AN ASSESSMENT OF THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF ALTERNATIVE BASIC EDUCATION TO PRIMARY EDUCATION (GRADE 1-8) IN AFAR REGION

BY

ANWAR AHMED ALI

JUNE, 2010
AN ASSESSMENT OF THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF ALTERNATIVE BASIC EDUCATION TO PRIMARY EDUCATION (GRADE 1-8) IN AFAR REGION

A Thesis Presented to
The School of Graduate Studies
Addis Ababa University

In partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts in Educational Policy and Planning

BY

ANWAR AHMED ALI

JUNE, 2010
This thesis has been submitted for examination with my approval as University Advisor

Name: Befekadu Zeleke

Signature: 

Date of Submission: __________________
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LIST OF TABLES</th>
<th>I</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABBREVIATION</td>
<td>II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER ONE**

1. INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 1
   1.1. Background of the Problem ......................................... 1
   1.2. Statement of the Problem ........................................... 2
   1.3. Significance of the Study .......................................... 4
   1.4. Scope of the Study ................................................... 4
   1.5. Limitations of the Study ........................................... 5
   1.6. Definition of Terms .................................................. 5
   1.7. Organization of the Study ......................................... 5

**CHAPTER TWO**

2. Review of Related Literature ................................. 6
   2.1. Education for All .................................................. 6
   2.2. History of Education in Ethiopia .......................... 9
      2.2.1. Pre-1991 ....................................................... 9
      2.2.2. Post-1991 ..................................................... 9
   2.3. Concepts of Nomadism and Pastoralism .................. 12
      2.3.1. Definitions .................................................. 12
         2.3.1.1. Nomads .................................................. 12
         2.3.1.2. Pastoralists .......................................... 13
      2.3.2. Life Style of Nomads ...................................... 13
      2.3.3. Pastoralists and Development .......................... 15
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4. Pastoralists and Education</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Overview of Ethiopian Education Policy for the Pastoralists</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5. Formal Vs NFE in Pastoralist Areas</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1. Formal Education</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1.1. Attitude of Nomads towards Formal Education</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1.2. Critics on Formal Education</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1.3. Characteristics for Success</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2. Non Formal Education</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2.1. Types of NFE</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2.2. Characteristics for Success</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.3. Resemblance of Formal and Non-Formal Education</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.4. Pastoralist’s choice</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6. The Concepts of ABE</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7. Overview of Education in Afar Region</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.1. Land and People of Afar</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.2. Rationale of ABE in Afar</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3. The Current Status of Education in Afar Region</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3.1. Access</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3.2. Equity</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3.3. Efficiency</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3.4. Quality</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7.3.5. Challenges</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER THREE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Research Design and Methodology</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. The Research Method</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Data Sources</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.3. Sampling Technique and Sampling Population

3.4. Instrument and Procedures of Data Collection

3.5. Pilot Test

3.6. Method of Data Analysis

CHAPTER FOUR

4. Presentation and Analysis of Data

4.1. Characteristics of Respondents

4.2. Assessing the Major Gains

4.2.1. Education Delivery Modes

4.2.2. Access Gains

4.2.3. Location of ABECs

4.2.4. Access Problems

4.3. Equity and Efficiency Issues

4.3.1. Equity Issues

4.3.2. Internal Efficiency

4.3.2.1. Dropout rates

4.4. Relevance of ABE

4.4.1. Substitutability of ABE to Formal Education

4.4.2. Inferior Education?

4.4.3. Language of Instruction

4.5. Quality Issues

4.5.1. Supervision

4.5.2. In-Service Trainings

4.5.3. Educational Inputs

4.5.4. Quality Problems

4.5.5. Educational Qualification

4.5.6. Enhancing Competition
CHAPTER FIVE

5. Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations .......................................................... 50

5.1. Summary of Major Findings .................................................................................. 50

5.1.1. Demographic Characteristics of Respondents ................................................ 50

5.1.2. Major Gains from ABE .................................................................................... 51

5.1.2.1. Modes of Delivering Education .................................................................. 51

5.1.2.2. Access Gains .............................................................................................. 51

5.1.3. Equity Issues .................................................................................................... 51

5.1.4. Internal Efficiency ............................................................................................ 52

5.1.5. Relevance Issues .............................................................................................. 52

5.1.5.1. Curriculum .................................................................................................. 52

5.1.5.2. Language of Instruction ............................................................................. 52

5.1.6. Quality Issues .................................................................................................. 52

5.1.6.1. Supervision ................................................................................................ 53

5.1.6.2. In-service Trainings .................................................................................... 53

5.1.6.3- Educational Inputs ....................................................................................... 53

5.1.6.4- Quality Problems ........................................................................................ 53

5.1.6.5- Educational Qualification .......................................................................... 53

5.2. Conclusion ............................................................................................................ 54

5.3. Recommendations ................................................................................................ 55

Bibliography .................................................................................................................. 58

ANNEXES
LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Education Quality Indicators</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Description of the Sample</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Characteristics of Respondents</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Appropriate Education Delivery Modes</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Reasons for Appropriateness of the chosen Delivery Modes</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Rating the Impact of ABE on The Pastoralists In terms of Access</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Enrolment of Primary Education of Afar Region</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Nearness of ABE Centres to the Community</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Date of Sample Woredas</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Major problems That Denied Access to ABE</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Does ABE Create Opportunity for Girls Education?</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Willingness for Girls Education</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Reasons for Not Sending Girls to School</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Contribution of ABES in Reducing Dropouts</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Reasons for Dropout</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Substitutability of ABE Curriculum to Formal Education</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Reasons why the Curriculum of ABE Considered Inferior Education</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Ease of Using Mother tongue Language</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Frequency of Supervision</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Basing Annual Plan on Supervision Results</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Frequency of In-service Training</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Most Frequently Identified Quality Problems</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Enhancing Competition among ABE and Regular Students</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABBREVIATIONS

ABE  Alternative Basic Education
ABECS Alternative Basic Education Centers
ADB  African Development Bank
ASA  Annual Statistical Abstract
BEA-E Basic Education Association in Ethiopia
EFA  Education for All
E.C.  Ethiopian Calendar
G.C.  Gregorian Calendar
GER  Gross Enrollment Rate
KETB Kebele Education and Training Board
MOE  Ministry of Education
NFE  Non Formal Education
REB  Regional Education Bureau
UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UPE  Universal Primary Education
WE0  Woreda Education Office
PTA  Parent Teacher Association
IIZ/DVV Institut Fur Internationale Zusammenarbeit / Des Deutschen Volkshochschul Verbandes
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank Ato Befekadu Zeleke (Asst. Prof.), my thesis advisor, for his constructive comments and suggestions he rendered me throughout the writing of this thesis.

I would like to express my heartfelt and sincere appreciation to Ato Ibrahim Haji Ali, Ato Ahmed Ibrahim, W/t Sitty Ahmed, Ato Awol Nurhussien and my whole family for giving me resources, comments and moral support to accomplish this research.

I am also indebted to my friends Ato Jemal Korie and Ato Mohammed Seid for the support and encouragement they provided.
ABSTRACT

The main purpose of this research was assessing the contributions of ABE to primary education in terms of access, equity, efficiency, relevance and quality. The method employed to conduct this study was descriptive survey. Regional Education Bureau and Woreda Education Office officials and concerned experts, facilitators, the parents around the ABEs and 2 MOE experts were used as sources of data. To this end, the main contributions of ABE in terms of access to education, improvement in equity and internal efficiency were assessed. In addition, relevancy of ABE curriculum to the pastoralists and the level of quality of ABEs were also examined. The necessary data for the study was collected through questionnaires, interview, focus group discussions, observation and document review. The study was conducted in six randomly selected Woredas of Afar region. A total of 90 respondents, namely 2 MOE, 6 REB, 23 WEO, 20 facilitators and 39 community members have participated. The data analysis method used in the study was textual analysis and statistical tools.

The findings of the study revealed that: Although ABE has a positive impact and helped to reach more pastoralists than the formal schools, illness of students and mobility of the pastoralists during dry season in search of water and pasture increased dropout rate, especially girls; parents also showed preference towards Quranic teachings for their daughters, ABE was considered as an inferior education by the parents and their reasons were the contents of the text book and the length of time spent by children in schools; inadequate educational inputs, facilitator’s motivation and absenteeism, low qualification of facilitators were identified as quality problems.

The major conclusions drawn from the study were: ABE played a very important role in ensuring education to the pastoralists; although ABEs are established nearer to the communities, mobility makes it difficult for most parents to send their children, especially girls, to school; the drop out is found to be very high due to drought and illness of children, inadequate educational inputs and low educational qualification of facilitators.

Finally, the study recommended: launching feeding programme, providing incentives for female students, recruiting more female role model facilitators and applying flexible school calendar to increase access, improve equity and reduce dropouts. Revisiting the curriculum will ensure relevance and increase competitiveness of ABE students in grade 5. In order to improve the quality of ABEs: increasing the frequency of supervision, providing the necessary educational inputs, increasing the salary and minimum qualification and more training to the facilitators to make teaching career attractive to the natives.
CHAPTER ONE

1. INTRODUCTION
This chapter deals with the background and statement of the problem, and also the significances, the scope, limitations and organization of the study.

1.1. BACKGROUND OF THE PROBLEM
Education is a basic human right and has been recognized as such since the adoption of the universal declaration on human rights in 1948. Since then, numerous human rights treaties have reaffirmed this right and have supported entitlement of free and compulsory primary education for all children. Basic formal education is seen as essential for the full accomplishments of individuals as human beings, their survival and lifelong development (Kratli, 2001:13).

In 1990, the Education for All (EFA) commitment was adopted in Jomtien, Thailand. This vision was reaffirmed in Senegal, Dakar, in 2000 by the World Education Forum and a Framework for Action was endorsed. In the Dakar World Education Forum, developing countries agreed to make all necessary interventions for the realization of EFA goals while rich countries promised to support developing countries in their endeavor to achieve those goals. After the Dakar World Education Forum, in September 2000, heads of state that met at the United Nations unanimously adopted the Millennium Declaration committing themselves to a series of international development objectives to be reached by 2015. The declarations which are related to education stresses on achieving universal primary education and ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls; those in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities have access to complete, free and compulsory education of good quality (BEA-E,2006:2).

As a signatory of the declaration, Ethiopia has also exerted efforts to provide access to primary education to its people by formulating an Education and Training Policy in 1994. Among other things, the policy provided for a new educational structure and decentralized management, localized curriculum and the use of local language as a medium of instruction in primary grades (ADB/UNESCO, 2005:22). But there is much work to do before the goal of EFA is achieved specially in the pastoralist and remote rural areas of the country.
Ethiopia is home to the largest group of pastoralists which are estimated at 12-14 million. But these pastoralists are among the populations with the lowest enrollment in education indicating that direct, specific and targeted attention is required towards enabling pastoral children to access to quality education (Bosch et al, 2008:7). Mobility, sparse population, harsh environmental conditions and remoteness are clearly technical obstacles to the provision of formal education through systems that are designed for sedentary people in a well connected and densely populated areas has not been a viable option (Kratli, 2001:28).

The ABE program is taken to be an alternative initiated as a response to the above stated problems and chosen as a strategy by the MOE to provide favorable condition for the pastoralist out of school children to go to school. The Education Sector MDG Needs Assessment Report (2004:4) explains further by stating that the most effective strategy to expand alternative basic education for underserved and remote rural areas is the establishment of ABE centers which will enable every village to have smaller multi grade schools nearer to the community. According to the Afar REB report (1998:2), this strategy gave way to the ABE program to be tried in 3 pilot Woredas of Afar region in 1996 E.C. and later adopted in all 29 Woredas as one of the modalities used to provide education beginning 1997 E.C.

Hence, the goal of this research is to assess the contribution of ABE to primary education in terms of access, equity, efficiency, quality, and relevance and the problems associated with delivering the ABE modality in Afar region.

1.2. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

Providing quality basic education to all citizens has been acknowledged as a human right and a means for individual and national development. Ethiopia, by committing to the EFA goal of education for all, has made significant efforts to expand the access to and improve the quality of education (IIZ/DVV, 2005:1).

Looking at the current development of the education sector, the country’s national average GER was 95.6% while it stands at 26.2% in Afar and 32.7% in Ethiopian Somali regions, according to the MOE annual abstract in 2007/08. The national education sector’s focus of attention has currently shifted from access to quality issue. While, the
pastoralist regions of Afar and Somali now has to deal both with the access and quality of education (MOE, 2009:24).

In Afar region ABE was introduced and recognized by the government since 2005. The program was intended mainly to expand access to basic education that is equivalent to the first cycle of formal primary education (grade 1-4) to the children through flexible alternative mode of delivery suited to the socio-economic and cultural realities of the regions. In 2007/08, the number of ABE centers reached 303 as compared to 287 formal primary schools. From the total of 83018 children enrolled in the same year, ABE has contributed in teaching 24424 children (29.4%). This shows the significant role of ABE plays in the region (MOE, 2009).

