Addis Ababa University
አዲስ አበባ ዩኒቨርሲቲ
Seek Wisdom, Elevate your Intellect and Serve Humanity

ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF COMMERCE

PROGRAM OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT

ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT PROCUREMENT MANAGEMENT PRACTICE IN ETHIO TELECOM

BY

KIDIST DAGNACHEW

ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF COMMERCE
MA PROGRAM

JUNE, 2018

ADDIS ABABA, ETHIOPIA

ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF COMMERCE

PROGRAM OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT

ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT PROCUREMENT MANAGEMENT PRACTICE IN ETHIO TELECOM

BY

KIDIST DAGNACHEW

A RESEARCH PROJECT WORK SUBMITTED TO ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF COMMERCE IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE AWARD OF MASTER OF ARTS DEGREE IN PROJECT MANAGEMENT

ADVISOR
TEMESGEN BELAYNEH (PHD)

JUNE, 2018

ADDIS ABABA, ETHIOPIA

ADDIS ABABA UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF COMMERCE

DEPARTMENT OF PROJECT MANAGEMENT

ASSESSMENT OF PROJECT PROCUREMENT MANAGEMENT PRACTICE IN ETHIO TELECOM

BY

KIDIST DAGNACHEW

Approved Board Committee:

_____	_____
Examiner	**Signature**
_____	_____
Examiner	**Signature**
_____	_____
Advisor	**Signature**

DECLARATION

I, the undersigned, declare that, this research paper is my original work, prepared under the guidance of Dr. Temesgen Belayneh. All resources and materials used herein have been properly acknowledged. I further confirm that the project work has never been presented either in part or in full to any other university for the purpose of earning any degree.

BY: KIDIST DAGNACHEW
SIGNATURE: _____
DATE: _____

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements iv
List of Abbreviation v
List of Tables vi
Abstract viii
CHAPTER ONE 1
INTRODUCTION 1
1.1.Background of the Study 1
1.2.Background of the Company 2
1.3.Statement of the Problem 4
1.4.Basic Research Questions 5
1.5.Objective of the Study 5
1.6.Significance of the Study 6
1.7.Delimitation of the Study 7
1.8.Limitation of the Study 7
1.9. Organization of the Paper 8
CHAPTER TWO 9
REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE 9
2. 1 Project 9
2. 2 Project Management 10
2. 3 Definition of Procurement and Project Procurement Management 14
2.3.1. Definition of Procurement 14
2.3.2. Definition of Project Procurement Management 15
2. 4 Project Procurement Management Process 15
2.4.1. Procurement Planning 16
2.4.2. Solicitation Planning 17
2.4.3. Solicitation 19
2.4.4. Source Selection 20

2.4.5. Contract Administration 21
2.4.6. Contract Closeout 23
2. 5 Empirical Literature Review of the Study 23
CHAPTER THREE 27
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 27
3.1.Research Design 26
3.2. Population of the Study 26
3.3. Sample Size and Sample Technique 27
3.3.1 Sampling Technique 27
3.3.2 Sample Size 27
3.4. Sources and Instruments of Data Collection 27
3.5. Method of Data Analysis 28
3.6. Validity and Reliability of the Instrument 28
3.7. Ethical Consideration 29
CHAPTER FOUR 30
RESULTS AND DISCUSION 30
4.1.General Information of the Respondents 30
4.2.Analysis of Data Collected From Respondents 31
4.2.1. Project Procurement Planning 32
4.2.2. Solicitation Planning 39
4.2.3. Solicitation 41
4.2.4. Source Selection 44
4.2.5. Contract Administration 50
4.2.6. Contract Closeout 52
CHAPTER FIVE 55
SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS 55
5.1. Summary of the study 55
5.2. Conclusions 58
5.3.Recommendations 59
Reference 61
Appendix 64

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost I would like to thanks to the Almighty God for giving me patience and strength for accomplishing this project work.

Again deepest gratitude goes to my beloved late father Ato Dagnachew Damte who always gives me his unconditional encouragement and support which made it possible for me to continue my educational journey.

I am also thankful to all my friends for their encouragement, and invaluable support. Moreover I extend my gratitude to all the interview and questionnaire participants for their cooperation and support.

LIST OF ABBREVIATION AND ACRONYMS

CBS	Convergent Billing System
CRM	Customer Relation Management
ETC	Ethiopian Telecommunication Corporation
FDRE	Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
GTP	Great and Transformation Plan
IFB	Invitation for Bid
IS	Information System
IT	Information Technology
MVAS	Multi Value Added
NBE	National Bank of Ethiopia
Network PRO	Network Project Rollout
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organizations
PMBOK	Project Management Body of Knowledge
PMI	Project Management Institution
RFP	Request for Proposal
RFQ	Request for Quotation
SD	Standard Deviation
SPSS	Statistical Package for Social Science
TEP	Telephone Expansion Program
WBSs	Work Breakdown Structures

LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1: General Characteristics of the Respondents 30

Table 4.2 Provision of related training 32

Table 4.3 Make-or-buy analysis for planning procurement.....33

Table 4.4 Expert judgment for planning procurement.....33

Table 4.5 Conducting market research for planning procurement 34

Table 4.6 Consideration of past project procurement documents.....35

Table 4.7 Activity resource and cost estimation consideration 35

Table 4.8 Associated risks and mitigation plan identification.....36

Table 4.9 Identification of overall procurement need of the project 37

Table 4.10 Separate procedure followed for managing project procurement.....37

Table 4.11 Aggregate Mean and SD for Procurement Planning Process 38

Table 4.12 Standardize procurement document prepared.....39

Table 4.13 Accurateness, relevance and completeness of information obtained 40

Table 4.14 Aggregate Mean and SD for Solicitation Planning Process 40

Table 4.15 Appropriateness of procurement documents way of communication 41

Table 4.16 Arrangement of pre-proposal visits 42

Table 4.17 Usage of bidders' conference for answering questions 42

Table 4.18 Respond for questions and doubts raised for suppliers individually 43

Table 4.19 Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation for Solicitation Process.....43

Table 4.20 The presence of standardize pre-defined proposal evaluation criteria 44

Table 4.21 Preliminary screening used before making detail evaluation of proposal 45

Table 4.22 Cost and estimated delivery date are factors for evaluating proposal 45

Table 4.23 Consideration of other factors for selecting suppliers' proposal 46

Table 4.24 Consideration of future requirement change in procurement contract 48

Table 4.25 Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation for Source Selection 49

Table 4.26 Monitoring and controlling of suppliers performance 50

Table 4.27 Suppliers' performance status gathered from concerned stakeholders.....51

Table 4.28 Presence of formal procedure to accept/reject change.....51

Table 4.29 Aggregate Mean and SD for Contract Administration 52

Table 4.30 Identification of contract closeout activities.....53

Table 4.31 Lesson learned documentation.....53

Table 4.32 Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation for Contract Closeout 54

ABSTRACT

Project procurement management is among the ten knowledge areas that a project manager must be familiar with for a successful implementation of a project work. Depending upon the specific type of project being managed, over 50 percent of the total project cost can be attributed to parts, supplies and services procured. For many high-technology projects, this procurement fraction can approach 90 percent. Most of the world telecom operators upgrade their procurement capabilities to achieve best suppliers relation, to bring improved risk management, and to enhance fast growth opportunities. Hence, this study is targeted to assess project procurement practice of Ethio Telecom by addressing the process undergone namely: Procurement planning, Solicitation Planning, Solicitation, Source Selection, Contract Administration and Contract Closeout. The primary data was collected from a total of 60 respondents from a total population of 198 out of which 15 was approached for answering questions related to planning procurement process and the rest 45 are approached for answering the remaining process which are selected using non-probability purposive sampling and the collected data analyzed using SPSS version 20.0. Then the data presented quantitatively using descriptive statistics with the help of table, frequency and percentage. Semi-structured interview was also conducted with the 5 project managers and 4 Contract Management Program Managers, and analyzed qualitatively by integrating secondary data obtained from the company policy and procedure documents, project management working manual, reports, process templates and magazines. Accordingly, the finding of the study reveals the company fail to provide training related to project and project procurement, fail to arrange pre-proposal visit, not considering suppliers risk management issue as evaluation criteria, week monitoring system for products arrived at the project site and not gathering suppliers' performance status report from concerned stakeholders. Thus, a recommendation has been made under this study on what actions should be taken in order to improve project procurement management practice of Ethio Telecom.

Key words: Procurement, Project Procurement Management, Procurement Planning, solicitation planning, solicitation, source selection, contract administration and contract closeout.

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study

Projects now a day have great practice in private, government, NGOs and other forms of organizations. It helps to find solutions for the existing problem, to provide new/improved products, and also to win advantage of unexploited business opportunity. Unlike operations, projects are characterized by uniqueness, complexities, non-repetitive, temporary life time with constrained schedule, cost and performance. Such unique features require projects managed by other forms of management called project management. Project management is the application of knowledge, skills, tools, and techniques to project activities to meet the project requirements (PMBOK, 2013).

According to Beleiu et al. (2015), adequate use of project management techniques is among the main factors influencing project success globally. Like other sectors, application of project management is important on telecommunication sectors for the following four main reasons (Sherif, 2006). First, regulatory and technological changes promoted unbundling of telecommunication services. Second, its infrastructural projects take several years and involve several thousands of individuals. Third, the forms of telecommunication services, ranging from basic telephony using wireline or wireless access, to internet or broadband services. Finally, new services must fit within an environment defined by already existing technical and organizational legacies.

PMBOK (2013), Project procurement management is among the ten knowledge areas that a project manager must be familiar with for a successful implementation of a project work. It is needed to acquire products, services, and/or results needed for the project. Procurement systems make a difference in project implementation, while poorly managed project procurement relationships negatively with project performance.

According to Kirai et al. (2016), Procurement is the nerve center of performance in every institution which needs a tight system to be adopted and followed. Many procurement activities suffer from neglect, lack of proper direction, poor co-ordination, bureaucracy, lack of open competition and transparency, differing levels of corruption and not having a trained and qualified

procurement specialists who are competent to conduct and manage the procurement process in a professional, timely and cost effective manner. Week project procurement in Ethiopia resulted from insufficient planning, shortage of funds, and timely inaccurateness of large procurement (Karlsson, 2011).

Ethio telecom is one of the dominant telecom industries in Africa having a vision to become world class provider of telecom service. Since telecommunication is one of the prime support services needed for rapid growth and modernization of various sectors of the economy as well as for attracting investment, creating market opportunities, enhancing competitiveness and boosting regional economic integration, the Ethiopian government has made huge investments to improve service quality, coverage and institutional capacity in the telecom sector (NBE, 2017). Since the company is responsible for such country wide contribution through its huge investments, it's important to assess the practice of project procurement of the company.

1.2 Background of the Company

Telecommunication service was introduced in Ethiopia in 1894 by Emperor Menelik II through the telephone line constructed from Addis Ababa to Harar. The telecom service got different name and structure throughout different years. From 1890 up to 1907 it is called "Central Administration of Telephone and Telegraph System of Ethiopia". It is renamed as "the Central Office of Post, Telegraph and Telephone System of Ethiopia" since 1907-1909. After the independence from Italian occupation, it was reestablished in the name of "Imperial Board of Telecommunication of Ethiopia" in 1952 having the purpose to rehabilitate, extend, repair and maintained the telecommunication facilities of Ethiopia and to engage in business of telecommunication for profit.

Under the Derg regime (1974-1991), the Ethiopian Telecommunication renamed as "The Provisional Military Government of Socialist Ethiopia Telecommunication Service" at 1975 and renamed again as "Ethiopian Telecommunication Authority" on 1981 that retained this name up to 1996. At this period, the telecommunication service had made a major change of technology ranging from automatic to digital technology.

Under the FDRE, the telecommunication sectored was restructured and separated into two entities called "Ethiopian Telecommunication Authority" and "Ethiopian Telecommunication Corporation

(ETC)" on 1996. In 29th November 2010, Ethio Telecom is established having missions to connect Ethiopia through state-of-the-art telecom service, provide high quality, innovative and affordable telecom products and services that enhance the development of the nation, build reputable brand known for its customers consideration, build its managerial capability and manpower' talent that enables Ethio Telecom to operate at international level and support community and environment development. According to the a report revealed on May 18, 2018 Ethio Telecom has 64.4 million mobile subscribers , 1.2 million fixed line subscribers, and the number of internet subscribers reached 16.5 million. The company also able to collect 27.79 Billion Birr in which 75.3% is from mobile subscribers, 17.1% from Data and internet while the remaining 5.2% is from international services.

Among its sixteen divisions, Program Management Division is the one which is responsible to manage the project management methodologies, skills, and tools within the company. Its primary objective is to achieve all of the project goals and targets while honoring the preconceived project constraints. It is also have an objective to optimize the allocation and integration of inputs necessary to meet pre-defined objectives. The scope of the division is limited to make follow up of projects which fulfill one or combination of the following parameters. The total cost of the project need to be greater than 10 million Birr, the scope of the project needed to cover more than 2 divisions and/or the project required to have strategic importance for the company. Other projects that do not meet one of the above requirements fall under the supervision of their own respective division. There are two types of projects identified by the Program Management division called Hardware Projects that include infrastructural expansion assigned to Network division of the company and the Software Projects which is assigned to the Information System division.

The Sourcing and Facilities division has three sections. Sourcing section organizes the purchasing control and delivery of goods and services within the appropriate framework and in accordance with the company strategic plan and budget. It manages the company relationship with its suppliers and partners. The section is responsible both for the day-to-day operation as well as for projects procurement. The Logistics section optimizes logistics resources to facilitate goods management by optimizing the Warehouse management, by facilitating goods shipment and by performing inventory management. The Facilities and Fleet section provides facilities and fleet to the whole company.

