A Study of the Civil Service Reform in Adama City Administration: Regional State of Oromia- Ethiopia

In Partial Fulfillment of Requirement for the Masters Degree in Public Administration and Development Management

By

Yosef Taye

Advisor: Dr. Tegegne Teka

March 2011
Addis Ababa
A Study of the Civil Service Reform in Adama City Administration: Regional State of Oromia- Ethiopia

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of Requirement for the Masters Degree in Public Administration and Development Management

By

Yosef Taye

March 2011
Addis Ababa
A Study of the Civil Service Reform in Adama City Administration: Regional State of Oromia- Ethiopia

Prepared by: Yosef Taye

Approved by Board of Examiners

Tegegne Teka (Ph D)    ____________    ________
Advisor                Signature     Date

Professor Chakradhar Dash, (PhD)   ____________    ________
Examiner                Signature     Date
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

From the formative stages of this thesis to the final draft, I owe an immense debt of gratitude to my advisor, Dr. Tegegne Teka, for his sound advice and careful guidance. They were all invaluable. It was a great opportunity to have him as my advisor.

I would also like to thank all staff in Adama City administration, the city dwellers, businessmen, hotel owners and Keble officials who agreed and gave me access to valuable documents, information, opinions and interview on Adama City Administration. Special thanks go to Ato Tola Beriso the Mayor of Adama City and Ato Tsegaye Abera public relation officer for giving me permission for data collection; without their cooperation, this thesis would not have been undertaken. And also I would like to thank the owners of primary and secondary data.

For financial assistance, special thanks go to Addis Ababa University College of Management, Information and Economic Science and Department of Public Administration and Management.

Finally, I am grateful to my parents and family members who offered me unconditional love and interest in the years of my educational training.

TABLE OF CONTENTS
Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 Background of the Study ................................................................. 1
1.2 Statement of the Problem .............................................................. 6
1.3 Objectives of the Study ................................................................. 8
   1.3.1. General Objectives .............................................................. 8
   1.3.2 Specific Objectives .............................................................. 8
1.4 Significance of the Study ............................................................... 9
1.5 The scope of the Study ................................................................. 10
1.6 Methodology .................................................................................. 10
   1.6.1 Research Methods .............................................................. 10
   1.6.2 Population and Sampling Design ....................................... 10
   1.6.3 Techniques of Data Collection .......................................... 12
   1.6.4 Method of Data Analysis ................................................. 12
1.7 Limitation of the Study ................................................................. 12
1.8 Description of Adama ................................................................. 12
1.9 Organization of the Thesis .......................................................... 13

Chapter Two: Literature Review

2.1 Introduction .................................................................................. 14
2.2. Concept of Reform ..................................................................... 14
   2.2.1 Guiding Principle of Public Sector Reform ....................... 16
   2.2.2 Meaning and Motive of Civil Service Reform .................. 20
      2.2.2.1 Objectives of the Civil Service Reform .................... 20
2.3 A Historical Perspective of Civil Service Reform Program and its
Impact on Service Delivery ................................................................. 22
  2.3.1 First Wave: Structurally-Oriented Public Service Reforms........... 23
  2.3.2 Second Wave: Focus on Capacity Building.................................. 23
  2.3.3 Third Wave: Focus on Service Delivery Improvements .......... 24
2.4 Civil Service Reform Program in Ethiopia ........................................... 25
  2.4.1 Current Civil Service Reform Program in Ethiopia .................. 25
2.5. Service Delivery Policy in the Civil Service Reform Program in
Ethiopia ..................................................................................................... 27
  2.5.1 Problems of the Ethiopian Civil Service in the Delivery of
Services .................................................................................................... 29
  2.5.2 The Need for Policy ................................................................. 30
  2.5.3 Scope of the Policy ................................................................. 31
  2.5.4 Objectives of the Policy ............................................................. 31
2.6 Challenges of Civil Service Reform in Ethiopia ............................. 31
2.7 Business Process Reengineering Practices, Challenges and Experiences in
Ethiopia ..................................................................................................... 33
2.8 The Implication of Re-engineered Processes on the Organizational
System ..................................................................................................... 35
2.9 The Challenges of Civil Service Reforms in Developing Countries .... 37
2.10 The Reason why Civil Service reform Failed in Developing Countries.... 38
2.11. How can Civil Service Reform be Designed and Implemented ........ 39

Chapter Three: Presentation and Analysis of Data
3.1 Introduction .......................................................................................... 41
3.2 Profile of Respondents ........................................................................ 41
  3.2.1 Profile of the Employees .......................................................... 41
  3.2.2 Profile of the Clients of the City .................................................. 43
3.3 Enabling Environments for Civil Service Reform ............................................. 44
3.4 Challenges of Implementation in Civil Service Reform .............................. 47
  3.4.1 Institutional Challenges ........................................................................... 47
  3.4.2 The Views of Clients about Employees .................................................. 51
  3.4.3 Challenges of Adama City Administration in Civil Service Reform ......... 54
3.5 Achievements of the Civil Service Reform Program ...................................... 56
  3.5.1 The Views of Clients on the Service Provided .......................................... 58
  3.5.2 The Availability of Clearly Stated Formalities and Procedures .................. 58
  3.5.3 The Benefits for the Residents of Adama City .......................................... 59
  3.5.4 Achievements Gained by Adama City Administration .............................. 61
3.6 The Attitude of Employees on the Civil Service Reform Program ............... 62

Chapter Four: Conclusions and Recommendations

  4.1 Conclusions .................................................................................................. 63
  4.2 Recommendations ....................................................................................... 65
References .............................................................................................................. 68
Appendix: I ........................................................................................................... viii
Appendix :II........................................................................................................... xvi
Appendix: III ........................................................................................................ xvii
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURE

Table: 1 Employees by sex, job, age, educational level, marital status and service of years--------------------------------------------------------------- 42
Table: 2 Clients by sex, marital status, age group and educational level ----------------------- 43
Table: 3 Respondents rate on the appropriateness of the enabling environment for implementation of the service delivery reform.---------------------------------------- 44
Table 4: Respondents rating on challenges related to lack of institutional capacity to address the following challenges.  -------------------------- 47
Table: 5 Views of clients about employee competency and work habits. --------------------- 51
Table: 6 Respondents rating on fairness of treatment --------------------------------------------------------------- 52
Table: 7 Employees’ views on the exchange communication with the management on service delivery---------------------------------------------------------------54
Table: 8 Views of civil servants on the achievement of the service delivery reform ---- 56
Table: 9 Views of clients on the achievement of the service delivery reform----------------- 58
Table: 10 Views of clients on clearly stated formalities and procedures ------------- 58
Table: 11 Employees perception of the reforms in Adama city administration. --------- 62

Figure: 1 Revenue collected by Adama city administration before and after civil service reform Program --------------------------------------------------------------- 57
ACRONYMS

AAU: Addis Ababa University
BPR: Business Process Reengineering
CSR: Civil Service Reform
CSRP: Civil Service Reform Program
EPRDF: Ethiopian People’s Revolutionary Democratic Front
MCB: Ministry of Capacity Building
NCBP: National Capacity Building Program
NPM: New Public Management
PSCAP: Public Service Delivery Capacity Building Program
SAP: Structural Adjustment Program
SSA: Sub-Saharan African
ABSTRACT

This study attempts to explain the civil service reform in the delivery of public services which is implemented in Adama city administration. It aims at assessing whether the reform achieved the intended objectives about efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of services, to render better quality services and be accountable for its failure, to produce committed citizens, and to bring attitudinal change towards public service delivery. To this end, the study starts by explaining the overall move for reform globally and then narrows its scope. It also deals with assessing the factors that led to the achievement or failure of the process in Adama city administration.

The study presents data collected from the field using a qualitative and quantitative approach. The instruments used to gather the data are questionnaires, interviews, observation and documents. However, the data collected draws a complex picture. It indicates that some reform measures are successful while others unsuccessful. For instance, the number of clients served has increased to some extent, time of queuing for services is reduced or services rendered per hour has increased and decentralized delivery of services at Kebele level. On the other hand, capacity building and behavioral change towards serving clients in fair manner are not observed.

The study reveals factors that impeded the achievement of the reform process like limited resources, poor communication of the reform objective, small amount of remuneration, and lack of local ownership of reform. As a general assessment, the reform has achieved its objectives to some extent in the delivery of services and the study concludes with suggestions of what the future reformers should strive to do for successful reforms.
CHAPTER ONE

Introduction

This chapter is concerned with the study problem and its approach. It includes background of the study, statement of the problem, objectives of the study, significance of the study, scope of the study, research methods, and description of the study area as well as organization of the study.

1.1 Background of the Study

Ethiopia had existed as a nation state for long period of time, but the history of modern administration institutions is recent. A semblance of modern administrative institutions appeared for the first time in October 1907 when Emperor Menelik established nine ministries (Beyene as cited in Adamolekun, 2002:228). However, Haile Selassie I regime (1923–1974) is generally credited with initiating modern administrative and local government reforms in Ethiopia. The Imperial regime issued in 1932 a decree that recognized Addis Ababa as a municipality with defined functions (e.g. road and public security) and introduced a system of municipal taxation on land. This was a major initiative in municipal governance in Ethiopia (Sisay, 1996).

However, for a long period of time Municipal management and governance was a neglected issue. Given a long tradition of centralized administrative experience, this did not helped municipalities to be independent and responsible for many functions and responsibilities at the local level. In this regard, inadequate capacity in terms of trained personnel, financial resources, and obsolete systems handicapped municipalities from delivering services and infrastructure to urban residents (Sisay, 1996).

Urban centers are charged with the responsibility for providing services such as health, education, revenue collection, water and sanitation, and fire protection services among others within their areas of jurisdiction. But the existing facilities in most urban centers were planned to cater for a much smaller number of people and the system of giving services to urban residents is not effective and accountable and the apparatus for public
service delivery is not built on the ethos and values of integrity, impartiality and neutrality.

Furthermore, the expansion of commerce and industrial development has added to the existing high population growth in the towns without any commensurate rise in the quality and quantity of public infrastructure and urban services and facilities. Factors that affect service delivery include insufficient resources (both collection and allocation), mismanagement, weak technical and institutional capacity to increase service coverage, and lack of planning and foresight.

As a result of rapid urbanization in developing countries, pressure on urban services and facilities has become a serious problem in many urban centers, and job opportunities offered by cities are too few for the large numbers of new urban dwellers. Among the reasons accounting for the failure of many municipalities of developing countries to cope with the demands of their increasing populations are: firstly, the limitations of their political frameworks for city development; secondly, the inadequacies of their financing systems; and, thirdly, the inefficiencies of their management systems.

In this respect, it seems very difficult to continue without any improvement to cope with the need to provide services to urban residents in effective system and the apparatus for public service delivery based on the ethos and values of integrity, impartiality and neutrality. Therefore, there should be a need to reform the civil service by giving the due emphasis on public service delivery. According to Beyene (as cited in Adamolekun, 2002:235) the need for an efficient civil service to implement the various economic and decentralization drives led the governments to launch its reform program.

*The modern state is changing and reforming to find innovative, efficient and effective ways to deliver quality services in order to compete in the global market. This has resulted in a number of reforms and new models of management. Therefore, governments over the past periods have implemented reforms to improve performance in response to internal and external pressures. The demands for efficient and effective delivery of quality services within a global economy require fundamental changes, which cannot be rapidly achieved because the demands involve institutional and cultural changes. Institutional transformation involves*
far-reaching changes in the manner in which government functions and makes decisions, and often requires an overhaul of long established systems. It requires the formulation of good policies and capable public institutions to implement the policies in order for countries to develop (The world bank, 1997:13).

Civil Service Reforms were used as a tool for creating a skilled and efficient government workforce. Efficient and motivated civil service was important for governance, production and distribution of public goods and services, formulation and implementation of economic policy, and management of public expenditure. Hence, “The broader aim of civil service reform was therefore, the creation of a government workforce with the skills, incentives, ethos, and accountability needed to provide quality public services and carry out functions assigned to the state” (Schiavo, 1996: 1).

Many countries began to borrow civil service reforms introduced by Britain and USA, either voluntarily or as in the case of developing countries a condition of donors for financial assistance. According to Kamarck (2007) civil service reform of the public service internationally have a number of common principles. The theoretical framework of this research takes into account the following guiding principles of civil service reform which are very much relevant to my study. As Kamarck (2007) wrote the main characteristics of the New Public Management (NPM) are:

I. Government works well if it is organized around baskets of “services and results” but not around the hierarchies of “agencies and programs.”

II. Government services should be organized and sensitive to their customers.

III. Results-orientation results in better management than the stewardship orientation reflected in traditional public administration.

IV. Accountability is largely driven via transparency and choice instead of hierarchy and inspection

V. It attempts to break down operational procedures in order to better focus on outcomes.

VI. Pursue a customize response vs. one-size-fits-all; to do this requires pushing as much authority as practicable to the front line delivery agent, or reducing the distance between the “center” and the “edge” as much as possible.

VII. Use incentives in place of disincentives where possible (“trust but verify”)
VIII. Place a greater reliance on risk management than on risk avoidance.

IX. Emphasize being performance-based rather than process-compliance focused in accountability and oversight.

X. Separate policy and regulatory development from program implementation functions in order to increase the programmatic executive-level emphasis on implementation.

