 2008) Through TVET technological knowledge and practical skill are transmitted to person from all spheres of society. It combined theory and practical elements of education such as specific calculation, knowledge about certain materials working methods and so on are combined with practical training through instruction in the workshop of a training institution or practical work in an enterprise (ecd, 2006; MoE, 2008; Richard, 2007).

The term “cooperative training” encompasses all forms of training conducted jointly by TVET institutions and industries/enterprises. The training takes place alternatively in a school environment and in the real-life environment of the workplace. Most of the training occurs in the enterprise where practical skills and applications of theory take place. The trainee goes to TVET institutions for only a limited period of time, to acquire theoretical knowledge and basic skills in the specific training area. Enterprises and TVET institutions are expected to cooperate in planning, implementing and assessing CT (Richard, 2007, Girma, 2010).

In the planning phase enterprises or industries or companies (here after used interchangeably of simply industries) are asked to state their expectations for training outcomes: what skills, knowledge and attitudes do they wish trainees to acquire at the end of their training. These expectations help set occupational standards and develop curricula to meet the standards. Enterprises are further expected to contribute their expertise to how the desired training outcomes will be achieved.

In the implementation phase enterprise participate in implementation by providing practical training on their premises. They communicate with TVET institution and other enterprise

regarding the achievement of training objectives; further training needs, problems, experienced during training and other issues (ecd, 2008).

In the assessment phase enterprises take part in the communities that perform the final assessment of training outcomes, e. g. through occupational assessment.

To this end there are various factors needed to be fulfilled such as partner establish a TVET institutions, training curriculum, a training coordinator and so forth.

Hence, this paper tries to explore and assess the trends and challenges of cooperative training in Afar Regional state TVET system. In doing so, the study focuses on the practice of Lucy TVET College in Afar Regional State.

### **1.1 Statement of the Problem**

Cooperative Training is an integral part of TVET System in Ethiopia. The success in cooperative Training has its own implication in the achievement of the objective of the TVET system. To implement cooperative training there are various inputs need to be fulfilled. It also needs the participation of various stakeholders. Stakeholders such as trainees, enterprises/industries, governmental and nongovernmental organizations have to be aware of the basic logic of cooperative training as well as practically see the benefit of the system to all stakeholders directly and indirectly. Moreover a successful cooperative training demands the harmonious relations between stakeholders, mainly TVET institutions and enterprises/industries; appropriate inputs and infrastructures, skilled and committed trainers and managers and so on. It is with all this inputs and human coordination that cooperative training can minimize the existing structural and others problems that TVET systems have faced in developing countries like Ethiopia. From this context an assessment of the status and implementation of cooperative training in TVET system is very significant. Assessing the performance of cooperative training at national or sub national level has to be an indispensable task of all concerned bodies.

This study also attempts to explore the practice of cooperative training in Lucy TVET College in Afar Regional State. It tries to describe the trends and explore the challenges and the gaps in designing and implementing cooperative training in the college. It tries to show what peculiar problems and challenges encountered the practice of cooperative training in the college. Moreover it discuss how the stakeholders interact to deliver appropriate cooperative training

service and how this service benefit or affect all participants vis-à-vis the intended objectives of Cooperative training at large.

## **1.2 Research Questions**

- How industries interact with the college to realize cooperative training in the region?
- To what extent the enterprises/industries are involved in planning, implementing and assessing cooperative training?
- To what extent the requirements of cooperative training such as human and material inputs fulfilled in the college?
- What are the challenge and prospects of cooperative training in TVET of Afar Regional State?

## **1.3 Objective of the study**

The general objective of the study is to assess and explore the practice of cooperative training in Afar Regional State taking the case of Lucy TVET College.

### **Specific Objectives:**

- To explore the interaction between the college and the industries in realizing CT
- To assess the involvement of enterprises/industries in planning, implementing and assessing stage of cooperative training
- To explore the level of human and material resource fulfillment and its implication on the status of cooperative training.
- To identify the challenge and prospect of cooperative training in the TVET of Afar Regional State.

## **1.4 Limitation of the Study**

The study focuses on the practice of cooperative training in Afar Regional College taking Lucy TVET College as a case.

The study was designed to assess the status of cooperative training in Afar regional state. However it is confined to the institutional limit of Lucy TVET College. During conducting this study various problems which may affect the quality of this study encountered. The lack of

organized data in Afar Regional State and the shortage of reading materials in the area are among the serious problems that the student researcher came across.

### **1.5 Significance of the study**

Primarily the finding of the study will have policy implication directly at college and regional level Cooperative training practice and management. And its benefit can be extended indirectly (if it is not being ambitious) national level since lesson can be drawn from best practice at local level.

The study is believed to enrich the existing data on cooperative training mainly from the context of Afar Regional State where there is limited research on the issues of TVET. Moreover the study may be used as preliminary data for those who are interested to study on the issue further and with different context or dimensions.

### **1.6 Organization of the study**

The study is divided in to five chapters. The first chapter discusses the background and the objectives of the study. The second chapter explains the relevant review of literature on the issues of cooperative training. The third chapter comprises methodology and method of the study. In the fourth chapter data analysis is presented. The last chapter consists of Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations of the research.

## Chapter Two

### 2. Review of Related Literature

In this section of the study, issues, trend and concept related to TVET and cooperative training is discussed. In doing so the historical background of TVET in Ethiopia and the practice of cooperative training in some selected countries as well as terms and concepts relevant to analysis and substantiate the forth coming discussions are explained.

#### 2.1 Evolution of Vocational Education in Ethiopia

Education in Ethiopia has a long history. The pioneer in providing the educational service was that of religious institutions such as the church and mosques (Paula, 2004). The subject they offer as were those, which for prayers and for the services of the institutions to which they were affiliated.

However, concerning the issues of accessibility of church education, Tekeste (1996), described its weakness as "It is the most probable that the location of the monasteries(virtually all of them situated in the most in accessible part of the country) had contributed to the low out reach of the church to the community"(Ibid). In addition, *it had restricted to boys* (Paula, 2004).

As other policies and measures he had attempted to take, Tewodros II also appear unique in the sector of education in Ethiopian History. Tewodros attempted to introduce skill subjects in training institution at Gafat with the help of the British's and the French expatriates who were willing and forced to lend their hands to modernize Ethiopia mostly in the sphere of making weapons (Baharu, 1991).

Modern public education made modest entry in to the history of the country in the beginning of 1900's with the establishments of the Menilik School. The major objective of the school was teaching of foreign language, the proficiency of which essentials for maintenance of countries independence (Tekeste, 1996).

The second government school established by Regent Taffari Mekonen in 1925. Like Menilik School, Taffari Mekonen School functioned as school for the teaching of foreign languages with difference that Ethiopian religion was supposed to be thought in latter by the founders that

“educated person who has not properly mastered the language and literature of his own country is like a boat without a rower”

The brief Italian occupation 1936-41 seriously disrupted the educational system owing to the death of educated persons and destructions of the already existing few educational institutions which either closed or changed in to military purposes.

The first post war school was opened on 1941 under the name of *Ecol National des Artes Techniques* popularly known as ENAT. But before this period individuals such as Dr Wariqnh Martin (Hakim Workineh) organized craft school under the name of an association called Ya fiqirina Agalgiot mahiber (love and service Association) in 1924 and 1932 another school named Saint Saviors school. These schools were opened for section of societies such as liberated slaves and orphans. In addition, the school of radio and telegraph opened in 1933. Since 1962 successive self-schools called comprehensive schools have started to be opened up to 1984. It was with this trend vocational education started together with modern education of the country.

In 1984 another set of schools that of polytechnic was started followed by specialized vocational schools of 10+2, 10+ 3 has been opened. Now we have level I II, III IV and V program. This is the evolution of the Ethiopian vocational education system in brief. Currently the system is called Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) ( MoE, 2008).

## **2.2 What is new in the concept of TVET?**

The current vocational education system called TVET system defined as combination of theory and practice; elements of education such as specific calculation of knowledge about certain materials working methods and so on combined with practical training through instruction in the workshop of a training institution or practical work in an enterprise. While the T (technical), in TVET appeals to be different and higher level (above higher education). The V(vocational) is linked with specific practical occupations which include training and upgrading in all occupational fields of agriculture, industry, crafts and the service sector (ecbp, 2006).

TVET is concerned with the acquisition of knowledge and skills for the world of work. In the past various terms have been used to describe elements of the field that are now conceived as comprising TVET. The Second International Congress on Technical and Vocational Education

held in Seoul in 1999 decided that the most comprehensive term to use is Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) (MoE Rwanda, 2008).

This is any education, training and learning activity leading to the acquisition of knowledge, understanding and skills which are relevant for employment or self-employment. TVET serves here as an overarching term to describe all kinds of formal, non-formal and informal training and learning provided by or in all different institutions, providers and learning locations (Ibid). To comprehend the concept deeper it is necessary to conceptualize terms constituted in the concept of TVET. This is done as follows:

### **2.2.1 Vocational training/education**

Vocational training/education is a system which aims at providing recipients with the necessary knowledge and skills to exercise a profession in order to be integrated in the labor market. Vocational training includes initial Vocational Training/Education and continuing Vocational Training (Ibid) here understanding of the concept give much weight to its purpose. UNESCO in Bennet (2003:6) defined vocational education giving much weight to typology, departmentalization and level as "formal education designed to prepare for skilled occupation in industry, agriculture and commerce generally at secondary level". In so doing here vocational education is considered as formal education. By giving much emphasis to its value in life UNESCO and ILO in Bennet (2003:12) describe it as "provision of opportunity for individual or groups to gain directly and broadly applicable long term relevant option of alternative for improving the quality of their life".