Even though ABE is said to be flexible, low cost and necessary to reach the pastoralists, the issue of quality of education given fell under a question mark. Nowadays the teachers and also the regional supervision results and conferences on education suggest that the children are not getting quality learning in ABECs and that the REB has to do a lot to improve the deteriorating situation (REB, 2008:2).

Moreover, the REB is faced with the increasing concern that whether the students who completed level 3 of ABE would be able to compete with those of grade 5 students coming from the regular program. Growing gender disparity and dropout rate are also another area of concern.

In light of these issues, the research concentrated on assessing the contributions of ABE to primary education in terms of access, equity, efficiency, relevance and quality of education and find out the main problems associated with delivering the ABE in Afar region and present recommendations.

The specific objectives of the study are to:

1. Assess the major gains obtained from introduction of ABE in the region.
2. Examine the level of equity and efficiency of ABE.
3. Explore the extent to which relevant curriculum is in place for the pastoralists.
4. Identify the level of quality maintained in ABE.
5. Find out the recommendations to help achieve better results in ABE.
In order to meet these objectives, the study was guided by the following basic research questions:

1. What are the main contributions of ABE in terms of access to education in Afar region?
2. Does ABE improve equity and promote internal efficiency?
3. How relevant is the curriculum of ABE to the pastoralists?
4. Is the quality of education maintained in the ABEs?

1.3. SIGNIFICANCES OF THE STUDY

The Afar REB has launched ABE with the main purpose of reaching out the children of pastoralists living in remote and rural areas and are out of school. The effectiveness and efficiency of an educational modality can be assessed depending on the thorough understanding of its contributions and the problems that affect the achievement of its goals and objectives. Now that the number of ABECs and children enrolled in them are increasing from time to time that its contributions has to be assessed in terms of indicators such as access, equity, efficiency, quality, and relevance of education.

In this respect the study will:

- Help in providing lessons and can be used to revisit the ABE modality.
- Serve as a regional information and document and also be used for decision making purposes.
- Throw some light on the contributions of ABE in Afar region and serve as a reference for further study.
- Increase the awareness of educational leaders and draw their attention towards the problems of ABE.
- Provide important recommendations for a better planning in REB.

1.4. THE SCOPE OF THE STUDY

The study focused mainly on Afar region. Besides, the study concentrated on examining the contribution of ABE in terms of access, equity, internal efficiency, quality, and relevance.
1.5. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

One of the limitations of this study was inaccessibility of Woredas and sites of ABE. Some respondents especially in rural areas were suspicious and reluctant to participate in focus group discussions. For example, when the respondents were asked about their willingness for girl’s education, they replied with agreement despite the low girl’s enrollment. Therefore, the researcher was forced to ask the facilitators the same question to find out reasons behind for their unwillingness.

Poor documentation and record keeping especially in statistics was another limitation. The annual enrollment data presented by MOE and Afar REB are different. The researcher tried to use data related with ABE from the REB. This was because the researcher understands from own experience in the Afar REB that due to time constraint to collect all the data from all the Woredas, the REB usually sends incomplete data to the MOE.

1.6. DEFINITION OF TERMS

**Alternative Basic Education:** refers to a system of learning which is characterized by flexibility, capacity to recognize and creatively utilize diversity, and transparency in terms of the degree of openness: in terms of access and learning opportunities.

**Facilitator:** is a para-professional assigned to teach in ABE centers or a person responsible for facilitating ABE classes.

**Non-formal Education:** is any organized educational activity outside the established formal system intended to serve identifiable learning clienteles and learning objectives (Ayalew et al, 2008:7).

1.7. ORGANIZATION OF THE STUDY

This study is organized in five chapters. The first chapter deals with the background of the study, statement of the problem, significance of the study, limitations of the study and definition of terms. Chapter two presents review of related literature. The third chapter is concerned with research design and methodology while chapter four concentrates with presentation and analysis of data. Summary of the main findings, conclusions and recommendations are treated in the final chapter.
CHAPTER TWO
REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

This chapter deals with the review of related literatures concerning the issues under study. The major topics included in the chapter consists of EFA, historical overview and current status of education in Ethiopia, concepts of nomads and pastoralists, education policy for the pastoralists, contrasting formal and NFE, concepts of ABE and overview of education in Afar region.

2.1. EDUCATION FOR ALL

Education is fundamental to economic, social and political development. The right to education for all is not only a desired outcome but also a process that must be characterized by democratic principles such as non discrimination and equality, participation, transparency and accountability. It involves the creation of new knowledge and thinking, as well as breaking up old practices (UNESCO, 2008:9).

Education is a long standing human right that should be met unconditionally. The provision of education to all citizens has become an international issue and a national agenda since the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights which affirmed that, elementary education was to be made free and compulsory available for all children in all nations (MOE, 2008:1).

According to UNESCO/IIEP (2006:1), the international community has on various occasions in recent decades shown its commitment to expanding access to education and improving the quality of education through the organization of more major international conferences. These conferences help to define an agenda and to identify priorities which most countries can adhere to. Ever since, treaties and declarations have been promulgated to turn these aspirations into reality.

One such conference took place in 1990. Education for All (EFA) is an international commitment launched in Jomtien, Thailand to bring the benefits of education to "every citizen in every society" (World Bank, 2008). The Year 1990 was also declared by the
United Nations as the International Literacy Year. These two events provided the much needed impetus and opportunity to all governments and NGOs to commit themselves to the goal of providing education for all in their respective countries. According to Chatterjee (2006:2), the nations of the world discussed on the major aspects of EFA, arrived at a consensus on what constitutes basic education, declared their commitment to ensure that the basic learning need of all children, youth and adults are met effectively in all countries and adopted a framework of action to realize the goal.

In 2000, that goal was far from being realized, but the pledge has been renewed and a new deadline is set for 2015. EFA is an important framework uniting efforts from international organizations, national and international non-governmental organizations and governments alike (Hestad and Licht, 2002:11).

After a decade of slow progress, the international community reaffirmed its commitment to EFA in Dakar, Senegal, in April 2000 and again in September of that year. At the latter meeting, 189 countries and their development partners adopted the two EFA goals that are also included in the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs):

- **Achieve universal primary education**: ensure that all boys and girls complete a full course of primary schooling, and
- **Promote gender equality and empower women**: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005, and at all levels by 2015 (World Bank, 2009).

Although MDGs 2 and 3 refer only to issues of universal primary education and gender parity, respectively, the World Bank recognizes that achieving these goals requires supporting the full EFA commitment (World Bank, 2009).

In order to meet the challenges faced by the education sector, the Dakar Forum committed itself to the Dakar Framework for Action- a practical document laying out goals and strategies for achieving EFA. The Framework for Action adopted six major goals for education which covered the attainment of UPE and gender equality, improving literacy and educational quality, and increasing life skills and early childhood education.
programs, and were to be achieved within 15 years (EFA GMR, 2003:1). It is also important to see that the conference proposed a new vision on education, demanding among other things, more consistent attention to education outside of the formal school environment and an increased role of the civil society and other development partners (IIEP, 2006:1).

While there has been progress towards EFA since 2000 in the sub-Saharan Africa region, it has been uneven. The pace of progress towards universal primary education (UPE) in the region has been faster than during the 1990s, with the average primary net enrolment ratio (NER) increasing from 57% to 70% between 1999 and 2005. However, some countries have lagged behind and some goals – such as early childhood care and education (ECCE), the learning needs of young people and adults, adult literacy and the quality of education – have received insufficient attention. Most countries failed to eliminate gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005. These must be redressed if children, youth and adults are to benefit equally from the opportunities education provides (EFA GMR, 2008:1).

There has been a summing up of relevant factors that form major barriers for achieving basic education for all. Sarkar (2004:12) has classified these factors into four groups:

- **Accessibility** - discrimination, the burden of household chores, and the burden faced by children combining work and schooling
- **Affordability** – direct, indirect, and opportunity costs
- **Quality** – the lack of infrastructure, facilities, materials, and support systems for children; inadequate conditions of work for teachers, low status of teachers, lack of adequate training, aids and materials for teachers, and the lack of sensitivity of education authorities and teachers to the needs of children at risk
- **Relevance** - curriculum detached from local needs, values and the aspirations of children at risk, curriculum inadequate to prepare students for gainful and skilled employment (Roschanski, 2007:2).
2.2. HISTORY OF EDUCATION IN ETHIOPIA

2.2.1. Pre-1994

Although existence of an alphabet in Ethiopia dates back to the fourth century A.D, it was only in the 1890s that literacy and basic education were realized as a means of development and modernity (Mammo, 2005:4).

Formal education in Ethiopia was basically restricted to religious instruction under the control of the Ethiopian Orthodox Church (Roschanski, 2007:7). The primary purpose of church and mosque education was to prepare devoted and faithful young who would promote their respective doctrines (Seyoum, 1996:28).

The international recognition that the country obtained following the Victory of Adowa and the innovation introduced by Minilik II, accentuated the need to modern education so as to deal with the prevailing political situations of the then period and to manage the innovations introduced (Ayalew, 2000:8).

Emperor Minilik II issued a declaration in 1886 E.C. (i.e., 1893/4) to the effect that every child, male or female, should get education after the age of 6. This effort was eventually strengthened by the establishment of a modern school in 1908 (Shenkut, 2005:5).

Secular education was introduced to Ethiopia in 1908 with the first public school in Addis Ababa, followed a year later by the opening of a primary school in Harar. The focus was on foreign languages with French being mandatory and English, Italian and Arabic being optional. The introduction of government-sponsored education was a reaction to an increasing need for educated elite to fill positions in the government, as well as to advance trade and industry.

Expansion of the education system came to a halt during the Italian occupation between 1936 and 1941, when all governmental schools closed down (Roschanski, 2007:7). According to Maaza (1996:65) the Fascist policy was to wipe out the embryonic modern education system.

After the war some efforts were made to give priority to education and a number of schools and institutions of higher learning were opened over the subsequent 2 or 3 decades in order to produce teachers and administrators for the state machinery. According to the Education Sector Strategy (TGE, 1994:1), over these years the student enrollment increased continuously at the cost of quality and without a commensurate
growth in economy resulting in growing number of educated unemployment and disguised employment.

Education during the Derg regime seemed a little bit improved compared to the regime of Haile Selassie I in terms of access. However, the educational structure was designed totally with the Socialist philosophy and Communist ideology which couldn’t provide quality, equitable and relevant education. And it was unfit to support the promotion of national development and mutual respect among nations, nationalities and peoples. Limited provision, inequitable distribution, inefficiency, irrelevance and poor quality are fundamental problems of education prior to 1991 (FDRE, 2008:2). The Education Sector Strategy (TGE, 1994:8) in its part expresses the situation at the time as:

(\textit{Due to the}) civil war, a number of the schools in the country are in fairly bad state of repair needing major maintenance or rebuilding. Most of the functioning schools are ill equipped and highly overcrowded... most primary school buildings are not of an appropriate standard and the compounds are neither conducive for the teaching learning process nor for an all rounded and healthy development of students.

2.2.2. Post 1991

Ethiopia was one of those Sub-Saharan African countries with the least participation of school age children in primary schools. The development of the education sector in Ethiopia has been at an early stage. According to the MOE (1999: 2), The Education and Training Policy of the country was formulated in 1994 by the Ethiopian Government. The reform encompasses every aspects of the educational system- the curricula, teacher training, educational inputs, educational finance, organization and management, structure of education, career structure of teachers, and evaluation. The reform is aimed at total restructuring of the educational system to address the following problems in the sector.

- low primary school participation;
- rural areas and girls are not well served;
- the quality of education is low;
- the system is inefficient;
- funding is inadequate; and
- capacity for planning and management is weak
To transform the policy into action, education sector development programs (ESDP) have also been developed and implemented (Ayalew et al, 2006:2-3).

Girmay et al (as cited in Semera University) described the policy document as:

...... for the first time in the history of education of the country, a comprehensive, consolidated and written policy for the education and training system. It (ETP) was written on the basic issues surrounding access, quality, equity and efficiency (2009:2).

Since the introduction of the 1994 ETP, there are encouraging signs that show enrolment at all levels is rising. In addition, the equity and quality issues are being addressed and significant result has been recorded. This is by and large an outcome of the ESDP - a comprehensive intervention package developed by the government in order to mobilize national and international efforts to boost the performance of the system, in particular the primary education sub-sector. It is in fact a document that "translates the policy statement into action" comprising a series of five years plans within a 20 years perspective plan (MoE, 1999: 4).

Ethiopia has made enormous strides in education provision. Despite the more than three-fold increase in primary education enrollment over the past decade, Ethiopia nevertheless faces serious and increasing challenges to achieve primary education for all (FDRE, 2004:1).

Ethiopia substantially lags behind most countries in sub-Saharan Africa in terms of coverage and distribution. Ethiopia has set itself goals which are more ambitious than the MDGs. The report on the Education Sector MDG Needs Assessment (MOE, 2004:1), explained that there is little doubt Ethiopia can achieve the internationally agreed education MDGs of education for all up till Grade 5 by 2015. In this regard, the report further explained that the challenge is not just that of building schools in all parts of the country, but also to ensure that local communities use the schools to full capacity.