The problem of widespread poverty in Sub-Saharan African (SSA) countries is not related to unavailability of resources but due in large part to the problem of good governance. In Africa, administration is characterized by expansion, patronage and authoritarian rule (Miller, 2005, pp: 68). To alleviate good governance problems, most developing countries have commenced political and economic reforms since 1980s that aim at promoting economic growth, reduce poverty and encourage popular participation in development (Mugerwa, 2003). These recent public administration reforms in sub-Saharan African countries are inspired by or have parallel in the public administration reform experience of other countries (Adamolekun, 2002: 159).

In line with the above paragraph, the Ethiopian government has commenced different public administration reforms, Structural Adjustment Programs (SAPs) in 1992/93 by giving due attention to economic stabilization and structural reform measures, particularly in the civil service, finance sector and public enterprises areas which aimed at improving market related incentives, removing cost price distortions, promoting private enterprises and exports, through time liberalizing the economy and reducing the role of the public sector. While this reform was in process the Prime Minister’s office set up a civil service reform task force to examine the overall management arrangement and operation of the civil service at all levels of public institutions in 1994(policy framework paper of Ethiopia, 1998). Moreover, in 2001, extensive government reorganization was undertaken along with the launching of a National Capacity building program which gave new impetus to the civil service reform program (http://www.hull.ac.uk, 2006).

Ethiopian constitutional framework gives the federal and regional governments parallel power to enact laws concerning administration of civil employees and their conditions of
service. However, Article 52.2 of the 1995 Ethiopian Constitution requires regional
governments “to ensure that educational, training and experience requirement of any job,
title or position approximate national standards.” According to Paulos (2009) both levels
of governments have civil service commissions of their own, which are independently
mandated to implement civil service laws, policies, regulation, and directives; supervise
and control hiring (recruitment, selection and placement), transfer (lateral and vertical),
salary administration, performance appraisal, training, discipline and separation of civil
servants, and evaluate organizations and staffing of government office.

According to Beyene (as cited in Adamolekun, 2002:235) the need for an efficient civil
service to implement the various economic and decentralization drives led the Ethiopian
government to launch its reform program. And the reform program was carried out in to
different phases. The first phase of the civil service reform concentrated on structuring
line institutions, releasing excess manpower for redeployment elsewhere in the civil
service or regions, or retrenching those who could not be absorbed. Overall, about 30,000
civil servants were retrenched, some through natural attrition and a significant number
were laid off as redundant employees, the latter were paid severance packages and some
safety nets were also provided.

The second phase of civil service reform started with the establishment of the task force
for civil service reform in November, 1994. The six main areas of work of the task force
were: Organization of top management; management of information systems; financial
management and structuring; human resource management; central arrangement for
organizing and managing the civil service; and quality of public service delivery
(Beyene, 2002).

In 2001, the government unveiled the comprehensive national capacity building program
(NCBP). The capacity building strategy fits well to the country’s development strategy.
In general, and for poverty reductions in particular, capacity building program comprises
the development of human resources, building and the strengthening of institutions, and
establishment of effective working practices in a coordinated approach. The NCBP is
currently implementing a consolidated and organized reform with the flagship Public
Service Delivery Capacity Building Program (PSCAP), which seeks to enable Ethiopia’s federal, regional and local institutions to deliver public services efficiently and effectively, empower citizens through public participations, and foster a government environment conductive to value creations. To this end, the government has initiated comprehensive civil service reform program primarily aimed at improving service delivery in the civil service. In general the important area of focus has been the civil service reform activities aimed at improving the efficiency and competence of officials and workers in the public sector so that they focus their efforts on the new development policy framework based on the market economy model. This was accompanied by launching the major capacity building program involving governmental and support institutions, with a special emphasis on strengthening the self-reliance of poor local communities.

The civil service is the heart of the Ethiopian Government state machinery. Therefore, improving the performance of the civil service system emerged as a major issue in all government institutions. Therefore, the aim of this study is to examine the implementations and challenges of civil service reform programs in the delivery of service within the regional state of Oromia in Adama City Administration. The study also questions whether the civil service reform program actually led to improvement in services?

1.2 Statement of the Problem

The gap between aspiration and reality suggest a requirement for government to reform its public institutions. Public sector reform program, of course does not bring automatically improvement in the delivery of services. Even through, there is comprehensive implementation of the civil service reform programs is commendable, but it is still questioned? Have these reforms actually led to improvements in the delivery of services?
For many years problems have been observed in Ethiopian public institutions in delivering services to the public. The major problems in the civil service were: lack of structural set up that was amenable to plan the execution as well as for its effective monitoring and control; absence of clearly defined management systems and procedures of effective and efficient utilization of human resources; and lack of managerial know-how and low service delivery systems.

There are several reasons why the efficiency of service delivery became low generally in civil service institutions of Ethiopia and Adama city administration in particular.

The major challenges that face the civil service: unskilled workers, inefficiency of the work force, unaccountability and an eroded ethical behavior of the civil servant, long and time consuming organizational structures, shortage of resources, lack of capacity to give sufficient attention to service delivery improvement, inconsistency of regulations and guidelines governing public institutions, Civil servants were demoralized by their income which was very low in comparison to those in the private sector, lack of initiative and commitment among the civil servant and practice of neglecting the customers’ needs, the existence of unfavorable conditions of work, misuse of human resource management system as well as consistent government policies are some (Etefa, 2006:4).

Furthermore, successful implementations of the civil service reform with regard to service delivery to achieve the desired result face the following challenges. These are lack of cooperation from staff since the reform is viewed as reducing the work force, cutting jobs and income, insufficient staff training and development, lack of enthusiasms and interests, lack of funding leads, lack of top management support in trying to implement solutions generated by BPR initiatives, selection and training of employees in civil service reform in delivery services process is time consuming, and not so well-defined internal control is under the new process re-engineering.

City administration lacks sustainable efforts to change public sector values to instill in public servant the value of quality services, commitment to their job and serving the public. For problem solving and reducing wastage, to enhance transparency and accountability in the civil service, to build ethically sound and free of corruptions, nepotism and favoritism and finally to view citizens as customers of a public service.
However, the implementation process is not simple. It would be a challenge for the leader. It requires behavioral, attitudinal and capacity change from both director and employee. In light of these, this research investigates the implementation and challenges the city faces during the rendering of services.

The government has introduced civil service reform in general but prioritized the improvement of service delivery as the most important. To this effect the public service delivery improvement policy has been designed with its directions and strategies in 2001/02 full fledge service delivery reform. In line with this, The Ministry of Capacity Building in 2002 launched the Public Sector Capacity Building Support Program as part of the Civil Service Reform by having the following objectives to:

i. Improve the scale, efficiency and responsiveness of public service delivery at the Federal, regional and local levels;

ii. Empower citizens to participate more effectively in shaping their own development;

iii. Promote good governance and accountability (MCB, 2002).

1.3 Objectives of the Study are listed below:

1.3.1 General Objectives are:

I. To provide information about city management in Adama, its employees and operational guidelines that would show the gains of the civil service reform program in the delivery of services.

II. To investigate possible challenges and problems in the introduction and implementation of civil service reform program in a city administration.

1.3.2 Specific Objectives are:

I. To find out the extent to which the objectives of civil service reform programs have been translated into reality in Adama city Administration?

II. To investigate the major problems created in the implementation of civil service reform programs.
III. To find out the measures taken by the city administration to consolidate the change process in continuous manner?

IV. To know how the managers carry out activities in continuous manner in coaching and progress review properly in the city?

V. To evaluate the understanding and commitment of employees and managers towards the reform objectives.

VI. To identify the contribution of reform program for effective and efficient delivery of public services.

VII. To identify the factors that deteriorate employees motivation?

VIII. To enhance the public sector ability and good civil service reform program and to identify causes and negative impacts in executing or implementing toward productivity and creativity.

IX. To make some recommendations on the civil service reforms in the Adama City Administration more effective.

1.4 Significance of the Study

Apart from being an obligatory requirement as partial fulfillment for the award of master’s degree to the researcher, the study tries to show the benefit that the country can drive through establishing sustainable economic and social development through a reformed civil service that is characterized by a strong administrative capacity which is capable to perform core government functions while improving the quality of services delivered to citizens. The impacts of the research could be the following:

I. The study would try to find out the relationship between the implementation of the civil services reform program in delivery of service and the problems associated to it.

II. The study could help Adama city administration to improve the delivery of services by alleviating problems that affect the civil service reform programs
III. It is useful for all to identify problems in the civil service in order to deliver services more efficiently, effectively, in responsive and accountable manner.

IV. The study can be used as further reference for other researchers who intend to conduct further studies in the area.

1.5 The Scope of the Study

The study mainly focuses on the implementation and challenges in civil service reform program in the delivery of service at Adama City Administration.

1.6 Methodology

1.6.1 Research Methods

The study investigates the implementation and challenges faced in the civil service reform programs with regard to delivery of services within Adama city administration. In this study, descriptive survey method is employed in order to assess the opinions of employees, clients and management officials to describe the practices of the implementation of civil service reform programs in the delivery of service. Because, descriptive research method is the best method to explain the phenomena as it is and also helps to answer “what is” questions.

The researcher employs both qualitative and quantitative research methods. The researcher consults different literature to review on the general state of civil service reform in the delivery of services and its specific situation in Ethiopia. The researcher also considers both primary as well as secondary sources to generate data to describe and analyze the implementation process of civil service reform in service delivery. In the study, the instrument used to collect necessary information is questionnaires and interviews based on semi-structured questionnaires, observation, etc.

1.6.2 Population and Sampling Design

The research work requires specific, manageable, attainable, relevant and timely information from its respondents. According to Gay (1981) the appropriate number of subjects to be creditable for a study depends upon the type of the research work involved.
For instance, for descriptive survey research method, a sample a 10% of the population is considered to be a minimum for a larger population and for smaller population 20% may be required.

In order to gather a more holistic perspective about the implementation and challenges of civil service reform in the delivery of services to the residents of Adama city, the data was collected systematically from specific departments that are crucial to evaluate the service delivery. Based on this, the researcher selected the Department of Revenue, Land Administration and Allocation section and different Kebeles (that are mentioned below) for research purpose.

In conducting interviews, the researcher used purposive sampling in selecting the interviewees. The researcher conducted interviews with 3 BPR committee members in Revenue and Tax Department, with one official of the Capacity Building Bureau of the city and three interviewees from each of the clusters in the selected Kebeles. Based on the interview that was made with the heads of departments, the city administration provides service on average from 200-250 residents per day. To administer questionnaires on those residents who get service from the city administration, 20 % of the 250 or 50 respondents were selected randomly. There are 150 employees in the city administration that provide service to urban residents. Out of these, 20 % of the 150 or 30 respondents were selected randomly for questionnaire administration.

To assess the benefits the residents of Adama city gained in the delivery of service at the grassroots level after the implementation of civil service reform, the following Kebeles were selected to collect more relevant data. The Kebeles in the city administration can be grouped into three clusters. Three Kebele administrations out of 18 were selected by simple random lottery methods from the three clusters. The first Kebele represents trade and commerce area (Kebele 12), second Kebele represents the residents in the city (Kebele 11), and third Kebele represents the newly settled residents which has a lot of land ownership problems (Kebele 03).

i. Kebeles in cluster one: Kebele 06; 07; 08; 09 and 12
ii. Kebeles in cluster two: Kebele 03; 04; 10; 11; 15;16; 17; and 18
iii. Kebeles in cluster three: Kebele 01; 02; 03 and 05.

1.6.3 Techniques of Data Collection

Once the research population was determined the next step was collecting data by utilizing different data collection techniques. The following instruments were used to gather information about civil service reform and its effect on service delivery as follows:

i. Observation:- to critically evaluate the current civil service delivery in the Adama city administration

ii. Questionnaire:- distributed to employees and clients,

iii. Interview:- based on semi-structured questionnaire employed to gather the opinion of top, middle and supervisory level of management;

iv. Reports and documents: - the reforms were reviewed and in-depth discussions were conducted with civil service program coordinating office of Adama city administration.

1.6.4 Method of Data Analysis

The collected data were analyzed by using tables, figure, percentages frequencies and qualitative method employed.

1.7 Limitations of the Study

The researcher faced the following problems such as; lack of research experience, financial constraints, shortage of relevant documents and a lack of cooperation from some of the respondents.

1.8 Description of Adama

Adama is located 100 km to the south east of Addis Ababa. It was founded in 1915 as an urban settlement while building the railway from Addis Ababa to Djibouti. The historical name of Adama was derived from a wild plant of the surrounding areas called cactus tree. During the regime of King Hailesilasse, in the year 1916 its original name was changed to Nazareth. However, as its proclaimed by Oromia Regional State in the year 1992, its name has been changed to its original name, Adama.
Adama is situated 1600-1700 meters above sea level and in a Latitude from $8^\circ$-33.8N to $8^\circ$-36N and a Longitude from 39$^\circ$ 11” 57E to 39021’15E in the Rift valley of warm climate. Its average annual weather conditions are 21 degree centigrade with small amount of rain from June to September. In general, the town has sunny and windy weather conditions.

In 1936, the municipality of Adama was accredited only for a total area of 120 hectares. The town has shown sustainable and fast progress and at present its total area covers 32.4km$^2$. It has now decentralized its authority to 18 Kebeles of the town to facilitate the basic activities so as to bring about effective changes in offering good governance and relevant public service at all levels.