1.3 Statement of the Problem

Effective procurement is critical for execution of projects successfully. Depending upon the specific type of project being managed, over 50 percent of the total project cost can be attributed to parts, supplies, and services procured, and for many high-technology projects, this procurement fraction can approach 90 percent (Morris & Pinto, 2007).

According to Wyman (2013), most of the world telecom operators upgrade their procurement capabilities to achieve best suppliers relation, to bring improved risk management, and to enhance fast growth opportunities. They need to improve their procurement practice due to their purchasing portfolio become increasingly diverse from simple items such as switches and routers to a much wider array of products such as software, IT solutions, maintenance and margin engineering on resale. Since technologies are shift very rapidly, their procurement expected to look up compatible suppliers that help them to be flexible and react quickly. For example traditional telecom vendors like Ericson and Nokia have seen significant drops in their margins, due to aggressive competition from new players like Huawei and ZTE.

Karlsson (2011), conducted a study to understand project management in Ethiopia and Sweden which conclude method of procurement management has big weakness and the lack of adequate planning often causes problems in the production when materials, machines and parts are delivered too late or not at all in Ethiopia, however, the study was on construction companies. Other research was conducted on effective public procurement management impact in the implementation of successful public project by (Martha, 2015) but the study is on the area of housing development projects of the country. Another study on project procurement practice conducted on Alemgena road maintenance project having an objective to assess the studied project procurement practice. The Major gap from the different studies is that they do not cover up each process of the project procurement.

Academic research are conducted on Ethio Telecom that covers areas such as supply chain management, sourcing staff perception, foreign purchase practice, and supplier performance management but there is no study on project procurement management of the company.

According to the gathered report from GTP meeting held on 2016, different project team members of the studied company reveals that most of delay in projects occurs due to quality problem of the purchased item, corruption, lack of adequate make/buy analysis and fail to deliver the ordered items on time by the Sourcing and Facility Division of the company. Therefore, this study has been initiated with the intention filling the gap between the practices of project procurement management with that of the theoretical perspective of the knowledge area.

1.4 Basic Research Questions

The general question of this study was what are the practices of project procurement management at Ethio Telecom?

Specifically the researcher answered the following research questions after collecting and analyzing the data.

- How does the project procurement planning look like in Ethio Telecom?
- How does solicitation planning and solicitation practice is being undertaken in Ethio Telecom?
- How does source evaluation and selection practice is being undertaken in Ethio Telecom?
- How does contract administration practice of Ethio Telecom looks like?
- What practices are being followed to close out a contract in Ethio Telecom?

1.5 Objective of the Study

The general objective of the study is to describe the practice of project procurement management in Ethio Telecom. While attempting to achieve the stated general objective, the study was also specifically tries to achieve the following objectives:

- To examine the project procurement planning practice in Ethio Telecom.
- To examine solicitation planning and solicitation practice of Ethio Telecom.
- To investigate source evaluation and selection practice in Ethio Telecom.
- To assess contract administration practice of Ethio Telecom.
- To examine contract closing out practice of Ethio telecom.

1.6 Significance of the Study

After named Ethio Telecom the company announce the most critical program on April, 2014 called Telecom Expansion Program (TEP). The company budgeted 1.6 billion dollar for the program and scheduled to implement within 6 month for Addis Ababa and 2 years for regional sites. The goal of the program is to improve the network quality and capacity. Its objective is to serve additional 39 million customers, 3G network expansion to regions, to launch 4G network for 400,000 customers in Addis Ababa, to improve the network capacity from 64% to 85%, to create modern call center and customer service.

According to the TEP project charter, the major stakeholders of the program are Information System Division, Network Division, and Sourcing and Facility Division of the company. The Information System division of the company establish IS-Transition Section which includes Multi Value Added-MVAS, Customer Relation Management –CRM, Convergent Billing System – CBS, and Dunning automation/Debt collection management departments to implement the software project of the Program. The network division also establish Network PRO section to implement infrastructural expansion of fixed line and wireless network projects of the program over 13 telecom network circles all over the country. The company budgeted its 85%-90% for procurement of product and service for the program from local and international suppliers. From this, it can be conclude that it is important to assess the project procurement practice of the company.

This study will help the company to evaluate its current project procurement practice. Findings and recommendations also will guide the studied company to maximize the contribution of its sourcing and program management functions to meet projects objective. The findings may be of great use to the academia, especially those who may wish to carry out further research on project procurement

1.7 Delimitation of the Study

The findings and conclusion that are drawn from the research represented projects of Ethio Telecom. Among the different projects undertaken in Ethio Telecom, the study focus on projects under the umbrella of Telephone Expansion Program (TEP.

1.8 Limitation of the Study

The researcher experienced the following holdups during the research process.

- Difficulty to meet all the targeted respondents who are managers due to their busy schedule and taking annual leave. Due to this two of the project managers reached via phone interview and one of the interviewee respondents was on acting but included on the study due to resignation of the main manager.
- Documents which are important for the researcher but confidential to the company are not allowed for detail review but only for eye screening on some permitted study points. Such materials include cost related documents, project charter, and some project activity plans, process and procedure templates.
- Respondents which are staff members of the company that have know-how starting from planning up to closing phase of the procurement process are very few in number and difficult to reach. By considering this the researcher prepare separate questionnaire for those who are participated in planning phase of procurement and others who are participated in the rest of the process.
- Due to the project is on closing phase, some of sample respondents of questionnaire already receive reassign letter to work on their previous operational position while still working on the project in which their busy schedule makes the data collection process difficult.

1.9. Organization of the Research Report

This study is organized in five chapters in which the first part contains background of the study, background about the studied company, statements of the problem, basic research questions, objective of the study, significance, scope and delimitation of the study. The second chapter deals with review of related literature and the third chapter describes the methodology of the study. It covers research design, sample and sampling techniques, source and instruments of data collection and method of data analysis. Validity and reliability of the study as well as ethical consideration also included. Results and discussion are discussed in the fourth chapter, and the last chapter deals with the research summary, conclusion and recommendations. At the end, References and some annexes had been attached.

CHAPTER TWO: REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

2.1 Project

There are number of definitions about project by different scholars having similar meaning. According to Wysocki (2014), Project is a sequence of unique, complex, and connected activities that have one goal or purpose and that must be completed by a specific time, within budget, and according to specification. Another definition provided by Kerzner (2009), states project is a series of activities and tasks that have a specific objective to be completed within certain specification having defined schedule, funding limit, and consume human and non-human resources (i.e., money and equipment) with multifunctional nature (i.e., cut across several functional lines).

Another definition provided by PMBOK (2013), Project is a temporary endeavor undertaken to create a unique product, service, or result. According to Heerkens (2002), Project is temporary in nature undertaken to achieve a particular aim in response to a need and the solution to a problem which consists of small jobs (tasks) and ordinarily culminates in the creation of an end product or products (deliverables). It is also defined by Tayntor (2010), as a unique, finite set of multiple activities intended to accomplish a specific goal.

The above definitions have basic similarity which helps to emanate the following basic characteristics of project. Project is a temporary endeavor which refers done only one time having a definite beginning and end date. It does not necessarily mean the duration of the project is short (PMBOK, 2013). Unlike operations, projects need to end eventually having a defined life span.

An ongoing work effort consists of a repetitive process which follows the organization procedure that may involve in providing the same product is Operation. Unlike operations, though similar activities are done a true project is unique at least in one aspect (Tayntor, 2010). Projects are a means to respond for those requests that cannot be addressed within the normal operation of the organization. Generally uniqueness of the project means non-routine or a one-off activity which never repeated exactly.

It has defined constraints in terms of time, cost, and performance requirements. Since projects are finite, they have specified beginning and completion date. It also requires considering the dedicated budget and limited resources. The client or the recipient of the project's deliverables, expects a certain level of functionality and quality from the project which refers to performance requirement. Projects also characterized by having single and definable purpose which used to determine whether the goal has been made at the end.

Projects are ever increasingly needed by many organizational forms due to the following some reasons mentioned by scholars. Heerkens (2002) states that projects are not only required for negative problems but also positive kinds of problems such as developing new product. According to PMBOK (2013), the outcome of the project may be tangible or intangible that can create product which can be either a component of another item, an enhancement of an item, or an end item in itself. It can also create a service or a capability to perform a service, an improvement in the existing product lines and a result such as outcome of a document. They are also means to respond to those requests that cannot be addressed within the organization normal operational limits (Kovächs, 2004). Project used to find solution for a critical business problem, and/or take advantage of the untapped business opportunity (Wysocki, 2014).

2.2 Project Management

Project management is the application of knowledge, skills, tools, and techniques to project activities to meet the project requirements (PMBOK, 2013). Project management is accomplished through the application and integration of the project management processes of initiating, planning, executing, monitoring and controlling, and closing. It requires all of the skills of general management to secure the project success.

According to Robert K. Wysocki project management is designed to answer what business situation is being addressed, what does the business need to do, what will you do, how will you do it, how will you know you did it and how well did you do. Project management is an organized common-sense approach that utilizes the appropriate client involvement in order to meet sponsor needs and deliver expected incremental business value (Wysocki, 2014).

According to Tayntor (2010), the major difference between project management and fundamental management is that added up skill required from project manager is called the ability to manage change. Unlike project managers, the general manager of the operations management requires for maintaining status quo to make thing stable. While the project manager changes it.

Project management processes are grouped into five categories known as Project Management Process Groups by Project management Institutes (PMI). Initiating process group performed to define a new project or a new phase of an existing project by obtaining authorization to start the project or phase. It involves activities such as selection of the best project given resource limits, recognizing the benefits of the project, preparation of the documents to sanction the project and assigning of the project manager.

Planning process group required to establish the scope of the project, refine the objectives, and define the course of action required to attain the objectives that the project was undertaken to achieve. There is definition of the work requirements, definition of the quality and quantity of work, definition of the resources needed, scheduling the activities and evaluation of the various risks.

While Executing process group performed to complete the work defined in the project management plan to satisfy the project specifications. It requires negotiating for the project team members, directing and managing the work as well as working with the team members to help them improved.

Monitoring and controlling process group required to track, review, and regulate the progress and performance of the project; comparing actual outcome to predicted outcome; identify any areas in which changes to the plan are required; and initiate the corresponding changes.

Finally closing process group performed to finalize all activities across all Process Groups to formally close the project or phase. It verifying that all of the work has been accomplished, contractual closure of the contract, financial closure of the charge numbers and administrative closure of the paperwork.

According to the PMBOK (2013), there are ten project management knowledge areas that every project addresses and these Knowledge areas represent a set of competency skills and processes

that must be properly utilized by the project managers throughout the life cycle of the project. These are;

- **Project Scope Management**

It includes the processes required to ensure that the project includes all the work required to complete the project successfully. It is an umbrella for the processes facilitating the inclusion of all the necessary and sufficient goods and/or services in the procurement package (Kovächs, 2004). Managing the project scope is first and foremost concerned with defining and controlling what is and is not included in the project.

- **Project Time Management**

It is a set of those processes that support the timely completion of the procurement. Project Time Management includes both a planning component and a control component. The planning component provides time estimates for both the duration of a project task (that is, how long will it take in terms of clock time to complete the task) and the actual effort or labor time required to complete the task. The duration is used to estimate the total time needed to complete the project. The labor time is used to estimate the total labor cost of the project. The control component is part of the Monitoring and Controlling Process Group and involves comparing estimated times to actual times as well as managing the schedule and cost variances (Wysocki, 2014).

- **Project Cost Management**

It is involved in planning, estimating, budgeting, financing, funding, managing, and controlling costs so that the project can be completed within the approved budget (PMBOK, 2013). According to Rad (2002), it used to minimize the cost of the project while maintaining acceptable levels of quality as well as scope of the deliverables for the duration of the project.

- **Project Quality Management**

According to (Heerkens, 2002), it includes both quality assurance (planning to meet quality requirements) and quality control (steps taken to monitor results to see if they conform to requirements).

- **Project Human Resource Management**

It focuses on actions related to human aspect of the project. It includes the processes that organize, manage, and lead the project team/staff. All the team members with assigned roles and responsibilities having their varied set of skills are important in project planning and decision making by adding their expertise to the process and strengthens their commitment to the project.

- **Project Communication Management**

It includes the processes that are required to ensure timely and appropriate planning, collection, creation, distribution, storage, retrieval, management, control, monitoring, and the ultimate disposition of project information (PMBOK, 2013). At the heart of many of the top ten reasons why projects fail is poor communications (Wysocki, 2014). The main reason for such failure is not from planning effective communication plan but from executing such plan.

- **Project Risk Management**

It is a set of processes to realize, examine, prevent, eliminate, or diminish procurement risks (Kovächs, 2004). According to PMBOK (2013), project risk management includes the processes of conducting risk management planning, identification, analysis, response planning, and controlling risk on a project. Its primary focus is to minimize the probability of negative events challenging the outcome of the project and maximizing any opportunities that exist.

- **Project Procurement Management**

It ensures that the project is getting the right materials at the right time with the best cost.

- **Project Stakeholder Management**

It includes the processes required to identify the people, groups, or organizations that could impact or be impacted by the project, to analyze stakeholder expectations and their impact on the project, and to develop appropriate management strategies for effectively engaging stakeholders in project decisions and execution (PMBOK, 2013).

- **Project Integration Management**

It includes the processes and activities to identify, define, combine, unify, and coordinate the various processes and project management activities within the project management process groups (PMBOK, 2013).

Generally speaking, one way or another project manager and the project team members are involved in performing the above knowledge management areas throughout the life of a project.

2.3 Definition of Procurement and Project Procurement Management

2.3.1 Definition of Procurement

Kerzner (2009), Define Procurement as the acquisition of goods and services by involving two parties customer who is buying and supplier who is selling with different objectives who interact in a given market segment. Procurement characterized by most often a dynamic and repeated activity with short-term objectives often conflicting with long term ones (Dimitri, Piga, & Spagnolo, 2006).