Another notable feature of Ethiopian education is the large discrepancy between regions, with some regions approaching achievement of EFA, whereas other regions, in particular those with pastoralist population, are lagging behind seriously. According to the report by the Education Sector Review, this discrepancy may lead to political problems and destabilization in the future because more educated and more qualified people from advantaged areas take higher level and higher paying jobs both in public and private
sectors. This discrepancy is also seen in terms of rural urban comparison. In urban areas, because of the increase in enrollment as compared to the increase in facilities and class sizes have reached at a pedagogically unacceptable level. On the other hand, many schools in rural areas have much lower number of students than schools are expected to accommodate (PHRD, 1996: III).

In light of the aforementioned problems it is important to understand who the pastoralists and/or nomads are and what measures should be taken or what type of educational modes of delivery is appropriate in order to reach the pastoralist children and thereby achieve the EFA goals.

2.3. THE CONCEPT OF NOMADISM AND PASTORALISM

2.3.1. Definitions

A lot of ink has been spilt on the definition of nomads and pastoralists. Some writers and authorities use the words interchangeably to refer to the communities who move from place to place in search of water and pasture for their cattle. Woldemichael (cited by Abeynur, 2006: 18) questioned whether nomadic and pastoralist concepts are synonymous or not and further presented an example from the Nigerian “Nomadic education Policy” and the Kenyan “Pastoralist Education”. The term ‘nomad’ is a common metaphor for aimless wandering or ‘zelan’ in Amharic. Due to this negative connotation attached to the word, for example in Ethiopia, people prefer to be addressed as pastoralists or ‘arbitoader’ in Amharic (PACT, 2008:5).

Let us look at some definitions and classifications in order to help us reach the conclusion on the terms.

2.3.1.1. Nomads

Wayne (cited by Owiny, 2006) explains that the word nomad is derived from the Greek word pasture – nomos- people who move with their households in search of pasture for their animals. The movement of traditional nomadic peoples is far from haphazard. It is both predetermined and systematic. According to Mugerwa (as cited in Owiny, 2006), nomadism is highly mobile production system that does not undertake any cultivation and does not have any base.
A report by MOE (2006:3) categorized nomads “based on their mobile life style, nomads can be pastoralists, migrant fishermen and hunter food gatherers. Of these the pastoralists are most predominant in Africa.

2.3.1.2. Pastoralists

Klunghardt (1998:1) defines pastorals as those, “whose subsistence is based on herding of animals within a set of spatially dispersed natural resources”. They can be nomadic or transhumant. Swift (cited by Owiny, 2006) defined pastoralism as a production system where 50% or more of household gross revenue, such as the total value of marketed production plus the estimated value of subsistence consumed within the household comes from livestock or livestock related activities; or where more than 15% of household food energy consumption consists of milk products.

According to MOE (2006:4) pastorals are classified as:

- Nomadic pastoralists- who live and derive most of their food and income from domestic livestock. They don’t have any place of residence.
- Agro pastoralists- who integrate crop farming with livestock. They live in semi-permanent settlements and only the male members move in search of pasture and water.
- Transhumant pastoralists- have a permanent home area and move more or less on regular routes.

Carr-Hill (2005:15) described the nomadic communities as a mix of ‘pure’ pastoralists, agro-pastoralists, transhumant pastoralists and hunter gatherers.

There are two components in any definition of pastoralists: the degree of dependence on livestock-based activities, and the nature and form of mobility (UNDP, 2003:3).

Looking at the above definitions and classification, it is possible to say that the term ‘nomad’ can be used to explain the mobile lifestyle of the people in which pastoralists are also part. Pastoralists are one of the types of nomads who move from place to place and whose economic activity is of primarily raising animal and using their byproducts.

2.3.2. Life Style of Nomads

According to Klunghardt (1998:1), pastoralism originated in the Northern hemisphere some 9000 years ago as a result of some ecological needs of particular kinds of livestock. For thousands of years, the nomad was the master of the savannah and the grassland. His mobility, his social discipline manifested in the warrior class, his ample access to protein
and to animal products useful to warfare, made him superior to the farmer who huddled within or at the edge of the forest according to Imre (cited by Owiny, 2006:46).

Nomadic herders number several tens of millions people in Africa, the Middle East, and South, Southwest and central Asia. They include some of the poorest and most vulnerable of all southern population (Krati, 2001:7).

Most nomads live in marginal areas like deserts, steppes, and tundra, where mobility becomes a logical and efficient strategy for harvesting scarce resources spread unevenly across the terrain (Imre, 2002:33). Pastoralists have adjusted themselves rather well to the fragile ecosystems that are perpetually affected by drought and desertification and adapted by evolving a distinct and unique economic and traditional knowledge system where livestock and livestock related activities provide about 50% of their livelihood (Bosch et al:2006:23).

Livestock is the main center of nomadic economy. Almost all nomads consider their cattle a sign of prosperity and security, as matrimonial and social alliances depend on it. Consequently, mobility is a key feature and those family groups who are most successful nomadic pastoralists also exhibit a higher degree of mobility in search of water and pasture. Therefore, mobility is a strategy of survival for herds and nomads. The issue of mobility is further explained by Bosch et al (2006:27) as that mobility tends to vary from region to region and overtime within the pastoralist livelihood systems. Although there is a general pattern, it has to be adapted to the seasonal and environmental possibilities of the environment.

The MOE report (2006:3) shows that, nomads are estimated to constitute about 6% of the African population and can be found in 21 countries- Nigeria, Ghana, Cameroon, Niger, Mali, Senegal, Chad, Mauritania, Algeria, Egypt, Eritrea, Sudan, Ethiopia, Somalia, Uganda, Djibouti, Kenya, Tanzania, Botswana, South Africa and Namibia.

The pastoralist population of Ethiopia makes up about 13.7% of the population inhibiting most of the lowlands. The pastoralists are heterogeneous in ethnic composition and social structure, having some larger ethnic groups such as the Somalis, the Oromo and the Afar (PFE, 2009:7).
2.3.3. Pastoralists and Development

Pastoral people, frequently, are blamed for ignorance and unwillingness to cooperate. However, according to a study made in pastoralist areas in the horn of Africa, pastoralists tend to live in small groups and are often isolated and rarely have someone from their own social groups to represent them in political and social meetings outside their community. The study further states that governmental organizations, banks and social agencies are generally located in the capital cities or larger regional towns (Bosch et al, 2006:27).

The MOE (2008:2) also recognized the long period of neglect and marginalization of pastoralists in Ethiopia and elaborates on the absence of infrastructures and social services in these areas under the past governments of the country.

The pastoral people were mostly poor, with limited security and consequently unable to take risks with their future. Illiteracy was high, but there were nevertheless rich sources of indigenous knowledge. Moreover, the pastoralists were realistic and prepared to adapt new practices if they thought the outcome would be positive (Bosch, 2006:60).

Governments first start to address pastoralists in the 1970’s, following the principle of blaming the victim. After large pastoral livestock projects in the 1970’s and 1980’s were halted and the imposition of sedentary life failed, the new generation of pastoral projects has common characteristics: a respect for mobile pastoral strategies, and for herder’s indigenous knowledge and technical understanding. Nevertheless, problems remain. Old myths die hard, and outdated policies are rejected. Pastoralists are still often treated as second class citizens when it comes to investments, service delivery, political power and citizenship. Their irrational mobility is often cited as a reason (UNDP, 2003:1-3).

2.3.4. Pastoralists and Education

The importance of education provision to nomadic communities is integral to the overall achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and Education for All (EFA). Attaining the two education MDGs are dependent not just on mass enrolment drives, but also on targeting and reaching those smaller percentages of marginalized groups who are currently unable to access the system. It is time for educators to explore flexible and innovative approaches in education provision that address specific barriers (de Souza, 2006:91).
As a signatory of the declaration, Ethiopia has also exerted efforts to provide access to primary education to its entire people by formulating an Education and Training Policy in 1994. Among other things, the policy provided for a new educational structure and decentralized management, localized curriculum and the use of local languages as a medium of instruction in primary grades (Carr-Hill, 2005:22).

Based on the ETP, the third ESDP has given due consideration to mainstream pastoralist education in all sub sectors of the education sector. Although, conducive conditions are created for the development of pastoralist education in Ethiopia, the rate of growth still remains very sluggish compared to what has been achieved at countrywide level (MOE, 2008:2-3). For example, looking at the development of the education sector, in 1994/95 the national average GER was 29%, whereas the GER of Afar and Somali regions were 9.1% and 14.3% respectively. According to the MOE annual abstract, in 2007/08, the country’s national average GER has grown to 95.6% while it stands at 26.2% in Afar and 32.7% in Somali regions.

Education is reaching thousands of children in pastoralist areas. But still provision of only formal schooling leaves pastoralists either without education or provides with education that is not relevant to their lives (PACT ETIHIOPIA, 2008:11). Expansion of formal education provision is not enough to ensure that Education For All reaches nomadic and pastoralist children. The interventions should be community-based that can respond to the context and mobility patterns of the pastoralist. It is only when governments have made efforts to reach nomads and pastoralists in innovative ways that completion rates will be improved (OXFAM, 2005:7).

2.4. OVERVIEW OF ETHIOPIAN EDUCATION POLICY FOR THE PASTORALISTS

Although modern education has a long history in Africa, including Ethiopia, there are millions of school age children who are still unable to get the opportunities of basic education. The non-formal and alternative approaches to basic education are one of these programs found to be appropriate in response to the need and demand for basic education for those deprived and marginalized populations (Befekadu, 2006:1).
Although the ETP declares that non-formal education (NFE) will be provided and be integrated with basic education at all levels of the formal education, it was not included in ESDP I. However, after a lot of internal and external pressures, MOE was forced to accept NFE as a mode of delivery for basic education and included it in ESDP II (Mammo, 2005:14).

In ESDP II, MOE underscored that NFE is an alternative to the formal education and accepted that the three-year cycle of alternative basic education is equivalent to the formal basic education (grades 1 – 4). Program Action Plan of ESDP II (2002:16) even indicated that 320,581 out-of-school children of 7 – 14 years attended alternative basic education in 2000/01. The same document mentioned that 1,049,061 whose age was 15 years and above attended adult and NFE in that same year (MOE, 2002:16).

ESDP III emphasized the need to strengthen non formal education and other alternative modes of delivery to address these out of school children. It is recognized that without ABE the country will not achieve the EFA goals and the MDGs (PACT, 2008:1).

The ESDP III (PP.26 – 27) invites and encourages local governments, religious and international organizations, the private sector and communities to offer NFE and training. The government in its part will play its roles in policy formulation, the development of curricula and strategy, production of learning materials, setting standards, providing professional assistance, and facilitating access to school buildings (Mammo, 2005:15).

The document further states that non-formal and adult education will have alternative basic education for out-of-school children of 7 – 14 years, literacy for youth and adults whose ages are 15 years and above, and basic skills training to youth and adults (MOE, 2004:26).

By continuing its effort to expand education to the pastoralist areas of the country, the MoE prepared a strategic document entitled “Strategies for Promoting Primary and Secondary Education in Pastoralist Areas” in 2008. Inside sources also indicate that the Department of Gender and Educational Equity is envisaged within the MoE organizational structure to deal with adult and NFE, gender, pastoralist education, special needs education and to include eventually pre-primary education (Mammo, 2005:15).
2.5. FORMAL VS NON FORMAL EDUCATION IN PASTORALIST AREAS

2.5.1. Formal Education

Formal education is an institutionalized, chronologically graded and hierarchically structured education running from lower primary to the upper reaches of the university. Generally full time and sanctioned by the state” (Combs et al, 1974 cited in Mammo, 2004:11).

Combs and Ahmed (1973), identifies the most important characteristics of formal education i.e.

- it is graded chronological
- should produce evidence for passing through the lower grades to be able to attend the next higher grade and should usually be in the right age range.
- it is hierarchical structured (i.e. one should start learning at the lower level of primary education and proceed to the upper reaches of the educational system)
- it is sanctioned by the state
- it is institutionalized (i.e. education is provided in specific learning centers schools, colleges, etc) at specific times (days and months of the year)

The expansion of formal schooling is the single most important factor driving the spread of literacy worldwide over the past two centuries, and especially the past fifty years. Its impact spans historical periods and geography. Schools have been, and continue to be, the place where most people acquire their core literacy skills (UNESCO, 2005:24).

Attributes of formal provision could be associated with positive images of a more professionally-developed, regulated system with the aim of providing children with access to jobs in the formal sector (Rose, 2007:9).

2.5.1.1. Attitude of Nomads towards Formal Education

Findings from researches on the topics such as the attitude of the nomads towards formal education; indicated that nomadic pastoralists had a positive attitude towards formal education and were willing to acquire it (Ezeomah, 2006:63-64).

For those who have positive attitudes, the problem associated with sending children to formal school was that parents were dependent on their school-age children for herding animals and for undertaking other household tasks that were important for their survival. To overcome these difficulties, nomadic pastoralists had indicated that they wished to
have flexible education that took account of their children’s work in the homestead and the time needed for household chores rather than regular schools built a long distance from home. They also wanted to have teachers who understood the nomadic way of life and culture (Ezeomah, 2006:63-64).