Based on figures from the 2007 Population and Housing Census results of Central Statistical Agency, this city has an estimated total population of 222,035 of whom 109,659 were males and were 112,376 females. In 1994 National Census report, this town had a total population of 127,842 of whom 61,965 were males and 65,877 were females. This shows the population of the city has grown by 74 percent.

Adama is the modern city that has road crossing to the sea port and has a rail way line. All these natural and manmade attributes make Adama and its surroundings a base for investment in several sectors, such as hotels, recreations centres, small and heavy industries and etc. That is why Adama is considered as one of the leading cities of the country.

1.9 Organization of the Thesis

The study is organized in the following way; the first chapter deals with the background, the statement of the problem, objectives of the study, significance and scope of the study and methodologies. The second chapter deals with Literature review. The third chapter deals with presentation and analysis of data. Finally, in the fourth chapter conclusions and recommendations are presented. The thesis has a bibliography, a few appendixes and other formal documents.
CHAPTER TWO

Literature Review

2.1 Introduction
This chapter gives an account of civil service reform trends globally by reviewing different literatures on civil service reform program by various authors. It starts by presenting an account of civil service reform trends globally. It describes various efforts made by countries in reforming their civil service and the factors that stimulated the need for such action. It describes challenges encountered in the implementation of reforms in various countries as pointed out by various authors.

2.2 Concept of Reform
In recent times, there has been accelerated change globally brought about by technological advances, greater decentralization and good governance. These dynamic changes emanated from technological innovation, public pressure to redefine the role of the state, or the development of supranational institutions rapid global economic advances. The ramifications of these changes are being felt by government in the form of increasing expectations for better governance through effective service delivery, transparency, accountability and rule of law.

The World Bank also recently concluded that public sector reform has “great potential to reduce poverty” (World Bank, 2000, p. 100.) and that “good ... government institutions [are] associated with higher income growth, national wealth, and social achievements” (Thomas, 2000, p. 136). The public sector reform programs have a great deal for development, and in at least two ways:

I. It will lead to better delivery of the basic public services that affect living standards of the poor, and
II. It will create a climate conducive to private sector development.

Because of this, various countries commenced to reform their public service with the evolving and changing role of the state. Whether it is the onset or end of war, the collapse of communism, the demands of the populace, the development and crisis of the welfare
state, economic imperatives, decentralization or the introduction of technology, states face the challenge of adapting to these dynamic factors (Miller, 2005).

Civil Service is the operational arm of the government charged with the implementation and administration of public policy (Atkilt 1996: 55), must keep pace with the changing times in order to meet the aspirations of the people. The purpose of „reform” is to reorient the Civil Services into a dynamic, efficient and accountable apparatus for public service delivery built on the ethos and values of integrity, impartiality and neutrality. Thus, the impetus of Civil Service reform is to raise the quality of public services delivered to the citizens and enhance the capacity to carry out core government functions, thereby, leading to sustainable development.

Hence, the government of Ethiopia through its Public Service Reform Programme continues to improve and modernize its systems to support the development of the country and provide timely and high quality services to all customers. The latest development in this process is the introduction of the civil service reform.

To this effect, Ethiopian Government has taken the initiative to build the capacity in all the regional states of the country. Based on this initiative, the Adama city Administration adopted reform programs to promote transparency, accountability & good governance. Capacity Building Bureau is the responsible organ for supervising, coordinating and guiding the implementation of capacity building initiatives of the City Administration. The Capacity Building Bureau gives due emphasis to the following activities.

I. Create, build and strengthen capacity implementation programs in collaboration with the City Administration organs of the Municipality, public associations and private investors.

II. Design efficient urban management guideline for the City Government and organs of the municipality.

III. Improve service delivery by adopting appropriate strategies.

IV. Coordinate the execution of civil service improvement program and offer necessary technical and professional support.

V. Improve & strengthen the Civil Service Program in a consistent manner.
VI. Strengthen decentralized administration at Kebele, and central levels to offer effective and efficient services to the public.

VII. Establish close relations with Regions and Executive Offices of the City Administration to implement Capacity Building Programs.

VIII. Strengthen the human resource and the organizational structure of the Bureau and other offices coordinated and guided by the Bureau.

IX. Provide professional support to executive offices under the City Administration on human resource and organizational structure upon request.

X. Create Monitoring and Evaluation systems at all levels

XI. Monitor, evaluate and provide feedback to execute the Civil Service Programs at all levels and check performance in relation to the expected outcome and impact.

2.2.1 Guiding Principles of Public Sector Reform

A system of adequately performing public bureaucracies is a basic requirement for developing countries to progress and prosper. In this analysis, I used the general (Western) theoretical frames of reference New Public Management (NPM) lines of thinking.

This part attempts to explore the essential characteristics of New Public Management and administrative reforms that need to be adopted to strengthen public administration. It begins with an overview of the Traditional Public Administration. And proceeds by defining NPM and giving an insight on the context within which it emerged. The paper goes on to explore essential characteristics of NPM. Thereafter, it recommends administrative reforms that need to be adopted to strengthen service delivery in City Administration.

Public administration refers the aggregate machinery (policies, rules, procedures, systems, organizational structures, personnel, etc.) funded by the state budget and in charge of the management and direction of the affairs of the executive government, and its interaction with other stakeholders in the state, society and external environment. It also refers to the management and implementation of the whole set of government
activities dealing with the implementation of laws, regulations and decisions of the government and the management related to the provision of public services.

Public administration as both theory and practice began in the late nineteenth century. Nowadays, the principles that guide the administration in the public institutions divided into two traditional and modern of public administration. The underlying principles for the traditional model of public administration include the Max Weber’s theory of bureaucracy, Frederick Taylor’s theory of scientific management and Woodrow Wilson’s principle of separation of politics from administration. According to them the traditional model of public administration is characterized by administering under the formal control of political leadership, based on a strictly hierarchical model of bureaucracy, staffed by permanent, neutral and anonymous officials, motivated by the public interest, serving any government part equally, and not contributing to policy but merely administer those policies decided by the politicians, Fox and Miller (1995) cited in Common (1998).

“In the past two decades there has been an unprecedented wave of reform as the traditional model of public administration has come under attack” (Minongue, 2001: 20). The traditional model of public administration being replaced by the so called New Public Management, the traditional model of public administration remains the long-lasting and most successful theory of management in the public sector. It is only that in recent times, its theories and practices are now considered old-fashioned and no longer relevant to the needs of a rapidly changing society.

To this effect, according to Jreisat (2002) a new paradigm in management is assuming that the existing management system is deficient, ill-organized, poorly managed, very costly and generally ineffective for the government. From this, we can understand that New public management (NPM) seeks to enhance the efficiency of the public sector, a collection more flexible strategies in terms of service delivery and human resource management. The main assumption in the NPM-reforms is that more market orientation in the public sector will lead to greater cost-efficiency for governments, without having negative side effects on other objectives and considerations.
There are differing interpretations of what that common response consists of. But there is general agreement that key components include deregulation of line management; conversion of civil service departments into free-standing agencies or enterprises; performance-based accountability, particularly through contracts; and competitive mechanisms such as contracting-out and internal markets (Polidano, 2001:44).

New public management arose first in New Zealand in 1979 (and reform of governance continues there to this day), then, in quick order, Britain, Canada and the U.S.A., and it were aggressively marketed internationally throughout the 1990s. According to Sharma the emergence (NPM) is associated with the changed role of the state and the growing demands for good governance practices worldwide (Sharma, 2007:4).

According to Sharma New Public Management a reform stream from neoliberal ideology, which prioritize market over the state and establishes a goal to run government as a business. As he notes, NPM reforms shift the emphasis from traditional public administration to public management. The inadequacies of the traditional model of public administration are the determinants for the rise of the new public management. Such inadequacies became apparent in the period between 1970s and 1980. It is thus argued that by comparing outputs with inputs, hierarchical structures are not necessarily the most efficient of organizations. Bureaucracy may be ideal for control but is usually slow in moving; work standardization may entail the cost of innovation. The model of political control was inadequate, illogical and always problematic, in assuring genuine accountability.

Thus, new paradigm for civil service reforms in the more academic literature, they have been described as „New Public Management” or „Managing for Results” or „Reinventing Government.” As Kamarck (2007), the main characteristics of the NPM are:

I. Government works well if it is organized around baskets of “services and results” not the hierarchies of “agencies and programs.”

II. Government services should be organized and sensitive to their customers.
III. Results-orientation results in better management than the stewardship orientation reflected in traditional public administration.

IV. Accountability is largely driven via transparency and choice instead of hierarchy and inspection.

V. It attempts to break down operational procedures in order to better focus on outcomes.

VI. Pursue a customized response vs. one-size-fits-all; to do this requires pushing as much authority as practicable to the front line delivery agent, or reducing the distance between the “center” and the “edge” as much as possible.

VII. Use incentives in place of disincentives where possible (“trust but verify”)

VIII. Place a greater reliance on risk management than on risk avoidance.

IX. Emphasize being performance-based rather than process-compliance focused in accountability and oversight.

X. Separate policy and regulatory development from program implementation functions in order to increase the programmatic executive-level emphasis on implementation.

On the other hand, Kamensky(2005:19) the characteristics of the NPM as the types of public management reforms that includes the following:

I. An emphasis on management skills to complement policy skills,

II. A shift from bureaucratic reliance on rules and inputs to quantifiable output measures and performance targets,

III. The decentralization of management and development of new systems of reporting and monitoring,

IV. The separation of large hierarchical bureaucratic structures into more flat semi-autonomous divisions

V. The incorporations of private sector management practices such as strategic planning, mission statement and performance contracts, and

VI. A preference for efficiency and cost saving Kamensky( as cited in Miller,2005:19).
2.2.2 Meaning and Motive of Civil Service Reform

The classic definition of Civil service reform is given by Wikipedia

*Civil service reform is a deliberate action to improve the efficiency, effectiveness, professionalism, representatives and democratic character of a civil service, with a view to promoting better delivery of public goods and services, with increased accountability.*

en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Civil_service_reform

From this definition, it is clear that CSR include activities like data gathering and analysis, organizational restructuring, improving human resource management and training, enhancing pay and benefits while assuring sustainability under overall fiscal constraints, and strengthening measures for public participation, transparency, and combating corruption.

The major motives for the emergence CSR at the beginning 1990s were:

- The ineffectiveness of policies, rules and regulations on civil service
- Lack of experience on planning and implementation by the civil service
- Lack of structural set up for monitoring and control
- Unidentified management systems and procedures in utilization of manpower and other resources
- Lack of managerial know-how, absence of standard job classification and low service delivery systems (CSR report, 1994).

2.2.2.1 Objectives of the civil service reform program

The civil service as primary arm of government must keep pace with the changing times in order to meet the aspirations of the people (Atkilt 1996: 55). Based on this, the ultimate goal of government in developing countries is to reduce poverty and to enhance public institutions effectiveness. By having this, the purpose of CSR is to reorient the Civil Service into a dynamic, efficient and accountable apparatus for public service delivery built on the ethos and values of integrity, impartiality and neutrality. The reform is to raise the quality of public services delivered to the citizens and enhance the capacity
to carry out core government functions, thereby, leading to sustainable development (World Bank” 2002).

The overall objective of the CSRP was to restructure the civil service in such a way as to make it more productive, effective and efficient, and strengthen its capacity for the implementation of development programmes. CSRP was designed to contribute for improving the management of resources in the public sector. This is consistent with Civil Service Reform elsewhere in Africa, whose purpose is to improve the effectiveness and performance of the civil service and to ensure its affordability and sustainability over time. Hence, this is to raise the quality of public services delivered to the population and to enhance the capacity to carry out core government functions. This is essential to promote sustained economic and social development (Westcott, 1999: 146).

Generally the main objective of CSR is to put forward proposals to restructure the administration of the civil service so as to make it more reliable and prepare one to face the changes and increasingly demanding challenges in years ahead and meet the demands of the society.

Furthermore, the World Bank as cited in Etefa the major objectives of the CSR are primarily structural with an impact on service delivery and government effectiveness that have a close link with a macroeconomic stability (World Bank” 2002). The major objectives of CSR as the bank noted are presented with the figure below.
Typical objectives of CSR program

Correct fiscal imbalances
- Wage bill relative to GDP and as a proportion of government expenditures
- Sustainability of civil service pension system

Pay and career structures
- Wage levels and comparability with private sector
- Promotion and career structures
- Shortage of qualified labor in particular skill areas

Improving accountability and service delivery
- Reducing high-level corruption and partisan influence
- Creating incentives for senior staffs
- Reducing administrative corruption
- Service delivery improvement in key sectors, particularly health and education
- Improved capacity for regulation and revenue raising
- Empowering consumer groups through surveys and reform of administrative laws

Potential impact on macroeconomic stability

Structural issues with potential impact on service delivery


2.3 A Historical Perspective of Civil Service Reform Program Impact on Service Delivery

According to Kithinji Kiragu, in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) like other regions of the world, Public Service Reform (PSR) has evolved over time. In a general perspective, there have been three waves of PSR in the region. However, waves are not neatly defined and one notes that there is considerable overlap. Some countries still have a pronounced
element of the first and/or second wave while moving into the third wave in their reform programme. The first wave covered the decade of mid-80s to mid-90s. Its distinctive feature is its focus on restructuring the public service. This has been aptly described as the structural reform wave; the second wave was dominant in the late 1990s. Its predominant trait is capacity building; and the third wave started about 2000, with the particular objective to underline improved service delivery.