Another definition of procurement is management of a broad range of processes that are associated with an organization desire to obtain the necessary goods and services needed for manufacturing a product, transforming inputs to outputs, or indirectly operating the organization. These processes involves identifying and analyzing user requirements and type of purchase, selecting suppliers, negotiating contracts, acting as liaison between the supplier and the user, and evaluating and forging strategic alliances with suppliers (Morris & Pinto, 2007). Its function extends to acquisition of suppliers, pricing, purchasing, and administration of contracts. It also involves to storage, logistics, inspection, expediting, transportation, and handling of materials and supplies. According to Laby et al. (2014), a procurement process involves a series of activities like purchasing, transporting, stoking and supply.

Since it is economically difficult for companies to make all the materials they use, procurement process is used to ensure the buyer receives goods, services or works at the best possible price, when aspects such as quality, quantity, time, and location are compared (Wikipedia, 2010). It is also a practice that can increase corporate profitability by taking advantage of quantity discounts,

minimizing cash flow problems, and seeking out quality suppliers (Kerzner, 2009). According to Dimitri et.al (2006), efficient procurement is a core necessity for firms' profitability as well as survival. But the problem is that most companies see the procurement process as tactical rather than strategic and as cost rather than a benefit to the company (Neef, 2001).

2.3.2 Definition of Project Procurement Management

According to PMBOK project procurement management is one of the ten knowledge areas of project management that includes the processes necessary to purchase or acquire products, services, or results needed from outside the project team. Another definition of project procurement management is the processes to control and administrate contracts and purchase orders from sources external to the project organization (Karlsson, 2011).

According to Heagney (2012), project procurement management involves deciding what must be procured, issuing requests for bids or quotations, selecting suppliers, administering contracts, and closing them when the job is finished.

2.4 Project Procurement Management Process

PMBOK (2013), identifies four processes of project procurement management namely plan procurement management, conduct procurements, control procurements, and close procurements. Plan procurement Management is the process of documenting project procurement decisions, specifying the approach, and identifying potential sellers. While conduct procurement is the process of obtaining seller responses, selecting a seller, and awarding a contract. Control procurement is a process of managing procurement relations, monitoring contract performance, and making changes and corrections to contracts as appropriate. Finally, close procurement process is about completing each procurement.

Wysocki (2014), Morris et.al (2007), Luckey (2006), Fleming (2003) and PMBOK, (2000), identified six phases of project procurement management namely procurement planning, solicitation planning, solicitation, source selection, contract administration and contract closeout. This classification will used by this literature in the next section by reviewing the studied company procurement policy. PMBOK (2013), assumed that in order to say project procurement exists the buyer of an item for the project is assigned to the project team and that the seller is organizationally

external to the project team. It is also assumed that a formal contractual relationship will be developed and exists between the buyer and the seller.

2.4.1. Procurement Planning

Martha citing Basheka (2008) define procurement planning as a process of determining the procurement needs of a project and the timing of their acquisition and their funding such that met the projects need as required in an efficient way. Plan Procurement Management is the process of documenting project procurement decisions, specifying the approach, and identifying potential sellers (PMBOK, 2013). Care need to be taken at this stage since other activities of the project procurement implementation decisions emanates from its planning document.

The purpose of project procurement plan is to determine whether to acquire outside support, and if so, it determine what to acquire, how to acquire it, how much is needed, and when to acquire it. Morris et.al (2007) sates procurement planning used to identify factors in the decision, make-or-buy analysis and contract type selection of the project procurement. According to Laby et.al (2016), Project procurement planning identifies the items that are needed to procure, define the process for acquiring those items and finally schedule the time. Kerzner (2009), procurement plan is the first step for planning purchases and acquisitions which used to answer the following; what to procure, when and how, what are my sources, should I make or buy and if suppliers are not qualified, how I shall qualify them questions.

Different authors describe what issues needed to be addressed in procurement planning process. According to PMBOK (2013), procurement plan use project management plan, requirements documentation, risk register, activity cost estimates, stakeholder register, enterprise environmental factors, and organizational process asset as an input. Using make-or-buy analysis, expert judgement, market research and meeting as technique and tool to produce an output of procurement management plan, procurement statement of work, procurement documents, source selection criteria, make-or-buy decisions, change requests and project documents updates.

Kerzner (2009), procurement plan includes defining the need for the project, development of the procurement statement of work, specifications and work breakdown structure, performing a make or buy analysis, laying out the major milestones and the timing/schedule, determining if long lead

procurement is necessary, cost estimating including life-cycle costing, determining whether qualified sellers exist, identifying the source selection criteria, preparing a listing of possible project/procurement risks (i.e., a risk register), developing a procurement plan and obtaining authorization and approval to proceed.

The plan required to define items to be procured with justification statements and timelines, type of contract to be used, risks associated with procurement management, how procurement risks will be mitigated, determining costs and if/how they're used as evaluation criteria, any standardized procurement templates or documents to be used, how multiple suppliers will be managed if applicable, contract approval process, decision criteria, establishing contract deliverables and deadlines, how procurement and contracts are coordinated with project scope, budget, and schedule, any constraints pertaining to procurement, direction to sellers on baseline requirements such as contract schedules and work breakdown structures (WBSs), vendor management, identification of any prequalified sellers if applicable and performance metrics for procurement activities (www.projectmanagementdocs.com).

Kovächs (2004), Procurement management plan sets the procurement framework for the project that will serve as a guide for managing procurement throughout the life of the project and updated will be possible as acquisition needs change.

2.4.2. Solicitation Planning

According to Fleming (2003), it is the process of making plans leading to a solicitation of responses from sellers. PMBOK (2000), also defines it as a process that involves preparing a document needed to support the solicitation process. This process facilitate accurate, relevant and complete responses from prospective sellers.

According to Fleming (2003) and PMBOK (2000), solicitation planning uses project procurement planning as an input and use standard forms and expert judgment as tools and techniques to produce evaluation criteria and procurement documents such as Invitation for Bid (IFB), Request for Proposal (RFP) and Request for Quotations (RFQ).

According to Martha citing Lynch (2013), Request for Proposal (RFP) is a two envelope procurement method which can be used for procuring goods, services or works. It requires sellers

to submit relevant and detailed information as per the request of the buyer. PMBOK (2013) also define Request for Proposal (RFP) as type of procurement document used to request proposals from prospective sellers of product or service. Wysocki (2014), states RFP is the heart of the procurement process and provides the basis for the contract and the work to be completed. It is used when suppliers, contractors or service providers are expected to propose a specific solution (methodology and work plan) for fulfilling a particular procurement requirement.

Invitation for Bid (IFB) is used to obtain written requests for quotes, bids, best prices from suppliers (Fleming , 2003). The major difference between Request for Proposal (RFP) and Invitation for Bid (IFB) is that RFP is a great tool used in soliciting proposals from suppliers for products and services that cannot be evaluated by cost alone. While IFB is used when there is no substantive difference among the products and services that meet specifications so that the only difference among responsive bids is price and used when price is only one of the criteria that are needed for evaluating offers (https://dpi.wi.gov/school-nutrition/procurement/methods/formal).

Request for Quotation (RFQ) is type of procurement document used to request price quotations from prospective sellers of common or standard products or services (PMBOK, 2013). It is normally used to obtain price information on goods or services (Fleming , 2003).

Some literatures also recommend the use Request for Information (RFI). It is a type of procurement document whereby the buyer requests a potential seller to provide various pieces of information related to a product or service or seller capability (PMBOK, 2013). RFI is recommended when there is little knowledge of exactly what is available on the commercial market or unable to identify sellers who have the specific capability (Wysocki, 2014). When only information on a product or on a given company is desired the buyer will often issue a Request for Information (RFI) form to the prospective companies (Fleming , 2003). It does not consider whether supplier has the resource, capabilities and processes for more extensive analysis. The information gathered used as a base to decide who should be invited to respond and specific content to be included on Request for Proposal (RFP).

2.4.3. Solicitation

Solicitation is the process of requesting responses from sellers eventually resulting in procurement (Fleming , 2003). According to PMBOK (2000), Solicitation involves obtaining responses from prospective sellers on how project needs can be met. It is also a process of sending out a document with the desired requirements for potential suppliers (Wysocki, 2014).

According to Wysocki (2014), Request for Proposal (RFP) can be announced via advertising, renting targeted list, asking previous vendors, and attending trade shows. He recommended for managing bidders questions and responses via answer questions individually, hold a bidders conference, and put Request for Proposal (RFP) online to respond questions quickly. Morris et.al (2007), solicitation process involves developing qualified seller's lists, contacting prospective sellers, and conducting a bidders' conference to receive the sending out proposal from sellers.

PMBOK (2013), Kerzner (2009) and Luckey et.al (2006), suggested bidders' conference which is a meeting held between the buyer and all the prospective sellers to prevent no single bidder has more knowledge than others and no bidder receive preferential treatment. To be fair, buyers should take great care to ensure that all prospective sellers hear every question from any individual prospective seller and every answer from the buyer (PMBOK, 2013). In many industries and countries companies have found it a useful practice (Fleming , 2003).

According to Wysocki (2014), it is also important to answer questions and doubts directly from individual suppliers as well as conduct pre-proposal or field visits to view the capability of the market site, production factory, and technical and managerial capability of pre-identified potential suppliers.

According to PMBOK (2000) and Fleming (2003), Solicitation Process will end with the receipt of proposals from prospective sellers. It require seller-prepared documents that describe the sellers' ability and willingness to provide the requested product in accordance with the requirements of the relevant procurement document prepared at solicitation planning process.

2.4.4. Source Selection

Source selection process evaluates seller proposals, and ends with the issuance of a contract award to a seller (Fleming , 2003). According to PMBOK (2000), the process involves the receipt of bids or proposals and the application of the evaluation criteria to select a provider. The selected sellers are those who have been judged to be in a competitive range based upon the outcome of the proposal or bid evaluation, and who have negotiated a draft contract that will become the actual contract when an award is made (PMBOK, 2013).

After suppliers respond for the request, the next step is selecting potential seller. According to PMBOK (2013), it is recommended to move from conducting preliminary screening to more detailed evaluation of respondents after having short list respondents to select one/more qualified sellers to perform the work. According to Luckey et.al (2006) and Tayntor (2010), it is recommended to review proposals, select a short list of vendors, evaluate the qualifications of each of the short list vendors and make final decision to select the best supplier.

Before evaluating sellers' response for Request for Proposal (RFP), it is important to establish sellers' evaluation criteria (Wysocki, 2014). Such criteria help to choose the best among several competing suppliers by evaluating their proposal response against the pre-settled standards. Seller selection process includes application of the evaluation criteria to the contractors' proposals (Kerzner, 2009).

Many factors aside from cost and price need to be evaluated in the source selection decision process which also suggested by scholars. According to Wysocki (2014), among the suggested qualitative criteria corporate experience with similar work, financial stability, technical approach, personal experience, skill and competency, risk management process and location shall need to be considered by applying chosen quantitative models for evaluation and ranking sellers. According to Luckey (2006), it is important to consider the priorities and requirements of the project as well as stakeholders while selecting among sellers. Since projects are subject to time, budget and quality constraint it is advisable to select the best seller that can successfully complete with in time frame, with in a given cost and promising the best quality. He also recommends considering seller experience, risk tolerance and provision of warranties for the service they provide. Kerzner (2009), while several criteria can be used, the most common are time, cost, expected management team of

the project (i.e., quality of assigned resources), and previous performance history are majors. They all suggested that selecting seller is a critical decision since the wrong decision affects the three pillars of project: time, cost and performance.

Source selection process is leading to a contract award. According to Wysocki (2014) and PMBOK (2013), awarding contract may be single award, and multiple award. Single award is when a single seller emerges with the highest evaluation score while multiple award is when there is no single seller who scored high enough across the listed criteria which require the buyer to assign part of the work for different sellers. Multiple sources also may require for critical products (PMBOK, 2000). Robert K. Wysocki also states no award scenario when there is none sellers who meet the minimum requirements of the project (Wysocki, 2014).

Final management approval and even contract award does not always allow a seller to begin work (Fleming , 2003). According to Kerzner (2009), the award cycle results in a signed contract between the buyer and the selected sellers'. A contract is a mutually binding legal agreement that obligates the seller to provide the specified products, services, or results, and obligates the buyer to compensate the seller (PMBOK, 2013). According to Kerzner (2009), a contact should include the following four basic elements. First, there must be mutual agreement between the parties ensuring the offer is accepted. Second, it include consideration which refers to something of value is exchanged between the parties. Third, contract capability refers the contract will be binding only if the contractors has the capacity and consent to perform. Finally, the contract must be for a legal purpose to reflect the contractor's legal obligation, or lack of obligation, to deliver end products.

2.4.5. Contract Administration

PMBOK (2000), contract administration is a process of ensuring that the sellers' performance meets contractual agreement. PMBOK (2013), also referred it as control procurement process which is about managing procurement relationships, monitoring contract performance, and making changes and corrections to contracts as appropriate. It manages seller performance, and manages changes to seller authorized scope (Fleming , 2003). The key benefit of this process is that it ensures both the sellers and buyers performance meets procurement requirements according to the terms of the legal agreement. Kerzner (2009), it is a process that make sure for compliance by the seller to the buyers contractual terms and conditions to make sure that the final product is fit.

PMBOK (2013), control procurement use project management plan, procurement documents, agreements, approved change requests, work performance reports and work performance data as an input to produce an output on work performance information, change requests, project management plan and updates, project documents updates and organizational process assets updates using contract change control system, procurement performance reviews, inspections and audits, performance reporting, payment systems, claims administration and records management system as techniques and tools.