There is also a view in some nomadic communities that formal education is antagonistic to their cultural, social and economic way of life as well as to their human environment (FFE, 2006:23). For complex social, cultural or political reasons, certain population groups find themselves excluded from mainstream society, a phenomenon often resulting in reduced access to formal education and literacy programmes (IIEP, 2005:21).

2.5.1.2. Critics on Formal Education

Formal education promotes a world view and a human environment derived essentially from the western historical context where it originally developed. Therefore it is more relevant to western culture and socio economic realities and is argued to threaten the integrity of pastoral society and its specific needs. The trouble is that it is difficult to establish western type of formal schooling to functional pastoralists (Carr-Hill and Peart, 2005:78-85).

Mere expansion of formal education provision, based on a model of what works in urban situations, is not enough to ensure that Education For All reaches nomadic and pastoralist children. Limited provision of static schooling, or projects which have focused on getting nomadic boys and girls to adapt to the formal system, have failed (OXFAM: 2005, 7).

The lack of relevance of formal schooling to the pastoralists generates a lack of interest and motivation, thereby causing low enrolment figures and high drop-out rates. This indicates that there is a need for a different curriculum – one that is designed to be relevant to nomadic life (FFE, 2006:23).

2.5.1.3. Characteristics for Success

According to Kratli (2001:7-8), few formal education programs that have performed with some degree of success in pastoralist areas are characterized by being:

- Delivered within a non antagonistic cultural environment and relying on a human interface strongly sympathetic to the nomadic culture
- Supported by effective law enforcement
• Free of charge
• Matched by pastoral development policies successful in decreasing labor intensity and also freeing children from the household’s labor demand
• Provided within an existing local education structure
• ‘planted’ into an existing pastoral support ideology

2.5.2. Non-Formal Education

Non Formal Education programs, though they have been misunderstood, are not substitute or parallel system to formal schools but rather an approach to complement formal education in order to achieve higher rate of education in society. Thus according to Coombs and Ahmed (1973), non-formal education can be defined as an organized, structured and systematic learning service delivered outside the framework of formal school system to a specific group (s) of people for a specific objective, at low cost in terms of both time and resources. Carton et al (as cited in Mammo, 2004) also defined NFE as a lifelong process by which every person acquires and accumulates knowledge, skills, attitudes and insights from daily experiences and exposure to the environment.

2.5.2.1. Types of Non Formal Education

Hopper (as cited by Befekadu, 2007:5-6) identified 7 types of NFE which are:
1. Para-formal education – for example evening classes, distance education,
2. Popular education- which often have political elements
3. Personal development- where courses are sold for direct consumption
4. Professional and vocational training- include all forms of in-service skills development
5. Literacy with skills development- is a combination of literacy and skills development
6. Supplementary NFE programs- provided to specific groups of disadvantaged children
7. Early childhood care and education- provided by parents or community groups in line with their traditions or insights to support early development.

2.5.2.2. Characteristics for Success

According Kratli (2001:8) successful non-formal basic education programs have the following common features:
• are delivered within a non antagonistic cultural environment and can rely on a human interface strongly sympathetic with the nomadic culture;
• are based on two way processes, that is, are highly flexible in structure and content and maintain such flexibility over time, in order to respond to changing needs;
• the informal settings of the school environment allow parents close surveillance over physical and moral security of children (especially girls),
• are willing to acknowledge social, economic and political hindrances of the rural community,
• Interface with existing government institutions for education and development (IIZ/DVV, 2005:155).

Hoppers (2006:91) also added the following factors among others
• Use of non professional instructional personnel
• Community involvement in the management of the schools
• Use of local languages of instruction
• Practice of ongoing teacher development and support.

Successful implementation of NFE depends on adoption of a strategic mechanism that would detect levels of responses of the pastoralists, rates and level of acceptance, analyze reasons for high or low levels of impact, create remedial and corrective actions to overcome disincentives, difficulties and obstacles if any, determine which conditions are present or lacking and in what degree, and create the necessary conditions as quickly as possible (Owiny, 2006:67).

2.5.3. Resemblance of Formal and Non-Formal Education
Over the last decades both formal and non formal education has been changing. While formal education is still the center of educational universe, in many countries it has lost to a greater or lesser extent its rigidity, central prescription of content and pedagogy and central administrative control. Whether by design or default, communities and local authorities have come more prominent in influencing the actual delivery of education, including interpretation of the curriculum. School staffs have gained more freedom of maneuver, if only because more of their resources come directly from the community. In some countries, the recruitment of staff itself has been decentralized. As a result, even
while administrative and financial boundaries continue to exist, de facto formal and non-formal education has come to resemble each other much more (Hooper, 2006:105).

2.5.4. Pastoralist’s choice

Experience in the non-formal sector indicates that interventions that respond to context and mobility patterns, can work. Appropriate modifications, such as adjusting the school calendar to ensure appropriate timing, or adapting the curriculum to ensure its relevance, are necessary. Pastoralist schooling also needs to be sensitive to issues of safe and accessible water supplies and food security, which have a huge impact on schooling opportunities for children in pastoralist zones. It is only when governments have made efforts to reach nomads and pastoralists in innovative ways that completion rates have improved (OXFAM: 2005, 7).

According to de Souza (2006:112), non-formal education appears to be more appealing to nomads than formal education because the courses can be more relevant, flexible and shorter, allowing for the domestic obligations particular to the nomadic lifestyle. However, although having an education may not be as prestigious as having herds of animals, both are being increasingly recognized as being important. Education for all is more likely to be achieved if girls and boys are not forced to choose between herding and schooling.

OXFAM (2005:3) asserts that it has to be understood when pastoralist and nomadic parents send their children to school, they do not want a substandard education, but one which is both the same as others receive, with the same certification, and is also relevant to their mobility, way of life, and knowledge.

2.6. THE CONCEPTS OF ALTERNATIVE BASIC EDUCATION

Alternative Basic Education refers to a system of learning which is characterized by flexibility, capacity to recognize and creatively utilize diversity, and transparency in terms of the degree of openness—open access, open learning, and limitless opportunities to release the creative potential of the learners (Befekadu:2007:7).

‘Alternative education’ is the over-arching term that refers to education programs that are not considered formal education programs. Often, but not exclusively, they are offered outside the auspices of the formal government education system. Alternative education,
in its strictest interpretation, includes programs that are not managed by the government but rather implemented by agencies and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) (IIIEP/UNESCO, 2009:2).

The IIIEP/UNESCO also identified that there are two main types of alternative education programs: The first deals with those that provide an alternative means of access to education. The second refers to an alternative in curriculum provision. Alternative access programs provide alternative methods of delivery to ‘fill the gap’ of education provision for children who are not enrolled in the formal system due to age, gender, ethnicity or geographical location. (IIIEP/UNESCO, 2009:2).

Alternative Basic Education is a type of school equivalency program for children ages 7-14, in which learners cover the equivalent of the first four grades of primary school in just 3 years, and are then able to transition into the formal system (Anis, 2007:5).

ABE program offers basic skills of reading, writing, arithmetic and basic knowledge in environmental science to out of school children. What makes the provision of ABEs for children important is the lack of formal schools at or close to where they live. Alternative basic education belongs to Para-formal education form of the Non-formal Education (NFE). Para-formal education includes all educational activities in between the formal programs that follow the highly organized, structured and full-time educational ladder (Ayalew et al, 2008:18).

Alternative Basic Education is characterized by low-cost construction, community contribution to construction and school management, inclusion of disadvantaged ethnic groups, gender and special needs groups, teaching in the local vernacular, selection of a facilitator from the local area, accelerated learning and active and learner-centered teaching methodologies and flexibility in delivery of education (Anis,2007:5).

In response to the education need of children, and youth, alternative Basic education programs have been initiated with majority being run by Non-Governmental Organizations, Faith Based organizations and community groups in some parts of the country both in rural and urban. These programs continue to play an effective role in meeting the basic learning needs of children who would otherwise miss out in the achievement of basic education. Therefore, these alternative Education programs are
crucial for increasing access as well as bridging gaps in the learning process (ECS, 2004:1-2).

There are challenges associated in the provision of ABE. Challenges such as inadequacy of finance, lack of ownership of the program by nomadic communities, infrastructural challenges such as lack of basic facilities and access to food and water, and lack of quality materials and of professional teachers who were sensitive to the culture of the nomads which in turn affect sustainability (Phillips, 2006:34). Others are concerned with quality. Teachers with only a few weeks of training do not perform as well as others who have been certified or upgraded (Anis et al, 2008:15). Other challenges, identified by the research conducted by Semera University (2009:99), are related to the linkage of ABE with the regular stream in Afar region. The research found out that even those very few (ABE students) who joined the regular system at grade five could not survive because of lack of basic academic knowledge and inability to communicate with the medium of instruction.

From a number of studies on alternative education, Aronson (1995) identified the following characteristics of successful alternative education programs:

A. Culture and Climate- willingness to participate in the program, focus on the students as a whole, and warm relationships among stakeholders

B. Organizational Structure- it has small sized schools and classrooms, relatively autonomous in decision making, and provides comprehensive programs.

C. Curriculum and Instruction- the program gives teachers flexibility in designing strategies and methods that work for the students.

2.7. OVERVIEW OF EDUCATION IN AFAR REGION

2.7.1. Land and People of Afar

The Afar Regional State is one of the nine National Regional States comprising the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, administratively divided into five Zones and 32 Woredas. It is located in the northeastern part of Ethiopia with a landmass of about 270,000 square kilometers and is inhabited by 1.7% of the national population according to the Central Statistics Agency (CSA 2008). Yet the Afar people are not merely confined to this boundary. Although the majority of the Afar people reside in Ethiopia, they are
also found in Eritrea and Djibouti. The Region consists mainly of lowland, with a predominately hot and dry semi-desert climate. The extreme case is Dalol at about 116 meters below sea level (JRM, 2005).

The Afar people speak a Cushitic language and are characterized as socio-culturally homogeneous. The population in Afar is unevenly distributed over the five Zones, with Zone one the highest population of 421,790 and Zone five with the lowest population of 183,701. The current census figures a total population in Afar of 1,411,092, with a rural population share of 86.6%. About 90.03% of the population in the Region is Afar, while the rest is a blend of people from different ethnic groups mainly called “highlanders” (CSA 2008).

2.7.2. Rationale of ABE in Afar

Inadequacies of the formal education to respond to the demand of basic education (relative to the needs and circumstances of clientele) necessitated the introduction of ABE. According to Semera University (2009:8), the following are considered as the main rationale for ABE:

- Low participation rate.
- Low cost – the need to reach more children with minimum cost.
- Enrollment disparity between urban and rural areas and between boys and girls.
- High dropout rates in the formal education sector.
- Distance of schools from settlement areas/natural barriers.
- The schedule and the time table of teaching learning is flexible to suit local needs.
- ABE activity promotes community participation and hence facilitate community take over.
- ABE reduces resource burden on the government.

2.7.3. The Current Status of Education in Afar Region

2.7.3.1. Access

The Afar region ranks lowest in Ethiopia on several measures of access to basic education. According to the MOE annual abstract (2007/08), the gross enrollment of primary schools (1-8) stands at 26.2% and the NER is 20.1%.
In Afar region ABE was introduced and recognized by the government since 1997 E.C. The program was intended mainly to expand access to basic education that is equivalent to the first cycle of formal primary education (grade 1-4) to the children through flexible alternative mode of delivery suited to the socio economic and cultural realities of the regions. In 2007/8, the number of ABEC has reached 303 as compared to 287 formal primary schools. From the total of 83018 children enrolled in the same year, ABE has contributed in teaching 24424 children (29.4%). This shows the significant role of ABE plays in the region (MOE ASA, 2009).

2.7.3.2. Equity

Gender Gap (GG) and Gender Parity Index (GPI) generally show gender inequalities in school participation. GG is the difference between the GER of boys and girls. The direction of gender disparity in enrolment can be indicated using the gender parity index (GPI), which is the ratio of female to male GER. In a situation of perfect equality GPI is 1, while 0 indicates the highest disparity.

Currently the GER for boys is 29% and 22.4% for girls. The Gender Gap (GG) and the Gender Parity Index (GPI) is 6.6 and 0.77 respectively in 2007/08, according to MOE annual abstract.

The rural urban disparity can also be used to measure equity. In urban areas a total of 14427 children and in rural areas 42297 children are enrolled in grade 1-8 primary schools.

2.7.3.3. Efficiency

Efficiency in education is related with economical usage of available time, human power, materials and finance. Problems related to efficiency are manifested in wastages in the education system mainly in the forms of school dropout and grade repetition (Semera University, 2009: 16).