2.3.1 First Wave: Structurally-Oriented Public Service Reforms

The drive for this first wave of PSR in SSA, as was the case in other developing countries, emerged from the macroeconomic and fiscal reforms that were set in in structural adjustment programmes sponsored by the donors. Public service reform then sought to make Government affordable and lean through cost reduction and containment measures, especially by way of rationalizing the machinery of Government, divesting non-core operations, retrenching redundant staff, removing ghost workers from the payroll, freezing employment and adopting measures to control the wage bill and other personnel-based expenditures.


2.3.2 Second Wave: Focus on Capacity Building

Staff training was for many years a pronounced element of capacity building in the public service of most governments in the region. In the mid-1990s, there was a remarkable shift to a broader definition of what capacity building entailed which was accompanied by new initiatives in the context of public sector reform programs.

The conceptual groundwork for the initiatives to shift PSRPs” focus to cost-reduction and structural orientation was that weak capacity was the root problem in the poor delivery of public services. This conceptual frame apparently derived from the perceived success in improving and expanding public service delivery in developing countries in the decade
after independence through capacity building interventions. It was thereby assumed that it
would naturally lead to improved service delivery.

According to Kithinji Kiragu, the key interventions in this second wave of PSRPs included:

• **Enhancing staff skills.** This aspect of the reform perpetuated past practices but there
  was a heightened sense of the need to give more emphasis to on-the-job and short-term
  training and to manage technical assistance differently.

• **Improving management systems and structures.** The systems targeted for improvement
  included those for human resources, financial and information management. Improvement in structures extended in some countries to encompass structural (as contrasted with governance-oriented) decentralization.

• **Restoring incentives and improving pay.** Negative incentives have also been included,
  i.e., sanctions for non-compliance with new codes of ethical conduct.

• **Improving the work environment.** Elements of this have been identified to include
  raising budgetary allocations for operations and maintenance expenditures, office

2.3.3 Third Wave: Focus on Service Delivery Improvements

Besides the perceived inadequacies of the first and second waves of PSRPs, the added
impetus for the reform programmes to focus on service delivery improvement originated
from six factors. In brief they are:

I. The need to demonstrate early results;
II. Public demands for transparency and accountability;
III. The shift to market economies and private sector-led economic growth;
IV. Influence of “new public management”;
V. The need for PSRPs to support sector-wide approaches; and
VI. Pursuit of an integrated systems approach.
Generally, the second to fourth factors are related and reflect a response to global trends that impact on the environment in which the states will operate in future. The first, fifth and sixth factors present a more strategic approach in the design of PSRPs.


2.4 Civil Service Reform Program in Ethiopia

The early years of the twentieth century witnessed the inception of modern public administration and the emergence of civil servant in Ethiopia. As of this period, the civil service has been serving the different regimes in power. The current regime (FDRE) has also introduced major reform measures in the civil service (Paulo’s, 2001:22).

2.4.1 Current Civil Service Reform Program in Ethiopia

According to (Paulo’s, 2001:8-10), Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (FDRE) has been taking different reform measures in the political, economic and social spheres. The major changes include the move from a centralized unitary state to an ethnic based decentralized state; a shift from a command economy to a market-based economy in the context of a structural adjustment; and the introduction of a multi-party electoral system. The government has also taken different specific measures, one of which is civil service reform. So far the government has implemented two phases of civil service reform in the country.

In the first phase, the measures taken include the initial actions of the government to overhaul the problem in the civil service system. In order to alleviate the problems of civil service, the government established an Inter-Ministerial Committee (task force) consisting of representatives from the Prime Minister’s Office, Ministries of education, Finance, Planning and Economic Development, Labor and Social Affairs and the Public Service Commission. The committee was mandated to review the appropriateness of the existing structure of government in the light of the new economic policy and devolution measures. It was given the task of reviewing the whole civil service administrative system so as to recommend ways and means of renovation. Beyene (as cited in Adamolekun, 2002:236).
In doing so, the task force had in turn created six sub-committees to work on the restructuring of institutions; civil service pay; position classification; personnel directives and manuals; efficiency; effectiveness and accountability; and training. This task force submitted draft proposals on the salary scale, allowances and benefits of the civil servant. A study on working conditions and occupational safety was underway. A study on position classification in the civil service had been made and its proposals had been submitted. Nonetheless, all the above studies have not been put into action. The committee had also submitted a study on ways of restructuring the central government institution (Ministries and commissions) as well as a manning plan for the same Beyene (as cited in Adamolekun, 2002).

The other major reform measure taken during the first phase was the issuance of a retrenchment policy. The policy resulted in the retrenchment of civil servants and employees of public enterprises who were said to be redundant.

In addition to the above two major reforms i.e. the restructuring of the government institution and the retrenchment programs, the following civil service reform measures were taken:

i. Terminating automatic assignment of fresh graduates of higher institutions to public organizations.
ii. Lifting the order which denies the periodic salary increment for those who earn a monthly salary of Br 636 and above;
iii. Revising the rate of per diem payments for the civil service;
iv. Canceling the policy that denies the right to resign from duty, especially for the semi-professional and professional workers in the civil service;
v. Raising the lowest pay of the civil servant from Birr. 50 to Br.105 as of September 1990;
vi. Approving salary increments for teachers, doctors and university professors;
vii. Freezing recruitment in the civil service except for some crucial positions.

In the second phase, the current government (FDRE) launched its civil service reform programmed in 1996 with the following overall mission:
1. Capable of achieving government economic and social polices efficiently and effectively; and

2. Promotes democracy and federalism (Civil Service Reform program in Ethiopia, 1994).

To pursue this mission, the government (FDRE) developed sub-programmers of reform in five key areas. Responsibility for each sub-programme has been placed within the relevant federal government central institution, with a senior official appointed as director. The sub-programme and responsible federal institutions are indicated in Table 1:

**Table 1. Sub-program of CSR and Responsible Institution**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUB-PROGRAMME</th>
<th>LEAD INSTITUTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Expenditure management and control</td>
<td>Ministry of Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Human resource management</td>
<td>Federal Civil Service Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Top management systems</td>
<td>Office of the prime Minister</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Service Delivery</td>
<td>Office of the prime Minister</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Ethics</td>
<td>Office of the prime Minister</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Civil Reform program in Ethiopia (1994)*

**2.5 Service Delivery Policy in the Civil Service Reform Program in Ethiopia**

Service is generally any activity undertaken to meet social needs. Public service, particularly, refers to those activities of government institutions aimed at satisfying the needs and ensuring the well being of society as well as enforcing laws, regulations and directives of the government. The service delivery reform (SDR) in Ethiopia aimed at bringing about efficiency and effectives, render better quality services and be accountable for its failure, produce committed citizen, and to bring attitudinal change towards public service delivery (SDR sub-program, 2000).
Modern service delivery, which has been a distinguishing feature of the private sector, has become a typical issue among government as well as non-government institutions to transfer good management practices from the private to the public sector. Service delivery basically refers to the systematic arrangement of activates in service giving institutions with the aim of fulfilling the needs and expectations of service receivers and other stakeholders with the optimum use of resources. In short, improvement of service delivery means increasing the costeffectiveness, coverage and impact of services.

Although the Ethiopian civil service has a long tradition and experience of serving various governments, it has so far given little attention to service delivery. The orientation, attitude and work practices of the bureaucratic machinery established to carry out highly centralized and control oriented government policies of the previous regimes are ill-suited to the needs of the new policy environment in Ethiopia.

Radical changes about political economic and social changes have taken place in Ethiopia since the establishment of the transitional government. The promulgation of the new constitution, the federal arrangement of the state, the decentralization of administration to the lowest level of government, the shift towards the market-oriented economy as well as the adoption of the Agriculture-led industrial development strategy have laid down the foundation upon which all other major policy changes are built.

One of the prerequisites for service delivery improvement in the civil service is the existence of clearly defined policy that reflects government intentions and expectations regarding service delivery and quality of services as well as the rights and obligations of service providers and recipients in the process of service delivery. Accordingly, the Federal Government of Ethiopia has issued this policy primarily aimed at improving service delivery in the civil service.
2.5.1 Problems of the Ethiopian Civil Service in the Delivery of Services

There are several problems that contributed to poor service delivery in the Ethiopian civil service. The major problems include:

i. Positive attitude towards public service has not developed to the desired extent;

ii. Insufficient recognition that citizens have rights to perceive services from governments;

iii. Lack of accountability in civil service institutions for failure to meet expected performances;

iv. Service delivery in many public institutions are based on long and time consuming, excessively hierarchical organizational structure obsolete management practices;

v. Services are in most cases provided in a manner that suits the administrative convenience of the providers rather than meet the needs of the recipients;

vi. Civil service institutions tend to concentrate more on concerns for inputs and routine activates that on achieving tangible outputs by way of implementing government policies and programs as well as improving services;

vii. The public is seldom given clear and adequate information on the availability of particular services and the conditions required to get these services;

viii. Civil service institutions are sole providers of some services

ix. Most of the institutions do not have any formally constituted complaints handling mechanisms;

x. Service delivery improvement is not given sufficient attention in the planning process of may government institutions;

xi. In many cases the level of imitative and commitment to improve services leaves much to be desired;

xii. Shortage of resources constrains improvement of services to the desired level;

xiii. Inconsistency of regulations and guidelines governing institutions that provide related services as well as lack of coordination and cooperation among various departments within an institution and between related institutions often hamper efficiency in service delivery;
xiv. Human resource management system and conditions of work in the civil service do not motivate employees to provide quality service;

xv. Service users and often unaware of their right and obligations pertaining to services and at times tend to resort to illicit means to get the services;

As a result of these and other problems, the civil service has so far not been able to effectively carryout government policies and programs as well as to organize and delivery cost effective services. Consequently, its role in promoting economic and social development remains limited.

Besides, the fact that the civil service, on several occasions, has not been able to properly address the rights of service users to get public services in a fair equitable manner has contributed to the prevailing negative perception among the public about the efficiency of government institutions and civil servants.

In general, it is believed that absence of a clear and consistent government policy on service delivery in the civil service partly accounts for the prevalence of the above mentioned problems.

2.5.2 The Need for Policy

The state of service delivery in civil service institutions calls for fundamental changes. The government is committed to bring about such an improvement. Thus, the service delivery policy is the first step to realize such government commitment. The policy is specifically designed to:

i. Create awareness among civil service institutions and the general public about government intentions and expectations regarding service delivery and quality and quality of services.

ii. Publicize the rights and obligations of both service providers and recipients:

iii. Encourage and promote service delivery improvement throughout the civil service;

iv. Encourage continuing improvement in service delivery
2.5.3 Scope of the Policy

Federal ministries, Commissions, Public authorities and Municipal administrations as well other agencies financed from the regular budget of the Federal Government. The Federal Government will make utmost efforts and provide necessary support to assist Regional States to formulate and implement their own policies on service delivery by adapting contents of this policy to their specific conditions.

2.5.4 Objective of the Policy

The overall objective of the policy on service delivery is to attain user satisfaction in service delivery in the civil service. The specific objectives are to ensure:

i. efficiency and effectiveness of service delivery in the civil service thus reducing the burden of providing and receiving services and thereby facilitating economic and social development;

ii. Equity in access to government provided services and in the treatment of service users:

iii. Those institutions are managed in such as way as to provide better quality services and accountable for failure to do so.

2.6 Challenges of Civil Service Reform in Ethiopia

In spite of the significant growth of the concept the civil service not all organizations embarking on civil service reform projects achieve their intended results. Civil Service rules by themselves will not lead to good governance if they are not backed by political will and the preparedness of government to impose total adherence to these rules to promote public good.

There are multiple challenges in every reform. However, to be successful in any reform process the organization should identify challenge and forward appropriate solution. Paulos in his study (2001:93-94), has identified the major challenges that faced during the process in the civil service reform. As he suggested possible solutions and achievements are not achieved without any challenge in CSR. Further, he argues that Organizational
leaders, steering teams, redesign teams and change agents have passed through many challenges at different times and in different processes of the CSR. These are:

**Misconceptions about civil service program or attitudinal problem:** Misconceptions and attitudinal problems include: not understanding civil service reform in its entire sense and attempts to restructure departments; weakness or unwillingness to sense and internalize the need for change; complacence with the status quo; relating civil service only with downsizing and turning once back to the concepts and empirical evidences. According to him, the framework of the civil service reform emphasized that the need for more attitudinal changes rather than reinforcing or strengthening the existing organizations, structures and methods.

He argues that in Ethiopia the civil servant seems pessimistic about the whole reform process. In order to tackle these problems there should be necessary motivating measures such as competitive salary and benefit schemes for the civil service that hardly exist. If these preconditions are not fulfilled for the civil servant, one may wonder how the reform measures, especially in service delivery and ethics are going to be implemented. Ataklit(1996) in his finding, he mentioned that the objective of the civil service reform is not layoffs but to deliver public service in the right manner. In cases where the capabilities of some public servants do not fit the requirements of the new jobs, the government has promised to pay their salary until another job is found for them (with or without retraining); or until they find other jobs by themselves, or until they are trained and organized to start their own business (with financial accommodation by the government). For the aged civil servants, retirement is another option.