### **2.2.2 Technical Education**

Technical Education is a structured system aimed at providing recipients with the necessary knowledge and skills to continue their studies at tertiary education level or to exercise a profession in order to be integrated into the labor market. Technical Education, on the other hand puts more emphasis on theoretical education (MoE, Rwanda, 2008).

By combining the above two as Technical and vocational Education (TVE) UNESCO and ILO (2001:17) stated as:

"all forms and aspects for education that are technical and vocational in nature provided either in vocational institution or under their authorities of the private sector or through other forms of organized education, formal or non formal aiming to ensure that members of the community have accesses to the pathways of lifelong learning"

### **2.2.3 Continuing TVET**

Continuing TVET refers to training activities in which people take part in order to obtain knowledge and/or learn new skills for a current or a future job, to increase earnings, to improve carrier opportunities in a current or another field (MoE Rwanda, 2008).

### **2.2.4 Principles of TVET**

TVET in Ethiopia has various conceptual and non conceptual principles. One of the conceptual principles is "stockholders involvement" (MoE, 2008). Specifically stakeholders are needed to play a major role in various functions of the TVET system, one of these functions is stakeholders are needed since they contribute much to the success of the system by participating in "TVET delivery through the provision of training to their own staff, offering internships to trainees and providing apprenticeship training" (Ibid). Concerning TVET delivery, the non-public sector needs to play a decisive role. It already contributes significantly through in-company TVET schemes and, in particular, through wide-spread traditional apprenticeship training provided in the micro and small business sector. In addition to these employer-based TVET schemes, non-government TVET institutions will become an increasingly important pillar of the overall TVET supply (Ibid). Hence, in short among various role of improving and widening the training delivery mode is the central role that stakeholders could play; this led us to the discussion cooperative training which warrants a genuine cooperation between TVET institution and stockholders.

## **2.3 Modes of Delivery and their challenges**

There are two types of TVET delivery modalities in Ethiopia: formal and non formal. Non-formal TVET (NFTVET) is any organized form of training for which the content and learning aims and targets have been defined. By definition, NF-TVET means training based on well-defined curricula, either within or without an institution, with or without guidance from a teacher or trainer. From the general economic development and the demand for better livelihood point of

view, NF-TVET is considered a broad area of learning that accommodates learning/training needs of various target groups both in content, scope depth and goal orientations. It also includes informal training, e.g. learning on the job or self-learning (Education Expertise Center. Ethiopia: 2008)

In the Ethiopian TVET strategy (MoE, 2008) traditionally, Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) has been fragmented and delivered by different providers at various qualification levels. Hence, this gives the modalities of training multiple pictures.

Historically, such training as institutionalized in 1976 when community skill Training Centers (CSTC), established in 1976 in various Woredas with the intention of initiating integrated rural development through a joint effort of all development sectors particularly those working at Woreda level (Education Expertise Center. Ethiopia: 2008)

Non-formal TVET programs, such as the above one designed by public institutions, NGOs, and private schools offer employment-oriented TVET programs to various target groups, including school leavers, people in employment, school drop outs and marginalized groups in the labor market. In addition such Community Skill Training Centers (CSTC), prisons, farmers training centers, rural appropriate technologies, etc are known non-formal TVET training centers (MoE, 2008; Education Expertise Center Ethiopia, 2008) while Public TVET institutions under the education sector were concentrating on producing middle level technical graduates at post Grade 10 level. In parallel with this, public and private companies have had their own TVET programs, as have NGOs and private TVET providers.

Some of the known skills and training provided in the informal centers include woodwork, metal work, tailoring, embroidery, weaving, typing, computer training, driving, etc However, experiences vary across regions in the country and in other countries regarding the types of trainings given and the modality under which it is given. It appears important to highlight the efforts made to establish CSTCs for giving training on indigenous crafts and modern trades.

The historical background, achievements, strengths and weaknesses of CSTCs is well documented in the Internal Paper No. 33, June 2005 issued by IIZ/DVV quoted in (Education Expertise Center, Ethiopia (2008). The following extract is made from this same document. Accordingly, more specifically CSTCs were created to provide education and training to youths and adults who had completed their literacy education. The objectives were:

- Introduce and expand appropriate technology for the rural community, particularly the farmers;
- Improve the backward agriculture practice through farmers Through short term training;
- Train community members with different vocational skills training areas; and
- Establish a development resource center for the community at large.

The many studies made on CSTCS indicate that they were not effective as expected. Some of the reasons documented are:

- The issue of integrating planning and human resource from various sectors and
- Providing budget to CSTCs was not addressed sufficiently right from the very beginning.
- The skill training centers were neither need based nor market oriented.
- The skill training centers are under equipped.
- Many were looted and destroyed during the last years of the Derg government.

CSTCs are underutilized due to low budget and lack of trained coordinators. CSTCs are used only a few months a year leaving the trainers idle most of the year. As a result the staff of CSTC is unmotivated and not sufficiently trained. In addition unlike formal TVET, these programs are not yet systematically delivered. Informal (on-the-job) training is widespread, but due to the absence of a systematic assessment and certification system there are currently no mechanisms to recognize informal occupational learning.

The formal TVET is much better researched than that of non-formal. There are data that helps have to have a general picture on the area for example between 1996/7 and 2004/5, the number of TVET institutions providing formal TVET increased from 17 to 199, and enrolment from 3,000 to 106,305. Of these, 31% were trained in non-government TVET institutions. Around 60% of formal TVET is provided in the form of regular programs and 40% in evening classes. However, despite the enormous expansion, formal TVET only caters for less than 3% of the relevant age group. Enrolment figures in formal TVET programs show a fair gender balance with 51% female students. However, girls are over proportionately represented in commerce and typical female occupations such as textiles and hospitality, and underrepresented in traditional technical occupations. In 2004/05, another 42,000 trainees were enrolled in agriculture TVET

programs and some 10,000 in teacher training institutes and colleges (MoE, 2008). However the following have been major problems in the sector by the national TVET strategy (MoE, 2008:10-11)

- Lack of cooperation of the employers as they were not consulted during the planning process. An internship and cooperative training system based on profound cooperation between TVET institutions and employers and a joint training delivery still needs to be developed in order to increase the quality of TVET and hence the employability of graduates.
- There are also indications that TVET lacks effectiveness and efficiency. Studies have shown that many TVET graduates remain unemployed even in those occupational fields that show a high demand for skilled manpower. Furthermore, substantial resource wastages occurred as a result of underutilization of equipment in public TVET institutions.
- The shortage of a sufficient corps of TVET teachers/instructors represents one of the obstacles to TVET development in Ethiopia. The quality of TVET teachers/instructors has suffered as a result of the low reputation of their profession.
- Most TVET teachers/instructors have relatively low formal qualifications, severely affecting TVET delivery at higher qualification levels. Furthermore, technical teachers, more often than not, have been unmotivated. They did not choose to become technical teachers, but were placed in technical teacher colleges because there were no other options available to them., Existing TVET teachers/instructors are (mostly) inappropriately practically skilled, i.e. not competent to provide TVET in accordance with the occupational standards. This is a result of a training system that long emphasized theoretical knowledge (though often not aligned with modern technology requirements), disregarding the importance of practical skills and appreciation of the world of work.
- Finally, under-funding is a structural problem in the TVET sector, particularly in the public system. Costs of TVET will remain high, if it is to be provided as centre based training, which is still the predominant mode of TVET delivery in Ethiopia. As with most other countries, public TVET programs in Ethiopia are usually more expensive than general education, requiring lower than average teacher/student ratio and substantial

capital and recurrent expenses incurred through practical training. As a consequence of budgetary constraints, most urban public TVET programs are under-funded while rural public TVET program suffered from poor facilities and shortages of training materials.

Coming back to the non formal sector, traditional apprenticeships in the small and micro enterprise sector constitute another presumably important, yet entirely un-researched, training environment. Public and private training schemes planned to produce administrative and health personnel to the market in sufficient quantity. Agriculture TVET programs, which have been massively expanded during recent years, are disconnected structurally with non-agriculture TVET programs. (Education Expertise Center, Ethiopia: 2008)

With the advent of the education and training policy, the formal TVET system of the country requires completion of a tenth-grade education and leads to certificates on the level of 10+1, 10+2 or 10+3. By contrast NF-TVET designates every other form of technical and vocational education and training. This includes:

- Training over different periods of time. From short-term courses of a few days to long-term programs of up to 6 months,
- Training through different modalities: (Institutional, community based, mobile, link and apprenticeship)
- Life skills or add-on components for Primary Educations
  - Training for a wide range of target groups:
  - Unemployed, youth and adults,
  - School dropouts and those with grade 8 - education or lower including illiterate people,
  - People potential /active in the informal economic sector,
  - People from urban and rural areas,
  - Landless poor, and
  - Disadvantaged groups
  - People with disabilities

Hence, Non-formal TVET differs from formal TVET in the following respects:

- The educational background of the target groups is different and very diverse.