By convention, a drop out or repetition rate exceeding three percent is usually regarded as a high rate. Accordingly, it can be clearly observed from the above table that over the last four years(1997-2000 E.C), almost all Woredas (under study) has had a trend of drop out rate that can generally be considered as very high (Semera University, 2009: 39).
TABLE 1- EDUCATION QUALITY INDICATORS (2007/2008)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PTR</th>
<th>PSR</th>
<th>% of qualified teachers 1-4</th>
<th>% of qualified teachers 5-8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afar region</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>71.3</td>
<td>36.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Average</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>97.3</td>
<td>66.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source- Semera University, 2009

2.7.3.5. Challenges

According to the report by Save the Children Norway-Ethiopia (2008:4), the key challenges the Afar REB has been facing in providing education are related to the problems of increasing access to primary education for the pastoralist boys and girls, improving quality and improving regional, district and school level educational planning and management.
The major reasons for drop out as explained by facilitators, supervisors and parents during the study are:

- **Frequent mobility:** as parents seasonally move in search of pasture and water, children are forced to follow.

- **Child labor:** many children are forced to work as wage laborers in the nearby large farms in order to support their family economically. This more acute during the harvest time and many quit schools. Children are also very much engaged with domestic chores. Girls fetch water from distant places, look after kids at home and perform other similar activities leaving them with no time to school. Boys are usually responsible to look after goats and camels.

- **Early marriage:** According to the Woreda ABE supervisors and Facilitators early marriage counts as one cause for the high drop out of girl students from the centers (Semera University, 2009: 92-93).

2.7.3.4. Quality

Other things being equal, the success of teaching and learning is likely to be influenced by the resources made available to support the process and the direct ways these resources are managed. It is obvious that schools without teachers, textbooks or learning materials will not be able to do all effective job. In that sense, resources are important for learning quality. Inputs are enabling in that they underpin and intrinsically related to teaching and learning process which in turn affect the range and type of inputs used and how effectively they are employed. The main important variables are materials and human resources (Carr-Hill, 2005:36)

The quality of the primary education has also been examined in terms of the qualification and some other related general characteristics of the teaching staff. The following table examines the quality of education in Afar region as compared to the national average in 2007/08.
TABLE 1- EDUCATION QUALITY INDICATORS (2007/2008)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PTR</th>
<th>PSR</th>
<th>% of qualified Teachers 1-4</th>
<th>% of qualified Teachers 5-8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afar region</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>71.3</td>
<td>36.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Average</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>97.3</td>
<td>66.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source- Semera University, 2009*

2.7.3.5. Challenges

According to the report by Save the Children Norway-Ethiopia (2008:4), the key challenges the Afar REB has been facing in providing education are related to the problems of increasing access to primary education for the pastoralist boys and girls, improving quality and improving regional, district and school level educational planning and management.
CHAPTER THREE
RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

3.1. THE RESEARCH METHOD
The study employed qualitative and quantitative approaches. These methods were used to collect and analyze the variables related to the indicators of performance.

3.2. DATA SOURCES
Both primary and secondary data were the sources of the study. Primary data was gathered using interview, questionnaires, focus group discussions with the community, and observation of the situations in the sample centers.

The sources of primary data were:

- REB officials (bureau head, department heads and team leaders) and planning experts and NFE coordinators,
- WEO officials (office heads and desk heads) and supervisors,
- ABE facilitators,
- Concerned MOE experts,
- Discussion with the community members around the centers,
- Observation of ABE center environments,

The sources of secondary data were reports, abstracts, studies and newsletters from REB, MOE, local NGOs and international organizations obtained from researcher’s own collection, AAU library and internet sites.

3.3. SAMPLING TECHNIQUE AND SAMPLING POPULATION
Afar region has 32 Woredas. The sample for this study consisted of six Woredas which were selected using simple random sampling method. Accordingly, Ayssaita, Mille, Addar, Ewa, Dewe and Awash Woredas were chosen using simple random sampling technique. From these Woredas, 11 ABE centers (14.3% of the total 77 ABE centers in the sample Woredas) were randomly selected by giving a quota for each Woreda based on the assumption that these much centers represent the sample Woredas from own experience and advice from REB experts. Random sampling method is chosen because it gives equal chances for all Woredas to be included in the sample.
TABLE 2- DESCRIPTION OF THE SAMPLE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>SAMPLE</th>
<th>TOTAL No of ABECs</th>
<th>SAMPLE ABECs</th>
<th>NO. OF RESPONDENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>REB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Bureau Head</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Department Heads</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Team leaders</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Primary Education Expert</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>ABE Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>WEO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Office Heads</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Desk heads</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Supervisors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Facilitators</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Ayssaita</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Mille</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Addar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Ewa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Dewe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Awash</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>MOE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Community Members</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>ABE centers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Ayssaita</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Mille</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Addar</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Ewa</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Dewe</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Awash</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The respondents from REB, MOE and WEO (from the randomly selected Woreda) were deliberately chosen by considering their possible knowledge on the areas of ABE due to the positions they held in their respective offices.

Department heads, team leaders, concerned planning expert and ABE coordinator were chosen to respond from the REB. WEO heads, education program desk heads, education support desk heads and supervisors were participated in the study from WEO.

All the facilitators teaching at the randomly selected ABE centers were incorporated in the study. Community members who reside near the sample ABE centers and who were also willing to take part in the discussion were invited to participate.

3.4. INSTRUMENT AND PROCEDURES OF DATA COLLECTION

The research instruments employed for the data collection are listed and explained below.

- **Questionnaires** - Both open ended and closed ended questionnaires were prepared to collect data from REB and WEO staffs, concerned MOE experts and facilitators. The same questionnaire (annex 1) was applied for REB and WEO experts to collect information mainly on the appropriateness of delivery modes, impact of ABEs on girl’s enrollment and dropout rate, relevance of curriculum and other main quality issues and problems assuming the respondents have almost the same knowledge on the issues raised. MOE respondents use questionnaire (Annex 3) to respond to the same issues but from the policy perspective of the MOE. Facilitators take part in the study by responding to the questionnaire annex 2. They responded mainly to questions related to proximity of ABE centers to the pastoralists, willingness of parents for girl’s education, ease of using mother tongue language, calendar flexibility, availability of teachers housing and other educational inputs.

- **Interview** - structured interviews were used for REB and WEO officials (bureau and office heads) to find out mainly the problems related to access and quality and the respective solutions recommended. Additional interviews were conducted to the department heads to further explain the findings obtained from the questionnaires.

- **Focus group discussions** - were conducted for the community members residing near ABE centers. The points of discussions were arranged in advance (annex 5). The participants were asked to discuss about and respond to issues related mainly to
their willingness for girl's education, season and reasons for migration and dropout. All the participants in the focus group discussion were Afar natives where 5 out of the total of 39 participants were female.

- Document analysis—relevant documents such as: reports and abstracts of REB and MOE, studies of researchers, studies, reports and newsletters of NGOs and international organizations were also reviewed.
- Observation of the ABE centers—A checklist was prepared to collect data on the availability of educational materials, condition of ABE centers and the surrounding environment related to the subject of the study.

3.5. PILOT TEST
In order to avoid unclear statements and ambiguity, the draft questionnaire was tested in Ayssaita woreda. Based on the results from the test, improvements on the language used and relevance of question to the respondents were made.

3.6. METHOD OF DATA ANALYSIS
The data analysis was made by clustering and tabulating the responses to each of the questions presented on the questionnaires by various respondents. Then frequency of responses and the respective percentages, the mean and standard deviation for each table was drawn.
- Statistical tools—tools employed to analyze the collected data were the frequency and percentage distribution of responses in order to compare the number and weight of responses. Mean rank and standard deviation were also used to identify the average responses obtained and the distribution of responses from the mean value respectively. The ratings on the questionnaires were given weight of 5 for strong agreement and 1 for strong disagreement.
- Textual Analysis—is used in the interpretation of data obtained from the data collection instruments and documents.
CHAPTER FOUR

PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF DATA

This part of the study deals with the presentation and analysis of data gathered through the data collection instruments which are questionnaires, interviews, focus group discussions and observation. The data obtained from the instruments were predominantly individual responses of the MOE experts, REB and WEO heads, department and desk heads, and experts. Other data are obtained from the facilitators and community members who are settled near the ABE centers. Out of the total 49 questionnaires distributed only three (6.1%) were not collected.

The research questions concentrate on:

- Assessing the major gains obtained from the introduction of ABE in terms of ensuring access to the pastoralists.
- Examine the level of equity and efficiency of ABE.
- Explore the extent to which relevant curriculum is in place for the pastoralists.
- Identify the level of quality maintained in ABE.

4.1. CHARACTERISTICS OF RESPONDENTS

The respondents involved in this study consist of bureau head, department heads, team leaders and experts from Regional Education Bureau; Office heads, desk heads and supervisors from Woreda Education Office; ABE facilitators; community members living near the ABE centers. Two concerned experts from the MOE have also been participated.

As shown in table 3, more male REB and WEO respondents (91.7%) were participated in the study than females (8.3%). Only 2 female facilitators, 1 WEO head and 5 community members happened to be female respondents. The findings here reveals that the position of REB and WEO heads and experts were male dominated.

According to their profile, most of the REB and WEO respondents were married (75 %) as compared to the 25% single respondents. While all facilitators participated were single. When we look at the education level, 54% of the respondents from REB and WEO have diploma. 12.5% and 16.7% of the respondents were degree and MSC holders respectively. This shows that the REB and WEO have relatively better personnel who can carry out their duties in terms of their qualifications.
Although the minimum countrywide qualification for facilitators is grade 10, the findings show that facilitators' educational level was concentrated at grade 6-8 (85%) with the average (mean) education level of grade 7, and standard deviation (SD) of 1.28. This casts doubts whether they are able enough to teach the children. The rest of 15% of facilitators were between grades 9-10.

Looking at the work experience of the respondents, 41.6%, 12.6%, 33.3%, and 12.5% of the REB and WEO staffs have a range of 1-3 years, 4-6 years, 7-10 years and above 10 years of work experience. The majority of facilitators (80%) have an experience of between 1 and 3 years with a mean value of 2.75 and standard deviation of 1.29. This can lead to a conclusion that most facilitators are relatively inexperienced and may also raise questions on the quality of education provided to children.

**TABLE 3- CHARACTERISTICS OF RESPONDANTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>CHARACTERISTICS OF RESPONDANTS</th>
<th>REB and WEO</th>
<th>FACILITATORS</th>
<th>MOE</th>
<th>COMMUNITY MEMBERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>SEX</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>91.7</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>MARITAL STATUS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>EDUCATION LEVEL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Less than grade 6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Grade 6-8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Grade 9-10 +</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Grade 11-12+</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>diploma</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>54</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>MSC</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>WORK EXPERIENCE ON CURRENT JOB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>1-3 years</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>41.6</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>4-6 years</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>7-10 Years</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Above 10 years</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2. ASSESSING THE MAJOR GAINS FROM ABE

The first research question deals with assessing the major gains obtained from the introduction of ABE. Before going to assess the contributions of ABE in terms of access, it is important to find out whether ABE is accepted by the pastoralist population as an appropriate mode of delivery.

4.2.1. Education Delivery Modes

With the view to fit the provision of education to the life style and existing situation of the region, different modes of deliveries are being practiced in the Afar region. Namely: formal schools, boarding schools, hostess to peripheral pastoralists' children, mobile schools and ABEs.

Questions were presented in the questionnaire to the respondents in order to find out which delivery modes are the most appropriate for the Afar pastoralists.

**TABLE 4 - APPROPRIATE EDUCATION DELIVERY MODES FOR PASTORALIST CHILDREN**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>DELIVERY MODE</th>
<th>RESPONDANTS REB/WEO/MOE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>FREQUENCY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Formal school</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Boarding school</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>ABE</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the data presented in table 4, the majority of responses from REB,WEO and MOE (77%) shows that ABE is the most appropriate delivery mode of education to the pastoralists. Some others choose delivery modes like boarding school (15.3 %), and formal schools (7.7%).

The result reveals the majority of REB, WEO and MOE respondents found ABE to be a better option for pastoralists. In an effort to find out why the respondents chose the respective modes of deliveries, they were asked to present their respective reasons.
The results on table-4 reveal that ABE is chosen for its relative advantage on ease of access (41.5%) and its application of local language of instruction (37.5%), according to the REB and WEO respondents. The underlying reason of those who choose formal education was its quality of education and input availability. While boarding schools were favoured by 3 REB and WEO respondents for the quality of education provided (4.2%), ease of access (4.2%) and educational input availability (4.2%). One of the MOE respondents suggest boarding school for its available inputs and the other chose ABE for the use of local language.

Out of the total of 26 respondents, 20 of them (19 REB and WEO staffs and 1 MOE expert) favored ABE to be an appropriate modes of delivery. This leads to a conclusion that, ABE is the most appropriate mode of delivery for the pastoralist people of Afar for its advantage over ease of access and local language of instruction.