Change management, specification interpretation, adherence to quality requirements, inspections and audits, warranties, performance reporting and records management, Contractor (seller) management, contractor (seller) performance report, documenting sellers performance (for future source selection teams), production surveillance, approval of waivers, breach of contract, claims administration, resolution of disputes, and payment schedules are among basic functions of administrating contracts (Kezrner, 2009).

It is important to gather performance status from different appropriate stakeholders of the project to discuss on the progress, risks, problems and ensuing tasks of procurement to monitor and report the progress and performance status report of sellers (Kerzner, 2009). According to Kuipers, et al. (2016/2017), it is about the measurement and evaluation of mutually agreed performance indicators between buyers and sellers. It consists of sending out, collecting, measuring, aggregating and evaluating performance data based on the predefined performance criteria and creating specific supplier dashboards.

PMBOK (2013), suggest the use procurement performance technique to review sellers' progress to deliver project scope and quality, within cost and on schedule, as compared to the contract. It can include a review of seller prepared documentation and buyer inspections, as well as quality audits conducted during seller's execution of the work. Such reviews may take place as a part of project status reviews, which would include key suppliers. Project status review meeting can be used to determine the performance of the project including procurement performance against the baseline plan (Fleming , 2003).

Changes in project scope are inevitable (Fleming , 2003). If this is the case, it is important to consider the requirement change request and require project managers to implement process to

keep changes managed and controlled (PMBOK, 2013). Kerzner (2009), also added up majority of contract administrating time spent in handling changes.

Impact analysis required to be conduct before accepting or rejecting any change in requirement to minimize its influence on the time, cost and performance of the project as a whole (Wysocki, 2014). He also suggested members of both parties must review and agree on change requests for approval of change, and must be communicated to the prospective stakeholders. According to Fleming (2003), project procurment require formal change control procedure including identification of people who have authorization to make change. Approved change requests can include modifications to the terms and conditions of the contract, including the procurement statement of work, pricing, and descriptions of the products, services, or results to be provided which require formally documented in writing and approved before being implemented (PMBOK, 2013).

2.4.6. Contract Closeout

Settles all open contractual issues, claims and closes out each procurement (Fleming , 2003). The key benefit of this process is that it documents agreements and related documentation for future reference (PMBOK, 2013). According to Morri et.al (2007), contract closeout function involves contract documentation, steps in the claims process, termination of contracts, and lessons learned.

Wysocki (2014), point out there should be a clear understanding of when the project is finished, state what the final product of the project is to be, who is to determine if it has been delivered, and what is to be done with any open issues. Wysocki (2014) and Fleming (2003), also recommend to keep all the necessary informations after the contract closed out for future projects.

2.5 Empirical Literature Review of the Study

Karlsson (2011), conducted a study on project management in Sweden and Ethiopia with the purpose to identify which successful methods of project management in Swedish projects that are appropriate to implement in Ethiopia operations and vice versa to increase the efficiency and minimize the risks in construction projects. The study analyzed qualitatively and data was gathered through informal interviews and observations on construction sites. It used to analysis based on the nine knowledge areas of project management including project procurement management. The

author concluded in Ethiopian construction project experience there is lack of procurement planning that often causes problems in the production when materials, machines and parts delivered too late or not at all. Project procurement managers have limited and little influence and control regards sub-contractors. The researcher recommends priority should need to be given for the development of procurement plan together with the priority of budget schedule control.

Another study was conducted by Meseret (2016), on project procurement practice in Alemgena Road Maintenance project. The researcher adopted purposive sampling and employed semi-structured interview, and questionnaire technique as the research instrument which was analyzed using descriptive statistics applying SPSS software. The researcher recommended provision training, to consider risk while on procurement planning, select vendors objectively, to held pre-bidding meeting and sellers site visit, and to conduct regular review and performance report.

Aliza, Stephen, & Bambang (2011), conducted a study on the importance of project governance framework in project procurement planning. The methodology applied for the study involved a comprehensive literature review on Malaysian public sectors experience. They recommend the importance of implementing project governance framework to ensure that the decision makers are answerable and accountable, and the decision making is transparent to avoid any ethical issues arises. They suggest their recommendation on other developing countries to implement similar method to ensure transparency of the decision making.

Another study was conducted by World Bank (2012), titled diagnosing corruption in Ethiopia on different sectors of the country such as health, educational, rural water supply, justice, construction, land, and mining including telecommunication sector of the country named Ethiopian Telecommunication Corporation (ETC) which later called Ethio Telecom. The study use document analysis, stakeholder interviews, and census building workshops as a methodology. The study recommend to enforce minimum standards of procurement consistent with the public procurement proclamation, establish a working group to validate the appropriateness of procurement procedures, to appoint an independent assessor to monitor procurement, to ensure greater transparency through disclosure agreements., to strengthen internal auditing and to create an ETC-supplier forum in order to protect its procurement procedure from corruption.

Martha (2015), conducted study on effective public procurement management in implementation of successful public projects in Ethiopia which is a case study on Addis Ababa city government housing development project office. The study examine the impact of current public procurement practice on construction of condominium housing, procurement planning, procurement method, procurement contract administration and the procurement policy. The researcher adopted purposive sampling using interview, and questionnaire technique as the research instrument which was analyzed using descriptive statistics. The researcher recommends the studied organization to prepare its own procurement policy, procurement planning with appropriate stakeholders, ensuring long term relationship and the use of electronic recording to control contract management process.

Studies conducted on the area of project procurement management by different researchers mainly made a recommendation that will support one of the procurement management areas. The different studies did not cover up each process of the project procurement. Thus, this study will examine the whole process of project procurement management according to Wysocki (2014), Morris et.al (2007), Luckey (2006), Fleming (2003) and PMBOK, (2000), namely procurement planning, solicitation planning, solicitation, source selection, contract administration and contract closeout.

CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Research Design

The study apply descriptive research design since it attempts to assess the practice of project procurement management in Ethio Telecom. Descriptive design helps to present a picture of the specific detail of a situation and describing the characteristics of a particular situation (Neuman, 2007). Since the research purpose was to describe a particular phenomenon at a single point in time it was a cross-sectional study.

3.2 Population of the Study

The target population used to answer for the planning procurement phase of the study includes 50 staff members who are participated in the planning phase of the Telephone Expansion Program (TEP). It consists Expertise from Network Division, Information System Division and project owner departments of the studied company.

The target population of the study for the remaining process from solicitation planning up to contract closeout were 148 employees who are currently working on Sourcing and Facility Division at headquarter since the company follow centralized procurement system.

Information System Transition section has 4 departments with their respective managers who act as both functional and project managers to execute software projects of the Telephone Expansion Program (TEP) became population for the study. Besides to the software part, the execution of hardware aspect of the program fall under the Network PRO section in which its manager was also targeted. In addition 8 Contract Management Program Managers from TEP are also considered.

3.3 Sample Size and Sample Technique

3.3.1. Sampling Technique

The study applied non-probability sampling. According to (Yalew, 2017), it is useful for certain studies that require the researcher to collect the data from particular individuals that have know-how about the studied situation. It enables the researcher to choose sample of participants that are necessarily sufficient for the study.

The sampling type applied in the study was purposive sampling. It is useful when focusing on a limited number of informants, whom we select strategically so that their in-depth information give optimal insight into an issue. According to (Neuman, 2007), such type of sampling is appropriate when a researcher use it to select unique cases that are especially informative, and when it wants to identify particular types of cases for in-depth investigation. The researcher found it appropriate due to the total population for this study involves in procurement activities for a project directly having assignment letter and indirectly on temporary base besides with their operational responsibility. Following this it is important to use purposive sampling to identify direct participants on project procurement management practice since they are relevant for the study.

3.3.2. Sample Size

15 of the respondents was approached to collect data about the planning process practice of project procurement. Data for the remaining process of the study from solicitation planning up to contract closeout was collected from 45 respondents. 4 Project Managers from software project and 1 project manager from hardware project of the program were approached. Besides, four TEP contract management program managers are also approached for the study by considering their responsibility and position in vendors' contract management section of the program.

3.4 Sources and Instruments of Data Collection

In order to get appropriate data, the study uses both primary and secondary sources of data. Primary sources of data include questionnaire and semi-structured interview to supply firsthand information from sample respondents based on the review of related literature important to the subject of the study. The reviewed literature was made to develop an insight on procurement

management practice within the process related with projects. Thus, interview and questionnaires was designed focusing on the practice of project procurement management and its process. Project Managers and Contract Management Program Managers were reached via Semi-structured interviews. While project staff members were reached using questionnaire.

The secondary sources of data emanates from the company policy and procedure documents, project management working manual, reports, process templates and magazines. In addition relevant books, journals and empirical research also used.

3.5 Method of Data Analysis

The data collected was analyzed using both quantitative and qualitative methods. The data obtained from close ended questionnaire was analyzed using SPSS version 20.00 software which helps to make descriptive analysis of the gathered data to present quantitatively using frequency and percentage. While the semi structured interview made was analyzed by organizing the common ideas and concepts of the response into a generalizable format.

3.6 Validity and Reliability of the Instrument

For research data in order to be of value and of use requires validity and reliability measurements. Both are fundamental bases of scientific method of research. For a research to be reliable, it also needs to be valid.

Validity

Validity of research refers the degree to which the research findings are true (Walliman, 2006). It is about finding out if the data collected is relevant to the problem being investigated. The validity of the research was considered while developing close-ended questionnaires and semi structured interviews checked by benchmarking the related literature review and questionnaires in order to generate a valid response. The instrument of data collection validity was checked by asking others that has know-how on the studied area for feedback and asks my advisor for approval before conducting collection.

Reliability

Reliability refers the degree to which the results of the research are repeatable (Walliman, 2006). It is about absence of difference in the research findings if the research were repeated. In order to confirm the applied researcher approach is consistent or not, the research has been supported by using reliable sources of information such as related journals, articles, books, websites, and work papers and studies related to the studied area.

The reliability of the interviews was also maintained by having 9 interviews with Contract Management Program Mangers and project managers of the studied company to ensure the reliability of the information obtained by cross checking the respective responses gained from them.

The Likert scale questionnaire items reliability was checked by the application of the Cronbach Coefficient Alpha using SPSS software for the computations of internal consistency. As a rule of thumb, researchers consider a measure to have adequate reliability if Cronbach's alpha coefficient exceeds 0.7 (Leary, 2012). It scored 0.92 and 0.71 for the planning procurement process and for the remaining process respectively which indicates the presence of good internal consistency among the items and promise the reliability and acceptability of the items for the study.

3.7 Ethical Consideration

An official support letter from Addis Ababa University School of Commerce was written to Ethio Telecom. Data collection was undertaken after permission has been obtained from the company. The researcher followed ethically and morally acceptable processes throughout the research. The data was collected with the full consent of the participants. Since it could not be ethical to access some confidential documents of the company, the organization code of ethics also considered. All the collected data are confidential for both the participants and the company. All documents which are referred throughout the research are fully acknowledged.

CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS AND DISCUSION

Introduction

The objective of this chapter is to provide the findings and results from the data collected through close ended questionnaire and semi structured interview which is analyzed using SPSS statistics version 20.0 in order to assess the practice of Ethio Telecom project procurement management practice and to provide adequate recommendations for the identified gaps. In addition the researcher reviewed different templates, validated process, policy and procedures which are used for project procurement management practice in the company in order to crosscheck and validate the findings by using multiple sources. The reviewed documents include; project management process, TEP supply chain management process, procurement management process, TEP vendor payment process, TEP reporting management process, template of project change request, and the company sourcing policy and procedure.

4.1 General Information of the Respondents

This section summarizes and presents the demographic characteristics of the respondents such as age, level of education, year of work experience and current work position.

Table 4.1: General Characteristics of the Respondents

		Frequency	**Percent**	**Valid Percent**	**Cumulative Percent**
Age of the Respondents	20-30	13	21.7	21.7	21.7
	31-40	27	45.0	45.0	66.7
	41-50	13	21.7	21.7	88.3
	Above 50	7	11.7	11.7	100.0
	Total	60	100.0	100.0	
		Frequency	**Percent**	**Valid Percent**	**Cumulative Percent**
Level of Education	Diploma	4	6.7	6.7	6.7
	Degree	35	58.3	58.3	65
	Postgraduates	21	35.0	35.0	100.0
	Total	60	100.0	100.0	

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Year of Work Experience	Less than 5 Year	3	5.0	5.0	5.0
	5-10	18	30.0	30.0	35.0
	11-15	28	46.7	46.7	81.7
	Above 15	11	18.3	18.3	100.0
	Total	60	100.0	100.0	
		Frequency	**Percent**	**Valid Percent**	**Cumulative Percent**
Current Work Position	Supervisor	5	8.3	8.3	8.3
	Expert	9	15.0	15.0	23.3
	Specialist	19	31.7	31.7	55.0
	Administrator	27	45.0	45.0	100.0
	Total	60	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

The above table depicts that 21.7% of respondents holds age between 20–30, 45% of them holds age between 31– 40, 21.7% holds between 41–50 and the remaining 11.7% holds age above 50. The above table also reveals that 6.7% of the respondents' holds diploma, 58.3% of the respondents are degree holders and the remaining 35% are postgraduates. The finding reveals that Ethio Telecom has well educated employees for the study area. In respect to year of work experience 5% of the respondents has less than 5 years' of experience. While 30% of the respondents holds between 5–10 years' of experience and most of the respondents (65%) have above 11 year of experience. This shows the respondents can understand the process of the study area and respond for the questionnaire clearly. The above table also depicts 8.3% of the respondents were on supervisory position, 15% of the respondents are expertise, 31.7% of them are specialists and the remaining 45% are on administrator position. From the above information the researcher accredited respondents' qualifications, experiences and positions that they hold allow them to knowledgably and reasonably put their extent of agreement, so that, it has positive contribution on the validity of the study.