- Teachers/trainers/instructors are so far usually not certified or examined.
- There are no standardized curricula to be used in non-formal TVET provision.
- The duration of training is usually shorter and varies widely.
- Non-formal TVET is more cost effective than formal TVET.

### **2.3.1 Cooperative Training**

The difference between training and education discussed in which training is considered as system aiming at providing the necessary knowledge and skills to exercise a profession in order to be integrated in the labor market. While Education aims at providing recipients with the necessary knowledge and skills to continue their studies at tertiary education level or to exercise a profession in order to be integrated into the labor market. Moreover, the later puts more emphasis on theoretical education. Hence the difference between Cooperative Education and cooperative training reflects similar difference. The discussion of the two terms here is made from the above sprit.

Cooperative education/training, a form of experiential or work-integrated *learning* is common in tertiary educational institutions worldwide. It is a collaborative enterprise in which students, employers and other actors work together to produce work-ready graduates; that is graduates that have (particularly) practical skills that complement theoretical academic learning, and that make them of almost immediate value to employers (Richard, 2007) . Hence cooperative education/training is a triad or triplet partnership involving the institution, the company and the trainee.

Cooperative education has a variety of names and these often reflect its location. So in the UK it is seen most commonly in 'sandwich' programs, and in the USA, it takes the form of 'co-op' work placements, in Ethiopia it is called cooperative training or apprenticeship (MoE, 2002, 2007). In any system, the students spend predetermined periods of time - such periods of time commonly called work placements - in a relevant workplace. So an engineering student at university might complete from two to three-months work 'placements' in an engineering firm, a

food technology student at a polytechnic might do the placement in the form of one day a week in a food testing laboratory, and so on (Richard, 2007) .

Cooperative education appears to be the peak of a series of experiential learning opportunities that include job shadowing, job twinning, and work experience or internship, and is often an integral part of school–work transition programs.

Job shadowing is a school-supervised career exploration activity, which can begin in middle of school and continue through high school. Students visit worksites and "shadow" employees as they perform their jobs. Job shadows are designed to be short term. Job shadows emphasize observing the workplace, not participating as a productive worker. The job shadow provides the student a meaningful introduction to the world of work and provides a context for understanding the relationship and interaction between the academics taught in the classroom and the workplace. Job shadowing allows a student to spend one-half to one day (or, in some cases, up to three days) with a worker in a specific occupation (MoE Ontario, 2008).

Job twinning provides the opportunity for the student to accompany a cooperative education student to his or her placement for one-half to one day. A student or trainee may participate in more than one job shadowing or job twinning experience, thereby obtaining a broader range of career information through observation in typical workplace environments (MoE Ontario, 2000).

While Internships help students move from school to the workplace by offering "hands-on" learning, in real work settings, over a relatively long period of time. They are school-supervised and may be paid or unpaid. The internship is designed to give students a better sense of the jobs within a particular business or industry; to provide students with information about all aspects of the business; and to aid them in understanding, through experience, how each part of a company aids another in meeting the goals and objectives of a business or industry (MoE Ontario, 2000).

Hence cooperative education resembles as a generic name for all experiential learning or training at work place. Irrespective of the difference between all the above types involved, cooperative education courses include a classroom component, comprising pre-placement and integration activities, and a placement component. Students earn cooperative education credits by integrating classroom theory with planned learning experiences in the community to achieve learning based on the curriculum expectations of the related course ( MoE Ontario, 2000 ). The

same is true for cooperative training that is " a program which combines academic study with paid, monitored and credit bearing work" (Bailey and Merritt in Ascher, 1994:1).

Placements should provide students with challenging opportunities. These opportunities help them to apply and extend the knowledge, and practice and refine the skills, acquired in the related course and to demonstrate achievement of placement expectations that reflect current workplace practices and standards (MoE Ontario, 2000).

Cooperative education involves a partnership between education and business, industry, agriculture, labor, or community organizations. It also includes students, teachers, parents, employers, and placement supervisors. Additional participants may be involved in the case of exceptional students and other students with special needs. Joint planning by these individuals ensures that students are provided with a systematic introduction to career exploration, experiential learning, and career planning (MoE Ontario, 2000).

Similarly Ethiopian TVET strategy defines Cooperative Training in TVET as a mode of TVET provided in partnership between enterprises and TVET institutions. Usually, the bulk of practical training takes place in an enterprise, while theory and initial practical exposure is provided by the TVET institution (MoE, 2002).

### **2.3.2 Benefits of Cooperative Training**

Cooperative education in one form or another is now a major 'industry' worldwide and is practiced widely, Franks & Blomqvist, quoted in (Coll, 2001). Cooperative training is something of an intuitive concept; one that appeals to almost anyone engaged in hiring employees or training graduates (Eames, quoted in Coll, 2007). The principal argument is that all three parties involved in cooperative education (i.e., students, employers, and companies) stand to benefit (Franks & Blomqvist, quoted in Coll, 2007).

Trainees pass-through TVET programs are expected to acquire and develop various skills and knowledge. Concerning this UNESCO described them as 'Skill matrix' covering at least three possibly four conceptually related domains (King, 2010). These are:

First are the core, essential or communication skills which are now routinely measured at basic levels of literacy, numeracy and IT, but also at higher levels of analyzing, interpreting and manipulating text and number.

Second, there are the so-called soft skills or new skills. These refer to crucial capacities such as team-work, decision-making, problem-solving, learning to learn, adaptability and negotiating, as well as using the core skills interactively. These soft skills are widely regarded as crucial to work and to successful living, and hence are also termed work skills and life skills. Terms such as employability and trainability may also be considered here.

Thirdly, there are the more occupationally-related technical and vocational skills. These too cover a range from basic levels of craft, design and technology to higher knowledge-based skills, and they span commercial, industrial, agricultural and service occupations. Surprisingly, the major student assessment programs clearly, use terms such as employable skills.

Fourthly, some analysts argue for behavioral or attitudinal skills, such as discipline, perseverance, tolerance, enterprise and self-confidence. Hence, trainees accrue some or most of the above variety of benefits as a consequence of cooperative training over conventional programs. These consist of: *academic benefits* (e.g., increased motivation to learn, increased ability to finance tuition, improved perception of benefits of study, etc.), along with *personal benefits* (e.g., increased autonomy, increased communication skills, improved time management, etc.), and *career benefits* (e.g., increased employment opportunities, career clarification, international opportunities, etc.) (Dressler and Keeling quoted in Coll, 2007).

Cooperative training as described before aids matching between employers and young people; it improves the quality of learning by making it more applied and relevant; it develops important work related knowledge and skills; and can be combined in a number of ways. The dimensions along which they vary have strong impact both up on the extent to which they are learning intensive and up on the makeup on the enterprise. As a result their benefit to the parties can vary widely (Drouhin and Richard, 2000).

countries young women are over-represented in the service sector, particularly in the low pay occupations while young men predominate in construction, industrial and craft apprenticeships.

**Careers guidance:** In the dual system countries young people must find their own apprenticeship places by making a direct application to an employer. To do this, young people must be informed in good time of the factors to be considered in making a choice of occupation. To achieve this, students are offered well-established programs of careers education in schools which examines apprenticeship occupations, the prospects they offer and the type of work involved so that students can make an informed choice of route post-16. Careers education is supported by publicly-funded careers offices and also by employer organizations and individual employers who advertise their apprenticeship opportunities and explain them to applicants. In Australia prospective apprentices are referred to employers through a network of Australian Apprenticeship Centers which in turn contact providers or Group Training Organizations. Both France and England suffer from indifference and sometimes hostility towards work-based training in schools and little or no advice is provided.

**Demand for apprentices:** In England eight per cent of employers offered apprenticeships in 2009, the lowest proportion of all the countries reported here. Nearly a third did so in Australia and in the dual-system countries around a quarter offered apprenticeships. Very large firms with over 500 employees make an important contribution to demand for apprentices. In Germany almost all such firms took on apprentices in 2005 compared to just 30 per cent in England. In all the apprentice countries demand is still not adequate to provide for all those seeking apprenticeship and government payments to employers are available in all apprentice countries – except for England – to encourage demand (Ibid).

### **2.5.2 Experience of selected African countries**

TVET systems in Africa differ from country to country and are delivered at different levels in different types of institutions, including technical and vocational schools (both public and private), polytechnics, enterprises, and apprenticeship training centers. The nature of apprenticeship also varies among African countries (AU, 2007).

In West Africa in particular, traditional apprenticeship offers the largest opportunity for the acquisition of employable skills in the informal sector. In Ghana, the informal sector accounts for more than 90 percent of all skills training in the country.

In all of Sub-Saharan Africa, formal TVET programs are school-based. In some countries, training models follow those of the colonial power. In general however, students enter the vocational education track at the end of primary school, corresponding to 6 – 8 years of education as in countries like Burkina Faso and Kenya, or at the end of lower or junior secondary school, which corresponds to 9 – 12 years of what is called basic education in countries like Ghana, Nigeria, Mali and Swaziland. The vocational education track has the unenviable reputation of being a dead end so far as academic progression is concerned and fit for those pupils who are unable to continue to higher education (Ibid).