**Absence consolidated bureaucratic structure with competent personnel**

According to Ataklit, there is a serious problem or shortage of a professionally recruited and trained staff. The administrative performances in delivering public services are very poor which resulted from absence of well developed administrative system. But the whole civil service forced to move blindly from one to another end. To alleviate, he
proposes that before implementing the whole concepts or elements of NPM there should be essential background work in capacity building and in other areas of administration.

**Limited Commitment among Some Organizational Leaders (at early stages):** Lack of such commitments and poor communication has been revealed through: lack of adequate knowledge on the concepts of business process re-engineering (BPR); putting the change agenda aside or giving it as an assignment to others; not cooperating with the assigned change agents (consultants); not assigning the best people for reengineering teams; inadequate follow up and weak support. To overcome these obstacles, the leadership at Ministry of Capacity Building has made discussions with the top leadership of such organizations and reached at consensus. Such measure has improved the problem of what in most circumstances happen in public institutions.

**Poor communication:** The BPR framework requires communication with employees, customers and stakeholders throughout the various phases of the project cycle. Due to lack of formal communication (especially in the middle of the project), however, confusion and rumors among employees have been common in many public institutions.

**2.7 Business Process Reengineering Practices, Challenges and Experiences in Ethiopia**

In this section, we will see the experience of BBR implementation in Ethiopia. Ethiopia is striving to build sustainable economic development and good governance aiming to improve the living standard of its citizens. The civil service system is one of the key tools in achieving these goals. However, it is certain that the old bureaucratic system of civil service system does not help the government in achieving sustainable development and good governance. Because the old system is ineffective and inefficient, the outdated systems and procedures need system overhaul in order to have civil service systems that support the development and good governance.

The government has been undertaking lots of reform measures in order to create the civil service system that support the attainment of economic development and good governance. Among these reform programmes BPR which aims to radically transform the
civil service system into modern, effective and efficient system that allows government to attain the vision and policy strategies.

The government has chosen BPR in order to get the civil service system shift radically, transformed to totally new civil service system where jobs are organized around results, people are focused on end result, the management and measurement system based on result and the belief and values of people in the organization has charged toward supporting development. This is the fundamental reason that government has chosen BPR as a great tool to achieve their total transformation of the civil services system (Belete, 2008).

Since 1996/97 E.C., Ethiopia has been undertaking civil service reform programs where service delivery sub component,, among the others has better helped the organizations in improving the organization services speed. BPR has started more clearly and broadly 1998/99 E.C. in some of the federal government organizations and in some regions and universities.

Organizations undertaking BPR has been going through lots of challenges where lack of reengineering leader and lack of adequate knowledge and skill for undertaking BPR were critical among others. Reengineering leadership is a critical factor in achieving BPR. Because of the fact that BPR entails system overhaul, major change in rules and structure, many critical decisions on resources, unlike other change programmes, it can never succeed without executive leadership. There was a time that many organization’s leaders did not understand this fact and the BPR effort has delayed as a result.

The other major challenges were the misunderstanding on BPR from people in organization, including stakeholders. Some of the major misunderstanding points were:

i. Thinking BPR is American culture oriented, it doesn’t work in our environment
ii. BPR resulted in massive lay off
iii. BPR needs sophisticated technology
iv. BPR is for those developed countries that passed through industrial development and technologically advanced, we are too far behind, so we do not have resources, readiness to absorb BPR (Belete, 2008).

2.8 The Implication of Re-engineered Processes on the Organizational System

The two cornerstones of any organization are the people and the processes. If individuals are motivated and working hard, yet the business processes are cumbersome and non-essential activities remain, organizational performance will be poor. Business process is a cure for such problem, Carter (2005) also believes the necessity of Business Process Reengineering is the key to transforming how people work. What appear to be minor changes in processes can have dramatic effects on cash flow, service delivery and customer satisfaction. Even the act of documenting business processes alone will typically improve organizational efficiency by 10%.

i. **Work Unites Change – from – Functional Departments to Process Teams:**
   
   Once business processes is restructured, process teams- group of people working together to perform an entire processes-turn out to be the logical way to organize the people who perform the work (Hammer and Champy, 1993). Moreover, multi dimensional skilled individual or group of people are assigned to perform the process from start to finish and placed the employee in appropriate position. Belete et.al (2007) stated that performers in the process are placed based on the process organized. Therefore, performers are placed on the steps and jobs sequentially ordered and organized in the process based on their competency: pay-for-skill approach. Process teams don’t contain representative from all the functional departments involved structure. Rather, process teams replace the old departmental structure.

ii. **Jobs Change- from Simple Tasks to Multi- Dimensional Work:** Process team workers, who are collectively responsible for process results rather than individually responsible for tasks, have a different kind of job. They share joint responsibility with their team members for performing the whole process, not just a small piece of it. They not only use a broader range of skills from day to
day, they have to be thinking of a far bigger picture. While not every member of the team will be doing exactly the same work — after all, they have different skills and abilities — the lines between them blur (Belete, 2008).

iii. **Peoples Role Change — from Controlled to Empowered:** Companies that have re-engineered do not want employees who can follow rules; they want people who will make their own rules. As management invests teams with the responsibility of completing an entire process, it must also give them the authority to make the decision needed to get done (Belete, 2008).

iv. **Job Preparation Changes— from Training to Education:** If jobs in re-engineered processes require that people not follow rules, but rather that they exercise judgment in order to do the right thing, then employees need sufficient education so that they can discern for themselves what the right thing is. In companies that have re-engineered, the emphasis shifts from training to education— or to hiring the educated.

v. **Focus of Performance Measures and Compensation Shifts— from Activity to Results:** In companies that have re-engineered, contribution and performance are the primary bases for compensation. Measure their performance and pay them on the basis of the value they create (Belete, 2008).

vi. **Advancement Criteria Change — from Performance to Ability:** A bonus is the appropriate reward for a job well done. Advancement to a new job is not. In the aftermath of reengineering, the distinction between advancement and performance is firmly drawn. Advancement to another job within the organization is a function of ability, not performance. It is a change, not a reward. Promotion should be based on the ability and the potential that the individual deserve for the next position, not by reward for the best accomplishment of the existing job (Belete, 2008).

vii. **Values Change — from Protective to Productive:** Re-engineering demands that employees deeply believe that they work for their customers, not for their bosses. An organization’s management systems—the ways in people are paid, the measures by which their performance is evaluated, and so forth—are the primary
shapers of employees’ values and beliefs. Therefore, companies must link their value and belief they want to build in their organization with the organization management system. (Belete, 2008).

viii. **Organizational Structures Change-from Hierarchical to Flat**: When a whole process becomes the work of a team, process management becomes part of the team’s job. Decision and inter departmental issues that used to require meeting of managers and now get made and resolved by teams during the course of their normal work. Pushing decision about work down to the people doing it means that managers’ traditional roles are diminished. Consequently, the organizational structure tends to be flat, as work is performed by team of great autonomy and supported by few managers (Belete, 2008).

ix. **Executive Change–from Scorekeepers to Leaders**: In a reengineered environment, the successful accomplishment of work depends far more on the attitudes and efforts of empowered workers than on the actions of the task oriented functional managers. Therefore, executives must be leaders who can influence and reinforces of unequivocal success. However, the mistakes of the past provide indications of promising paths for future efforts. Consensus is building around approaches to PSR that emphasize (or at least take into account) the following elements that mentioned above.

### 2. 9 Challenges of Civil Service Reforms in Developing Countries

Reform, in particular within the public sector, has been undertaken in many countries and has proved to be challenging and difficult to manage. The challenges involved in managing reform, as experienced by Western as well as developing economies, have many aspects in common. These include the need to pay attention to appropriate structure, relevant skills and competencies, legislative support, appropriate behavior and attitudes, and most importantly a visionary leadership.

Public sector management in Africa has faced a number of challenges that have limited the scope, speed and quality of services rendered. There is no doubt that there are observable limits to the ability of a government to solve all economic and social problems. Nevertheless there is a consensus that public sector performance, particularly in the area of service delivery, needs to be improved. Such challenges include institutional capacity; multiple accountability; declining public service ethics; declining social values and civil service morale; and corruption. African governments need to increase their efforts to curtail these challenges to well-meaning public sector reforms.

Reforms usually faced problems emanating from the following aspects:

Support for the reform programs remains narrow and difficult to sustain at all levels, (i.e. those of political leaders, the public at large, and bureaucrats) for two reasons: First, the reforms are still stigmatized by the pain of such first wave structural reform measures as retrenchment, employment freeze, cost sharing, etc. Second, to the extent that the reform entails the change, there are large constituencies who perceive threat and resist change. Weak capacity and resource constraints often hinder implementation of plans and programs for improvement and expansion of services. Furthermore, in a vicious circle, poor budgeting and financial management practices exacerbated the problems of capacity and resources constraints, and vice versa. There are no effective incentives for performance. Generally, pay remains low for public servants in the countries. At the same time, pay reform is not readily feasible in the short to medium term because of the limited wage bill that can be afforded under budgetary constraints (Mutahaba & Kiragu, 2002, 68).

2.10 The Reason why Civil Service Reform Failed in Developing Countries

For developing countries, the civil service reform agenda presents a major challenge. Even with the best intentions, it is not normally initiated internally. Given that contention, an added difficulty is that there is no standard approach to civil service reform. In itself, any country should be permitted to construct its own reform agenda. On the other hand, it could be seen as wasteful; „re-inventing the wheel syndrome”. For SSA countries to reform their civil services and not to have some opportunity to reflect on the wider, general principles that apply would appear almost perverse. Moreover, it has been stated that “more attention needs to be paid to devising a coherent, overarching strategy for civil
service reform, detailing the set of tactics by which the strategic goals will be achieved” (Nunberg and Nellis, 1995).

2.11 How can Civil Service Reform be Designed and Implemented

1. Local Leadership and Ownership. CSR is doomed to fail if the main source of energy and leadership for it comes from outside. Donors cannot play a leading role, and they must not dictate the content, pace and direction of CSR. CSR is, among other things, an intensely political process that will inevitably pose a threat to important local stakeholders. Strong, relentless and well-placed local leadership is essential for overcoming the political and bureaucratic obstacles that confront a reform program.

2. Popular Pressure for Reform. Although local political and bureaucratic leadership is an essential ingredient for PSR, it is not sufficient. The public administration cannot be relied upon to reform itself. Impetus for reform must come from local stakeholders who are outside as well as inside the public sector.

3. The Impact of Accountability. Failed accountability is at the root of public sector dysfunction. Successful CSR strategies should therefore be adapted to address shortcomings in the accountability environment within which the public sector operates. Reformers must have an appreciation of factors such as institutions of accountability, access to information about public programs and public expenditure, their capacity to analyze information about the public sector and place demands on it for better performance, and the degree to which public agencies feel compelled to respond to institutions of accountability.

4. The Power of Information. Wide dissemination of information that allows citizens to monitor public service delivery and public expenditure can have a powerful positive impact on the attitudes and behavior of public officials. Experience in developing countries with “service-delivery surveys” has shown that information flows can set in motion an uncontrollable dynamic promoting a more accountable and better-performing public sector (Paul, 1998).
5. **The Impact of Organizational Culture.** Public sector organizations with a culture that is outcomes-oriented and “mission-driven” appear to have higher levels of performance that an organization lacking these features (Grindle & Hilderbrand, 1995). This underscores the importance to successful CSR of public-sector leadership styles and internal performance management practices that focus on results and service to the public.

6. **Build Capacity for Policy-making.** Providing timely and well-argued policy advice to public decision-makers is generally regarded as a core responsibility of the public service. Capacity to fulfill this function is in short supply in many developing countries, a problem that has been under-addressed by donors. Recent experience in this area has yielded lessons for policy capacity building in developing countries (Schacter, 1999).

7. **Take a More Sophisticated View of Downsizing.** The first generation of public-sector pay and employment reforms generally failed to achieve its objectives. This does not mean that pay and employment reform should be abandoned. It does however suggest that reformers should take a more sophisticated approach to downsizing, seeing it as a means to the end of a more focused, more effective and more efficient public sector. This means integrating downsizing programs into a larger frame of reference that includes a view on the appropriate role and size of government, an appropriate system for setting performance objectives and measuring progress against them, and a reformed pay structure conducive to attracting, retaining and motivating highly qualified staff (Nunberg, 1997).
CHAPTER THREE

Presentation and Analysis of Data

3.1 Introduction

This chapter is concerned with data presentation, analysis and interpretation of the data that were collected through questionnaires, interview, observation, and document. For this purpose, the researcher distributed a total of 80 questionnaires, 50 for clients and 30 employees from different departments in Adama City Administration. Additionally, the researcher conducted interviews with 3 BPR committee members in revenue and tax department, with one official of the capacity building bureau of the city and three interviewees from each cluster Kebeles. From the total number of questionnaires that were distributed to clients and employees the rate of return for the questionnaire is (42) 84 percent and (28) 93 percent respectively. Each sub-topic will be presented and discussed as follows.

For the sake of convenience for data presentation “No” shows that the respondents have rated the achievement and the challenge they face as “strongly disagree or disagree”, “Yes” shows that the respondents have rated the achievement and the challenge they face as “strongly agree or agree” and “No Opinion” as it is.