4.2 Analysis of Data Collected From Respondents

The researcher applied five point Likert scale questionnaire where (1 =Strongly Disagree, 2 = Disagree, 3 = Uncertain, 4 = Agree and 5 = Strongly Agree) to collect data from respondents. 60 questionnaire were distributed to the target group of respondents and all of them are filled and returned. Part of the questionnaires related to general information of the respondents and training

related questions are distributed to all of the 60 respondents. Questions related to planning procurement are distributed only for 15 of the respondents and the rest 45 respondents fill questions related to the process of procurement starting from solicitation planning up to contract close out. This is due to respondents lack complete know-how about the whole process of the study area. The data was analyzed and presented using SPSS software program while semi structure interview results have been analyzed qualitatively.

Table 4.2 Provision of training related to project and project procurement management

	Response	**Frequency**	**Percent**
Did you take any training related to project management provided by your company?	Yes	18	30.0
	No	42	70.0
	Total	60	100.0
	Response	**Frequency**	**Percent**
Did you take any training related to project procurement management provided by your company?	Yes	9	15.0
	No	51	85.0
	Total	60	100.0

Source: Own Survey, 2018

From the above table 4.2 data, 70% and 85% of the respondents answers that they do not take training related to project management and project procurement management respectively. TEP program managers and project managers also insist the company failed to provide formal training for project staff members via interview. Instead the company has been used giving mentoring about the program and its sub projects. It also allow project staff members close work especially with service and foreign suppliers for knowledge sharing purpose. The researcher realize less priority is given for provision of training related to project and project procurement management issues.

4.2.1. Project Procurement Planning

This part of the study discussed on the first step of the project procurement management. The analysis has been conducted and presented depending on the responses collected from participants through questionnaire, semi structured interviews and relevant document review.

Table 4.3 Make-or-buy analysis for planning procurement

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	-	-	-	-
	Disagree	2	13.3	13.3	13.3
	Uncertain	2	13.3	13.3	26.7
	Agree	8	53.3	53.3	80
	Strongly Agree	3	20	20	100
	Total	15	100	100	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

The above table 4.3 reveals that out of the total respondents, 13.3% disagree, 13.3 uncertain, 53.3% agree and the remaining 20% agree that there is consideration make-or-buy analysis before deciding to buy from outside vendors to meet the project procurement need of the company. Furthermore, interview made with the Contract Management Program Managers also confirmed that the analysis is made to identify what the company cable to make, what is available from local suppliers and what to acquire from foreign suppliers. The project management process of the company also states it is important to identify whether to acquire or not at the planning phase of the project.

Table 4.4 Expert judgment for planning procurement

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	-	-	-	-
	Disagree	-	-	-	-
	Uncertain	2	13.3	13.3	13.3
	Agree	7	46.7	46.7	60.0
	Strongly Agree	6	40.0	40.0	100.0
	Total	15	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

According to table 4.4, 13.3% of the respondents are uncertain while 46.7% agree and 40% strongly agree that the use of expert judgement for planning project procurement. To triangulate the data, interview conducted with project managers and contract managers also reveals that there is establishment of Expert Group for the entire planning phase of the project who are selected based on their past experience, skill and ability, work experience and participation in previous projects of the company. In addition to expertise within the company, external experts are used

who are providing consultancy service in requirement selection, technology selection and contract preparation.

The company also form Technical Sourcing Committee having members from Network PRO Section, Information Transition Section, sourcing expertise as well as managers from user business units of the company. Members from Network PRO Section are expertise in their position helps to identify infrastructural requirement for the project and members from Information Transition Section are also expertise in their position helps for identification of business requirement of the project. User business units are departments or division of the company who are direct beneficiaries and became owner after the project completed. Following this, their managers are members of the Sourcing Committee for providing input for requirement selection process at planning phase.

Table 4.5 Conducting market research for planning procurement

		Frequency	**Percent**	**Valid Percent**	**Cumulative Percent**
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	6.7	6.7	6.7
	Disagree	2	13.3	13.3	20.0
	Uncertain	1	6.7	6.7	26.7
	Agree	4	26.7	26.7	53.3
	Strongly Agree	7	46.7	46.7	100.0
	Total	15	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

The above table 4.5 illustrates, out of the whole respondents 6.7% strongly disagree, 13.3 disagree, 6.7% uncertain, 26.7% agree and 46.7% strongly agree about conducting market research for planning procurement.

Data obtained from interview also confirms that the company use market assessment as its sourcing policy element for its project and operational procurement. The market information consists of product list and portfolio, supplier profile, price offer and other related information and update the data periodically and as needed. It helps to view supply and demand within the market, identify the power of suppliers, and level of competition.

The company also collect information about suppliers and there products online on its official website. New suppliers both from local and foreign market register and update their information

accordingly. The required information includes company profile, recent consecutive three years financial audit report, product or service portfolio, recommendation letter, and valid license and certificates.

Table 4.6 Consideration of past project procurement documents

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	-	-	-	-
	Disagree	2	13.3	13.3	13.3
	Uncertain	4	26.7	26.7	40.0
	Agree	1	6.7	6.7	46.7
	Strongly Agree	8	53.3	53.3	100.0
	Total	15	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

Table 4.6 depicts that more than half of the respondents (53.3%) strongly agree that consideration of past project procurement documents for making future decision while the remaining 13.3% disagree, 26.7% uncertain and 6.7% agree.

Interview with Contract Management program Managers also confirms there is reference of past project procurement documents to review issues such as suppliers profile and performance, type of goods and/or services provided, content of the contract, contract management issues, risks incurred, claims and way of solving, issues related to contract change and contract audit report. Such reference helps to identify possible threats, and opportunities as well as learn from past mistakes for making better decision.

Table 4.7 Activity resource and cost estimation consideration

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	-	-	-	-
	Disagree	-	-	-	-
	Uncertain	3	20.0	20.0	20.0
	Agree	8	53.3	53.3	73.3
	Strongly Agree	4	26.7	26.7	100.0
	Total	15	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

Table 4.7 reveals 20% of the respondents are uncertain while the remaining 53.3% and 26.7% agree and strongly agree respectively about consideration of activity resource and activity cost estimation for planning procurement for projects.

According to the company project management process document and TEP project charter, there is activity definition to identify specific activities to be performed to produce the various project deliverables and sequencing them to support for the development of an achievable schedule. This helps for resource estimation to identify the type and quantity of resources require to accomplish each activities. After estimating the required resources, an approximation of the costs of the resources needed to complete the project activities is estimated. According to project management process of the company its states activity cost must be estimated for all resources (people, services, material, hardware and software) that will charged to the project. According to Contract Management Program Managers such estimation helps to decide on what to acquire at what cost.

Table 4.8 Associated risks and mitigation plan identification

		Frequency	**Percent**	**Valid Percent**	**Cumulative Percent**
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	6.7	6.7	6.7
	Disagree	3	20.0	20.0	26.7
	Uncertain	3	20.0	20.0	46.7
	Agree	5	33.3	33.3	80.0
	Strongly Agree	3	20.0	20.0	100.0
	Total	15	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

Table 4.8 depicts that 6.7% strongly disagree, 20% disagree, 20% uncertain, 33.3% agree and the remaining 20% of respondents strongly agree. Most of the respondents reveals the company identify associated risks and prepare mitigation plan for its projects. The issue is confirmed via interview and by reviewing TEP project charter. Project risk management activity of the company not only involves in identification of risks and develop risk responses but also implement and track the risk responses.

Table 4.9 Identification of overall procurement need of the project

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	2	13.3	13.3	13.3
	Disagree	1	6.7	6.7	20.0
	Uncertain	2	13.3	13.3	33.3
	Agree	6	40.0	40.0	73.3
	Strongly Agree	4	26.7	26.7	100.0
	Total	15	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

Table 4.9 reveals that 13.3% strongly disagree, 6.7% disagree, 13.3% uncertain, 40% agree and 26.7% agree on the identification of overall procurement need for the project. According to interview with the program contract mangers and project managers, at the end of procurement planning issues such as whether to acquire, what to acquire, how to acquire, how much to acquire and when to acquire is determined.

Table 4.10 Separate procedure followed for managing project procurement

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	6.7	6.7	6.7
	Agree	-	-	-	-
	Uncertain	2	13.3	13.3	20.0
	Agree	5	33.3	33.3	53.3
	Strongly Agree	7	46.7	46.7	100.0
	Total	15	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

From the above table 4.10, 6.7% strongly disagree, 13.3% uncertain, 33.3% agree and the remaining 46.7% of the respondents strongly agree on the presences of separate procedure used for managing project procurement in Ethio Telecom.

To triangulate the data the researcher review TEP project charter which includes separate project procurement management section and develop its own governance such as TEP-Vendor's payment process, TEP- supply chain management, TEP- vendor’s performance reporting process and TEP-contract close out Process. The process documents includes inputs used, process steps, expected output, owner of the process, process flow chart, activity table, supporting tools, systems and documents.

Based on the data gathered using interview with the program contract managers, they confirmed that the company follow separate procedure and process which is different from corporate sourcing mainly on the nature of the contract, monitoring and controlling procedure, level of flexibility, and on the number of participant for approval.

Table 4.11 Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation for Project Procurement Planning Process

Items	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
There is a separate procedure to be followed for managing project procurement	15	4.13	1.13
Make-or-buy analysis is made before deciding to buy from outside vendors	15	3.80	0.94
Expert judgment is used for planning	15	4.27	0.70
Market research is conducted.	15	3.93	1.34
There is consideration of past procurement documents for making future decision	15	4.00	1.19
Activity resource and cost estimation is ensured	15	4.07	0.70
Associated risks and mitigation plan is identified while planning procurement	15	3.40	1.24
Overall procurement need of the project is identified at the end of planning.	15	3.60	1.35
Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation		3.9	1.07

Source: Own Survey, 2018

As shown in table 4.11, the respondents overall mean regarding to the project procurement planning scores 3.9 which implies project procurement planning practice were high. Individual items mean also lied between 3.41 -4.2 which indicates most of respondents agree on the above listed items.

The SD for presence of separate procedure, conduction of market research, consideration of past project procurement document, identification of risk and mitigation plan, and identification of overall need of the project lies between 1.13 and 1.35 in which the variables have highest SD which indicates the individual response were a little over 1 point away from a mean. For the remaining items the standard deviation is less than one and the individual response did not deviate at all from the mean.

4.2.2. Solicitation Planning

This part of the study discussed on the second step of the project procurement management. The analysis has been conducted and presented depending on the responses collected from respondents through questionnaire and semi structured interviews.

Table 4.12 Standardize procurement document to obtain bid/proposal from suppliers

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	6.7
	Uncertain	4	8.9	8.9	15.6
	Agree	10	22.2	22.2	37.8
	Strongly Agree	28	62.2	62.2	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

Table 4.12, reveals more than half of the respondents (62.2%) strongly agree on the preparation of standardize procurement document to obtain bid/proposal from suppliers. The remaining 2.2% strongly disagree, 4.4% disagree, 8.9% uncertain and 22.2 agree on the issue.

The result is confirmed by Contract Management Program Managers on the preparation of standardized procurement document called Request for Information (RFI) and Request for Proposal (RFP) which is prepared by two committees called technical and commercial. The technical committee is responsible to identify detailed requirements and description of the item, mandatory requirement, optional requirement, specific features of the item, the solution it provides, environmental effect the item has on use and mention if there is a need for certification such as ISO. The financial committee is responsible to prepare but not limited to minimum acceptable amount of unit price, and total cost of ownership.

First, there is preparation of Request for Information (RFI) which is used to obtain information about product and services offered by potential suppliers for the purpose of preparing RFP which is used to obtain response from suppliers.

Table 4.13 Accurateness, relevance and completeness of information obtained from RFP&RFI documents

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	4.4
	Uncertain	6	13.3	13.3	17.8
	Agree	18	40.0	40.0	57.8
	Strongly Agree	19	42.2	42.2	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

According to respondents from the above table 4.13, 2.2% strongly disagree, 2.2% disagree, 13.3% disagree, 40% agree and the remaining 42.2% strongly agree about the information gathered from RFP & RFI documents helps to get accurate, relevant and complete information.

Data from interview reveals the justification for obtaining such information is due to the involvement of experts from internal and external as well as involvement of concerned stakeholders in preparation of procurement document. Besides, there is revision and approval of the document by Steering Committee before communicated to suppliers. The steering committee consists of members from different background such as project managers, project costing managers, program managers, chief executive officers of Network, chief executive officers of Information System, chief executive officers of Sourcing and Facility Divisions, TEP program director and chief executive officer of the company. From this point, it can be concluded that the prepared procurement documents helps to obtain accurate, relevant and complete information from suppliers.

Table 4.14 Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation for Solicitation Planning Process

Items	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
Standardize procurement document is used to obtain bid/proposal from vendors	45	4.38	0.98
The prepared document (RFP/RFI/IFB) helps to get accurate, relevant and complete information from vendors	45	4.18	0.91
Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation		4.28	0.95

Source: Own Survey, 2018

As shown in table 4.14, the respondents overall mean regarding to the project procurement planning scores 4.28 which implies solicitation planning process practice were very high. Individual items mean also consists of 4.38 and 4.18 which indicates most of respondents strongly agree on the above listed items. The SD for the above listed items on Table 4.14 contains 0.98 and 0.91 which is less than one which can be concluded that individual response did not deviate at all from the mean score.

4.2.3. Solicitation

This part of the study discussed on the third step of the project procurement management. The analysis has been conducted and presented depending on the responses collected from respondents through questionnaire, semi structured interviews and relevant document review.