The duration of school-based technical and vocational education is between three and six years, depending on the country and the model. Some countries begin to utilize dual system of training in the college and industries.

#### **2.5.2.1 Apprenticeship in Ghana**

Apprenticeship, as offered in the formal and informal industry, is mainly by private initiative, although some state institutions offer limited apprenticeship schemes (Education Reform Review Committee 2002 quoted in N.A. 2007).

The latest labor force data show that in 2000, informal apprenticeship sector contributed over 70% of self-employed among the total labor force of over 7 million and there were 207,047 economically active people (15 years and older) in apprenticeship training (Ghana Statistical Service 2005 in *ibid* ). Over three-quarters (76.8%) of the apprentices were aged 15 - 29 years; 18,006 (57%) were males and 89,041 (43%) were females. The males were mainly in auto-mechanics, carpentry, tailoring and driving while the females were primarily in dressmaking, hairdressing and catering (Ibid)

Modalities regarding apprenticeship in the informal sector vary. Entry requirements, if any exist, are generally low and not restricted by age, ethnicity or proof of literacy (ILO, 1988). Depending on the trade, the master and the apprentice, apprenticeship may take from months to years.

Working hours of apprentices are usually long, typically six days a week with weekly working hours ranging from 50 to 60. Some apprentices pay for their training while others forego income for the work they do. In some instances, they receive free board and lodging or some pocket money or occasional bonus. In some rare cases, apprentices are permitted to sell what they produce in their spare time with the materials and the equipment they find in the workshop (Ibid).

A characteristic of formal apprentice training in Ghana is the lack of uniformity in training content, duration and certification. These weaknesses in the training system need to be addressed. However, since apprenticeship is mainly private initiative, the Education Review Committee has recommended the formulation of government policy regarding registration of apprenticeship providers and standardization of content, duration of training programs and certification, in collaboration with industry, identifiable trade associations and training providers.

In the White Paper Report on Education Reform Review, the Government has now decided to partner the private sector in a more systematic way to promote apprenticeship programs including assuming full responsibility for the first year of the apprenticeship programs (Ministry of Education Youth and Sports, 2004).

#### **2.5.2.2 Apprenticeship in Tanzania**

In Tanzania also there are two modalities of apprenticeship training. The provided artisan training in the industrial trades are characterized by two main clienteles, namely, pre-service training to school leavers and in-service training to those who were already employed. For the school leaver group, a traditional apprenticeship model was adopted with students initially attending VTCs for one year of full time basic theoretical and practical training followed by usually three years of on-the-job training. During this latter period, students were to be formally indentured as apprentices to the sponsoring enterprise and, on successful completion of their training, were to receive a Certificate of Apprenticeship. Apprentices and other workers wanting to take Trade Tests which were administered by NVTDC attended evening classes at the VTCs. It was a formal requirement that the three Trade Tests (III to I) had to be taken sequentially ( Bennell et al., 1999).

Broadly speaking, this training was confined to a limited range of traditional, male dominated artisan trades and was primarily oriented to meeting the needs of formal sector enterprises, particularly in the manufacturing sector.

By early 1998, VETA management had started to make concerted efforts to ensure that training provided by VTCs becomes more demand driven. In particular, labor demand surveys were carried out in all eight regions during 1997 in order to assess training needs of both formal and informal sector enterprises in all sectors. New modular based training is also being slowly introduced that covers both technical/manual and entrepreneurial/commercial skills. There is a clear recognition that traditional long, pre-employment artisan training must be increasingly replaced by short-term training that is targeted on training needs of workers already in employment. However, three and a half years after its creation, actual progress made by VETA in reorienting its training provision remains limited. While the reason for this slow progress are not entirely clear, management shortcomings have undoubtedly been a major factor.

#### **2.5.2.3. Apprenticeship in Kenya**

Similar to Ethiopia and other African countries apprenticeship in Kenya has two wings as formal and in formal apprenticeship training. The feature of Kenyan apprenticeship/ cooperative training/ is summarized as follows.

The formal apprenticeship program bases on the government legislation in 1973 to formalize the apprenticeship training system thorough comprehensive national industrial training scheme for the training of craft apprentices. To encourage the industries to train their workers in accordance with the new training scheme, a levy was introduced herby all medium and large companies would be required to contribute. Those who provided training from their workers would be entitled to a reimbursement at the end of the year. A very small number of youth obtains training thorough this system (Fereje, 2000).

During the apprenticeship period the learners are required to take trade tests at appropriate level of the program. The lowest competency level awarded is at grade 3 and Grade 1 is the highest level.

The informal (apprenticeship system in Kenya has its roots in the Indian craftsmen imported in to the country during colonial days, from the construction of railways. After its completion the

Indians stayed and formed the basis of the skilled technical manpower in the country mainly for maintaining of the railway. People working with Indians acquired enough trade skills to work as semi skilled and later as skilled workers. There are various characteristics of this sector to date depending on the owner/trainer or idiosyncratic values of the learned and so on. The system is the low regard for formal certification.

Most of the learning in apprenticeship training takes place on the job. In the case of formal apprenticeship training, the Industrial Training act in Kenya mandates vocational college attendance for about six months in each year. The learning process for the apprenticeship involves observing or actually working on tasks. Within the informal sector no time limits are imposed. Apprentices progress at their own pace and can exit whenever they feel they have acquired sufficient skills.

As any one expects the Kenyan system of apprenticeship training the breadth and depth of the craft masters knowledge and skills as well as those of the other journeymen will to a large extent determine the knowledge and skills the apprentices acquire. Additionally the social interaction between the apprentices and the journey men and other apprentices are also crucial to the overall development of the apprentice. Overall the contextual factor determines the quality of technical and enterprise skills of the apprentices as well as their entrepreneurial interest ( Fereje, 2000) .

In general, as briefly described in the above, countries throughout the world pursue various structures and strategies in designing and implementing TVET in general and cooperative training in particular. The primary lesson that can be drawn from the above survey of experience of selected countries, most of them involves various stakeholders to realize the objectives of cooperative training. Secondly African countries tend to integrate their modern cooperative training system with the existing traditional training practices or formal with the informal sector. Above all the variety and uniqueness of the practice of cooperative training in the above countries entail the designing and implementation of CT depends on the situation and dynamics of the local context. Hence, despite the promotion of various popular strategies such as the forming of partnership and involvement of nongovernmental actors in CT, the planning, implementation and assessment of CT should base on the local demand and dynamics.

## **Chapter Three**

### **3. Methodology**

#### **3.1 Study Design**

This research is a case study in which a purposive sampling technique is utilized. This made deliberately to select students who experienced Cooperative Training and industries which participate in Cooperative Training with Lucy TVET College. In so doing the primary data generated through from trainees, trainers, College management members, industry supervisors and owners. According to Case study is an empirical inquiry that investigates contemporary phenomena within its real life context and multiple source of evidence are used including observation and interviews (Creswell and Clark, 2007).

Case study has its own drawback, in order to overcome this problem the Study employed field observation and documentary research. As represented by Creswell and Clark (2007), that the most common and well-known approach for the mixing methods is the triangulation design. It is useful to obtain different but complimentary data on the same topic to best understanding the research topic. In this study, the triangulation design is used to bring together the strength and non-overlapping weaknesses of quantitative method with those of qualitative methods.

#### **3.2 Target sample**

In this study, the target sample are stakeholders of Cooperative Training such as Trainers, Trainees, the college management and industry/ enterprises /companies in Afar Regional State taking Lucy TVET College as a case.

#### **3.3 Data Source**

In order to achieve the objectives of the study, data was collected mainly from primary sources through questionnaires, interviews and field observations. Secondary data from published and unpublished materials, such as books, and journals are also used.

To acquire representative sampling out of 200 total trainees who experienced CT from the exiting four departments (Accounting, Irrigation, Sanitation and electro mechanics) 30 trainees selected randomly from the three departments which has 55-60 class size and 10 trainees randomly from one department which has 30 trainees (See table 3.1). In general 100 trainees

were selected following semi clustered and random sampling to ensure representation from each department.

Thirty trainers were considered as a sample which is total number of trainers in the college. These respondents filled the questionnaire. Similarly the top 5 management members were taken as an interviewee including the two deans of the college. Moreover, one guidance counselor is taken as an additional interviewee.

Regarding supervisors and owners/heads of industries 13 and 11 respectively were selected as an interviewee purposively from those industries and companies involved in Cooperative training with the college (see Table 3.1).

Hence the sampling technique can be said semi-cluster, purposive and random sampling

**Table 3.1: sample Size of the study**

No.	Sample type	Total	Sample	%
1	trainers	30	30	100
2	Trainees who involved in CT	200	100	50
3	Management of the college	5	5	100
4	Industry Supervisors	20	13	60
5	Industry Managers	20	11	55
6	Guidance and councilor	1	1	100
	<b>Total</b>	<b>276</b>	<b>160</b>	<b>58</b>

**Source: Lucy TVET College**

As Table 3.1 depicts there are 230 trainers and trainees, 5 management members as well as one guidance and councilor who are related to CT. From these 30 of them are trainers and 200 of them are trainees. In order to get industry supervisors and owners it is used the already existed total number which accounts around 20 (which involve in CT) of which 13 and 11 were selected respectively.