3.2 Profile of Respondents

This part presents background information of respondents which clarify the sex, age, educational level, marital status and years of service.

3.2.1 Profile of the Employees

As indicated in Table 1, 64 percent of the respondents are males and the remaining 36 percent are females. On the other hand, the marital status of 71 percent are married while the remaining 29 percent unmarried. Regarding age category, 75 percent of respondents lie above 27 years.
Table 1: Employees by sex, job, age, educational level, marital status and years of service

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>General background of the respondents</th>
<th>Specific characteristics</th>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Unmarried</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Age group</td>
<td>18-30</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>41-60</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Above 61</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Educational background</td>
<td>&lt;10 grade</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10+2 complete</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Technical and vocational</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>MA, MSC and above</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Work Experience</td>
<td>&lt;2 years</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3-5 years</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6-8 years</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9-11 years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12 and above</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Field survey, 2010*

When we see their level of education, out of the 28 respondents, 3 percent are 10+2 complete, 29 percent are technical and vocational, 29 percent are diploma holders, 37 percent are degree holder and the rest MA degree holders. Regarding the years of services in city administration, 37 percent served less than 2 years, 39 percent served for
3-5 years, 18 percent served above 6-8 years and the 7 percent served 9-11 years. This implies that the 76 percent of respondents have served between 1-5 periods of time.

### 3.2.2 Profile of the Clients

For the purpose of data triangulation, a detailed questionnaire were designed and distributed to clients of the city administration when they appear to get service from revenue and tax collection department. As indicated in Table 2, out of 42 respondents, 57 percent are males and the remaining 43 percent are females.

#### Table 2: Clients by sex, marital status, age group and educational level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>General background of clients</th>
<th>Specific characteristics</th>
<th>Number of respondents</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Unmarried</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>18-30</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>41-60</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Above 61</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Educational background</td>
<td>&lt;10 grade</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10+2 complete</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Technical and vocational</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>MA, MSC and above</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Field survey, 2010*

Regarding the age distribution, from the total 42 respondents 43 percent are in age group of between 18-30 years, 33 percent are between 31-40 years, 24 percent are between 41-60 years of age while NO respondents is above the age of 61. Pertaining to their level of education 10 percent are below grade 10 and 14 percent 10+2 complete respectively. Whereas 33, 24 and 12 percent of the respondents have got vocational and technical certificates, diploma and degree respectively and the remaining 7 percent of respondents have got Masters Degree and above. From this we can understand that majority of
respondents possess at least vocational and technical certificates in their respective field of studies which can enable them to fill the questionnaire through understanding.

### 3.3 Enabling Environment for Service Delivery Reform

**Table: 3. Respondents rate on the appropriateness of the enabling environment for implementation of service delivery reform.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The introduction of service delivery reform in your organization well designed?</td>
<td>9(33%)</td>
<td>16(56%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>There have been good preparations the before commencement of the full implementation of the service delivery reform?</td>
<td>10(36%)</td>
<td>17(58%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>There is a periodical discussion with the different stakeholders, customers and employees focusing on service delivery reform?</td>
<td>10(37%)</td>
<td>16(56%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Customer’s needs and expectations are identified in advance?</td>
<td>9(32%)</td>
<td>18(65%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Is sufficient fund available to carry out activities in the office?</td>
<td>5(19%)</td>
<td>21(76%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Is there suitable office available to carry out the reform?</td>
<td>5(19)</td>
<td>20(73%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Field survey, 2010*
As indicated in Table 3, 33 percent responded Yes, 56 percent said No while 11 percent have No Opinion on the well organizations of the service delivery reform.

Regarding the preparations before the commencement of the full implementation of the service delivery reform, 36 percent replied Yes, 58 percent responded No while 6 percent have No Opinion. Regarding periodical discussion with the different stakeholders, customers and employees focusing on service delivery reform, out of the total 28 respondents, 37 percent said Yes, 56 percent said No while 7 percent have No Opinion. In similar manner, the respondents have also rated whether customers needs and expectations were identified in advance. Out of the total 28 respondents, 32 percent said Yes, 65 percent replied No while 7 percent have No Opinion. Respondents also rated the availability of fund to carry out the activities in Adama city administration. Out of the total 28 respondents, 19 percent said Yes, 76 percent responded No while 5 percent have No Opinion. Regarding the availability of suitable offices, out of 28 respondents, 19 percent replied Yes, 73 percent said No while 8 percent have No Opinion.

**Generally, the responses regarding enabling environment for service delivery reform implementation can be summarized as follows:**

- More than 56 percent respondents responded that city administration was not well prepared before entering in to the full implementation.
- Regarding communication with various clients in identifying their needs and what they expect the organization requires a lot work to remain undone in addressing what customers need and want.
- Facilities and the office for service delivery are not sufficient and suitable for employees to render service in appropriate manner.

To undertake service delivery reform there should be the existence of enabling environment to carry out the reform to achieve the intended objectives. However, the evidence shows that developing countries resources intended to be used to facilitate implementation of reform is not available in the sufficient amount. In similar manner the availability of resources in implementation of civil service reform in Adama city administration was less convincing to be sufficient. Regarding to the facilities they said
that there is a shortage of equipment and service rooms, due to the shortage of budget and inadequacy of facilities.

Resources were needed to finance the reform process to achieve the set objectives such as facilities, Training of reform managers and better pay and incentives to implementers. However, according to evidence collected from respondents the Adama city administration service reform experienced the difficulty of insufficient resources.

Another necessary condition needed for effective reform was the improved communication mechanism for all parts of the reform the takes place. As it suggested by Corkery “the need for effective communication with all the actors and stake holders who have interests in the process of civil service reform and with all the ministries and agencies which can contribute to the identification of issues and the development of programs of reform” (Corkery, 1995:3). However, based on the responses obtained from respondents there is no well established communication using various means with various actors and stake holders regarding to what the reform constituted.
### 3.4 Challenges of Implementation in Civil Service Reform

#### 3.4.1 Institutional Challenges

Table: 4. Respondents rating on challenges related to institutional capacity to address the following challenges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Your organization addresses your performance gaps?</td>
<td>11(29%)</td>
<td>16(67%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>If your performance does not meet desired performance standard, what actions institutions take, which includes for example training, coaching, formal education and…etc</td>
<td>5(19%)</td>
<td>20(73%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Trained manpower under your department is adequate?</td>
<td>3(8%)</td>
<td>23(85%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>All employees placed on appropriate positions, i.e. they are placed in a position which is according to their educational background and experience.</td>
<td>7(23%)</td>
<td>20(73%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>I get adequate training on service delivery reform that equips me better for the job.</td>
<td>11(38%)</td>
<td>15(55%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Is there clear standards of service delivery were set to compare achievement with the reform?</td>
<td>22(78%)</td>
<td>6(22%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Is compensation related to performance?</td>
<td>4(13%)</td>
<td>24(87%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Incentives given to workers are improved service delivery?</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>24(87%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Field survey, 2010*
As indicated in Table 4, whether organization fills the performance gap is rated, out of 28 respondents, 29 percent replied Yes, 67 percent responded No where as the remaining 4 percent have No Opinion. In similar manner, the action taken by organization to alleviate the problem of performance gap is also rated. Accordingly out of the 28 respondents, 19 percent replied Yes, 73 percent responded No while 8 percent have No Opinion.

As can be seen from Table 4, in addition to the above challenges resulting from inability of the organization emanated from the adequacy of training and appropriateness of placement. Accordingly out of 28 respondents, regarding the adequacy trained manpower, the placement of employees on appropriate position and training on the service delivery reform are rated as follows; 8, 23, 38 percent replied Yes; 85, 73, 55 percent replied No while 7, 4, 7 percent have No Opinion respectively.

In similar manner, respondents have rated the challenges on the availability of clear standards of service delivery to compare achievement and whether compensation related to performance as follows; 78, 13 percent replied Yes while 22, 87 percent responded No respectively. Regarding incentives given to workers improved service delivery have been rated as follows; accordingly out of the 28 respondents, 87 percent replied No while 13 percent have No Opinion.

**The response on institutional challenges can be summarized as follows:**

i. To some extent they tried to fill the performance gap but there is no work in continuous manner to address the problem.

ii. The issue concerning “employee placement appropriateness”; the response indicate that there is serious problem with the placement of the employee.

iii. Concerning the adequacy of manpower, the response shows that Adama city administration is not in a position to implement the reform.

iv. The survey tells us that training was provided to employees to implement the service delivery reform.

v. Regarding better compensation standard the responses show that it is not in the way that motivates employees for excellence.
The responses show that the institutional capability was less convincing and also the contributing factor to the low pace and success of the reform program. The attribute of implementing agencies and personnel in terms of educational qualification and the size of agencies staff are very important for successful policy implementation. It is clear that implementation of the service delivery reform needs educated man power. However, there is shortage of skilled man power in the city administration as a result of high professional turnover. Because of this, the majority of the civil servants as indicated in Table 1, have been working in the Adama city administration for less than 2 years. Less years of experience in the job has resulted low payment for the civil servants.

According to Ntukamanzina (1998: 52) successful implementation of reform program is expected to bring positive changes to the implementing agency which in return would lead to the achievement of the following objectives. Such objectives are:

• To enhance the capacity of top civil service management in the management of change
• To improve or enhance the technical skills of civil servants who will be retained in the service
• To build the capacity of institutions by upgrading with modern administrative technology

According to Teskey and Hooper capacity building considered in the reform program mostly included provisions for training individuals who are to implement the reform and those employed to execute various government activities to equip them with skills and techniques necessary for their assignments (http://www.unpan1.un.org/...1999). The response of the employees implies that more than 50 percent were assigned duties for which they had inadequate skills.

Therefore, Adama city Administration must give due emphasis to the importance and need for training as one of the core issues in capacity building. The interview with the management indicated that within a short period of time training was provided for civil servants. Training is not provided in continuous manner to improve the staff.

Moreover, the training covers the detail of the new processes and the manual by which they guide their operation. This shows that the management should give sufficient
training with supportive material, especially for these kinds of new concepts to increase their understanding and awareness.

When we look at the responses regarding the placement of employees, it was carried out on the bases of their educational background and willingness of the employee. Placement of employees is not implemented based on the merit principle. However, improper placements of employee are difficult to enhance efficiency of services and even to the service provider. Because employees are not familiar with the specified job; it will be difficult to play their roles well. Therefore, the placements of the employees should be based on their competency. Belete et.al (2007) described that multi dimensional skilled individual or group of people are assigned to perform the process from start to finish. Performers are placed on the steps and jobs sequentially ordered and organized in the process based on their competency.

Regarding appropriate number of staff in the departments of Adama city administration the interview showed that, there is no stable number of staff due to high turnover and the number of staff is fluctuating from time to time. Sufficient size of qualified staff and sufficient resources are of paramount importance for smooth and successive policy implementation.

The efficiency and effectiveness of the government employees is low as a result of low remuneration of civil servants. Therefore, result based remuneration is vital for the rehabilitation of civil servant, particularly in terms of realizing improvements in capacity and delivery of public goods and services. Generally, according to Mutahaba as quoted from motivation theory, “a man is an economic animal who is motivated by material rewards. His effort will depend on the level of compensation: therefore, employers should pay their employees in accordance to level of effort” (Mutahaba, 2005:1).

From the above paragraph, it is clear that Adama city Administration should recognize the need and the importance to improve incentives for civil servants. As we can see from the data, incentive/salary for professional and managerial staff whose support is critical to the success of reform is not motivating for better excellence. Even though, there is 38%
salary increment since the first month of 2011 to civil servants, it may not satisfy civil servants compared to what they expected. Due to this, low pay will remain to be the single most serious problem or constraining factor for effective operation of civil service.

3.4.2 The Views of Clients about Employees

Table: 5 Views of clients about employee competency and work habits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Very good</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>good</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fair</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Poor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Very poor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>How do you measure the competency of the concerned staff of the city, especially those who provided you the service?</td>
<td>12(28)</td>
<td>10(24)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11(26)</td>
<td>5(12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4(9)</td>
<td>42(100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>To what extent are you satisfied with the courteousness and helpfulness of the concerned staff of city?</td>
<td>2(5)</td>
<td>8(19)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6(14)</td>
<td>12(29)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14(33)</td>
<td>42(100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Own Survey, 2010

As can be seen from Table 5, concerning the questions regarding competency and to what extent they are satisfied with the courteousness and helpfulness of employees the clients have rated in the following manner. Out 42 respondents; 28, 5 percent rated very well; 24, 19 percent rated well; 26, 14 percent rated fair; 12, 29 percent rated poor and while others 9, 33 percent rated very poor responded respectively.
From Table 5, we can see that there is no major attitudinal change on competence of the employees in Adama city Administration. As indicated by many scholars, resistance to change has been one of the big problems in implementing service delivery reform (Salisu, 2003; Manda, 2000). For instance, in the case of time management, workers in "one stop shop" are better than in those in other departments. Based on the information obtained from the interview, employees commonly come late to office even more than 30 minutes of normal working time due to carelessness. In addition to this, the researcher observed that at least about half an hour has been spent while wondering from office to office or looking through windows or they spent time discussing irrelevant matters with their friends.