Table 4.15 Appropriateness of procurement documents way of communication

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	3	6.7	6.7	6.7
	Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	11.1
	Uncertain	3	6.7	6.7	17.8
	Agree	17	37.8	37.8	55.6
	Strongly Agree	20	44.4	44.4	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

The above table 4.15 depicts that 6.7% strongly disagree, 4.4% disagree, 6.7% uncertain, 37.8% agree and the remaining 44.4% strongly agree about appropriateness of the way used to communicate the prepared procurement documents for the target suppliers.

Data obtained from Contract Management Program Managers reveals that the prepared documents were communicated for potential suppliers by any means available. The communication tools includes online announcement via the company website, newspapers, television, radio and social networks. The prepared procurement documents communicated especially by sending out for pre-identified potential suppliers; for products and services which are available only on foreign market, for wide range nature of product portfolio, for urgency need, for requirement of mass purchase and when large investment required. From the above data, the way of communication used for announcement of procurement document is valid.

Table 4.16 Arrangement of pre-proposal visits

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	5	11.1	11.1	11.1
	Disagree	26	57.8	57.8	68.9
	Uncertain	4	8.9	8.9	77.8
	Agree	5	11.1	11.1	88.9
	Strongly Agree	5	11.1	11.1	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

From the above table 4.16, more than half of the respondents (57.8%) disagree on the arrangement of pre-proposal visit. While the remaining 11.1% strongly disagree, 8.9% uncertain, 11.1% agree and 11.1% also strongly agree. The interviewees also admits the company fail to conduct pre-proposal market visits.

Table 4.17 Usage of bidders' conference for answering prospective suppliers questions

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	5	11.1	11.1	11.1
	Disagree	6	13.3	13.3	24.4
	Uncertain	3	6.7	6.7	31.1
	Agree	21	46.7	46.7	77.8
	Strongly Agree	10	22.2	22.2	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

Table 4.17 depicts 11.1% strongly disagree, 13.3% disagree, 6.7% uncertain, 46.7% agree and the remaining 22.2% of the respondents strongly agree on the use of bidders' conference/pre-bid meeting to give answer for the asked questions and doubts to all prospective sellers.

Data from Contract Management Program Managers interview also reveals the company use bidders' conference to provide clarification for project procurement bidders'. The bidders' provide their questionnaire in written format and the program contract management team members replies such queries in written format by reading the queries without mentioning the name of the supplier who asked the question but not about cost estimate of the project procurement. A full set of a minutes of the conference sent to all bidders' if they want within a reasonable time frame.

Table 4.18 Respond for questions and doubts raised by prospective suppliers individually

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	6.7
	Uncertain	4	8.9	8.9	15.6
	Agree	15	33.3	33.3	48.9
	Strongly Agree	23	51.1	51.1	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

The above table 4.18 depicts more than half of the respondents (51.1%) strongly agree that the company respond for questions and doubts raised by prospective sellers individually. The remaining 2.2% strongly disagree, 4.4% disagree, 8.9% uncertain and 33.3% agree on the issue.

The interviewees also confirmed that for any individual help the bidders' can contact the project procurement team members via their cell phone and email while the team members are expected to respond accordingly except some confidential information. The company also provide free calling minute and unrestricted internet for its project procurement team members to encourage them providing any needed help for bidders' boldly.

Table 4.19 Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation for Solicitation Process

Items	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
Procurement documents such as RFP/RFI/IFB are announced for targeted vendors using appropriate way of communication.	45	4.09	1.15
Pre-proposal visits is arranged.	45	2.53	1.179
The company use bidders' conference/pre-bid meeting to give answer for the asked questions and doubts to all prospective sellers.	45	3.56	1.289
The company respond for questions and doubts raised by prospective sellers individually.	45	4.27	.963
Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation		3.61	1.144

Source: Own Survey, 2018

As shown in table 4.19, the respondents overall mean regarding to the solicitation process scores 3.61 which implies solicitation practice were high. Individual items mean also lied between 3.56 - 4.27 which indicates most of respondents agree on the above listed items except for pre-proposal visit arrangement which scores mean of 2.53.

4.2.4. Source Selection

This part of the study discussed on the fourth step of the project procurement management. The analysis has been conducted and presented depending on the responses collected from respondents through questionnaire, semi structured interviews as well as by reviewing relevant documents.

Table 4.20 The presence of standardize pre-defined proposal evaluation criteria

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	6.7
	Uncertain	4	8.9	8.9	15.6
	Agree	28	62.2	62.2	77.8
	Strongly Agree	10	22.2	22.2	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

From the above table 4.20, out of the whole respondents more than half (62.2%) agree the presence of standardize pre-defined proposal evaluation criteria. The remaining 2.2% strongly disagree, 4.4% disagree, 8.9% uncertain and 22.2% strongly disagree. The researcher has supported the above responses by referring project management process document of the company.

In line with this, the referred documents states that the procurement evaluation criteria should be defined at the planning stage of project procurement to ensure that the procurement meets the project requirement. The process justify the need for evaluation criteria is that the suppliers can then be evaluated against the predefined evaluation criteria.

Table 4.21 Preliminary screening used before making detail evaluation of proposal

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	5	11.1	11.1	11.1
	Disagree	8	17.8	17.8	28.9
	Uncertain	3	6.7	6.7	35.6
	Agree	17	37.8	37.8	73.3
	Strongly Agree	12	26.7	26.7	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

From the above table 4.21, 11.1% strongly disagree, 17.8% disagree, 6.7% uncertain, 37.8% agree and 26.7% strongly agree about the company conduct preliminary screening before making detail evaluation of proposal.

The interview made with Contract Management Program Managers also confirmed that the company uses preliminary screening before making detail evaluation of the received proposal. Screening is made by checking whether the received proposals from suppliers comply with preliminary and eligibility requirements asked by the company. Mostly the requested information includes licenses, certifications, financial report, and bid security.

Table 4.22 Cost and estimated delivery date are the main factors used for evaluating proposal

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	4.4
	Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	6.7
	Uncertain	3	6.7	6.7	13.3
	Agree	8	17.8	17.8	31.1
	Strongly Agree	31	68.9	68.9	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

Table 4.22 reveals that more than half of the respondents (68.9%) strongly agree on consideration cost and estimated delivery data as main factor to evaluate bidders' proposal since it is important to consider the priorities of the project. The remaining 4.4% strongly disagree, 2.2% disagree, 6.7% uncertain and 17.8% agree on the issue.

The interview conducted also confirmed the company give priority consideration for those suppliers that considered the project time schedule and budget in there proposal provision.

According to Dvir et.al (2003) meeting schedule and budget goals are the major success measures of project which is also repeatedly said by Contract Management Program Managers of the company during interview.

Cost and estimated delivery date are considered under commercial evaluation of the proposal. There is consideration of two types of cost in the case of TEP named total cost of ownership and life span cost. Total cost of ownership comprises the following but not limited to; base price, payment cost, price variation factors, packaging charges, maintenance cost, spare parts cost and recurring cost. The life span cost computes cost of the purchased item for the next five years which is beyond the schedule of the TEP. Such financial feature of the procurement were applicable especially for foreign purchased items and such feature distinguish it from corporate procurement of the company.

Table 4.23 Consideration of other factors for selecting suppliers' proposal

		Frequency	**Percent**	**Valid Percent**	**Cumulative Percent**
Financial Stability	Strongly Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	4.4
	Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	8.9
	Uncertain	4	8.9	8.9	17.8
	Agree	17	37.8	37.8	55.6
	Strongly Agree	20	44.4	44.4	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	
		Frequency	**Percent**	**Valid Percent**	**Cumulative Percent**
Technical Requirement	Strongly Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	6.7
	Uncertain	3	6.7	6.7	13.3
	Agree	17	37.8	37.8	51.1
	Strongly Agree	22	48.9	48.9	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	
		Frequency	**Percent**	**Valid Percent**	**Cumulative Percent**
Risk Management Issue	Strongly Disagree	8	17.8	17.8	17.8
	Disagree	19	42.2	42.2	60.0
	Uncertain	3	6.7	6.7	66.7
	Agree	8	17.8	17.8	84.4
	Strongly Agree	7	15.6	15.6	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Past Experience	Strongly Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	4.4
	Disagree	3	6.7	6.7	11.1
	Uncertain	1	2.2	2.2	13.3
	Agree	12	26.7	26.7	40.0
	Strongly Agree	27	60.0	60.0	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

The above table 4.23 reveals consideration of financial stability, technical requirement, risk management issue and past experience to evaluate and select among suppliers'.

From the table, 4.4% strongly disagree, 4.4% disagree, 8.9% uncertain, 37.8% agree and the remaining 44.4% strongly agree about consideration of financial stability while selecting among suppliers'. To triangulate the data, interview conducted with the Contract Management Program Managers reveals that the company most importantly give prior consideration on the financial stability aspect of the suppliers in order to maintain confidence on their financial system and make sure they are cable of honoring the contract. Suppliers' financial report, monetary stability, and operation with their respective financial institution are also considered.

Especially foreign suppliers are expected to provide the required product and services on credit with convenience means of reimbursement, interest rate and grace period. Suppliers with less capacity to provide credit purchase were disqualified and not able to go through further evaluation process. Some suppliers that have capacity to provide credit are also disqualified because they ask change in some country wide policy than dealing with what the company can do. Shortage of foreign currency at country wide is the justification behind for consideration of credit purchase.

Table 4.23 also reveals that 2.2% strongly disagree, 4.4% disagree, 6.7% uncertain, 37.8% agree and the remaining 48.9% strongly agree about consideration of technical requirement for evaluating and selecting among suppliers proposal. Interview with Contract Management Program Managers also confirmed that consideration of technical requirements. Evaluation panel held to conduct technical evaluation while expertise from Network PRO and Information Transition Sections meet to check out the received proposals considered the predetermined requirements.

Table 4.23 also depicts that, 17.8% strongly disagree, 42.2% disagree, 6.7% uncertain, 17.8% agree and the remaining 15.6% strongly agree about consideration of risk management issue for selecting among proposals. The results shows that the company is not considering the risk management process of suppliers. Contract Management Program Managers also illustrates that suppliers are not requested to provide their risk management process.

From table 4.23, more than half of the respondents (60%) strongly agree that the company considered past experience of suppliers for selecting among the received proposals. The remaining 4.4% strongly disagree, 6.7% disagree, 2.2% uncertain and 26.7% agree of the issue. To triangulate the result, the conducted interview also reveals that suppliers expected to bring recommendation letter from different international telecom operators to consider their past performance and reputation. There is reference of past performance document for suppliers which are previously work with the company.

Interview with Contract Management Program Managers reveals that the evaluation report needs to be approved and signed by the delegated committee members to precede for negotiation. Then negotiation panel held with selected bidders to reach on mutual agreement which later became part of the contract and bidders for the contract selected as per the negotiation result. The company follow multiple contract award for project procurement in order to minimize possible risks.

Table 4.24 Consideration of future requirement change in procurement contract

		Frequency	**Percent**	**Valid Percent**	**Cumulative Percent**
Valid	Strongly Disagree	4	8.9	8.9	8.9
	Disagree	9	20.0	20.0	28.9
	Uncertain	2	4.4	4.4	33.3
	Agree	14	31.1	31.1	64.4
	Strongly Agree	16	35.6	35.6	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

The above table 4.24 reveals that 8.9% strongly disagree, 20% disagree, 4.4% uncertain, 31.1% agree and the remaining 35.6% strongly agree on raised issue. Most of the respondents agree that the terms and conditions of the contract are open to consider future requirement change.

Change is inevitable; therefore requires some type of change management plan as mandatory for every project (PMBOK, 2013). Since this is the case it is important for the terms and conditions of the contract to consider future possible change management and open for amendment.

Table 4.25 Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation for Source Selection

Items	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
There is standardize pre-defined proposal evaluation criteria.	45	3.98	0.84
Preliminary screening is used before making detail evaluation of proposal.	45	3.51	1.36
Cost, estimated delivery date and performance are the main factors used for selecting project procurement proposal.	45	4.44	1.04
Consideration of Financial Stability	45	4.13	1.06
Consideration of Technical Requirement	45	4.27	0.94
Consideration of Risk Management Issue	45	2.71	1.38
Consideration of Past Experience	45	4.31	1.10
The terms and conditions of the contract are open to consider future requirement change	45	3.64	1.38
Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation		3.87	1.14

Source: Own Survey, 2018

As shown in table 4.25, the respondents overall mean regarding to the Source selection scores 3.87 which implies source selection practice were high. Individual items mean also lied between 3.51 - 4.44 which indicates most of respondents agree on the above listed items except for consideration of risk management issue to evaluate suppliers documents since it scores mean of 2.71.

The SD for presence of standardize pre-defined proposal evaluation criteria, and consideration of technical requirement scores less than 1which implies individual response did not deviate at all from the mean. But for the remaining listed items on table 4.25, SD lies between 1.04 and 1.38 which indicates the individual response were a little over 1 point away from a mean.

4.2.5. Contract Administration

This part of the study discussed on the fifth step of the project procurement management. The analysis has been conducted and presented depending on the responses collected from respondents through questionnaire, semi structured interviews as well as by reviewing relevant documents.

Table 4.26 Monitoring and controlling of suppliers performance

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	4.4
	Disagree	7	15.6	15.6	20.0
	Uncertain	2	4.4	4.4	24.4
	Agree	12	26.7	26.7	51.1
	Strongly Agree	22	48.9	48.9	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

Table 4.26 reveals that, 4.4% strongly disagree, 15.6% disagree, 4.4% uncertain, 26.7% agree and 48.9% agree that the company monitor and control if suppliers performance meets project procurement requirements according to terms of the contract.

The Contract Management Program Managers also confirms that the company tracks and ensures the delivery of the product and services as per the contract using supporting documents such as goods shipment letter, inspection letter, goods arrival note, surveyor report, and test report.