## **Chapter Four**

### **4. Data Presentation and Analysis**

This chapter consists of description and analysis of the data collected through different techniques. The first part describes the general characteristics of the respondents'. Then, the main theme of this study namely: the status and practice of cooperative training in Lucy TVET College focusing on various detailed dynamics is discussed. In so doing, the data gathered through semi-structured questionnaires are triangulated with the data acquired through in-depth interview of the key informant.

#### **4.1 General Description of the respondents**

To describe and analyze the status and practice of Cooperative Training in Afar Regional State taking Lucy TVET College as a case study is the major theme of the study. The numbers of trainers' respondents were 30 all 30 were properly responded. This shows that the response rate was 100%. On the other hand the number of trainees' respondents was 100 of which all of them were properly responded. This also shows the response rate is still 100%. This achieved owing to fact that in distributing the questionnaires it is used formal channels and gatherings so that respondents return the questionnaires soon.

The demographic features such as gender, age, educational status, years of experience, profession, addressed in this part of the study.

#### 4. 1.1 Description of TVET trainers/instructors

Table 4.1.1 Description of TVET trainers/instructors, Guidance and Councilor and Management by educational status and gender

No	Position	Educational Status									Total
		Diploma			Degree			Masters			
		M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	
1	Trainers	7	1	8	20	2	22	-	-	-	30
2	Guidance and councilor	-	-	-	1	0	1	-	-	-	1
3	Management members	-	-	-	4	0	4	1	0	1	5
	<b>Total</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>36</b>

As depicted in the Table 4.1.1 out of 30 trainers 8 of them have diploma while 22 are degree holders. In terms of gender distribution are three female trainers of which 2 of them have degree. The guidance and councilor has degree but not in related filled to his position. There is only one MA holder who assumes managerial position while the rest of management members are degree holders.

**Table 4.1.2 Respondents characteristics based on Age and years of experience**

No			Years of work experience			Total
			Trainers	Guidance and councilor	Management members	
1	Age	20-30	9	-	-	9
		31-40	15	-	4	19
		Above 41	6	1	1	8
	<b>Total</b>		<b>30</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>36</b>
2	Work Experience	Below 5 years	10	-	4	14
		6-10	17	-	-	17
		11-15	3	1	1	5
		Above 16	-	-	-	-
	<b>Total</b>		<b>30</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>36</b>

As described on the Table 4.1.2., in Lucy TVET College, there are 15 trainers (50%) with age ranging from 31-40, while 9 from 20-30 and 6 above 40 years old. Hence, it can be concluded that the age distribution in the college is predominantly young. Coming to the experience there are only 3 trainers with experience above 11 while the rest are below 10 years of experience. The management members' age predominately between 31-40 and their experience also reflection of their age.

Hence, one can see that in terms of experience Lucy TVET College filled by young professional which has its own implication on the management and training performances. Moreover, the shortage of professional and skilled human resource both in Guidance Counseling and in the management section adds another gloomy picture on the fulfillment of requirements for CT in particular and TVET in general.

### 4.1.3. Description of Trainees

**Table 4.1.3 Distribution of trainees based on age, level and department**

No		Years											Total	
1	Level	III												
2	Year	3 <sup>rd</sup>												
3	Department	Electro Mechanical Technician	Irrigation			Sanitation			Accounting					
		30	30			30			10			100		
4	Age	Below 15			16-20			21-25			Above 26			
		M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	M	F	T	
		-	-	-	9	6	15	45	30	75	6	4	10	100

As depicted in the Table 4.1.3 all respondents are level III 3<sup>rd</sup> year trainees. They were selected from the four departments, of which accounting department represented by only 10 trainees while the rest there by 30 trainees each. Concerning age the majority of trainees are from 21-25 years while 10 trainees are above 26 years. This indicates that the trainees are very ready for the world of work at least in age.

## 4.2 Awareness and Interest towards Cooperative Training

Table 4.2.. Industries and trainees Interest towards cooperative training

Respondents	Questions	Responses			
		Strongly Agree %	Agree %	Disagree %	Strongly Disagree %
Trainees	Industries have interest towards CT	-	4	37	59
	Trainees are interested in CT	75	12	6	7
	Industries have awareness about CT	7	27	18	48
Trainers	Industries have interest towards CT	13	10	70	7
	Trainees are interested in CT	67	33	0	0
	Industries have awareness about CT	9	11	17	63

As clearly indicated in the Table 4.2. respondents reacted negatively to the statement which claim industries interested on cooperative training. From 100% of each group of respondents about 7% trainers and 59% trainees strongly disagreed, 70% of trainers and 37% of trainees disagreed. Only 4% of trainees and 23% of trainers respond positively. This indicates that as important stakeholders both trainees and trainers perceive industries negative feeling towards Cooperative Training.

The above data also reflected during interview with the supervisors and managers. Out of 13 supervisors 9 of them express CT as a burden to the industry/company. They justified their claim by listing various problems such as diverting human resource away from production, increasing maintenance of machineries, adding burden of management and so on. According to the

interviewees the serious problem they face is the issue of insurance and medical service as a result of any accident that may happen during training. The trainees are insured neither through the college nor through the industries.

Similarly the college management members also expressed difficulty in convincing industries /companies to accept trainees for CT. Primarily; they do not feel responsible even to understand their role in CT. They consider CT as way of TVET colleges transferring risk and burden to them. As a result they remain reluctant to accept trainees or limit the number of trainees they could train.

Hence, one can easily understand that the level of willingness of the industries to CT. However both the Ethiopian TVET strategy and other similar documents consider industries as major stakeholder in CT. The cooperative Training Handbook as discusses in the second chapter (MoE, 2007) also considers the involvement or partnership with enterprises/industries as one of the basic requirements of CT. Despite this entire claim the willingness of industries in Afar Region appears to be very low as describe above. This can be considered as a major challenge for the practice of CT in the region.

Similarly, The Respondents were asked to react for a statement stating the interest of trainees in Cooperative Training (see annex I. question number 5 and annex 2 question number 1). As a result only 7% and 6% of trainees strongly disagreed and disagreed respectively, while large number of trainees 75% strongly agreed and 12% agreed. Similarly, none of the trainers reacted negatively to the statement, while 33% agreed and 67% strongly agreed with the claimed statement (See Table 4.2.). It can be concluded that trainees are interested in cooperative training in Lucy TVET College. Hence, regarding interest of trainees there is no gap for effective practice of CT in the college.

Concerning the awareness of industries about CT, as it is indicated in the Table 4.2. more than 60% (48% strongly Disagreed and 18% disagreed) of trainees claim that industries have a gap in understanding Cooperative Training. Trainers also claim similarly as 63% of them strongly disagreed and 17% of disagreed. Here, it can be concluded that lack of awareness of the over whole benefit of Cooperative Training is a major challenge in the region. This gap could make industries and their workers to be reactant to participate and improve Cooperative training.

During interview with the managers and supervisors, the problem of awareness on CT is expressed by the respondents who even demand regular awareness creation and experience exchange program on the CT.

The college management also reflects similar idea during interview in which respondents described industries do not understand or have the will to understand about CT. Since as business persons they calculate the cost and benefit of engaging in such initiative. So they see less direct benefit out of CT so react negatively or remain reluctant to invest any attention or time on it. Hence, according to the interviewees, the lack of understanding about CT is somehow seems motivated forgetting or motivated ignorance by the industries.

### 4.3. Benefit of Cooperative Training

Table 4.3. Benefit of Cooperative Training and the proximity of the CTC

Respondents	Questions	Responses			
		Strongly Agree %	Agree %	Disagree %	Strongly Disagree %
Trainers	CT Minimizes the cost of training in the college	43	52	5	0
	CT is a burden to the college	0	0	77	23
Trainees	CT is Important means to getting a job	60	28	7	5
	I am benefited from CT.	31	57	12	0
Trainees	I travel far to reach to CT Center	43	4	52	1

To assess the benefit of CT to the college and trainees, respondents were asked to indicate the role of CT to the two parties.

Primarily, trainers were asked to indicate their opinion on the role of CT in minimizing the college's cost. As depicted in Table 4.3. 52% of the respondents agreed while 43% strongly agreed to the claim. Thus, CT in Lucy TVET College is being considered as strategy to minimize cost of Training. Moreover, based on this data, it can be deducted that CT in the college is playing substantial role.

Trainers were also asked to react of the negative statement which indicates CT as burden to the college than benefit. As indicated on the Table 4.3., all of them responded negatively i.e. 23% strongly disagree and 77% disagree. Hence, this data primarily entails that trainers' positive perception about CT. Secondly, it may also show that practical role of CT as value adding system to Lucy TVET College in particular and to Afar Regional States and elsewhere TVET system in general.

The data gathered from Interviewing supervisors and managers also confirm the above positive attitude. All most all respondents concur on the benefit of CT to the trainees in various aspects such as accessibility of practical training, accesses to job, development of hard working culture, acquainting to the world of work, introduction of machineries and so on.