According to the data obtained from the respondents in Table 5, Adama city administration has a problem in providing quality services to its residents. As Murdic (1990:421-422) noted that one of the conditions for customer satisfaction and quality services is the courtesy and helpfulness of frontline staff to clients. These involve politeness, respect, and friendliness of contact personnel by considering the customers interest. The view of the clients showed that 70 percent rated the employees as poor and very poor. Therefore, the city administration needs to work hard to improve the courteousness and helpfulness of the employees. On the other hand, the majority of the client 78.6 percent rated the efficiency of the staff very good, good and fair. Thus, in order to improve the image of Adama city administration and to further advance its efficiency, more training and revision on the reward system must be given due consideration.

Table 6: Respondents rating on the fairness of treatment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Response category</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Do you think the employees treat customers equally without any bias?</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>24(59)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>18(41)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>42(100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: own survey, 2010
As can be seen from Table 6, the views of respondents concerning the fairness of treatment the civil servants out of 42 respondents, 59 percent replied that there is fairness in the treatment while 41 percent responded that there is No fairness and equality. According to the respondents, the bases of differentiation are nationality, nepotism, language and also religion.

When we look at the 2007 Population and Housing Census results of the Central Statistical Agency, we find the following percentages of ethnic composition in Adama city administration: Oromo (46.07%), Amhara (41.6%), Silt’e (4.54%), Sebat Bet Gurage (4.05%), Sodo Gurage (2.02%) and all other ethnic groups (8.25%). Regarding the languages spoken in Adama city, Amharic is spoken as a first language by 55.05% of the residents, Oromigna by 35.08%, Siltegna by 2.43%, Guragigna by 2.1%, and Tigrigna by 1.99%; the remaining 1.88% spoke other languages. The majority of inhabitants in Adama city follow Ethiopian Orthodox Christianity with 78.39%, followed by Muslims 13.39%, 4.33% by Protestants, 1.85% by Catholics, and 1.32% practiced traditional beliefs.

According to the Constitution, each regional state government has a quasi-sovereign status and has been given considerable powers and authority, including a separate Regional Constitution, an elected regional assembly, the right to use its own national language in schools, its own public administration and its own courts. In addition, each regional state has been given an authority to prepare its own socio-economic development plan, mobilize resources for local and regional development and prepare and implement the regional budget.

Although Adama city administration has a mixed ethnic composition, the Municipal/urban management and governance is held by one ethnic group. The designation of the regional states is based on ethnic considerations with the aim is to solve or prevent (potential) ethnic or political tensions in various parts of the country. But as can be seen from the Table 6, the views of the urban residents using the sampled respondents, 41 percent responded that there is no fairness and equality when the civil servants render service. Of course, this rating is not of the majority but it is significant to
send a message that Adama city administration may have to revisit its language communications in the city administration.

**Table 7: Employees views on the exchange communication with the management on service delivery**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes (%)</td>
<td>No (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>During the implementation process there were orientations to all staff?</td>
<td>23(81%)</td>
<td>5(19%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>There are open communication between the management and the employee.</td>
<td>11(40%)</td>
<td>14(52%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: own survey, 2010

As can be seen from Table 7, when we consider the orientation given to employees on service delivery reform, out of 28 respondents, 81 percent said Yes while 19 percent said No. Regarding the existence open communication, out of the total 28 respondents, 40 percent replied Yes, 52 percent responded No while 8 percent responded with No Opinion. However, inadequate communication may switch off one of the organization’s vital support systems during a time of rapid change. Internal and external communication is a vital element of change program and one that is frequently under-resourced and underestimated.

### 3.4.3 Challenges of Adama City Administration in Civil Service Reform

When we look at the responses obtained from the interview and my own observations before the implementation of the service delivery reform program, the challenges of Adama city administration were the following:

i. Lack of professionalism and poor capacity building
ii. Inefficient incentive systems that do not appreciate upright and outstanding civil servants but reward the corrupt and the incompetent

iii. Outmoded rules and procedures that restrict the civil servant from performing effectively

iv. Systemic inconsistencies in promotion

v. Lack of adequate transparency and accountability

vi. Political interference and administrative acquiescence

vii. A noticeable slowness in processing documents

viii. Lack of documentation problems

ix. Presence of cumbersome bureaucracy.

Even though there are improvements in the delivery of service, there are still a lot of problems when we look the data obtained from interview, responses from staff members and clients and from my own observations. Even after the implementation of the service delivery reform in the city administration, the following challenges still exist from lack of institutional capacity to address what employees need and want and the challenges that emanated from the absence employees good work ethics. To mention the major problems:

i. Lack of budget

ii. Very weak leadership and management

iii. Lack of coordination between management and employees

iv. High turnover of competent workers due to poor remuneration

v. Lack of transparency and responsiveness

vi. High frequency of late comes to office

vii. Low morale of employees as the result of inadequacy of incentives

viii. Lack of attitudinal change on employees

ix. Rudeness and a lack of courtesy towards the service users

x. Shortage of skilled human resource

xi. Lack of motivation and lack of positive attitude for good work values and efficiency.
3.5 Achievements of the Civil Service Reform Program

Table: 8. Views of civil servants on the achievement of Service Delivery reform

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Has the service delivery reform improved the quality of service provided?</td>
<td>18(64%)</td>
<td>9(32%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Is the service delivery reform reduced the time of service provided?</td>
<td>17(61%)</td>
<td>9(32%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Own survey, 2010

When we calculate changes in quality service compared to before and after service delivery reform, out of the total 28 respondents 64 percent said Yes, 32 percent responded No while the remaining 4 percent have No Opinion. On the other hand, when we look at the time taking after the implementation service delivery reform, out of the 28 respondents, 61 percent said Yes, 31 percent said No and 7 percent have No Opinion.

The Federal Civil Service Commission (FCSC, 2005) states that most customer-service organizations define quality as a totality of features and characteristics of a product or service that bears on its ability to satisfy needs. This means organization should always strives to meet what the customers or clients expect, service specification, employee performance, training needs, and managing customers or client service expectations. That is why the main objective of service delivery reform is to speed up the service and to improve the quality as Rivard (1998) noted that service delivery reform to produce highly positive results for firms and clients, including significant reductions in costs, errors, and times.
When we look at the responses obtained from the interview, before the implementation the civil service reform in Adama city administration revenue collection was done by incompetent administrative staff. Moreover, the existence of rampant corruption and inappropriate enforcement mechanism used by the city administration to achieve compliance were also the reasons for low revenue collection. According to them, these changes achieved after the implementation of civil service reform by putting the following measures:

i. Improve the quality of services to the taxpayers,
ii. Counteract fraud and other forms of tax evasion,
iii. Assess, collect and account for all sources of tax in continuous manner,
iv. Administer effectively and efficiently all the revenue sources
v. Promote voluntary tax compliance.

Source: Adama city administration revenue department
3.5.1 The Views of Clients on the Service Provided

Table: 9. Views of Clients on the Achievement of the Service Delivery Reform

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Highly improved</td>
<td>Fairly improved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N (%)</td>
<td>N (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Have you seen improvements in the service delivery system of the city from what was the situation previously?</td>
<td>16(38.1)</td>
<td>18(42.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>What is your overall opinion on the quality of service that you received from the city?</td>
<td>10(23.8)</td>
<td>20(47.6)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Own survey, 2010

As can be seen from Table 8, clients have rated the institutional achievements on delivery systems and quality service. Clients indicated that the improvement in the service delivery and the overall quality of the service. Out of 42 respondents; 38.1, 23.8 percent rated highly improved; 42.8, 47.6 percent rated fairly improved; 9.5, 4.8 percent rated don’t know while the rest 9.5, 23.8 percent responded that it has not improved respectively.

3.5.2 The Availability of Clearly Stated Formalities and Procedures

Table: 10. Views of clients on clearly stated formalities and procedures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>No. ( %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>35(83)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>7(17)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>42(100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Own survey, 2010
It is necessary that the city administration must put in place clear formalities to be fulfilled by clients. According to the opinion of customers, out of 42 respondents 83 percent responded that there are clearly stated formalities and procedures while the remaining responded to the contrary. As we can see from Table 10, the positive responses the result of the service delivery reform.

3.5.3 The Benefits for the Residents of Adama City

Decentralized administrations in delivering services have a fundamental importance to make public institutions more effective in meeting citizens’ needs and to create the right conditions to empower community and involve it in the management of its own affairs. By recognizing this, in 2002 E.C Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia designed to shift decision-making closer to the people at the “grass roots level” and to improve the responsiveness of service delivery. The need for a participatory decision-making at local and grass-roots levels to make public institutions and individuals is particularly relevant for service delivery (FDRE, 2002).

In spite of this, our country’s constitution allows Woreda administration implement policies, laws, plans, directives, and guidelines of regional governments and coordinate activities of Woreda executive organs or sector offices. Because, they are close to the community which have a great importance in the responsiveness for over-seeing socio-economic and developmental activities in Kebeles under their jurisdiction (Tegegne G/Eg. and Kassahun B., 2007: 15). According to them, based on indicative guidelines provided by Woreda administration, Kebele administrations prepare plans in consultation with sub Kebeles (Ketenas) and government teams, the results which enabled kebeles to have consolidated plans, budgeted activities to be undertaken in a given fiscal year are subsequently identified by specifying the amount to be covered through government allocations and community contributions (finance, labor and material).

After the implementation of civil service reform particularly in service delivery, in 2000 E.C the Adama city administration decentralized its administration at Kebele as a focal point for delivery of services to offer effective and efficient services to the urbanites.
Information has been obtained from different segments of city residents which include the urbanite and business people after the introduction of the decentralized administrations in delivery services at Kebele level. Numerous opportunities and benefits have been achieved after the implementation of the civil service reform in the delivery of services in the city which permitted decentralized delivery of services at Kebele administration level. These opportunities and benefits are summarized below:

i. Responsibilities and resources that have been decentralized at the Kebele level have helped to address the needs of community. For instance, at Kebele 03 there is a serious land ownership problem because the area regarded as newly settlement areas or locally known as “Cherka Sefer”. After the implementation of land management and administration delivery at Kebele level, 90% of the on land ownership of Kebele 03 residents” got solutions. Moreover, the length of time to serve the public considerably decreased from days, months and sometimes years to 2 hours.

ii. After the implementation of land management and administration of services at the Kebele level, measures have been taken by the city administration to improve the delivery and management of urban land to poor and the houseless. For instance, in Kebele 11 after conducting a comprehensive evaluation by elected representatives of the city residents, they identified those individuals and households who needed urban land. They distributed 105 land holding certificates which include infrastructure and service facilitates like water and electric power to those individuals and households by paying Eth. Birr 5,000.

iii. Administration at Kebele level is now done by consulting and incorporating community priorities, budgeting and being accountable for performance results. For instance in 2003, in Kebele 11, the budget allocated by the city administration is Eth. Birr 17 million. But to carry out all the planned activities, the Kebele needed additional Eth. Birr 3 million from the community which has been collected by the kebele administration.

iv. Employing Kebele community policing to protect the urbanites from unethical practices. For instance, in Kebele 09 before the participation of the community in
preserving the security there was a serious problem regarding safety and security. However, after the participation of the community in collaboration with police, they were successful in maintaining and preserving the safety and security by using neighborhood watch groups in their irrespective Kebeles.

v. Interface between the urbanities and the city government considerably developed. Interface is important because it is one of the key ways that communities can communicate their needs and concerns to government officials.

vi. Urban dwellers participate in national development with the help of Kebeles on policies and projects that affect their community.

vii. Finally, the community developed the culture of participatory decision-making process.

**3.5.4 Achievements gained by Adama City Administration**

The city administration started the reform to give quality services to clients and customers by having the objectives of service delivery reform policy of Ethiopia which emphasized on efficiency and effectives, render better quality services and be accountable for its failure, produce committed citizen, and to bring attitudinal change towards public service delivery. However, due to challenges that were presented in previous sections their achievement was limited but there are improvements in delivery of service to some extent. By having this, few achievements recorded are the following:

i. Before the implementation of the civil service reform there was time consuming processes in service provisions. For instance, based on my observation in the department of land supply and administration, it took only 40 minutes compared to one week in the past to render the service.

ii. The civil service reform improved documentation problems in city administration. This was a major factor that delayed efficiency in Adama city administrations.

iii. The application of „One Stop Shop” helped in the delivery of service with speed and efficiency. The use of computers and easy documentation increased the
responsiveness of the workers to provide service and also service takers took advantage of saving time.

### 3.6 The Attitude of Employees on the Civil Service Reform Program

**Table: 11.** Employees perception of the reform in Adama city administration.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Do you think that a civil service reform program respects the rights of civil servants?</td>
<td>5(19%)</td>
<td>19(68%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Most civil service reform programs in the city administration get the appropriate goal?</td>
<td>8(26%)</td>
<td>14(52%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: own survey, 2010*

As can be seen from Table 11, whether civil service reform program respects the rights of civil servant, 19 percent said Yes, 68 percent said No while 13 percent said No Opinion. Regarding the question whether civil service reform programs in the city administration achieved the intended goal, out of the total 28 respondents, 26 percent responded Yes, 52 percent said No while 22 percent have No Opinion.

Implementation of civil service reform program needs not only facilities, skills, remuneration and so on, but it also needs attitudinal change of employees towards accepting the new change introduced. The majority of the civil servants see the service delivery reform as an externally imposed rather than a homegrown system to alleviate the problems of the service delivery in Adama city administration.
CHAPTER FOUR

Conclusions and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusions

This chapter provides conclusions and recommendations on the basis of the analysis and interpretation of the data that were collected through questionnaires, interview, observation and documents on civil service reform in Adama city administrations.