It's worth to notice on the above table that flexibility of school calendar was not chosen by the respondents as one of the advantages of ABE. Further examination of the issue reveals that according to the ABE strategy, the schedule and time table of teaching and learning is flexible to suit the local needs. But observation of the researcher and the interview made to the ABE facilitators revealed that all ABE centers which were visited during the study have been working in the predetermined time schedule and calendar as of formal schools.
4.2.2. Access Gains

Recognizing the contributions of NFE to achieve UPE by 2015 and from lessons and achievements gained in the implementation of ESDP II, ESDP III included the NFE program in a more elaborated and greater emphasis. The document states that:

- To increase access to basic primary education, alternative approaches such as low cost schools, one classroom school, multi-grade classroom schools, etc. for first cycle primary schools will be encouraged.
- A stronger and wider role for non-formal education and other alternatives for the expansion of primary education will be implemented. Therefore, alternative basic education and functional adult literacy programs shall be expanded (Ayalew et al, 2008:33).

In Afar region the ABE program was intended mainly to expand access to basic education that is equivalent to the first cycle of formal primary education (grade 1-4) to the children through flexible alternative mode of delivery suited to the socio economic and cultural realities of the regions (MOE ASA, 2009).

It has been six years since the establishment of ABE in Afar region, “Does the establishment of ABE impact the pastoralists?” was the next question that should be answered.

**TABLE 6- RATING THE MEAN IMPACT OF ABE ON THE PASTORALISTS INTERMS OF ACCESS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>RESPONDENTS</th>
<th>VERY STRONG</th>
<th>STRONG</th>
<th>MODERATE</th>
<th>WEAK</th>
<th>VERY WEAK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NO %</td>
<td>NO %</td>
<td>NO %</td>
<td>NO %</td>
<td>NO %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MOE/ REB/WEO</td>
<td>6 25</td>
<td>14 54.2</td>
<td>4 12.5</td>
<td>2 8.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>FACILITATORS</td>
<td>6 30</td>
<td>14 70</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>12 28</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to table 6, out of 46 respondents, 40 of them agree that ABE impacted the pastoralist children in terms of access. The mean (average) response for the MOE, REB and WEO respondents were 3.96 with a standard deviation of 1.16. This shows that most of the respondents think ABE strongly impacted the pastoralists and the important role ABE is playing in providing the opportunity of education to the pastoralist children.
In an attempt to further examine the impact that ABE have brought in terms of access, let us see the regional enrollment data for 1998 up to 2001 E.C. on table 7.

TABLE 7 - ENROLLMENT OF PRIMARY EDUCATION (GRADE 1-8) IN AFAR REGION FOR THE YEAR 2005/6-2008/09.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>2005/06</th>
<th>2006/07</th>
<th>2007/08</th>
<th>2008/09</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REGULAR</td>
<td>30171</td>
<td>18741</td>
<td>48912</td>
<td>34149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABE</td>
<td>10868</td>
<td>5222</td>
<td>16090</td>
<td>15770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GER (%)</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>35.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% OF CONTRIBUTION OF ABE TO PRIMARY EDUCATION</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>27.8</td>
<td>32.9</td>
<td>46.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


According to the planning head of the region, before the introduction of ABE the regional enrollment rate has been growing from 1% to 3% per annum. After ABE was launched in 2005/06, it grew at an average of 5% per year. As depicted on table 7, the contribution of ABE to the overall enrollment was 32.9%, 42.4%, 41.6% and 42.6% between 2005/06 and 2008/09. We can infer from the data the importance of ABE in creating access to the pastoralist children. Those pastoralist children would have no access to basic education had the ABE not been established in their areas.

4.2.3. Location of ABECs

One of the reasons to launch ABE is its low cost of construction resulting in the establishment of ABE centers in remote areas where the community resides.

In order to test how near the ABE centers are actually located to the community, facilitators were asked whether the centers are located near the beneficiaries. The results of the question are summarized on table 8 below.

TABLE 8- NEARNESS OF ABE CENTERS TO THE COMMUNITY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>RESPONDENTS</th>
<th>RATE OF RESPONSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VERY NEAR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FACILITATORS</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As depicted on table 8, almost all ABE centers were established near to the community. In fact 85% of the visited centers were located very near to the community. This shows that ABE is located deep in to hard to reach pastoralist areas of the region. Observation of the researcher also confirmed that most of the visited centers have “Afar Ari” - the traditional home of Afar, around it.

4.2.4. Access Problems

We have seen on table 7 that the gross enrolment rate of the region reached 40.1% in 2008/09 (REB: 2008/09). We have also found out in the study that ABE was the most appropriate mode of delivering education and that it is located near the Afar pastoralists. Let us first see whether there is a demand for education in the first place.

**TABLE 9— DATA OF SAMPLE WOREDAS (REGULAR AND ABEs) IN 2008/09.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SAMPLE WOREDAS</th>
<th>NO OF SCHOOLS</th>
<th>NO OF ABE CENTERS</th>
<th>REGULAR</th>
<th>ABE</th>
<th>GER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWASH</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2209</td>
<td>2094</td>
<td>4303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEWE</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1013</td>
<td>619</td>
<td>1632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EWA</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>645</td>
<td>609</td>
<td>1254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AYSSAITA</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>2964</td>
<td>2070</td>
<td>5034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADDAR</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>515</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MILLE</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1312</td>
<td>855</td>
<td>2167</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The data which was obtained from REB shows that the GER for Awash woreda reached 97%. For the other woredas, less than half of the school aged children are out of school in Ewa and Ayssaita. Only less than a quarter of school aged children are enrolled in Mille and Dewe woredas in 2008/09. This shows that there is a huge demand for education in Afar region as a considerable number of children are still out of school.

Then, what is the reason for the other children not to go to school in the region after all? The study further tried to identify the underlying reasons for the low enrolment in the region. Table 10 summarized the results of the responses of the REB and MOE staffs.
TABLE 10– MAJOR PROBLEMS THAT DENIED PASTORALISTS ACCESS TO ABE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>MAJOR PROBLEMS</th>
<th>REB/WEO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Mobility of pastoralists</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Conflict</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Absence of schools</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Lack of awareness</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Demand for child labour</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Cultural problem</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One of the major problems that denied pastoralists access to ABE was found to be mobility of pastoralists in search of water and pasture for their cattle, according to 58% of REB and WEO respondents. Attitudinal and cultural factors were also mentioned by some of the respondents.

In this regard, interviews with REB and WEO heads and focus group discussions conducted with the community members revealed the general pattern of pastoralist mobility. Pastoralists usually move to neighbouring areas during drought seasons or when the level of water contained in the fields dry out. Other pastoralists also move when it rains in other places. For example, pastoralists in Ayssaita, Mille and Addar Woredas move to zone 4 (Teru, Ewa and Chifra woredas) when it rains there. They stay in zone 4 for three months (June-August).

4.3. EQUITY and EFFICIENCY ISSUES

The second research question deals with examining the level of equity and efficiency of education achieved in ABEs.

4.3.1. Equity issues

Gender parity is one of the problems that need to be addressed in the education system of the country. The international community has been committed to achieve the EFA and MDGs during the time frame set for each goal. The target set regarding gender was “to eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005, and at all levels of education no later than 2015” (UNESCO, 2000:17). Although Ethiopia is one of the signatory countries, it could not close gender gap at primary level according to the time frame. The situation is worse in Afar region. The gender parity index in 2008/9 is 0.77 in as compared to the national level of 0.90 (Annual Abstract, 2009:28).
In order to find out the attitude of REB and WEO staffs, question were asked “does ABE create opportunity for girl’s education?”

### TABLE 11- DOES ABE CREATE OPPORTUNITY FOR GIRL’S EDUCATION?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>N=26</th>
<th>MEAN</th>
<th>STANDARD DEVIATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MOE/ REB/WEO</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to table 11, the average value for the responses is 3.96 with a standard deviation of 1.3, which means on average respondents choose the rate “I agree” for the above question.

We can conclude from the above table that the majority of the respondents agree that the ABE has created an opportunity for girl’s education in Afar region due to its locational proximity to the pastoralist areas. Earlier long distance to school was the major reason usually mentioned by parents as an excuse for not sending their daughters to school for safety concerns. Now ABEs are established nearer to the communities (villages) that it is easier and safe for girls to get education. Further examination of regional data shows low girl’s enrolment. According to table 7, in 2008/09 girl’s enrolment in ABEs was 11644 as compared to 21056 boys, which accounts for a little less than half of the boys. This trend is evident in almost every year. During the same year, girl’s enrolment was 30644 as compared to 46141 boys (66% of boys). If ABE created favourable conditions for girl’s education, then why is the GER for girls still low? In order to identify the underlying drawbacks, looking at the parent’s willingness for girl’s education is given priority in the study. Since facilitators are responsible for lobbying the parents to bring the children to school, facilitators were asked about parent’s willingness. The resulting responses are depicted on table 12.

### TABLE 12 – WILLINGNESS FOR GIRLS EDUCATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>RESPONDENTS</th>
<th>RATE OF RESPONSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>FACILITATORS</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The result on table 12 shows that 13 facilitators (65%) responded that parents would like to send girls to school. This finding was supported by the focus group discussion undertaken with the community members. Moreover, for parents sending one or more of their children to school is seen as a potential path leading to employment in the formal sector. The rest of respondents (35%) mentioned parent’s unwillingness to send their daughters to school.

Looking at the justifications of the unwilling parents, it can be seen in table 13 that 42.8% of the facilitators mentioned that parents usually prefer to send their daughters to Quranic schools (madrassa).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>JUSTIFICATION</th>
<th>NO. OF RESPONDENTS</th>
<th>% OF RESPONDENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>House hold labour demand</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Long distance to school</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Cultural problems</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Preference for Quranic school</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>42.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Preference to send boys</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Household labour demand (28.6%) and preference for boy’s education (14.3%) were also considerable drawbacks cited by the facilitators for denying girls access to education.

The result of focal group discussion shows that all parents mentioned their willingness for girl’s education. But it is also observed that participants in the focal group discussion do not want to show their refusal for girls education openly may be due to frequent campaign for girl’s education by the REB and NGO’s.

Absence of enough female role models is also observed by the researcher. The characteristics of the respondents reveal that only 2 female facilitators are found out of a total of 20.

4.3.2. Internal Efficiency

Internal efficiency refers to the measurement of performance with in the education system. One of the research questions was concerned with assessing the contribution of ABE in reducing the high dropout rate in Afar region. In this section one of the internal efficiency issues, dropout rate, will be dealt.
4.3.2.1 Dropout Rates

One of the reasons for the introduction of ABE is the concern for the high dropout rate in formal schools. The underlying assumption was that ABE centers are located near to the community and also have flexible calendars that drop out will be reduced significantly. In order to find out whether ABE has contributed to the reduction of dropout rate among the pastoralists, the questionnaire incorporated a question “has ABE helped to reduce dropout rate?”

**TABLE 14- CONTRIBUTION OF ABE IN REDUCING DROPouts**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>n=26</th>
<th>MEAN</th>
<th>STANDARD DEVIATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>MOE/ REB/WEO</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>1.313</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown on table 14, REB, WEO and MOE staffs responded with the mean value of 3.38 and a standard deviation from the mean value at 1.313 showing that the average respondent chose the rate “I agree” for the above question posed.

Respondents who disagreed to the above question were also asked to specify why they think ABE could not reduce dropouts. Their responses were summarized on table 15.

**TABLE 15 - REASONS FOR DROP OUTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>REASONS</th>
<th>NO. OF FACILITATORS</th>
<th>% OF FACILITATORS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Drought</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>62.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Disease</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>37.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Other reasons</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the table above, students’ retention rate, especially during the dry season is very low. 5 of facilitators mentioned drought as a major reason for the pastoralist children to leave school. The rest of respondents believe that illness of children caused them to quit.

**4.4. RELEVANCE OF ABE CURRICULUM**

The third research question deals with exploring the relevance of the curriculum. The issue of relevance of curriculum in ABE always stresses pastoralists. This is a crucial matter in any education provision especially to the pastoralists. According to Owiny (2006:130), learning experiences should be modified to match the pastoralists’ background, interest, aspirations and lifestyles.
4.4.1. Substitutability of ABE to Formal Schools

Even though the curriculum should take the pastoralist life in to consideration, ABE should still be able to provide them knowledge that is equivalent to the education given in formal schools.

In order to find out the substitutability of ABE and formal education, the questionnaire incorporated questions that rate the responses of REB and WEO staffs and MOE experts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>n=26</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>REB/WEO</td>
<td>2.75</td>
<td>1.327</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The respondents from REB and WEO who were asked to answer whether the curriculum of level 1-3 of ABE can be a substitute to that of the formal grade 1-4 responded with the mean value of 2.75 with a standard deviation of 1.327.

The results of the study show that most (14 or 58.3%) of the REB and WEO respondents answered "I do not know". 10 out of 24 of the REB and WEO respondents do not think it is substitutable. But all of the respondents from MOE agreed that ABE's curriculum is substitute to the formal school curriculum. Literature supports the responses of the MOE respondents. According to Ayalew et al (2008:22), the ABE curriculum is organized as follows. The content of formal education, which is delivered in Grade 1, and some of the contents for Grade 2 are included in level 1. Similarly, the contents of formal education from Grade 2, which is left over from level 1, and some of the contents of grade 3 are taught in level 2. Finally, some of the contents for Grade 3 and all of the contents in Grade 4 are made to be embraced in level 3 in the ABE program.