Trainees were asked to indicate their view on the role of CT in accessing the job to them. As shown in table 4.3. 60% of trainees strongly agreed and 28% agreed indicating their view on CT role as important way taking them to the environment of job. Here, this data, can be interpret as Trainees see CT not only as source and vehicle of knowledge and skill but also as bridge to the world of work. This view is more an asset than a liability to the CT system.

The same spirit is reflected from the interviewees who consider CT as vehicle through which industries could accesses trained human power. They express that during hiring process they give priority to those graduates trained in their industry.

Trainees were asked to indicate whether they are benefited from CT or not. As indicated in Table 4.3. Only 12% disagreed while 57% agreed and the rest 31% strongly agreed. Here the data indicate that more than 85% of trainees benefited from CT. Hence, one can evaluate despite various circumstances CT is more or less is benefiting trainees.

Trainees were asked to react on statement that indicates their travel far to reach to CT centers. As indicated in Table 4.3. 52% responded agree while 1% strongly agreed, hence it can be concluded that more than 50% of trainees in Lucy TVET college travelled longer distance to get CT. This could be considered as one of the infrastructural and operational problem which hinder or minimize the accessibility and the quality of Cooperative Training.

The data listed on the open ended question of the trainees' questionnaire reflect the above problem as major challenge in the area. According to the trainees they travel longer distance to reach both the college and the industries for cooperative training. They travel an average of 8 km from their home to the college then back to their home. The weather condition of the area worsens the problem. As a result absenteeism and late coming both in the class room and industries is a norm than exceptional phenomena.

#### **4.4. Management of CT in Lucy TVET College**

As discuss in chapter two, management involves various aspects or function ranging from planning to evaluation. Management of Cooperative Training also involves similarly various tasks and functions. Here, in this part, opinion of respondents on various issues related to management of CT such as professional guidance and counseling, CT guide, role of trainers, readiness of trainees for CT, assignment and evaluation of trainees' performance based on curriculum and so on are analyzed and presented.

**Table 4.4. Management of CT in Lucy TVET College**

Respondents	Question	Responses			
		Strongly Disagree %	Disagree %	Agree %	Strongly Agree %
Trainers	The presence of refreshment training in the college	0	0	23	77
	The presence of training on CT in the college	0	0	23	77

On job training is said to be one means of creating competent human power and it is one aspect of human resource management in TVET system in particular and any other system in general. Regarding this trainers were asked to indicate the presence of refreshment training in their college. Surprisingly, all trainers reacted negatively as indicated in Table 4.4. Hence, it can be deducted that there is a serious deficit of on job training in Lucy TVET College. This would have its own implication on the overall performance of the college in general and the management and practice of cooperative training in particular. The same reaction is exhibited for question regarding the presence of training on CT in the college.

Trainer also asked to tell the accessibility of CT guideline to the trainees. As depicted in the Table 4.5. More than 80% (7 strongly disagree and 77 disagree) reacted negatively. Only 16 % (13 agreed and 3 strongly agreed) witness the accessibility of the guide to trainees.

Trainees also asked to respond on the benefit they may acquire from the CT guideline. As clearly, indicated in the Table 4.5, only 9% of the respondents agreed on the benefit of the guideline. The remaining 91% (14% strongly disagreed and 77% disagreed) claimed that they got no benefit from the CT guideline. This could be related to the previous two identified problems. These are the problem of appropriateness and accessibility. To go to deeper observation even from those trainees who have claimed to accesses the CT guide (16%) think that they do not benefit from the guideline. Hence, it can be concluded that the problem is not only related to accessibility but also appropriateness of the CT guide in Lucy TVET College.

#### 4.6. The Role of Guidance and Councilor

Table 4.6. The Role of Guidance and Counselor in CT

Respondents	Questions	Responses			
		Strongly Disagree %	Disagree %	Agree %	Strongly Agree %
Trainers	The presence of professional guidance and counselor	50	40	10	0
	The role of Guidance and counselor	40	56	4	0
Trainees	I have Guidance and Councilor whom I consult for any concern	42	37	16	5

Vocational guidance and councilor is one of the basic requirements for successful CT. The councilor is expected to monitor, assist and coordinates enterprise training and ensures the school based competences are learned in accordance with the training plan ( MoE, 2007). Trainers were

asked to indicate the presence of professional Guidance and Councilor in the College. As shown in Table 4.6., only 10% agreed and 40% trainers disagreed and 50% strongly disagreed with the claim. Since the majority (90%) of the trainers claims the absence of professional guidance and councilor, it can be concluded that, there is a gap in skilled and competent Guidance and Councilor in the Lucy TVET College.

To explore the role being played by Guidance and Councilor in the college, trainers were asked to react to a claim stated as “Guidance and Counselor plays a great role in CT program of my college”. As indicated in Table 4.6. Only 4% of trainers agreed while the remaining 56% disagree and 40% strongly disagreed. This may be because of shortage of professional guidance and councilor or many other problems the role being played by the guidance and councilor in the college seems very insignificant. As discussed in the second chapter the role of guidance counselor in TVET system in general in cooperative training program in particular is very significant. However, in Lucy TVET College the practice of CT not supported by professional guidance and counseling service. The implication of this gap would be reflecting on trainees’ professional choice, pursuit of cooperative training and so on.

The absence of a person who could follow up the CT in industries from the college is mentioned by many supervisors and industry managers as a challenge for the ongoing CT program. This, according to the respondents, gives the impression that the college is simply transferring its responsibility to the industries. They consider this gap as justification for their claim that CT is a burden to them than to the college.

The college management members and guidance and councilor also reflected the similar idea regarding the problem of shortage of personnel who could follow up CT in industries. According to the respondents the college has only one guidance and councilor who could play the above role but he could follow all trainees because of the fact that the trainees’ large number. To make matter works according the respondents, the guidance and councilor of the college is not professional.

The above question with different form was presented to the trainees to explore despite the shortage of professionalism how much the trainees are benefited from the college Guidance and Councilor. The question stated as “I have Guidance and Councilor whom I consult for any

concern” For this claim, as indicated in Table 4.6. 42% strongly disagreed, 37% disagreed, 16% agreed and only 5% of the trainees strongly agreed. The response of the trainees also indicates the gap in guidance and counseling service in the college.

#### 4.7 The allotment of time for CT

Table 4.7 The allotment of time for CT in Lucy TVET College

Respondents	Question	Responses			
		Strongly Disagree %	Disagree %	Agree %	Strongly Agree %
Trainers	Allotted Time for C.T is Enough	50	4	24	22
Trainees	Allotted Time for CT is Enough	8	49	32	11

Education and training management include the allotment of appropriate time. So time management in education has implication on the outcome of the sector. Both trainers and trainees were asked to react for the claim which indicted the allotment of enough time to CT. As indicated in the Table 4.7. Their response is contradicting. 50 % of trainers strongly agreed while almost the same number of trainees, (49%) strongly disagreed. Such disparity indicates problems in allotment of time. It seems that trainees face shortage of time or lack of satisfaction on the duration of CT in the college. However, trainers believe that the time is well enough to the program. In fact considerable number of trainees 43% reacted positively. Hence, it indicates the problem may only reflect on limited departments. Thus it can be concluded that at least on some sections and department of Lucy TVET College the allotted time for CT seems to be problematic.

Regarding time management the data gathered from the interview indicate that not only the duration but also the schedule of the CT often does not suit with the annual plan of the industries. Moreover, the college often fails to adhere to the schedule of it set annually.

According to the college management, the time allotment is designed from the center and they as implementers try to realize any curriculum send to them from the Regional Education Bureau. In fact the college community has the right to comment on the issues to the Education Bureau. They concur that in some department there could be shortage while in other extra time during CT.

#### 4.8. The Readiness and capability of trainees to CT

Table 4. 8. The Readiness and Capability of Trainees to CT

Respondents	Question	Responses			
		Strongly Disagree %	Disagree %	Agree %	Strongly Agree %
Trainees	I am ready for CT	4	8	40	48
Trainers	Trainers are ready for CT	14	23	45	18

Trainees were asked to react to their readiness in skill to involve in cooperative training. As indicated in Table 4.8. 88% of trainees (48% strongly agree and 40% agree) responded positively while the remaining 12% disagree or strongly disagreed. This indicates that in Lucy TVET College trainees start CT after acquiring basic skills on their field of specialization. Moreover, in terms of confidence and self image the trainees appear to be more ready for CT.

However, all industry managers and supervisors during interview mentioned lack of basic knowledge, skill and discipline as well as work habit define most trainees joining their industries. This situation created a challenge in CT according to most supervisors. Lack of industriousness and discipline is another serious challenge even affecting day to day communication of the community in industries and the trainees. This problem may perceive because of the miss match of the expectation of the industries and the actual competency of the trainees.

#### 4.9. The Role of Trainers to CT

Table 4.9 The Role of Trainers to CT

Respondents	Question	Responses			
		Strongly Disagree %	Disagree %	Agree %	Strongly Agree %
Trainers	I as a trainer has a role in improving the management of CT	0	0	77	23
Trainees	My Trainer assists me in CT	64	30	0	6

Trainers were asked to respond to the statement “I as a trainer have much role to improve the management of CT” For this statement as depicted in Table 4.9. All of them reacted positively as 77% agreed and 23% strongly agreed with the claim of the provided sentence. This data indicated that in Lucy TVET College the trainers’ role and their attitude as well as willingness to improve the status of Cooperative Training management are great.