According to the company TEP-supply chain management process, procured products are required to arrive at central or regional warehouse of the company for inspection. Expertise from Network Division and/or Information System Division of the company inspect the product and the warehouse team prepare inspection report for TEP contract management team members. The interviewed managers also confirms that for products which directly arrive at project sites are not subject to inspection by expertise and suppliers are not questioned if any defect is found.

The interviewed managers reveals that contract related to service procurement monitored and controlled using release of payment when suppliers complete the agreed upon phase of the project by getting the signature of the project managers.

Communication plan section of TEP project charter states project status meeting shall be made once in a week among its program mangers', director, chief executive officers', and project managers to discuss on the progress of the project as a whole. According to the Contract Management Program Managers and project managers, weekly meeting with foreign suppliers held to discuss on the progress of the signed contract.

Table 4.27 Suppliers' performance status gathered from concerned stakeholders

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	12	26.7	26.7	26.7
	Disagree	13	28.9	28.9	55.6
	Uncertain	3	6.7	6.7	62.2
	Agree	6	13.3	13.3	75.6
	Strongly Agree	11	24.4	24.4	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

Table 4.27 reveals that most of the respondents strongly disagree and disagree that suppliers' performance status is gathered from stakeholders such as project managers and project team members. The data depicts 26.7% strongly disagree, 28.9% disagree, 6.7% uncertain, 13.3% agree and the remaining 24.4% strongly agree on the raised issue.

Interview conducted with project managers also confirmed that the company did not ask for feedback and recommendation about the performance of suppliers. They recommend if project procurement team ask their feedback on issues such as cooperative nature of service suppliers, quality of item, durability, and if training is required or not on usage of the purchased product and services. According to Kerzner (2009), it is important to gather performance status from different appropriate stakeholders of the project.

Table 4.28 Presence of formal procedure to accept/reject project requirement change

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	9	20.0	20.0	20.0
	Disagree	7	15.6	15.6	35.6
	Uncertain	2	4.4	4.4	40.0
	Agree	14	31.1	31.1	71.1
	Strongly Agree	13	28.9	28.9	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

The above table 4.28 reveals 20% strongly disagree, 15.6% disagree, 4.4% uncertain, 31.1% agree and 28.9% strongly agree on the issue of presence of formal procedure to accept/reject project requirement change. Most of the respondents agree that the company follow formal procedure to accept/reject project requirement change.

Interview conducted with project managers and Contract Management Program Managers confirmed that the company prepared formal procedure for accepting or rejecting project requirement change by mentioning who initiate the request, valid template for request, who approves and whom participate in the process. They confirmed that minor change in the scope of procurement that do not impact the overall quality, time, cost and related terms of the contract is not acceptable for amending the whole contract.

Table 4.29 Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation for Contract Administration

Items	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
The company monitor and control that vendors performance meets project procurement requirements according to terms of the contract	45	4.00	1.26
Vendors' performance status is gathered from stakeholders such as project managers and project team members	45	2.80	1.58
The company follow formal procedure to accept/reject project requirement change.	45	3.33	1.54
Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation		3.376	1.46

Source: Own Survey, 2018

As shown in table 4.29, the respondents overall mean regarding to the contract administration scores 3.38 which implies contract administration practice were high. Individual items mean also includes 4.00 and 3.33 which indicates most of respondents agree on the above listed items except for performance status gathered from the concerned stakeholder since it scores mean of 2.80. The SD for the above listed items lies between 1.26 and 1.58 which indicates the individual response were a little over 1 point away from a mean.

4.2.6. Contract Closeout

This part of the study discussed on the last step of the project procurement management. The analysis has been conducted and presented depending on the responses collected from respondents through questionnaire, and semi structured interviews.

Table 4.30 Identification of contract closeout activities

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	4.4
	Disagree	3	6.7	6.7	11.1
	Uncertain	2	4.4	4.4	15.6
	Agree	11	24.4	24.4	40.0
	Strongly Agree	27	60.0	60.0	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

From table 4.30, more than half of the respondents (60%) strongly agree on contract closeout activities are clearly identified. The remaining 4.4% strongly disagree, 6.7% disagree, 4.4% uncertain and 24.4% agree.

According to the interviewed Contract Management Program Managers, there is identification of major activities to consider for closing contract. There is documentation of major issues and pending issues tracker to consider whether to close the contract or not. The company provide acceptance letter for suppliers if list of activities on major issues are completed and ongoing follow up effort made on activities that are listed in pending issue tracker. Suppliers are also obliged to handover warranty documentation including expiration date.

Table 4.31 Lesson learned documentation

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Disagree	3	6.7	6.7	8.9
	Uncertain	1	2.2	2.2	11.1
	Agree	7	15.6	15.6	26.7
	Strongly Agree	33	73.3	73.3	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Source: Own Survey, 2018

From table 4.31, more than half of the respondents (73.3%) strongly agree on the presence of lesson learned documentation. The remaining 2.2% strongly disagree, 6.7% disagree, 2.2% uncertain and 15.6% agree on the issue.

According to data collected from interviewees reveals that there is documentation of lesson leaned after each projects are completed and compiled centrally for program report at large. The identified

problems, risks identified, solutions undertaken, threats and opportunities are documented and supported by pictures and videos.

Table 4.32 Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation for Contract Closeout

Items	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
The identified problems, solution undertaken, threats and opportunities during the overall procurement process is documented.	45	4.29	1.12
There is lesson learned documentation.	45	4.51	0.99
Aggregate Mean and Standard Deviation		4.4	1.06

Source: Own Survey, 2018

As shown in table 4.29, the respondents overall mean regarding to the contract closeout scores 4.4 which implies contract closeout practice were very high. Individual items mean also includes 4.29 and 4.51 which indicates most of respondents strongly agree on the above listed.

CHAPTER FIVE: SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS & RECOMMENDATIONS

Introduction

This study aims to assess project procurement practice of Ethio Telecom. To accomplish the objectives of the research, the researcher applied descriptive approach and both quantitative and qualitative data were collected through questionnaire, semi structured interview and document review. Thus, this section reports the summary of findings, conclusions and recommendations of the study

5.1. Summary of Findings

The sampling technique used was purposive. 60 questionnaires were prepared and distributed for 60 samples, out of which 15 samples fill out for questionnaire related to planning procurement process of the study area. The remaining 45 respondents fill out for the rest of the project procurement process. All participants' responses for closed ended questions. To triangulate the findings, interview was conducted with 5 project managers and 4 Contract Management Program Managers. The data gathered through semi structured interviews were compiled and well maintained with the data gathered with questionnaire. Thus, findings retrieved from the data presented in this section are:

- More than half of the respondents (70%) reveals that they do not take any training related project management provided by the company on table 4.2. The table also reveals 85% of the respondents do not take any training related to project procurement management provided by the company.
- Majority of the respondents agree that Ethio Telecom considered make-or-buy analysis, expert judgment, and market research as tools and techniques for planning project procurement.
- Respondents from table 4.6 reveals 53.3% strongly agree and 6.7% agree on consideration of past project procurement documents Ethio Telecom. Interviewees (Contract Management Program Managers) also confirms such reference helps to identify possible threats, and opportunities as well as learn from past mistakes for making better decision.

- From table 4.7, most of the respondents agreed on the issue of consideration activity resource and cost estimation while planning procurement process to identify what to acquire at what cost.
- Most of questionnaire respondents and interviewees with Contract Management Program Managers agreed that Ethio Telecom identify associated risks and prepare mitigation plan while planning its project procurement.
- Most of questionnaire respondents and interviewees also agreed that overall need of the project are identified after planning procurement process. The data is confirmed by referring Ethio Telecom project management process which states whether to acquire, what to acquire, how to acquire, how much to acquire and when to acquire should be determined after planning project procurement management.
- Ethio Telecom follows separated procedure for managing its project procurement from its corporate procurement. The data has confirmed by the agreement of most of the respondents and by reviewing process documents only used for project procurement practice.
- Most of the respondents (62.2%) from table 4.14 strongly agree that Ethio Telecom prepare standardize procurement document such as RFI and RFP to obtain bid/proposal from suppliers. Most of the respondents also agree that prepared procurement documents helps to get accurate, relevant and complete response from prospective suppliers. Interviewees (Contract Management Program Managers) reported the company able to collect such information because of participation of concerned stakeholders, involvement of expertise within and outside the company, and approved by a committee before the documents are released.
- Table 4.15 reveals most of the respondents agreed on the appropriateness of the way of communication used to communicate the prepared procurement document. According to the interviewees (Contract Management Program Managers) the communication tools includes online announcement, newspapers, television, radio, social networks and sending out for prospective suppliers.
- From table 4.16, more than half of the respondents (57.8%) disagree and 11.1% strongly disagree on arrangement of pre-proposal visit by Ethio Telecom.

- Most of the respondents from table 4.17 and table 4.18 agreed on the usage of bidders' conference, and respond individually for questions and doubts raised by prospective suppliers.
- Ethio Telecom uses standardized pre-defined proposal evaluation criteria for evaluating the received proposals from suppliers. More than half of the respondents (62.2%) from table 4.20 agree and the company project management process also support the raised issue.
- Ethio Telecom conduct preliminary screening before making detail evaluation of the received procurement proposals documents from prospective suppliers. The idea is supported by interviewees (Contract Management Program Managers) and by most of the respondents from table 4.21.
- From table 4.22, more than half of the respondents (68.9%) strongly agree on the usage of cost and estimated delivery date as major factors for evaluating bidders' proposal. Table 4.23, reveals the company also consider financial stability, technical requirement and past experience of suppliers to evaluate suppliers' proposal. But it fails to consider risk management process of suppliers. The data is confirmed by 42.2% disagreement and 17.8% strongly disagree with the idea of risk management issue consideration for evaluating the received proposals.
- Most of the respondents agree that the terms and conditions of the contract are open to consider future requirement change. The data is confirmed by most of the respondents from table 4.24 in which 31.1% of them agree and 35.6% of them strongly agree with the idea.
- Most of the respondents from table 4.26, agreed with the idea of monitoring and controlling of suppliers performance by Ethio Telecom. The company hire inspectors, uses reporting templates, preparing follow up process documents, held project status meeting and make payment based on completion of the agreed upon phase of the project as monitoring and controlling tools. Interviewee Contract Management Program Managers reveals for products arrived directly at project sites are not subject to inspection by expertise and suppliers are not questioned if any defect is found.
- Most of the respondents from table 4.27 reveals that the company failed to collect suppliers' performance report from the concerned stakeholders such as project managers and project team members. The result is supported by conducting interview with project managers.

- Most of questionnaire respondents and interviewees reveals the company uses formal procedure to accept or reject project requirement change. The interviewees (Contract Management Program Managers) depicts the company determine who initiate the request, prepare valid template for request, mentions who approves the requested change and whom participate in the process.
- From table 4.31, more than half of the respondents (60%) strongly agree that the company identifies major activities which need to be considered for closing a contract. 73.3% of the respondents from table 4.32 also strongly agree on the idea that the company uses lesson learned documentation while closing contract.

5.2. Conclusions

This research aimed at assessing project procurement practice of the company which is composed of six processes identified by reviewing related literature of the study area. Data obtained from analysis and major findings of the research are concluded here below.

Ethio Telecom fail to provide formal training related to project and project procurement management. The company considers make-or-buy analysis, expert judgment, market research, past project procurement documents, and activity and cost estimation for planning project procurement. At the end of planning procurement; associated risks and mitigation plan as well as overall procurement need of the project are identified. The company also follows separate project procurement procedure.

Ethio Telecom prepares standardize procurement document to obtain bid/proposal from suppliers. The prepared documents help the company to get accurate, relevant and complete response. It also uses appropriate means of communication to announce its procurement documents for its prospective suppliers. It prepares bidders' conference and individually approaches its suppliers to answer and clarify their questions and doubts. But the company fails to arrange pre-proposal visit.

The company uses pre-defined proposal evaluation criteria and prefers to conduct preliminary screening before making detail evaluation the received proposals. Cost and estimated delivery dates are the major factors used for evaluation proposals. The company also considers financial

stability, technical requirement and past experience of suppliers for evaluation. But it fails to consider suppliers risk management issue.

Contract is signed between Ethio Telecom and its selected suppliers after reaching an agreement by preparing negotiation panel. The terms and conditions of the contract are open consider future possible requirement change. The company monitor and control that suppliers' performance meets project procurement requirements according to terms of the contract using different methods, any project requirement change is welcomed or rejected by following formal procedure. But the company failed to gather suppliers' performance status from main stakeholders such as project managers and project team members. Besides there is week monitoring and controlling of products which are directly arrived at project site. The company clearly identifies contract closeout activities and prepare lesson learned document for its future reference.

5.3. Recommendations

The practice of project procurement management in Ethio Telecom shows a deviation with that of theoretical aspect of the knowledge area. On which the company should recognize and give greater emphasis to the identified gaps and ensure the effective management of its project procurement practice. Thus, the researcher provides the following recommendations pinpointing focal points that would be helpful to the company project procurement management in fruitful directions.

- The company should provide adequate training on project and project procurement management area for project team members since it increases their knowledge and skill. The training also help them for better understanding of the three constraints of project while they make decision.
- The company should arrange pre-proposal visit especially for its large procurement decisions in order to view the capability of the market site, production factory, and technical and managerial capability of pre-identified potential suppliers.
- The finding of the study reveals the company is financially dependent on its suppliers for procuring foreign products and services, and more emphasis is given on financial aspect of suppliers for evaluating and selecting among them. The researcher recommends the company not to neglect and consider their risk management practice as well as check how they redistribute in satisfactory manner.

- The company should gather performance status report from the concerned stakeholders about the following information but not limited to; the quality of the received products and services, on time delivery of resources, and if training is needed. This will help to take early appropriate measures for the identified gaps before things getting worse.
- The finding of the study reveals Ethio Telecom uses tight monitoring and controlling system for products arrived at regional and central warehouse but fail for products arrived directly at project site. Following this, the researcher recommends the company should develop tight monitoring and controlling system on those products directly arrived at project site.