In an attempt to find out why 10 out of the 24 REB and WEO respondents said ABE curriculum is not substitutable to formal curriculum, they were asked to present their reasons.
TABLE 17 - REASONS WHY THE CURRICULUM OF ABE CONSIDERED NOT SUBSTITUTABLE TO FORMAL EDUCATION?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>FACTORS</th>
<th>RESPONDENTS OF REB/WEO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Type of subjects given</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Contents of text books</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Length of time in schools</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Relevance of curriculum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Qualification of teachers</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We can see from table 17 that the underlying reasons why the respondents think that ABE curriculum is not substitutable to the formal curriculum was not actually from the points of view of relevance, contents of text book or the type of subjects given in the ABEs. The main reason was the length of time spent by the children in the centres. Low qualification of teachers was mentioned by 30% of the respondents. These factors mentioned by the respondents do not actually make the ABE curriculum inferior.

We can conclude from the responses on the above table that the curriculum of ABE is substitutable to the formal curriculum.

4.4.2. Language of Instruction

The use of mother tongue language serves as a medium of instruction at primary level. In addition it has been considered to be instrumental to develop self-reliance and psychological motivation, and retain social and cultural values as well as "retain self identity" (IBE, 2001:14). It is found important to rate the level of ease of adopting mother tongue as a medium of instruction.

TABLE 18 - EASE OF USING OF MOTHER TONGUE LANGUAGE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>RESPONDENTS</th>
<th>RATE OF RESPONSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ease of using mother tongue language for the facilitators</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ease of using mother tongue language for the students</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most of the facilitators who were asked replied that the use of Afar language for instruction is easier for the facilitators as well as for the students. Therefore it can be
concluded that use of mother tongue as media of instruction, has proved to be successful in ease of communication for both the facilitators and the students.

It has to be noted here that the medium of instruction is not in mother tongue language (Afar aff) in formal schools.

4.5. QUALITY ISSUES

The fourth research question is set to explore the quality of education in ABE centers. The ABE program was started in order to expand access to primary education. Expanding educational opportunities to the children in the pastoralist areas was one of the pressing factors which necessitate the introduction of ABE program in the region. There is now a growing concern about the need to improve the quality of basic education provided in the ABE centers. In this part of the study, quality issues which are related to supervision, in-service trainings, educational inputs, quality problems, educational qualification of facilitators and competition are examined.

4.5.1. Supervision

The higher the frequencies of supervision, the quicker problems are identified and the faster corrective measures are taken. Keeping this in mind, respondents were asked about the frequency of supervision made to the ABE centres.

**TABLE 19- FREQUENCY OF SUPERVISION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>RESPONDANTS</th>
<th>FREQUENCY OF SUPERVISION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>ANNUALLY</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>NO</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>REB / WEO</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Facilitators</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to 55% of REB and WEO staffs responded that supervision is made 3 times a year. Interview results of WEO heads confirmed that supervision is made usually at the beginning, in the middle and at the end of the school calendar. According to the Education Programme and Supervision Department of REB, bi-annual supervision is made by the REB, at the beginning and at the end of school calendar.

Once supervision is made, it is important that the results of supervision be analysed and corrective measures be taken. In addition to responding to drawbacks on the spot, the results can also be used to base annual plans of the REB and WEOs. Questions are
incorporated in the questionnaire to see whether supervision outcomes are taken into account during planning.

**TABLE 20- Basing Annual Plans on Supervision Results**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>RESPONDENTS</th>
<th>NO</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>NO</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>NO</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>NO</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>NO</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>REB/WEO</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>41.7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown on table 20, 66.7% of respondents agree that supervision is considered during planning. 16.7% does not agree and the rest of 16.7% do not know about it.

**4.5.2. In-Service Trainings**

In order to keep the quality of education given in ABEs, pre-service and in-service trainings should be given regularly.

Almost all of the facilitators who were asked replied that in-service trainings are not enough for them to teach properly.

**TABLE 21 – Frequency of In-Service Trainings**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>FACTORS</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>One time</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2 times</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>More than 2 times</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>No trainings at all</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to table 21, most of the sample facilitators take in-service trainings for only one time. 20% of the respondents did not even take in-service trainings at all.

**4.5.3 Educational Inputs**

The other quality issue is availability of educational materials. Lack of furniture, instructional materials and a learning environment is very demotivating and destructive to facilitators and unattractive to learners. During the field visit, the researcher observed that text books and facilitator guides are available at 1:2 ratios. Other inputs like combined desks are not available. Students sit on stones and wood in a child unfriendly environment. Even the compounds of the centres are not fenced and have no separate latrines. In 2 of the sample ABE centres in Addaar and Ewa Woredas, which are funded by Save the Children Norway, combined desks and separate latrines are provided.
4.5.4. Quality Problems

REB and WEO staffs were asked to identify quality problems of ABEs. Their responses were depicted on table 22.

**TABLE 22– MOST FREQUENTLY IDENTIFIED QUALITY PROBLEMS OF ABE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>MAJOR PROBLEMS</th>
<th>MOE/REB/WEO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Absence of inputs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Facilitator's motivation</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Inadequate qualification of facilitators</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Absenteeism</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Lack of supervision</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>High Drop out</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>26</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the above table, almost 46% of respondents mentioned inadequate qualification of facilitators, 20.8% absence of inputs, 8.4% facilitator's motivation and 12.5% see lack of supervisions as quality problems.

The majority of respondents sought inadequate qualification of facilitators and lack of inputs as a major problems faced in ABEs.

4.5.5- Educational Qualification

One of the major indicators of the quality of education is the motivation and morale of the teaching force. The majority of the interviewed facilitators mentioned a feeling of being under-paid and neglected.

According to an interview made with the REB head, the minimum educational qualification of facilitators to be recruited in ABE centres is grade 6. But the MOE guidelines set the minimum level at grade 10. It is difficult to find grade 10 completers who are willing to serve as facilitators. It is considered unattractive and challenging. Once an Afar Youngman reaches this level it is not very hard to get recruited at WEOs or continue education and training in other sectors like health, water and agriculture. Many of them became facilitators because they didn’t have any other training or employment options.
4.5.6- Enhancing Competition

Questions were included in the questionnaire requiring respondents to site those areas that should be enhanced in order to bring fair competitive atmosphere between ABE completers and formal grade 4 completers in grade 5.

TABLE 23- ENHANCING COMPETITION AMONG ABE AND REGULAR STUDENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>FACTORS</th>
<th>RESPONDENTS OF REB/WEO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Changing the ABE curriculum</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Provide educational materials</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>More supervision</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Increasing education qualification of facilitators</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Provide more training for the facilitators</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Other (combination of the above factors)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In order to enhance competition among ABE and regular students in grade 5, respondents of REB and WEO cited increasing educational qualification of facilitators (25%), more supervision (20.8%), changing the ABE curriculum (16.6%), provide more training for the facilitators (12.8%) and provide educational materials (12.5%) as a remedial action.
CHAPTER FIVE
SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In Afar region ABE was introduced and recognized by the government since 2005. The program was intended mainly to expand access to basic education that is equivalent to the first cycle of formal primary education (grade 1-4) to the children through flexible alternative mode of delivery suited to the socio economic and cultural realities of the regions. The main purpose of the study, therefore, was to assess the major contribution of alternative basic education to primary education in the Afar region.

In an attempt to fulfill the purpose, the research was lead by 4 basic questions. The first research question was concerned with finding out the main contributions of ABE in terms of access. The second question dealt with examining the level of equity and efficiency of ABE. The third question focused on exploring the extent to which relevant curriculum is in place for the pastoralists. The fourth question tries to identify the level of quality maintained in ABE.

The study was conducted in six randomly selected Woredas of Ayssaita, Mille, Addar, Ewa, Dewe and Awash. A total of 90 respondents were involved in the study. Respondents include REB (1 bureau head, and 5 staffs), WEO (5 office heads and 18 staffs), 20 facilitators, 2 MOE experts and 39 community members.

5.1. SUMMARY OF MAJOR FINDINGS

5.1.1. DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS OF RESPONDENTS

The REB, WEO and facilitators were male dominated. Most of the REB and WEO staffs were married. But all of the facilitators are single. The REB, WEO have relatively qualified personnel who can carry out their duties in terms of their qualifications. Although the minimum countrywide qualification for facilitators is grade 10, the findings show that the majority of facilitators’ educational level is concentrated at grade 6-8 and 1-3 years of experience leading to a conclusion that most facilitators are relatively inexperienced and may also cast a doubt on the quality of education provided to children.
5.1.2. MAJOR GAINS FROM THE ABE PROGRAM

5.1.2.1- Modes of Delivering Education

An appropriate form of education delivery mode should be chosen which should take consideration of low enrolment among pastoralists and the integration of pastoralist children within their own settings and structures. ABE was the most appropriate delivery mode of education to the pastoralists because of reasons such as ease of access, use of local language and calendar flexibility.

5.1.2.2- Access Gains

- ABE have strong and positive impact on the pastoralist children in creating access to education. In 2001 E.C., from the total of 109485 children enrolled in the same year, ABE has contributed in teaching 32700 children which means 42% the total students in the region are enrolled in ABE centers.
- Those children would have no access to basic education had the ABE been not established in their areas.
- ABE played important role in ensuring education to the hard to reach pastoralist remote areas of the region.
- Almost all of the sample centers in the region are established closer to the surrounding communities.
- One of the major problems that denied pastoralists access to ABE is found to be mobility of pastoralists in search of water and pasture for their cattle. Attitudinal and cultural factors and their great attachment to cattle were also noted as hampering children to go to school.

5.1.3. EQUITY ISSUES

- ABE has created an opportunity for girl’s education in Afar region due to its locational proximity to the pastoralist areas.
- But the GER of girl students accounts for half of that of boy’s number in 2001 E.C.
- Even though most of the parents who are part of the focus group discussion expressed willingness, facilitators think that parents would prefer to send their daughters to Madrassas and the boys to school.
- The number of female facilitators that serve as role models are limited.
5.1.4. INTERNAL EFFICIENCY

- One of the reasons for the introduction of ABE in the region is the concern for the high dropout rate in formal schools. The assumption was that ABE centers are located near to the community and also have flexible calendars that drop out will be reduced significantly it is still high in the region.
- The root cause of students to dropout from the ABE centers is found to be drought. Illness of children is also identified as another factor for children causing them to quit.

5.1.5. RELEVANCE ISSUES

5.1.5.1- Curriculum

- The contents of the formal curriculum, which is meant for four years, are shortened to be covered in three years.
- Although, most of the REB and WEO respondents do not know whether the ABE curriculum is substitutable to the formal school curriculum, MOE respondents and literature confirmed the substitutability of both curriculums. The reasons for those who do not agree was related to the length of time spent in schools and low qualification of facilitators.

5.1.5.2- Language of Instruction

- All of the facilitators who responded confirmed that using Afar language in ABE centres makes it easier for them and the children to communicate in the class.

5.1.6. QUALITY ISSUES

- Expanding educational opportunities for children in the pastoralist areas was one of the pressing factors which necessitate the introduction of ABE program in the region.
- Although increase in access is achieved, there is now a growing concern about the quality of basic education provided in the ABE centers.

5.1.6.1- Supervision

- Bi annual supervision is made by the REB, at the beginning and at the end of school calendar,
• Results of the study confirmed that supervision is made usually at the beginning, in the middle and at the end of the school calendar by WEOs.
• Most respondents have agreed that supervision outcomes are taken into account during planning.

5.1.6.2- *In-service Trainings*

• Almost all of the facilitators who were asked replied that pre-service and in-service trainings are not enough for them to teach properly.
• Most of the sample facilitators take in-service trainings for only one time. Others didn’t take at all.

5.1.6.3- *Educational Inputs*

• Lack of furniture, instructional materials and a learning environment is very demotivating to facilitators and learners.
• It is observed that text books and facilitator guides are available at 1:2 ratios.
• Other inputs like combined desks are not available. Students sat on stones and wood in a child-unfriendly environment.
• Even the compounds of the centres are not fenced and have no separate latrines.

5.1.6.4- *Educational Qualification*

• The majority of the interviewed facilitators mentioned a feeling of being under-paid.
• The minimum educational qualification of facilitators who are recruited in the sample ABE centres is grade 6. But the MOE guidelines set the minimum level at grade 10.
• Once an Afar Youngman reaches this level it is not very hard to get recruited at WEOs or continue education and training in other sectors like health, water and agriculture.
5.2. CONCLUSIONS

Based on the major findings, the following conclusions were made:

1. The ABE system responds to the urgent need for an education that suits the special needs and constraints of pastoral life. ABE was launched mainly to expand access to basic education to the children in Afar region. ABE is found to be the most appropriate mode of delivery for the pastoralist people of Afar for its advantage over ease of access and local language of instruction. ABEs are established nearer to the hard to reach pastoralist communities and have impacted them positively in terms of access. Statistical data of the REB also shows that ABE has contributed considerably to the overall enrollment.

2. Although increase in enrollment is achieved due to the establishment of ABEs, mobility of the pastoralists in search of water and pasture for their cattle was identified as the major problem denying access to some of the children.