To check the practicability of this willingness and positive attitude trainees were asked to indicate the level of assistance they acquire from their respective trainers. As indicted below in Table 4.9. Only 6% trainees respond positively claiming that they are getting assistance from their trainers. 94% of trainees claim that they are not getting any assistance from their respective trainers in cooperative training. This indicates that not only the dissatisfaction of the trainees but also the trainers’ willingness to improve CT is not well utilized by the system.

#### 4.10. Assignment and Assessment of Trainees in CT

Table 4. 10 Assignments and Assessment of Trainees in CT

Respondents	Questions	Responses			
		Strongly Agree %	Agree %	Disagree %	Strongly Disagree %
Trainers	Assignment of trainees on the right work position	10	60	27	3
	Trainees are not well assessed during CT	10	15	40	35
Trainees	Assignment of trainees on the right work position	70	15	14	1
	Assessment of Trainee performance in CT	1	3	90	6

As discussed in the second chapter, placement should provide trainees with challenging opportunities. These opportunities help them to apply and extend the knowledge, and practice as well as refine the skills, required in the related course and to demonstrate achievement of placement expectations that reflect current workplace practices and standards. The respondents were asked to indicate the properness of assignment of trainees on the right job position during cooperative training. As indicated in Table 4.10. Majority of respondents reacted negatively, 70% of trainees and 10% of trainers at the level of strongly disagree and 60% trainers and 15% of trainees disagreed for positive claim of the sentence on the appropriateness of the assignment of the trainees.

This dictates that the assignment of trainees by industry on any job position that may not be related to the curriculum and overall objective of training.

Interviewees also concur with the above idea. They explained that reason for this assignment problem because of the fact that the higher number of trainees in one job position. When this occur industries forced to distribute trainees to different job positions despite the position failed to fit with the curriculum and specialization of the trainees

The college management members also reflect the above problem. They express that industries often assign trainees on the wrong position where they simply serve the industries as laborers than professional technicians. For example trainees send for accounting and other business departments may end up being cleaners and organizer of old files in any enterprise during the time allotted to CT. Hence, the less will of on cooperative training is not only reflecting on during reception but also during assignments of trainees on the right job position.

Like the assignment here also respondents were asked to indicate the assessment process in CT. They were asked to react to a statement “Trainees are not well assessed during CT”.

As it shown in the Table 4.10., 6% of trainees and 35% trainers strongly disagreed and 40% of trainers and 90% of trainees disagreed. Only total of 25 % of trainers and 4 % of trainees reacted positively. Hence, the data clearly indicate the gap in assessment of trainees’ performance during cooperative training. The gap in assessment of trainees’ performance is a direct reflection of the assignment problem. Moreover, interviewees consider not only the high number of trainees but also the lack of skilled personnel on the assessment technique in the industry as a major challenge to the assessment program.

The college management members also express the problem similarly. According to them so far they have receive no trainees being assessed as incompetent by industries, most of the trainees have graded above 90%. This clearly shows how the system is seriously spoiled.

#### **4.11 The Assignment of Supervisor by industries during CT**

As indicated in the second chapter a training coordinator or supervisor, who based in enterprise /industry where he/she play a role in ensuring that the trainee acquires the required work based competences indicated in the training plan is required for successful accomplishment of CT. Based on this the presence of CT supervisor in CT system of Lucy TVET College is explored as follows:

**Table 4.11 Assignment of Supervisor by industries during CT**

Respondents	Question	Responses			
		Strongly Disagree %	Disagree %	Agree %	Strongly Agree %
Trainer	Industries assign supervisors for CT	30	60	0	10
Trainees	Industries assign supervisors for CT	75	18	3	4

Respondents were asked to indicate the presence of the right supervisor in their respective cooperative training centers. As it can be seen on the Table 4.11 75% of trainees and 30% trainers strongly disagreed to the statement indicating the presence of appropriate supervisor for cooperative training. 60% of trainers and 18% of trainees similarly disagreed to the claim. Hence, it can be concluded that the industries do not assign professional supervisor for cooperative training. This gap can have its own implication on training and assessment of the performance of trainees at cooperative training.

Data from interview with the managers and supervisors indicate that the industry may fail to assign supervisors to each trainee because of lack of professional human power. Sometimes when the work load increases industries could not move a human power from one production area and hence they encourage trainees to work by themselves cooperating with any worker in the work position. This problem worsen because lack of supervisor from the college side.

However, the college management expressed that they have some supervisor who could follow up the CT by visiting the industries. They don't stay there long owing to the fact that they have to supervisor all trainees of the college.

#### 4.12 Infrastructure provided for CT and the general status of the management

Table 4.12 Infrastructure provided for CT and the general status of the management

Respondents	Question	Responses			
		Strongly Disagree %	Disagree %	Agree %	Strongly Agree %
Trainees	There is Poor level of Infrastructure for C.T in the college	12	18	30	40
Trainer	There is Poor level of Infrastructure for C.T in the college	7	3	18	72
Trainers	There is good staffs of management of CT	7	77	13	3

Trainees were asked to react to a statement which describes the poor level of infrastructure provided by their college for cooperative training. As it is indicated in the Table 4.12 70% (40% strongly agreed and 30% agreed) reacted positively indicating the poor level of infrastructure for cooperative training. This makes up additional challenge to practice of cooperative training in the area.

Similarly, trainees also reflect the same idea on the status of infrastructure provided by the college to CT. Here

Similarly trainers were asked to describe the level of the management of Cooperative Training in their college. As depicted in table 4.12 77% of the trainers responded that they disagree with the positive claim of the statement about the management of CT in the college. Similarly 7 % trainers strongly disagreed. This shows the poor level of management of CT in Lucy TVET College. This, no doubt that, is the implication of various gaps and problems discuss in the

could minimize the problem of guidance and counseling by mobilizing trainers to assist trainees in cooperative training.

Problem related to proper guideline for cooperative training: the role of guideline in cooperative training is indispensable. But this role would be more visible when there is appropriate guideline and accesses to the stakeholders on the right time. However the cooperative training guideline in Lucy TVET College is not appropriately prepared and accessible to the stakeholders.

Assignment and assessment during cooperative training: trainees' involve in cooperative training so that they could enhance their technical skill by practical experience in the industries. However the assignment of trainees in non related job position is a common trained in the region. As a result trainees return back to their college without gaining the intended skill and competence. This seriously affects the major objective cooperative training. Another dimension of placement is the assignment of trainees in the inappropriate industries where there is no facility for the intended training.

Similarly, the assessment of the performance of the trainees also exhibited similar challenge. This in fact is direct reflection of the assignment problem. If trainees are not assigned on the right position how and with what standard could they be evaluated? Industries consider the large number of trainees and the lack of skilled personnel to evaluate the trainees' performance in industry as a major course of the problems in assignment and assessment.

Lack of follow up from the college: the cooperative training in the industries are not supported by personnel from the college. The industries/companies expected personnel from the college to follow up the training in industries. However this demand has not yet positively responded by the college. This is not only because of lack of human resources in the college but also because of lack of commitment and devotion from the management.

between the college and industries: stakeholders of cooperative training mainly colleges and industries are expected to work together for mutual benefit. However, the relation between college and industries is not as expected. Their relation is very limited to exchange of cooperative training. They do not plan and evaluate cooperative training practice and do not get any service from the college. Most industries consider their cooperative training as burden than an asset. The college does not try to improve

the relation by various means's. In general the relation between the college and industries is very poor. In other word the major stakeholders in cooperative training despite their participation are not getting benefit from the program.

This seriously affects the cooperative training which demands full commitment and cooperation from all stockholders. The problem reflected during agreement signing, assignment and assessment of trainees in industries.

## **5.2 Conclusion**

Cooperative training as an integral part of TVET system involves various stakeholders and demands vast investments. Therefore, at each stage such as, planning, implementation and evaluation of cooperative training, the involvement of various actors such as TVET institution, and enterprises/ industries as well as the deployment of sufficient inputs is indispensable. The success of cooperative training demands all these actors and resources as well as the harmonization of all actors for the common cause, i.e., the success of cooperative training.

Viewing the practice of CT at Lucy TVET College from the above spirit indicates that the CT has various problems at planning, implementation and evaluation stages. The problems have emanated among other things, shortage of resource/ human and material/ and finance, poor management of the college, reluctance of the enterprises/ industries to take part more genuinely in the cooperative training as well as lack of effort from the college to increase the involvement of enterprises/ companies in the CT. All these gaps appear a bottleneck of cooperative training in the region.

### 5.3 Recommendations

All the above problems exhibited in the practice of cooperative training of Lucy TVET and Water Works College seriously affect the cooperative training in particular the over whole TVET system of the region as well as the relation between stakeholders in general. Hence, the college has to consider all problems and attempt to minimize the gap by cooperating itself with all stakeholders such as the industries/companies. In doing so, the following recommendations are forwarded based on the conclusion.