REFERENCES

Aliza, A. H., Stephen, K., & Bambang, T. (2011). The Importance of Project Governance Framework in Project Procurement Planning. *The Twelfth East Asia-Pacific Conference on Structural Engineering and Construction*, 1929-1937.

Anypol limited company;Ethio Telecom. (2014). *National Phone Directory.* AddisAbaba, Ethiopia: The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.

Atilla, K. (2004). *Enhancing Procurement Practices: Comprehensive Approach to Acquiring Complex Facilities and Projects.* New york, United State of America: Springer Science+Business Media , LLC .

Beleiu, I., Crisan, E., & Nistor, R. (2015). Main Factors Influecing Project Success. *Interdisciplinary Management ResearchXI*, 59-72.

Blomberg, M. (2006). *Developing a Strategic Procurement Process.* Sweden: Lulea University of Technology.

Dimitri, N., Piga, G., & Spagnolo, G. (2006). *Handbook of Procurement.* The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge cb2 2ru, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Dvir, D., Raz, T., & Shenhar, A. J. (2003, February). An empirical analysis of the relationship between project planning and project success. *International Journal of Project Management*, 89-95.

Eriksson, P. E., & Vennström, A. (2010). *Effects of Procurement on Project Performance : a survey of Swedish Contsruction Clients.* Sweden: Luleå University of Technology.

Ethio Telecom. (2014). *Ethio Telecom Citizen Charter.* Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Ethio Telecom .

Ethio Telecom Human Resource Division. (2015). *Telecom Magazine* (Vol. I). Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Ethio Telecom.

Fleming, Q. W. (2003). *Project Procurement Management-Contacting,Subcontracting, Teaming* (1st ed.). California, United States of America: FMC Press.

Heagney, J. (2012). *Fundamentals of Project Management, 4th edition.* New York, United State of America: American Management Association.

Heerkens, G. R. (2002). *Project Management.* United State of America: McGraw-Mill.

https://dpi.wi.gov/school-nutrition/procurement/methods/formal/rfp-ifb. (n.d.). *https://dpi.wi.gov*. Retrieved from Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction

Hussien, N. B. (2013). *Procurement Performance and Operational Efficiency in Telecommunication Industry in Kenya.* Nairobi, Kenya: University of Nairobi.

Institution of Project Management. (2000). *A Guide to the Project management Body of Knowledge.* Pennsylvania, United State of America: Project Management Institute, Inc.

Institution of Project Management. (2013). *A Guide to the Project management Body of Knowledge* (sth ed.). Pennsylvania, United state of America: Project Management Institute, Inc.

Jainendrakumar, T. D. (2015, November). Project Procurement Management for Project Managers. *PM World Journal, IV*(XI).

Karlsson, P. (n.d.). *Project Management in Sweden and Ethiopia - Potential improvements in Project Management methods.*

Kerzner, H. (2009). *Project management : a systems approach to planning, scheduling, and controlling* (10th ed.). Hoboken, New Jersey: Published by John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Kirai , A. K., & Kwasira, J. (2016, April). Assessment of Determinants of Procurement Performance at Kenya Pipeline Company. *International Journal of Research in Business Management, IV*(4), 43-54.

Kovächs, A. (2004). *Enhancing Procurement Practices, Comprehensive Approach to Acquiring Complex Facilities and Projects.* New York: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Kuipers, B. V., Adriaans, R., Dolder, T. v., Fleuren, L., Haag, E., Kok, A. d., . . . Alleijn, S. (2016/2017). *Supplier Relationship Management (SRM).* United State of America: Capgemini Consulting .

Laby, N. C., Arokiaprakash, A., Indira, M., & Manivel, S. (2016). Analysis of Factors Influecing Procurement Process and Proposing a Decision Making Module for Construction Project on Multi-Site Context. *International Journal of Applied Research ISSN 0973-4562 Volume 11*, 6689-6693.

Leary, M. R. (2012). *Introduction to Behavioral Research Methods* (Vol. sixth). United States of America: Pearson Education, Inc.

Luckey, T., & Phillips, J. (2006). *Software Project Management For Dummies.* Indianapolis, Indiana: Wiley Publishing.

Martha, S. (2015). *Effective Public Procurement Management in Implementation of Successful Public Projects in Ethiopia: A Case Study of Addis Ababa City Government Housing Development Project offices.* Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Addis Ababa University.

Mereset, A. (2016). *Project Procurement Practice in Alemgena Road Maintenace Project.* Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Addis Ababa University.

Morris , P. W., & Pinto, J. K. (2007). *The Wiley Guide to Project Technology, Supply Chain, and Procurement Management.* New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, In.

National Bank of Ethiopia. (2017). *Annual Report 2016/17.* Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: National Bank of Ethiopia.

Neef, D. (2001). *e-Procurement from Strategy upto Implementation.* United States of America: Prentice Hall, Inc.

Neuman, W. L. (2007). *Basics of Social Research; Qualitative and Quatitative Approaches.* Boston: pearson Education.

PMBOK. (2013). A Guide to the Project Management Body of Knowledge . Pennsylvania, USA: Project Management Institute, INC.

Rad, P. F. (2002). *Project Estimating and Cost management.* United State of America: Management Concepts, Inc.

Sherif, M. H. (2006). Telecommunication Project Management. In M. H. Sherif, *Managing Projects in Telecommunication Services* (Vol. II). New Jersey, USA: John Wiley and Sons.

Tayntor, C. B. (2010). *Project Management Tools and Techniques for Success.* United State of America: Taylor & Francis Group.

Wallace, W. L., & Xia, Y. L. (2014). *Delivering Customer Value through Procurement.* Pearson FT Press.

World Bank. (2012). *Diagnosing Corruption in Ethiopia Perceptions, Realities, and the Way Forward for Key Sectors.* (J. Plummer, Ed.) Washington DC: International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank.

Wikipedia. (2010, October). *www.wikipedia.org*. Retrieved from www.wikipedia.org: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Procurement#Procurement_life_cycle

www.projectmanagementdocs.com. (2018). *www.projectmanagementdocs.com.* Retrieved from www.projectmanagementdocs.com: http://www.projectmanagementdocs.com/project-planning-templates/procurement-management-plan.html

Wyman, O. (2013). *The Procurement Value in Ethio Telecom-Unlocking Further Potential and Ensuring Actual Financial Impact.* NewYork: Marsh & McLennan Companies.

Wysocki, R. K. (2014). *Effective Project Management: Traditional, Agile* (7th ed.). Indianapolis, Indiana: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Yalew, E. M. (2017). *Basic Research Principles and Applications.* Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: Bahir Dar University.

APPENDIX

Addis Ababa University College of Business and Economics
School of Commerce Masters of Art in Project Management

Dear Respondents:

My name is Kidist Dagnachew, I am a graduating class student of Masters Program in Project Management at Addis Ababa University School of Commerce. As part of the Masters program now I am conducting a project work entitled **Assessment of Project Procurement Management Practice in Ethio Telecom.**

I kindly request you to participate in this research study by completing the attached questionnaire. In order to ensure that all information will remain confidential please do not include your name anywhere in the questionnaire. I also sincerely request you to respond to the questions as honestly as possible and return the completed questionnaires.

In case of any question or dilemma please contact me via **—kidistdagnachew55@gmail.com**

Thank you for your cooperation!

Part I: General Information

1. Your age ……...
2. Level of education

Diploma	☐	Postgraduates	☐
Degree	☐	Other, please specify	☐

3. Year of work experience…….
4. Your current work position

Manager	☐		
Supervisor	☐		
Expert	☐		
Specialist	☐		
Administrator	☐	Other, please specify……	

5. For how many years have you worked on issues related with project procurement? .....

Part II: This section is to find out your opinion about the project procurement practice at Ethio Telecom. Please circle your answer for multiple choice questions and indicate your opinion by putting (√) on the appropriate number for the five point scale questions where: Strongly Disagree=1, Disagree=2, Uncertain=3, Agree=4, and Strongly Agree=5

1. Did you take any training related to project management provided by your company?
   A) Yes B) No
2. Did you take any training related to project procurement management provided by your company?
   A) Yes B) No

Procurement Planning

No.	Question	1	2	3	4	5
1	Make-or-buy analysis is made before deciding to buy from outside vendors.					
2	Expert judgment is used for planning.					
3	Market research is conducted.					
4	There is consideration of past procurement documents for making future decision.					
5	Activity resource and cost estimation is considered while planning.					
6	Associated risks and mitigation plan is identified while planning procurement.					
7	Overall procurement need of the project is identified at the end of planning.					
8	There is a separate procedure to be followed for managing project procurement.					

Addis Ababa University College of Business and Economics
School of Commerce Masters of Art in Project Management

Dear Respondents:

My name is Kidist Dagnachew, I am a graduating class student of Masters Program in Project Management at Addis Ababa University School of Commerce. As part of the Masters program now I am conducting a project work entitled **Assessment of Project Procurement Management Practice in Ethio Telecom.**

I kindly request you to participate in this research study by completing the attached questionnaire. In order to ensure that all information will remain confidential please do not include your name anywhere in the questionnaire. I also sincerely request you to respond to the questions as honestly as possible and return the completed questionnaires.

In case of any question or dilemma please contact me via **—kidistdagnachew55@gmail.com**

Thank you for your cooperation!

Part I: General Information

6. Your age ……...
7. Level of education

Diploma ☐ Postgraduates ☐

Degree ☐ Other, please specify ☐

8. Year of work experience…….
9. Your current work position

Manager ☐

Supervisor ☐

Expert ☐

Specialist ☐

Administrator ☐ Other, please specify……

10. For how many years have you worked on issues related with project procurement? .....

Part II: This section is to find out your opinion about the project procurement practice at Ethio Telecom. Please circle your answer for multiple choice questions and indicate your opinion by putting (√) on the appropriate number for the five point scale questions where: Strongly Disagree=1, Disagree=2, Uncertain=3, Agree=4, and Strongly Agree=5

3. Did you take any training related to project management provided by your company?

B) Yes B) No

4. Did you take any training related to project procurement management provided by your company?

B) Yes B) No

Solicitation Planning

No.	Question	1	2	3	4	5
1	Standardize procurement document is used to obtain bid/proposal from Suppliers.					

2	The prepared document (RFP&RFI) helps to get accurate, relevant and complete information from suppliers.					

Solicitation

No.	Question	1	2	3	4	5
3	Procurement documents such as RFP/RFI/IFB are announced for targeted vendors using appropriate way of communication.					
4	Pre-proposal visits is arranged.					
5	The company use bidders' conference/pre-bid meeting to give answer for the asked questions and doubts to all prospective suppliers.					
6	The company respond for questions and doubts raised by prospective sellers individually.					

Source Selection

No.	Question	1	2	3	4	5
7	There is standardize pre-defined proposal evaluation criteria.					
8	Preliminary screening is used before making detail evaluation of proposal.					
9	Cost and estimated delivery date are the main factors used for evaluating project procurement proposal.					
10	The following points are considered for selecting suppliers proposal;					

	✓ Financial stability					
	✓ Technical requirement					
	✓ Risk management issue					
	✓ Past experience					
11	The terms and conditions of the contract are open to consider future requirement change (the contract is open for amendment).					

Contract Administration

No.	Question	1	2	3	4	5
12	The company monitor and control that suppliers' performance meets project procurement requirements according to terms of the contract.					
13	Suppliers' performance status is gathered from stakeholders such as project managers and project team members.					
14	The company follow formal procedure to accept/reject project requirement change.					

Contract Closeout

No.	Question	1	2	3	4	5
15	Contract closeout activities are clearly identified.					
16	There is lesson learned documentation.					

INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR PROJECT MANGERS

Dear Interviewee,

First of all I would like to thank you for your willingness to respond to my questions. My name is Kidist Dagnachew, I am a Masters of Art student in Project Management at Addis Ababa University School of Commerce. As part of my MA project work, I am studying **Assessment of Project Procurement Management Practice in Ethio Telecom**. This interview is made so as to have more in depth on the matter under study.

Thus, I kindly request you to answer all the questions assuring you that all responses will be used only as an input for this study.

1. Did you believe that the project procurement planning is made with the integration of appropriate stakeholders?
2. Did you believe the project procurement process consider the three pillars of project: cost, schedule and quality?
3. Would you list if you face any procurement related problems which have an effect on the performance of the project?
4. Does the project procurement department request you about the current performance status of vendors?
5. On project status meeting, does the issue of project procurement raised?
6. Does justifiable project requirement change welcomed?

INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR CONTRACT MANAGEMENT PROGRAM MANAGERS

Dear Interviewee,

First of all I would like to thank you for your willingness to respond to my questions. My name is Kidist Dagnachew, I am a Masters of Art student in Project Management at Addis Ababa University School of Commerce. As part of my MA project work, I am studying **Assessment of Project Procurement Management Practice in Ethio Telecom**. This interview is made so as to have more in depth on the matter under study.

Thus, I kindly request you to answer all the questions assuring you that all responses will be used only as an input for this study.

1. Is there separate documented procedure for project procurement?
2. Is there a systematic process to identify project procurement requirement?
3. What are the major outputs of procurement plan?
4. How did the company announce procurement document such as RFI/RFP/IFB to the perspective vendors?
5. What are the situations that led to no/single and/or multiple contract awards?
6. What are the major factors used to evaluate vendors' proposal for project procurement?
7. What kind of mechanism used to monitor and control the performance of vendors?
8. Is there a documented and well understood project procurement change management plan clearly defining what go through the change management process, who brings the change request forward, how change requests are documented, who is involved in decision making and who approves changes?
9. When is to say the contract is close out?
10. Is there referencing system for past procurement files?
11. Is there any related training provided for staff members participated in project procurement?