3. Although most parents are willing to send their children to school, preference to send boys to ABEs and girls to Quranic schools were observed. Parents demand for household labour is also seen.

4. Most of the respondents agree that ABE has created conducive environment to reduce drop out. But drought and illness hampers them to stay in schools.

5. Literature and MOE experts confirm that the curriculum of ABE and formal schools are substitutable to each other.

6. The frequency of supervision undertaken by the REB and WEO were not enough. But the outcomes of supervision are used as a base for planning.

7. Inadequate in-service trainings, inadequate educational inputs (combined desks, text books), low facilitator’s motivation (related to low salary) are also identified as quality problems. Observation confirmed that the compounds of the ABE centres were not fenced and has no separate latrines.

7. The average minimum educational qualification of facilitators who are recruited in the sample ABE centres is grade 7, but the MOE guidelines set the minimum level at grade 10.

54
5.3. RECOMMENDATIONS

Taking in to consideration the findings obtained and the conclusions drawn, the following recommendations are presented:

1. ABEs are found to be an appropriate mode of delivery for the Afar pastoralists. It has contributed in reaching out to remote areas where there were no education opportunities before. ABEs are chosen for the relative advantage on the ease of access and application of local languages of instruction. Although increase in access is achieved, mobility of pastoralists in search of water and pastures for their cattle hampers some of the children to school. The following are recommended to tackle these problems:

A. The REB should continue to provide ABE to the pastoralist children of Afar region for its potential advantages for the pastoralists.

B. Introducing feeding program in ABEs will significantly increase enrollment of pastoralists in ABEs. It can also significantly reduce the level of drop out. It is assumed that if the parents are sure that their children will be fed at school, they will leave them behind with the women at home during migration. The feeding program can be supported in collaboration with the community and the government. Local community members and the REB can contribute goats or cattle for ABE center to provide milk for the children during breakfast and lunch time. During dry season some of the cattle will be sold to fund the meal. The REB will give training to Center Management Committees on how to run the program.

C. Cooperative efforts of different sectors are required to bring about more settlements to the pastoralists. For example, Regional Water Resource Bureau can select water construction points where there are schools. The REB in turn can select sites of school construction where there is a water point. Both bureaus can plan together. Moreover, the Regional Pastoralist and agro pastoralist Bureau should work more on the settling the mobile pastoralists through the development of pasture areas. Health care for human and animals should be strengthened.
1. Adopting flexible school calendar will also help to improve enrolment and reduce dropout rate. The schooling time should be decided by the surrounding community. It should start after the student finished herding the cattle or other home duties.

2. Although most of the parents who are part of the focus group discussion are willing for girl’s education, some of them prefer Quranic schools. In order to improve equity in the region the following recommendations are presented:
   A. Since many parents expressed their preference for Quranic school (Madrassa) especially girls, it is important to construct ABEs near to the Quranic Schools. This can be materialized by giving the Quran teacher training and providing teaching materials. It can also be made by allocating some time for the children to attend Quranic teachings after or before ABE classes are given.
   B. The REB should attract and recruit more female facilitators to serve as role models in order to affect girls’ education positively.

3. Relevance of curriculum is a very sensitive issue to the pastoralists. Most of the participants in the study think that ABE is an inferior education and the major reasons are contents of the text book and length of time spent by children in schools. In order to ensure relevance, it is recommended that:
   A. Supplementary reading materials should be prepared by the REB.
   B. The curriculum for the ABE should be revisited to keep up with the growing need of the pastoralists and maintain relevance of education given in ABEs.

4. The higher the frequencies of supervision, the quicker problems are identified and the faster corrective measures are taken. In order to tackle problems that rose due to inadequate supervision:
   A. The REB and WEOs should increase the frequency of supervision. The REB should make at least a quarterly supervision, while WEO should make monthly supervision to ABE centres.
   B. Centre Management Community (CMC) can play important roles in controlling the ABE from short range if appropriate trainings are given.

5. Inadequate in service trainings, lack of educational inputs and low facilitator’s motivation were identified as quality problems. As a recommendation:
A. It is very important for the REB to conduct a study in order to assess the impacts of the trainings given for the facilitators. The results of the study would also help to identify in what areas the facilitators need more training.

B. Textbooks should be provided by the REB to those centres where deficiency is observed.

C. The REB should find ways to design and provide low cost combined desks.

D. Community participation should be initiated in constructing fences around the centres and digging separate latrines.

E. Provision of teacher’s housing near the centre (it can be an Afar traditional houses “Afar ari”) by coordinating government and community efforts will significantly reduce teacher absenteeism.

6. The facilitators’ educational level is concentrated at grade 6-8 with 1-3 years of experience, although the minimum countrywide qualification for facilitators is grade 10. In this case the following are recommended:

A. It is important to adopt other motivating environments or obligatory preconditions in order to attract more grade 10 completers in to the teaching career.

B. Based on the country wide guidelines, the Afar REB has to increase the minimum qualification of facilitators to be recruited. In areas where it is difficult to obtain grade 10 completers, it is important to give the facilitators additional in-service trainings that would increase their ability to teach.

C. There should also be arrangements for self development program which enables facilitators to continue their education in summer program. In this case considering the use of community radio programs to upgrade facilitators educational level through distance education mode is important.


APPENDICES
ANNEX I

Addis Ababa University
School of Graduate Studies

Questionnaires to be filled by the REB and WEOs experts

This questionnaire is intended to gather data for a post graduate thesis entitled "AN ASSESSMENT OF THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF ALTERNATIVE BASIC EDUCATION TO PRIMARY EDUCATION IN AFAR REGION".

The goal of the research is to find out the contribution of ABE to primary education in terms of access, quality, equity and relevance and the problems associated with delivering the ABE modality in Afar region. The collected date will only be used for the research purpose.

Therefore, your timely and honest response is indispensable for the success of the study.

The researcher would like to thank you very much in advance for your cooperation.

N.B.

- No need to write your name
- Mark your response in the space provided by putting “X” or “√” signs in the box of your preference from the choices given
- ABBREVIATIONS used: ABE Alternative Basic Education, UPE Universal Primary Education, REB Regional Education Bureau, WEB Woreda education Office

1. PERSONAL INFORMATION

1.1. Region/ Woreda

1.2. Name of the organization

1.3. Sex of respondent [ ] Male [ ] Female

1.4. Marital status

1.5. Educational level

1.6. Current position

1.7. Work experience on current position
2.

A) ACCESS ISSUES

1. What mode of delivery do you think is most appropriate to the Afar pastoralists?
   - [ ] Formal schools
   - [ ] Boarding schools
   - [ ] ABE
   - [ ] Mobile schools
   - [ ] Other (please specify) __________________________

1.1. Why do you choose the above delivery mode for the pastoralist children? (more than one answer is possible)
   - [ ] School calendar flexibility
   - [ ] Quality of education given
   - [ ] Ease of accessibility
   - [ ] Availability of educational material
   - [ ] Use of local language for instruction
   - [ ] Other (please specify) __________________________

2. How do you rate the impact of ABE on the pastoralists in terms of access to primary education?
   - [ ] Very strong
   - [ ] Strong
   - [ ] Moderate
   - [ ] Weak
   - [ ] Very weak

3. If it was not for the ABEs, do you think the children would have no access to education?
   - [ ] I strongly agree
   - [ ] I agree
   - [ ] I don’t know
   - [ ] I disagree
   - [ ] I strongly disagree

4. Would you list those major problems that you think denied children access to ABEs?
   __________________________________________________
   __________________________________________________
E) QUALITY ISSUES

1. Do you think level 3 ABE completers are able to compete with those children from the formal stream in grade 5 and above?

☐ I strongly agree ☐ I agree ☐ I don’t know
☐ I disagree ☐ I strongly disagree

1.1. If your answer to the above question is “DISAGREEMENT” then what should be done?

☐ Changing the ABE curriculum
☐ Provide more educational materials
☐ More supervision
☐ Increasing the educational qualification of facilitators
☐ Provide more training to facilitators
☐ Other (please specify) ___________________

2. How frequent is the supervision of the ABE centers made by the REB/WEO?

☐ Quarterly (4 times in a year) ☐ Semi annually (twice in a year)
☐ Once in a year ☐ other (please specify) __________

3. Does the REB/WEO management base the supervision results to make the annual plan?

☐ I strongly agree ☐ I agree ☐ I don’t know
☐ I disagree ☐ I strongly disagree

4. What are the frequently identified problems related to quality of education in ABEs?

☐ Absence/lack of educational inputs
☐ Problems related to facilitator’s motivation
☐ Problems related to inadequate qualification and ability to teach
☐ Problems related to absenteeism of teachers and/or students
☐ Other (please specify) ____________________________

THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME
This questionnaire is intended to gather data for a post graduate thesis entitled “AN ASSESSMENT OF THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF ALTERNATIVE BASIC EDUCATION TO PRIMARY EDUCATION IN AFAR REGION”. The goal of the research is to find out the contribution of ABE to primary education in terms of access, quality, equity and relevance and the problems associated with delivering the ABE modality in Afar region. The collected data will only be used for the research purpose. Therefore, your timely and honest response is indispensable for the success of the study. The researcher would like to thank you very much in advance for your cooperation.

N.B.
- No need to write your name
- Mark your response in the space provided by putting “X” or “✓” signs in the box of your preference from the choices given
- **ABBREVIATIONS** used - ABE Alternative Basic Education
  - UPE Universal Primary Education
  - REB Regional Education Bureau
  - WEB Woreda education Office

1. **PERSONAL INFORMATION**
   1.1. Name of the organization ____________________________
   1.2. Sex of respondent ☐ Male ☐ Female
   1.3. Marital status ____________________________
   1.4. Educational level ____________________________
   1.5. Current position ____________________________
   1.6. Work experience on current position ____________________________
2.

A) ACCESS ISSUES

1. What mode of delivery do you think is most appropriate to the pastoralists?
   - [ ] Formal schools
   - [ ] Boarding schools
   - [ ] ABE
   - [ ] Mobile schools
   - [ ] Other (please specify)

1.2. Why do you choose the above delivery mode for the pastoralist children? (more than one answer is possible)
   - [ ] School calendar flexibility
   - [ ] Quality of education given
   - [ ] Ease of accessibility
   - [ ] Availability of educational material
   - [ ] Use of local language for instruction
   - [ ] Other (please specify)

2. How do you rate the impact of ABE on the pastoralists in terms of access to primary education?
   - [ ] Very strong
   - [ ] Strong
   - [ ] Moderate
   - [ ] Weak
   - [ ] Very weak

3. Would you list those major problems that you think denied children access to ABEs?
   ________________________________________________________________
   ________________________________________________________________

B) EQUITY ISSUES

1. Do you think ABE created opportunity for more girls to enroll as compared to the formal schools?
   - [ ] I strongly agree
   - [ ] I agree
   - [ ] I don’t know
   - [ ] I disagree
   - [ ] I strongly disagree
C) EFFICIENCY ISSUES

1. Do you think ABE helped to reduce the dropout rate?

[ ] I strongly agree  [ ] I agree  [ ] I don’t know
[ ] I disagree  [ ] I strongly disagree

D) RELEVANCE ISSUES

1. Do you think the curriculum/text books prepared for ABE level 1-3 are equivalent/substitute to that of grade 1-4 of the formal stream?

[ ] I strongly agree  [ ] I agree  [ ] I don’t know
[ ] I disagree  [ ] I strongly disagree

1.1 If your answer to the above question is “DISAGREEMENT”, then what makes ABE inferior to the regular school’s curriculum?

[ ] The type of subjects given  [ ] The contents of the textbooks
[ ] The length of time given for the children to exercise
[ ] The relevance of the curriculum to the pastoralists
[ ] Other (please specify) ____________________________

E) QUALITY ISSUES

1. Do you think level 3 ABE completers are able to compete with those children from the formal stream in grade 5 and above?

[ ] I strongly agree  [ ] I agree  [ ] I don’t know
[ ] I disagree  [ ] I strongly disagree
1.1. If your answer to the above question is "DISAGREEMENT" then what should be done?

- Changing the ABE curriculum
- Provide more educational materials
- More supervision
- Increasing the educational qualification of facilitators
- Provide more training to facilitators
- Other (please specify)

2. What are the frequently identified problems related to quality of education in ABEs?

- Absence/lack of educational inputs
- Problems related to facilitator’s motivation
- Problems related to inadequate qualification and ability to teach
- Problems related to absenteeism of teachers and/or students
- Other (please explain)

3. What is the minimum educational qualification set by the MOE to recruit facilitators?

- Grade 6
- Grade 8
- Grade 10
- Other (please specify)

4. How long is the duration for pre service training according to MOE?

- 1 month
- 2 months
- Other (Please specify)

5. How long is the duration for in-service training according to MOE?

- 5 days
- 10 days
- Other (Please specify)

THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME
DECLARATION

I the undersigned, declare that this is my original work and that all sources of material used for the thesis have duly been acknowledged.

Name: Anwar Ahmed Ali

Signature: ____________

June, 2010
Addis Ababa