1. The college have to try to ensure the mutual benefit of the system by providing its service to the stakeholders and improving the awareness of the stakeholders towards cooperative training. Mainly it would be more advisable to increase the awareness of the industries and companies regarding cooperative training
2. Much has to be done to improve the management of Cooperative training in the college. The college has to involve stakeholders in planning, organizing directing and evaluating the Cooperative training. In this regard the time of the cooperative training, its duration and so on should consider the annual plan and intake capacity of the industries.
3. The college has to ensure the competency and behavior of trainees before dispatching them to cooperative training. In this regard the college could utilize non technical teachers in the college such as civic and ethical education and entrepreneur teachers. Moreover co curricular clubs could be used as a vehicle in enhancing the discipline and manner of the trainees
4. The college has to diversify its income by closely working with stakeholders and using other means. This could easily assists in minimizing the budget deficit of the college. So the lack of infrastructure or human resources could be minimized by non government source of income.
5. The college has to try to use the trainers and other human resource of the college so as to improve the practice of cooperative training in the college. This could be in deploying trainers to assist trainees in cooperative training, in planning or evaluating the cooperative training, in awareness creation programs, in come generating activities and so on.
6. The college has to assign regular supervisors of the cooperative training so as to insure proper placement, training and assessment of the trainees in the industries.

7. The college has to exert its effort to involve more stakeholders in planning, implementing and evaluation of the TVET system. Moreover, it has to create means of motivation for the stakeholders through giving recognition, may be advertising their deeds and participation in the cooperative training if not their product to the college community .
8. The college has to generate strategy to fill the gap created by unskilled guidance and councilor. It may use creating on job training to the existing councilor or hiring additional councilor by cooperating with the stakeholders.

## Reference

- AU. (2007). Strategy to Revitalize Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Africa
- Baharu, Z. (1991). Modern History of Ethiopia 1955-1974. Addis Ababa AAU, press.
- Banerjee, M. (1984). Business Organization and Management. New Delhi, Kalyani publishers
- Bennell H. et al. (1999) Vocational Education and Training in Tanzania and Zimbabwe in the Context of Economic Reform - Education Research Paper No. 28, 1999, 122 p.
- Castillo, J. et al. (1999). "Job satisfaction of Ohio agricultural education teachers" The Ohio State University *Journal of Agricultural Education*.
- Castro, C. (1995). Training policies for the end of the century: UNESCO: International Institute for Educational Planning Paris.
- Coll, R. (2007). Learning science and technology through cooperative education, School of Science & Engineering, University of Waikato, AsiaPacific Journal of Cooperative Education, 2007, 8(2), 131-147 retrieved on January 2011.
- Cook and Hunsaker. (2002). Management and Organizational Behavior Boston, McGraw-Hill, Inc.
- Davar, R. (2003). Personnel Management and Industrial Relations. Bombay, Vikas Publishing.
- Drouhin, M. and Richard, S. (2000). 'From initial education to working life: making transition work' in David Atchoarena The transition of youth from school to work, eds. UNESCO available at <http://www.unesco.org/iiep>.
- Ecbp. (2006). Who is who in TVET in Ethiopia; Addis Ababa? Engineering capacity building program(MoE).
- Ecdp. (2007). Co operative training Hand book ecdp.
- Education Expertise Center. Ethiopia. (2008). Non . Formal TVET Mapping Survey The case of Amhara, Oromia and Addis Ababa.
- Fereje, A. (2000). The integration of youth into the informal sector: the Kenyan experience in David Atchoarena The transition of youth from school to work, eds. UNESCO available at <http://www.unesco.org/iiep>.
- Francis, D. (2007). Enhancing Apprenticeship Training in Ghana Through Distance Learning, Department of Technology Education, University of Education, Winneba.
- Gibaldi, J. (1995). MLA Hand book for writers of research papers. New York. The modern language Association of America.

## **Annex I**

**Addis Ababa University  
School of Graduate Studies  
College of Education  
Department of Business Education**

### **Questionnaire for TVET Instructors**

The main purpose of this questionnaire is to collect information about Cooperative Training in Afar Regional state.

Please note that your input is every important to this study, so please try to answer all the questions (without skipping any).

The study is meant for impartial fulfillment of MA Degree in Educational Management.

#### **General Direction:**

1. Please do not write your name
2. Please encircle wherever there are alternatives.
3. Write your opinion briefly for the open ended questions.

Thank you

## I. Background of the Respondent

1. Your Institution \_\_\_\_\_
2. Your specialization \_\_\_\_\_
4. Level of qualification A. Diploma B. Degree /BA, BED BSC/ C. MA/MSC
5. Sex A) Male B) Female
6. Experience in years A. below 5 B. 5 to 10 C. 11 to 15 D. Above 15
7. Age A. 20-30 B. 30-40 C. above 40

II. In this part of the questionnaire statements are listed down, circle the number which indicates the level of your agreement/ disagreement on the clam of the sentences.

1= I strongly disagree

2= I Disagree

3=I agree

4= I strongly agree

No.	Question	1	2	3	4
1	Trainees are ready for cooperative training	1	2	3	4
2	Management of cooperative training in my institution is very good	1	2	3	4
3	Industries in our area are interested to take part in cooperative training	1	2	3	4
4	I as a trainer has much role in improving cooperative training management	1	2	3	4
5	Trainees are interest to go out for cooperative training	1	2	3	4
6	My Institution support industries which participate in cooperative training	1	2	3	4
7	Trainees assigned on the right work position during cooperative training	1	2	3	4
8	There is appropriate guideline for cooperative training in my institution	1	2	3	4
9	The general condition of cooperative training in my institution is good	1	2	3	4

10	There is poor status of infrastructure for cooperative training	1	2	3	4
11	My institution has good relation with industries in the relation	1	2	3	4
12	Trainees are well assessed in during cooperative training	1	2	3	4
13	Industries assign supervisor for managing cooperative training	1	2	3	4
14	Industries are not willing to sign agreement on cooperative training	1	2	3	4
15	Industries and companies are aware of the cooperative training	1	2	3	4
16	Industries evaluate trainees based on the curriculum	1	2	3	4
17	Industries are always provided the cooperative training guide line	1	2	3	4
18	Trainees always provided with cooperative training guide line	1	2	3	4
19	The time allotted for cooperative training is not enough	1	2	3	4
20	There is professional guidance and counseling in my college	1	2	3	4
21	Guidance and councilor plays a great role in cooperative training program of my college	1	2	3	4
22	I believe that Cooperative training program minimize the cost of training in my college	1	2	3	4
23	Cooperative training is just additional burden brining less benefit to the college	1	2	3	4
24	my Institution prepare refreshment training to the staff always	1	2	3	4
25	Refreshment trainings are related to cooperative training	1	2	3	4

**III. Please write your opinion for the following questions!**

1. What are the three major problems of Lucy TVET and water works college?

---

---

---

---

---

2. What are the major problems related to Cooperative training in your college?

---

---

---

---

---

3. What could be the possible solutions for the above two types of problems

---

---

---

---

4. What is the role of the following stockholders for successful accomplishment of Cooperative Training?

**A. Colleges**

---

---

---

---

---

**B. Industries/ companies**

---

---

---

---

---

**C. trainees**

---

---

---

---

## **Annex IV**

**Addis Ababa University**

**School of Graduate Studies**

**College of Education**

**Department of Business Education**

**Interview guide for Head of companies and supervisors as cooperative training partners**

- Name of the institution you are working for \_\_\_\_\_
- Your position \_\_\_\_\_
- Your task in relation to cooperative training \_\_\_\_\_
- Work experience \_\_\_\_\_
- How many apprentices you receive annually?
- And from your experience, what are the top 3 most serious problem in cooperative training?
- And from your experience, what are the top 3 most benefits you could get from cooperative training?
- Do you think formal agreement is needed to cooperative training
- do you think trainees get benefit out of the training in your organization?
- Do you think trainees contribute for the success of your organization?
- Do you assigned supervisors for the trainees according to their specialization

## **Annex V**

**Addis Ababa University**

**School of Graduate Studies**

**College of Education**

**Department of Business Education**

### **Interview guide for supervisor and managers in TVET institution and in companies**

- What are the problems facing cooperative training?
- Do you think both TVET institutions and Companies get benefits out of cooperative training?
- Do you think cooperative training is viable training strategy?
- Do trainees get appropriate position during training?
- What role could you play for the success of cooperative t

## Annex VI

### Profile of interviewee

Number	Position of the interviewee	Date of the interview
1	Supervisor of Awash basin Authority	May 2011
2	Supervisor and head of worer agricultural research center	May 2011
3	Kesem Kebena irrigation project supervisor and head	May 2011
4	Ethiopia cotton processing factory supervisor and head	May 2011
5	Awash filer factory supervisor and Head	May 2011
6	Supervisor and head of Central Grage	May 2011
7	Awash marble factory supervisor and head	May 2011
8	Middle Awash Agricultural development organization supervisor and head	May 2011
9	Amibara agricultural development organization supervisor and head	May 2011
10	Amibar finance and economic development office	May 2011
11	Africa agricultural development organization supervisor and head	May 2011
12	Amibar education office	May 2011
13	Amibar pastoralist office	May 2011
14	Guidance and councilor	April 2011
15	Academic Vice dean of Lucy TVET and WWC	April 2011
16	Vise Dean of Lucy TVET and WWC	April 2011
17	Lucy TVET and WWC registrar	April 2011
18	Administration Head of the College	April 2011