From the commencement of the implementation of civil service reform program in Ethiopia, the public service delivery reform objectives wanted to achieve efficiency and effectiveness, render better quality services and be accountable for its failure, produce committed citizen and to bring attitudinal change.

The implementation of the civil service reform program covers a lot of things that will change public institutions in the provision of services. After the implementation of the service delivery reform changes have come in Adama city administration in making Kebeles as focal point for service delivery, delay in service delivery has been reduced and customers satisfaction has improved. It is also important to note that changes in public service lack sustainability. The main reason for this is the hurdle encountered in the implementation of the service delivery reform in the city administration. The hurdles for successful implementation of civil service reform program seem to be emanating from the following challenges:

i. **The incentive system:** low salaries have adverse consequences which includes poor staff morale and decline in work effort as well as difficulty in recruitment of technical and professional staff. As we can see from the data, the Adama city Administration is not in the right track to address remunerations, incentives and the reward needs of the civil servants. However, starting from March 2011 there is salary increment to the civil servants but the increment may not absorb the inflation that prevails in Adama city.
ii. **The reform suffered from the slow pace of acceptance towards change** in the mindset and behavior of public servants towards quality public service delivery. One of the conditions customer satisfaction and quality services is the courtesy and helpfulness of frontline staffs to clients. These involve politeness, respect, and friendliness of contact personnel by considering the customer’s interest. Based on the information obtained from the respondents the city administration is not in the right path in providing quality public service delivery.

iii. **Lack of employees awareness about the benefits, objectives and principles of the BPR.** The data shows that, the employee has negative attitude about BPR, they see BPR as a means of lay-off. Moreover, the training was not sufficient and was not supported by briefing manuals, papers and guidelines that contain the goals and principles of BPR and no continuous training was available.

iv. **Limited commitment of the civil servants:** A small number of dedicated civil servants in the Adama City Administration have been striving for the implementation of CSRP. However, there is a need to ensure that all civil servants should support the reform. Based on the information obtained from the clients there was lack of support from the bureaucrats. Lack of support led to delays and in extreme cases, to the blockage of reform process.

v. **Civil service reform program suffered from lack of resources:** In Adama city Administration civil service reform program suffered from lack of resources in mobilizing for the delivery of services generated from internal and external sources that was very important in the successful implementation of reform objectives. The insufficient financial resource was among the hurdles spelt out by the respondents in implementing the reform. The data shows that there is inadequacy of facilities and equipments because the budget of the departments is inadequate and there is insufficient room for improvement. This hampers the city administration to render service efficiently.

vi. **Poor communication:** Another condition that was necessary for effective reform was the improved communication mechanism within the city jurisdiction to implement the reform. However, based on the information obtained from clients
there is lack of improved and smooth communication system which emanated from language barriers.

vii. **Lack of qualified civil servants by quantity and quality:** The Lack of qualified civil servants by quantity and quality have been a requirement for successive reform. There was the need to have qualified personnel who could put CSRP plans in action in an effective way. However, the data shows that there were no sufficient employees who could manage change and guarantee sustainability at the start of the reform program. Furthermore, the city administration was suffering from professional’s turnover due to low remuneration.

**Changes and Achievements in Adama city Administration**

i. **Changes in service delivery:** As we can see from the data, services in the city administration have changed to some extent. Decentralized service delivery at Kebele administration level, the number of clients served has increased to some extent, time of queuing for services is reduced or services rendered per hour has increased.

ii. **Service rendered responsiveness:** As the data shows, the responsiveness to services rendered is good. The application of “one stop shop” increased the transparency and satisfaction of clients since the client could follow what they want to be served in front of them. The data also shows that the waiting time for getting services has reduced after the implementation of BPR.

**4.2 Recommendations**

For successful reform, Adama city administration should take note of the following recommendations:

i. The civil servant who is responsible for the implementation process should be equipped with training in order to manage and bring change. Objectives and goals of reform must be known and understood by implementers since this will derive personal commitment better than imposing penalty to enforce commitment of employees.
ii. The reform should start with **encouraging incentives** because it influences the commitment of qualified professionals who can manage change to remain in the civil service. Even though there is an increment salary since March 2011 to civil servants, it may not satisfy their expectations. The major reason for lower pace of reform and low commitment by the reforms is because of poor salaries, reward and system. Therefore, it is important for the administration to strive to improve employees remuneration and rewards to make them more committed in the implementation of the reform process.

iii. Another important aspect in the reform that the city administration should consider is to ensure the existence of effective **communication and coordination** of reform activities. This should start from initiating reform goals and objectives and maintaining them in a sustainable manner both for reformers and those affected by the reform outcomes.

iv. Building adequate **institutional capacity** for efficient delivery of urban services and infrastructure; to enhance the professional capability and institutional capacity of municipalities for preparation and implementation of urban development plans. Adama city should enhance the role and involvement of professionals and technical expertise in urban governance and management with a view to building adequate urban management capacity for service delivery and development.

v. Another important aspect of a **successful reform** is to make the reform internally identified and to make it home grown.

vi. **Result oriented evaluation** must be strengthened. There were no consistent methods of setting targets for the city administration and departments, measuring performance against these targets, rewarding success or disciplining failure. Without accountability for results, there was little incentive for employees to strive in improving their performance.

vii. **Changing the mindset of public administrators** and the civil servant regarding public programs and resources do not belong to them as personal fulfillment.
Rather, public administrators and civil servants have accepted the responsibility to serve citizens in fair and equitable manner by acting as stewards of public resources. Due to this, administration must give due attention to inculcate good public service ethics which emphasizes on equity, integrity, moral conduct and political neutrality.

viii. **Reducing over politicization of the reform.** Civil service reform in the delivery of public services needs professionals and political support from above. From the discussions, I have come to understand that the civil service reform in Ethiopia has become politicized and has been used for the benefit of politicians. This will eliminate professional ethics from the public service. Therefore, the government must reduce the over politicization of the civil service and work closely with professionals.

ix. The critical measure that appears to be an essential condition for reform in the urban service delivery like Adama is the mixed ethnic composition. The Municipal/urban management and governance in urban service delivery that the Federal Government has to change is the dominance of one ethnic group of urban administration to mixed ethnic group of urban administration. To enhance greater participation of communities in urban development, the Federal Government must **encourage democratic and civil culture** as foundations for harmony and efficient delivery of urban services.

New public management has not been of great success as it was expected in developing countries because of well developed democratic culture and the presence of the basics of an old public administration discipline which made the introduction of the new elements of informal structures and practices difficult to sell. This is also the case in Adama city administration. A combination of capability and commitment are therefore critical to the success of civil service reform. Adama city administration needs to overhaul its working environment to make them competitive and democratic.
REFERENCES


Civil Service Reform program in Ethiopia, 1994.


World Bank, (2002); Civil Service Reform; Strengthening World Bank And IMF Collaboration; Washington: Library Congress Cataloging-In-Publication Data.

Internet Based Sources


Getachew, H.M, (2007). Civil Service Reform: In two Miniseries. Available at:

6.1.2010

Kithinji Kiragu (2002), “Improving Service Delivery through Public Service Reform:” Lessons
of Experience from Select Sub-Saharan Africa Countries. Available at:

available at:

Simmy M. Marwa and Mohamed Zairi(2009) Challenges of successful reform, an
international perspective. Available at:

Teskey, G &R.Hooper.(1999) “Tanzania Civil Service Reform: Case Study”, available at:

This questionnaire is prepared to collect information from selected respondents for the accomplishment of thesis program with the topic of “CIVIL SERVICE REFORM IN ADAMA CITY ADMINISTRATION”. The study is carried out as a partial fulfillment of the requirement for the master of “PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT”. The main objectives of this questionnaire are to access the successfulness of civil service reform program in delivering public services in the city administration of Adama.

This questionnaire seeks your views regarding the enabling environment, quality, responsiveness and speed of service that provided in the city administrations. The findings of the study will only be used for academic purposes, to make recommendation based on findings in order to improve the system and hence you are kindly requested to forward your views and experiences as carefully as possible. Each of your answer have great contribution for the completeness of the research paper.

I would like to thank you in advance for your kind cooperation in responding to this questionnaire. The information generated in the study kept confidential.

Instructions: 1. Do not write you name
   2. Place a tick mark “X” in the boxes and / or briefly write your Response in the space provided.
   3. Attempt all questions
Part: I

Questionnaire to be filled by the civil servant

Personal Information

1. Your current position in the organization__________________________________

2. Sex: - Male  Female

3. Marital status: Married  Single

4. Age  18-30  41-60  31-40  Above 61

5. Educational background
   Incomplete of grade 10  Diploma
   Grade 10+2 complete  Bachelor Degree
   Vocational and Technical  MA, MSC and above

6. Year of service in the organizations
   Below 2 years  6-8 years  Above 12 years
   3-5 years  9-11 years

Key for questions 10-19

1. Please, tick on No 1 if you strongly disagree; No 2 if you disagree; No 3 if you do not have opinions; No 4 if you agree; No 5 if you strongly agree.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7. The introduction of service delivery reform in your organization is well designed?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. There have been good preparations before commencement the full implementation of the service delivery reform?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. There is a periodical discussion with the different stakeholders, customers and employees focusing on service delivery reform?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Customer’s needs and expectations were identified in advance?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Answer Options</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Is sufficient fund available to carry out activities in the office?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Is there suitable office available to carry out the reform?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Your organization addresses your performance gaps?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. If your performance does not meet desired performance standard, what actions they take, which includes for example training, coaching, formal education and...etc</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Trained manpower under your department is adequate?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. All employees placed on appropriate positions, i.e. they are placed in a position which are according to their educational background and experience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. I have adequate training on service delivery reform that equips me better for the job.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Is there clear standards of service delivery were set to compare achievement with the reform?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Is compensation related to performance?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Incentives given to workers is improved service delivery?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Is the service delivery reform improved the quality of service provided?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Is the service delivery reform reduced the time of service provided?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. During the implementation process there were orientation to all staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. There are open communication with the management and the employee</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Do you think that a civil service reform program respects the rights of civil servant?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Most civil service reform programs in the city administration get the appropriate target?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
27. Would you suggest one example of difficulties the implementation of civil service reform programs in the city administration and explain it?

______________________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________________

28. Would you comment what shall be done to protect employees’ difficulties in civil service reform programs?

______________________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________________

29. Is there any additional comment in the civil service reform programs of the city?

______________________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________________

______________________________________________________________________________

Thank you for your cooperation
Part: II

Interview Questions to city management officials

1. Your current position in the organization__________________________________
2. What major reforms are made and are applicable in the area of service delivery?
3. What are the obstacles/impediments faced in carrying out the program?
4. What is the most significant change of the reform in the service delivery and how do you measure its significance?
5. To what extent the motivation and commitment of the employees in implementing the reform?
6. Is there any motivation introduced after reforms? Yes or No? If yes what they are?

________________________________________________________________________

7. Do you think there are sufficient professionals to deliver the service? Yes or No? If yes what measures taken?
8. Is there any success in implementing the program by improving the salaries, reducing the number of employees, and cut expenditure?
9. Are there procedures and systems by which customers are served?
10. How do you determine whether or not your customers are satisfied with the service the city provides?

Thank you for your cooperation
**Part: III**

**Questionnaire to be filled by the city clients**

**Personal Information**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Sex: -</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. Marital status: Married</th>
<th>Single</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Other; specify  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3. Age</th>
<th>18-30</th>
<th>41-60</th>
<th>31-40</th>
<th>Above 61</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4. Educational background</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Incomplete of grade 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade 10+2 complete</th>
<th>Bachelor Degree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vocational and Technical</th>
<th>MA, MSC and above</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5. If you feel that you have waited more time to get the services, what do you think the reasons?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. What recommendations do you suggest to minimize or alleviate the above problems?

7. Your knowledge about the current major service delivery reform program of the city?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High</th>
<th>Low</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. How do you get the service delivery of the city in comparison with the reform you expect?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Highly improved</th>
<th>Do not know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fairly improved</th>
<th>not improved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9. Have you seen improvements in the service delivery system of the city from what was the situation previously?

   Highly improved □ □  not improved □ □
   Fairly improved □ □  Do not know □ □

10. Do you think that there are clearly stated formalities and procedures to get the service you are looking for from the city?

    Yes □ □  No □ □

11. How do you measure the competency of the concerned staff of the city, especially those who provided you the service?

    Very good □ □  Poor □ □
    Good □ □  Very poor □ □
    Fair □ □

12. Do you think the employees treat customers equally without any discrimination?

    Yes □ □  No □ □

13. If you say yes, on what bases? ________________________________________

14. To what extent are you satisfied with the courteousness and helpful of the concerned staff of city?

    Very good □ □  poor □ □
    Good □ □  very poor □ □
    Fair □ □

15. What is your overall opinion on the quality of service that you received from the city?

    Highly improved □ □  do not know □ □
    Fairly improved □ □  not improved □ □
16. Please provide general comment on the service you get from the city.

______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________

Thank you for your cooperation
Interview Questions about decentralized service delivery

1. Is there any benefit the community has obtained after a decentralized delivery of service has been implemented in your Kebele?

2. Have you seen improvements in the service delivery system of the city from what was the situation before four years?